

Clause embodied in Report No. 2 of the Administration Committee, as adopted by the Council of the City of Toronto at its meeting held on February 13, 14 and 15, 2002.

4

**City of Toronto
Multilingual Services Policy**

(City Council on February 13, 14 and 15, 2002, adopted this Clause, without amendment.)

The Administration Committee recommends:

- (1) the adoption of the report (December 17, 2001) from the Commissioner of Corporate Services, subject to the cost of providing the French language translation services, referred to therein, not exceeding \$10,000 per year; and**
- (2) that the Commissioner of Corporate Services be requested to:**
 - (a) monitor the policy and report back to the Administration Committee prior to the end of the year on any additional strategies that need to be considered to ensure that the policy is effective; and**
 - (b) continue to work with the French community, multicultural committees, ethnic media (including local media) in the City to address the concerns raised with respect to lack of advertising in the ethnic and French media, and report thereon to the Ethnic and Race Relations Committee.**

The Administration Committee submits the following report (December 17, 2001) from the Commissioner of Corporate Services:

Purpose:

This report describes the results of the consultations with the Race and Ethnic Relations Committee and the French Committee regarding a City of Toronto Multilingual Services Policy. Staff were directed to consult with these committees following a report entitled "City of Toronto Multilingual Services Policy" that was submitted to the Administration Committee at its meeting of October 16, 2001. (Appendix 1)

Financial Implications and Impact Statement:

There is a small financial impact as result of the recommendations of this report. Increasing the volume of French translations to ensure that French is included on all documents where another language is provided (in full or in summary form) will cost the City an additional estimated \$8,000.00 per year. This cost will be spread across all departments; thus the impact will be fairly insignificant on each individual department or service area.

Recommendations:

It is recommended that the City of Toronto approve the Multilingual Services Policy as submitted in the report (October 2, 2001) from the Commissioner of Corporate Services, with the following additions to it:

- (a) Under Section (3) “French Language Services”:

The third paragraph will now read: “This policy recommends that French translation of documents be provided (in full or in summary form) whenever public information materials are translated into another language. Excepted from this is the purchase of advertising which is addressed separately in this policy.”

- (b) Under Section (2) “Guidelines for Determining Priorities for Multilingual Services”:

Add the following two paragraphs:

“The City of Toronto Advertising Policy, adopted by Council at its meeting of July 24, 2001, addresses the purchase of advertising in newspapers that publish in languages other than English. The Advertising Policy states that ‘much of the City’s social marketing/public information advertising is directed at those most in need. There are instances where mainstream outlets do not reach the target audiences for these messages. Therefore, advertisements may be placed in newspapers that publish in languages other than English.’

The Advertising Policy also states ‘that advertising be based on a communications plan which includes identification and assessment of the target audience and how best to reach the target audience within budget’.”

- (c) Under Section (4) “General Operating Procedures”:

Add the following sentence: (g) That the City of Toronto work with the City of Toronto French Committee to ensure the delivery of cost effective multilingual services to the French community using the existing French networks.

Background:

A report entitled “City of Toronto Multilingual Services Policy” was submitted to the Administration Committee at its meeting of October 16, 2001 (Appendix 1). The Administration Committee directed staff to consult with the French Committee and the Race and Ethnic Relations Committee. These consultations were done with the committees at their regularly scheduled meetings of October 22 and November 6, 2001 respectively.

Comments:

The Race and Ethnic Relations Committee endorsed the policy contained in the October 16, 2001 report to Administration Committee.

The French Committee submitted for consideration a series of proposed additions to the policy. A copy of the full text, as submitted by the French Committee, is attached in Appendix 2. The committee's main points are summarized as follows:

Under Background:

- (a) The former City of Toronto established a French Committee in 1981 and in 1999, the new City of Toronto approved the continuation of this committee.

Under Principles:

- (a) The ethnic diversity of our community is a source of social, cultural and economic enrichment and strength, and of national/international prestige.
- (b) English and French are common links to many ethnic communities.
- (c) English and French are important factors in attracting newcomers from other countries and other regions of Canada.

Under Demographics:

- (a) There are many immigrants who come from countries where English or French is an official language.
- (b) Francophones moving to Toronto from other regions of Canada also contribute to the growth of this City.
- (c) The French community in Toronto is not concentrated in any particular neighbourhood.
- (d) Because the French community (a) speaks one of the official languages of Canada, (b) has certain rights guaranteed under federal and Ontario legislation, (c) is an established as well as an intake community, and (d) is an important factor in attracting both French speaking Canadians from other parts of Canada and newcomers from French speaking countries, the French community, therefore, has more influence for Toronto than the comparative number of its members.

Under French Language Services:

- (a) The translation of documents (or summaries thereof) into French must be included whenever public information materials are translated into another language.

Under General Operating Procedures:

- (a) The City of Toronto should work with the City of Toronto French Committee to ensure the delivery of cost-effective French language services.

In consideration of the French Committee's request to include French whenever a document (or portion thereof) is translated into another language, it should be noted that the former City of Toronto Council, at its meeting on October 19, 1989, adopted Clause No. 43 of Report No. 36 of The Executive Committee, entitled "French Translation of City of Toronto Printed Materials." This report's recommendation stated:

"That when materials relating to issues of general public interest are sent to Toronto residents and ratepayers, and are to be produced in any language in addition to English, such materials be automatically produced in both official languages, French and English, as well as in any other language(s) specified."

The French Committee, therefore, is seeking to ensure this practice of the former City of Toronto is part of the new City of Toronto Multilingual Services policy.

Conclusions:

As a result of consultations with the Race and Ethnic Relations Committee and the French Committee, staff are recommending three amendments to the Multilingual Services Policy for the City of Toronto regarding: (a) the provision of French translations, (b) advertising and (c) staff working with the French Committee to ensure the cost-effective delivery of French-language services.

Contact:

Patricia MacDonell, Manager, Public Information, Corporate Communications Division
416-392-8591

Valerie Chavossy, Director, Corporate Communications Division 416-397-4149

Appendices:

Appendix 1: Original policy submitted to Administration Committee on October 16, 2001.

Appendix 2: Policy with proposed changes (in bold) submitted by French Committee.

The Administration Committee also submits the following report (October 2, 2001) from the Commissioner of Corporate Services:

Purpose:

This report outlines a multilingual services policy for the City of Toronto. The goal of the policy is to affirm the City's commitment to ensuring that City information is made available to all its residents. It formalizes practices already in place, and provides guidelines for staff in determining how residents can best be served through the use of multilingual services.

A separate policy addressing barrier-free communications for seniors and people with disabilities will be developed.

Financial Implications and Impact Statement:

There are no new financial implications associated with this policy. Recommendations contained in the report are mindful of the need for accountability. Costs for providing multilingual services are to continue to be borne by the individual departments or programs.

Recommendations:

It is recommended that:

- (1) the City of Toronto Multilingual Services Policy be comprised of the following four components, as described further in this report:
 - (a) fundamental principles on which multilingual services are based;
 - (b) guidelines in determining priorities for multilingual services;
 - (c) description of French Language Services delivery; and
 - (d) general procedures and operational guidelines; and
- (2) the City of Toronto adopt the multilingual services policy as outlined in this report and that appropriate officials be given authority to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.

Background:

Previous policies:

Of the seven amalgamating municipalities, the former Metro and the former City of Toronto had policies referring to multilingual access. These municipalities had designated multilingual staff who provided translation and interpretation services. The other municipalities provided multilingual services on an informal basis. (Appendix 1).

Current Approach:

Since amalgamation, City departments have had uniform access to translation and interpretation services.

In 2000, the City of Toronto provided residents with oral interpretations in 52 languages and written translations in 37 languages. These services are provided by the Multilingual Services Unit of the Corporate Communications Division. The unit serves all City departments, as well as many agencies. High volume clients include Public Health, the Works and Emergency Services Department, Parks and Recreation and the City's various housing organizations. Staff in the Multilingual Services provide a full range of services ranging from consultation on demographics of a neighbourhood and identification of prominent languages, to translation, interpretation, through to project completion.

Toronto's Diversity:

Toronto's diverse population makes it one of the most multilingual cities in the world. More than half of Toronto's residents (52 percent) have come from outside of Canada. Toronto is recognized world-wide as a city that embraces its different communities. The City's vision reflects the values and traditions of a diverse, democratic society.

Process for developing this policy:

Staff consulted with a variety of stakeholders including Members of Council, representatives from the Access and Equity Unit of the CAO's Office and staff from departments and agencies.

Comments:

(1) Principles:

It is recommended that the following fundamental principles form the basis of the City of Toronto's multilingual services policy:

- (a) The City of Toronto recognizes that the ethnic diversity of our community is a source of social, cultural and economic enrichment and strength.
- (b) The City of Toronto recognizes that providing multilingual services is an effective way to reach individuals, groups and organizations of diverse communities to allow them to access City services and programs.
- (c) Adoption of this policy is another step in the implementation of the Council-approved report of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity (December, 1999) which states:

"All residents shall be entitled to municipal services and programs which are racially sensitive, culturally and linguistically appropriate, gender appropriate, accommodate disability, and are adequately resourced to ensure equitable access and outcomes."
- (d) The need to provide multilingual services must be addressed in communications plans that support City of Toronto programs.
- (e) The City of Toronto will provide high quality, accurate translations that meet professional standards.
- (f) To ensure efficiency and accountability in the provision of multilingual services, the City shall deliver multilingual services, that meet the diverse needs of its many audiences, in the most timely and cost effective manner through the Multilingual Services Unit, Corporate Communications Division.

(2) Guidelines for Determining Priorities for Multilingual Services:

The delivery of multilingual services requires sound judgement and decision-making in ascertaining how interpretation and translation needs can be met in the most effective manner. It is important to first identify the target audience(s). Departmental and agency staff responsible for specific public services or programs are the most familiar with their audiences' needs. The decision to translate a document or provide interpretation services into one or more languages requires that a number of factors be considered:

- (a) Demographics: The City of Toronto's population, as identified by home language in the most recent census data is outlined in appendix 2. Demographic information is useful when a particular message is targeted to all City residents. Languages accessed through the City's Language Line Services (over-the-phone interpretation service) is also a useful guide.
- (b) Language needs of a particular community: When narrowing the target audience to specific communities, the language needs of ethno-racial groups in those communities must be determined. This is often the case for certain public health or public education programs where staff are able to identify specific ethnic communities, or specific population groups, as the intended recipients of a message.
- (c) Language needs of a particular geographic area or neighbourhood: When the message is intended for easily identifiable geographic areas, the prominent languages spoken in that particular area must be determined. This is an approach often used by Works and Emergency Services, for example, when it communicates information about road or watermain work in a particular neighbourhood.
- (d) Type of City information: Priorities may also be established based upon the nature and type of information. For example, a document which addresses life-threatening issues such as carbon monoxide poisoning or immunization is identified as a priority for translation. The length of a document should also be taken into consideration; for many documents a summary is appropriate.

The Multilingual Services Unit is in regular contact with the Access and Equity Office, the Public Health Division, Social Services, Housing Services and the Urban Development Services Department to keep up-to-date on population trends and immigration patterns, as well as language needs for new arrivals to the city. This is supplemented, as appropriate, by information obtained from school boards.

(3) French Language Services:

The provision of French language services is outlined in the Government of Ontario's French Language Services Act and the Federal Government's Official Languages Act. The federal government translates all documents into the two official languages and ensures that federal government services are available in either English or French.

The Province of Ontario's French Language Services Act guarantees each individual the right to receive provincial government services in 23 designated areas of the province; the City of Toronto is one such area. Under the Act, municipalities are not required to provide French language services, even in designated areas. Municipalities are responsible for deciding whether or not to provide their services in French.

This policy recommends that the translation of documents into French be provided whenever public information on citywide issues is also translated into another language.

(4) General Operating Procedures:

In order for multilingual services to be delivered consistently across the City, it is useful to include a number of operational guidelines as part of this policy.

- (a) Departments must determine budgets and include translation and interpretation services in their annual workplans.
- (b) Departments should provide as much notice as possible to Multilingual Services regarding upcoming translation projects to ensure print and production deadlines are met.
- (c) In conjunction with the Multilingual Services Unit, departments should evaluate the effectiveness of translation and interpretation in reaching their audiences and achieving their objectives.
- (d) The Multilingual Services Unit in Corporate Communications will continue to broker multilingual services for city departments and agencies at competitive rates.
- (e) Departments/programs providing written materials in third languages should include the phrase "oral interpretation available in additional languages." The provision of interpretation services can be through Language Line Services (over the phone) or by City staff, where appropriate.
- (f) Where appropriate, individual units in departments should establish lists of employees who speak other languages and who are willing to provide an informal interpretation service to help overcome language barriers in the delivery of customer service.

Conclusions:

This report recommends a multilingual services policy for the City of Toronto that provides principles, guidelines and operating procedures for the effective delivery of multilingual and French language services to its communities. A separate policy addressing barrier-free communications for seniors and people with disabilities will be developed.

Contacts:

Valerie Chavossy, Director, Corporate Communications Division 416 397-4149

Patricia MacDonell, Manager, Public Information 416 392-8591

Elizabeth Pong, Supervisor, Multilingual Services 416 397-5003

Appendices:

Appendix 1: Copies of applicable policies of former Metro and former City of Toronto

Appendix 2: Recent census data

Appendix 1: Applicable policies of former Municipalities

Metro Toronto:

The Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto passed its Ethnoracial Access to Metropolitan Services Policy on August 15, 1990 (Report No. 23 of the Management Committee). The policy stated that:

- “The Council of the Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto reaffirms its commitment to the principle that the ethnoracial diversity of our community is a source of social, cultural and economic strength;
- The Council of the Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto recognizes that individuals, groups and organizations of diverse ethnoracial minority communities encounter barriers in their efforts to gain access to services and derive equal benefit from the services directly provided, purchased and contracted by the Municipality;
- The Council of the Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto undertake to develop specific measures to ensure that individuals, groups and organizations representative of diverse ethnoracial minority communities have access to racially sensitive, culturally appropriate services, and are able to participate in the planning, design, development and delivery of services directly provided, purchased and contracted by the Municipality.

Former City of Toronto:

The City of Toronto adopted a Multi-lingual Access Program on May 6 and 13, 1991 (Executive Committee Report No. 9) and June 1993 (Executive Committee Report No. 26). The Multi-lingual Access Program stated that:

“...the City recognizes its obligation to make its services available to racial and ethnic groups. This responsibility includes facilitating access to services by removing barriers that may be caused by average complexity, language differences or discrimination.”

and

“The City of Toronto is responsible for removing barriers that may be presented by organizational complexity, language differences, cultural insensitivity, racial intolerance and discriminatory attitudes and practices.”

Immigration Statistics 1991 - 2000
Immigrant Landings - Canada, Ontario and Toronto, 1991, 1999

Year	Canada	Ontario	GTA	Toronto	Percent of GTA	Percent of Canada
1991	232,751	119,771	89,455	70,064	78.3%	30.1%
1992	254,820	139,074	109,740	86,981	79.3%	34.1%
1993	256,736	134,853	107,673	84,633	78.6%	33.0%
1994	224,373	117,502	95,429	75,228	78.8%	33.5%
1995	212,860	115,900	96,016	76,310	79.5%	35.8%
1996	226,043	119,690	97,900	79,439	81.1%	35.1%
1997	216,021	117,660	99,447	82,101	82.6%	38.0%
1998	174,162	92,296	76,920	64,877	84.3%	37.3%
1999	189,885	104,080	84,314	70,273	83.3%	37.0%
2000	226,379	133,101	107,781	90,695	84.1%	40.1%

Source: Citizenship and Immigration Canada
Immigration and Settlement Unit, Ontario Ministry of Citizenship
Prepared by: Health Planning, Toronto Public Health/June 6, 2001

Immigrant Landings to
Ontario and Toronto

Country of Birth	Toronto 1999	Ontario 1999	To % of Ontario	Toronto 1998	Ontario 1998	To % of Ontario
China, People's Republic of	13306	17436	76.3%	9278	11882	78.1%
India	6653	11493	57.9%	5810	9583	60.6%
Pakistan	5239	7427	70.5%	5143	6709	76.7%
Philippines	2579	4037	63.9%	2417	3708	65.2%
Sri Lanka	3132	3861	81.1%	2429	2895	83.9%
Iran	2936	3764	78.0%	3545	4294	82.6%
Korea, Republic of	2590	3392	76.4%	1567	1877	83.5%
Russia	2235	2815	79.4%	2624	3213	81.7%
United States of America	1096	2638	41.5%	976	2120	46.0%
Jamaica	1482	2171	68.3%	1413	2055	68.8%
Ukraine	1582	2000	79.1%	1239	1794	69.1%
Romania	1229	1906	64.5%	1169	1797	65.1%
Yugoslavia	835	1742	47.9%	742	1706	43.5%
England	543	1468	37.0%	536	1295	41.4%
Afghanistan	924	1369	67.5%	957	1297	73.8%
Somalia, Democratic Republic of	777	1359	57.2%	805	1211	66.5%
Bangladesh	1044	1301	80.2%	1037	1262	82.2%
Iraq	685	1298	52.8%	643	1169	55.0%

Immigrant Landings to
Ontario and Toronto

Country of Birth	Toronto	Ontario	To % of	Toronto	Ontario	To % of
	1999	1999	Ontario	1998	1998	Ontario
Guyana	857	1277	67.1%	809	1183	68.4%
Trinidad and Tobago, Republic of	681	1081	63.0%	690	1078	64.0%
Albania	785	1070	73.4%	317	450	70.4%
Taiwan	814	1036	78.6%	1110	1357	81.8%
Poland	437	1028	42.5%	494	1117	44.2%
Union of Soviet Socialist Republics	811	968	83.8%	952	1372	69.4%
Hong Kong	587	933	62.9%	1867	2479	75.3%
Bosnia-Herzegovina	357	881	40.5%	444	943	47.1%
Egypt	542	868	62.4%	582	861	67.6%
Vietnam, Socialist Republic of	430	767	56.1%	486	935	52.0%
Mexico	368	669	55.0%	347	557	62.3%
Nigeria	495	669	74.0%	437	562	77.8%
Germany, Federal Republic of	266	662	40.2%	272	602	45.2%
Colombia	476	657	72.5%	331	458	72.3%
Ghana	436	630	69.2%	579	798	72.6%
Saudi Arabia	418	630	66.3%	609	783	77.8%
Lebanon	225	619	36.3%	307	654	46.9%
South Africa, Republic of	326	551	59.2%	356	538	66.2%
Jordan	328	528	62.1%	246	376	65.4%
Turkey	360	508	70.9%	400	522	76.6%
Kuwait	268	499	53.7%	290	555	52.3%
Syria	257	488	52.7%	311	492	63.2%
United Arab Emirates	342	486	70.4%	427	504	84.7%
Bulgaria	371	483	76.8%	376	474	79.3%
Sudan, Democratic Republic of	226	460	49.1%	234	550	42.5%
Ethiopia	300	450	66.7%	281	426	66.0%
Hong Kong Sar	300	413	72.6%	251	344	73.0%
Cuba	187	385	48.6%	177	299	59.2%
Netherlands, The	62	382	16.2%	40	246	16.3%
Brazil	245	380	64.5%	217	318	68.2%
Japan	226	375	60.3%	187	296	63.2%
Croatia	139	372	37.4%	94	238	39.5%
Israel	274	371	73.9%	242	356	68.0%
Belarus	289	339	85.3%	336	387	86.8%
Czech Republic	172	337	51.0%	10	117	8.5%
Kazakhstan	260	337	77.2%	470	593	79.3%
Hungary	173	288	60.1%	129	212	60.8%
Slovak Republic	169	282	59.9%	68	117	58.1%
Indonesia, Republic of	158	272	58.1%	38	60	63.3%
Algeria	145	270	53.7%	146	241	60.6%
Zaire, Republic of	141	265	53.2%	137	228	60.1%

Immigrant Landings to
Ontario and Toronto

Country of Birth	Toronto	Ontario	To % of	Toronto	Ontario	To % of
	1999	1999	Ontario	1998	1998	Ontario
Morocco	114	259	44.0%	110	226	48.7%
Kenya	160	258	62.0%	99	160	61.9%
Portugal	142	253	56.1%	193	314	61.5%
Ecuador	196	249	78.7%	202	253	79.8%
France	140	244	57.4%	114	240	47.5%
Grenada	202	240	84.2%	229	272	84.2%
Scotland	83	235	35.3%	42	161	26.1%
Italy	111	233	47.6%	99	201	49.3%
El Salvador	129	232	55.6%	116	224	51.8%
Argentina	135	192	70.3%	149	192	77.6%
Venezuela	124	191	64.9%	102	174	58.6%
Peru	95	190	50.0%	100	159	62.9%
Malaysia	102	173	59.0%	89	131	67.9%
Switzerland	51	167	30.5%	53	180	29.4%
Moldova	108	163	66.3%	116	167	69.5%
Singapore	95	149	63.8%	59	83	71.1%
Palestinian Authority (Gaza/West Bank)	79	147	53.7%	77	132	58.3%
Australia	57	145	39.3%	82	152	53.9%
Guatemala	53	143	37.1%	57	138	41.3%
Haiti	17	136	12.5%	18	124	14.5%
St. Vincent and the Grenadines	107	136	78.7%	120	137	87.6%
Libya	38	125	30.4%	38	99	38.4%
Latvia	100	123	81.3%	113	125	90.4%
Tanzania, United Republic of	73	114	64.0%	53	104	51.0%
Uzbekistan	80	113	70.8%	80	101	79.2%
Rwanda	44	111	39.6%			
Chile	64	103	62.1%	83	118	70.3%
Dominican Republic	75	102	73.5%	59	95	62.1%
Qatar	65	101	64.4%	56	72	77.8%
Yemen, Republic of	34	101	33.7%	34	82	41.5%
Barbados	65	100	65.0%	62	111	55.9%
Greece	58	95	61.1%	56	90	62.2%
Nepal	61	90	67.8%	43	66	65.2%
Thailand	57	90	63.3%			
Fyr Macedonia	56	88	63.6%			
Armenia	69	86	80.2%	65	72	90.3%
Djibouti, Republic of	4	78	5.1%			
Ireland, Republic of	30	76	39.5%	31	71	43.7%
Chad, Republic of	26	71	36.6%			
Kyrgyzstan	63	71	88.7%			

Immigrant Landings to
Ontario and Toronto

Country of Birth	Toronto 1999	Ontario 1999	To % of Ontario	Toronto 1998	Ontario 1998	To % of Ontario
Uruguay	50	71	70.4%	59	72	81.9%
Mauritius	37	69	53.6%	31	67	46.3%
Nicaragua	24	69	34.8%	37	60	61.7%
Azerbaijan	54	66	81.8%	85	91	93.4%
Belgium	24	66	36.4%			
Cambodia	29	64	45.3%	41	101	40.6%
Bahrain	34	62	54.8%	51	74	68.9%
Burundi	29	62	46.8%			
Lithuania	37	61	60.7%	51	65	78.5%
Uganda	36	61	59.0%	27	58	46.6%
St. Lucia	41	57	71.9%			
Honduras	23	54	42.6%			
Sweden	21	54	38.9%			
Eritrea	32	50	64.0%			
Not Coded				336	554	60.6%
Georgia				72	77	93.5%
Tunisia				40	70	57.1%
Estonia				45	61	73.8%
Macao				46	58	79.3%
All Other Countries of Birth	804	1435	56.0%	983	1650	59.6%
Column Total	68207	103717	65.8%	63329	92629	68.4%
Official Total	68207	103717	65.8%	63265	92629	68.3%

Source: Citizenship and Immigration Canada Data: Immigration and Settlement Unit, Ontario
Ministry of Citizenship, Culture and Recreation

Prepared by: Health Planning, Toronto Public Health/Aug 2000

The Administration Committee also submits the following report (October 27, 2001) from the Commissioner of Corporate Services, entitled “City of Toronto Multilingual Services Policy: With Input from French Committee” (Appendix 2):

Purpose:

This report outlines a multilingual services policy for the City of Toronto. The goal of the policy is to affirm the City’s commitment to ensuring that City information is made available to all its residents. It formalizes practices already in place, and provides guidelines for staff in determining how residents can best be served through the use of multilingual services.

A separate policy addressing barrier-free communications for seniors and people with disabilities will be developed.

Financial Implications and Impact Statement:

There are no new financial implications associated with this policy. Recommendations contained in the report are mindful of the need for accountability. Costs for providing multilingual services are to continue to be borne by the individual departments or programs.

Recommendations:

It is recommended that:

- (1) the City of Toronto multilingual services policy be comprised of the following four components, as described further in this report:
 - (a) fundamental principles on which multilingual services are based;
 - (b) guidelines in determining priorities for multilingual services;
 - (c) ~~description of~~ French Language Services delivery; and
 - (d) general procedures and operational guidelines.
- (2) the City of Toronto adopt the multilingual services policy as outlined in this report and that appropriate officials be given authority to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.

Background:

Previous policies:

Of the seven amalgamating municipalities, the former Metro and the former City of Toronto had policies referring to multilingual access. These municipalities had designated multilingual staff who provided translation and interpretation services. The other municipalities provided multilingual services on an informal basis. (appendix 1).

Les anciennes villes de Métro et de Toronto fournissaient aussi des services en français (annexe 3-français). L'ancienne ville de Toronto avait établi en 1981 le Comité français de l'hôtel de ville de Toronto/ the French Committee of Toronto City Hall lequel, durant l'amalgamation, fut transformé au Comité français de la Ville de Toronto/ City of Toronto French Committee actuel en 1998.

The former Metro and the Former City of Toronto also provided French services (appendix 3-anglais). The Former City of Toronto had established in 1981 the French Committee of Toronto City Hall / Comité français de l'hôtel de ville de Toronto which, during the amalgamation, was transformed into the present City of Toronto French Committee / Comité français de la Ville de Toronto in 1998.

Current Approach:

Since amalgamation, City departments have had uniform access to translation and interpretation services.

In 2000, the City of Toronto provided residents with oral interpretations in 52 languages and written translations in 37 languages. These services are provided by the Multilingual Services Unit of the Corporate Communications Division. The unit serves all City departments, as well as many agencies. High volume clients include Public Health, the Works and Emergency Services Department, Parks and Recreation and the City's various housing organizations. Staff in the Multilingual Services provide a full range of services ranging from consultation on demographics of a neighbourhood and identification of prominent languages, to translation, interpretation, through to project completion.

Toronto's Diversity:

Toronto's diverse population makes it one of the most multilingual cities in the world. More than half of Toronto's residents (52 percent) have come from outside of Canada. Toronto is recognized world-wide as a city that embraces its different communities. The City's vision reflects the values and traditions of a diverse, democratic society.

Process for developing this policy:

Staff consulted with a variety of stakeholders including Members of Council, representatives from the Access and Equity Unit of the CAO's Office and staff from departments and agencies.

Comments:

(2) Principles:

It is recommended that the following fundamental principles form the basis of the City of Toronto's multilingual services policy:

- (a) La ville de Toronto reconnaît que la diversité ethnique de notre communauté est une source d'enrichissement et de force aux niveaux social, culturel et économique et de prestige/influence au niveaux national et international.
- (b) The City of Toronto recognizes that the ethnic diversity of our community is a source of social, cultural and economic enrichment and strength and of national and international prestige/influence.

La ville de Toronto reconnaît que divers groupes ethniques ont choisi de s'identifier au français ou à l'anglais, les deux langues officielles du Canada; que le français et l'anglais sont des facteurs importants pour attirer de nouveaux arrivants de souches ethniques des autres pays et des autres régions du Canada.

The City of Toronto recognizes that various ethnic groups have chosen to identify with French or English, the two official languages of Canada; that both French and English are important factors in attracting newcomers of ethnic backgrounds from other countries and from other regions of Canada.

***La ville de Toronto reconnaît que les communautés francophone et anglophone sont non seulement des communautés établies; mais également des communautés d'accueil et d'intégration, composée de milliers d'individus dont les langues maternelles sont le français ou l'anglais et de milliers d'autres pour lesquels le français ou l'anglais sont des langues de choix ou apprises pour la communication.

***The City of Toronto recognizes that the Francophone and Anglophone communities are not only established communities, but also intake and integration communities made up of thousands of individuals whose mother tongue is either French or English and thousands more for whom French or English are the preferred or learned languages of communication.

***La ville de Toronto reconnaît que les communautés francophone et anglophone sont les liens communs entre plusieurs groupes ethniques.

***The City of Toronto recognizes that the French and English communities are the common links between many ethnic groups.

- (b) The City of Toronto recognizes that providing multilingual services is an effective way to reach individuals, groups and organizations of diverse communities to allow them to access City services and programs.

***La ville de Toronto reconnaît que ses communautés de langues officielles, avec leur diversité et infrastructure ethniques respectives, lui permettent de représenter la dualité linguistique du Canada lors d'événements politiques, sociaux, culturels, sportifs d'envergure nationale et internationale.

***The City of Toronto recognizes that its official languages communities, with their respective ethnic diversity and infrastructure, allow it to represent the linguistic duality of Canada at political, social, cultural, sporting events of national and international level.

- (c) Adoption of this policy is another step in the implementation of the Council-approved report of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity (December, 1999) which states:

“All residents shall be entitled to municipal services and programs which are racially sensitive, culturally and linguistically appropriate, gender appropriate, accommodate disability, and are adequately resourced to ensure equitable access and outcomes.”

- (d) The need to provide multilingual services must be addressed in communications plans that support City of Toronto programs.

- (e) The City of Toronto will provide high quality, accurate translations that meet professional standards.
- (f) To ensure efficiency and accountability in the provision of multilingual services, the City shall deliver multilingual services, that meet the diverse needs of its many audiences, in the most timely and cost effective manner through the Multilingual Services Unit, Corporate Communications Division.

(2) Guidelines for Determining Priorities for Multilingual Services:

The delivery of multilingual services requires sound judgement and decision-making in ascertaining how interpretation and translation needs can be met in the most effective manner. It is important to first identify the target audience(s). Departmental and agency staff responsible for specific public services or programs are the most familiar with their audiences' needs. The decision to translate a document or provide interpretation services into one or more languages requires that a number of factors be considered:

- (a) Demographics: The City of Toronto's population, as identified by home language in the most recent census data is outlined in appendix 2. Demographic information is useful when a particular message is targeted to all City residents. Languages accessed through the City's Language Line Services (over-the-phone interpretation service) is also a useful guide.

***Démographie: Nombreux sont les immigrants provenant de pays où le français ou l'anglais sont des langues officielles ou des langues parlées (souvent apprises) qui s'intègrent à la communauté torontoise.

***Demographics: Many immigrants, from countries where French or English are official languages or spoken (often learned) languages, integrate Toronto's community.

***Démographie: La migration francophone et anglophone (intra-provinciale et inter-provinciale) est un autre élément de la croissance de la ville de Toronto, impliquant aussi la composition de leurs groupes ethniques respectifs.

***Demographics: Francophone and Anglophone migration (intra-provincial and inter-provincial) is another element in the growth of the city of Toronto, including the composition of their respective ethnic groups.

- (b) Language needs of a particular community: When narrowing the target audience to specific communities, the language needs of ethno-racial groups in those communities must be determined. This is often the case for certain public health or public education programs where staff are able to identify specific ethnic communities, or specific population groups, as the intended recipients of a message.

- (c) Language needs of a particular geographic area or neighbourhood: When the message is intended for easily identifiable geographic areas, the prominent languages spoken in that particular area must be determined. This is an approach often used by Works and Emergency Services, for example, when it communicates information about road or watermain work in a particular neighbourhood.

***La communauté francophone n'est pas concentrée dans un seul quartier ou secteur de la ville. La communauté francophone, étant une communauté établie et d'accueil, ayant aussi accès à des services garantis par des lois fédérale et ontarienne, fournit, grâce à ses réseaux francophones établis, plusieurs services à ses membres, incluant ceux dont la langue maternelle est le français et ceux pour lesquels le français est la langue de choix ou apprise pour la communication.

***The French community is not concentrated in a single neighbourhood or area of the city. The Francophone community, being an established and an intake community and having access to services guaranteed by federal and Ontario laws, provides through established Francophone network, many services to its members, including those whose mother tongue is French and those for whom French is their preferred or learned language of communication.

La ville de Toronto reconnaît que la communauté francophone parle une des langues officielles du Canada; qu'elle jouit de certains droits garantis sous la législation fédérale et ontarienne; qu'elle est une communauté établie et d'accueil; qu'elle est un facteur important pour attirer les Canadiens d'expression française des autres régions de l'Ontario et du Canada et pour attirer de nouveaux arrivants de souches ethniques des autres pays francophones ou des autres régions du Canada et que, pour toutes ces raisons, la communauté francophone a plus d'influence pour Toronto que le nombre comparatif de ses membres.

The City of Toronto recognizes that the French community speaks one of the official languages of Canada; that it has certain rights guaranteed under federal and Ontarian legislations; that it is an established as well as an intake community; that it is an important factor in attracting French-speaking Canadians from other regions of Ontario and Canada and in attracting newcomers of ethnic backgrounds from other Francophone countries and from other regions of Canada and that, for all these reasons, the French community has more influence for Toronto than the comparative number of its members.

- (d) Type of City information: Priorities may also be established based upon the nature and type of information. For example, a document which addresses life-threatening issues such as carbon monoxide poisoning or immunization is identified as a priority for translation. The length of a document should also be taken into consideration; for many documents a summary is appropriate.

The Multilingual Services Unit is in regular contact with the Access and Equity Office, the Public Health Division, Social Services, Housing Services and the Urban Development Services Department to keep up-to-date on population trends and immigration patterns, as well as language needs for new arrivals to the city. This is supplemented, as appropriate, by information obtained from school boards.

(3) French Language Services:

The provision of French language services is outlined in the Government of Ontario's French Language Services Act and the Federal Government's Official Languages Act. The federal government translates all documents into the two official languages and ensures that federal government services are available in either English or French.

The Province of Ontario's French Language Services Act guarantees each individual the right to receive provincial government services in 23 designated areas of the province; the City of Toronto is one such area. Under the Act, municipalities are not required to provide French language services, even in designated areas. Municipalities are responsible for deciding whether or not to provide their services in French.

~~This policy recommends that the translation of documents into French be provided whenever public information on citywide issues is also translated into another language.~~

***Toronto reconnaît l'importance de la dualité linguistique aux niveaux provincial et national; reconnaît la communauté francophone comme étant une des deux communautés de langue officielle du Canada et reconnaît les avantages de promouvoir le bien-être et la croissance de sa communauté francophone dans sa poursuite de prestige/influence nationale et internationale et reconnaît donc l'égalité du français et de l'anglais lorsqu'elle fournit des services multilingues à ses citoyens.

***Toronto recognizes the importance of linguistic duality at the provincial and national levels; recognizes the importance of its French community as being one of the two official language communities of Canada and recognizes, the advantages of promoting the well-being and growth of its French community in its pursuit of national and international prestige/influence and therefore recognizes the equality of French and English when it provides multilingual service to its citizens.

Toronto reconnaît l'importance de la continuité et la complémentarité des services en français offerts aux niveaux fédéral, provincial et municipal pour ses citoyens de langue française et surtout pour l'accueil envers et l'intégration de ses nouveaux arrivants francophones, en provenance des autres provinces ou pays.

Toronto recognizes the importance of the continuity and complementarity of French language services offered at federal, provincial and municipal levels for its French-speaking citizens and especially for the intake and integration of its Francophone newcomers, from other provinces or countries.

(4) General Operating Procedures:

In order for multilingual services to be delivered consistently across the City, it is useful to include a number of operational guidelines as part of this policy.

Que la ville et les organismes francophones établissent un partenariat via le Comité français de la ville de Toronto afin d'assurer la livraison de services multilingues à coûts abordables à la communauté francophones en utilisant les réseaux francophones existants.

That the City and Francophone organizations establish a partnership via the City of Toronto French Committee to ensure the delivery of cost effective multilingual services to the French community using the existing French networks.

- (a) Departments must determine budgets and include translation and interpretation services in their annual workplans.
- (b) Departments should provide as much notice as possible to Multilingual Services regarding upcoming translation projects to ensure print and production deadlines are met.
- (c) In conjunction with the Multilingual Services Unit, departments should evaluate the effectiveness of translation and interpretation in reaching their audiences and achieving their objectives.
- (d) The Multilingual Services Unit in Corporate Communications will continue to broker multilingual services for city departments and agencies at competitive rates.
- (e) Departments/programs providing written materials in third languages should include the phrase "oral interpretation available in additional languages." The provision of interpretation services can be through Language Line Services (over the phone) or by City staff, where appropriate.
- (f) Where appropriate, individual units in departments should establish lists of employees who speak other languages and who are willing to provide an informal interpretation service to help overcome language barriers in the delivery of customer service.

Conclusions:

This report recommends a multilingual services policy for the City of Toronto that provides principles, guidelines and operating procedures for the effective delivery of multilingual and French language services to its communities. A separate policy addressing barrier-free communications for seniors and people with disabilities will be developed.

Contacts:

Valerie Chavossy, Director, Corporate Communications Division, 416 397-4149

Patricia MacDonell, Manager, Public Information, 416 392-8591

Elizabeth Pong, Supervisor, Multilingual Services, 416 397-5003

Appendices:

Appendix 1: Copies of applicable policies of former Metro and former City of Toronto

Appendix 2: Recent census data

The Administration Committee reports, for the information of Council, having also had before it a communication (January 16, 2002) from the Councillor Peter LiPrete, Ward 8 - York West, writing in support of the City of Toronto Multilingual Services Policy.

The following persons appeared before the Administration Committee in connection with the foregoing matter:

- Ms. Manon Le Paven, President, City of Toronto French Committee;
- Mr. Jean Bédard, Q.C., incoming President, The Toronto French Committee; and
- Mr. Francois Bergeron, Associate Publisher, L'Express; and filed a written submission in regard thereto.

Councillor Pam McConnell, Toronto Centre-Rosedale, also appeared before the Administration Committee in connection with the foregoing matter.