

# GL6.31 Attachment 3

## Attachment 3: Accessibility Strategy Research and Consultation Summary

### SUMMARY

---

As directed by City Council, Municipal Licensing and Standards (MLS) has developed a vehicle-for-hire accessibility strategy. The accessibility strategy under consideration proposes to:

- **Create and administer an Accessibility Fund Program** that would collect regulatory charges from members in the vehicle-for-hire industry that do not provide wheelchair accessible service, and disburse funds to City-licensed wheelchair accessible owners and drivers who meet and maintain eligibility for the fund. Funding would be disbursed based on service standards established by the Executive Director of MLS, reflecting the higher capital and operating costs of providing accessible service, and will be determined through declaration and trip data. MLS will audit declarations, and trip data to ensure compliance against service standards. This will encourage, through financial incentives, wheelchair accessible taxicabs to be available to deliver service.
- **Update accessibility-related by-law requirements** to address unmet accessibility needs. These include requiring all drivers in the industry to have accessibility training, updating the Taxicab Bill of Rights to include language about fare refusals related to accessibility, and requiring PTC drivers who provide wheelchair accessible service to complete a City-approved accessibility training program. In addition, the proposed accessibility strategy includes a recommendation to license all providers of accessible service to ensure that all accessible trips meet minimum requirements for safety and consumer protection.

This attachment provides a review of how accessible vehicle-for-hire service is delivered in Toronto and a summary of the consultation and research findings. Details on the proposed accessibility strategy can be found in the accompanying staff report.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

<b>Overview of Research and Consultations</b> .....	<b>3</b>
1. Current Provision of Accessible Service.....	3
2. Proportion of Accessible Taxicabs .....	4
3. Consultation Process .....	5
4. Preliminary Data Analysis .....	11
5. Jurisdictional Scan .....	11
6. Complaints and Enforcement .....	12
<b>Appendix</b> .....	<b>13</b>
Appendix 1: Accessibility Panel Members.....	13
Appendix 2: Jurisdictional Scan .....	14

# RESEARCH AND CONSULTATIONS

---

## Overview of Research and Consultations

In developing the proposed strategy, staff sought feedback from users of accessible vehicles-for-hire. This was done through public consultation meetings, Accessibility Panel meetings with users, advocates, experts, and providers, the procurement of a third-party to conduct public opinion research and facilitate focus group meetings with both users and providers, and an online survey for users of accessible service.

In addition to these outreach efforts, staff consulted with the Toronto Accessibility Advisory Committee, completed a jurisdictional scan, leveraged the general public opinion survey to ask about attitudes and use of accessible vehicle-for-hire service, undertook a preliminary data collection exercise (which included brokerages, PTC, and Wheel-Trans data), and analyzed complaint and enforcement data. Throughout the review, MLS consulted with City staff in the Equity and Human Rights Office to seek their advice on best practices on matters related to consultations, survey development, and disability research.

## 1. Current Provision of Accessible Service

### Overview

The City of Toronto currently licenses 5,205 taxicabs. This includes 4,626 standard taxicab licences and 579 Toronto Taxicab Licences (TTLs). Of the 4,626 standard taxicabs, 97 of these licences have wheelchair accessible vehicles connected to them. Over 95% of these 97 standard taxicab licences are affiliated with the Toronto Transit Commission (TTC) Wheel-Trans program. The City does not charge an annual renewal fee for owners of wheelchair accessible taxicabs.

The provision of metered on-demand vehicle-for-hire service is different than the services provided through the Wheel-Trans program. Under the Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act, the City is required to ensure that equitable vehicle-for-hire service is available to all individuals. As such, the aim of the vehicle-for-hire accessibility strategy is to advance this service. Wheel-Trans, in comparison, offers pre-booked service at the same cost as a standard transit fare to eligible individuals who are not able to take other TTC transit options for some or all of their trip.

As required in the Vehicle-for-Hire By-law, all of the City's accessible vehicles, including the City's 579 TTL vehicles, must be D409 compliant. That is, they must comply with Canadian Standards Association vehicle standards for motor vehicles designed or converted and equipped for the purpose of transporting persons with physical disabilities. The D409 Standard specifies the design and manufacture of the vehicle, lifts, and ramps, the mobility aid location and securement, and the required safety equipment.

Under the By-law, every TTL is required to be affiliated with a brokerage. There are currently 17 brokerages with TTLs associated with them. The number of TTLs each brokerage has ranges from 1 to approximately 160.

Private transportation companies (PTCs) with more than 500 PTC drivers are required to provide wheelchair accessible service to the public. This service must be available when requested through the platform within the average wait time for non-accessible taxicab service, and the fare cannot be higher than the fare charged for the lowest-cost non-accessible service.

## **Background: Toronto Taxicab Licences**

In its February 2014 meeting, City Council adopted the creation of the TTL class, as well as a number of other amendments to Chapter 545, Licensing - the By-law that governed the taxicab industry at the time<sup>1</sup>. These amendments were adopted as part of the City's approach to improving accessibility in the vehicle-for-hire industry. That is, that the City would have a long-term goal of moving towards a 100% wheelchair accessible taxicab fleet. The amendments were designed so that, as taxicab owners retired or sold their business, any new purchasers would be required to convert the licence to a TTL. It was anticipated that this turnover would take up to 50 years. In 2014, Council authorized City staff to issue the first 290 TTL plates.

In November 2015, City Council authorized the issuance of a further 100 TTLs<sup>2</sup>.

At its May 2016 meeting, City Council established a new By-law to govern vehicles-for-hire, including taxicabs and private transportation companies<sup>3</sup>. As part of this, the requirement that a TTL must be issued upon the sale of a taxicab licence was removed. Council adopted a new requirements for accessible service delivered by PTCs and directed staff to report back on an accessibility strategy and accessibility fund.

## **2. Proportion of Accessible Taxicabs**

The City has licensed 579 TTLs and 97 standard taxicabs with accessible vehicles. This means that 13% of the City's taxicabs are wheelchair accessible.

Through research and consultations with users, advocates, and providers, staff heard that a vehicle that is wheelchair accessible is not always the most accessible vehicle for everyone. Specifically, sedans are more accessible to some individuals with sensory, mobility, and/or flexibility-related disabilities, as it is easier to enter and exit sedans. Providers of accessible service told staff that they frequently receive requests for sedan-specific service from people who are elderly, as well as those with visible and non-visible disabilities. Data collected from the TTC Wheel-Trans program and taxicab brokerages supports this; approximately 48% of accessible trips in Toronto in 2018 were done by a sedan. This suggests that an accessible taxicab fleet should include both sedan-style taxicabs and wheelchair accessible taxicabs in order to accommodate the diverse needs of customers.

Using this information, additional research, a jurisdictional scan, and consultations, staff are not recommending an increase to the number of TTLs issued.

---

1 <http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2014.LS26.1>

2 <http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2015.LS6.1>

3 <http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2016.LS10.3>

Staff recommend creating and administering the proposed Accessibility Fund Program. This is to encourage, through financial incentives, existing wheelchair accessible taxicabs to be on the road and available to deliver service. Through enhanced data collection, the City will be able to better understand supply and demand of wheelchair accessible taxicabs, including wait times.

### **Feedback from Toronto Accessibility Advisory Committee**

On April 11, 2019, MLS presented to the Toronto Accessibility Advisory Committee (TAAC) on item [DI1.4: Accessibility Feedback on Vehicle-for-Hire Accessibility Strategy](#)<sup>4</sup>. This provided an overview of the accessibility strategy and consulted with members on the proportion of on-demand wheelchair accessible taxicabs in Toronto. Staff advised the Committee that the accessibility strategy being considered focuses on encouraging, through financial incentives, accessible taxicabs to be on the road delivering service and does not include the issuance of more accessible taxicab licences. The Committee was told that staff plan to collect data from the industry to better assess demand and monitor service delivery. If more TTLs are required, members were advised that staff would first consult with the Toronto Accessibility Advisory Committee and report to Council with recommendations.

Members of the Committee emphasized the need to consider users and their experience when moving forward with an accessibility strategy for the vehicle-for-hire review to ensure equitable access. Suggestions included looking at ways that the City can collect feedback on the level of customer service and advance high-quality training for drivers.

On June 4, 2019, TAAC considered [DI2.1: Chair's Report](#)<sup>5</sup> and requested staff to consider creating a licensing category exclusively for accessible service delivery to advance accessible vehicle-for-hire service in Toronto. This has been considered as part of the proposed Accessibility Strategy, which is designed to promote the availability of accessible vehicles through the Accessibility Fund Program. Staff have also recommended creating a new licensing category called accessible limousine. This new category will bring currently unlicensed service providers into the regulatory framework and ensure a standard level of service across all accessible vehicle-for-hire services.

## **3. Consultation Process**

### **Public Consultations**

Staff hosted a series of public consultation meetings as part of the broader Vehicle-for-Hire By-law Review. A first round of consultations was held in September and October 2018, followed by a second round in March 2019.

---

4 <http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2019.DI1.4>

5 <http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2019.DI2.1>

### *First Round of Public Consultations*

Between September 17 and October 3, 2018, nine public meetings were held. At each of these meetings, attendees provided feedback on the current vehicle-for-hire industry, including what changes would be required in order to provide better accessible service.

Staff heard concerns about how accessible service is provided in Toronto and the financial cost of providing accessible service (due to the purchase price, replacement cost and maintenance required for accessible vehicles). Staff also heard from users and providers that the City's aim of metered, on-demand wheelchair accessible service is not being consistently met. Suggestions included a dispatch service for accessible vehicles, a dedicated Accessibility Fund Program to subsidize the cost and maintenance of wheelchair accessible vehicles, and reviewing training for wheelchair accessible vehicle drivers.

### *Second Round of Public Consultations*

Staff hosted a second round of public consultations between March 4 and March 19, 2019. Two meetings had topics related to accessibility: one meeting had the general topic of accessibility and the second was specifically related to Toronto Taxicab Licences. For the meeting on accessibility, members of the public had the option to attend in-person or watch and listen live on the City's Get Involved YouTube channel.

During the accessibility public meeting, staff heard concerns from users that accessible service is not always readily available and that there is sometimes inconsistent quality of service. In general, members of the public and accessibility industry were supportive of a program to provide incentives to owners and drivers of accessible taxicabs in order to improve availability and quality of service. Members of the public told staff that the accessibility strategy should also include increased public education and awareness, improved training, and a consideration for individuals with non-mobility disabilities, such as those who are deaf, blind, use a service animal, and have other visible and non-visible disabilities. Staff heard that fare refusals and issues around service animals continue, despite being prohibited under the City's By-law and provincial legislation. There was strong support from accessible users for mandating side-entry conversions on wheelchair accessible vehicles.

During the public consultation meeting on TTLs, approximately 60 TTL owners were in attendance. The conversation focused on the high cost of providing accessible service and how low demand act as disincentives to providing on-demand accessible service. Suggestions included allowing TTL owners to convert their licences to standard licences, reducing the amount of competition to make providing the service more profitable, and providing incentives to offset the higher operating costs.

When asked about an accessibility fund program, owners of TTLs generally expressed support for such a program to offset higher operating costs. Those who supported the fund told staff that the costs of gas, operation, conversion, and maintenance are all higher for accessible vehicles than sedans and suggested that the fund include these aspects. Staff heard mixed opinions on tying funding to specific service standards (e.g. number of hours on the road). Most industry members tended to support this as long as it adequately offset the higher operating costs. Those in opposition were concerned about the ability for owners and drivers to continue to work as they age given the

physically demanding nature of the job and the need for brokerages to be giving more non-accessible trips to TTLs.

### **Vehicle-for-Hire Accessibility Panel**

In May 2016, City Council directed staff to create a working group of stakeholders, accessibility experts, and advocates to develop a funding program and process that will advance inclusive on-demand ground transportation for all users and develop an accessibility strategy.

Staff convened an Accessibility Panel group comprised of users, advocates, experts, and providers of accessible service. A full list of organizations involved can be found in Appendix 1 of this attachment. Staff conducted research and outreach, and worked with the Equity, Diversity, and Human Rights division as well as the Seniors Transition Office to determine membership.

The Accessibility Panel group met twice and the input provided during these meetings informed the proposed accessibility strategy. The first meeting was held on January 17, 2019 with a follow-up meeting on February 27, 2019.

Feedback received at the first meeting was used to inform the next steps in the overall vehicle-for-hire accessibility strategy and included the following key points of discussion:

- **Access:** staff heard from users that wheelchair accessible service is often inconsistent and difficult to access, particularly at nighttime. Attendees also told staff that it is sometimes difficult for users to connect with a wheelchair accessible provider and suggested looking at ways to encourage wheelchair accessible vehicle availability.
- **User Experience:** staff heard that some drivers charge a higher rate for wheelchair accessible service despite being prohibited in the By-law.
- **Service Animals:** staff heard that fare refusal for service animals remains an issue, despite being prohibited by provincial and municipal laws.
- **Entry Type:** staff heard that the City should consider exclusively using side-entry wheelchair accessible vehicles. Currently, both rear and side-entry are permitted.
- **Training:** staff heard that there is an opportunity for the City to review requirements for accessibility training in the vehicle-for-hire industry.
- **Higher Costs:** staff heard that the cost to provide wheelchair accessible service is higher than providing non-accessible service (i.e. capital and other costs). Attendees commented that funding should be considered to support on-demand wheelchair accessible service.
- **Assistive Devices:** staff heard that additional assistive devices should be considered, particularly for those with non-mobility disabilities.

At the follow-up meeting in February 2019, staff consulted on specific approaches for the Accessibility Panel to consider. Staff also provided this information electronically by email so that all invitees could review and provide comment. Staff consulted on the following key considerations:

- The creation of a Vehicle-for-Hire Accessibility Fund Program;

- The use of service standards and criteria to determine funding eligibility; and
- Opportunities to improve accessibility training.

The following summarized feedback was received during the second Accessibility Panel meeting:

- **Data Collection:** staff heard that the City should be collecting more information about the industry to better assess wait times, service delivery, and demand for wheelchair accessible service.
- **Vehicle-for-Hire Accessibility Fund Program:** staff heard general consensus that the approach is a good idea and should be considered further. Staff heard that the higher cost of operating a wheelchair accessible taxicab should not be borne by the owners and drivers and that the City should consider ways to offset this cost. Attendees cautioned about the need to ensure accountability and a return on investment for the City.
- **Funding and Service Standards:** funding should consider both capital costs and operating costs and that the data is first required in order to monitor and distribute any funds. Some of the service standards suggested included encouraging drivers to be available during late night and early morning times, and setting minimum number of days or hours per month that the vehicle or driver needs to be delivering service in order to be eligible for full funding.
- **Driver Training:** staff heard that the City should consider reviewing the content for accessible driver training, the method of delivery, and opportunities to centralize accessible training. Attendees spoke about the importance of engaging community partners when developing training programs.

## Opinion Research and Surveys

### Public Opinion Survey

The City procured The Strategic Council, a third-party market research firm, to conduct public opinion research.

An online survey was conducted to better understand residents' attitudes, experience, and satisfaction with the vehicle-for-hire industry since the implementation of the Vehicle-for-Hire By-law in 2016. 1007 respondents completed the survey, which took place between February 20 and March 1, 2019. A sampling plan was developed to ensure a representative cross section of Torontonians by gender, age, district, and socioeconomic status, reflective of the most recent Statistics Canada data. The full report can be found in Attachment 2 of the staff report.

A component of this survey included accessibility. The survey found that:

- One-in-ten residents have either taken or arranged assistive/accessible transportation or wheelchair-accessible transportation in the past 12 months.
- A limited number of respondents (16%) report having used a taxicab that accommodates people using wheelchairs or scooters. Of those who have not, similar numbers are open to the idea (43%) or say they would not use this type of taxicab (41%).



- Uncertainty about whether the following statements were true indicate a lack of knowledge when it comes to wheelchair accessible vehicles:
  - A wheelchair accessible taxicab costs the same metered fare as a sedan taxicab (66% correctly identified this as a true statement)
  - A wheelchair accessible vehicle is only for people with disabilities and cannot be hailed for the general public (53% incorrectly identified this as a true statement)
  - You can request a wheelchair accessible vehicle through a Private Transportation Company, such as Lyft and Uber (51% correctly identified this as a true statement)
- Among those who have taken a wheelchair-accessible trip, three-quarters (74%) rate it as 'excellent/good', with three-in-ten (28%) rating it as 'excellent'.
  - The main reasons for this rating was that there were no issues (36%), the driver was helpful (27%) or friendly (21%), and the service was on time (19%).

### **Focus Groups with Providers and Users of Accessible Service**

The Strategic Counsel conducted focus groups with providers and users of accessible service. One focus group was held with providers and two focus groups were with users of accessible vehicle-for-hire service. The focus groups were held on March 27, 2019. The full report can be found in Attachment 2 of the staff report.

Key findings from the accessibility-related focus groups:

- The general public has little knowledge of how wheelchair accessible services are provided in Toronto;
- Users of accessible service tend to use the TTC's Wheel-Trans and conventional transit options, citing low income as the main limitation;
- Users of accessible service felt that there are benefits and drawbacks to the way wheelchair accessible service is delivered by both taxicabs and PTCs; and
- There was general consensus that proper training is a crucial component of advancing quality service and expanding accessibility training to all drivers in the vehicle-for-hire industry would promote better service for all.

### **Surveying Users of Accessible Vehicle-for-Hire Services**

Staff reviewed current research on disability to better understand its prevalence. In doing so, staff found that there is limited Toronto-specific disability research on accessible transportation.

At a national level, Statistics Canada's [Canadian Survey on Disability, 2017](#)<sup>6</sup> found that 22% of the Canadian population aged 15 years and over have at least one disability. The most common disability types are pain-related (14.5%), flexibility (10.0%), and mobility (9.6%). Nationally, the prevalence of disability increases with age; 13% of Canadians who are 15 to 24 years of age have at least one disability compared to 47% for Canadians 75 years of age or older.

---

6 <https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/89-654-x/89-654-x2018002-eng.htm>

To better understand demand and user experience, staff developed an online survey for individuals who use accessible vehicle-for-hire services, including those who book on behalf of someone. Developed in consultation with the City's Social Development, Finance, and Administration division, Equity and Human Rights office, and the Toronto Rehabilitation Institute, the survey was hosted by the City and ran from April 4, 2019 to April 30, 2019, inclusive. The survey had 253 respondents.

The online survey, hosted by the City, did not have the same scientific controls as the online polling conducted by The Strategic Counsel. The results of the survey should not be considered statistically significant, but rather used to provide additional insight into service demand and experience of those who use licensed wheelchair accessible vehicles.

Key findings from the City-hosted survey for users of accessible service:

- Respondents typically use public transit (44%), this includes Go Transit, TTC, and Wheel-Trans services. Those who do not are most likely to drive or carpool (25%). Of those who typically use City-licensed vehicles-for-hire (19%), the data suggests that users are more likely to use Uber and Lyft when they take a wheelchair accessible vehicle at least once a day.
- 73% of respondents stated that they have used or booked a wheelchair accessible vehicle through taxi brokerages, PTC, street hail, and/or TTC's Wheel-Trans program.
- The majority of respondents indicated that they book wheelchair accessible service through the TTC's Wheel-Trans Program (58%). The next most common booking method was through taxicab brokerages (47%), and then PTCs (32%).

The survey also had an open-text field where respondents could provide their feedback on what would improve the delivery of wheelchair-accessible service. Common feedback topics included:

- **Brokerage-booked trips:** respondents who have booked through brokerages stated that the drivers are trained and professional, and cited reasonable response times, clean taxicabs, and an affordable cost. However, customers who reported a poor experience provided, at times, reasons that conflicted with these, including: poor ride quality (bumpy and noisy), unclean taxicabs, that drivers have poor communication, drive aggressively, and have limited knowledge of accessibility needs.
- **PTC-booked trips:** respondents who have booked through PTCs stated that they liked that the vehicles are clean, drivers are friendly, helpful, and provide good customer service, and the affordable pricing. However, respondents raised concerns that the wait time is variable, that PTCs often do not have wheelchair accessible vehicles available, that drivers are sometimes poorly trained, and rear-entry conversion used is unsafe and contributes to a poor ride quality.
- **Conversion Type:** several responses included concerns with rear-entry conversions and advocated for more side-entry wheelchair accessible vehicles. The limited availability of curb cuts, user experience, and poor ride quality were all cited as concerns.

- **Training:** respondents highlighted the importance of the driver in determining the quality of the service. Feedback included the need for strong road knowledge, customer service skills, and training for all providers of accessible service.

#### 4. Preliminary Data Analysis

To better understand how many wheelchair accessible trips are completed in Toronto, staff compiled 2018 data from the TTC, brokerages, and PTCs.

Aggregated by week, staff were able to determine the number of wheelchair accessible vehicle and sedan trips done through the TTC's Wheel-Trans program. To collect the brokerage data, staff reached out to the four brokerages affiliated with the TTC Wheel-Trans wheelchair accessible vehicle contracts, as well as the brokerage with the most TTLs affiliated with them. This accounted for approximately 75% of the 579 TTLs in Toronto. The data collected from PTCs allowed staff to assess the number of wheelchair accessible trips taken through PTC platforms. Where PTCs offer an assistive option, staff included this under sedan service.

Staff estimate that there were approximately 4.4 million accessible trips provided in Toronto, of which approximately 2.3 million trips (52%) are wheelchair accessible.

It is estimated that there were around 2.1 million accessible trips where the client specifically requests a sedan for an accessibility reason. The majority of these (63%) were delivered by Wheel-Trans. Not all brokerages track sedan-specific requests. For PTCs, the number of assistive trips was used to estimate the number of sedan and ambulatory trips.

The data provided is the City's best estimate of the number of trips completed by accessible vehicles in Toronto in 2018. However, the numbers should only be considered an estimate as they are self-reported by five of the seventeen licensed brokerages with TTLs (accounting for approximately 75% of TTLs), and the majority of accessible taxicab trips are by a brokerage that only uses accessible taxicabs (and, therefore, not all of their trips would be for people requiring accessible service).

#### 5. Jurisdictional Scan

Staff completed a comprehensive jurisdictional scan of Canadian and American municipalities that are developing strategies to advance accessible vehicle-for-hire service. These municipalities were: Calgary, Chicago, Edmonton, Hamilton, Montgomery (Maryland), New York City, Ottawa, Portland, San Francisco, Seattle, and Winnipeg. A summary of the jurisdictional scan is provided in Appendix 2 of this attachment.

These municipalities have made it a goal to improve the availability of wheelchair accessible vehicles-for-hire to passengers with disabilities. To do this, the municipalities examined are considering or implementing a number of different approaches, including:

- mandating wheelchair accessible service for taxis and/or PTCs;

- imposing a ratio or percentage of wheelchair accessible vehicles in brokerage, owner's/agent fleet;
- providing financial compensation and incentives to owners and taxicab drivers to provide wheelchair accessible service; and/or
- providing financial compensation to owners and taxicab drivers who provide wheelchair accessible transportation.

To encourage operators to provide wheelchair accessible transportation, the majority of municipalities examined have begun developing subsidy programs to offset the higher cost of delivering accessible service. Such programs include:

- subsidizing the purchase or conversion of wheelchair accessible vehicles;
- subsidizing the maintenance and the operation of the vehicle;
- compensating drivers for the provision of wheelchair accessible service;
- waiving licensing fees; and/or
- paying for training.

Staff consulted with regulators in a number of cities that are implementing their own accessibility strategies (Calgary, Chicago, and Seattle). These cities collect data related to taxicab service for both non-accessible and accessible rides. This allows them to implement accessibility strategies tied to the provision of accessible service.

Calgary, for example, is implementing a taxicab incentive program. In it, \$0.30 from every taxicab and PTC trip is allocated to an accessibility fund program. This fund is used to offset the higher operating costs for owners and drivers. Owners are entitled to a maximum of \$3,000 per year. Half of this is a set amount of money per year as a grant and the other half is tied to service standards, such as minimum number of days on the road providing service and minimum number of hours operating. Similarly, drivers are entitled up to a maximum of \$2,000, based solely on service standards such as accepting all accessible trips, completing a minimum number of accessible trips per month, and being available after-hours or late-night (i.e. 10 p.m. – 4:00 a.m.).

## 6. Complaints and Enforcement

In developing the proposed vehicle-for-hire accessibility strategy, staff analyzed TTL complaint and enforcement data between 2014 (when TTL licences were first issued) and 2018. The most common complaints are related to poor driving habits, failing to be civic and well behaved, refusing to serve the first person, using unauthorized rates, and using the colour scheme of another taxicab or brokerage. In addition, MLS conducts proactive inspections of licensed vehicles-for-hire. The number of complaints and charges received, per year, is provided in Table 1.

Table 1: Number of complaints and charges received, per year, related to TTLs

TYPE	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	Total
Number of Complaints	0	45	41	29	22	137
Number of Charges	2	8	1	6	11	28

## APPENDIX

---

### Appendix 1: Accessibility Panel Members

Staff from the City's Municipal Licensing and Standards (MLS) division hosted two Accessibility Panel consultation meetings January and February 2019.

Attendees were invited based on their knowledge of accessible vehicle-for-hire service. Many invitees provide service or advocate on behalf of people with disabilities. Individuals and organizations directly involved in the vehicle-for-hire industry were also invited. MLS staff worked with the City's Equity, Diversity, and Human Rights division to identify advocates, experts, and organizations that represent individuals and groups who may experience barriers when accessing accessible transportation. Organizations that attended at least one meeting include (in alphabetical order):

- Access Independent Living Services
- Beck Taxi
- Bob Rumball Centre for the Deaf
- Canadian Hearing Society
- Canadian National Institute for the Blind
- Centennial College School of Transportation
- Checker Taxi
- Circle of Care Sinai Health System
- City of Toronto's Equity, Diversity, and Human Rights Division
- Community Living Toronto
- Co-op Cabs
- Epilepsy Toronto
- HandiHelp Accessible Innovations
- Harmonize Mobility
- Multiple Sclerosis Society of Canada
- Ontario Federation of Cerebral Palsy
- Scarborough City Cab
- Spinal Cord Injury Ontario
- Sprint Senior Care
- Toronto Accessibility Advisory Committee, Former Member
- Toronto Rehabilitation Institute
- Toronto Transit Commission Wheel-Trans
- Uber
- Wheelchair Accessible Transit Inc.

Additional organizations invited to the meetings were provided the meeting materials and were able to submit comments related to the Vehicle-for-Hire Accessibility Strategy. These included: Alliance for Equality of Blind Canadians, Arch Disability Law, Canadian Hard of Hearing Association (Ontario), CARP Toronto, City of Toronto's Seniors Transition Office, Faurecia, Inclusive Design Research Centre OCAD University, Lyft, an OCAD Inclusive Design Member, Sound Times, and Spectrum Patient Services.

## Appendix 2: Jurisdictional Scan

At the time of the jurisdictional scan, municipalities were at different stages in the implementation of their accessibility funding program. Funding programs generally have eligibility and/or service standards that must be met and funding is typically not automatic. In some cities, recipients must reapply each year for funding.

Table 2: Summary of jurisdictional scan of accessibility programs

CITY	NUMBER OF WHEELCHAIR ACCESSIBLE TAXICABS	FUNDING SOURCE	FUNDING RECIPIENTS	NOTES (if applicable)
<b>Toronto</b> (Proposed)	676  (4,334 people per accessible taxi)	<b>PTC</b> \$0.10 per trip and \$7.23 per driver  <b>Taxicab Industry:</b> Between \$62.66 and \$250.64 per year, depending on licence	<b>Taxicab Owners</b> Up to \$4,796.42 per year for side-entry  Up to \$3625.42 per year for rear-entry  <b>Taxicab Drivers</b> Up to \$2,187.50 per year	Currently, PTCs with 500+ vehicles must provide accessible service within the average wait time for non-accessible taxicab service and at equivalent price to lowest non-accessible option. No change to this is proposed.
<b>Calgary</b>	189  (6,555 people per accessible taxi)	<b>All Taxicabs and PTCs</b> \$0.30 per trip	<b>Taxicab Owners</b> \$1,500 grant and up to \$1,500 incentive per year  <b>Taxicab Driver</b> Up to \$2,000 incentive per year	Taxicab incentive program was scheduled to start January 2019 and payments to start in 2020
<b>Chicago</b>	355  (7,650 people per accessible taxi)	<b>PTC</b> \$0.10 per trip  <b>Taxicab Owner</b> \$22 per month (non-accessible vehicles only)	<b>PTC Driver</b> \$15 per ride  <b>Taxicab Owner</b> \$20,000 conversion, \$8,000 per year maintenance  <b>Taxicab Driver</b> \$15 per 12 hour lease  <b>Centralized Dispatch</b> \$60,000 per month	Fleet owners with 10+ taxicabs must have 1 accessible taxicab in service for every 10 taxicabs  Taxicab fleet owners are required to use accessible vehicle as replacement vehicle

<b>CITY</b>	<b>NUMBER OF WHEELCHAIR ACCESSIBLE TAXICABS</b>	<b>FUNDING SOURCE</b>	<b>FUNDING RECIPIENTS</b>	<b>NOTES (if applicable)</b>
<b>Edmonton</b>	95  (9,816 people per accessible taxi)	<b>VFH Brokerages</b> \$50/vehicle (max \$50,000 per year), taxicab and limousine brokerages are excluded	TBD (report going to Council September 2019)	Accessible fund surcharge is waived for brokerages that have at least one wheelchair accessible vehicle in service
<b>Hamilton</b>	40  (13,422 people per accessible taxi)	<b>PTC</b> Voluntary payment of \$2,000 - \$20,000 depending on number of vehicles	<b>Taxicab Driver</b> \$5.00 per dispatched trip	Payments are only for dispatched trips participating in the one year pilot (began September 2018)
<b>Montgomery (Maryland)</b>	70  (15,129 people per accessible taxi)	<b>PTC</b> \$0.25 per trip	TBD	
<b>New York City</b>	4,840 (includes Taxi of Tomorrow, Green Taxi and Yellow Taxi)  (1,781 people per accessible taxi)	<b>Taxicab Industry</b> \$0.30 per trip	<b>Taxicab Owner</b> \$14,000 conversion and \$4,000 per year maintenance (for four years)  <b>Taxicab Driver</b> Fee based on kilometres of \$6-\$30 per dispatched trip  Plus an additional \$1 per trip (Yellow Wheelchair Accessible Taxi)	
<b>Ottawa</b>	191  (4,891 people per accessible taxi)	<b>PTC</b> \$0.07 per trip	<b>Not-for-profit and community agencies</b>  <b>Passengers</b> (discounted taxi coupons)	Agencies are funded to expand transportation in rural areas

CITY	NUMBER OF WHEELCHAIR ACCESSIBLE TAXICABS	FUNDING SOURCE	FUNDING RECIPIENTS	NOTES (if applicable)
<b>Portland</b>	93  (6,965 people per accessible taxi)	<b>PTC</b> A portion of a \$0.50 per trip surcharge goes towards accessibility  <b>Taxicab Industry</b> TBD	<b>PTC Driver</b> \$15 per trip  <b>Taxicab Company</b> \$15 per trip	Both taxicabs and PTCs are required to provide wheelchair accessible service and can participate in the program
<b>San Francisco</b>	37  (23,901 people per accessible taxi)	<b>PTC</b> \$0.05 per trip (minimum)  <b>Taxicab Industry</b> TBD	<b>Taxicab Owner</b> \$300 per month maintenance, \$200 per month for purchase of used vehicle, \$300 per month for purchase of new vehicle  <b>Taxicab Driver</b> \$10 per trip	Pilot program for up to 36 months  Owners must operate a minimum of 80 hours and provide at least 20 verified trips per month (funding connected to a paratransit program)
<b>Seattle</b>	50  (14,495 people per accessible taxi)	<b>PTC</b> \$0.10 per trip  <b>Taxicab Owner</b> \$0.10 per trip (or a flat-rate)	<b>Taxicab Owner</b> \$15 per shift, \$20 per dispatched trip (if owner is a driver), and \$3,500 per year maintenance  <b>Taxicab Driver</b> \$20 per dispatched trip and \$15 per shift	Funded by the City and King County through taxi and PTC per trip surcharge  Waived licence fee for wheelchair accessible taxis  Lower regulated shift rental rates for accessible taxicabs (i.e. \$15 per shift max, \$105 per week max.)
<b>Winnipeg</b>	130  (5,425 people per accessible taxi)	<b>PTC</b> \$0.07 per trip  <b>Taxicab Industry</b> \$0.07 per trip	TBD	Winnipeg began regulating VFH industry as of March 1, 2018  Report scheduled for December 2019