

Former Canada Malting Complex – Request by Facilities and Real Estate to demolish all structures west of the silo units and rehabilitate the silos

Date:	November 14, 2007
To:	Toronto Preservation Board Toronto and East York Community Council
From:	Director, Policy and Research, City Planning Division
Wards:	Trinity-Spadina – Ward 20
Reference Number:	

SUMMARY

The purpose of this report is to inform the Toronto Preservation Board of a recent structural condition survey and heritage impact assessment prepared by the City's Facilities and Real Estate Division for the former Canada Malting Complex site and to provide recommendations with respect to Asset Preservation's request to demolish all structures west of the silo units.

After consulting with the Economic Development Culture and Tourism (EDCT) Division and Asset Preservation, the Director of Policy and Research is requesting that consideration of a partial demolition on the site be deferred until a report on the feasibility of locating the Toronto Museum Project on this site is presented to City Council next year (tentatively scheduled for April 2008).

RECOMMENDATIONS

City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council defer its decision on a partial demolition of the Canada Malting Complex until the Economic Development, Culture and Tourism Division has

completed a feasibility study on the Toronto Museum Project currently being considered for this site; and

2. Heritage Preservation Services staff respond to Facilities and Real Estate’s recommendation to partially demolish the former Canada Malting Complex prior to their 2009 Capital Budget Submission deadline.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications associated with adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY

May 10, 2007	Facilities and Real Estate distributes a Structural Condition Assessment of the former Canada Malting Company Complex to various city stakeholders, including Heritage Preservation Services and EDCT for comment.
June 1, 2007	Facilities and Real Estate convene a city stakeholder meeting to discuss the Structural Condition Assessment.
June 29, 2007	Acting Director of Design Construction and Asset Preservation (DCAP) sends a recommendation to the Manager of Heritage Preservation Services that the Canada Malting Complex buildings west of the silo unit be demolished as part of a “go forward action plan”.
July 12, 2007	Manager, Heritage Preservation Services requests that DCAP have a heritage impact assessment prepared by a qualified heritage consultant.
October 10, 2007	Historica Research Limited submits a heritage impact assessment.

ISSUE BACKGROUND

The former Canada Malting Company complex at 5 Bathurst Street (now 5 Eireann Quay) is owned by the City of Toronto and has been listed on the City’s inventory of heritage properties since June 20, 1973. Based on a structural condition survey prepared by Trow Associates, the City of Toronto’s Facilities and Real Estate Division has recommended the demolition of all structures west of the silo units and the rehabilitation of the silo units. The Trow report recommended demolition of the entire site.

At the request of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, a heritage impact assessment was undertaken by Historica Research Limited to recommend an overall conservation strategy to guide the City's decisions pertaining to proposed demolition and silo restoration. (The former Canada Malting executive offices still stand but will not be affected by the proposed changes and are not included in this study).

The Heritage Impact Assessment report prepared by Historica Research Limited concludes that there are both adverse affects and beneficial effects of the proposed partial demolition. The report notes that despite numerous reuse and preservation proposals put forward since the plant closed in 1987, none have proven to be viable given the complex's vast scale and the purpose-built interiors designed for industrial processes. In the absence of any plan for adaptive re-use it was stated that if demolition of the buildings west of the silos will lead to conservation of the landmark elevator complex, partial preservation is better than none. The report also recommended that city staff determine if the complex has physical value as well as associative and contextual value.

The EDCT Division is currently forming a cross-divisional adaptive re-use advisory group to consider the feasibility of using the Canada Malting Complex site for a City of Toronto museum. Heritage Preservation Services staff will serve on the advisory group.

Facilities and Real Estate did not include the partial demolition of the Canada Malting Complex in its 2008 Capital Budget, and DCAP has budgeted for continued monitoring and stabilization work for next year.

COMMENTS

Physical Value of the Site and Adaptive Re-Use

Heritage Preservation Services staff believe that it would be premature to approve the demolition of any part of the former Canada Malting Complex prior to a more comprehensive understanding of the site's current adaptive re-use potential. HPS staff have concluded that buildings and machinery throughout the complex have physical value (in addition to contextual and associative value) and could provide interpretive opportunities for a city Museum at this or other locations. Portions of the complex could be salvaged and incorporated into an adaptive re-use project of this type.

Structural Condition Assessment

HPS staff acknowledges that there are serious hazards and degradations associated with the site's current condition and that DCAP's monitoring regime is only a short term solution.

Proposed Demolition and Conservation Strategy

In the event that the EDCT Divisions' assessment of the site can find no viable opportunities for adaptive re-use of buildings west of the silo units, HPS will recommend that the proposed partial demolition be approved conditional upon a conservation and

mitigation strategy to be prepared by a qualified industrial heritage consultant, subject to the approval of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services. The report would include (but not be limited to) as-found site recording, an equipment inventory and salvage strategy for machinery, the rehabilitation of the silo units and their external components and the designation of the CMC silos under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act .

CONTACT

Denise Gendron
Manager, Heritage Preservation Services
Tel: 416-338-1075
Fax: 416-392-1973
E-mail: dgendron@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Barbara Leonhardt
Director, Policy and Research
City Planning Division

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment No. 1: Site Map