

THE CITY OF TORONTO

City Clerk's Division

Minutes of the Sustainability Roundtable Meeting No. 7

Wednesday, May 15, 2002

The Sustainability Roundtable met on Wednesday, May 15, 2002, Room 308/309, Metro Hall, 55 John Street, Toronto, commencing at 9:15 a.m.

Members and Alternates Present:

Councillor Jack Layton,	Chair and Sustainability Advocate
Dr. Sheela Basrur,	Medical Officer of Health
Michael Berger,	Coalition for a Green Recovery
Jean Blundell,	C.U.P.E. Local 79
John Cartwright,	Toronto and York Region Labour Council
Ellen Greenwood,	The Ontario Environment Industries Association
Philip Jessup,	Toronto Atmospheric Fund
Councillor Irene Jones,	Board of Health Representative
John J. Kiru,	Toronto Association of Business Improvement Areas
Mary MacDonald,	Urban Development Services
Brian MacKay,	Board of Health
Gerald McNeely,	The Catholic Children's Aid Society of Toronto
Katrina Miller,	Toronto Environmental Alliance
Fiona Nelson,	Alternate Member at Large
Councillor Jane Pitfield,	Works Committee Representative
John W. Ryall,	Toronto Catholic District School Board
Wayne Reeves,	Economic Development, Culture and Tourism
Barney Savage,	The United Way of Greater Toronto
Dr. Beth Savan,	Co-Chair and Community University Research Alliance (CURA) Project Promoting Sustainability
Dr. Fran Scott,	Toronto Public Health
Rosanna Scotti,	Strategic & Corporate Policy, CAO's Office
John Warren,	Works and Emergency Services

Others Present:

John Abela,	Economic Development, Culture and Tourism
Kehinde Bah,	Youth Cabinet
Arthur Beauregard,	Economic Development, Culture and Tourism
Roger Clarke,	Ministry of the Environment
Nick De Carlo,	Canadian Auto Workers
Wayne Chan,	Urban Development Services
Roger Clarke,	Ministry of the Environment
Sarah Climenhaga,	Black Creek Regional Transportation Management Association (TMA)
Rick Daigle,	Toronto District School Board
John Elvidge,	Strategic and Corporate Policy, CAO's Office
Melissa Felder,	CM Consulting
Peter Finestone,	International Council for Local Environmental Initiatives (ICLEI)
Christopher Gates,	Enbridge Commercial Services Inc.
Jonathan H. Gee,	Environment Canada
Sarah Gingrich,	Toronto Public Health
Effie Ginzberg,	Works and Emergency Services
Christopher G. Hill,	Enbridge Commercial Services Inc.
Robert Kerr,	International Council for Local Environmental Initiatives (ICLEI)
Lisa King,	Toronto and Region Conservation Authority
Eric Krause,	Works and Emergency Services
Harvey Low,	Community & Neighbourhood Services
Gerry Manley,	Toronto Taxi Industry
Don Miller,	City of Kitchener
Chris Murphy,	Toronto Hydro
Pamela Robertson,	Innis College, University of Toronto
Sandra Rodriguez,	Strategic & Corporate Policy, CAO's Office
Meg Shields,	Strategic & Corporate Policy, CAO's Office
R. V. (Bob) Smith,	Natural Resources Canada
Greg Suttor,	Community and Neighbourhood Services
Victor Tryl,	Finance
Judy Warn,	Executive Assistant to Councillor Gerry Altobello
May Wong,	Toronto Atmospheric Fund

7.1 Confirmation of Minutes

The minutes of the meeting of the Sustainability Roundtable held on April 8, 2002 were confirmed.

7.2 Greening Fleets: Best Practices, Overcoming Barriers and Sustainability

In response to a request from the Planning and Transportation Committee, to review recommendations with regards to Ambassador Taxicab purchasing Ultra Low Emission Vehicles, the Sustainability Roundtable set aside time at this meeting to share information on green fleet best practices. The Chair, with the assistance of SRT Support Staff, sent a letter of invitation to local and municipal fleet operators to participate in the discussion on implementing green fleet operations.

(1) Introductory Comments:

Dr. Sheela Basrur, Medical Officer of Health – Transportation, Air Quality and Health: The Need for Action

Dr. Sheela Basrur, Medical Officer of Health, made a presentation regarding the need for innovative pollution prevention strategies, including Green Fleets, in order to improve health and quality of life for the citizens of the City of Toronto.

The presentation is attached. Some key information included:

- Carcinogenic Effects
 - New evidence PM is associated with lung cancer
 - Long-term effects not well understood
 - Levels of some carcinogens in air are near or exceeding tolerable level
 - Diesel exhaust – probable human carcinogen
 - Transportation sector largest source
- Climate Change
 - Indirect health effects of greenhouse gas emissions
 - Increase in heat waves and smog alerts
 - electricity consumption
 - burning of fossil fuels
 - emission of all contaminants
 - health effects
- Conclusions – Opportunity
 - Vehicle emissions are impacting health and must be reduced
 - Criteria pollutants, carcinogens and climate change chemicals

Robert Kerr, International Council for Local Environment Initiatives – Green Fleets: A Guide to Increasing Efficiency and Reducing Emissions from Municipal Fleets

Robert Kerr made a presentation describing how municipalities can play an important role in reducing global warming and air pollution emissions, by adopting a Green Fleet policy.

The presentation presented the following points on what a municipality should do to green its fleet:

- Downsize vehicles
- Optimize vehicle use
- Incorporate efficiency into bid specifications
- Maximize efficiency
- Eliminate fleet vehicles
- Buy vehicles that run on alternative fuels
- Use transit, bike, walk, or telecommute
- Go with electric drive

(2) Success Stories: Overcoming Barriers

Effie Ginzberg, Fleet Services, City of Toronto

Effie Ginzberg made a presentation on the activities Fleet Services Division, City of Toronto, is undertaking to green its fleet.

The presentation presented the following points:

- Current technology under evaluation;
 - Halo spark plugs
 - 109 Natural gas vehicles (1 light duty pick up truck)
 - Hybrid vehicles (1 Honda Insight, 2 Toyota Prius)
 - Multiple Spark Discharge Units
 - 100% Bio Diesel Fuel
 - Fuel Cell evaluation (1 under review for future testing)
- Greening through Specifications
 - Fleet Services evaluates vehicle for environmental impact as an evaluation tool:
 - how much energy is consumed in the production of a specific vehicle
 - what is the USEPA/Environment Canada fuel consumption rating
 - base light duty vehicles are now powered by an efficient 6-cylinder engine
 - idle controllers on heavy diesel equipment
 - content of recycled materials
- Communications
 - Corporate Communications/Fleet Services developed “Greening our Fleet” identification placed on all LEV/ULEV vehicles
 - Honda Insight and Toyota Prius demonstrations at selected events
 - Information boards
 - Anti idling awareness campaign

- Next Steps (Fleet Transition Plan)
 - Subsidized by Toronto Atmospheric Fund
 - Establish clear goals towards reduced emissions
 - Establish realistic transition timeline based on current and emerging technology
 - Measure output
 - Best fit of technology to meet operational needs
 - Target completion date of January 1, 2003

Philip Jessup, Toronto Atmospheric Fund: Mandate, Partnerships and LEV/ULEV Vehicles

Philip Jessup, Executive Director, Toronto Atmospheric Fund, made a presentation regarding their mandate, partnerships and a study of available information regarding LEV/ULEV vehicles available in Canada.

The presentation presented the following points:

- Mandate
 - Reduce CO₂ emissions
 - Improve local air quality
 - Promote energy efficiency
 - Save money & create jobs
 - Advance new technology
- LEV Availability
 - 95 passenger car models certified from virtually all manufacturers in 2000
 - 65 light duty trucks certified from most manufacturers in 2000
 - Almost half the passenger car models now available in Canada are LEV
- ULEV Availability
 - ULEVs are 50% cleaner overall than the average new 2002 model year
 - 85 passenger cars are certified from 16 manufacturers in 2002
 - 8% of these passenger car models are manufactured by the Big Three
 - 56 light duty trucks and SUVs are certified from mostly the Big Three in 2001
- LEV/ULEV Caveats
 - Fuel efficiency and CO₂ emissions are not addressed by this certification program
 - Some vehicles available in the U.S. are not available in Canada
 - Emissions performance degrades from 50,000 – 100,000 miles
 - Some grades of gasoline degrade performance
 - Good maintenance required

- What is TAF doing?
 - Grant to Enbridge to assist taxis acquire OEM CNG vehicles
 - Grant to the City of Toronto to pilot test hybrid vehicles
 - Grant to Corporate Services, City of Toronto to develop strategic transition plan to ULEVs

The presentation from Mr. Jessup also included the case study information from the state of California Passenger Fleet Average Emissions study and the United Parcel Services Case study.

Christopher G. Hill, Enbridge Commercial Services Inc. – Repair Our Air Fleet Challenge

Mr. Christopher G. Hill, Enbridge Commercial Services Inc. made a presentation regarding the Repair Our Air Fleet Challenge.

Mr. Hill advised that in order to fight smog, Enbridge has engaged other organizations with fleets in the Southern Ontario air shed in an anti-idling effort to reduce air pollution. The Enbridge Fleet Challenge was announced at the Toronto Smog Summit in 2001 and was immediately taken up by a number of companies and organizations.

The following companies and organizations are participating in the challenge:

- Enbridge
- City of Brampton
- Toronto Hydro
- Ontario Power Generation
- Co-op Cabs
- The Beer Store
- Union Gas

Sarah Climenhaga, Black Creek Regional Transportation Management Association (TMA)

Ms. Sarah Climenhaga, Executive Director, TMA, made a presentation regarding the Black Creek Regional Transportation Management Association (TMA).

She advised the TMA is a non-profit association of public and private partners dedicated to reducing traffic congestion and improving air quality in the Black Creek region.

A TMA is a private non-profit membership organization providing a variety of transportation services and options for commuters. The appeal of TMA lies in its co-operative approach. By working together, organizations can accomplish more than any one government agency, employer, developer or resident could do alone.

A TMA offers a variety of transportation services to members, including:

- Expertise on parking management, cycling infrastructure and trip reduction
- Outreach to employees and students
- Ride-matching services, in order that site users can find a carpool
- Advocacy for improved transit service
- Recruitment of new members to form a stronger support base

The current members are located within the boundaries formed by Dufferin Street, Highway 401, Weston Road/Pine Valley Drive and Highway 7.

In the coming months, TMA will be taking action in the following areas:

- Guaranteed Ride Home program development – so that employees can get home in an emergency
- Vanpooling – for trips that are too long for transit
- Special member appreciation events – to reward members for their contributions

Melissa Felder, CM Consulting on behalf of The Beer Store – Fleet Challenge Submission

Ms. Melissa Felder, CM Consulting on behalf of The Beer Store presented the results from the Fleet Challenge.

In February of 2001, The Beer Store purchased an on-board computer technology (CADEC) for its London heavy-duty vehicle fleet. CADEC monitors engine parameters such as fuel efficiency, engine speed (RPMs), and speeding and idle time for vehicles. Initial CADEC baseline measurements for TBS London found that the fleet of 19 vehicles idled 115.25 hours a week, or 461 hours a month. Following a comprehensive driver-training program, TBS London was able to halve fleet idle time to 61 hours a week. Since February 2001, TBS London has decreased idle time by an average of 51%. The TBS idling strategy has resulted in fuel and financial savings for the London fleet in addition to environmental benefits compared to a business-as-usual scenario.

Business Improvements/Financial Savings

Overall, TBS London has been estimated to have eliminated almost 3000 idling hours from fleet operation from February 2001 - April 2002 due to its new idling reduction strategy. Since February 2001, average fuel efficiency has improved from 39.2 l/100 km to 33.8 l/100 km, an improvement of 14%. This has exceeded the TBS fuel savings target of 34.1 l/100km.

Cumulative fuel savings attributable to (1) improved fuel efficiency and (2) reducing idling amounts to approximately 32,365 litres since February 2001, or approximately \$20,552.00 in fuel costs. Idling reduction also means longer periods between engine rebuild cycles as one hour of engine idle has been estimated to be equivalent to two hours of driving. For example, idling has been estimated to reduce the operating life of engine oil by 75%, from 600 engine hours to 150 engine hours.

Environmental Benefits

The usage of this fuel (32,365 l) in heavy-duty vehicle operation would be equivalent to the release of 114.27 tonnes of CO₂ equivalent to the atmosphere when accounting for total life cycle of the fuel. Consequently the measures taken in TBS London have decreased greenhouse gas emissions by approximately 114 tonnes of CO₂ in comparison to a business-as-usual scenario. As a result of steps taken to reduce idling and improve fleet efficiency in

London, The Beer Store was since awarded a Fleet Excellence Award in the Enbridge Fleet Challenge on April 29, 2002.

Summary and Link to Sustainability

Councillor Jack Layton thanked all presenters and advised that the issue creating a Green Fleet, not only for the City of Toronto, but also for all companies and government organizations, is important, in order to reduce the greenhouse gas emissions and improve the air quality.

He advised that the SRT meeting provided a diverse group of companies and government organizations an opportunity to meet and exchange ideas.

He further stated that the SRT and its workgroups is an ideal organization to address the issue of Green Fleets, use of alternative fuels, improvement of air, land and water quality. The SRT will be able to receive all the information presented at this meeting, review the same, and present recommendations to City Council for consideration.

(A copy of the presentations is appended hereto as Appendix "A".)

The SRT held a general discussion on the information presented, and recommended that the said information be referred to the Financial Mechanisms Workgroup; that the Financial Mechanisms Workgroup review the same and prepare a set of recommendations for consideration by the SRT; and that the SRT report to City Council through the Policy and Finance Committee.

The SRT also requested that the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services forward a copy of the Fleet Transition Plan to the SRT, in order that the SRT may review the same and prepare comments regarding the said Fleet Transition Plan for the Administration Committee.

7.3 Draft Annual Report to the Policy and Finance Committee

The SRT had before it the draft annual report (June 19, 2002), which will be presented to the Policy and Finance Committee.

The SRT approved the following review process:

- May 15 - Draft report circulated to SRT
- May 31 - Comments from SRT to Staff
- June 7 - Revised report circulated to SRT
- June 14 - Sign-off by SRT members
- June 19 - Agenda closing date for Policy and Finance Committee
- July 4 - Policy and Finance

Members requested that the recommendations in the report refer to the request for the SRT to review sustainability reporting including ecoBudgetting.

7.4 Status Report: The Toronto Interdepartmental Environment Team (TIE): Report on the Progress of the Environmental Plan Recommendations

SRT Support Staff advised that a report from TIE will be presented at the next SRT meeting.

The SRT requested that TIE, in preparing their report, take into account the following, and provide comments with regard to the same:

That the following recommendations, which were considered at the Toronto Cancer Prevention Coalition (Dr. Savan was the SRT representative), be taken into account, as part of the TIE report:

Recommendation No. 1:

It is recommended that:

- (a) the SRT work with the CAO's Office and TIE to promote a Right-to Know Strategy;
- (b) the SRT then work with the City Solicitor to examine what tools (legal and otherwise) are available to implement the strategy; and
- (c) the Right-to-Know strategy be highlighted as a priority recommendation of the Environmental Plan.

Recommendation No. 2:

It is recommended that:

- (a) the City's Corporate Clean Air Strategy include mechanisms to reduce exposure to carcinogens via air pathways; and
- (b) the Environmental and Occupational Working Group of the Toronto Cancer Prevention Coalition examine the City's Environmentally Preferable Purchasing (EPP) Policy and how it relates to cancer prevention strategies.

7.5 Workgroup Reports

Education and Awareness Workgroup

Meg Shields presented a mock-up of the SRT Newsletter headed "Synergies".

She advised that the newsletter will be available in electronic form only, and requested SRT members to provide their feedback with regard to the proposed layout of the newsletter.

She further advised that the first edition of the newsletter will be available within the next 2 to 3 weeks, and will be posted on the SRT Website.

The SRT members reviewed the newsletter and advised that they were in agreement with the proposed layout.

The SRT further requested that information from the Green Fleet item of today's meeting be included in the first newsletter.

Measurement Workgroup

Peter Finestone, Acting Chair, Measurements Workgroup, presented the following report:

"Continuous Progress:

Since the last update the Measurement Workgroup has been very active. It has met approximately once per month as a whole and in small subgroups on a biweekly basis or even more frequently for some members. The group is working on both selecting and creating a manageable set of indicators for presentation to the SRT and eventually through the members interested parties for feedback. In the end we are striving for a total of 25-30 indicators. The Workgroup was overly optimistic in its projected timelines. We now hope to have a draft to the Roundtable for the September meeting. We recognize that this will be an iterative process at the outset and for the future as the tool undergoes continuous improvements.

Extensive Review and Preparation for Selection:

In preparation for our “workshop” days, the Measurement Workgroup took full day three days to push the work forward, various members reviewed previous indicator work from Canada, the United States and around the world. In particular we focused on the Vital Signs project and FCM Quality of Life study ensuring that we built upon this work. We also built from the literature a comprehensive set of characteristics of a good sustainability variable to inform our choices.

Context for the Measurement Tool:

The Workgroup reviewed and had presentations on the vast array of data collected by City departments and recognized that this data will continue to be gathered and reported out. It was decided that our job was not to replace or overtake the work already being done but to augment the result. We felt that this would be achieved by attempting to devise “sustainability” indicators, that is ones which are inherently more integrative. We also felt, building on our work related to the Charter, that the indicator work should build on existing initiatives and directions of the City. As such, we have adopted the general framework of Council’s Strategic Plan. We have actually found this to be a very powerful decision and instructive about sustainability. Indicators, therefore, are being devised to generate information on its five areas: Social Development, Economic Vitality, Environmental Sustainability, Good Governance and City Building. It is particularly the latter two, which are, we think, adding particular value to the generally accepted sustainability three pillars.

Nature of the tool under development:

As stated, the measurement instrument being conceived will try to focus on integrative measures that would provide insight into more than one of the elements of sustainability. We are also working to make it relatively short, recognizing that the other reports will continue to flow, and achievable so that it can and will be done with regularity. We are also conceiving it as providing a goal orientation thereby potentially being able to inform decisions, promote sustainability in the City and the practices of the City. We hope that the indicators will generate focus and information, which will help to align efforts, generate creative thought and advance the strategic plan. Our object is to try to provide data and information in the end in which Council has some control and therefore can take direct action.

We saw the primary users/audience of the results being Councillors, SRT members and City staff with interested parties (community leaders, media, business and general public) as important secondary users.

We also recognize that the next phase, the Workgroup will try to assist the City Auditor to devise a “Sustainability Audit” of the Corporation. We have identified important elements and variables needing review, which we see as fitting that assessment, and will leave things out of the initial measurement tool.

Data needs:

The Workgroup is clear that they will generally have to work with available data. We will have to use proxy data for some elements and are prepared to recommend this approach to the SRT. There was, however, a very strong consensus that a general survey of the public (based on sampling techniques, etc.) will need to be constructed and run if the Roundtable is to obtain some particularly relevant information. Our recommendation will be prudent but we wish to mention at this time that some funds (or in-kind contributions/sponsorship) will need to be found and made available.”

Financial Mechanisms Workgroup

Dr. Savan advised that work is continuing, in consultation with the Governance Workgroup, on the development of a Sustainability Lens, which will assist Council in ensuring that sustainability components are embedded in the budget process.

She further advised that a pilot proposal is being prepared and will be ready for use with the 2003 budget process.

The Financial Mechanisms Workgroup also adopted the following recommendation and now presents the same for consideration and approval:

It is recommended that the Chief Administrative Officer, in consultation with the Chief Financial Officer & Treasurer, update the City’s Toronto Budget 2002: Community Workbook for Discussions on the City’s Operating Budget, to include the following information:

- (a) indicate services provided;
- (b) incorporate ecoBudget measurement of capital assets;
- (c) indicate trends;
- (d) specify capital versus current costs; and
- (e) if possible, provide information on how some services provided cut across all areas and different departments within the City.

Governance Workgroup

Meg Shields provided an update indicating that the Governance Workgroup is assisting in the development of a Sustainability Lens.

The Governance Workgroup adopted the following recommendation, and now presents the same for consideration and approval:

It is recommended that the City, through the Commissioner of Corporate Services, add a course for senior staff on sustainability, to the Executive Development Program.

The SRT recommended that:

- (1) the reports from the Workgroups be received; and**
- (2) the recommendations from the Financial Mechanisms Workgroup and the Governance Workgroup be endorsed and forwarded to the appropriate City Officials for their information and necessary action.**

7.6 SRT Website

Meg Shields advised that work on the SRT Website is well underway. She presented a draft layout of how the Website will be constructed, and detailing the materials which will be posted.

Information regarding the final design and proposed launch date of the Website will be forwarded to SRT Members in the near future for their review and approval.

Next Meeting Dates

The next meeting dates for the Sustainability Roundtable are as follows:

Wednesday, July 24, 2002
9:15 a.m. SHARP to 12:30 p.m.
Room 308/309
Metro Hall
55 John Street

Thursday, September 12, 2002
9:30 a.m. SHARP to 12:30 p.m.
Room 308/309
Metro Hall
55 John Street

Please note: Coffee will be served at 9:00 a.m. and the meetings will start at 9:15 a.m. SHARP.

The meeting adjourned at 1:00 p.m.

Chair