



STAFF REPORT ACTION REQUIRED

City-Wide Security Plan

Date:	February 4, 2008
To:	Budget Committee
From:	City Manager
Wards:	All
Reference Number:	P:\2008\Internal Services\F&re\bc08018F&re- (AFS 5560)

SUMMARY

As part of the 2007 Operating Budget, the City Manager was asked to report on a City-Wide Security Plan prior to the 2008 Operating Budget process. What is being proposed is a synopsis of the City's overall approach to security matters in the context of sharing resources, ensuring that baseline standards are set, and identifying the gaps between the current state and the established standards.

While some City divisions and Agencies, Boards, and Commissions have internal security plans which guide their present and future needs for operating and capital security, there exists no overall security plan that encompasses all the plans under one umbrella.

This report provides a synopsis of the Corporate Security framework and the details of the required improvements and enhancements to produce the City-Wide Security Plan. A further report will be tabled in the fall of 2008 on the completed City-Wide Security Plan.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Manager recommends that:

1. Further improvements and enhancements be made to the current Corporate Security framework with the objective of enhancing corporate standards and further centralizing those security functions which have City-wide implications.
2. The Corporate Security Unit will undertake further consultations with the affected divisions and review existing divisional security plans and create plans for divisions currently without plans and report back in the fall of 2008.
3. Applicable Agencies, Boards, and Commissions be requested to review and apply the security framework and report to their respective Boards regarding their own security plans by the fall of 2008.
4. The appropriate City officials be authorized and directed to take the necessary action to give effect thereto.

Financial Impact

1. There are no new financial requirements emanating from this report.
2. The total amounts currently spent on security for Category 1 and 2 divisions (See Attachment 1) is approximately \$11 million. The amount spent on security for Category 3 divisions (See Attachment 1) is undetermined at this time, as this cost is integrated into general maintenance funds.
3. The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

DECISION HISTORY

The Toronto City Council Decision Document for the Special Council Meeting of April 20 and 23, 2007 references a “City-wide security review” in 3 clauses:

- Under “Citizen Centred Services “A”, Parks, Forestry and Recreation”, Clause #12, “funding for future phases of the Divisional Safety and Security Plan be considered in the context of the **City-wide security review**;”
- Under “Toronto Transit Commission – Conventional”, Clause #93, “the City Manager, in consultation with the TTC, Toronto Police Service and the Deputy City Managers, report back to Executive Committee, prior to the 2008 Operating Budget process, on a **City-wide security policy**, which addresses, among other issues, the use of TTC Special constables, such report to include input from the Chief of Police and Local Commanders from the at-risk communities; and”
- Under “Toronto Transit Commission – Conventional”, Clause #94, “the Interim Chief General Manager of the Toronto Transit Commission report back to the Budget Committee, prior to the 2008 Operating Budget process, with a revised multi-year security strategy that would be consistent with a **City-wide security plan**.”

Clauses #93 and #94, were contained under the operating budget implications for the Toronto Transit Commission (TTC). On October 4, 2007 the TTC provided to the City Manager a copy of the “Toronto Transit System Security Plan 2007” that was previously approved by the Toronto Transit Commission on March 21, 2007. The memo attached to this plan highlighted that the TTC has unique security issues specific to transit and that other service providers should have plans that address their unique issues. This memo further advised that on July 30, 2007, applicable TTC staff met with senior Toronto Police Service personnel regarding Special Constable personnel and various security issues related to the TTC.

ISSUE BACKGROUND

General Security

The roles, responsibilities, and expectations of security as a whole have greatly evolved over the last number of years. Security was once viewed as a minor program consisting mainly of staffing used to provide directions, access, and patrols to ensure security and to look for building deficiencies. Security is now a dynamic and challenging function. Areas that have evolved to prominence over the last few years include threat and vulnerability assessments, standards, remote monitoring, state of the art physical security, emergency planning, workplace/domestic violence, anti-terrorism planning and crime prevention.

Senior management are legally responsible to ensure employees, patrons, and assets are appropriately protected and to ensure security programs are in place that deter, detect, and respond. Having City facilities with various degrees of (non-standard) physical and operational security, poses a higher risk of occurrence and litigation. Facilities of similar type must have a similar standard of security regardless of division or location within the City and also need to be benchmarked against other similar businesses.

At the City of Toronto, the role, responsibilities, and importance of security varies per division. For example, at a Transportation Yard most security measures are focused on after-hours protection of assets, whereas for a Recreation Centre a greater focus is on ensuring the safety of patrons (the public) and Parks, Forestry & Recreation staff to ensure programs run effectively and the public feels safe attending the facility.

Corporate Security

The Security & Life Safety Unit of Facilities and Real Estate (Corporate Security) is the key security service provider to City divisions. Some services are City-Wide mandated services, while others are provided on a chargeback basis to the applicable Division.

Mandated security services include:

- The management of all video surveillance systems – “City of Toronto Security Video Surveillance Policy”.
- The investigation of workplace violence incidents - “Workplace Violence Policy”
- City’s Access and Identification (ID) cards
- City’s security lead - labour disruption planning

Many security services are coordinated between divisions by Corporate Security to take advantage of the standardization, cost-effectiveness, expertise, and existing infrastructure.

Some specific examples of consolidated security services include:

- A Corporate Security Control Centre where most security alarms are received regardless of division. This includes over 300 sites monitored, 1370 card readers, 1000’s of alarm points, remote video surveillance, etc.
- Mobile Patrols that are spread out into districts of the City to proactively patrol and respond to divisions’ facilities regardless of division. These mobile staff are charged back to various divisions on a proportional basis.
- Capital security project management staff that perform threat assessments, system design, and implement security capital improvements regardless of division. Thus ensuring physical security standards are met and classifications of facilities have the same physical security.

Corporate Security provides security services to the various divisions for many reasons. The sharing of resources, knowledge, and expertise allows for security to be provided in a standardized and cost-effective manner.

City Divisions and Corporate Security Involvement

For the purpose of the City-wide Security Plan, City divisions are divided into three categories:

- 1) those in corporate space where Corporate Security has a direct responsibility to provide services;
- 2) those where the division has landlord responsibilities and Corporate Security provides all security services, with some on a chargeback basis; and,
- 3) those where the division has landlord responsibilities and Corporate Security provides mandated security services, but not all physical and operational security services at all locations.

Attachment #1 lists all City divisions according to these categories.

Major divisions in Corporate space include:

- Human Resources
- Legal Services
- Purchasing & Materials Management
- Corporate Finance
- Toronto Building
- Information & Technology
- City Planning
- Strategic Communications
- Municipal Licensing & Standards

Divisions that have landlord responsibilities and Corporate Security provides all security services, mostly through Service Level Agreements and chargebacks, include:

- Parks, Forestry & Recreation
- Toronto Water
- Social Services
- Transportation
- Solid Waste Management
- Public Health
- Court Services
- Children's Services
- Fleet Services
- Clerks

Divisions that have landlord responsibilities and Corporate Security provides mandated security services, but not all physical and operational security services at all locations, includes:

- Homes for the Aged
- Museum and Heritage Services (of EDCT division)
- Shelter, Support and Housing Administration
- Emergency Medical Services
- Toronto Fire Services

Defined Corporate Security involvement at these sites is attributed to the fact that these sites are staffed 24/7 and have specific security measures tailored to the needs of the specific program.

Agencies, Boards, and Commissions

Agencies, Boards, and Commissions (ABC's) all have different operational, physical, and legislative requirements and, except for the TTC and Toronto Public Library, very defined property limits. As such, each ABC with a security program normally provides their own security services and management. Some ABC's with in-house Security staff and management include the Toronto Transit Commission, the Toronto Zoo, Exhibition Place, and the Toronto Public Library. While there exists informal dialogue and information sharing between Corporate Security and the security representatives of the ABC's, there are opportunities for the formal enhancement of the relationship.

COMMENTS

This report reviews the current Corporate Security framework, and recommends improvements and enhancements to produce the City-Wide Security Plan.

Framework for Security Plans

A similar framework used to create divisional plans is anticipated to be used in the creation of the City-Wide Security Plan. This framework involves:

a) Data Gathering

Required data gathering and analysis is completed by:

- Identification / prioritization of the various threats / risks posed and the evaluation of the current measures in place to counteract these threats (a threat assessment). A security threat assessment of the facility should follow a recognized documented risk assessment methodology such as the “General Security Risk Assessment Guideline” from ASIS International (American Society of Industrial Security).
- Completing a Security Building Condition Assessment. This Security BCA is similar to a regular state of good repair building condition assessment; however, its sole focus is on security, an area not covered by on-going state of good repair BCA. A key factor in the Security BCA is determining the security counter-measures that should be used. The “Corporate Security Assessment Methodology for Building Classification” provides this roadmap and can be used to help document the physical and operating security measures currently in place at the facility, provide the baseline standard for the facility type, and thereby highlight the areas below the standard.

b) Standards Development

Required standards development is completed by:

- Devising applicable security standards, practices, policies, counter-measures, and capital plans to enable the division to mitigate the risks which those threats present.

c) Implementation and Maintenance

Required implementation and maintenance includes:

- Implementation of the standards, policies, practices, and capital plans through installation of new equipment, re-positioning of current equipment, staff training, etc.
- Maintenance of the safety and security program through equipment maintenance and testing, mobile security patrols, security equipment monitoring, alarm response, etc.

An example of this framework being used for the creation of a divisional security plan is the Parks, Forestry and Recreation Division's Comprehensive Safety and Security plan, approved by City Council in 2006. This security plan utilized the framework to provide a snapshot of their current levels of security, the baseline standard they should achieve, and highlighted future, multi-year operating and capital funding requirements in order to meet the predetermined standards.

Applicable Agencies, Boards, and Commissions (ABC's) will use the framework to determine a baseline standard of security for their employees, visitors, and assets; establish where their ABC is currently positioned according to pre-defined baseline standards; and, ascertain what resources are required to meet and maintain the standards. Applicable Agencies, Boards, and Commissions are to report to their respective boards regarding their own security plans by the fall of 2008.

Required Enhancements of the Corporate Security Framework to Complete the City-Wide Security Plan

Building upon the level of security achieved by Corporate Security, the City-Wide Security Plan involves data gathering, updating of divisional security plans, creation of new divisional security plans, and the combination of these plans to be centrally managed by the Corporate Security Unit.

Required data gathering includes:

- Working with key contacts for Category 3 divisions (See Attachment 1) to obtain further background on their operating and physical security including budgeted funds, statistics of incidents, obvious deficiencies, roadblocks to further enhancements, and special requirements of certain classifications of facilities or areas in their division.
- Obtaining relevant City-wide statistics through City insurance loss reports, H&S reports, Security incident reports, and Police incident statistics to be help determine the level of threats for different areas.
- Meeting and receiving feedback from additional stakeholders including; Health & Safety staff, Risk & Insurance Management, the Toronto Police Service, and the City's Office of Emergency Management.
- Meeting with the key contacts for the Agencies, Boards, and Commissions to review proposed formal interactions that would enhance the City-Wide Security Plan.

Once the divisional plans are consolidated, charting the current conditions of physical and operating security in the various divisions, an analysis occurs to:

- 1) determine an appropriate, consistent baseline standard of security for all employees, visitors, and assets to provide the facilities with adequate and consistent levels of protection;
- 2) Utilize security building classifications to determine which facilities require levels of security higher than the baseline standard based on threats, occurrences, legislation, guidelines, standards, and benchmarking;
- 3) establish where each division is positioned based on a gap analysis between what security measures are required and what security measures exist;
- 4) identify future short and long term resources required to meet the identified gaps and achieve the pre-defined standards; and,
- 5) identify future short and long term resources required to maintain the standards.

The details of this framework form the basis of the coordinated City-wide Security plan which will be reported to Committee in the fall of 2008.

City-Wide Security Plan

As described in recommendation #2, a number of activities must occur following the proposed framework for the creation of the City-Wide Security Plan. Once all division plans are consolidated it is anticipated that the City-Wide Security Plan will contain future recommendations. It is anticipated that some of these recommendations may include:

- 1) The centralization of the security function allowing existing and future security resources to be properly coordinated, shared and responsive towards those areas in demonstrated need according to threats, thus augmenting the overall level of security. These resources include: staffing, hardware and software infrastructure, contracts, knowledge, and expertise. Centralization also allows applicable City sections to focus on the delivery of their core services.
- 2) A consistent standard of reporting security incidents in order for appropriate documentation, investigation and follow-up to occur.
- 3) A multi-year capital and operating plan to maintain and enhance current security levels with prioritization going to those areas in most demonstrated need according to risk.

Future Report

This report provides a synopsis of the Corporate Security framework and the details of the required improvements and enhancements to produce the City-Wide Security Plan. A further report will be tabled in the fall of 2008 on the completed City-Wide Security Plan.

CONTACT

Bruce Bowes
Chief Corporate Officer
(Tel) 416-397-4156
(Fax) 416-392-4007
bbowes@toronto.ca

Mike McCoy
Director, Facilities Operations
(Tel) 416-397-5270
(Fax) 416-392-4828
mmccoy@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Shirley Hoy, City Manager

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 List of City Divisions and Corporate Security Involvement