



CITY CLERK

Clause embodied in Report No. 3 of the Policy and Finance Committee, as adopted by the Council of the City of Toronto at its meeting held on April 14, 15 and 16, 2003.

3

City of Toronto Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination

(City Council on April 14, 15 and 16, 2003, adopted this Clause, without amendment.)

The Policy and Finance Committee recommends the adoption of the following report (March 20, 2003) from the Chief Administrative Officer; and further that the Chief Administrative Officer be requested to establish a community advisory group to assist in the preparation of the Terms of Reference and the ongoing development of the next study:

Purpose:

This report presents the Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination for Council's consideration and approval.

Financial Implications and Impact Statement:

There are no additional financial implications for the 2003 budget because the actions arising from this report are ongoing and have been integrated within existing resources and budgeted for in 2003. Resources are available within the 2003 budget for implementation. A departmental planning guide is being developed to assist departments with preparing three year access and equity plans. These plans will identify any additional financial implications for new initiatives in future years and will be addressed through the annual budget process. The Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer has reviewed and concurs with this financial impact statement.

Recommendations:

It is recommended that:

- (1) the vision statement in the Final Report of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity adopted by Council in 1999 (Appendix 1) be re-affirmed as the City's vision on access, equity and diversity;
- (2) the Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination (Appendix 2) along with its vision, goal, guiding principles and strategic directions (Appendix 3) be adopted; and
- (3) the appropriate City Officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.

Background:

At its meeting of April - May 2001, (Policy and Finance Committee Report 4, Clause 9), Council directed the Chief Administrative Officer to prepare a City of Toronto Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination. This directive responded to the findings of ethno-racial inequities in the Michael Ornstein study and the City's proposal to the Government of Canada to establish a domestic plan of action for the elimination of racism and discrimination in relation to the United Nations World Conference Against Racism.

At its meeting of December 2001, (Administration Committee Report 18, Clause 25), Council established a Council Reference Group, comprised of Councillors serving on Community Advisory Committees and Working Groups on Access, Equity and Human Rights, to oversee the preparation of the Plan of Action. Council also requested that the CAO submit the Plan of Action by April 2003.

In February 2003, (Policy and Finance Committee Report 1, Clause 15), Council further directed that the Chief Administrative Officer use the report on the implementation of the recommendations of the Final Report of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity and the Council Reference Group's community consultation report, "Just Do It!" as the foundation for preparing the Plan of Action.

Comments:

Context:

Toronto is one of the most diverse cities in the world and has gained an international reputation for the successful management of its diversity. The City owes its success to the diverse people and communities that have made their home in Toronto. Equally important to Toronto's success is the leadership of Council in bringing forward public policies and programs aimed at removing barriers, promoting equitable participation of all residents and building an inclusive society.

In 1999, Council adopted the vision statement and ninety-seven (97) recommendations of the Final Report of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity. The City has been operating within this framework of access, equity and diversity. City departments have been implementing the recommendations, and Council has recently adopted the Chief Administrative Officer's status report on the implementation of the Task Force recommendations.

In addition, among the policies and programs approved by Council since 1998, are: the policy on non-discrimination; workplace human rights and harassment policy; policy on the elimination of hate activity; employment equity policy and workforce survey; access and equity grants program; immigration and settlement policy framework; multilingual services policy; same sex spousal benefits and the principle of same sex marriage. An employment accommodation policy and an Accessibility Plan required by the *Ontarians with Disabilities Act* are currently in preparation. City departments have also initiated access and equity plans.

Recognizing what the City has accomplished, the Plan of Action proposed in this report takes a step further to focus on the elimination of racism and discrimination. The rapid social and

economic change experienced by Toronto since the 1990's has made the task of achieving the goal of access, equity and diversity more challenging. There has been an intensification of the social and economic disparities among Toronto residents. These disparities impact disproportionately on Aboriginal people, racial minorities, recent immigrants, people with disabilities, women, lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender people. The Michael Ornstein study and studies by Statistics Canada, Canadian Council on Social Development, Centre for Social Justice Foundation for Research and Education, United Way of Greater Toronto, Family Services Association and the recently released 2001 Census data have documented these trends.

The City has noted that many of the inequities experienced by diverse individuals and groups require action by all sectors and all orders of government. As a result, the Plan of Action has included advocacy and partnership activities and co-operative strategies involving diverse communities, business, labour, employers, the education system and other orders of government.

Preparing the Plan of Action – A consultative process:

The proposed City of Toronto Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination has been developed through a consultative process. The Council Reference Group initiated the first series of consultations. It invited residents, community groups and organizations to offer input. Approximately 50 sessions were held across the City from May to November 2002.

Based on the results of this process, a draft Plan of Action was developed. The draft plan was reviewed by the Policy Coordination Team, the Executive Management Team and the inter-departmental access and equity staff team. For community input, the draft plan was also presented to the City's Community Advisory Committees at their meetings and at two community meetings convened by the Diversity Advocate.

Results of the Council Reference Group's consultation – "Just Do It!"

The report on the Council Reference Group's consultations, "Just Do It!" was released in November 2002 on the occasion of the City's celebration of the UN Human Rights Day.

Participants in the consultation sessions expressed their frustration with the barriers experienced and acts of hatred in their lives. They stressed the multiple factors, such as race, gender, disability, place of origin, sexual orientation and gender identity that compound their experience of discrimination in what is called "intersection of identities". They expressed the fear that they might be witnessing the decline of Toronto. They stated that addressing racism and discrimination was an urgent matter and asked the City to do more to create an inclusive society and to establish accountability mechanisms to monitor and assess the effectiveness of City policies and programs.

The report presents seven strategic directions for the Plan of Action based on the comments and specific recommendations and suggestions for action by the City from consultation participants. The seven strategic directions (outlined in Appendix 3) are:

- (i) Political leadership;
- (ii) Advocacy;

- (iii) Economic participation;
- (iv) Public education and awareness;
- (v) Service delivery;
- (vi) Building strong communities; and
- (vii) Accountability.

These strategic directions are consistent with the goals of social development, economic vitality, good governance and city building in Council's Strategic Plan.

The Plan of Action and the recommendations of the Final Report of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity - Resource implications:

The proposed actions in the Plan of Action relate to and reinforce the implementation of the recommendations of the Final Report of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity. The ninety-seven (97) recommendations of the Task Force are broad-based and include actions to eliminate racism and discrimination. Among the actions in the Task Force recommendations that are specifically related to the Plan of Action are Aboriginal self-determination, disability access, advocacy and partnership, participation and communication, service equity and planning, employment and leadership, building economic capacity, building and supporting community capacity, monitoring and evaluation, implementation and follow-up.

Since the City has been implementing the recommendations of the Final Report of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity, resources have been put in place for the implementation of actions for the elimination of racism and discrimination. No additional financial implications would result in 2003 from the adoption and implementation of the Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination. Resources may be needed in the future and they will be addressed through the annual budget process.

The Plan of Action is an important indication that the City is committed to the elimination of racism and discrimination and that it recognizes the multiple factors that create the experiences of discrimination among diverse people and communities in Toronto.

The approach of the Plan of Action:

The key message from the communities to the City of Toronto is that the City must remain vigilant and continue to challenge racism and discrimination. The Plan of Action recognizes this message and focuses on removing the barriers of racism and discrimination as essential steps in achieving the goal of access, equity and diversity. The racism and discrimination addressed in the Plan of Action include not only actions and behaviours motivated by biases, prejudice and hate by groups and individuals, but also broader social, economic, educational and political systems that have the effect of creating the barriers that deny equitable access to goods and services, education, housing, the labour market and life opportunities to people and communities of diverse backgrounds.

Through the Plan of Action, the City:

- (a) reaffirms “Diversity Our Strength”, embraces opportunities to build an inclusive society, serves as a model of diversity, and celebrates the cultural, economic and social successes of our diverse communities;
- (b) affirms its commitment to removing the barriers of racism and discrimination that exclude and disadvantage individuals and communities from participating equitably in all spheres of life in Toronto;
- (c) acknowledges that multiple factors, such as race, gender, disability, sexual orientations, gender identity, place of origin compound the discrimination of individuals and communities;
- (d) ensures that non-discrimination, anti-racism, accessibility and equity policies and programs are integrated in the operations of the municipality;
- (e) strengthens advocacy and partnership with communities, public and private sectors and other orders of government; and
- (f) demonstrates accountability to all residents in striving to achieve the goal of a diverse, equitable and inclusive society.

Highlights of the Plan of Action:

There are eight action items in the Plan of Action (Appendix 2).

- (1) The City will continue to achieve the full implementation of all recommendations of the Final Report of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity. As noted above, the 97 recommendations in the Final Report of the Task Force include actions for the elimination of racism and discrimination, and are complementary to the actions proposed in “Just Do It!”
- (2) The City will build an organization which is responsive to the diversity among City residents by developing an Action Plan Guide on access, equity and diversity to be used by departments and agencies, boards and commissions in developing action plans; developing an Accessibility Plan and report (*Ontarians with Disabilities Act*); completing the employment equity workforce survey; using the survey results to develop measures and actions to improve the representation of designated groups in the City’s workforce; implementing an employment accommodation policy; requesting agencies, boards and commissions to conduct an employment equity workforce survey; and implementing training and awareness programs that address all biases and intersection of diverse identities.

- (3) In response to the changing demographic composition of the population, the City will publish an annual diversity report card; undertake research to establish indicators for monitoring socio-economic conditions and setting service delivery priorities; conduct specific studies on issues identified by communities, including the intersection of identities; and hold a bi-annual workshop/seminar on best practices.
- (4) To pursue the direction of economic participation, the City will increase involvement in Aboriginal economic development in partnership with Aboriginal community organizations; integrate into the City's labour force development plans co-operative strategies to address unique needs of diverse communities, to ameliorate labour market and economic disparities; implement mentoring programs to assist employees and immigrant workers; continue outreach and information initiatives so that businesses from diverse communities have access to the procurement process of the City and agencies, boards and commissions; and provide information, peer networking and advocacy to remove barriers faced by small businesses and businesses owned by people from diverse communities.
- (5) In recognition of the need to build strong communities, the City will establish partnerships with communities, government and public and private sector organizations to address discrimination and inequity; develop resources of emerging community organizations through grants, staff support and access to City space; identify and remove barriers to municipal elections; use creative and innovative community engagement practices to facilitate diverse communities' participation in the City's decision-making process; continue to explore funding and resources for the establishment of an Office of Disability Issues; and review zoning bylaws to address barriers faced by the Aboriginal and diverse communities practising cultural and spiritual traditions and advocate for changes.
- (6) In recognition of the need for the public to accept and value diversity, the City will promote to the public the City's vision on access, equity and diversity and inform the public of City policies on non-discrimination, human rights and anti-hate; portray diverse populations in the City's advertising, communications and cultural programs through appropriate and inclusive language, pictures and images and create a Diversity Day; work with community groups, public and private sector organizations and other orders of government to combat hate and discrimination; publicize and celebrate the success and achievements of diverse people and communities to counter negative stereotypes and help the public understand their contributions to Toronto; and provide information on City services in plain language, multi-lingual and alternate formats, and make information available on the City's website, in published materials and to the ethno-specific and community media.
- (7) In keeping with its leadership and advocacy role, the City will continue to advocate to the federal and provincial governments for funding and co-operative strategies regarding affordable housing, public transit, childcare, employment programs, training in official languages, settlement services for immigrants and refugees; literacy programs; and accreditation and recognition of prior learning; develop an Urban Aboriginal Strategy in accordance with the principle of Aboriginal self-determination in partnership with the

Aboriginal communities and other orders of government; and advocate and partner with the school system to acquire adequate funding from the Province to meet the educational needs of students from diverse backgrounds, changes to allow community use of school space and facilities and continuation of equity programs.

- (8) In recognition of the need for the oversight and coordinated approach to accountability and monitoring, the Inter-departmental staff team on access and equity function as a corporate co-ordinating group for the implementation of the Plan of Action, Accessibility Plan and the recommendations of the Final Report of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity, assisting the Chief Administrative Officer to provide regular reports on progress to Council.

Conclusion:

The Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination will be one of the avenues for the City to pursue its goal of access, equity and diversity. It is a timely and appropriate response to the challenges of the intensification of social and economic disparities in the City. It re-affirms the City's commitment to removing the barriers of racism and discrimination. It reinforces the implementation of the recommendations of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity. It ensures that non-discrimination and anti-racism are integrated in the operation of the municipality.

Contacts:

Ceta Ramkhalawansingh, Manager, Diversity Management and Community Engagement, Strategic and Corporate Policy/Healthy City Office, Tel: (416) 392-6824, Fax: (416) 696-3645; e-mail: cramkhal@toronto.ca

Rose Lee, Coordinator, Diversity Management, Strategic and Corporate Policy/Healthy City Office, Tel: (416) 392-4991, Fax: (416) 696-3645; e-mail: rlee@toronto.ca

List of Attachments:

Appendix 1 - Vision Statement, Final Report of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity

Appendix 2 - Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination

Appendix 3 - Vision, Goal, Guiding Principles and Strategic Directions, Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination

Appendix 1
City of Toronto

Vision Statement on Access, Equity and Diversity

Diverse communities and groups make up the population of Toronto. The City of Toronto values the contributions made by all its people and believes that the diversity among its people has strengthened Toronto.

The City recognizes the dignity and worth of all people by equitably treating communities and employees, fairly providing services, by consulting with communities and making sure everyone can participate in decision-making.

The City recognizes the unique status and cultural diversity of the Aboriginal communities and their right to self-determination.

The City recognizes the barriers of discrimination and disadvantage faced by human rights protected groups.

To address this, the City will create an environment of equality in the government and in the community for all people regardless of their race, ancestry, place of origin, colour, ethnic origin, disability, citizenship, creed, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, same sex partnership, age, marital status, family status, immigrant status, receipt of public assistance, political affiliation, religious affiliation, level of literacy, language and/or socio-economic status.

The City of Toronto will implement positive changes in its workforce and communities to achieve access and equality of outcomes for all residents and to create a harmonious environment free from discrimination, harassment and hate.

Appendix 2

Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination

Preamble:

Toronto has become one of the most diverse cities in the world and has gained an international reputation for the success of its diversity. The City has an inclusive vision of society, which is equitable and built on the strength of its diversity. Through the leadership of Toronto City Council, the City has adopted and implemented policies and programs on Non-discrimination, Human Rights, Elimination of Hate, Access and Equity Grants, Employment Equity and Action Plan on Community Access and Equity. These policies and programs are in place to remove barriers, promote equitable participation of all residents and build an inclusive society.

The City recognizes that notwithstanding the above initiatives, intensifying social and economic disparities impact disproportionately on diverse individuals and communities. It must work proactively to improve access and equity, be more inclusive and continue to challenge racism and discrimination. Through this Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination, the City:

- (i) reaffirms “Diversity Our Strength”, embraces opportunities to build an inclusive society, serves as a model of diversity, and celebrates the cultural, economic and social successes of our diverse communities;

- (ii) affirms its commitment to removing the barriers of racism and discrimination that exclude and disadvantage individuals and communities from participating equitably in all spheres of life in Toronto;
- (iii) acknowledges that multiple factors, such as race, gender, disability, sexual orientation, gender identity, place of origin compound the discrimination of individuals and communities;
- (iv) ensures that non-discrimination, anti-racism, accessibility and equity policies and programs are integrated in the operation of the municipality;
- (v) strengthens advocacy and partnership with communities, public and private sectors and other orders of government; and
- (vi) demonstrates accountability to all residents in striving to achieve the goal of a diverse, equitable and inclusive society.

Action	Related Strategic Direction	Time Frame	Department Responsibility
(1) Guided by the directions set out by the Final Report of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity, the City will work towards achieving full implementation of the 97 recommendations. These recommendations address the City's goals for access and equity as well as the City's role as advocate.	- Political leadership - Advocacy - Economic participation - Public education and awareness - Service delivery - Building strong communities - Accountability	2003-2004	All departments
(2) The City will continue to take actions aimed at building an organization which is responsive to the diversity among City residents by: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) developing an Access Action Plan Guide, which will include measurement indicators for use by City Departments and the City's Agencies and Special Purpose Bodies to prepare and submit their Action Plans to City Council (b) developing an Accessibility Plan as required by the <i>Ontarians with Disability Act</i> to remove barriers to services for people with disabilities, and submit reports to the provincial government 	- Political leadership - Accountability - Service delivery - Economic participation	June 2003 December 2003 Report required by September 2003 for submission to the Government of Ontario	CAO CAO Corporate Services Urban Development Services and other departments

Action	Related Strategic Direction	Time Frame	Department Responsibility
(c) completing the employment equity workforce survey of City Departments as outlined in the goal of the City's Employment Equity Policy to achieve a representative workforce at all occupational levels		Survey completed early 2004	Corporate Services
(d) using the survey results to develop proactive employment equity plan and programs which include mechanisms for measuring and monitoring outcomes and results		Targeted for fall of 2004	Corporate Services and all departments
(e) implementing an employment accommodation policy to provide appropriate accommodation, for instance, to employees with disabilities and employees who need religious accommodation		Accommodation policy June 2003	Corporate Services
(f) requesting that the City's Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Special Purpose Bodies conduct employment equity surveys with the results to be reported to City Council			Agencies, boards and commissions
(g) implementing a range of training and awareness programs, including the sensitizing of staff and management to the accommodation needs of employees with disabilities and employees who need religious accommodation, and making sure that training offered is current and addresses issues of gender, race, disability, religion, lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender people, etc., and acknowledging the impact of the intersectionality of these factors.		To begin in May 2003; employment accommodation policy information sessions in June or September 2003	Corporate Services and CAO

Action	Related Strategic Direction	Time Frame	Department Responsibility
(3) In response to the changing demographic composition of the population, the City will:	- Accountability - Building strong communities - Service delivery	June 2003	CAO
(a) publish an annual diversity report card based on identified indicators		Initiated in spring 2003	CAO, Community and Neighbourhood Services; Urban Development Services
(b) undertake research to establish indicators which can monitor the socio-economic status of groups, and which can be used to set service delivery priorities		2003-2004	CAO and departments
(c) conduct specific studies on issues identified through community consultations and by the community advisory committees on access, equity and human rights, including analysis based on gender and intersection of diversity			
(d) hold bi-annual workshop/seminar on best practices and involve participation from all sectors of the City.		March 2004	CAO
(4) To pursue the direction of economic participation, the City will:	- Economic participation - Building strong communities - Public education and awareness	Ongoing in 2003	Economic Development
(a) increase its involvement in Aboriginal economic development in partnership with Aboriginal community organizations		Ongoing in 2003	Economic Development
(b) integrate into the City's plans for labour force development co-operative strategies with other orders of government, educational and training institutions and public and private sector organizations to address the unique needs of Aboriginal people, women, people with disabilities, immigrants, refugees, visible minority people,			

Action	Related Strategic Direction	Time Frame	Department Responsibility
lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender people, people with low literacy, and to ameliorate the labour market and economic disparities between various groups in the City			
(c) implement mentoring programs to assist employees to develop skills for occupational advancement and internationally trained professionals to access employment in their fields of expertise, and encourage and recognize employees who act as volunteer mentors		Fall 2003	Corporate Services and CAO
(d) continue outreach and information initiatives so that businesses from diverse communities have access to the procurement process of the City and its Agencies, and Special Purpose Bodies		Ongoing	Finance All Departments
(e) provide information, peer networking and advocacy to remove barriers faced by small businesses and businesses owned by people from diverse communities, such as access to loans and credit.		Ongoing	Economic Development
(5) In recognition of the need to build strong communities, the City will:	- Building strong communities - Service Delivery		
(a) establish partnerships with diverse communities, other orders of government and public and private sector organizations to address issues of discrimination and inequity		Ongoing	CAO, Community and Neighbourhood Services
(b) develop the resources of emerging community organizations through the			

Action	Related Strategic Direction	Time Frame	Department Responsibility
City's grants programs, staff support, access to space for meetings and programs as well as access to incubator programs for new entrepreneurs		Ongoing	CAO Community and Neighbourhood Services Corporate Services
(c) identify and remove barriers to municipal elections for all voters, provide information on municipal elections in different languages and alternate communication formats and disseminate the information in ways that are free of bias, and encouraging voter turnout		Ongoing	Corporate Services
(d) use creative, innovative and proactive community engagement practices to facilitate diverse communities' participation in the City's decision-making process			
(e) continue to explore funding and resources for the establishment of an Office of Disability Issues		2003	All departments
(f) review zoning bylaws and City policies to address barriers faced by the Aboriginal and diverse communities practising cultural and spiritual traditions, take action on issues that fall within the City's jurisdiction, and advocate for changes if regulations affecting these practices fall under other jurisdictions.		Ongoing	CAO Urban Development Services
(6) In recognition of the need to increase public awareness of the breadth and depth of the City's diverse communities and their contributions to the vitality of Toronto, the City will:	- Public education and awareness - Building strong communities		

Action	Related Strategic Direction	Time Frame	Department Responsibility
(a) publicize and celebrate the success and achievements of diverse people and communities to counter negative stereotypes and help the public understand their contributions to Toronto		Ongoing	All departments
(b) provide information on City services and programs in plain language, multi-lingual and alternate formats, and make the information available on the City's website, in published materials and to the ethno-specific and community media		Ongoing	Corporate Services and all departments
(c) portray diverse populations in the City's advertising, communications, cultural programs and special events through appropriate and inclusive language, pictures and images, including the creation of a Diversity Day as a part of the Celebrate Toronto Street Festival		Ongoing	Corporate Services and all departments
(d) promote to the public the City's vision on access, equity and diversity and inform members of the public City policies on non-discrimination, human rights and anti-hate and harassment through information and communication campaigns, community outreach and engagement programs, proclamations on days of significance and special events		Ongoing	All departments
(e) work with community groups, public and private sector organizations and other orders of government to combat hate and discrimination		Ongoing	All departments

Action	Related Strategic Direction	Time Frame	Department Responsibility
(f) increase the awareness and understanding of residents and City staff regarding the role of the City of Toronto's Human Rights Office.			Corporate Services
(7) In keeping with its leadership and advocacy role, the City will: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) continue to advocate to the federal and provincial governments for adequate funding and co-operative strategies to provide affordable housing; public transit; childcare; employment programs; training in official languages; literacy programs; accreditation and recognition of prior learning and experience of immigrant workers; and settlement services for immigrants and refugees; and for programs to increase voter participation in municipal elections (b) develop a Toronto Urban Aboriginal Strategy and Aboriginal Office in accordance with the principle of Aboriginal self-determination in partnership with the Aboriginal communities and other orders of government (c) act as an advocate and partner with the school system to acquire adequate funding from the Province to meet the educational needs of students from diverse backgrounds, changes to allow community use of space and recreational facilities in schools, and the continuation of equity programs in schools. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Advocacy - Accountability - Political leadership 	Ongoing Draft strategy by the end of 2003 Ongoing	CAO All Departments CAO School Advisory Committee CAO

Action	Related Strategic Direction	Time Frame	Department Responsibility
(8) In recognition of the need for the oversight of the implementation of the Plan of Action and for a coordinated approach to accountability, monitoring and advising City Council: (a) the City Council Reference Group for the Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination continue to fill this oversight and monitoring role, and meet quarterly to review the status of the implementation of the Plan of Action (b) the interdepartmental staff team on access and equity function as a corporate co-ordinating group for the implementation of the Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination, the Accessibility Plan, and the recommendations of the final report of the Task Force on Community Access and Equity.	- Political leadership - Accountability		Council CAO and Commissioners

Appendix 3

City of Toronto

Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination Vision, Goal, Guiding Principles and Strategic Directions

Vision:

Toronto is a City in which:

- (i) residents have a greater awareness and sensitivity to diversity issues;
- (ii) City staff are trained to serve and respect the diversity of residents;

- (iii) the contribution of all groups to the City's past is recognized, and the contributions we all make to its future is understood;
- (iv) residents are able to move around with ease and access all public services;
- (v) the city's leaders model a commitment to diversity;
- (vi) there is respect world-wide for its innovative and proactive approaches to combating racism and discrimination; and
- (vii) there is pride in the diversity of the population.

Goal:

The goal of the Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination is:

to create an environment of equality in Toronto for all people regardless of their race, ancestry, place of origin, colour, ethnic origin, disability, citizenship, creed, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, same sex partnership, age, marital status, family status, immigrant status, receipt of public assistance, political affiliation, level of literacy, language and/or socio-economic status, and to enable all residents to participate fully in the social, cultural, recreational, economic and political life of the city.

To achieve this goal:

We will eliminate the barriers that restrict all residents from participating in all aspects of civic life through the elimination of racism and all forms of discrimination.

We will build a cohesive community that benefits all, by incorporating principles of access, equity and human rights, in all plans being prepared by the City.

We will identify priorities in consultation with the community, stakeholders, partners and other orders of government.

We will take actions that will respond to the priorities which will achieve an inclusive society.

Guiding Principles:

Shared vision:

The City of Toronto is strengthened when all residents share a vision for a society that is inclusive and values the diversity of its people.

Shared future and heritage:

Our future as a city of people from diverse backgrounds is a shared future. We may come from different countries and speak many languages, but our home and our city of choice is Toronto. We endorse the principle of Aboriginal self-determination. Together we are one as we build a common future which respects our different histories.

Strength through diversity:

Diversity is a core strength of Toronto. The city's success as a community comes from the respect and value which we place upon diversity. The City of Toronto will nurture and support this diversity.

Strong communities/dynamic city:

All residents must share in the prosperity of the city. Every resident of Toronto must believe that the city belongs to them and that each person is able to participate in all aspects of the life of the city. Eliminating harassment and discrimination, and achieving access to employment, shelter, food, transit, childcare and education are necessities for strong communities.

Strategic Directions for the Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination:

Political Leadership:

Demonstrate leadership in building an inclusive society through the articulation of a vision which values diversity in all aspects of city life.

Lead a responsive organization that recognizes that diverse groups experience discrimination based on the intersection of several aspects of their identity, including gender, race, disability, and sexual orientation.

Act upon the City's multiple roles as policy maker, employer, service provider, grants provider, regulator, and purchaser of goods and services to ensure an equitable society.

Allocate resources for programs that sustain communities and respond to the needs of vulnerable populations.

Speak out against all forms of discrimination and inequality.

Advocacy:

Act as an advocate with all sectors and orders of government for legislation, funding and programs to sustain communities, support economic participation and deliver responsive services.

Recognize and support the unique history and position of the urban Aboriginal population and the right to self-determination.

Speak out in support of the elimination of barriers faced by diverse groups and the most marginalized communities and work to prevent the creation of additional barriers.

Establish partnerships with all sectors to build an inclusive society.

Economic Participation:

Support the full participation of all communities in the economic life of the city.

Ensure the availability of adequate and accessible supports required for the economic participation of all communities, including accommodation, childcare, literacy and ESL (English as a Second Language) programs, transit and affordable housing.

Implement employment equity strategies to ensure the City's workforce reflects the diversity of the population.

Support the contribution the diverse communities make to the city's position in the global economy.

Public Education and Awareness:

Communicate a clear commitment to the value of diversity.

Implement campaigns and programs that inform residents about services, their rights and obligations.

Promote understanding, respect and interaction among diverse communities.

Develop and disseminate materials that document the contribution of all groups to the building of Toronto.

Service Delivery:

Ensure that programs and services serve the needs of a diverse population and provide equitable benefits to all residents.

Involve communities in setting policies and priorities for service delivery.

Deliver services that respond to the changing needs of the population.

Building Strong Communities:

Strengthen organizations to enable communities to make their voices heard.

Allocate resources to emerging communities so that they can participate in civic society along with more established groups.

Promote literacy and official language ability among residents to enable them to participate and move ahead in society.

Accountability:

Strengthen mechanisms for community voices to be part of the City's decision-making process.

Conduct research and publish reliable data with the objectives of monitoring the status of groups and developing policies and practices aimed at combating racism and discrimination.

Establish indicators, evaluation mechanisms and regular reporting requirements to monitor and assess the implementation of the Plan of Action.

(From the Report of the Community Consultations on the Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination, “Just Do It!”)

Report of the Community Consultations on the Plan of Action
for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination – “Just Do It”, November, 2002

Diversity Our Strength

Diversity is a fundamental characteristic of our city. It gives Toronto strength through an ability to value, celebrate and respect differences. It is this recognition of diversity, which makes Toronto one of the most creative, caring and successful cities in the world.

Despite this success, many of our residents are not full participants in civic life. The existence of racism and discrimination affects all aspects of life from economic investment and job creation, education and the arts, to the protection of human rights. To change this, we began a process of consultation in May 2002 with Toronto residents to develop the City of Toronto’s Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination.

Over 1,000 people participated in this process through attendance at public consultations, meetings of the Advisory Committees, Working Groups and focus groups, as well as through the presentation of written submissions and oral presentations.

The Reference Group heard a very clear message: Toronto residents want the City to continue its leadership and advocacy. They want City Council to increase its investment in strategies and programs which make Toronto a community in which everyone has access to the benefits of the city. Participants want the City to continue implementation of its access, equity and human rights policies and to increase its advocacy with other governments, sectors and institutions.

Consultation participants endorsed the proposed goal and principles for the Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination, which we circulated during the consultation process. From the hundreds of suggestions and proposals we received, we have identified strategic directions. These directions address political leadership, advocacy, economic participation, public education and awareness, service delivery, building strong communities and accountability.

Many concrete suggestions were made by consultation participants. We have documented these suggestions in this report because they provide the City and other organizations with proposals that can lead to full participation in the civic process.

We are encouraged by the hope expressed by consultation participants, that together we can build an inclusive city.

This report will be circulated to our colleagues on City Council and will be given to the Chief Administrative Officer to use as a guide for drafting the City's Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination.

We express our appreciation to everyone who participated in the consultations. They have made a valuable contribution to the development of the Plan of Action.

Councillor Sherene Shaw
Chair, Council Reference Group
Diversity Advocate,
Chair, Race and Ethnic Relations Community Advisory Committee, and
Member, Status of Women Community Advisory Committee;

Councillor Maria Augimeri
Chair, Working Group on Language Equity and Literacy;

Councillor Pam McConnell
Chair, Status of Women Community Advisory Committee,
Chair, Working Group on the Elimination of Hate Activity, and
Member, Community Advisory Committee on Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender Issues
Councillor Kyle Rae
Chair, Community Advisory Committee on Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender Issues, and
Chair, Working Group on Employment Equity

Councillor David Miller
Vice-Chair, Council Reference Group
Chair, Working Group on Immigration and Refugee Issues

Councillor Suzan Hall
Chair, Youth Gang Work Group, and
Member, Race and Ethnic Relations Community Advisory Committee

Councillor Joe Mihevc
Disability Advocate, and
Chair, Disability Issues Community Advisory Committee

Councillor Jane Pitfield
Chair, Aboriginal Affairs Community Advisory Committee

Table of Contents

Introduction and Mandate
The Consultation Process
What We Heard
A Vision and Direction for Toronto

Community Proposals for the Plan of Action

- Appendix A Consultation Invitation and Schedule
 - Appendix B List of Deputants
 - Appendix C List of Written Submissions
 - Appendix D Building a Plan of Action Discussion Kit
-

(1) Introduction and Mandate:

Toronto is recognised as having one of the most diverse populations in the world. Who are we? Toronto has the largest population of Aboriginal people of any city or reserve in Canada. Almost half of our residents were not born in Canada. People who belong to racial minority groups are the majority of the City's population. Nearly twenty per cent of residents have a disability and women account for at least half of the population. The lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender population in Toronto is estimated to be the third largest in North America.

Toronto's Aboriginal population is estimated to be between 65,000 and 100,000. Their population reflects a diverse range of languages, professions, and income levels. Compared to the general population, Aboriginal peoples experience tremendous difficulties in gaining access to much needed social, health and economic services to address the various challenges they face.

Currently, an estimated 17 per cent of the population has some form of disability. With an aging population, this is expected to dramatically increase in the coming years.

Toronto continues to be the primary destination of immigrants and refugees to Canada because of its rich diversity and economic structure. Toronto has the largest immigrant population of any urban area in Canada. Our residents are from about 200 countries of origin and speak more than 170 languages. They practice most of the religions of the world. For example, half of the country's Jewish population lives in Toronto, mass is said in 35 languages, over 200,000 Muslims observe Ramadan, and 80,000 Sikhs observe Khalsa Day celebrations.

Toronto's residents are highly-skilled, with degrees and work experience earned both within Canada and abroad. There are also people with limited literacy skills and people who do not speak English or French fluently.

Toronto is home to many families who are living comfortably. Yet, it is also home to a growing number of people who live in poverty. It is home to increasing numbers of lone parent households, youth and seniors living alone, people with mental illnesses, and people who are homeless.

Toronto has found that its diversity has been a continuing source of success and prosperity. However, the city's success has not been equally shared among its residents.

Having noted patterns of inequality by gender, race, disability, immigrant status and level of literacy, and the discrimination faced by our most vulnerable communities, Toronto City Council decided in April 2001 to prepare a Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination. Toronto City Council also noted that the City has taken on a leadership role in creating a positive and welcoming environment for the city's diverse communities. Continued success requires actions by all sectors and orders of government. To that end, Toronto City Council called upon the Government of Canada to establish a domestic Plan of Action to respond to the critical issues identified by community organizations during the consultative process leading up to the United Nations World Conference Against Racism (UN-WCAR).

In December 2001, Toronto City Council decided to take further action on the elimination of racism and all forms of discrimination by preparing a municipal Plan of Action. To make this decision, Council considered a report from delegates who attended the UN-WCAR Conference and recommendations from the Community Advisory Committee on Race and Ethnic Relations regarding the results of the City-commissioned Ornstein Study on ethno-racial inequality in Toronto.

The Ornstein Study concluded that for ethno-racial minorities, the level of education does not translate into higher paying, stable employment. Ethno-racial communities were found to have significantly higher levels of unemployment and poverty compared to that faced by persons of European origin.

Specific findings of the Ornstein study included the following:

- (a) in 1996, the adult unemployment rate for persons of non-European origin was nearly double that of persons of European origin (12.5 per cent vs 7 per cent);
- (b) for some communities, the unemployment rates were significantly higher - Ethiopians - 24 per cent, Ghanaians - 45 per cent, and Somalis - 24 per cent;
- (c) persons from Sri Lanka, Pakistan, Vietnam and Latin America have unemployment rates that are two to three times greater than average;
- (d) the unemployment rate for youth (15 to 24 years) is 19.6 per cent compared to 38 per cent for African and Black youth;
- (e) 14 per cent of European-origin families live below the LICO (Low Income Cut Off) compared to 32 per cent for Aboriginals, 35 per cent for South Asians, 45 per cent for Africans, Blacks and Caribbeans, and 45 per cent for those of Arab and West Asian origin;
- (f) Toronto residents of Ethiopian, Ghanaian and Somali origin live below the poverty line at rates of 70 per cent, 87 per cent and 62 per cent respectively; and

- (g) the family poverty rate of all non-European groups is more than twice that of European groups;

Many other studies have found evidence of racism and all forms of discrimination – both direct and systemic – being experienced by residents and workers in Toronto:

- (a) a 1999 study on racial stereotyping in the media found that, between 1994 and 1997, there was an over-representation of articles featuring Jamaicans connected with crime, immigration and deportation. The study also showed that the media portrayed Vietnamese people as criminally and socially deviant;
- (b) since 1993, there have been 1,588 crimes of hate reported to the Toronto police of which the Black community has been the most victimized, and 50 per cent of hate crimes being against people of colour;
- (c) in a survey of anti-gay/lesbian violence in Toronto, 78 per cent of the survey respondents reported experiencing verbal assaults, 38 per cent reported being chased and followed, and 21 per cent reported some form of physical violence;
- (d) the Report of the Commission on Systemic Racism in the Ontario Criminal Justice System (1995) found that between 1986 and 1993, the number of prisoners described as Black admitted to Ontario prisons increased by 204 per cent, while the number of white prisoners admitted increased by 23 per cent; and
- (e) the Report also noted that Black and Aboriginal women are even more over-represented among prison admissions than Black and Aboriginal men, and that there is an over-representation of black men and women and male youths in prison admissions.

Other studies have also highlighted inequalities among Toronto residents:

- (a) between 50 and 80 per cent of people with disabilities are either under-employed or have never been employed;
- (b) over two-thirds of jobs in the lowest paid occupations are held by women;
- (c) women filled most of the growth of jobs in the part-time work force;
- (d) 24 per cent of Torontonians aged 16 and older were not able to read most everyday printed material;
- (e) a national study conducted in 1996 found that Toronto had the eighth highest rate of urban poverty in Canada;
- (f) one out of four families with children were living in poverty. Ethno-racial groups and immigrant families generally have lower incomes and higher rates of poverty;

- (g) the number of Aboriginal children in care is five times the overall average; and
- (h) the senior population is one of the fastest growing populations in Toronto, rising by 87 per cent since 1971. By 2031, it is expected that more than one-quarter of city residents will be seniors. A high proportion of seniors have no knowledge of either of Canada's official languages, and the poverty rate among seniors is also higher than the national average.

Council directed that the Plan of Action respond to the issues raised by the Ornstein study and other studies on inequality. To give direction to the preparation of this Plan of Action, City Council established a Council Reference Group, composed of the Diversity Advocate and the Chairs and members of Council's Community Advisory Committees and Working Groups on Access, Equity and Human Rights. Council directed this Reference Group to seek community input into the Plan of Action.

By directing that all of the City's Community Advisory Committees and Working Groups be involved in the consultation process and that the Plan of Action address racism and **all** forms of discrimination, City Council was mindful of the need for a holistic approach. Council recognized that to be successful, strategies for the elimination of inequality must be comprehensive and holistic, and must recognise that individuals and groups face multiple barriers.

This report summarizes the results of the community consultations.

(2) The Consultation Process:

The Council Reference Group invited residents, community groups and organizations to offer help and input to build the Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination. The Reference Group proposed that the Plan of Action build on the legacy and leadership for which the City is known.

The Council Reference Group also noted that the City's Anti-Discrimination Policy provides protection on a wide range of human rights grounds:

"race, ancestry, place of origin, colour, ethnic origin, disability, citizenship, creed, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, age, marital status, family status, receipt of public assistance, political affiliation, religious affiliation, record of offences or level of literacy."

In its letter of invitation to participate in the process, the Reference Group invited participants to comment on the proposed Goal and Principles for the Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination and to respond to the following questions:

What priorities should the City's Plan of Action address to eliminate racism and all forms of discrimination?

How should we respond to these priorities? What actions should various sectors and other orders of government take?

How can the City help build community capacity and support participation in the social, cultural, recreational, economic and political life of Toronto?

How can the City work with the community to evaluate progress towards eliminating racism and all forms of discrimination?

What would a city that has eliminated racism and discrimination look like?

Over 1,000 people participated in the consultation process.

The Reference Group's letter of invitation to participate in the process to prepare the Plan of Action (see Appendix A) was distributed by mail to over 2,000 individuals and organizations. In addition to press releases, notices of the public consultations were placed in community and ethno-specific newspapers. Information was also provided in 13 languages, as well as English and French.

Members of the public were invited to share their suggestions through the City's Web site, by calling, writing, or attending a public consultation.

At the city-wide consultations and those held by the Community Advisory Committees, a formal presentation was delivered followed by public deputations. The lists of participants who submitted written submissions and made verbal presentations are provided in Appendices B and C.

Focus groups were held with specific sectors and groups such as youth, ethno-racial communities, business associations, resident and ratepayer groups, community organizations, grant recipients, and faith groups. The focus groups were informal and allowed for more in-depth discussion of the issues.

To encourage discussion, a kit was developed to capture suggestions on the five consultation questions (see Appendix D). Respondents are able to complete the kit as a group or individually. This kit has been distributed throughout the city and will continue to be a useful tool in engaging residents in these discussions and capturing their ideas on eliminating racism and discrimination in Toronto.

(3) What We Heard:

The Reference Group heard a range of emotion and passion during the sessions. Consultation participants expressed anger, fear, frustration, and pain. Participants also had hope.

Some participants were angry that they were still experiencing barriers and acts of hatred in their lives. They stated over and over again that addressing racism and discrimination was an urgent matter and wanted the City to do more to create an inclusive society.

They noted that the restructuring process at the City brought on by amalgamation had put social justice on the back burner and they were not sure that the City was paying attention to what was happening on the street.

While participants recognized that the City has always been a leader in addressing issues of diversity, they felt that with all the changes in recent years, this leadership has not been as evident.

Participants expressed fear that they might be witnessing the decline of Toronto. They are seeing inequalities and disparities worsening in a dramatic and disturbing fashion, partly due to continued racism and discrimination in the labour market. They are seeing more hostility on the streets of Toronto. Some participants were emphatic that Toronto was a less welcoming place than it used to be. They feel isolated and on their own and do not see evidence that the City is a partner in their struggle for change.

Participants expressed frustration that they were being consulted again. Individuals and community groups asked why they were being consulted when the City and other governments had a catalogue of actions that could be taken.

Participants expressed frustration that they could not participate in the civic life of the city. They felt that they were so caught up with daily survival that they did not have the time to participate or take advantage of what Toronto had to offer. Balancing work and family life was a struggle. Balancing family accounts was even harder. Many could not afford to take transit to the library or to recreation centres. They could not afford housing and food costs, let alone user fees for recreational programs. Some could not use or had difficulty using public transit because of physical barriers.

Participants gave examples of incidents of racism and discrimination. The pain of those experiences was evident to the Reference Group as deputants recounted these incidents.

The Reference Group heard about racist acts in the street – with passers-by not offering assistance – and of examples of discrimination experienced with daycare providers, teachers, doctors and police.

The Reference Group heard of communities and families slipping deeper and deeper into poverty because they were unable to earn a living wage. Some could not afford childcare. Others were under-employed and struggling financially because their education and work experience earned outside Canada are not recognized.

Since the tragic events of September 11, 2001, communities have experienced an increase in hate activity. They told the Reference Group that they were more vulnerable on the streets of Toronto. Some participants stated that they had become targets of verbal and physical acts of hate and that their human rights had been eroded.

Even though there were expressions of anger, frustration and pain, the Reference Group was encouraged by the hope people had for Toronto. Although many participants felt abandoned by government, they had some trust in this consultation process because of their previous involvement with the City of Toronto.

They welcomed the opportunity to participate in these consultations with one of the few orders of government where discussion on issues of diversity is taking place. Participants expressed hope that the City of Toronto would continue to act as an advocate on behalf of its residents despite the current political climate, and that the City would continue to lead the country in addressing issues of diversity.

They had hope that the Plan of Action would result in real change.

At the launch of the consultation process, Councillor Sherene Shaw, Diversity Advocate, noted that the Plan of Action would take a holistic approach.

Action against racism, for example, will be more effective if it is a total strategy for the achievement of equity for all, including not only issues of race, but also those of ethnicity, faith, gender, disability, immigrant and refugee status, lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender issues, Aboriginal issues, and those of other human rights protected groups. In other words, the City of Toronto's Plan of Action must be presented and pursued within the context of equality and justice for all members of society. The plan of action must therefore be an inclusive framework with respect to both process and content.

Councillor Sherene Shaw
May 27, 2002

Participants echoed this sentiment and stressed the need to acknowledge and address the intersection of all identities. They told us that everyone is not fully protected unless racism and discrimination against all groups are eliminated. They saw a holistic approach as recognizing that the social and economic problems of access and equity are not compartmentalized and that people can experience multiple types of discrimination, which can lead to greater marginalization. For example, a person with disabilities can be female and belong to an ethno-racial minority group or be an Aboriginal person. One can also belong to the lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender community or be Two-spirited.

People from the lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender community also spoke of the need to extend the discussion of sexual orientation to include transsexuals and to recognize that there are many emerging aspects of gender identity, such as inter-sexed people. The need to address issues of emerging communities and the changing needs of existing communities was echoed throughout the consultations.

While participants recognized that the City of Toronto has a limited area of responsibility, they raised a wide range of issues that affect all aspects of the lives of city residents. While some of these issues were within the City's jurisdiction, many were not. Participants brought these issues to the Reference Group because they felt they had nowhere else to go. They also felt that since the City is the order of government that is most involved on a daily basis with the community it should be an advocate on their behalf to other orders of government. Participants felt that the City, speaking on behalf of 2.5 million residents, was more likely to be heard than individual communities.

Side Notes:

“It is clear that the City is in crisis with respect to coping with the diversity of an increasing population. Therefore, similar to some of its North American counterparts, it must pursue the path of developing a solid urbanization strategy which focuses on real partnerships and investment into racialized communities...”

“Many politicians court the ethnic vote in Toronto, but they forget their constituents after they are elected.”

“The ramifications of not addressing this issue are too frightening to behold. We only need to look at the horrific inter-ethnic, interracial, and inter-religious conflicts around the world to know what the consequences might be.”

“We pride ourselves on living in a city that works for people. We claim that our diversity is our strength. We relish the calm and the peace... However, I am concerned that we may now be living under a ‘cold peace’.”

“City services for lesbians, gays, bisexuals and transgendered people are centered downtown. We need services where we live.”

“Since 9/11, ‘Muslim’ is a euphemism for walking bomb.”

“We are living in a poisoned environment with infected people.”

“Racism is a growing problem in Toronto. How do I know? I know because the number of attacks on me keep increasing.”

“Being a person of colour makes me an outsider in mainstream queer communities.”

“There is no safe place.”

“The underlying causes of discrimination and social exclusion are many and complex. The consequences of not dealing with them are that Toronto has become increasingly a society segmented and segregated along lines of gender, disability, age, ethnic and racial identity.”

“Toronto...one of the most diverse cities, provides a fertile ground for potential acts of discrimination. It also has the potential to become a model for dealing with this complex issue.”

(4) A Vision and Direction for Toronto:

Consultation participants spoke of their vision for the city, and endorsed the Goal and Principles circulated by the Reference Group.

Goal

It is proposed that the goal of the Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination be:

“to enable all residents to participate fully in the social, cultural, recreational, economic and political life of the city”.

To achieve this Goal:

We will eliminate the barriers that restrict all residents from participating in all aspects of civic life through the elimination of racism and all forms of discrimination.

We will build a cohesive community that benefits all, by incorporating principles of access, equity and human rights, in all plans being prepared by the City.

We will identify priorities in consultation with the community, stakeholders, partners and other orders of government.

We will take actions that will respond to the priorities, which will achieve an inclusive society.

Guiding Principles:

Shared vision:

The City of Toronto is strengthened when all residents share a vision for a society that is inclusive and values the diversity of its people.

Shared future and heritage:

Our future as a city of people from diverse backgrounds is a shared future. We may come from different countries and speak many languages, but our home and our city of choice is Toronto. We endorse the principle of Aboriginal self-determination. Together we are one as we build a common future, which respects our different histories.

Strength through diversity:

Diversity is a core strength of Toronto. The city's success as a community comes from the respect and value which we place upon diversity. The City of Toronto will nurture and support this diversity.

Strong communities/dynamic city:

All residents must share in the prosperity of the city. Every resident of Toronto must believe that the city belongs to them and that each person is able to participate in all aspects of the life of the city. Eliminating harassment and discrimination, and achieving access to employment, shelter, food, transit, childcare and education are necessities for strong communities.

Side Notes:

We want a Toronto in which:

- (i) residents have a greater awareness and sensitivity to diversity issues;
- (ii) City staff are trained to serve and respect the diversity of residents;
- (iii) the contribution of all groups to the City's past is recognized, and the contributions we all make to its future is understood;
- (iv) residents are able to move around with ease and access all public services;
- (v) the city's leaders model a commitment to diversity;
- (vi) there is respect world-wide for its innovative and proactive approaches to combating racism and discrimination; and
- (v) there is pride in the diversity of the population.

Proposed Strategic Directions:

Directions:

After hearing the deputations and reviewing the submissions made, the Reference Group found that many of the individuals and organizations had similar concerns. There were consistent messages on the priorities for action and the direction the City should take in the Plan of Action. Proposed directions address political leadership, advocacy, economic participation, public education and awareness, service delivery, building strong communities, and accountability.

Political Leadership:

Demonstrate leadership in building an inclusive society through the articulation of a vision which values diversity in all aspects of city life.

Lead a responsive organization that recognizes that diverse groups experience discrimination based on the intersection of several aspects of their identity, including gender, race, disability, and sexual orientation.

Act upon the City's multiple roles as policy maker, employer, service provider, grants provider, regulator, and purchaser of goods and services to ensure an equitable society.

Allocate resources for programs that sustain communities and respond to the needs of vulnerable populations.

Speak out against all forms of discrimination and inequality.

Advocacy:

Act as an advocate with all sectors and orders of government for legislation, funding and programs to sustain communities, support economic participation and deliver responsive services.

Recognize and support the unique history and position of the urban Aboriginal population and the right to self-determination.

Speak out in support of the elimination of barriers faced by diverse groups and the most marginalized communities and work to prevent the creation of additional barriers.

Establish partnerships with all sectors to build an inclusive society.

Economic Participation:

Support the full participation of all communities in the economic life of the city.

Ensure the availability of adequate and accessible supports required for the economic participation of all communities, including accommodation, childcare, literacy and ESL (English as a Second Language) programs, transit and affordable housing.

Implement employment equity strategies to ensure the City's workforce reflects the diversity of the population.

Support the contribution the diverse communities make to the city's position in the global economy.

Public Education and Awareness:

Communicate a clear commitment to the value of diversity.

Implement campaigns and programs which inform residents about services, their rights and obligations.

Promote understanding, respect and interaction among diverse communities.

Develop and disseminate materials which document the contribution of all groups to the building of Toronto.

Service Delivery:

Ensure that programs and services serve the needs of a diverse population and provide equitable benefits to all residents.

Involve communities in setting policies and priorities for service delivery.

Deliver services that respond to the changing needs of the population.

Building Strong Communities:

Strengthen organizations to enable communities to make their voices heard.

Allocate resources to emerging communities so that they can participate in civic society along with more established groups.

Promote literacy and official language ability among residents to enable them to participate and move ahead in society.

Accountability:

Strengthen mechanisms for community voices to be part of the City's decision-making process.

Conduct research and publish reliable data with the objectives of monitoring the status of groups and developing policies and practices aimed at combating racism and discrimination.

Establish indicators, evaluation mechanisms and regular reporting requirements to monitor and assess the implementation of the Plan of Action.

(5) Community Proposals for the Plan of Action:

This section lists many proposals for action made during the consultations. Many proposals address issues within the City's jurisdiction, while others address issues that are the responsibility of other orders of government, school boards and other sectors.

(5.1) Political Leadership:

One consistent message heard throughout the consultations was the need for ongoing and unwavering political leadership on issues of equity and diversity.

Participants want – and expect – the City to lead all other sectors and orders of government in eliminating racism and discrimination from all aspects of city life. They repeatedly told us that the rest of Toronto will follow the standards and tone set by Council. They told us that Council should lead residents and all sectors in discussing and addressing issues of racism and all forms of discrimination. They want City Council to lead City departments in developing comprehensive and co-operative strategies and lead City employees in addressing issues of diversity in their day-to-day work. They want the City to recognize that the intersection of identities can compound the social problems many people face.

Participants suggested that City Council and senior City staff continue to demonstrate leadership through the following activities:

- (a) establish budget priorities that serve the needs of the diverse communities;
- (b) support all the City's access, equity and human rights programs with sufficient and long-term funding and resources;
- (c) create formal structures to address issues of inequality and diversity, and to ensure accountability;
- (d) review all City policies and programs for their impact on diverse communities, their contribution to an inclusive society, and their response to the needs of vulnerable communities;
- (e) provide diversity and anti-racism training to all elected officials to enable them to be effective champions of diversity;
- (f) institute contract compliance for businesses wishing to do business with the City;
- (g) enforce the City's Non-Discrimination Policy by removing and/or not placing City advertising with media outlets that do not reflect the city's diversity;
- (h) the elected leaders of the city should reflect the population of Toronto;
- (i) changes should be made to provide an Aboriginal representative on Council elected by the Aboriginal community;
- (j) explore how diverse communities can be empowered by providing them with resources and involving them in decision-making;
- (k) collaborate and consult regularly with other orders of government in order to develop appropriate legislation, policies and programs; and
- (l) take a firm stand against racial profiling in policing.

Side Notes:

“Responding to the challenges of the city’s diversity is therefore one of, if not the most important and urgent task of the City over the next few years.”

“I believe the time has come and the question needs to be asked, ‘Do the decision makers in our major institutions have the ethical, moral and political will to ensure that the various policies that currently exist are preserved and strengthened?’”

“The City must use all its available resources and power to become active advocates for the people who live in [the city] and to promote the diversity that exists in Toronto. City officials must actively and aggressively lobby the provincial and federal governments to take steps to challenge racism.”

(5.2) Advocacy:

Consultation participants acknowledged that responsibility for addressing equity and diversity issues does not just lie with City Council. They urged the City not to shy away from being a vocal advocate for change in areas where the City does not have direct control.

They told us that the City should make the Plan of Action a blueprint for change by advocating for its residents with all orders of government, community organizations, labour, business, the media, the school system, and the academic and research community.

The following activities were suggested:

- (a) organize a coalition of labour, business and community to lobby the provincial and federal governments for sustainable funding for the City of Toronto and for:
 - (i) policies and programs designed to combat racism and all forms of discrimination, and to promote social inclusion;
 - (ii) adequate settlement funding for settlement service providers;
 - (iii) adequate funding for appropriate ESL and literacy programs, that focus on workplace literacy and combine ESL and literacy for those with limited literacy skills in their first language;

- (iv) more accessible financial aid for post-secondary education for all groups;
 - (v) funding, policy and program initiatives that would address homelessness and the shortage of affordable housing in Toronto;
 - (vi) programs to address the causes of youth violence and the lack of opportunities for youth and children in vulnerable communities;
 - (vii) funds to launch the Toronto Response for Youth Program in more at-risk communities;
 - (viii) funding to make Toronto barrier-free;
 - (ix) the reinstatement of Employment Equity Legislation and the Anti-Racism Secretariat; and
 - (x) social assistance rates that reflect the cost of living in Toronto.
- (b) Work with professional accreditation bodies and educational institutions to reduce the barriers faced by immigrants in accessing professions and trades, to address the under-employment and poverty of our highly skilled and qualified immigrant population.
- (c) Collaborate with school boards, trustees, teachers' federations and unions to request adequate funding from the province for programs that students need to succeed. Advocate for a change in the funding formula to ensure school boards are able to meet the diverse needs of Toronto's communities through programs such as: ESL, heritage programs, School Community Advisors, Youth Counsellors, adult education classes, special education programs, and career guidance. Advocate for changes to allow for accessible recreation and community use of schools.
- (d) Begin discussions with teachers colleges, school boards, and education institutions to ensure:
- (i) the inclusion of race, class and gender lenses when developing school curricula and the integration of diversity in the school curricula;
 - (ii) that every Aboriginal child has the opportunity to learn Aboriginal history, culture and language, and achieve the highest education possible;
 - (iii) the provision of anti-racism training for all educators currently in the educational system and for new teachers through the teachers colleges;

- (iv) that school staff reflect the communities they serve;
 - (v) more effective communication between schools and parents and better communication about all available resources and how to gain access to required accommodation and programs;
 - (vi) that school boards make information available about the complaints process in the educational system;
 - (vii) that the negative impacts of streaming are identified and addressed;
 - (viii) anti-racism educational campaigns in schools which would include posters, songs, poetry and essays;
 - (ix) the method of teaching in both ESL and regular classes should be changed; and
 - (x) the religious accommodation policy is available in all schools.
- (e) Advocate for greater access, equity and fair representation in the mass media through:
- (i) responsible journalism that does not perpetuate negative stereotypes and portray the city's diversity as a social problem;
 - (ii) restricting advertisements that portray or display racism;
 - (iii) greater representation of the city's diversity at all levels of media operations, advertising and programming; and
 - (iv) increased and better coverage of events within the City's diverse communities.
- (f) Establish annual media awards for reporting and programming that make a substantial contribution to recognizing and promoting the city's diversity.

(5.3) Economic Participation:

Consultation participants told the Reference Group of the urgent need for the City to address the socio-economic inequalities faced by certain communities. Many felt that they had much to offer, but were restricted because of barriers in the labour market. We heard that many members of these communities have been marginalized and excluded from the economy by racism and discrimination, and are sinking deeper into poverty.

Participants also told us that there is a great need for supportive services to allow them to successfully participate in the economy. We heard that the public

transportation system often does not enable them to meet the demands of work and family life. The high cost of transit, childcare and housing are choking them financially. They also told us they need literacy, language, and skills training to participate more fully in the economy.

To support their economic participation, consultation participants suggested the following:

- (i) create viable economic development opportunities for the most at-risk communities;
- (ii) establish partnerships with professional, industry and trade associations to increase employment for all groups;
- (iii) provide support for small businesses in the city's diverse communities;
- (iv) evaluate the effectiveness of current initiatives which track suppliers' implementation of the Non-Discrimination Policy and strengthen strategies for addressing inequality in the labour market;
- (v) develop economic development strategies that would include fair wages and benefits for workers in all sectors of the economy;
- (vi) develop constructive and preventative programs for youth at risk, including employment, recreational and mentoring programs;
- (vii) develop mentoring programs to allow members of vulnerable communities to obtain job skills, training and employment experience;
- (viii) develop literacy, language, computer and skills training programs for newcomers and refugees;
- (ix) as the city's largest employer, take the lead in employment equity by developing and implementing a comprehensive and proactive Employment Equity Program, which includes a workforce survey, workforce data analysis, employment systems review, workplace accommodation, and staff training;
- (x) develop and implement a comprehensive job evaluation and pay equity policy; and
- (xi) implement workplace accommodation to provide flexibility in work schedules to recognize religious observances.

Side Notes:

"Turning off hate is not an easy or overnight process. It requires a great deal of work by many people....It means

strengthening the bonds of community to embrace diversity and reject bigotry.”

“...education is the means of transforming our society; through individual transformation we can ultimately achieve fundamental social reform now and not wait for this to occur in the distant future.”

“Help us to help ourselves and each other learn how to take a unified stand and make it perfectly clear that racism is not welcome....if we permit poisonous speech we have toxic environments and infected people.”

(5.4) Public Education and Awareness:

Participants pointed out that the elimination of racism and discrimination requires a change in both programs and attitudes. They told us that in order to gain strength from the city’s diversity, all city residents, businesses and organizations must understand and appreciate this diversity. Public education is needed for this to become a reality.

Participants noted that if racism and discrimination are learned, they could be unlearned. If children are taught racism from their parents, society can teach them to accept and celebrate diversity. Participants also noted that many adults need a greater understanding of other cultures and their neighbours.

To change public attitude, the following activities were suggested:

- (a) City Council publicly condemn acts of hatred and discrimination as being contrary to the principles of racial and cultural harmony.
- (b) Councillors and the Mayor increase their presence at ethno-racial and cross-cultural events.
- (c) Councillors and the Mayor walk through neighbourhoods to see first hand the isolation and lack of opportunities for vulnerable youth and children.
- (d) Develop a public education campaign which includes:
 - (i) material that promotes an understanding of other communities and informs residents of the contributions of all groups to the building of Toronto;
 - (ii) material that informs the various communities of their rights;

- (iii) permanent space for exhibitions and educational programs that recognize and promote the history of Aboriginal peoples and immigrants; and
 - (iv) monuments to the heroes of all communities.
- (e) Allocate a portion of the City's budget to ongoing anti-racism and anti-discrimination public education.
- (f) Create a diversity Web site that includes information on the diversity of the city, diversity resources, City activities that address racism and discrimination, and links to other sites.
- (g) Conduct more research and provide up-to-date data on the city's diverse populations. Conduct a survey of public attitudes and opinions on ethnic and race relations, racism and multiculturalism and use the results to develop the City's approaches to combat racism and discrimination.
- (h) Collect statistics on acts of hate and make them available to the public.
- (i) Offer training and information to victims, community-based organizations and public sector staff to strengthen their skills in addressing incidents of hate and discrimination.
- (j) Ensure that City-run and private childcare centres display and use children's literature which has been reviewed for appropriateness and is "bias-free".
- (k) Ensure City communications reflect the city's diversity and communicate to the diverse population:
- (i) adopt and disseminate guidelines on the portrayal of diversity in all City advertising and communications that would ensure the terminology and language usage are appropriate and inclusive, and that the pictures used represent the diversity of the population and are not stereotypical in their representation;
 - (ii) provide diversity training to all City media and communications staff;
 - (iii) allocate more advertising to community and ethno-specific media; and
 - (iv) develop strategies to ensure City communications are accessible by those whose first language is not English and by those who have limited literacy skills. Use clear language and design to provide information to the public. Consider the needs of incoming

immigrant groups when determining the languages for translation and the means of communication.

- (l) Implement a public awareness campaign on the proper use of accessible parking permits.
- (m) Strengthen public awareness campaigns with respect to the TTC and people with mobility issues, e.g. courtesy seating, elevator use.
- (n) Explore ways in which companies owned by members of vulnerable communities can be included in the City's promotional activities to demonstrate that all groups contribute to the growth and well-being of Toronto.
- (o) Explore other creative ways to promote awareness:
 - (i) establish International Women's Day as an official public holiday;
 - (ii) raise the profile of the UN International Day for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (March 21);
 - (iii) create friendship benches to facilitate dialogue between individuals; and
 - (iv) create avenues for public expression.
- (p) Provide increased resources for the elimination of hate activities.

Side Notes:

"A disability should not be seen as a stigma or something that might be contagious, but rather a fact of life. Some keep themselves isolated for fear of rejection or having been rejected."

"The quality of life in Toronto could be greatly improved if the citizens were equipped to handle racist incidents."

(5.5) Service Delivery:

Equitable access to services was also identified as a priority by consultation participants. They told us of being excluded from participation in social, business and educational activities because of the lack of physical access to venues in the city, limited accessible and affordable transportation, and the cost of renting space.

Participants also told us that finding City services that were sensitive to their specific needs was often difficult. They felt that when designing and delivering

services, City departments did not always recognize that “one size does not fit all” in a diverse city such as Toronto.

To ensure that all residents have access to the services they need, the following recommendations were made.

- (a) Ensure the accessibility of all City services by:
 - (i) regularly reviewing City policies, programs, services and buildings to ensure that they comply with the City’s non-discrimination and human rights policies and that they promote equitable access for all residents;
 - (ii) ensuring that, before a policy or program is implemented or eliminated, the City consults the affected communities and carries out impact studies to determine if there would be negative impacts, particularly on the most marginalized and most vulnerable communities;
 - (iii) developing a gender-based analysis tool to address the manner in which gender, class, social, economic, religious and cultural issues magnify the impact of racism, xenophobia and other forms of intolerance on women. Include intersectionality as a core principle in policy development;
 - (iv) making more effective use of limited City resources by conducting further analysis of patterns of inequality to identify the needs of different communities and undertake targeted remedial action;
 - (v) establishing and communicating guidelines to City employees, contractors and representatives of the City about non-discrimination, access and equity while conducting business on behalf of the City;
 - (vi) widely disseminating the accessibility audit of City facilities and direct City departments to incorporate their response into departmental action plans and budget submissions;
 - (vii) appointing a Municipal Ombudsperson to address the needs and complaints of residents in their interaction with the City;
 - (viii) providing ongoing diversity and anti-racism training to all City staff, particularly those providing front-line service. Organize an anti-racism week for the City’s workplaces;

- (ix) ensuring social service providers are representative of the community, understand the various cultures, and speak various languages;
 - (x) extending services for vulnerable communities to all under-served areas of the city;
 - (xi) providing more recreational programs for youth, and increasing the number of youth outreach workers;
 - (xii) proposing and supporting initiatives for civilian monitoring of police to ensure that certain communities are not over-policed;
 - (xiii) ensuring the Police Service's employment equity plans include programs to reflect the entire population, including the various languages, religions and cultures within the city; and
 - (xiv) ensuring appropriate places of worship and 'chaplains' of all faiths in places such as homes for the aged, community centres, fire halls, police stations, jails and shelters.
- (b) Use the City's multiple roles to ensure greater access within the city, by:
- (i) incorporating accessibility requirements within all City licensing and regulatory requirements;
 - (ii) directing that the Official Plan contain the necessary regulations and incentives to create a barrier-free city by 2008;
 - (iii) allocating resources to community organizations to make facilities accessible and making new funding conditional on compliance with accessibility requirements;
 - (iv) strengthening enforcement of disabled parking permit use for accessible spaces; and
 - (v) encouraging private sector employers to organize car pools and invest in company vans to transport employees living in the same area. This would reduce traffic congestion and therefore travel time.
- (c) Ensure the accessibility of the TTC by:
- (i) reviewing and amending the current definition of disability to include a broader range of disabilities, e.g. arthritis;
 - (ii) ensuring elevators are operational at all stations;

- (iii) posting clear instructions about who to contact if elevators and/or escalators are out of order and assistance is required;
 - (iv) developing strong, clear messages about who should use courtesy seating;
 - (v) finding alternate sources of funding for the TTC. Rising fares have a negative impact on access to transportation for many city residents and restrict their participation in aspects of civic life; and
 - (vi) resolving “journey to work” issues by establishing adequate routes, and better night time linkages, to and from the suburban areas.
- (d) Ensure adequate and sensitive long-term and temporary housing to vulnerable communities, by:
- (i) harmonizing municipal zoning by-laws and streamlining the zoning variance processes which govern residential use across Toronto to eliminate discrimination against supportive housing for people with mental illnesses;
 - (ii) funding adequate supportive housing units for people with mental health issues, shelters for LGBT youth and seniors, affordable housing for youth, accessible emergency shelters with the appropriate supports, and sensitive emergency accommodation for transsexual women;
 - (iii) developing a manual that outlines how to address the needs of transsexual women for use at shelters, housing and women's organizations, to reflect the implications of human rights rulings;
 - (iv) ensuring education and training support are provided to staff at emergency shelter services; and
 - (v) conducting a systemic audit with respect to physically accessible affordable housing.
- (e) Ensure communication to the various communities through the ethno-specific and community media by:
- (i) consulting with the communities to expand the number of ethno-specific and community media that cover municipal issues. Apply a gender lens when considering any outreach strategies to media outlets;

- (ii) developing a list of all ethno-specific and community media in Toronto. Ensure distribution of all City media releases and advisories to those on this list; and
 - (iii) distributing translated stories to the ethno-specific press.
- (f) Ensure greater access to appropriate literacy programs by:
- (i) establishing a literacy centre in a strategic high-need area, with satellite programs at accessible locations such as recreation centres, community schools and places of worship;
 - (ii) funding literacy research and outreach, to ensure the particular needs of various communities are identified and addressed;
 - (iii) providing space to, and share staff and training with, literacy programs; and
 - (iv) providing or supporting programs where parents can go with their children in the evening and have support with tutoring.

Side Notes:

“I live in a world of continuous pain, struggle to dress myself and to do many normal daily tasks. I feel intense frustration over my limitations. I have the same hopes and dreams as every other human being – I am no different. I want no sympathy from anyone, but to be understood and accepted for what is slowly becoming a life with obstacles.”

“The fact that in 2002, we are still talking about basic access shows how low of a priority physical accessibility remains.”

“We are concerned with the lack of monitoring of the police, especially when it comes to police relationships with ethno-racial communities in the city.”

“Supportive housing is often the difference between life and death.”

“We have had reports of women being turned away from shelters because they have a guide dog, or that materials are not made available in large print, or attendant care services cannot be arranged.”

(5.6) Building Strong Communities:

Throughout the consultations, we heard that many residents want to feel connected to a vibrant city, which is made up of strong communities. They told us that although they live and work in the city, they tend to operate within their own communities because that's where they feel welcomed and safe. They told us that they felt little if any connection to the larger community and would increase their participation in city life if barriers to their participation were removed and if they had a greater sense of belonging to the city. Others told us that there were economic barriers to their full participation. For some, the cost of transportation, admission and childcare limited their participation in many events.

We heard that participation in the political life of Toronto was limited because of access to information. City messages were not always communicated through channels that are accessible to all residents. In some communities, women receive information through their male family members. Many whose first language is neither English nor French, and those with limited literacy skills had difficulty communicating with the City.

We also heard that community groups and organizations want to be partners with the City in eliminating racism and discrimination. Participants noted that partnerships between the voluntary sector and public agencies present an opportunity to achieve a more inclusive society.

Many participants suggested specific ways the Plan of Action could build stronger communities:

- (a) Educate the various communities about the political process.
- (b) Strengthen the Community Advisory Committees and Working Groups by:
 - (i) allocating adequate resources and fill vacancies to support their work;
 - (ii) authorizing them to seek additional resources from public and private sources to enable them to carry out their responsibilities;
 - (iii) raising their profile and increasing community understanding of their function and composition by way of posters and the City's Web site; and
 - (iv) sharing the results of their deliberations with the communities they represent.

- (c) Promote the Toronto Youth Cabinet in schools and all youth venues and establish branches in schools so that youth throughout the city can participate.
- (d) Create more mechanisms for communities to participate in decision-making by:
 - (i) directing City departments, agencies, boards and commissions to proactively develop relationships with the various communities and develop opportunities for appropriate input in setting overall priorities for policy and program development, determining appropriate and feasible accommodations;
 - (ii) establishing access and equity committees for the Community Councils to give a voice to the concerns of the various communities;
 - (iii) establishing partnerships with agencies in the diverse communities for policy and program development and delivery initiatives;
 - (iv) supporting communities in playing a more substantive role in monitoring issues of access and equity. Recognize alternative strategies and recommendations put forth by communities as 'legitimate' and support their research and monitoring functions through resource allocation and acting on their recommendations;
 - (v) providing City departments with a comprehensive database of organizations and key contacts within the various communities; and
 - (vi) posting the agendas and minutes of all City task forces, committees and agencies on the City's Web site.
- (e) Expand the City's human and financial support for strengthening communities' ability to build the systems, structures and skills they need to define and achieve their objectives, including planning, training, resources, consultations and management of community initiatives.
- (f) Increase the diversity of communities represented at all City and City-funded events.
- (g) Support community-to-community mentoring programs so that emerging communities can learn from more established communities.

- (h) Use City grants as a tool to build communities by:
- (i) providing additional funding to fight racism, discrimination and hate crime;
 - (ii) ensuring grant application criteria are inclusive and establishing outreach strategies to encourage applications from emerging and under-served communities;
 - (iii) targeting City grants at building strong and safe communities. Increase grants programming and provide additional funding for emerging communities;
 - (iv) ensuring grants services and resources are distributed equitably across the entire City;
 - (v) funding micro-enterprise projects for youth; and
 - (vi) target social services to agencies which are providing support to emerging communities.
- (i) Ensure Toronto's diverse communities have access to a well-funded, fully accessible public transit system to support their participation in the social, cultural, recreational, economic and political life of Toronto.

Side Notes:

"I think we all agree that vision statements and finely worded policies are not worth the paper they are written on unless they are clearly tied to an implementation process. The equity field has suffered for too long in this inability to translate policy into practice."

"We must have evidence of implementation. To that end, we will need a form of reporting built into the Plan of Action that is public, timely, and accessible."

"It's not just [about] doing, but being seen to be doing. And finally, it's about being seen to be doing it right."

"Just do it!"

(5.7) Accountability:

Consultation participants generally applauded the City's goal of eliminating racism and discrimination, but emphasized the need to include mechanisms to

evaluate implementation and effectiveness. Long-term goals, with a process for evaluating progress are therefore needed to drive change and improvement.

They told us the Plan needs to be continuously reviewed to identify weaknesses and gaps in implementation. The road to access and equity is a journey, and not something that is done once and is then finished.

The following activities were recommended to evaluate the progress of implementation:

- (a) Entrench accountability into the Plan of Action for all activities that are within the City's direct responsibility as employer, policy maker, service provider, grants provider, regulator, contractor of goods and services, and civic leader.
- (b) Develop an Accessibility Plan as required by the Ontarians with Disabilities Act and establish monitoring and enforcement mechanisms to identify, remove and prevent barriers to persons with disabilities.
- (c) Develop a Management Guide to assist with the development of Access and Equity Action Plans and to ensure a consistent set of measures for determining accessibility and equity priorities across all City departments, agencies, boards and commissions.
- (d) Develop quantitative measures on the cost of racism and discrimination to society.
- (e) Work with communities to evaluate progress towards the elimination of racism and discrimination by conducting public surveys, monitoring participation at various events, and consulting with community groups and organizations.
- (f) Create mechanisms to hold the various City departments, agencies, boards and commissions accountable for their involvement and interactions with communities.
- (g) Establish an external body to monitor implementation of the Plan of Action.
- (h) Establish a reference point for human rights complaints in Toronto.
- (i) Establish a formal City Council mechanism to respond and to act upon issues of racism and discrimination.
- (j) Publish an annual report card, in plain language, with performance indicators for all City departments.

Side Notes:

“We wish to remind the City that it should be cognizant of the reality that the community may be suffering from ‘consultation exhaustion.’ We need to be persuaded to overcome our pessimism and cynicism when the actions of the City as reflected in its budget decisions continue to have a differential and negative impact on the most marginalized in our community.”

Appendix A – Consultation Invitation and Schedules
An invitation

Help prepare a City of Toronto Plan of Action
for the Elimination of Racism and Discrimination

The people of Toronto have been in the forefront of efforts to build a city, that respects and values its diverse communities. Toronto City Council has adopted many policies and taken actions to reduce the harmful effects of racism and discrimination. Yet, we need to do more so that each member of our society is a full participant in civic life.

We want to improve upon what has already been done. We seek your help and input to build a Plan of Action, which recognizes that our strength comes from our diversity.

To prepare this Plan of Action, Toronto City Council established a Reference Group and requested us to seek community input.

- (1) What priorities should the City’s Plan of Action address to eliminate racism and all forms of discrimination?
- (2) How should we respond to these priorities? What actions should various sectors and other orders of government take?
- (3) How can the City help build community capacity and support participation in the social, cultural, recreational, economic and political life of Toronto?
- (4) How can the City work with the community to evaluate progress towards eliminating racism and all forms of discrimination?
- (5) What would a city that has eliminated racism and discrimination look like?

Please contact us or attend one of the public meetings to discuss these questions and to tell us what actions must be taken to eliminate racism and discrimination.

Councillor Sherene Shaw
Diversity Advocate and Chair, Race and Ethnic Relations Community Advisory Committee

Councillor Maria Augimeri
Chair, Working Group on Language Equity and Literacy

Councillor Suzan Hall
Chair, Youth Gang Work Group and Member, Race and Ethnic Relations Community Advisory Committee

Councillor Pam McConnell
Chair, Status of Women Community Advisory Committee and Chair, Working Group on the Elimination of Hate Activity

Councillor Joe Mihevc
Chair, Disability Issues Community Advisory Committee

Councillor David Miller
Chair, Working Group on Immigration and Refugee Issues

Councillor Jane Pitfield
Chair, Aboriginal Affairs Community Advisory Committee

Councillor Kyle Rae
Chair, Community Advisory Committee on Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender Issues and Chair, Working Group on Employment Equity

Proposed Goal and Principles: Towards a City of Toronto Plan of Action for the Elimination of Racism and all forms of Discrimination

The proposed City of Toronto Plan of Action will build on the legacy and leadership for which the City of Toronto is respected.

The City of Toronto's non-discrimination policy provides protection on the basis of race, ancestry, place of origin, colour, ethnic origin, disability, citizenship, creed, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, age, marital status, family status, receipt of public assistance, political affiliation, religious affiliation, record of offences or level of literacy.

Goal:

It is proposed that the goal of the Plan of Action be: to enable all residents to participate fully in the civic, economic, social, cultural, political and recreational life of the city.

To achieve this goal:

- (a) We will eliminate the barriers that restrict all residents from participating in all aspects of civic life through the elimination of racism and all forms of discrimination.

- (b) We will build a cohesive community that benefits all, by incorporating principles of access, equity and human rights, in all plans being prepared by the City.
- (c) We will identify priorities in consultation with the community, stakeholders, partners and other orders of government.
- (d) We will take actions that will respond to the priorities which will achieve an inclusive society.

Guiding Principles:

Shared vision:

The City of Toronto is strengthened when all residents share a vision for a society that is inclusive and values the diversity of its people.

Strength through diversity:

Diversity is the core strength of Toronto. The city's success as a community comes from the respect and value, which we place upon diversity. The City of Toronto will nurture and support this diversity.

Strong communities/dynamic city:

All residents must share in the prosperity of the city. Every resident of Toronto must believe that the city belongs to them and that each person is able to participate in all aspects of the life of the city. Eliminating harassment and discrimination, and achieving access to employment, shelter, food transit, child care and education are necessities for strong communities.

Shared future and heritage:

Our future as a city of people from diverse backgrounds is a shared future. We may come from different countries and speak many languages, but our home and our city of choice is Toronto. We endorse the principle of Aboriginal self-determination. Together we are one as we build a common future which respects our different histories.

Priorities:

On January 16, 2002, the Diversity Advocate met with the City's five Community Advisory Committees, the following common priority issues were identified:

- (i) poverty reduction;
- (ii) housing;
- (iii) public transit and transportation;
- (iv) youth leadership and elimination of youth violence
- (v) employment;
- (vi) policing;

- (vii) education;
- (viii) public awareness; and
- (ix) community outreach

Other issues were included in the workplans of each committee. Changing or improving services and policies in these areas benefits everyone, even though a specific group faces a specific barrier:

- (i) pay equity;
- (ii) sexual assault;
- (iii) information and communications to improve access to services for marginalized groups;
- (iv) access to recreation programs;
- (v) daycare services;
- (vi) multi-lingual communications
- (vii) the City budget process;
- (viii) urban Aboriginal issues;
- (ix) health and addictions;
- (x) domestic violence;
- (xi) accessibility to buildings;
- (xii) accreditation of foreign credentials; and
- (xiii) diversity training.

Read the following reports: www.city.toronto.on.ca/diversity/reports:

- (a) Executive Summary of the City of Toronto Task Force on Community Access and Equity, January, 2000
- (b) Development of a City of Toronto Declaration and Plan of Action Regarding the Elimination of Racism in Relation to the United Nations – World Conference Against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance (UN-WCAR) – city Council Report, April, 2001
- (c) Ethno-Racial Inequality in the City of Toronto: An Analysis of the 1996 Census (Ornstein Study), May, 2000
- (d) Status Report – Study on Ethno-Racial Inequality in Toronto, October 2001
- (e) Status Report by the Chief Administrative Officer on the Implementation of the Recommendations of the Task force on Community Access and Equity, report to City Council, April, 2002

Also refer to:

- (i) Multilingual Services Policy;
- (ii) Workplace Human Rights and Harassment Policy;

- (iii) Employment Equity Policy;
- (iv) Submission to the House of Commons Standing Committee on Citizenship and Immigration; Bill C-11, *the Immigration and Refugee Protection Act*;
- (v) Submission to the Legislative Assembly Standing committee on Financial and Economic Affairs on Bill 125, the *Ontarians with Disabilities Act*

Consultation Schedule 2002:

City-wide consultations:

Toronto (May 27)
Etobicoke (May 28)
Scarborough (June 12)
North York (September 10)

Advisory Committee and Working Group Consultations:

Disability Issues Community Advisory Committee (May 14)
Community Advisory Committee on Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual,
Transgender Issues (May 15)
Race and Ethnic Relations Community Advisory Committee (May 27)
Aboriginal Affairs Community Advisory Committee (June 5)
Status of Women Community Advisory Committee (June 13)
Working Group on Immigration and Refugee Issues (September 18)
Working Group on Language Equity and Literacy (September 13, November 6 and 27)

Focus Groups and Other Consultations:

Coalition of Residents and Ratepayers Associations (October 2)
Access and Equity Community Organisations (October 9)
Business, Business Improvement Associations and Business
Development Organizations (October 16)
Faith groups (October 23)

Appendix B - List of Deputants

Community Groups and Organizations

A Call to Freedom Network
African Canadian Legal Clinic
ALPHA
Annex Women's Action Committee
Beyond Abilities
Canadian Arab Federation
Canadian Jewish Congress

Canadian Race Relations Foundation
Caribbean Cultural Workshop
Centre for Spanish Speaking People
Chinese Canadian National Council Toronto Chapter
Coalition of Black Trade Unionists
Community Social Planning Council
Council of Agencies Serving South Asians (CASSA)
Doorsteps Neighbourhood Services
Eden Cantkier-Kerry's Place
Griffin Centre
Hong Fook Mental Health Association
Human Rights and Race Relations Centre
Institute for the Healing of Racism
Karuna Community Service
Ontario Association for the Deaf
Ontario Council of Agencies Serving Immigrants (OCASI)
Parents Helping Improve Kids' Skills (PHINKS)
Pride Employment Network
Restoring Integrity and Self-Awareness through Education (RISE)
Regent Park Community Health Centre
Silayan Community Centre
Soka Gakkai International of Canada
Status of Women Community Advisory Committee
Tamil Anti-Racism Committee (TARC)
Toronto Community Housing
The Toronto and York Region Labour Council
United Steelworkers of America
Urban Alliance on Race Relations

Individuals:

Michael Akhter
Bill Alexander
Ellen Anderson
Dr. Sandra Romano Anthony
Susan Baker
Cyndy Baskin
Jean Bonnet
Monique Boyko-Lokumo
Gopa Chakravarty
Sally Chiappetta
David Dizzah
Philip Dufresne
Michael Francis
Susan Gapka
Susan Gotha
David Hanna

June Henderson
Silvina Hollingsworth
Eugenia Jolly
Aaron Lowe
Florence Lutale
Ali Mallah
Linvor J. McKoy
Emily Mills
Honey Novick
Roger Obonsawin
Dev Prashad
Rosa Prince
Rupert Raj
Karen Rodie
Richard D. Sampson
Imran Sayed
Andrew Schulz
Peter Ashward Sealy
Neethan Shanmugarajah
Noel Simpson
Najib Souflan
Harvey Starkman
Imran Syed
Eva Tavares
Daria Timmer
Libby Thaw
Omer Warfa

Appendix C - List of Written Submissions - Community Groups and Organizations:

A Call to Freedom Network
Aboriginal Affairs Community Advisory Committee
African Canadian Legal Clinic
Annex Women's Action Committee
Canadian Arab Federation
Canadian Jewish Congress
Canadian Race Relations Foundation
Chinese Canadian National Council Toronto Chapter
Coalition of Black Trade Unionists
Community Advisory Committee on Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender Issues
Council of Agencies Serving South Asians (CASSA)
Disability Issues Community Advisory Committee
Doorsteps Neighbourhood Services
Egale Canada
Griffin Centre

Human Rights and Race Relations Centre
Institute for the Healing of Racism
Nellie's
Ontario Council of Agencies Serving Immigrants (OCASI)
Pride Employment Network
Race and Ethnic Relations Community Advisory Committee
Regent Park Community Health Centre
Soka Gakkai International of Canada
Status of Women Community Advisory Committee
Tamil Anti-Racism Committee (TARC)
The Toronto and York Region Labour Council
United Steelworkers of America
Urban Alliance on Race Relations
Whyy Mee Counselling Foundation of Toronto
Working Group on Immigration and Refugee Issues
Working Group on Language Equity and Literacy

Individuals:

Ellen Anderson
Jean Bonnet
Philip Dufresne
Susan Gapka
Michelle Haney-Kileeg
June Henderson
Linvor J. McKoy
Honey Novick Gerald H. Parker
Rupert Raj
Richard D. Sampson
Peter Ashward Sealy
Noel Simpson
Harvey Starkman
Imran Syed

Mr. John Doherty, Community Social Planning Council, appeared before the Policy and Finance Committee in connection with the foregoing matter.

(City Council, at its meeting on April 14, 15 and 16, 2003, had before it, during consideration of the foregoing Clause, communications from the following:

- (a) (April 11, 2003) from Guy Ewing, Executive Director, Metro Toronto Movement for Literacy; and
- (b) (April 11, 2003) from Idris Madar, The Somali Family and Child Skills Envelopment Services.)