



Auditor General's Office

Presentation to the Audit Committee
November 4, 2008

Audit of City Performance in Achieving Access, Equity and Human Rights Goals

Jeff Griffiths, Auditor General, C.A., C.F.E.

Alan Ash, Director, C.I.A., C.F.E.

Jane Ying, Audit Manager, C.I.A., CGAP, MHSc

Akrivi Nicolaou, Audit Manager, C.Tech., MAATO

Presentation Outline

- Background
- Methodology
- Results
- Conclusion
- Next Steps



Auditor General's Office

Audit Objective

Determine the extent to which the City has achieved its access, equity and human rights goals.

Background

- Second Audit of Access, Equity and Human Rights
- 2004 Council directive for the Auditor General to conduct an access and equity audit once in each term of Council

Initiatives and Accomplishments

- 2007 Diversity in Governance Award for achieving representation of diverse communities in public appointments;
- Mentoring programs for internationally-trained professionals and City employees;
- Initiative to increase women's presence in local politics through a mentorship program;

Initiatives and Accomplishments

- Multi-lingual services;
- Divisional action plans on access, equity and human rights;
- Canadian Coalition of Municipalities against Racism and Discrimination; and
- Trans Access Project to address systemic barriers for homeless transsexual/transgendered people seeking shelter and support.

Methodology

- Review of relevant policies and procedures, legislative requirements, current literature, industry and other city practices;
- Interviews with staff, elected officials, and community and business representatives;
- Benchmarking with organizations in the private and public sectors.

Benchmarking

Organizations awarded Canada's 2008 Best Diversity Employer Award

- HSBC Bank
- IBM
- Ontario Public Service
- Toronto Police Service
- TD Bank Financial Group
- University of Toronto

29 Recommendations in Six Areas

- Human rights
- Civic engagement
- Corporate planning and implementation
- Divisional planning and implementation
- Access, equity and human rights planning among City ABCCs
- Monitoring and measuring progress

Human Rights

“Respect for human rights, human dignity, and equality, is a core value in Canadian society...”

Human rights legislation has been accorded quasi-constitutional status by courts.

Why is human rights important for the City?

- Legal obligations as an employer and service provider
- Over 500 complaints/enquiries are received each year
- Complaints filed at the Human Rights Tribunal of Ontario are costly to City
- Recent changes to the Ontario Human Rights Code
- Good business sense

How does the City promote human rights?

- City Human Rights Office
- Human Rights and Anti-Harassment Policy and Procedures
- Staff training

Key Human Rights Audit Recommendations

- Level of independence and authority of the Human Rights Office

Should the City not treat human rights and harassment complaints at least as equally important as complaints of another nature?

Key Human Rights Audit Recommendations

- Jurisdiction over human rights complaints
- Oversight for human rights decision-making
- Resources for the Human Rights Office
- Public accessibility to the complaint process

Civic Engagement

What is it?

Providing opportunity for public input into government decision-making.

Why is it important?

Cannot build an inclusive and citizen-centered city without seeking citizen involvement.

How does the City promote civic engagement?

For example:

- City-wide consultation events
- Public appointments
- Local consultation meetings
- Opportunities for public deputation

Key Civic Engagement Audit Recommendations

- Corporate civic engagement strategy
- Formal civic engagement mechanisms
- Input from employee groups

Corporate Planned Actions

- Workforce survey and Corporate Employment Equity Plan
- Corporate employment accommodation fund
- Staff training
- Toronto Urban Aboriginal Strategy

What we can learn from other organizations

- Successfully administer periodic workforce surveys
- Corporate fund for employee accommodation needs
- Mandatory Diversity Training

Access, Equity and Human Rights at City ABCCs

- **Almost all of the major ABCCs have developed internal policies**
- **None have developed a comprehensive and formalized action plan as required by City Council**
- **Difficult to track individual efforts over time**

Audit recommendation for ongoing monitoring and measuring progress

Management accountability through the annual performance evaluation process

Conclusion

The City has made progress through a number of significant initiatives.

Further efforts are necessary to achieve access, equity and human rights goals including the need to enhance the human rights complaint management process, complete the corporate civic engagement strategy, implement a periodic workforce survey process, and increase the level of diversity and human rights training.

Next Steps

- AG Report
- Management Response
- Audit Committee
- City Council
- Audit Follow-up