# **DA** TORONTO

# **REPORT FOR ACTION**

# Alterations to a Heritage Property, Intention to Designate under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, and Authority to Enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement – 50 Eglinton Avenue West

 Date: May 8, 2019
To: Toronto Preservation Board North York Community Council
From: Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, Urban Design, City Planning
Wards: Ward 8 - Eglinton - Lawrence

# SUMMARY

This report recommends that Toronto City Council approve the proposed alterations to the heritage property located within the proposed development site at 50-60 Eglinton Avenue West, linked with the proposed redevelopment of the site and per the settlement offer submitted to the City on July 13, 2018, and adopted by Council on July 23, 2018, in conjunction with an appeal to the Local Planning Appeals Tribunal ("LPAT") of the application for Zoning By-law Amendment, that Council include the property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register, that Council state its Intention to Designate the property included in the proposed development site (50-60 Eglinton West) under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, and that Council grant authority to enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement for the subject property.

# RECOMMENDATIONS

The Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, Urban Design, City Planning recommends that:

1. City Council include the property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.

2. City Council state its intention to designate the property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act in accordance with the Statement of Significance: 50 Eglinton Avenue West (Reasons for Designation) attached as Attachment 6 to the report May 8, 2019 from the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.

3. If there are no objections to the designations in accordance with the Ontario Heritage Act, City Council authorize the City Solicitor to introduce the bill in Council designating the property under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

4. If there are objections in accordance with the Ontario Heritage Act, City Council direct the City Clerk to refer the designation to the Conservation Review Board.

5. If the designations are referred to the Conservation Review Board, City Council authorize the City Solicitor and appropriate staff to attend any hearing held by the Conservation Review Board in support of Council's decision on the designation of the property.

6. City Council approve the alterations to the heritage property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West in accordance with Section 33 of the Ontario Heritage Act, to allow for the construction of a 32-storey tower on the lands known municipally as 50-60 Eglinton Avenue West, with such alterations substantially in accordance with plans and drawings (update issued April 19, 2019) prepared by Turner Fleischer Architects and Hariri Pontarini Architects, and on file with the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services; and the Heritage Impact Assessment, prepared by ERA Architects Inc., issued February 27, 2019 (with Addendum issued April 12, 2019) and on file with the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, all subject to and in accordance with a Conservation Plan satisfactory to the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services and subject to the following additional conditions:

a. That as a condition of the Section 37 Agreement as approved by the Local Planning Appeal Tribunal, the owner shall:

1. Enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement with the City for the property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West in accordance with the plans and drawings (update issued April 19, 2019) prepared by Turner Fleischer Architects and Hariri Pontarini Architects, and on file with the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, the Heritage Impact Assessment prepared by ERA Architects Inc. issued February 27, 2019 (with Addendum issued April 12, 2019) and in accordance with the Conservation Plan required in Recommendation 6.a.2 below to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services including registration of such agreement to the satisfaction of the City Solicitor;

2. Provide a detailed Conservation Plan, prepared by a qualified heritage consultant, that is consistent with the conservation strategy set out in the Heritage Impact Assessment prepared by ERA Architects Inc. issued February 27, 2019 (with Addendum issued April 12, 2019) to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;

3. Enter into and register on the property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West one or more agreements with the City pursuant to Section 37 of the Planning Act to the satisfaction of the City Solicitor, the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning, and the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services with such facilities, services and matters to be set forth in the related site specific Zoning By-law Amendment giving rise to the proposed alterations.

b. That prior to final Site Plan approval for the proposed Zoning By-law Amendment by City Council for the property located at 50-60 Eglinton Avenue West, the owner shall:

1. Provide final site plan drawings substantially in accordance with the approved Conservation Plan required in Recommendation 6.a.2 above to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;

2. Have obtained final approval for the necessary Zoning By-law Amendment required for the subject property, such Amendment to have come into full force and effect;

3. Provide a Heritage Lighting Plan that describes how the exterior of the heritage property will be sensitively illuminated to enhance its heritage character to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services and thereafter shall implement such Plan to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager Heritage Preservation Services;

4. Submit a Signage Plan to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;

5. Provide an Interpretation Plan for the subject property, to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services and thereafter shall implement such Plan to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;

c. That prior to the issuance of any permit for all or any part of the property 50-60 Eglinton Avenue West, including a heritage permit or a building permit, but excluding permits for repairs and maintenance and usual and minor works for the existing heritage buildings as are acceptable to the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, the owner shall:

1. Provide building permit drawings, including notes and specifications for the conservation and protective measures keyed to the approved Conservation Plan required in Recommendation 6.a.2 above, including a description of materials and finishes, to be prepared by the project architect and a qualified heritage consultant to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;

2. Provide a Letter of Credit, including provision for upwards indexing, in a form and amount and from a bank satisfactory to the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services to secure all work included in the approved Conservation Plan, and approved Interpretation Plan.

d. That prior to the release of the Letter of Credit required in Recommendation 1.c.2 above, the owner shall:

1. Provide a letter of substantial completion prepared and signed by a qualified heritage consultant confirming that the required conservation work and the required interpretive work has been completed in accordance with the Conservation Plan and Interpretation Plan and that an appropriate standard of conservation has been maintained, all to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;

2. Provide replacement Heritage Easement Agreement photographs to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.

7. City Council authorize the entering into of a Heritage Easement Agreement under Section 37 of the Ontario Heritage Act with the owner of the property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West in a form and content satisfactory to the City Solicitor and the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning.

8. City Council authorize the City Solicitor to introduce the necessary bill in Council authorizing the entering into of a Heritage Easement Agreement for the property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West.

# FINANCIAL IMPACT

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

# **DECISION HISTORY**

At its meeting of January 16, 2018, North York Community Council considered a Preliminary Report on Official Plan and Zoning Amendment applications to allow a 36storey mixed-use building, including a 2 to 3 storey base building, to be constructed on the subject properties at 50-60 Eglinton Avenue West. This construction entailed the demolition of 60 Eglinton Avenue West, and retention of the south and east façades of 50 Eglinton Avenue West. North York Community Council directed that a final report be scheduled following completion of the Midtown in Focus study.

http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2018.NY27.9

The owner appealed the official plan amendment and zoning by-law amendment applications to the LPAT, citing City Council's failure to make a decision within the prescribed time frames set out in the Planning Act, and a pre-hearing conference was scheduled to commence August 20, 2018.

On July 23, 2018, Council adopted the confidential recommendations of a report from the City Solicitor, accepting a settlement offer from the applicant dated July 13, 2018.

http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2018.CC44.40

On July 23, 2018, Council adopted Amendment No. 405 to the Official Plan for the Yonge Eglinton Secondary Plan, including the property located at 50 Eglinton Avenue Wes,t as identified on Map 21-10: Properties with Potential Cultural Heritage Value.

http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaltemHistory.do?item=2018.PG31.7

# BACKGROUND

#### Proposal

The development site at 50-60 Eglinton Avenue West consists of two existing structures: a Toronto Hydro-Electric substation, constructed in 1922 at the corner of Eglinton West and Duplex, and a 1960s addition to the west of this structure, at 60 Eglinton Avenue West. The proposed development comprises a four-storey podium and 32-storey tower for mixed-use development with residential space and commercial space, including both office and retail uses. Construction will entail the demolition of 60 Eglinton Avenue West, and the partial retention of 50 Eglinton Avenue West, comprising the south and east elevations along Eglinton Avenue West and Duplex Avenue. The south elevation will be retained in whole, with a return of the west elevation. The second storey of the east elevation will be retained in whole, while the ground floor will have four new bays installed below the existing second-storey window bays, to permit pedestrian access to an interior building walkway, forming a colonnade access through the east elevation to the south elevation, via the existing southern entrance. This proposal for the partial retention of 50 Eglinton Avenue West was prepared by Turner Fleischer Architects and Hariri Pontarini Architects and dated April 2019.

The proponent owns an abutting property to the west of this development, on which a second tower is proposed but not subject to this development application.

#### **Heritage Property**

The property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West was identified as a property of potential cultural heritage value in the Cultural Heritage Resource Assessment (CHRA) for the Midtown in Focus study. After further assessment, City staff have determined that 50 Eglinton Avenue West has cultural heritage value.

In brief, the property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West has design value as a well-crafted example of Edwardian Classicism applied to a hydro station from the interwar period designed for the Toronto Hydro-Electric System (THES). This structure exemplifies the style in the somber brick cladding with the stone detailing on the door and window surrounds, coping and cornice, with the latter incorporating a name band reading "Toronto Hydro-Electric System" on the principal (south) elevation, which confirms its associative value with this organization and its in-house design staff. This substation is the first built by the THES in North Toronto, and serves as an anchor at the northeast

corner of Eglinton and Duplex avenues, with a formal south entrance that belies the utilitarian nature of the building.

The Heritage Property Research and Evaluation Report is attached (Attachment 5). Attachment 6 contains the Statement of Significance (Reasons for Designation).

# **Adjacent Heritage Properties**

There are no heritage properties adjacent to the development site.

#### **Policy Framework**

The Planning Act and the associated Provincial Policy Statement guide development in the Province. The Act states that municipalities must have regard for matters of provincial interest. Section 2(d) specifically refers to "the conservation of features of significant architectural, cultural, historical, archaeological or scientific interest."

The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) issued under the authority of Section 3 of the Planning Act provides policy direction on matters of provincial interest related to land use planning and development. The PPS sets the policy foundation for regulating the development and use of land. Key objectives include: building strong communities; wise use and management of resources; and protecting public health and safety. The Planning Act requires that City Council's decisions affecting land use planning matters be consistent with" the Provincial Policy Statement.

Policy 2.6.1 of the PPS directs that "Significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved." Properties included on the City's Heritage Register are considered to be significant in this context. "Conserved" is defined in the PPS as "the identification, protection, use and/or management of built heritage resources in a manner that ensures their cultural heritage value or interest is retained under the Ontario Heritage Act."

Policy 2.6.3 states that "Planning authorities shall not permit development and site alteration on adjacent lands to protected heritage property except where the proposed development and site alteration has been evaluated and it has been demonstrated that the heritage attributes of the protected heritage property will be conserved."

The Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe, 2017 (the "Growth Plan") provides a strategic framework for managing growth in the Greater Golden Horseshoe region. Like other provincial plans, the Growth Plan builds upon the policy foundation provided by the PPS and provides more specific land use planning policies to address issues facing the Greater Golden Horseshoe region.

The policies of the Growth Plan take precedence over the policies of the PPS to the extent of any conflict, except where the relevant legislation provides otherwise. All decisions by Council affecting land use planning matters are required by the Planning Act, to conform, or not conflict, as the case may be, with the Growth Plan Policy 4.2.7.1 of the Growth Plan states that "Cultural Heritage Resources will be conserved in order

to foster a sense of place and benefit communities, particularly in strategic growth areas."

The City of Toronto's Official Plan provides the policy framework for heritage conservation in the City. The following Official Plan policies apply to the proposed alterations:

3.1.5.4: "Properties on the Heritage Register will be conserved and maintained consistent with the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada, as revised from time to time and adopted by Council."

3.1.5.5: "Proposed alterations, development, and/or public works on or adjacent to, a property on the Heritage Register will ensure that the integrity of the heritage property's cultural heritage value and attributes will be retained, prior to work commencing on the property and to the satisfaction of the City."

3.1.5.6: "The adaptive re-use of properties on the Heritage Register is encouraged for new uses permitted in the applicable Official Plan land use designation, consistent with the "Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada."

3.1.5.16: "Properties on the Heritage Register and publicly known archaeological sites and artifacts will be promoted through educational programs, museums, local celebrations and other programming opportunities."

3.1.5.26: "New construction on, or adjacent to, a property on the Heritage Register will be designed to conserve the cultural heritage values, attributes and character of that property and to mitigate visual and physical impact on it."

3.1.5.27:"Where it is supported by the cultural heritage values and attributes of a property on the Heritage Register, the conservation of whole or substantial portions of buildings, structures and landscapes on those properties is desirable and encouraged. The retention of faces alone is discouraged."

# The Standards and Guidelines

The Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada (Standards and Guidelines) is the official document guiding planning, stewardship and the conservation approach for all listed and designated heritage resources within the City of Toronto. The General Standards (1-9), Standards for Rehabilitation (10-12) and Standards for Restoration (13-14) apply to this project.

http://www.historicplaces.ca/media/18072/81468-parks-s+g-eng-web2.pdf

#### **Proposed Conservation Strategy**

Heritage Preservation Services has reviewed the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) and supplementary addenda, plans and elevations submitted in support of the application. The HIA finds that the proposed alterations and associated mitigation measures retain the integrity of the cultural heritage value, attributes and character of the site, as described in the statement of significance prepared by the HPS staff for 50 Eglinton Avenue West. Overall staff concur with this assessment and are supportive of the proposal.

#### **50 Eglinton Avenue West**

The south and east walls of the Toronto Hydro Vault Building (50 Eglinton Ave West) will be stabilized and retained in place with temporary bracing and integrated into the proposed new building, forming the outer walls of a colonnade along Eglinton Avenue West and Duplex Avenue, through which ground-floor interior commercial space will be accessed. The west and north walls of the building will be demolished, aside from a return of the west elevation from the Eglinton Avenue West elevation.

Elevations will be conserved in place with a retention system composed of exterior vertical steel trusses, extending the full height of the elevations. The trusses will be supported by the perimeter piling and shoring at the building face, and by caissons at the outer leg of the trusses. The below grade caissons will be coordinated and installed to avoid existing in ground services. Elevations will be fully supported by the retention trusses prior to any structural demolition taking place, and will be monitored throughout construction until they are fully supported by the new structure. Four new bays will be installed on the ground floor of the eastern elevation, oriented below and aligned with the four existing second-storey windows being retained. These new bays will convert the eastern elevation into a colonnade, providing pedestrian access to the interior of the building, and through the building via the existing southern entrance.

The proposed step-backs of the tower behind the retained elevations are 3.3 metres along Eglinton Avenue and 2.0 metres along Duplex Avenue to a height of four floors above the roof of the heritage building. The plain curtain wall of the base building above the substation building is subordinate and establishes a neutral architectural transition between the volume of the Eglinton Substation and the contemporary tower behind. The western portion of the south elevation of the tower is 1.5 metres proud of this step-back along 2.5 metres above the west side of the heritage building. This face increases to 4.5 metre at the fifth floor and at the seventh floor becomes a flush surface at 1.8 metre back from the face of the Heritage façade below. These step-backs will be sufficient to conserve the scale form and massing of the heritage property.

The metal doors at the southern entrance to 50 Eglinton Avenue West are proposed to be removed and fixed on an interior wall within the colonnade, to retain these features on site and maintain their visibility from the public realm, without impeding pedestrian circulation on the interior of the colonnade wall.

#### **Conservation Plan**

Should Council approve the proposed conservation strategy for the property at 50-60 Eglinton Avenue West, the applicant should be required to submit a Conservation Plan in concordance with the scope of work described in the Heritage Impact Assessment prepared by a qualified heritage professional to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services. The Conservation Plan should detail all of the recommended interventions and conservation work proposed for 50 Eglinton Avenue West including: any recommended restoration work; required repair work to the exterior and interior walls and roof being retained; a detailed plan describing how the heritage building will be protected during construction; a schedule of short and long-term maintenance requirements and estimated costs for all conservation work.

#### Interpretation and Lighting Plan

Should Council approve the proposed conservation strategy, prior to the issuance of permits for the proposed development the applicant should be required to submit a lighting plan and an interpretation plan to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager of Heritage Preservation Services. This plan should provide details of how the exterior of 50 Eglinton Avenue West will be lit such that its unique heritage character is highlighted. The interpretation plan should serve to communicate the cultural heritage values of the property to users and visitors of the building.

#### Signage Plan

Should Council approve the proposed conservation strategy, prior to the issuance of permits for the proposed development the applicant should be required to submit a Signage Plan to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.

#### Heritage Easement Agreement

Should Council approve the proposed conservation strategy, staff are recommending that the owner enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement to secure the long-term protection of the heritage property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West.

# CONCLUSION

Staff are supportive of the proposal to alter the subject heritage property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West to allow for the construction of a tower and infill podium through conservation of the east and west elevations of the building to the depth of the colonnade and interior pedestrian walkway. By doing so, the effects of the proposed development on the heritage property are mitigated by the legibility of the substation as a prominent corner building. Staff are supportive of the approach within this framework of conservation objectives at development site and are of the opinion that the proposal has been designed to conserve the cultural heritage values, attributes and character of on-site heritage property. Following research and evaluation according to Regulation 9/06, it has been determined that the property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West has design, associative and contextual value. The Eglinton Substation is a well-crafted example of a hydro substation from the interwar era with an Edwardian Classical design that is attributed to architect A. E. Salisbury of the Toronto Hydro-Electric System. The property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West is historically associated with the Toronto Hydro-Electric System that, following its founding in 1911, provided electrical service to the expanding City of Toronto and located substations at important service areas, including North Toronto. Contextually, with its scale, appearance and vintage, and in its highly visible location anchoring the corner of Eglinton and Duplex avenues near Yonge Street, the Eglinton Substation is a local landmark in North Toronto.

The Statement of Significance (Attachment 6) for 50 Eglinton Avenue West comprises the Reasons for Designation, which is the Public Notice of Intention to Designate and will be advertised on the City of Toronto's web-site in accordance with the City of Toronto Act provision and served on the Ontario Heritage Trust according to the provisions of the Ontario Heritage Act.

CONTACT

Guy Zimmerman Heritage Planner, Heritage Preservation Services Urban Design, City Planning Tel: 416-338-1094; Fax 416-392-1973 Guy.Zimmerman@Toronto.ca

# SIGNATURE

Mary L. MacDonald, MA, CAHP Senior Manager, Heritage Preservation Services Urban Design, City Planning Tel: 416-338-1079; Fax: 416-392-1973 Mary.MacDonald@toronto.ca Attachment No. 1 - Location Plan Attachment No. 2 - Photographs Attachment No. 3 - Rendered Views Attachment No. 4 - Architectural Plans & Drawings Attachment No. 5 - Heritage Property Research and Evaluation Report - 50 Eglinton Avenue East

Attachment No. 6 - Statement of Significance (Reasons for Designation) - 50 Eglinton Avenue East

#### LOCATION PLAN

This location map is for information purposes only and is oriented with North at the top. The red hatched lines mark the approximate boundaries of the subject property at 50-60 Eglinton Street West



# LOCATION PLAN

# ATTACHMENT 1



Birdseye view of the development site, which is indicated by the arrow. The exact boundaries of the site are not shown.

# PHOTOGRAPHS

#### ATTACHMENT 2



50 Eglinton Avenue West, 1925 (Source: City of Toronto Archives) - South Elevation



50 Eglinton Avenue West, 2016 (Source: Google) - View from South-east

# PHOTOGRAPHS

# ATTACHMENT 2



50 Eglinton Avenue West (Source: ERA Architects) - South Elevation (current)



50 Eglinton Avenue West (Source: ERA Architects) East Elevation (current)

# PHOTOGRAPHS

# ATTACHMENT 2



60 Eglinton Avenue West (Source: ERA Architect) - South Elevation (current)

# RENDERED VIEWS

#### **ATTACHMENT 3**



Proposed South (left) and East (right) Heritage Elevations



View looking north east

Proposed East Elevation View

# **RENDERED VIEWS**

#### **ATTACHMENT 3**



View looking south west

# Proposed East Elevation View



View from Eglinton and Duplex looking north east

Proposed View of South east corner



Ground Floor



Second Floor

**ATTACHMENT 4** 



Ground Floor (Detail at South-East Corner)

# ATTACHMENT 4



Proposed overall view from the south (tower to the right)



Proposed overall view from the east



Proposed East-West Cross Section Through Development (tower to the right)



Proposed North-South Cross Section Through Development

# ATTACHMENT 5

# HERITAGE PROPERTY RESEARCH AND EVALUATION REPORT



#### EGLINTON SUBSTATION 50 EGLINTON AVENUE WEST, TORONTO

Prepared by:

Heritage Preservation Services City Planning Division City of Toronto

January 2019

# 1. DESCRIPTION



Cover: aerial photograph (<u>www.bing.com/maps</u>); above: principal (south) elevation, 50 Eglinton Avenue West (Heritage Preservation Services, 2018)

50 Eglinton Avenue West: Eglinton Substation		
ADDRESS	50 Eglinton Avenue West (northwest corner	
	of Duplex Avenue)	
WARD	Ward 8 (Eglinton Lawrence)	
LEGAL DESCRIPTION	Plan 524E, Lots 6 and 7	
NEIGHBOURHOOD/COMMUNITY	Yonge-Eglinton (part of North Toronto)	
HISTORICAL NAME	Eglinton Substation <sup>1</sup>	
CONSTRUCTION DATE	1922	
ORIGINAL OWNER	Toronto Hydro-Electric System	
ORIGINAL USE	Industrial	
CURRENT USE*	Not applicable	
	* This does not refer to permitted use(s) as	
	defined by the Zoning By-law	
ARCHITECT/BUILDER/DESIGNER	A.E. Salisbury, architect	
DESIGN/CONSTRUCTION/MATERIALS	Brick cladding with brick, stone and wood detailing	
ARCHITECTURAL STYLE	See Section 2	
ADDITIONS/ALTERATIONS	See Section 2	
CRITERIA	Design/Physical, Historical/Associative &	
	Contextual	
HERITAGE STATUS	Cultural Heritage Evaluation	
RECORDER	Heritage Preservation Services:	
	Kathryn Anderson	
REPORT DATE	January 2019	

<sup>1</sup> It was originally known as the North Toronto Hydro-Electric Substation until the Glengrove Substation (1930) opened in the same community

# 2. BACKGROUND

This research and evaluation report describes the history, architecture and context of the property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West, and applies evaluation criteria to determine whether it merits inclusion on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register and designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act. The conclusions of the research and evaluation are found in Section 4 (Summary).

#### i. HISTORICAL TIMELINE

Key Date	Historical Event
1798	Lot 1, Concession 1, West of Yonge Street is surveyed north of
	present-day Eglinton Avenue West
1851	A community emerges around the cross-roads of Yonge Street
	and Eglinton Avenue (Image 2a)
1860	The development of "Eglington" is depicted on Tremaine's map
	and the former farm lot northwest of Eglinton Avenue and Yonge
	Street has been subdivided (Image 2b)
1889	Eglinton amalgamates with the adjoining community of Davisville
	as the Village of North Toronto; a year later, the Town of North
	Toronto (composed of Eglinton, Davisville and Bedford Park) is
1890	incorporated On the first Goad's Atlas illustrating North Toronto, the subject
1090	property remains undeveloped (Image 2c)
1903	Goad's Atlas is revised and shows the subdivision of the subject
1905	property under Plan 524E, with Lot 7 on the northwest corner of
	the Duplex Avenue (Image 2d)
1911	The Toronto Hydro-Electric System begins service
1912	The City of Toronto annexes North Toronto
1921 Nov	The Toronto Transportation Commission (forerunner to today's
	Toronto Transit Commission or TTC) is created and purchases
	two lots on Eglinton Avenue West, west of Duplex Avenue from
	the executors of the Croft Estate
1922	An archival photograph shows the rural status of Eglinton
	Avenue, west of Yonge Street (Image 3a)
1922 July	Building Permit 61779 is issued for the Toronto Hydro-Electric
	Substation on Eglinton Avenue <sup>2</sup>
1922 Sept	According to the tax assessment rolls, the Toronto
	Transportation Commission retains two lots on the northwest
4000 N	corner of Eglinton and Duplex avenues, which stand vacant
1922 Nov	The Toronto Transportation Commission transfers the latter
1000 Cart	properties to the City of Toronto
1923 Sept	On the next tax assessment roll, the substation is recorded and
1924	valued at \$25,000
1924	The City Directory for 1924 (with information dating to the previous year) identifies the unnumbered "North Toronto Hydro-

<sup>2</sup> The building permit does not survive, but it is recorded on an index at City of Toronto Archives

	Electric Substation" on Eglinton, west of Yonge, which is illustrated on the last update to Goad's Atlas (Image 2e)
1925	The Eglinton Substation is shown in an archival photograph (Image 3b), as well as a follow-up image in 1930 (Image 3c)
1938	Underwriters' Survey Bureau Atlas illustrates the subject property (Image 2f)
1955	With the plans prepared in 1955, the west addition to the property comprising the Eglinton Control Centre is shown in archival photographs in 1962 (Image 3d) and 1969 (Image 3e)
1981	An archival image illustrates the subject property (Image 3f)
2016	The property at 50 Eglinton Avenue is identified for its potential cultural heritage value in the Midtown in Focus Area Study

#### ii. HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

Yonge-Eglinton Neighbourhood and North Toronto:

The subject property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West is in the Toronto neighbourhood of Yonge-Eglinton, which is part of the historic community of North Toronto. Its origins date to the late 18th century when the expansive area north of the Town of York (Toronto) was surveyed into farm lots. The opening of Yonge Street to connect York with the northern hinterland led to the development of cross-roads communities along its length, including one adjoining present-day Eglinton Avenue where, in 1833, John Montgomery built the landmark tavern that was a pivotal location in the Rebellion of 1837. Historical atlases (including Tremaine's Atlas of 1860, with an extract attached as Image 2b) trace the development of the unincorporated Village of Eglinton, but misspell its name as "Eglington," an error that continued throughout most of the 19th century.<sup>3</sup> In 1889, the Village of North Toronto was created through the amalgamation of Eglinton and the neighbouring hamlet of Davisville. After the municipal boundaries were expanded to include Bedford Park, the Town of North Toronto was incorporated in 1890. The steady commercial and residential development of the area continued in the late 19th century with the improved transportation links to Toronto via the street railway and (briefly) the Belt Line commuter railway, leading to the annexation of North Toronto by the City of Toronto in 1912.

#### 50 Eglinton Avenue West:

The subject property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West stands on former farmland that was subdivided in the late 19th century, but remained vacant until the 1920s. Its development followed the creation in 1911 of the publicly-owned Toronto Hydro-Electric System. Formed to oversee the transmission and extension of reliable electrical power from Niagara Falls to the city, the Toronto Hydro-Electric System took over various

<sup>3</sup> Various sources suggest that the community was named for Scotland's Earl of Eglinton, who was connected to Canada through his participation in the War of 1812. Brown writes that, "in the 1820s, a clerical error changed it [from Eglinton] to "Eglington" – a mistake that lasted until around 1880, even in business directories and municipal documents," 66

private electrical companies as their contracts with the municipality expired.<sup>4</sup> In a similar move and as part of the amalgamation and expansion of services, in 1921, the Toronto Transportation Commission (forerunner to today's Toronto Transit Commission or TTC) was established by the City of Toronto to run electric transit lines, including those previously overseen by private enterprises. Among the latter was the Metropolitan Railway (afterward the Toronto and York Radial Railway) that served North Toronto via its Yonge Street route.

In 1921, while implementing its plans to extend streetcar service in North Toronto, the Toronto Transportation Commission acquired and reserved two lots on the northwest corner of Eglinton and Duplex avenues, one block west of Yonge Street. The next year (1922), the allotments were transferred to the City of Toronto where the municipally-owned Toronto Hydro-Electric System unveiled its new substation. According to archival sources, it was designed to "provide residential power and 550 volt traction power to the Metropolitan radial line on north Yonge Street and subsequent to the Toronto Transportation Commission's Yonge route and Eglinton Carhouse in the area."<sup>5</sup> Originally known as the North Toronto Substation, its name was changed in 1930 when a second power centre opened at Yonge and Glengrove between Eglinton and Lawrence avenues. Following the preparation of plans in 1955, the Eglinton Control Centre was built beside (west of) the substation at 60 Eglinton Avenue West.

Toronto Hydro-Electric System and Architect A. E. Salisbury:

The design of the Eglinton Substation is attributed to Toronto architect A. E. (Arthur Edward) Salisbury (1887-1955) in his capacity as a designer for the Toronto Hydro-Electric System where, beginning in 1925, he served for more than 30 years as the Supervisor of Architecture for the entity. Salisbury received his architectural training with local firms, including G. M. Miller and Company. During World War I, he worked with his father, architect Henry E. Salisbury (who had experience in the City Architect's office prior to establishing a private practice) before joining the privately-run Toronto Electric Light Company as a draftsman. In 1917, when the latter enterprise amalgamated with the new Toronto Hydro-Electric System, Salisbury was initially tasked with overseeing additions and alterations to existing substations, including the High Level Substation (1912) at 290 Macpherson Avenue and the Carlaw Substation (1916) at 369 Carlaw Avenue, both of which are recognized on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.

In 1923, Salisbury prepared the plans for the Danforth Avenue Substation (completed 1926) and highlighted its location on a major thoroughfare in an expansive design with classical detailing and brick and stone finishes. The Eglinton Substation was a scaled-down version of the latter edifice. According to the Electrical News and Engineering magazine, in 1930 it was among the 18 substations in service in Toronto, many of which dated to Salisbury's service with the corporation. The latter group included the Glengrove Substation (1930) that Salisbury designed for the North Toronto

<sup>4</sup> A detailed history of the development of Toronto's hydro system is found in *Bright Lights, Big City*, produced as part of an exhibition by the City of Toronto Archives in 1991

<sup>5</sup> City of Toronto Archives, Fonds 16 Item 3975. The Eglinton Carhouse (1922) opened on the southwest corner of Yonge and Eglinton

neighbourhood and represented a change in the Toronto Hydro-Electric System's standard design approach with its rugged stone cladding and Neo-Gothic styling. Following World War II, under Salisbury's supervision the Toronto Hydro-Electric System created substations that complemented the city's expanding residential neighbourhoods in scale and appearance, including those displaying the bungalow style at 386 Eglinton Avenue East in North Toronto and 640 Millwood Road in Leaside. In 1955 and immediately prior to his untimely death, the Eglinton Control Centre at 60 Eglinton Avenue, directly west of the subject building, was Salisbury's last design for the Toronto Hydro-Electric System.

#### iii. ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

Current photographs of the property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West are found on the cover and in Sections 2 and 6 of this report. The Eglinton Substation displays architectural features associated with the Edwardian Classical style, which was introduced in the early 1900s during the brief reign of Edward VII but, with its traditional and familiar approach to design and materials, resonated well into the 20th century. Edwardian Classicism is identified with the use of predominantly red brick cladding with brick, stone and wood detailing and, particularly, the application of decorative elements linked to classical architecture.

The architectural appearance of the Eglinton Substation was part of the aesthetic reflected in the Toronto Hydro-Electric System's facilities built in the 1920s following the entity's amalgamation with the Toronto Electric Light Company (the largest of the private enterprises that had previously delivered electrical power to the city) and the development of a common approach to design.

The Eglinton Substation has a two-storey rectangular-shaped plan with red brick cladding and brick, stone and wood detailing. Occupying a sloped site, the base is higher at the south end and has stone base courses and flat-headed window openings on the east and north elevations. Along the flat roofline, the detailing extends across the south, east and north elevations and incorporates stone coping and, beneath a parapet at the south end, a stone cornice incorporating the name "Toronto Hydro-Electric System." The principal (south) elevation is symmetrically organized into three bays where the main entrance is centred in the first (ground) floor. The classicallydetailed entrance surround with an entablature, mouldings and brackets contains a pair of wood doors with glazing. On either side of the entrance, single flat-headed window openings are set in stone surrounds and have multi-paned sash windows. These openings are repeated in the upper part of the wall where a tripartite window is flanked by single openings. The east side elevation facing Duplex Avenue and the rear (north) elevation that is viewed from the latter street contain flat-headed openings with stone detailing. The west side elevation adjoins the Eglinton Control Centre at 60 Eglinton Avenue.

# iv. CONTEXT

The location map (Image 1) shows the subject property anchoring the northwest corner of Eglinton Avenue West and Duplex Avenue. It is adjoined on the west by the Eglinton Control Centre, which is also viewed from both streets. Commercial properties are

found in both directions on Eglinton Avenue West while Duplex Avenue leads into the residential neighbourhood to the north.

Archival photographs documenting the area indicate that by the interwar era of the 20th century the major streets contained low-rise public and commercial buildings that shared a similar scale and design aesthetic to the Eglinton Substation, including the Dominion Bank that formerly anchored the northeast corner of Yonge and Eglinton.<sup>6</sup> With the removal of most of the earlier buildings of the same scale and vintage, as well as its setting at the corner of Eglinton and Duplex near Yonge Street, the Eglinton Substation remains a local landmark in the North Toronto neighbourhood.

# 3. EVALUATION CHECKLIST

The following evaluation applies Ontario Regulation 9/06 made under the Ontario Heritage Act: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest. While the criteria are prescribed for municipal designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, the City of Toronto uses it when assessing properties for inclusion on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties. The evaluation table is marked "N/A" if the criterion is "not applicable" to the property or X if it is applicable, with explanatory text below.

Design or Physical Value	
i. rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type,	Х
expression, material or construction method	
ii. displays high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit	Х
iii. demonstrates high degree of scientific or technical achievement	N/A

The property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West has design value as a well-crafted example of Edwardian Classicism applied to a hydro substation from the interwar period that was custom-designed for the Toronto Hydro-Electric System. As the most popular style of architecture for most building types in the early decades of the 20th century, Eglinton Substation exemplifies the style in the somber brick cladding with the stone detailing on the door and window surrounds, coping and cornice, with the latter incorporating a name band reading "Toronto Hydro-Electric System" on the principal (south) elevation.

Historical or Associative Value	
, , , , , , , , ,	Х
or institution that is significant to a community	
ii. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an	N/A
understanding of a community or culture	
iii. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder,	N/A
designer or theorist who is significant to a community	

The associative value of the Eglinton Substation is through its links to the beginnings of the Toronto Hydro-Electric System (THES), which began operations in 1911 as a public company designed to deliver electric power from Niagara Falls in the expanding city, a

<sup>6</sup> As seen in the 1930 archival image available on the City of Toronto Archives web site under Fonds 1231, Item 1630

role previously undertaken by private enterprises. As a new entity, the THES employed in-house design staff, principally A. E. Salisbury who first updated existing substations across the city before presenting a template for new buildings that shared a similar classically-inspired design aesthetic, with the Eglinton Substation amongst the earliest examples. The building was the first substation opened by the Toronto Hydro-Electric System in North Toronto and powered the expanded electric street railway, the existing radial railway and the new Eglinton Carhouse under the direction of the recently founded Toronto Transportation Commission (forerunner to today's Toronto Transit Commission or TTC). The Eglinton Substation pre-dated the Glengrove Substation (1930) on Yonge Street, north of Eglinton Avenue, another institutional landmark in North Toronto that is recognized on the City's Heritage Register.

Contextual Value	
i. important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area	N/A
ii. physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings	Х
iii. landmark	Х

Contextually, the property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West anchors the northwest corner of Eglinton and Duplex avenues, one block west of Yonge Street where it is a highly visible feature with its location, vintage and appearance. Physically, functionally, visually and historically linked to its setting, the Eglinton Substation stands as an institutional landmark in North Toronto.

#### 4. SUMMARY

Following research and evaluation according to Regulation 9/06, it has been determined that the property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West has design, associative and contextual value. The Eglinton Substation is a well-crafted example of a hydro substation from the interwar era with an Edwardian Classical design that is attributed to architect A. E. Salisbury of the Toronto Hydro-Electric System. The property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West is historically associated with the Toronto Hydro-Electric System that, following its founding in 1911, provided electrical service to the expanding City of Toronto and located substations at important service areas, including North Toronto. Contextually, with its scale, appearance and vintage, and in its highly visible location anchoring the corner of Eglinton and Duplex avenues near Yonge Street, the Eglinton Substation is a local landmark in North Toronto.

# 5. SOURCES

Archival Sources:

- Abstract Index of Deeds, Plan 542E, Lot 7
- Archival maps and atlases, <u>http://oldtorontomaps.blogspot.com/p/index-of-maps.html</u> and City of Toronto Archives
- Archival photographs, City of Toronto Archives, Toronto Public Library and <u>https://www.blogto.com/city/2013/11/what\_eglinton\_avenue\_used\_to\_look\_like\_in\_t\_oronto/</u> (individual citations in Section 6)
- Assessment Rolls, City of Toronto, Ward 3, Division 9, 1922 ff.
- Building Permit 61779, July 12, 1922
- Building Records, City of Toronto, Toronto and East York
- City of Toronto Directories, 1921-1924
- Goad's Atlases, 1884-1924, Volume 2
- Underwriters' Survey Bureau Atlas, 1938

Secondary Sources:

- Ashworth, Edward M., Toronto Hydro Recollections, 1955
- Bright Lights, Big City, City of Toronto Archives, 1991
- Brown, Ron, Toronto's Lost Villages, 1997
- "Eglinton-Pears Park Walk," North Toronto Historical Society, revised 1984
- Maitland, Leslie, Jacqueline Hucker and Shannon Ricketts, A Guide to Canadian Architectural Styles, 1992
- Myrvold, Barbara, North York in Pictures, 1979
- Obituary, Albert Edward Salisbury, Toronto Star, June 13, 1955, 35
- Ritchie, Don, North Toronto, 1992

# 6. IMAGES

Maps and atlases are followed by other archival images and current photographs. The arrows mark the location of the property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West. All maps are oriented with north on the top unless indicated in the captions.



1. Location Map, 50 Eglinton Avenue West: City of Toronto Property Data Map.



2a. Browne's Map of York Township, 1851; and, 2b. Tremaine's Map, 1860





2e. Goad's Atlas, Vol. 3, 1924; 2f. Underwriters' Survey Bureau Atlas, 1938

2. Archival Maps and Atlases, 50 Eglinton Avenue West: maps and atlases, 1851-1924, <u>http://oldtorontomaps.blogspot.ca/p/index-of-maps.html</u>, and 1934, City of Toronto Archives.



3a. Eglinton Avenue, west of Yonge, 1922; 3b. Eglinton Substation, 1925



3c. Eglinton Avenue, west to Duplex Avenue, 1930; 3d. 50 Eglinton, 1962



3e. Aerial, Yonge and Eglinton, 1969; 3f. 50 Eglinton, 1981

3. Archival Photographs, 50 Eglinton Avenue West: City of Toronto Archives, Fonds 1244, Item 508 (1922), Fonds 26, Item 3975 (1925), Fonds 1231, Item 1646 (1930) and Fonds 1257, Item 1057 (1962); Toronto Public Library, Item 115 (1981); and, <a href="https://www.blogto.com/city/2013/11/what\_eglinton\_avenue\_used\_to\_look\_like\_in\_toro\_nto/">https://www.blogto.com/city/2013/11/what\_eglinton\_avenue\_used\_to\_look\_like\_in\_toro\_nto/</a> (1969)



4a. Principal (left) and east side elevations



4b. East (left) and north elevations (with Eglinton Control Centre on the right)



4c. south elevation (right) and Eglinton Control Centre at 60 Eglinton Avenue West (left)

4. Current Photographs, 50 Eglinton Avenue West, 2018: Heritage Preservation Services.

STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE: 50 EGLINTON AVENUE WEST (REASONS FOR DESIGNATION)

The property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West is worthy of inclusion on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register and designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for its cultural heritage value. It meets Ontario Regulation 9/06, the provincial criteria prescribed for municipal designation under all three categories of design, associative and contextual value.

#### Description

The property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West is located on the northwest corner of Duplex Avenue, west of Yonge Street in the Yonge-Eglinton neighbourhood and the historic community of North Toronto. It contains the building known historically as the Eglinton Substation, which was constructed in 1922 by the Toronto Hydro-Electric System to provide power for the extension of the electric street railway, the existing radial railway on Yonge Street, and the Eglinton Carhouse (1922, and no longer extant) at the southwest corner of Yonge and Eglinton.

In 2017, the property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West was identified for its potential cultural heritage value in the Midtown in Focus: Cultural Heritage Resource Assessment (2018).

#### **Statement of Cultural Heritage Value**

The property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West has design value as a well-crafted example of Edwardian Classicism applied to a hydro substation from the interwar period that was custom-designed for the Toronto Hydro-Electric System. As the most popular style of architecture for most building types in the early decades of the 20th century, Eglinton Substation exemplifies the style in the somber brick cladding with the stone detailing on the door and window surrounds, coping and cornice, with the latter incorporating a name band reading "Toronto Hydro-Electric System" on the principal (south) elevation.

The associative value of the Eglinton Substation is through its links to the beginnings of the Toronto Hydro-Electric System (THES), which began operations in 1911 as a public company designed to deliver electric power from Niagara Falls in the expanding city, a role previously undertaken by private enterprises. As a new entity, the THES employed in-house design staff, principally A. E. Salisbury who first updated existing substations across the city before presenting a template for new buildings that shared a similar classically-inspired design aesthetic, with the Eglinton Substation amongst the earliest examples. The building was the first substation opened by the Toronto Hydro-Electric System in North Toronto and powered the expanded electric street railway, the existing radial railway and the new Eglinton Carhouse under the direction of the recently founded Toronto Transportation Commission (forerunner to today's Toronto Transit Commission or TTC). The Eglinton Substation pre-dated the Glengrove Substation (1930) on Yonge Street, north of Eglinton Avenue, another institutional landmark in North Toronto that is recognized on the City's Heritage Register.

Contextually, the property at 50 Eglinton Avenue West anchors the northwest corner of Eglinton and Duplex avenues, one block west of Yonge Street where it is a highly visible feature with its location, vintage and appearance. Physically, functionally, visually and

historically linked to its setting, the Eglinton Substation stands as an institutional landmark in North Toronto.

#### Heritage Attributes

The heritage attributes of the Eglinton Substation at 50 Eglinton Avenue West are:

- The placement, setback and orientation of the building on the northwest corner of Duplex Avenue
- The scale, form and massing of the building, which rises two extended stories on the sloped site with the raised base that is higher at the south end and has stone band courses and flat-headed window openings on the south, east and north elevations
- The materials, with the red brick cladding and the brick, stone and wood detailing
- The flat roofline with the stone coping and stone cornice that extends from the south elevation to the west and north elevations and incorporates a name band reading "Toronto Hydro-Electric System" on the south end
- The principal (south) elevation, which is symmetrically organized into three bays with the central entrance in the first (ground) floor that is flanked and surmounted by flatheaded openings with stone surrounds and multi-paned windows
- The main (south) entrance, where the pair of wood doors with glazing is placed in the classically-detailed surround with the entablature, mouldings and brackets
- The east side elevation facing Duplex Avenue and the rear (north) elevation (the latter is viewed from Duplex Avenue), which continue the pattern of symmetrically-placed flat-headed window openings with stone surrounds
- The west elevation is concealed by the adjoining building at 60 Eglinton Avenue West.