

THE CITY OF TORONTO

City Clerk's Division

Minutes of Board of Health

Meeting No. s7

Monday, July 29, 2002

The Board of Health held a special meeting on Monday, July 29, 2002 in Committee Room No. 1, 2nd Floor, City Hall, Toronto, commencing at 2:10 p.m.

Members Present:

Councillor Joe Mihevc, Chair	x
Councillor Augimeri	x
Councillor John Filion	x
Councillor Norman Kelly	x
Councillor Jane Pitfield	x
Councillor David Soknacki	x
Ms. Helen Chan	x
Mr. Brian Hyndman	x
Mr. Brian MacKay	x
Dr. Rosana Pellizzari	x
Ms. Nancy Peters	x
Trustee Mark Stefanini	x
Mr. Lee Zaslofsky	x

Also Present:

Ms. Fiona Nelson

Councillor Mihevc in the Chair.

Confirmation of Minutes.

On motion by Councillor Pitfield, the Minutes of the meeting of the Board of Health held on June 10, 2002 were confirmed.

**7.1 Election of Vice Chair for the Remainder of the Year.
Appointment of Members of Council to the Board of Health.**

The Board of Health had before it a communication (May 27, 2002) from the City Clerk, advising that the City of Toronto Council, at its meeting held on May 21, 22, and 23, 2002, in adopting, as amended, Clause No. 1 of Report No. 3 of the Striking Committee, entitled, "Appointment of Members of Council to Standing and Other Committees of Council, Various Boards, Special Purpose Bodies and Special Positions", appointed the following six Members of Council to the Toronto Board of Health, for a term of office commencing on June 21, 2002 and expiring on November 30, 2003, and until their successors are appointed:

Councillor Maria Augimeri
Councillor John Filion
Councillor Norman Kelly
Councillor Joe Mihevc
Councillor Jane Pitfield
Councillor David Soknacki

Councillor Mihevc nominated Councillor Pitfield as Vice-Chair of the Board, who accepted the nomination. There being no further nominations, Councillor Pitfield was duly elected Vice-Chair of the Board for the remainder of the year and until her successor is appointed.

(Administrator, Nominations and Appointments; c. Councillor Jane Pitfield; Medical Officer of Health; Jane Speakman, Legal Services – July 30, 2002)

7.2 2003 City of Toronto Budget Process.

The Board of Health had before it a report (June 26, 2002) from the Medical Officer of Health, providing information on the 2003 City Budget Process and its application to Toronto Public Health; advising that there are no financial implications from the adoption of this report; and recommending that the Budget Sub-Committee of the Board of Health be convened over the summer to review the draft 2003 Capital and Operating Budget submissions and advise staff on issues arising therefrom.

The Board noted that the current membership of the Budget Subcommittee is as follows:

Chair: Vacant (was Councillor Irene Jones)
Councillor Joe Mihevc
Councillor Jane Pitfield
Brian MacKay

Lee Zaslofsky.

On motion by Councillor Kelly, the Board of Health took the following action:

- (1) adopted the aforementioned report from the Medical Officer of Health;
- (2) appointed Councillor David Soknacki and Mr. Brian Hyndman to the Board of Health Budget Subcommittee;
- (3) appointed Councillor Joe Mihevc as Chair of the Budget Subcommittee; and
- (4) directed that the report on the Toronto Public Health 2003 budget be transmitted to the Board of Health through its Budget Subcommittee for consideration by the Board of Health, prior to being submitted to the Budget Advisory Committee.

The Membership of the Budget Subcommittee is as follows:

Councillor Joe Mihevc (Chair)
Councillor Jane Pitfield
Councillor David Soknacki
Mr. Brian Hyndman
Mr. Brian MacKay
Mr. Lee Zaslofsky

(Board of Health Budget Subcommittee; c. Medical Officer of Health; Jane Speakman, Legal Services – July 30, 2002)

7.3 Improving the Air Quality Index (AQI).

The Board of Health had before it a report (June 25, 2002) from the Medical Officer of Health, reporting on the progress to date by federal and provincial agencies in improving the Air Quality Index (AQI) and making recommendations for further changes to improve AQI; advising that there are no direct financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report and recommending that the Board of Health:

Board of Health Minutes
Monday, July 29, 2002

- (1) support the Ontario Minister of the Environment and Energy's decision to add fine particles (PM_{2.5}) to the list of pollutants used to calculate the Air Quality Index (AQI);
- (2) urge the Ontario Minister of the Environment and Energy to make further improvements to the AQI by:
 - (a) replacing the current AQI classifications (very good to poor) with terms that more accurately reflect the true health risk posed by smog-related pollutants (i.e. low, moderate or high health risk);
 - (b) replacing the current health messages delivered through the AQI with messages that alert the general public and sensitive populations (such as the elderly, children and those with respiratory and cardiac problems) to AQI values that may adversely affect their health;
 - (c) refining and pilot testing the new health risk-based AQI, including the development of forecasting capabilities for the new index;
 - (d) implementing by April 2004 the new health risk-based AQI which was developed by Health Canada and Environment Canada, in partnership with air quality experts from municipal and provincial governments, and health and environmental non-governmental agencies;
- (3) that the federal and provincial governments enhance the National Air Pollutants Surveillance (NAPS) system to support timely implementation of the new AQI as a uniform and consistent smog warning system across the country;
- (4) request the federal and provincial Ministers of the Environment to deploy sufficient air quality monitoring resources to enable the timely implementation of the new health risk-based AQI as a uniform and consistent air quality indicator system across Canada;
- (5) forward this report to the GTA Clean Air Council, the Ontario and Canadian Public Health Associations, the Association of Local Public Health Agencies, the Canadian, Ontario and New Brunswick Lung Associations, the Ontario Medical Association, the Association of Municipalities of Ontario, and the Federation of Canadian Municipalities, requesting their endorsement of the addition of fine particles (PM_{2.5}) to the current AQI reporting system by September 2002, and the implementation of the new health risk-based AQI in Ontario by April 2004; and
- (6) request that appropriate City officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect hereto.

Board of Health Minutes
Monday, July 29, 2002

Keith Stewart, Ph.D., Toronto Environmental Alliance, appeared before the Board with respect to this matter submitted a written brief.

Councillor Soknacki moved adoption of the report, as amended, by:

(A) amending Recommendation No. 3 to read:

“(3) request that the federal and provincial Ministers of the Environment enhance the National Air Pollutants Surveillance (NAPS) system to support timely implementation of the new AQI as a uniform and consistent smog warning system across the country;” and

(B) amending Recommendation No. 5 to include the Toronto Board of Trade and the Toronto and York Region Labour Council in the list of organizations.

Councillor Pitfield moved that the Medical Officer of Health, in consultation with appropriate City officials be requested to report to the Board of Health on the number of smog alert days in 2001 and 2002 thus far, and how smog alert days impact on the delivery of City services.

The foregoing motions *carried*.

To summarize, the Board of Health adopted the report, as amended, and, in so doing:

- (1) supports the Ontario Minister of the Environment and Energy’s decision to add fine particles (PM_{2.5}) to the list of pollutants used to calculate the Air Quality Index (AQI);
- (2) urged the Ontario Minister of the Environment and Energy to make further improvements to the AQI by:
 - (a) replacing the current AQI classifications (very good to poor) with terms that more accurately reflect the true health risk posed by smog-related pollutants (i.e. low, moderate or high health risk);
 - (b) replacing the current health messages delivered through the AQI with messages that alert the general public and sensitive populations (such as the elderly, children and those with respiratory and cardiac problems) to AQI values that may adversely affect their health;
 - (c) refining and pilot testing the new health risk-based AQI, including the development of forecasting capabilities for the new index;

Board of Health Minutes
Monday, July 29, 2002

- (d) implementing by April 2004 the new health risk-based AQI which was developed by Health Canada and Environment Canada, in partnership with air quality experts from municipal and provincial governments, and health and environmental non-governmental agencies;
- (3) requested that the federal and provincial Ministers of the Environment enhance the National Air Pollutants Surveillance (NAPS) system to support timely implementation of the new AQI as a uniform and consistent smog warning system across the country;
- (4) requested the federal and provincial Ministers of the Environment to deploy sufficient air quality monitoring resources to enable the timely implementation of the new health risk-based AQI as a uniform and consistent air quality indicator system across Canada;
- (5) forwarded this report to the GTA Clean Air Council, the Ontario and Canadian Public Health Associations, the Association of Local Public Health Agencies, the Canadian, Ontario and New Brunswick Lung Associations, the Ontario Medical Association, the Association of Municipalities of Ontario, the Federation of Canadian Municipalities, the Toronto Board of Trade and the Toronto and York Region Labour Council, requesting their endorsement of the addition of fine particles (PM_{2.5}) to the current AQI reporting system by September 2002, and the implementation of the new health risk-based AQI in Ontario by April 2004;
- (6) requested the Medical Officer of Health, in consultation with appropriate City officials, to report to the Board of Health on the number of smog alert days in 2001 and 2002 thus far, and how smog alert days impact on the delivery of City services; and
- (7) authorized and directed the appropriate City officials to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.

(Minister of the Environment and Energy; Federal Minister of Environment; GTA Clean Air Council; Ontario Public Health Association; Canadian Public Health Association; Association of Local Public Health Agencies; Canadian Lung Association; Ontario Lung Association; New Brunswick Lung Association; Ontario Medical Association; Association of Municipalities of Ontario; Federation of Canadian Municipalities; Toronto Board of Trade; Toronto and York Region Labour Council; c. Medical

Officer of Health; Jane Speakman, Legal Services; Keith Stewart, Ph.D., Toronto Environmental Alliance – July 30, 2002)

7.4 Assessing the Health Impacts of Diesel Exhaust in Toronto.

The Board of Health had before it a report (June 25, 2002) from the Medical Officer of Health, reviewing the health effects of diesel exhaust and assessing the potential impact in Toronto; advising that there are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report; and recommending that:

- (1) the Board of Health urge the federal Minister of the Environment to approve the proposed regulation to establish a 15-ppm sulphur standard for on-road diesel effective June 2006;
- (2) the Board of Health reiterate its request to the federal Minister of the Environment to take additional steps to reduce the public health risks arising from diesel emissions by:
 - (a) harmonizing sulphur standards for off-road diesel with those for on-road fuels;
 - (b) providing incentives for the early introduction of low-sulphur diesel;
- (3) the Board of Health encourage the federal Minister of the Environment and the federal Minister of Transport to negotiate the early introduction of low-sulphur diesel and the early adoption of low-emission diesel technology with the industry;
- (4) the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services, as Chair of the Toronto Inter-departmental Environment Committee, ensure that the City's Air Quality Strategy includes consideration of measures that can be taken to reduce emissions from, and exposure to, diesel exhaust;
- (5) the Board of Health forward this report to the GTA Clean Air Council and the Toronto Cancer Prevention Coalition for their information; and,
- (6) the appropriate City officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.

Keith Stewart, Ph.D., Toronto Environmental Alliance, appeared before the Board with respect to this matter and submitted a written brief.

Councillor Soknacki moved adoption of the aforementioned report, as amended by amending Recommendation No. 5 by adding the Toronto Transit Commission, the

Toronto Board of Trade and the Toronto and York Region Labour Council to the list of organizations.

Dr. Pellizzari moved that Recommendation No. 4 be amended by adding at the end thereof the following:

“Specifically, the Board of Health requests improved enforcement of the anti-idling by-law and the consideration of safer, alternative fuels”

The foregoing motions *carried*.

To summarize, the Board of Health adopted the aforementioned report, as amended, and, in so doing:

- (1) urged the federal Minister of the Environment to approve the proposed regulation to establish a 15-ppm sulphur standard for on-road diesel effective June 2006;
- (2) reiterated its request to the federal Minister of the Environment to take additional steps to reduce the public health risks arising from diesel emissions by:
 - (a) harmonizing sulphur standards for off-road diesel with those for on-road fuels;
 - (b) providing incentives for the early introduction of low-sulphur diesel;
- (3) encouraged the federal Minister of the Environment and the federal Minister of Transport to negotiate the early introduction of low-sulphur diesel and the early adoption of low-emission diesel technology with the industry;
- (4) requested the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services, as Chair of the Toronto Inter-departmental Environment Committee, to ensure that the City’s Air Quality Strategy includes consideration of measures that can be taken to reduce emissions from, and exposure to, diesel exhaust. Specifically, the Board of Health requests improved enforcement of the anti-idling by-law and the consideration of safer, alternative fuels;
- (5) forwarded this report to the GTA Clean Air Council; the Toronto Cancer Prevention Coalition; the Toronto Transit Commission; the Toronto Board of Trade; and the Toronto and York Region Labour Council for their information; and,
- (6) authorized and directed the appropriate City officials to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.

(Minister of Transport Canada; Federal Minister of Environment; GTA Clean Air Council; Federal Minister of Transport; Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services; Toronto Cancer Prevention Coalition; Toronto Transit Commission; Toronto Board of Trade; Toronto and York Region Labour Council; c. Medical Officer of Health; Jane Speakman, Legal Services; Keith Stewart, Ph.D., Toronto Environmental Alliance – July 30, 2002)

**7.5 Chromated Copper Arsenate (CCA) – Treated Wood
Advising the Public on Reducing the Potential for
Exposure to Arsenic.**

The Board of Health had before it a report (June 25, 2002) from the Medical Officer of Health, summarizing the health concerns surrounding Chromated Copper Arsenate (CCA)-treated wood and the potential for children's exposure to arsenic that can leach out of structures made of CCA-treated wood and outlining a public communications strategy on this matter regarding arsenic from CCA-treated wood structures directed at the public, school boards and childcare centres; advising that the estimated one time expenditure for developing and implementing the communications strategy outlined in this report is \$10,000; that funding for this initiative is available within the 2002 Toronto Public Health operating budget; and recommending that:

- (1) the Board of Health forward this report for information to City Council through the Economic Development and Parks Committee and the Community Services Committee; and
- (2) the appropriate City officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.

The Board of Health also had before it a communication (May 30, 2002) from the City Clerk, forwarding a motion moved by Councillor Chow, and adopted by City Council, at its meeting on May 21, 22 and 23, 2002, regarding pressure-treated wood in playground structures.

The Medical Officer of Health gave a verbal overview and submitted a Fact Sheet with respect to Chromated Copper Arsenate-Treated Wood.

On motion by Councillor Pitfield, the Board of Health adopted the aforementioned report and forwards same to City Council for information, through the Economic Development and Parks Committee and the Community Services

Committee, in accordance with Recommendation No. (1).

(Economic Development and Parks Committee; Community Services Committee; c. Councillor Olivia Chow; Medical Officer of Health; Jane Speakman, Legal Services – July 30, 2002)

7.6 Development Review Process: Harmonized Site Remediation Peer Review for Contaminated Sites.

The Board of Health had before it a communication (June 25, 2002) from the City Clerk, forwarding, for information, Clause No. 5 contained in Report No. 7 of the Works Committee, headed “Development Review Process: Harmonized Site Remediation Peer Review to Contaminated Sites”, which was adopted, as amended, by City Council at its meeting held on June 18, 19 and 20, 2002.

On motion by Councillor Pitfield, the Board of Health requested the Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services that when the report with respect to the efficacy of the new development review process is submitted to the Works Committee and the Budget Advisory Committee, the report also be submitted to the Board of Health for consideration.

(Commissioner of Works and Emergency Services; c. Medical Officer of Health; Works Committee; Budget Advisory Committee – July 30, 2002)

7.7 Council’s Goal of Purchasing 25 Percent Green Power.

The Board of Health had before it a report (June 10, 2002) from the Commissioner of Corporate Services, addressed to the Board of Health and the Administration Committee, responding to Council’s request regarding the process and progress being made towards meeting Council’s goal of purchasing 25 percent green power.

Keith Stewart, Ph.D., Toronto Environmental Alliance, appeared before the Board with respect to this matter and submitted a written brief.

The Board of Health:

- (1) on motion by Councillor Kelly, received the foregoing report for information;

- (2) on motion by Mr. Zaslofsky, recommended to the Administration Committee and the Budget Advisory Committee that a portion of savings achieved through demand side management be dedicated to green power purchases over the next 12 months; and
- (3) on motion by Dr. Pellizzari, directed that an urgent letter be sent to the Prime Minister, drawing his attention to the content of the following reports and urging him to ratify the Kyoto Protocols on behalf of Canada when he attends the Johannesburg meeting:
 - (a) (June 25, 2002) from the Medical Officer of Health, reporting on the progress to date by federal and provincial agencies in improving the Air Quality Index (AQI) and making recommendations for further changes to improve AQI;
 - (b) (June 25, 2002) from the Medical Officer of Health, reviewing the health effects of diesel exhaust and assessing the potential impact in Toronto; and
 - (c) (June 10, 2002) from the Commissioner of Corporate Services, responding to Council's request regarding the process and progress being made towards meeting Council's goal of purchasing 25 percent green power.

(Prime Minister; Administration Committee; Budget Advisory Committee; c. Commissioner of Corporate Services; Medical Officer of Health; Jane Speakman, Legal Services; Keith Stewart, Ph.D., Toronto Environmental Alliance – July 30, 2002)

7.8 Appointments to Board of Health Subcommittees and Sustainability Roundtable.

The Board of Health had before it a communication (June 24, 2002) from the Secretary, Board of Health, requesting the Board to appoint its representative(s) to the following subcommittees to replace Councillor Irene Jones:

- Board of Health Animal Services Subcommittee (chair)
- Board of Health Budget Subcommittee (chair)
- Board of Health Nominating Subcommittee; and
- Sustainability Roundtable (alternate: Brian MacKay)

On motion by Councillor Augimeri, the Board of Health:

- (1) requested staff to submit a report to the next meeting of the Board on the possibility of

appointing a Member of Council who is no longer a Member of the Board to the Animal Services Subcommittee;

- (2) appointed Councillor Mihevc as Chair of the Budget Subcommittee;
- (3) deferred consideration of appointments to the Nominating Subcommittee sine die; and
- (4) appointed Brian MacKay to the Sustainability Roundtable and Councillor Pitfield as alternate.

(Sustainability Roundtable; c. Medical Officer of Health; Jane Speakman, Legal Services; Helen Smith, Administrator, Nominations and Appointments – July 30, 2002)

7.9 Local Health Committee Minutes.

The Board of Health had before it minutes the following meetings:

- (1) Toronto/East York Local Health Committee meeting held on March 19, 2002;
- (2) Midtown Local Health Committee meeting held on May 27, 2002; and
- (3) Scarborough Local Health Committee meeting held on May 28, 2002.

On motion by Councillor Soknacki, the Board of Health received the foregoing minutes.

The Board of Health adjourned at 3:50 p.m.

Chair