

Update on Pedestrian Scale Street Lighting

Date: November 18, 2021
To: Infrastructure and Environment Committee
From: General Manager, Transportation Services
Wards: All

SUMMARY

The purpose of this report is to provide the Infrastructure and Environment Committee with information as requested, pertaining to the City's existing street lighting service agreement with Toronto Hydro Corporation ("Toronto Hydro"), addressing street lighting standards, accessibility and safety specifically in the context of pedestrian scale lighting.

This report provides a strategy to address the concerns raised for adding and replacing pedestrian-scale lighting where the sidewalks are dark at night and require additional lighting and for adding new lighting standards.

It is anticipated that any changes proposed may require amendments to the existing Street and Expressway Lighting Agreement with Toronto Hydro.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The General Manager, Transportation Services recommends that:

1. City Council direct the General Manager, Transportation Services to undertake an assessment of the general condition of existing pedestrian scale lighting assets and to include funding for staff oversight and third party consulting costs of \$1.0M within the 2022 Operating Budget submission for Transportation Services.
2. City Council authorize the General Manager, Transportation Services to negotiate the necessary amendments to the existing Street and Expressway Lighting Agreement with Toronto Hydro to include lighting styles, any required lighting asset standards, and any related funding impacts.
3. City Council direct the General Manager, Transportation Services to report back on the comprehensive state-of-good-repair plan for existing pedestrian scale lighting and ten year plan for new pedestrian scale lighting as part of the 2023 Budget process.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

Funding of \$1.0 M is required in 2022 for three staff positions and third party consultant costs to undertake an assessment for pedestrian scale lighting street lighting assets which will be included for consideration as part of the 2022 Operating Budget submission for Transportation Services.

The Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

DECISION HISTORY

At its meeting of July 5, 2021, the Infrastructure and Environment Committee considered report IE23.21, staff were directed to report back on the current agreement with Toronto Hydro, including information on the current status of the agreement, expiry or renewal date, and options for adding new lighting standards to those approved for use and installation by Toronto Hydro. Additionally, that this report include a policy for adding and replacing pedestrian-scale lighting where the sidewalks are dark at night and require additional lighting.

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2021.IE23.21>

COMMENTS

Current Agreement with Toronto Hydro

Effective January 1, 2006, the City sold its street and expressway lighting assets to Toronto Hydro. At that time, the parties also entered into a 30-year Street Lighting and Expressway Service Agreement (the "Service Agreement"), whereby Toronto Hydro became the City's street and expressway lighting service provider. The agreement term is from January 1, 2006 - December 31, 2035.

Subject to certain exceptions (e.g. BIA Lighting, Park Lighting, TTC lighting and public square lighting assets), the Service Agreement requires Toronto Hydro to maintain street and expressway lighting which either lights up the roadway, or both the roadway and sidewalks. As such, in addition to the expressly identified exceptions, the City has maintained responsibility for those lighting assets that only illuminate the sidewalk ("pedestrian scale lighting"). Where the assets are City-owned, service and maintenance has been undertaken on a case-by-case basis by Toronto Hydro for additional "special service" fees under the Service Agreement.

The Policy to Achieve Safe Street Lighting Levels

The City of Toronto requires all new street lighting designs to meet the illumination levels outlined in the North American Illumination Engineering Society (IES) standard known as Recommended Practice RP-8. This is a standard across municipalities in North America. All capital projects, developments, spot improvements, and other

upgrades are designed to meet these levels. Street lighting within the City is maintained by Toronto Hydro, at the RP-8 standard level as specified in the Street and Expressway Lighting (SEL) Service Agreement.

Toronto Hydro performs assessments regularly through requests received from the public and City Councillors. These assessments determine if an area meets or fails RP-8. If the area fails, a new street lighting design is created and construction is undertaken based on existing projects and available budget established as per the Service Agreement.

It is important to note that regular assessments performed by Toronto Hydro for roadway lighting do not include pedestrian scale lighting. Further, City Transportation Services does not currently have the necessary internal staff complement, nor special skillset resources to undertake this work. To date, the City has requested Toronto Hydro to maintain these particular assets as a "Special Service" which requires payment of an additional fee. The SEL Service Agreement provides that Special Services include, among other matters, services provided by Toronto Hydro, at the City's request, to maintain or repair a street lighting asset that isn't owned or subsequently acquired by Toronto Hydro under that agreement.

Proposed Strategy for Maintenance of Pedestrian Scale Lighting

In order to better anticipate the scope of future lighting and maintenance requirements for lighting assets that are not owned by Toronto Hydro, City Transportation Services has initiated an asset inventory count for pedestrian scale lighting and other lighting assets.

Following completion of this count and in consideration of the magnitude of the pedestrian scale lighting system, both internal and external staff resources will be required to undertake a fulsome Condition Assessment. A Condition Assessment will be undertaken for the purpose of addressing asset safety, accessibility, and lighting sufficiency issues. This work will also help staff to determine what efficiencies may be appropriate for future maintenance of City lighting assets. In the meantime, these lighting issues are being resolved on a case by case basis.

Once the above-noted work has been completed in respect of these lighting assets that are not owned by Toronto Hydro, City staff will report back on the results, with recommendations relating to street lighting service and maintenance solutions along with related budgetary impacts. Options to be considered will include how service and maintenance of these assets should be undertaken, such as potentially through Toronto Hydro or other third-party providers; and whether or not the City should maintain ownership of pedestrian scale lighting assets or whether they should be sold to Toronto Hydro. Each of the options will be reviewed in terms of the cost and anticipated benefit to inform the preferred recommendation.

Proposed Strategy for Adding New Lighting Standards

In parallel with the above-noted investigations, Transportation Services is currently undertaking additional work to review and update the City's palette for both street and

pedestrian scale lighting, and is consulting with Toronto Hydro (in respect of assets it currently owns) and other stakeholders (such as BIAs, and Waterfront Toronto) for these purposes. This work involves a careful review of safety and accessibility, and other pertinent lighting issues for both existing lighting assets and new installations, and also takes into account unique street light types required for heritage parts of the City.

There are currently more than 40 different styles of lighting which exist across the City, including traditional, decorative, heritage and LED fixtures. However, some of these styles are no longer available, making replacement and maintenance challenging. Toronto Hydro always attempts to substitute like-for-like, however, where older standards are no longer available, those styles are replaced to ensure the continuation of providing safe public roadway lighting levels that meet RP8 requirements. New decorative lighting may be available for areas of the City as identified by City staff, but some changes may require additional funding.

Once staff have negotiated new lighting styles, any required lighting asset standards, and any related funding impacts, it is recommended that staff report back on any necessary amendments required to the SEL service agreement.

Need for a Comprehensive State-of-Good Repair (SOGR) Plan

To date, Transportation Services staff have only been coordinating repairs to pedestrian scale lighting as they occur with Toronto Hydro. As Toronto Hydro has not assumed ownership, there currently is no SOGR plan for capital expenditure related to pedestrian scale lighting as there is with respect to the full roadway lighting. Once the asset assessment has been conducted for the pedestrian scale lighting, Transportation Services staff will develop a long-term capital plan, starting with submittals in the 2023 Transportation Services budget for consideration.

CONTACT

Roger Browne, M.A.Sc., P.Eng.
Director, Traffic Management Section
Transportation Services
E-Mail: Roger.Browne@Toronto.ca
Tel: 416-392-5372

SIGNATURE

Barbara Gray
General Manager, Transportation Services
Update on Pedestrian Scale Lighting