

ASSESSMENT OF ALTERNATIVE SOLUTIONS (PLANNING ALTERNATIVES)

	Do Nothing	Remove Bridge – Close Scarlett Road	Promote Transportation Demand Measures (TDM)	Promote Transportation System Management (TSM) Measures	Bridge Replacement / Road Improvement
Description of Alternatives	<i>No improvements made within the Study Area.</i>	<i>Remove bridge and close Scarlett Road between St. Clair Avenue and Dundas Street.</i>	<i>Measures to reduce the number of vehicles on the roadway.</i>	<i>Minor physical and/or operational modifications to improve the safety and capacity of the existing road network.</i>	<i>Improvements to the CP Rail underpass and existing road network.</i>
Criteria/Sub Factors					
Transportation					
Accessibility	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No change in accessibility. No left-turn from southbound Scarlett Road to eastbound Dundas Street. Pedestrian/cyclist movements through underpass will still be restricted. Substandard vertical and horizontal clearances of the underpass restrict access of large trucks, transit vehicles and emergency services vehicles. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Eliminates access between Dundas Street and St. Clair Avenue via Scarlett Road. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Does not address existing restrictions on accessibility for pedestrians, cyclists, transit, large trucks and emergency services vehicles through underpass. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Potential minor improvements to intersections for all modes (vehicles, pedestrians and cyclists). Does not address existing accessibility issues through underpass. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improvements to the underpass will improve accessibility for trucks, transit vehicles, emergency services vehicles, pedestrians and cyclists. Road network improvements, such as the addition of turn and through lanes, will increase accessibility in the study area.
Safety <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Vehicular, Pedestrian and Cyclist Safety 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Collision rates higher than typical for T-intersections in Toronto at both the Scarlett Road/St Clair Avenue and Scarlett Road/Dundas Street intersections. Safety concerns include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Sight distance restrictions; and Potential roadside hazards. Pedestrian/cyclist safety issues include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Less than desirable sidewalk width through underpass, Restricted sight distances at Dundas Street; Channelized right-turn lanes at Scarlett Road/Dundas Street; and Traffic queuing through pedestrian crossover at Bernice Crescent. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Mitigates most safety concerns related to the Dundas Street and St. Clair Avenue intersections with Scarlett Road. Diverted traffic may create or worsen safety issues at other intersections on the area road network. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> TDM has potential to reduce auto travel but may increase travel by pedestrians, cyclists and transit riders. Existing pedestrian/cyclist safety issues not addressed. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> TSM has potential to reduce collisions through study area. Some options, such as the removal of right turn channelizations at Dundas Street, may improve pedestrian/cyclist safety. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improved structure clearances reduce risk of collisions with structure and improve sight lines. Improved pedestrian/cyclist facilities such as wider sidewalks, cycling lanes and increased sight distances will enhance safety for pedestrians/cyclists. Improvements to capacity of Scarlett Road through underpass and adjacent intersections will reduce congestion/delay and the related collisions.

ASSESSMENT OF ALTERNATIVE SOLUTIONS (PLANNING ALTERNATIVES)

	Do Nothing	Remove Bridge – Close Scarlett Road	Promote Transportation Demand Measures (TDM)	Promote Transportation System Management (TSM) Measures	Bridge Replacement / Road Improvement
Description of Alternatives	<i>No improvements made within the Study Area.</i>	<i>Remove bridge and close Scarlett Road between St. Clair Avenue and Dundas Street.</i>	<i>Measures to reduce the number of vehicles on the roadway.</i>	<i>Minor physical and/or operational modifications to improve the safety and capacity of the existing road network.</i>	<i>Improvements to the CP Rail underpass and existing road network.</i>
Traffic Operations and Capacity <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Accommodation of current and future demand 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Capacity constraints exist for the following critical movements: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Eastbound left-turns at Dundas Street; Northbound through-right at St. Clair Avenue; Southbound dual left-turns at St. Clair Avenue; and Westbound left-turns at St. Clair Avenue. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Eliminates capacity constraints on Scarlett Road and Dundas Street. Diverted traffic would increase congestion at Jane Street intersections with St. Clair Avenue and Dundas Street. Short term disruption to travel through study area during construction. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> TDM has potential to reduce future travel demand, improving intersection operations. Does not address long-term capacity/operating issues. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> TSM measures can improve operation of some critical intersection movements in the short term. Minor disruption to vehicular traffic movement during implementation. CP Rail underpass restricts capacity to accommodate future traffic growth. Does not address long-term address capacity/operating issues. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Capacity improvements through the underpass and at the Scarlett Road intersections with St. Clair Avenue and Dundas Street could improve operation through the study area. Short term disruption to travel through Study Area during construction.
Railway Operations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No direct impact on railway operations. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Potential for short term disruption of railway operations during bridge removal. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No direct impact on railway operations. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No direct impact on railway operations. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Potential for short term disruption of railway operations during construction.
Transit Operations <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Effects on current and future transit operations <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Support for extension of streetcar service in St. Clair/Scarlett/Dundas corridors 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> TTC does not operate along Scarlett Road between St. Clair and Dundas. Buses have difficulty making left-turns from southbound Scarlett Road to eastbound St. Clair Avenue. Does not support extension of streetcar service through noted corridors. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Diverted traffic would increase congestion on the surrounding road network, which may delay existing transit services. Does not support extension of streetcar through noted corridors. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> With the implementation of TDM measures, transit ridership could potentially increase, thereby reducing congestion through the study area. Does not support extension of streetcar through noted corridors. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Potential to improve transit service through the study area by improving traffic operations. Widening eastbound lanes at St. Clair Avenue/Scarlett Road intersection would improve bus turning from southbound to eastbound Does not support extension of streetcar through noted corridors. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Bridge replacement could allow for operation of buses on Scarlett Road between St. Clair Avenue and Dundas Street if the TTC finds this to be a viable route. Improvements to traffic operations will improve transit trip times and reliability. Widening eastbound lanes at St. Clair Avenue/Scarlett Road intersection would improve bus turning from southbound to eastbound. Bridge replacement may accommodate extension of streetcar service.
Traffic Patterns <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Effect on traffic volumes on neighbourhood streets 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Existing capacity constraints and movement restrictions encourage traffic infiltration through residential neighborhoods north of St. Clair Avenue. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> High potential for increased traffic infiltration through residential area north of St. Clair Avenue. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The rate of growth of traffic infiltration on residential streets may decrease marginally with the implementation of TDM measures due to a reduction in automobile use. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> TSM measures could result in short-term reduction in traffic infiltration on residential streets due to intersection operation improvements. Some options may encourage traffic diversion to alternate routes. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provision of southbound left-turn at Dundas Street could provide relief at the Scarlett Road/St. Clair Avenue intersection and potentially reduce traffic infiltration through residential areas to the north. Improvements to vertical clearance at the underpass could encourage increased commercial vehicle traffic on Scarlett Road.

ASSESSMENT OF ALTERNATIVE SOLUTIONS (PLANNING ALTERNATIVES)					
	Do Nothing	Remove Bridge – Close Scarlett Road	Promote Transportation Demand Measures (TDM)	Promote Transportation System Management (TSM) Measures	Bridge Replacement / Road Improvement
Description of Alternatives	<i>No improvements made within the Study Area.</i>	<i>Remove bridge and close Scarlett Road between St. Clair Avenue and Dundas Street.</i>	<i>Measures to reduce the number of vehicles on the roadway.</i>	<i>Minor physical and/or operational modifications to improve the safety and capacity of the existing road network.</i>	<i>Improvements to the CP Rail underpass and existing road network.</i>
Natural and Social Environment					
Air Quality	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Traffic congestion has a negative impact on air quality. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Marginal improvement in air quality in Study Focus Area, but diversion of traffic could have a negative impact on air quality in other areas. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> TDM could result in a marginal improvement in air quality over the “do nothing” alternative. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> TSM could result in a marginal improvement in air quality over the “do nothing” alternative in the short-term. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Bridge replacement / road network improvements could result in a marginal improvement in air quality over the “do nothing” alternative.
Property Impacts <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Direct and indirect effect on buildings, property and access. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No direct impact on buildings, property or access. Ease of access will decline with increasing levels of congestion. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No impact on buildings or property. This option reduces accessibility to properties near the Scarlett Road/Dundas Street intersection. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No direct impact on buildings, property or access. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No impact on buildings. Minor property acquisition may be required for some options. Some options may restrict access to properties near intersections. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No impact on buildings. Property acquisition required to realign/widen roads and replace rail structure. Some design options may restrict access to properties near intersections.
Noise <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Effect of traffic/construction related noise 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No appreciable change in noise levels. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No appreciable change in noise levels. Short duration construction noise. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No appreciable change in noise levels. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No appreciable change in noise levels. Short duration construction noise. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No appreciable change in noise levels over the long term Most significant construction noise impacts due to nature and duration of the work.
Water Resources <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Effect on natural runoff and stormwater 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No impact on water resources. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No impact on water resources. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No impact on water resources. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Potential to increase stormwater run-off due to an increase in the amount of paved surfaces. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Potential to increase stormwater run-off due to an increase in the amount of paved surfaces.
Soils <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Effect on disturbing potential contaminated soils 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No impact on soils. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No impact on soils. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No impact on soils. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No impact on soils. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Potential for disturbance of contaminated soils.
Vegetation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Effect on existing vegetation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No impact on existing vegetation. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Potential for minor impacts to existing vegetation in the vicinity of the underpass. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No impact on existing vegetation. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Potential for minor impacts to existing vegetation. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Potential impacts to existing vegetation. No rare or endangered species in Study Area. Mature tree species are located on the north and south side of the rail line, with specimen species over 100 years old south of the rail line.

ASSESSMENT OF ALTERNATIVE SOLUTIONS (PLANNING ALTERNATIVES)					
	Do Nothing	Remove Bridge – Close Scarlett Road	Promote Transportation Demand Measures (TDM)	Promote Transportation System Management (TSM) Measures	Bridge Replacement / Road Improvement
Description of Alternatives	<i>No improvements made within the Study Area.</i>	<i>Remove bridge and close Scarlett Road between St. Clair Avenue and Dundas Street.</i>	<i>Measures to reduce the number of vehicles on the roadway.</i>	<i>Minor physical and/or operational modifications to improve the safety and capacity of the existing road network.</i>	<i>Improvements to the CP Rail underpass and existing road network.</i>
Economic and Cultural Environment					
Industrial/Commercial • Effect on deliveries, customers and employees	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Increasing traffic congestion will increase delays for deliveries, commuters, and customers. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Diverted traffic would increase congestion in adjacent areas, delaying deliveries, commuters, and customers. Reduced accessibility to local businesses could impact customers and employees. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> TDM may provide minor improvements for deliveries, commuters and customers by reducing congestion. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Some TSM measures may restrict access to local businesses. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Replacement of underpass and intersection improvements provides the potential for improvements for deliveries, commuters and customers by reducing congestion and increasing accessibility.
Archaeology/Heritage • Effect on known or potential resources	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No heritage resources designated within the Study Focus Area. No impact on archaeological resources. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No heritage resources designated within the Study Focus Area. No impact on archaeological resources. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No heritage resources designated within the Study Focus Area. No impact on archaeological resources. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No heritage resources designated within the Study Focus Area. Low potential to impact archeological resources as Study Focus Area has previously been disturbed. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No heritage resources designated within the Study Focus Area. Low potential to impact archeological resources as Study Focus Area has previously been disturbed.
Engineering					
Construction Costs • Capital Cost	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No construction costs. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Moderate construction costs would be associated with bridge removal and closing Scarlett Road. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No construction costs. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Minor construction costs would be associated with the implementation of TSM measures. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Major construction costs associated with bridge replacement and intersection improvements.
Utilities and Major Services • Impact on existing and proposed utilities and services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No impacts on utilities or services 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Potential minor impacts on utilities and services. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No impact on utilities or services. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Potential minor impacts on utilities and services. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Potential major impacts on utilities and services associated with bridge replacement and intersection improvements.
Recommendation	Carry forward only for comparison with other alternatives.	Do not carry forward.	Carry forward for consideration in combination with TSM and bridge replacement / road improvement alternatives.	Carry forward for consideration in combination with TDM and bridge replacement / road improvement alternatives.	Carry forward as preferred improvement alternative.