

Clause embodied in Report No. 2 of the Works Committee, as adopted by the Council of the City of Toronto at its meeting held on February 13, 14 and 15, 2002.

8

Intersection Safety Program to Reduce Red-Light Running

(City Council on February 13, 14 and 15, 2002, adopted this Clause, without amendment.)

The Works Committee recommends the adoption of the following report (December 31, 2001) from the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services:

Purpose:

The purpose of this report is to recommend that Council request the Government of Ontario to extend the appropriate legislation (Bill 102), thus allowing the City of Toronto to continue its red-light camera pilot project for an additional two years, until November 20, 2004.

Financial Implications and Impact Statement:

No specific financial approvals are being requested at this time. Contingent upon notification of the Government of Ontario's approval to extend Bill 102 for an additional two years, staff will report on the financial implications to the City of extending the red-light camera pilot project. It is anticipated that the follow-up "financial implications" report will be submitted to one of the Works Committee meetings to be held in May 2002. The follow-up report will provide information on the costs and revenues of the red-light camera pilot project to date. In addition, the report will identify the extent to which the project is meeting Council's direction that the debt charges to finance the pilot project be offset by the revenue generated from tickets produced by the red-light camera system.

Recommendation:

It is recommended that Council request the Government of Ontario, through the Ministry of Transportation, Ontario to extend Bill 102 for an additional two years, until November 20, 2004.

Background:

On December 18, 1998, the Red-Light Cameras Pilot Projects Act, 1998 (Bill 102) received Royal Assent. The Act amends the Highway Traffic Act to enable municipalities, for a period of two years, to use evidence obtained from red-light cameras to issue violation notices.

City Council, at its meeting held on April 11, 12 and 13, 2000, granted authority for City officials to:

- (1) retain Lockheed Martin IMS Canada for the supply, installation, operation and maintenance of red-light camera systems in the City of Toronto;
- (2) execute an operational agreement with the Ministry of Transportation, Ontario permitting the City of Toronto to become a designated red-light camera pilot area and to obtain motor vehicle registration information necessary to lay charges; and
- (3) implement a municipal processing centre for issuing offence notices on behalf of the City of Toronto as well as other participating municipalities under the program, and to execute an agreement with the participating municipalities regarding the sharing of staffing, office space and equipment costs.

There are six municipalities in Ontario which have been designated by the Ministry of Transportation, Ontario as red-light camera pilot areas, namely, City of Toronto, City of Hamilton, City of Ottawa, Regional Municipality of Halton, Regional Municipality of Peel, and the Regional Municipality of Waterloo.

The Ministry of Transportation, Ontario has hired a consultant to conduct the “before and after” evaluation study. The evaluation study includes 58 sites in total throughout Ontario, with approximately equal numbers of red-light camera sites, stepped-up police enforcement sites, and control sites. “Before and after” data collected and analyzed for the evaluation study will include collision frequencies, traffic volumes and red-light violations. Data relevant to other violations will be collected at the stepped-up police enforcement sites. Annual totals of red-light running convictions within the court districts of the participating municipalities will also be obtained.

The participating municipalities are reimbursing the Province for all costs associated with the evaluation study as well as the costs for provincial staff involved in project support.

Discussion:

On November 20, 2000, Bill 102 was proclaimed by the Lieutenant Governor and on the same day, the City of Toronto and the participating municipalities began operation of the red-light cameras. Based on the wording in Bill 102, the authority to operate red-light cameras will automatically expire on November 20, 2002.

The red-light camera pilot project includes 18 red-light cameras, which are routinely rotated among 68 sites within the six participating municipalities.

The “before and after” evaluation study includes data collected from 19 red-light camera sites and 17 stepped-up police enforcement sites located within the six participating municipalities. The “before and after” evaluation study also includes 22 control sites, 12 of which are located within the six participating municipalities and an additional 10 which are located within the Cities of London and Windsor, Ontario. The distribution of red-light cameras, police enforcement and control sites is listed in the table below.

Table 1: Red-Light Camera and Evaluation Site Distribution

Red-Light Camera Distribution			“Before and After” Evaluation Study (1)		
Municipality	# of Red-Light Cameras	# of Camera Sites	# of Camera Sites	# of Police Enforcement Sites	# of Control Sites (2)
Toronto	10	38	7	4	6
Hamilton	2	8	1	2	2
Ottawa	2	8	5	2	0
Halton	1	4	3	3	4
Peel	2	6	2	5	0
Waterloo	1	4	1	1	0
London	0	0	0	0	6
Windsor	0	0	0	0	4
Total	18	68	19	17	22

Notes:

- ¹ Data used in the “before and after” evaluation study are collected manually over an eight-hour period.
- ² The purpose of control sites is to provide a contrast of the frequency of red-light running compared to sites treated with either red-light cameras or stepped-up police enforcement.

In the first year of operation, approximately 21,800 violation notices were issued Province wide for red-light running at red-light camera sites. Approximately 9,300 of the violation notices issued were at red-light camera sites in the City of Toronto. The number of monthly charges laid for red-light running in the City of Toronto and for all six participating municipalities is listed in Appendix A. The City of Toronto red-light camera sites are listed in Appendix B.

There are three reasons for recommending that the City of Toronto request the Government of Ontario to extend the Red-Light Camera Pilot Project for an additional two years:

- (1) initial results from the first year of operation of the red-light cameras show a reduction in the frequency of red-light running;
- (2) there is strong public support for camera enforcement of red-light running; and
- (3) it would permit municipalities to continue operating red-light cameras beyond November 20, 2002, while waiting for the Government of Ontario’s decision regarding continuation of the project (expected in the fall of 2003), thereby avoiding a period of non-operation which may be unnecessary.

As part of the project, an independent comprehensive “before and after” statistical evaluation is being undertaken. The preliminary results from the study sites of the changes in red light running violations have just been compiled. The frequency of red-light running has decreased at

those red-light camera sites being evaluated by more than 40 percent on average. At the same time, the preliminary results indicate virtually no spillover effect in reduced violations at those intersections without cameras. The preliminary results demonstrate “reduction in violations” only whereas the real measure of the benefit of the project is in safety improvement as expressed by collision reduction. Collision data from the first full year of operation will be available in April/May 2002 and staff will report to Council at that time. However, at least two years of collision information is required to make a proper assessment of whether a change has really occurred. The collision analysis for the two-year project will be available in May 2003.

Public opinion studies conducted in Canada show that the public is strongly in favour of the use of red-light cameras. An Environics poll, conducted in early 2001, interviewed more than 2000 Canadian adults. The poll results are accurate to within two percent at the 95 percent level of confidence. The poll methodology indicates that Canadians were informed that electronic enforcement involves using cameras instead of police to identify vehicles that run red lights. When asked whether they support various forms of electronic traffic enforcement, Canadians expressed high levels of support for the use of electronic traffic enforcement techniques, such as red-light cameras. Seventy-nine percent of Canadians supported the use of cameras to identify vehicles that go through intersections after the traffic signal has turned red. It is interesting to note that the residents of Ontario, particularly in Toronto, are more likely than average to strongly support the use of all forms of electronic traffic enforcement.

As well as being supported by the public, extension of the red-light camera pilot project would be consistent with the initiatives of the Government of Ontario. A statement issued by the Government of Ontario in August 2001 indicates that addressing the issue of aggressive and unsafe driving and promotion of safe driving practices is a top priority of the Ministry of Transportation, Ontario.

The Province has indicated that the future of the red-light camera legislation will depend upon the results presented in the final evaluation report, which will summarize statistically the combined effect of police enforcement and red-light cameras. However, the final evaluation report summarizing the two years of the pilot project (November 2000 to November 2002) will only be complete in the summer of 2003, following receipt and analysis of all 2002 collision information (collision data will only be available from the police in April/May 2003).

If the current red-light camera legislation is not extended beyond its current two-year period, the authority to operate red-light cameras will expire in November 2002. This would mean closing down red-light camera operations to await the results of the review of the final evaluation report by the Ministry of Transportation, Ontario. If the Province were to decide to support continued use of red-light cameras, there would be a further waiting period until enabling legislation was enacted and proclaimed. A realistic timetable for these events is as follows:

Table 2: Red-Light Camera Project Extension Timetable

Date:	Event:
November 20, 2002	Current legislation expires. End of two-year pilot.
April/May 2003	Collision data received from police.
June 2003	Final evaluation study report completed and submitted.
August 2003	Ministry of Transportation completes review.
September 2003	Government of Ontario decides future of red-light camera legislation.
If the Government of Ontario decides in favour of red-light camera continuation, municipalities would have to take the following steps.	
October 2003	Municipalities commence procurement process for field equipment operations.
February 2004	New field services contract awarded by municipal Councils.
June 2004	Field service operation and maintenance commence.

A two-year extension of the red-light camera legislation, until November 2004, would allow the pilot project to continue without interruption. The two-year extension would provide the Province sufficient time to assess the “before and after” study results and to enact the appropriate legislation in the event that the Province determines, during the fall of 2003, that the project should continue. It would also provide the City of Toronto and other municipal partners sufficient time to procure services for red-light camera field operations through a competitive tendering process. If the Government of Ontario does not agree to extend the pilot project for an additional two years, red-light camera operations will be interrupted by almost two years, as shown in Table 2 above.

Conclusion:

The three reasons for recommending that the City of Toronto request the Government of Ontario to extend the Red-Light Camera Pilot Project for an additional two years are as follows:

- (1) initial project results show a reduction in the frequency of red-light running;
- (2) there is strong public support for camera enforcement of red-light running; and
- (3) it would permit municipalities to continue operating red-light cameras beyond November 20, 2002, while waiting for the Government of Ontario’s decision regarding continuation of the project (expected in the fall of 2003), thereby avoiding a period of non-operation which may be unnecessary.

Contacts:

Mike Brady
Manager, Red Light Camera Operations
Phone: 416-397-5016 Fax: 416-392-4919
mbrady@city.toronto.on.ca

Les Kelman
Director, Traffic Management Centre
Phone: 416-392-5372 Fax: 416-397-5011
lkelman@city.toronto.on.ca

Appendix A

Red-Light Camera Activity – Charges Laid

Month	Charges Laid - Toronto Sites	Charges Laid - All Sites (Toronto included)
November 2000	130	328
December 2000	272	723
January 2001	149	468
February 2001	174	587
March 2001	304	869
April 2001	447	1046
May 2001	534	1746
June 2001	777	2552
July 2001	1248	3017
August 2001	1744	3174
September 2001	1234	2408
October 2001	1309	2472
November 2001	943	2361
Total – to date	9,265	21,751

Appendix B

Toronto Red-Light Camera Sites

Location	Ward(s)
Finch Avenue and Kipling Avenue	1
Dixon Road and Islington Avenue	2, 4
Dixon Road and Martin Grove Road	2, 4
Eglinton Avenue and Martin Grove Road	3, 4
The Queensway and Royal York Road	5
Finch Avenue and Weston Road	7
Finch Avenue and Jane Street	7, 8
Dufferin Street and Steeles Avenue	8, 10
Allen Road and Sheppard Avenue	8, 9, 10
Bathurst Street and Finch Avenue	10, 23
Weston Road and Lawrence Avenue	11
Dundas Street and Keele Street	13
Dufferin Street and Eglinton Avenue	15, 17
Dufferin Street and St. Clair Avenue	17
Yonge Street and Eglinton Avenue	16, 22
Yonge Street and York Mills Road	16, 25
Dufferin Street and Bloor Street	18
Bloor Street and Bathurst Street	19, 20
University Avenue and Gerrard Street	20, 27
Yonge Street and Steeles Avenue	23, 24

Location	Ward(s)
Yonge Street and Finch Avenue	23, 24
Finch Avenue and Don Mills Road	24, 33
Eglinton Avenue and Don Mills Road	26
Yonge Street and Wellesley Street	27
Lake Shore Boulevard E/B and Yonge Street	28
Yonge Street and Richmond Street	28
Danforth Avenue and Broadview Avenue	29, 30
St. Clair and Victoria Park Avenue	31, 37
Lawrence Avenue and Victoria Park Avenue	34, 37
Eglinton Avenue and Pharmacy Avenue	35, 37
Eglinton Avenue and Markham Road	36, 38
Lawrence Avenue and Warden Avenue	37
Ellesmere Road and Brimley Road	37, 38
Ellesmere Road and Markham Road	38
Lawrence Avenue and Markham Road	38, 43
Steeles Avenue and Warden Avenue	39
Brimley Road and Huntingwood Drive	41
Kingston Road and Morningside Avenue	43, 44