

Consolidated Clause in Planning and Transportation Committee Report 2, which was considered by City Council on July 25, 26 and 27, 2006.

10d**Harmonization of the Sign By-law
Concerning Posters on Public Property**

City Council on July 25, 26 and 27, 2006, amended this Clause:

(1) *by amending the Recommendations of the Planning and Transportation Committee as follows:*

(a) *by deleting from Recommendation (1)(a) the words “on paper” and inserting instead the words “or paper”, so that Recommendation (1)(a) now reads as follows:*

“(1)(a)Section 693-30, Section A.(1), Posters on Kiosks, be amended to read:

‘A.(1) The poster is no more than 22 centimetres by 28 centimetres in size and consists of lightweight cardboard or paper only;’ ”; and

(b) *by deleting from Recommendation (1)(b) the words “the name of the”, and inserting instead the words “valid contact information for an”, so that Recommendation (1)(b) now reads as follows:*

“(1)(b)Section 693-31, Community Posters on Utility Poles, be amended by adding the following new Recommendation (8) under “B.”:

‘B.(8) The community poster include valid contact information for an owner(s) of the poster.’ ”;

(2) *by amending the draft by-law as follows:*

(a) *by amending the definition of “COMMUNITY POSTER” to read as follows:*

“COMMUNITY POSTER - A poster promoting citizen participation in religious, civic, charitable, or non-profit activities such as advertising festivals, community events, local artistic and cultural events, local community services, and political ideas, missing persons, pets or items.”; and

(b) *by amending § 693-28, Definitions and interpretation, by deleting the definition of POSTER contained in the draft by-law and replacing it with the following definition:*

“POSTER – A notice of any kind, including but not limited to an advertisement, bill, handbill, leaflet, flyer or placard, which is attached to a utility pole or kiosk, and includes a community poster;”; and

- (c) *by adding to the end of Section A of Subsection 693-29 - General Restrictions, the following:*

“including but not limited to parking meter ticket dispensers (pay and display machines), parking meters (including the vertical support posts), parking and traffic signs (including the vertical support posts), street litter disposal containers, newspaper boxes, traffic control devices, trees, signal control boxes, street furniture, bus shelters, bicycle-racks, fire hydrants, post boxes, switching cabinets, and phone booths and call stations”; and

- (3) *in accordance with the following staff recommendations contained in the Recommendations Section of the supplementary report (April 21, 2006) from the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards [as contained in the deferred Clause], subject to amending staff Recommendation (4) by amending Section B.(8) to read as follows:*

“B.(8) The community poster include valid contact information for an owner(s) of the poster.”,

so the staff recommendations, as amended, now read as follows:

“It is recommended that:

- (1) *§ 693-28. A. of the attached bill, be amended, by introducing the following definition:*

SCHOOL — A ‘school’ or a ‘private school’ as defined under the Ontario Education Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. E.2, or successor legislation;

- (2) *§ 693-29. C. of the attached bill, be amended by adding the words ‘or sidewalks’ after the word ‘boulevard’ in order that the section reads as follows:*

C. No person shall erect, attach, place or display, or cause or permit to be erected, attached, placed or displayed, any sign on any privately-owned poles located on boulevards or sidewalks;

- (3) *§ 693-30. A. (2) and § 693-31. B. (2) of the attached bill, be amended to also provide that no other method of affixing the poster to a kiosk or utility pole is permitted;*

- (4) *if Council is supportive of the Planning and Transportation Committee's recommended amendment that Section 693-31. Community Posters on Utility Poles, of the attached bill, include the requirement that a community poster include the name of the owner(s) of the poster, § 693-30. Posters on Kiosks, be amended by adding the following:*
- 'B.(8) The community poster include valid contact information for an owner(s) of the poster.'*;
- (5) *the City Solicitor be directed, once the kiosks have been installed, to prepare the necessary bill substantially in the form of the draft Postering By-law, attached and as amended, to incorporate recommendations one to four of this report, subject to any necessary refinements, including stylistic, format and organization, as may be identified by the City Solicitor and the Executive Director of Municipal Licensing and Standards; and*
- (6) *the appropriate City officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect thereto."*

This Clause, as amended, was adopted by City Council.

Council also considered additional material, which is noted at the end of this Clause.

City Council on June 27, 28 and 29, 2006, postponed consideration of this Clause to its next regular meeting on July 25, 2006.

Council also considered additional material, which is noted at the end of this Clause.

City Council on June 14, 2006, postponed consideration of this Clause to its next regular meeting on June 27, 2006.

Council also considered additional material, which is noted at the end of this Clause.

City Council on May 23, 24 and 25, 2006, postponed consideration of this Clause to its special meeting on June 14, 2006.

Council also considered additional material, which is noted at the end of this Clause.

City Council on April 25, 26 and 27, 2006, postponed consideration of this Clause to its next regular meeting on May 23, 2006.

Council also considered additional material, which is noted at the end of this Clause.

The Planning and Transportation Committee recommends that:

- (1) **City Council adopt the staff recommendations in the Recommendations Section of the report (February 13, 2006) from the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards, subject to the following:**
 - (a) **Section 693-30, Section A.(1), Posters on Kiosks, be amended to read:**

“A.(1) The poster is no more than 22 centimetres by 28 centimetres in size and consists of lightweight cardboard on paper only;”
 - (b) **Section 693-31, Community Posters on Utility Poles, be amended by adding the following new Recommendation (8) under “B.”:**

“B.(8) The community poster include the name of the owner(s) of the poster.”; and
- (2) **the hotline telephone number for posters, 416-393-CLEAN, be made available to the public to encourage them to call with any respective concerns in their community.**

Action taken by the Committee:

The Planning and Transportation Committee requested the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards, to report to City Council, for its meeting of April 25, 2006, on concerns raised at today’s meeting by Councillors and deputants.

The Planning and Transportation Committee held a public meeting on March 6, 2006, in accordance with the *Municipal Act, 2001*, and notice of the proposed amendment to Toronto Municipal Code Chapter 693, Signs, was posted on the City’s web site for a minimum of five days.

The Planning and Transportation Committee submits the report (February 13, 2006) from the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards:

Purpose:

To report on a draft Sign By-law concerning posters on public property, including signs on utility poles and kiosks.

Financial Implications and Impact Statement:

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

Recommendations:

It is recommended that:

- (1) Council adopt the regulations contained in the draft by-law appended to the Notice of Motion, Clause J(17), adopted by Council, at its meeting of January 31, February 1 and February 2, 2006, which referred to the draft Postering By-law to this meeting of the Planning and Transportation Committee together with the following amendment:

“Amend the definition of “OWNER” by deleting the definition contained in the draft by-law and inserting the following in its place: “OWNER - includes a person in the business of manufacturing and displaying posters, a person who installed a poster, a person who is in lawful control of a poster or otherwise directly benefits from the message of a poster”;
- (2) the City Solicitor be directed, once the kiosks have been installed, to prepare the necessary bill substantially in the form of the draft Postering By-law, attached to the Notice of Motion referred to in recommendation (1) of this report, in order to give effect to any of the recommendations adopted by Council; and
- (3) the appropriate City officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.

Background:

City Council on May 17, 18 and 19, 2005, referred this issue to the Mayor’s Office to propose a Postering By-law that would place limits on postering, consistent with the objectives of the “Clean and Beautiful City Initiative” and the principle of “freedom of expression”. The Mayor was requested to report directly to Council.

City Council, at its meeting of January 31, February 1 and 2, 2006, adopted a motion referring a draft Postering By-law to the March 06, 2006 meeting of the Planning and Transportation Committee. The Executive Director of Municipal Licensing and Standards, in consultation with the City Solicitor, was directed to report on the proposed by-law at this meeting.

Comments:

During the earlier debates related to this issue at Council, the key issue identified was the need to balance the concerns of any unjustified infringement of the guarantee of freedom of expression found in the *Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms* against the City’s objectives of avoiding littering, aesthetic blight, traffic hazards and hazards to persons engaged in the repair and maintenance of utility poles.

In the 1993 decision by the Supreme Court of Canada in *Ramsden v. Peterborough (City)*, the court found that a complete ban on postering contravened the right to freedom of expression, one of the fundamental freedoms in the *Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms*.

The judges agreed unanimously that: "... it is clear that posterage on public property, including utility poles, fosters political and social decision-making and thereby furthers at least one of the values underlying s. 2(b) [of the Charter]."

Though cities are unable to ban posterage, the court supported their concerns about litter and the "visual and aesthetic blight" that abandoned posters create, and suggested restrictions with respect to the location, quantity, size, length of time, and method of posting that were permissible.

The Court was not asked to consider, and did not express, an opinion on a minimum allowable level of posterage. It did indicate that any by-law restrictions must impair the right to freedom of expression as little as reasonably possible. Cases considering sign by-laws generally suggest that the City should ensure that persons wishing to display posters on public property have a fair opportunity to do so. What is fair or reasonable for any particular neighbourhood will depend on a number of factors such as the demand for posterage, density of population in that area, and the character of the neighbourhood.

The Proposed By-law

The proposed By-law seeks to:

- (a) provide businesses and residents with an opportunity to communicate through posterage;
- (b) minimize aesthetic blight and visual clutter;
- (c) avoid littering;
- (d) ease the repair and maintenance of public property including utility poles;
- (e) improve safety for motorists and pedestrians; and
- (f) facilitate an active enforcement program.

The following is a summary of the principles contained in the draft By-law:

1. Provide for a distinction between posters in general and community-based posters.

A poster would include a temporary notice of any kind, including but not limited to a notice, sign, advertisement, bill, handbill, leaflet, flyer or placard, which is attached with its entire back surface in contact with a utility pole or kiosk and is secured by removable tape, or staples; this includes a community poster.

A community-based poster would include a poster promoting citizen participation in religious, civic, charitable or non-profit activities and events, or advertising festivals, community events, political ideas, or missing persons, pets or items.

2. Expand the definition of the owner of a poster.

The owner of a poster would include a person in the business of manufacturing and displaying posters, a person who installed a poster, a person who is in lawful control of a poster or otherwise directly benefits from the message of a poster. For the purposes of this by-law, there may be more than one owner of a poster.

3. Introduce kiosks as a location for postering.

A kiosk would be a structure approved by the City along certain streets within the City for the purpose of posting posters and would include a poster board, a designated wall or other designated structures.

4. Designate locations for placement of posters and community based posters.

Any poster may be placed on a kiosk.

Additionally, community-based posters could be placed on utility poles throughout the City.

Under this by-law, no poster of any kind may be placed on structures such as traffic control devices, trees, signal control boxes, street furniture, bus shelters, bicycle racks, fire hydrants, post boxes, newspaper boxes, any decorative street light pole or art, and no poster of any type may be placed on or within any traffic island or median.

5. Introduce physical criteria that apply to all types of posters.

The following are examples of the criteria applicable to any type of poster.

A poster:

- (a) would be restricted in size and material, (no larger than 22 centimetres by 28 centimetres, and consisting of lightweight cardboard or paper, only);
- (b) would need to be attached flush to the surface, using only staples or removable tape;
- (c) would only be allowed to be placed no higher than two metres above the ground;
- (d) would have to be dated, showing the date of posting;
- (e) would only be permitted to be displayed for up to 30 days, or five days after the end of the advertised event, if any, whichever, is earlier;
- (f) conveying essentially identical information would be limited to one per postering location; and
- (g) would be required to face towards the property fronting on the highway, and away from the portion of the highway ordinarily used by vehicles.

6. Permit removal of poster by City and recovery of costs.

The City would be permitted to remove any sign, including posters, at any time and without notice, and charge back a per sign removal fee.

Enactment of the By-law

The underlying premise of the Postering By-law is the installation of kiosks. Until such time as kiosks have been constructed by, or on behalf of the City, for the use of the public, the provisions cannot come into full force and effect.

The design, installation, and location of kiosks will form part of the review presently being undertaken with respect to the street furniture programme. The Request for Proposal (RFP) related to the street furniture programme will be issued in the latter half of 2006.

The bill should be introduced to Council upon the successful deployment of the kiosks.

Conclusions:

The proposed By-law appears to provide a balanced approach between the guarantee of freedom of expression and the City's goals related to a Clean and Beautiful City, and provide defensible regulations and restrictions with respect to the location, quantity, size, length of time, and method of posting posters.

The bill for the proposed Postering By-law will be introduced to Council once all of the kiosks have been installed.

This report was prepared in consultation with the City Solicitor.

Contact:

Frank Weinstock, Manager, Policy and Business Planning Unit
Municipal Licensing and Standards
Telephone: 416-392-0404; Fax: 416-397-5463; Email: fweinst@toronto.ca

(A copy of the Notice of Motion, Clause J(17), adopted by Council, at its meeting of January 31, February 1 and 2, 2006, referred to in the foregoing report was forwarded to all Members of Council with the March 6, 2006, agenda of the Planning and Transportation Committee and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

The Planning and Transportation Committee also considered the following communications:

- (February 10, 2006) from the City Clerk;
- (March 2, 2006) from Canadian Civil Liberties Association;
- (March 3, 2006) from Bloor-Yorkville Business Improvement Area;
- (March 6, 2006) from Grant Orchard;
- (October 7, 2005) from Al Yolles; and
- (March 3, 2006) from Downtown Yonge Business Improvement Area.

The following persons addressed the Planning and Transportation Committee:

- James Robinson, Executive Director, Downtown Yonge BIA;
- Alison Gorbould, Toronto Public Space Committee;
- Grant Orchard, David Orchard Campaign for Canada;
- Josh Paterson, Acting Director, Canadian Civil Liberties Association;
- Briar de Lange, Bloor Yorkville BIA, and filed a copy of her submission;
- Phil Pothen;
- Jonathan Goldsbie;

- Brian Ridgeway, ASAP Rental;
- Al Yolles; and
- Mitchell Shnier.

Attachment to Motion J(17)

Authority: Planning and Transportation Committee Report No. , Clause No. , as adopted by
City of Toronto Council on
Enacted by Council:

CITY OF TORONTO

Bill No.

BY-LAW No.

To add Article IV, Posters on Public Property, to Municipal Code, Chapter 693, Signs

WHEREAS Council may pass by-laws to regulate signs and other advertising devices under paragraph 7 of subsection 11(1) of the *Municipal Act, 2001*, as amended; and

WHEREAS section 99 of the *Municipal Act, 2001* establishes rules that apply to a by-law of a municipality respecting advertising devices, including signs, and permits the removal of signs erected or displayed in contravention of the by-law; and

WHEREAS Council may pass by-laws imposing fees or charges on any class of persons for services or activities provided or done by or on behalf of the City under clause 391(1)(a) of the *Municipal Act, 2001*; and

WHEREAS Council may pass by-laws respecting highways under paragraph 1 of subsection 11(1) of the *Municipal Act, 2001*; and

WHEREAS under section 425 of the *Municipal Act, 2001*, by-laws may be passed by municipality for providing that any person who contravenes any by-law of the municipality passed under the authority of the *Municipal Act, 2001* is guilty of an offence; and

WHEREAS under section 427 of the *Municipal Act, 2001*, if a municipality has authority by by-law or otherwise to direct or require that a matter or thing be done, the municipality may, in the same or another by-law direct that, in default of it being done by the person directed or required to do it, the matter or thing shall be done at the person's expense, and the municipality may recover the costs of doing it by action, or the costs may be added to the tax roll and collected in the same manner as taxes;

The Council of the City of Toronto HEREBY ENACTS as follows:

1. Chapter 693, Signs, of The City of Toronto Municipal Code, is amended by adding the following:

ARTICLE IV
Posters on Public Property

§ 693-28. Definitions and interpretation.

A. As used in this article, the following terms shall have the meanings indicated:

BOULEVARD – The untravelled portion of a highway, but does not include a sidewalk or a median.

COMMUNITY POSTER – A poster promoting citizen participation in religious, civic, charitable or non-profit activities and events, or advertising festivals, community events, political ideas, or missing persons, pets or items.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR – The Executive Director of Municipal Licensing and Standards or his or her designate or successor official.

HIGHWAY – A highway as defined in section 1 of the *Municipal Act, 2001* that is under the jurisdiction of the City.

KIOSK – A structure, approved by the General Manager of the Transportation Division, or his or her designate or successor official, placed on a highway within the City for the purpose of posting posters and includes a poster board, a designated wall or other designated locations;

OWNER – Includes a person who created a poster, who installed a poster, who is in lawful control of a poster or otherwise directly benefits from the message of a poster.

POSTER – A notice of any kind, including but not limited to an advertisement, bill, handbill, leaflet, flyer or placard, which is attached with its entire back surface in contact with a utility pole or kiosk and is secured by removable tape, or staples and includes a community poster.

SIGN – Any device, structure or medium that uses any colour, form, graphic, illumination, symbol or writing to convey information of any kind to the public, and includes a poster.

STREET-LIGHTING POLE – A pole owned by Toronto Hydro Street Lighting Inc.

UTILITY POLE – Includes a utility pole, light standard, a pole owned or controlled by the Toronto Transit Commission, and a street lighting pole but does not include a privately-owned pole.

B. For the purposes of this article, there may be more than one owner of a poster.

C. For greater certainty, this article does not apply to election signs.

§ 693-29. General restrictions.

- A. Except as authorized by by-law or by agreement with the City, no person shall erect, attach, place or display, or cause or permit to be erected, attached, placed or displayed, any sign on, over or to any structure or thing located on land owned by the City or any of its agencies, boards or commissions.
- B. Except as authorized by by-law, no person shall erect, attach, place or display, or cause or permit to be erected, attached, placed or displayed, any sign on or to a kiosk, or a utility pole located within a highway.
- C. No person shall erect, attach, place or display, or cause or permit to be erected, attached, placed or displayed, any sign on any privately-owned poles located on boulevards.
- D. No person shall erect, attach, place or display, or cause or permit to be erected, attached, placed or displayed, any sign on any fencing of a construction site or demolition site as required pursuant to Chapter 363, Building Construction and Demolition, Article III, Fencing of Construction and Demolition Sites.

§ 693-30. Posters on kiosks.

- A. Despite §§ 693-29A and B, a poster may be placed on a kiosk if:
 - (1) The poster is more than 22 centimetres by 28 centimetres in size and consists of lightweight cardboard or paper only;
 - (2) The poster is securely attached flush to the surface of the kiosk using staples or removable tape;
 - (3) The poster is placed no higher than two metres above the ground;
 - (4) The poster is dated, showing the date of posting;
 - (5) The poster is displayed for not more than the earlier of:
 - (a) 30 days or
 - (b) Five days after the end of the advertised event, if any;
 - (6) Not more than one poster conveying essentially identical information is posted on the kiosk; and
 - (7) The poster faces towards the property fronting on the highway and away from the portion of the highway ordinarily used by vehicles.

§ 693-31. Community posters on utility poles.

- A. Despite §§ 693-29A and B, persons, charities, religious organizations, community organizations and schools may erect, attach, place or display, or cause or permit to be erected, attached, placed or displayed community posters on utility poles as permitted under Subsection B.
- B. A community poster may be placed on a utility pole located on a boulevard if:
- (1) The community poster is no larger than 22 centimetres by 28 centimetres and consists of lightweight cardboard or paper only;
 - (2) The community poster is securely attached flush to the surface of the utility pole using staples or removable tape;
 - (3) The community poster is placed no higher than two metres above the ground;
 - (4) The community poster is dated, showing the date of posting;
 - (5) The community poster is displayed for not more than the earlier of:
 - (a) 30 days or
 - (b) Five days after the end of the advertised event, if any;
 - (6) Not more than one community poster conveying essentially identical information is posted on the utility pole; and
 - (7) The community poster faces towards the property fronting on the boulevard and away from the portion of the highway ordinarily used by vehicles.

§ 693-32. Additional restrictions.

- A. In addition to the restrictions §§ 693-30 and 693-31, a poster shall not:
- (1) Be placed on or within any traffic island or median.
 - (2) Be a hazard or dangerous to vehicular or pedestrian traffic, as determined by the General Manger of Transportation or his or her designate or successor official.
 - (3) Cause any damage to municipal property.
 - (4) Become unsightly.
 - (5) Cover or overlap another poster or community poster, in whole or in part. Posters or community posters can be only one layer thick.

§ 693-33. Compliance.

Despite any other sign by-law or article in this chapter, a poster that complies with this article may be erected or displayed without a permit.

§ 693-34. Removal of signs.

- A. The Executive Director or the owner of a utility pole may, at any time and without notice, remove any sign from a utility pole in the course of periodic cleaning or maintenance operations.
- B. The Executive Director may, at any time and without notice, remove any sign that is displayed in contravention of this article.
- C. Any sign removed under this section may be destroyed or otherwise disposed of by the Executive Director or the owner of the utility pole without notice or compensation to any person who has an interest in the sign.
- D. Where a sign has been removed under Subsection B, the owner or any person responsible for erecting, attaching, placing or displaying, or causing or permitting the erecting, attaching, placing or displaying of the sign in contravention of this article shall, in addition to any fine or other penalty that may be imposed for an offence under this article, be required to pay to the City the greater of a per sign removal fee set out in § 441-9 of Chapter 441, Fees or the actual cost of removal and disposal of the sign, and the City may recover this amount by legal action or in like manner as municipal taxes.

§ 693-35. Offence.

Any person who contravenes any provision of this article is guilty of an offence.

2. Section 441-9 of Chapter 441, Fees, of The City of Toronto Municipal Code is amended by adding the following:

- F. Removal of signs.

The sign removal fee payable to the City under § 693-32D is \$60 per sign.

3. The following provisions are repealed:

- A. Section 9 of By-law No. 64-87, “For Prohibiting and Regulating the Erection of Signs and Other Advertising Devices”, as amended, of the former Borough of East York.
- B. Sections 215-27, and 215-28 of Chapter 215, Signs, of the former City of Etobicoke Municipal Code, as amended.
- C. Section 2.10 of By-law No. 30788, “A By-law to prohibit or regulate signs and other advertising devices”, as amended, of the former City of North York.

D. The following from Chapter 313, Streets and Sidewalks, of the former City of Toronto Municipal Code:

- (1) Article XB; and
- (2) the following from Schedule A, at the end of Chapter 313:

(from column 1)	(from column 2)	(from column 3)
“§ 313-73.4C	Removal of poster	\$60.00* (per poster)”

E. Paragraph 2.2.3 of Schedule A to By-law No. 22980, “A By-law to prohibit and regulate signs in the City of Scarborough.”, as amended, (Scarborough Sign Code) of the former City of Scarborough.

F. By-law 11928, as amended by by-law 3296-79 of the former City of York.

4. This by-law comes into force ...

ENACTED AND PASSED this day of , A.D. 2006.

Mayor

City Clerk

City Council – April 25, 26 and 27, 2006

Council also considered the following:

- *Report (April 21, 2006) from the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards [Communication 3(b)].*

Subject: Harmonization of the Sign By-law concerning Posters on Public Property

Purpose:

To report on concerns raised by Councillors and deputants at the Planning and Transportation Committee meeting of March 6, 2006, as they relate to the proposed regulations and standards for posterage.

Financial Implications and Impact Statement:

There are no financial implications from the adoption of this report.

Recommendations:

It is recommended that:

- (1) § 693-28. A. of the attached bill, be amended, by introducing the following definition:

SCHOOL — A “school” or a “private school” as defined under the Ontario Education Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. E.2, or successor legislation;
- (2) § 693-29. C. of the attached bill, be amended by adding the words “or sidewalks” after the word “boulevard” in order that the section reads as follows:

C. No person shall erect, attach, place or display, or cause or permit to be erected, attached, placed or displayed, any sign on any privately-owned poles located on boulevards or sidewalks;
- (3) § 693-30. A. (2) and § 693-31. B. (2) of the attached bill, be amended to also provide that no other method of affixing the poster to a kiosk or utility pole is permitted;
- (4) if Council is supportive of the Planning and Transportation Committee’s recommended amendment that Section 693-31. Community Posters on Utility Poles, of the attached bill, include the requirement that a community poster include the name of the owner(s) of the poster, § 693-30. Posters on Kiosks, be amended by adding the following:

B. (8) The poster includes the name of the owner(s) of the poster;
- (5) the City Solicitor be directed, once the kiosks have been installed, to prepare the necessary bill substantially in the form of the draft Postering By-law, attached and as amended, to incorporate recommendations one to four of this report, subject to any necessary refinements, including stylistic, format and organization, as may be identified by the City Solicitor and the Executive Director of Municipal Licensing and Standards; and
- (6) the appropriate City officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.

Background:

The Planning and Transportation Committee, at its meeting of March 6, 2006, requested the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards, to report to City Council for its meeting of April 25, 26, and 27, 2006, on concerns raised at the Committee meeting by Councillors and deputants.

Comments:

Staff reviewed comments and concerns raised at the Committee meeting and they appear to fall into two classes: additional restrictions and regulations, and enforcement issues.

Additional Restrictions and Regulations

Among the added restrictions and regulations noted or suggested were:

1. *A prohibition of posters on public and private utility poles, and restrictions preventing posterage to be done by any commercial or “for profit” organizations.*

Comment: As has been noted in earlier reports, the current status of the law does not permit a municipality to absolutely prohibit posterage. A municipality may only regulate the placement of posters in a manner that balances the interests of the City (for example, preventing litter, urban blight, and safety concerns), with the right of persons to display posters, (whether it be for commercial or non-profit purposes).

2. *A more specific definition of which groups can use utility poles; for example, schools should be defined as “public” or non-commercial/or “persons” as someone who owns a business.*

Comment: For clarity, the word school could be defined as it was in Article III of Chapter 693, Signs, in the Toronto Municipal Code. That is, the following definition could be introduced into § 693-28. A.

SCHOOL — A “school” or a “private school” as defined under the Ontario Education Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. E.2, or successor legislation.

3. *Amend § 693-29. C. to also prohibit signs on privately owned poles located on the sidewalks so that the section reads as follows: “No person shall erect, attach, place or display, or cause or permit to be erected, attached, placed or displayed any sign on any privately owned poles located on boulevards or sidewalks”.*

Comment: § 693-29. C. presently only identifies privately owned poles located on boulevards. The section could be amended to introduce the words “or sidewalk” to ensure that all privately owned poles are regulated.

4. *Require community groups, charities, religious organizations, and schools that hold events at City properties and Squares not to advertise through posterage on public property; and/or require community groups, charities, religious organizations and schools that receive City grant money, and that hold events at City properties, not to poster on public property/utility poles, except on designated community bulletin boards or kiosks.*

Comment: Introducing restrictions of this nature would be discriminatory.

5. *Posterage should also be banned from the following:*

- (1) *Parking meter ticket dispensers and parking meters (including the vertical support posts); all parking and traffic signs, including the vertical support posts; all street litter disposal containers; newspaper boxes of all types; phone booths and call stations; Rogers and Bell switching cabinets; and bicycle locking posts;*

- (2) *Ensure that no posters of any kind are placed on decorative poles or pedestrian lighting poles that are either private or public; and*
- (3) *Require street furniture owners to maintain their property free of posters.*

Comment: The limitations on the placement of posters in the by-law, as proposed, are comprehensive.

The by-law as proposed, would prohibit posters of any kind to be placed on structures or things within a highway or located on land owned by the City or any of its agencies, boards or commissions. Accordingly, this by-law would prohibit postering on structures located on City property, including traffic control devices, trees, signal control boxes, street furniture, bus shelters, bicycle racks, fire hydrants, post boxes, newspaper boxes, any decorative street light pole or art; no poster of any type may be placed on or within any traffic island or median.

6. *Postering should not be permitted at intersections, more specifically, within 50 feet of the corner.*

Comment: The proposed by-law already places significant restrictions on the placement of any sign. No posters of any kind are placed on decorative poles or pedestrian lighting poles that are either private or public. Posters must face towards the property fronting on the boulevard and away from the traveled portion of the highway.

This further restriction would be unduly restrictive, especially due to the fact that these poster locations are ideal in that they offer pedestrians an opportunity to read the information while waiting to cross a street.

7. *The use of glue must be banned, staples should not be allowed, or “in addition to staples and tape...include water-soluble paste”.*

Comment: The by-law, as proposed, clearly states the methods by which a poster may be affixed to a kiosk or utility pole. The poster is to be affixed flush to the surface of the kiosk, or pole using staples or removable tape. Discussions with staff from the Solid Waste Division indicate that these are the only methods that should be supported. The use of glues makes the removal of posters difficult.

It was also noted that it may be useful to clearly state that glue may not be used. The by-law could be amended to include a statement in § 693-30. A. (2) and § 693-31. B. (2) that no other method of affixing the poster to a kiosk or utility pole is permitted.

8. *Include legal size posters (8.5 x 14 inches or 22 x 36 centimetres) in poster criteria.*

Comment: An increase in the size of a permitted poster would have the effect of reducing the opportunities of individuals and groups to place posters.

9. *The Planning and Transportation Committee recommended to City Council that Section 693-31. Community Posters on Utility Poles, be amended by adding the following:*

B. (8) The community poster include the name of the owner(s) of the poster.

Comment: If Council is supportive of this amendment, then similarly, § 693-30. Posters on Kiosks, should be amended by adding the following:

B. (8) The poster include the name of the owner(s) of the poster.

The inclusion of the further requirement in both sections would ensure consistency for persons erecting, attaching, placing or displaying, or causing or permitting the erection, attachment, placement or displaying of a poster.

Enforcement

The enforcement of any by-law regulating posters will continue as a joint programme shared by the Municipal Licensing and Standards and Solid Waste Divisions. Municipal Licensing and Standards officers enforce the by-law and initiate the appropriate legal proceedings, while Solid Waste officers are responsible for the removal of posters and other illegal signage placed on poles and kiosks.

Enforcement consists of:

- (a) On a complaint basis, investigating and where necessary removing illegally placed signs and posters;*
- (b) Sending letters to posterers who habitually contravene the by-law, informing them of the regulations;*
- (c) Initiating prosecutions, where appropriate; and*
- (d) Removing signs and posters on a patrol basis.*

Solid Waste staff indicates that in 2005, over 300,000 posters and approximately 80,000 illegal signs were removed from hydro poles.

Conclusions:

Upon review of the comments, a number of minor amendments to the draft by-law are being recommended, including the introduction of a definition of “school”; the clarification of the restriction of postering on privately-owned poles to include those poles located on sidewalks; the introduction of a restriction to clarify that no other method of affixing the poster to a kiosk or utility pole is permitted except staples, or removable tape; and the inclusion of a requirement that every poster include the name of the owner(s) of the poster.

The enforcement of any by-law regulating posters will continue as a joint programme shared by the Municipal Licensing and Standards and Solid Waste Divisions. Municipal Licensing and Standards officers enforce the by-law and initiate the appropriate legal proceedings, while Solid Waste officers are responsible for the removal of posters and other illegal signage placed on poles and kiosks.

This report was prepared in consultation with the City Solicitor.

Contact:

*Frank Weinstock, Manager
Policy and Business Planning Unit
Municipal Licensing and Standards
Tel : (416) 392-0404
Fax : (416) 397-5463
Email : fweinst@toronto.ca*

List of Attachments:

Appendix 1: Draft Postering By-law

Appendix 1

*Authority: Planning and Transportation Committee Report No. 2, Clause No. 10, as adopted
by City of Toronto Council on*

Enacted by Council:

CITY OF TORONTO

Bill No.

BY-LAW No.

To add Article IV, Posters on Public Property, to Municipal Code, Chapter 693, Signs

WHEREAS Council may pass by-laws to regulate signs and other advertising devices under paragraph seven of subsection 11(1) of the Municipal Act, 2001, as amended; and

WHEREAS section 99 of the Municipal Act, 2001 establishes rules that apply to a by-law of a municipality respecting advertising devices, including signs, and permits the removal of signs erected or displayed in contravention of the by-law; and

WHEREAS Council may pass by-laws imposing fees or charges on any class of persons for services or activities provided or done by or on behalf of the City under clause 391(1)(a) of the Municipal Act, 2001; and

WHEREAS Council may pass by-laws respecting highways under paragraph one of subsection 11(1) of the Municipal Act, 2001; and

WHEREAS under section 425 of the Municipal Act, 2001, by-laws may be passed by municipality for providing that any person who contravenes any by-law of the municipality passed under the authority of the Municipal Act, 2001 is guilty of an offence; and

WHEREAS under section 427 of the Municipal Act, 2001, if a municipality has authority by by-law or otherwise to direct or require that a matter or thing be done, the municipality may, in the same or another by-law direct that, in default of it being done by the person directed or required to do it, the matter or thing shall be done at the person's expense, and the municipality may recover the costs of doing it by action, or the costs may be added to the tax roll and collected in the same manner as taxes;

The Council of the City of Toronto HEREBY ENACTS as follows:

1. *Chapter 693, Signs, of The City of Toronto Municipal Code, is amended by adding the following:*

*ARTICLE IV
Posters on Public Property*

§ 693-28. Definitions and interpretation.

- A. *As used in this article, the following terms shall have the meanings indicated:*

BOULEVARD – The untravelled portion of a highway, but does not include a sidewalk or a median.

COMMUNITY POSTER – A poster promoting citizen participation in religious, civic, charitable or non-profit activities and events, or advertising festivals, community events, political ideas, or missing persons, pets or items.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR – The Executive Director of Municipal Licensing and Standards or his or her designate, or successor official.

HIGHWAY – A highway, as defined in section 1 of the Municipal Act, 2001 or successor legislation, that is under the jurisdiction of the City.

KIOSK – A structure, approved by the General Manager of the Transportation Services Division, or his or her designate or successor official, placed on a highway within the City for the purpose of posting posters and includes a poster board, a designated wall or other designated structure;

OWNER – Includes a person in the business of manufacturing and displaying posters, a person who installed a poster, a person who is in lawful control of a poster or otherwise directly benefits from the message of a poster.

POSTER – A notice of any kind, including but not limited to an advertisement, bill, handbill, leaflet, flyer or placard, which is attached with its entire back surface in contact with a utility pole or kiosk and is secured by removable tape, or staples and includes a community poster.

SCHOOL — A school or a private school as defined under the Ontario Education Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. E.2, or successor legislation;

SIGN – Any device, structure or medium that uses any colour, form, graphic, illumination, symbol or writing to convey information of any kind to the public, and includes a poster.

STREET-LIGHTING POLE – A pole owned by Toronto Hydro Street Lighting Inc.

UTILITY POLE – Includes a utility pole, light standard, a pole owned or controlled by the Toronto Transit Commission, and a street-lighting pole but does not include a privately-owned pole.

- B. *For the purposes of this article, there may be more than one owner of a poster.*
- C. *This article does not apply to election signs as defined in § 693-5.*
- D. *Where the provisions of this article are in conflict with any other by-law applicable to posters, this article shall prevail to the extent of the conflict.*

§ 693-29. General restrictions.

- A. *Except as authorized by by-law or by agreement with the City, no person shall erect, attach, place or display, or cause or permit to be erected, attached, placed or displayed, any sign on, over or to any utility pole, structure or thing within a highway or located on land owned by the City or any of its agencies, boards or commissions.*
- B. *No person shall erect, attach, place or display, or cause or permit to be erected, attached, placed or displayed, any sign on any fencing of a construction site or demolition site as required pursuant to Chapter 363, Building Construction and Demolition, Article III, Fencing of Construction and Demolition Sites.*
- C. *No person shall erect, attach, place or display, or cause or permit to be erected, attached, placed or displayed, any sign on any privately-owned poles located on boulevards or sidewalks.*

§ 693-30. Posters on kiosks.

- A. *Despite § 693-29. A, a poster may be placed on a kiosk if:*
 - (1) *The poster is no more than 22 centimetres by 28 centimetres in size and consists of lightweight cardboard or paper only;*

- (2) *The poster is securely attached flush to the surface of the kiosk using staples or removable tape and no other method of affixing the poster to the kiosk is used;*
- (3) *The poster is placed no higher than two metres above the ground;*
- (4) *The poster is dated, showing the date of posting;*
- (5) *The poster is displayed for not more than the earlier of:*
 - (a) *30 days or*
 - (b) *Five days after the end of the advertised event, if any;*
- (6) *Not more than one poster conveying essentially identical information is posted on the kiosk;*
- (7) *The poster faces towards the property fronting on the highway and away from the portion of the highway ordinarily used by vehicles; and*
- (8) *The poster includes the name of the owner(s) of the poster.*

§ 693-31. Community posters on utility poles.

- A. *Despite § 693-29. A, persons, charities, religious organizations, community organizations and schools may erect, attach, place or display, or cause or permit to be erected, attached, placed or displayed community posters on utility poles as permitted under Subsection B.*
- B. *A community poster may be placed on a utility pole located on a boulevard if:*
 - (1) *The community poster is no larger than 22 centimetres by 28 centimetres and consists of lightweight cardboard or paper only;*
 - (2) *The community poster is securely attached flush to the surface of the utility pole using staples or removable tape and no other method of affixing the community poster to the utility pole is used;*
 - (3) *The community poster is placed no higher than two metres above the ground;*
 - (4) *The community poster is dated, showing the date of posting;*
 - (5) *The community poster is displayed for not more than the earlier of:*
 - (a) *30 days or*
 - (b) *Five days after the end of the advertised event, if any;*
 - (6) *Not more than one community poster conveying essentially identical information is posted on the utility pole;*

- (7) *The community poster faces towards the property fronting on the boulevard and away from the portion of the highway ordinarily used by vehicles; and*
- (8) *The community poster include the name of the owner(s) of the poster.*

§ 693-32. Additional restrictions.

A. In addition to the restrictions in § 693-30 and 693-31, a poster shall not:

- (1) *Be placed on or within any traffic island or median.*
- (2) *Be a hazard or dangerous to vehicular or pedestrian traffic, as determined by the General Manger of the Transportation Services Division or his or her designate, or successor official.*
- (3) *Cause any damage to municipal property.*
- (4) *Become unsightly.*
- (5) *Cover or overlap another poster or community poster, in whole or in part.*

§ 693-33. Compliance.

Despite any other sign by-law or article in this chapter, a poster that complies with this article may be erected or displayed without a permit.

§ 693-34. Removal of signs.

- A. The Executive Director or the owner of a utility pole may, at any time and without notice, remove any sign from a utility pole in the course of periodic cleaning or maintenance operations.*
- B. The Executive Director may, at any time and without notice, remove any sign that is displayed in contravention of this article.*
- C. Any sign removed under this section may be destroyed or otherwise disposed of by the Executive Director or the owner of the utility pole without notice or compensation to any person who has an interest in the sign.*
- D. Where a sign has been removed under Subsection B, the owner or any person responsible for erecting, attaching, placing or displaying, or causing or permitting the erecting, attaching, placing or displaying of the sign in contravention of this article shall, in addition to any fine or other penalty that may be imposed for an offence under this article, be required to pay to the City the greater of a per sign removal fee set out in § 441-9 of Chapter 441, Fees or the actual cost of removal and disposal of the sign, and the City may recover this amount by legal action or in like manner as municipal taxes.*

§ 693-35. *Offence.*

Any person who contravenes any provision of this article is guilty of an offence.

2. *Section 441-9 of Chapter 441, Fees, of The City of Toronto Municipal Code is amended by adding the following:*

F. Removal of signs.

The sign removal fee payable to the City under § 693-34D is \$60.00 per sign.

3. *The following is repealed:*

A. *Section 9 of By-law No. 64-87, “For Prohibiting and Regulating the Erection of Signs and Other Advertising Devices”, as amended, of the former Borough of East York.*

B. *Sections 215-27, and 215-28 of Chapter 215, Signs, of the former City of Etobicoke Municipal Code, as amended.*

C. *Section 2.10 of By-law No. 30788, “A By-law to prohibit or regulate signs and other advertising devices”, as amended, of the former City of North York.*

D. *The following from Chapter 313, Streets and Sidewalks, of the former City of Toronto Municipal Code:*

(1) *Article XB; and*

(2) *the following from Schedule A, at the end of Chapter 313:*

<i>(from column 1)</i>	<i>(from column 2)</i>	<i>(from column 3)</i>
------------------------	------------------------	------------------------

<i>“§ 313-73.4C</i>	<i>Removal of poster</i>	<i>\$60.00* (per poster)”</i>
---------------------	--------------------------	-----------------------------------

E. *The following from By-law 22980, “A By-law to prohibit and regulate signs in the City of Scarborough.”, as amended, (Scarborough Sign Code) of the former City of Scarborough:*

(1) *Section 4(2)(j); and*

(2) *Paragraph 2.2.3 of Schedule “A”;*

F. *Section 1 of By-law 11928, as amended, of the former City of York.*

G. *By-law No. 115-97 of the former Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto, “A by-law to regulate the installation and maintenance of posters on Metropolitan Roads.”*

4. *The following is amended:*
- A. *The following from By-law 22980, “A By-law to prohibit and regulate signs in the City of Scarborough.”, as amended, (Scarborough Sign Code) of the former City of Scarborough is deleted:*
- (1) *The words “poster panel,” in sections 2.4.2(2)(a), 2.4.2.(3)(e) and (f), 2.4.2(4)(a) of Schedule “A”; and*
 - (2) *The words “poster panels,” in section 2.4.2(5)(a)(i) of Schedule “A”.*
- B. *The words “poster panels” and “poster panel” in Article 13 of Chapter 835 of the former City of York’s Municipal Code is deleted.*
5. *This by-law comes into force on the date it is enacted.*

ENACTED AND PASSED this day of , A.D. 2006.

Mayor

City Clerk

Communication:

- *(March 1, 2006) from Josh Paterson, Acting Director, Freedom of Expression Project, Canadian Civil Liberties Association [Communication 3(a)].*

City Council – May 23, 24 and 25, 2006

Council also considered the following:

Communications:

- *(March 1, 2006) from Josh Paterson, Acting Director, Freedom of Expression Project, Canadian Civil Liberties Association [Communication 1(a)];*
- *(May 19, 2006) from Ken Chasse [Communication 1(b)(1)];*
- *(May 19, 2006) from Kevin Golding [Communication 1(b)(2)];*
- *(May 19, 2006) from Leah Stokes [Communication 1(b)(3)];*
- *(May 19, 2006) from Deanne Taylor [Communication 1(b)(4)];*
- *(May 19, 2006) from David McCallum, Associate Editor, Musicworks Magazine [Communication 1(b)(5)];*
- *(May 19, 2006) from Patrick Cameron [Communication not numbered];*
- *(May 19, 2006) from Shawn Syms [Communication 1(b)(6)];*
- *(May 19, 2006) from Daniel Quinn [Communication 1(b)(7)];*
- *(May 19, 2006) from Steve McKay [Communication 1(b)(8)];*
- *(May 19, 2006) from Meagan Bennell [Communication 1(b)(9)];*

- (May 19, 2006) from Melissa Brizuela [Communication 1(b)(10)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Philbert Kim [Communication 1(b)(11)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Kate Hoffmann [Communication 1(b)(12)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Corinne Alstrom [Communication 1(b)(13)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Caroline Chan [Communication 1(b)(14)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Chiara Purdy [Communication 1(b)(15)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Janis Demkiw [Communication 1(b)(16)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Mark Daye [Communication 1(b)(17)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Stephanie Forder [Communication 1(b)(18)];
- (May 20, 2006) from Kate Chung [Communication 1(b)(19)];
- (May 21, 2006) from Kawai Lam [Communication 1(b)(20)];
- (May 21, 2006) from Grace Willan [Communication 1(b)(21)];
- (May 21, 2006) from Pete Carmichael [Communication 1(b)(22)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Yvonne Parti [Communication 1(b)(23)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Penelope Tyndale [Communication 1(b)(24)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Avi Lewis [Communication 1(b)(25)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Ben Marans [Communication 1(b)(26)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Murray D. Lumley [Communication 1(b)(27)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Alice Barton [Communication 1(b)(28)];
- (May 21, 2006) from Motek W. Sherman [Communication 1(b)(29)];
- (May 23, 2006) from Erin Siegel [Communication 1(b)(30)];
- (May 23, 2006) from Liam O'Doherty [Communication 1(b)(31)];
- (May 23, 2006) from Allison Jack [Communication 1(b)(32)];
- (May 23, 2006) from Anna Przychodzki [Communication 1(b)(33)];
- (May 23, 2006) from Andrew Woodrow [Communication 1(b)(34)];
- (May 24, 2006) from Carrie Brown [Communication 1(b)(35)]; and
- (May 24, 2006) from Daibhid James [Communication 1(b)(36)].

City Council – June 14, 2006

Council also considered the following:

Communications:

- (March 1, 2006) from Josh Paterson, Acting Director, Freedom of Expression Project, Canadian Civil Liberties Association [Communication 1(a)(1)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Ken Chasse [Communication 1(a)(2)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Kevin Golding [Communication 1(a)(3)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Leah Stokes [Communication 1(a)(4)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Deanne Taylor [Communication 1(a)(5)];
- (May 19, 2006) from David McCallum, Associate Editor, Musicworks Magazine [Communication 1(a)(6)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Patrick Cameron [Communication 1(a)(7)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Shawn Syms [Communication 1(a)(8)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Daniel Quinn [Communication 1(a)(9)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Steve McKay [Communication 1(a)(10)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Meagan Bennell [Communication 1(a)(11)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Melissa Brizuela [Communication 1(a)(12)];

- (May 19, 2006) from Philbert Kim [Communication 1(a)(13)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Kate Hoffmann [Communication 1(a)(14)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Corinne Alstrom [Communication 1(a)(15)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Caroline Chan [Communication 1(a)(16)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Chiara Purdy [Communication 1(a)(17)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Janis Demkiw [Communication 1(a)(18)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Mark Daye [Communication 1(a)(19)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Stephanie Forder [Communication 1(a)(20)];
- (May 20, 2006) from Kate Chung [Communication 1(a)(21)];
- (May 21, 2006) from Kawai Lam [Communication 1(a)(22)];
- (May 21, 2006) from Grace Willan [Communication 1(a)(23)];
- (May 21, 2006) from Pete Carmichael [Communication 1(a)(24)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Yvonne Parti [Communication 1(a)(25)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Penelope Tyndale [Communication 1(a)(26)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Avi Lewis [Communication 1(a)(27)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Ben Marans [Communication 1(a)(28)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Murray D. Lumley [Communication 1(a)(29)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Alice Barton [Communication 1(a)(30)];
- (May 21, 2006) from Motek W. Sherman [Communication 1(a)(31)];
- (May 23, 2006) from Erin Siegel [Communication 1(a)(32)];
- (May 23, 2006) from Liam O'Doherty [Communication 1(a)(33)];
- (May 23, 2006) from Allison Jack [Communication 1(a)(34)];
- (May 23, 2006) from Anna Przychodzki [Communication 1(a)(35)];
- (May 23, 2006) from Andrew Woodrow [Communication 1(a)(36)];
- (May 24, 2006) from Carrie Brown [Communication 1(a)(37)];
- (May 24, 2006) from Daibhid James [Communication 1(a)(38)]; and
- (June 13, 2006) from Alison Gorbould, Toronto Public Space Committee [Communication 1(a)(39)].

City Council – June 27, 28 and 29, 2006

Council also considered the following:

Communications:

- (March 1, 2006) from Josh Paterson, Acting Director, Freedom of Expression Project, Canadian Civil Liberties Association [Communication 1(a)(1)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Ken Chasse [Communication 1(a)(2)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Kevin Golding [Communication 1(a)(3)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Leah Stokes [Communication 1(a)(4)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Deanne Taylor [Communication 1(a)(5)];
- (May 19, 2006) from David McCallum, Associate Editor, Musicworks Magazine [Communication 1(a)(6)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Patrick Cameron [Communication 1(a)(7)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Shawn Syms [Communication 1(a)(8)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Daniel Quinn [Communication 1(a)(9)];

- (May 19, 2006) from Steve McKay [Communication 1(a)(10)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Meagan Bennell [Communication 1(a)(11)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Melissa Brizuela [Communication 1(a)(12)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Philbert Kim [Communication 1(a)(13)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Kate Hoffmann [Communication 1(a)(14)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Corinne Alstrom [Communication 1(a)(15)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Caroline Chan [Communication 1(a)(16)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Chiara Purdy [Communication 1(a)(17)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Janis Demkiw [Communication 1(a)(18)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Mark Daye [Communication 1(a)(19)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Stephanie Forder [Communication 1(a)(20)];
- (May 20, 2006) from Kate Chung [Communication 1(a)(21)];
- (May 21, 2006) from Kawai Lam [Communication 1(a)(22)];
- (May 21, 2006) from Grace Willan [Communication 1(a)(23)];
- (May 21, 2006) from Pete Carmichael [Communication 1(a)(24)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Yvonne Parti [Communication 1(a)(25)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Penelope Tyndale [Communication 1(a)(26)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Avi Lewis [Communication 1(a)(27)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Ben Marans [Communication 1(a)(28)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Murray D. Lumley [Communication 1(a)(29)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Alice Barton [Communication 1(a)(30)];
- (May 21, 2006) from Motek W. Sherman [Communication 1(a)(31)];
- (May 23, 2006) from Erin Siegel [Communication 1(a)(32)];
- (May 23, 2006) from Liam O'Doherty [Communication 1(a)(33)];
- (May 23, 2006) from Allison Jack [Communication 1(a)(34)];
- (May 23, 2006) from Anna Przychodzki [Communication 1(a)(35)];
- (May 23, 2006) from Andrew Woodrow [Communication 1(a)(36)];
- (May 24, 2006) from Carrie Brown [Communication 1(a)(37)];
- (May 24, 2006) from Daibhid James [Communication 1(a)(38)]; and
- (June 13, 2006) from Alison Gorbould, Toronto Public Space Committee [Communication 1(a)(39)].

City Council – July 25, 26 and 27, 2006

Council also considered the following:

Communications:

- (March 1, 2006) from Josh Paterson, Acting Director, Freedom of Expression Project, Canadian Civil Liberties Association [Communication 1(a)(1)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Ken Chasse [Communication 1(a)(2)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Kevin Golding [Communication 1(a)(3)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Leah Stokes [Communication 1(a)(4)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Deanne Taylor [Communication 1(a)(5)];
- (May 19, 2006) from David McCallum, Associate Editor, Musicworks Magazine [Communication 1(a)(6)];

- (May 19, 2006) from Patrick Cameron [Communication 1(a)(7)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Shawn Syms [Communication 1(a)(8)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Daniel Quinn [Communication 1(a)(9)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Steve McKay [Communication 1(a)(10)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Meagan Bennell [Communication 1(a)(11)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Melissa Brizuela [Communication 1(a)(12)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Philbert Kim [Communication 1(a)(13)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Kate Hoffmann [Communication 1(a)(14)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Corinne Alstrom [Communication 1(a)(15)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Caroline Chan [Communication 1(a)(16)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Chiara Purdy [Communication 1(a)(17)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Janis Demkiw [Communication 1(a)(18)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Mark Daye [Communication 1(a)(19)];
- (May 19, 2006) from Stephanie Forder [Communication 1(a)(20)];
- (May 20, 2006) from Kate Chung [Communication 1(a)(21)];
- (May 21, 2006) from Kawai Lam [Communication 1(a)(22)];
- (May 21, 2006) from Grace Willan [Communication 1(a)(23)];
- (May 21, 2006) from Pete Carmichael [Communication 1(a)(24)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Yvonne Parti [Communication 1(a)(25)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Penelope Tyndale [Communication 1(a)(26)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Avi Lewis [Communication 1(a)(27)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Ben Marans [Communication 1(a)(28)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Murray D. Lumley [Communication 1(a)(29)];
- (May 22, 2006) from Alice Barton [Communication 1(a)(30)];
- (May 21, 2006) from Motek W. Sherman [Communication 1(a)(31)];
- (May 23, 2006) from Erin Siegel [Communication 1(a)(32)];
- (May 23, 2006) from Liam O'Doherty [Communication 1(a)(33)];
- (May 23, 2006) from Allison Jack [Communication 1(a)(34)];
- (May 23, 2006) from Anna Przychodzki [Communication 1(a)(35)];
- (May 23, 2006) from Andrew Woodrow [Communication 1(a)(36)];
- (May 24, 2006) from Carrie Brown [Communication 1(a)(37)];
- (May 24, 2006) from Daibhid James [Communication 1(a)(38)]; and
- (June 13, 2006) from Alison Gorbould, Toronto Public Space Committee [Communication 1(a)(39)].