

Transportation of Inflammable Liquids Over Subways on Keele Street

Date:	August 19, 2010
To:	City Council
From:	General Manager, Transportation Services
Wards:	Ward 8
Reference Number:	P:\2010\Cluster B\TRA\TIM\cc10018.tim

SUMMARY

By-law No. 72, enacted by the former Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto back in 1954, is a by-law which is still in effect that regulates the transportation of inflammable liquids on former Metropolitan roads over subways.

The Toronto York Spadina Subway Extension will operate directly below Keele Street between St. Regis Crescent and The Pond Road. With the proximity of three major tank farms to the Keele/Finch intersection, a high volume of tanker trucks transporting inflammable liquids currently travels this section of Keele Street. By-law No. 72 would prohibit these tanker trucks from continuing their use of this section of Keele Street in the future because they would pass over the subway. As a result, they would be required to travel circuitous routes to access and egress these tank farms.

Since the enactment of By-law No. 72 in 1954, there have been significant safety improvements in tanker truck design as well as stricter regulations in the related fire and engineering codes. Furthermore, a recent independent risk analysis has concluded that continuing the transportation of inflammable liquids at this location, once the subway is in operation, would result in an acceptable level of risk to public safety. Therefore, an exemption to By-law No. 72, which would allow tanker trucks to continue to use Keele Street and travel over the subway, has been recommended. This report examines the use of alternative routes to Keele Street for tanker trucks.

Financial Impact

There is no financial impact associated with this report.

ISSUE BACKGROUND

In March 1954, the former Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto enacted By-law No. 72 being a by-law “To regulate the transportation of inflammable liquids on Metropolitan roads over Rapid Transit subways”. This by-law, as amended, remains in effect and section 1 of this by-law states that, “No person shall transport any inflammable liquid along or upon any portion of a road included in the Metropolitan Road System under which is located any part of a subway of the Rapid Transit system of the Toronto Transit Commission or upon which is located any entrance or exit to such a subway.” By-law No. 72 does provide exemptions to the section 1 prohibition. However, the exemptions are not applicable in the case at hand.

At its meeting on June 15, 2010, the Public Works and Infrastructure Committee approved Item PW 34.8, “Transportation of Inflammable Liquids over Subways” which recommended that:

1. City Council amend former Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto By-law No. 72 to provide an exemption to the general prohibition such that the transportation of inflammable liquids would be permitted along or upon Finch Avenue West from Tangiers Road to Romfield Lane over the proposed LRT station.
2. The General Manager, Transportation Services, report directly to City Council on the appropriateness of a similar amendment to former Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto By-law No. 72 that would provide an exemption to the general prohibition and permit the transportation of inflammable liquids on the section of Keele Street under which the Spadina Subway Extension will operate, upon completion of an appropriate risk analysis.

At its meeting on July 6, 7 and 8, 2010, City Council deferred consideration of Item PW34.8 to the next meeting of City Council on August 25, 2010 and requested the General Manager, Transportation Services to enter into discussions with representatives of the Oil Companies to explore other alternatives, and report to City Council at the August 25, 2010 meeting.

At its meeting on July 14, 2010, the Toronto Transit Commission recommended that:

1. Toronto Council approve the recommendation of the Public Works and Infrastructure Committee to amend the former Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto By-Law No. 72, regulating the transportation of inflammable liquids on roads over subways:

- a. To provide an exemption to the general prohibition such that the transportation of inflammable liquids would be permitted along or upon Finch Avenue West from Tangiers Road to Romfield Lane over the proposed LRT station; and
 - b. Along or upon Keele Street from St Regis Crescent to The Pond Road over the proposed subway.
2. This report and its recommendations be forwarded to Toronto City Council for its consideration with Public Works and Infrastructure Committee report PW 34.8 at its August 25 and 26, 2010 meeting.

COMMENTS

As directed by City Council, staff of City Transportation and the TTC have met (July 13 and August 12, 2010) with representatives of the oil companies including representatives of the Canadian Petroleum Products Institute (CPPI). CPPI represents the interests of the downstream petroleum industry for all aspects of petroleum refining, distribution, transportation and marketing of petroleum products. Discussions focussed on tanker truck routing including alternatives to the use of Keele Street in the area of the tank farms, specifically the intersection of Keele Street and Finch Avenue West.

The feasibility of a new north-south road on the tank farm property, to be used as an alternative to Keele Street or Tangiers Road, was reviewed. Shell Canada has documented their concerns regarding this proposal, given the impacts to existing assets (pipelines, tanks) and associated costs. Other oil companies, which would be similarly impacted, have not yet provided formal comments.

With regard to the routing of tanker trucks travelling to and from the tank farms, the oil companies who contract out the transportation of their products do not dictate the route which tanker truck drivers must take. Instead, the drivers select the most direct, legal route available. Upon completion of the Spadina Subway Extension and the Finch West LRT, it is predictable that, for certain movements, tanker truck drivers destined to/originating from the tank farms will make use of Tangiers Road. For example, trucks originating from/destined to the east will make westbound right turns and southbound left turns at the intersection of Finch Avenue West and Tangiers Road. Also, empty tankers returning to the tank farms may find it less congested to make an eastbound left turn at Finch/Tangiers than at Finch/Keele. These predictable changes to truck routing will result in a reduction of the number of tanker trucks using the Keele/Finch intersection.

It should also be noted that CPPI has expressed to its members, the concerns regarding the high volume of tanker trucks on Keele Street.

In addition to the meetings with oil company representatives, a meeting was held on August 5, 2010 with the area Councillors as well as staff from the TTC and Transportation Services. Attendance included Councillors Augimeri, Moscoe, and

Perruzza as well as a representative from Councillor Giambrone's office. The discussion at this meeting focussed on the volume of tanker trucks traveling through the intersection of Keele Street and Finch Avenue West. Staff identified that during the TYSSE construction period, the extension of Tangiers Road will be in place and will serve as an alternate route for traffic which currently uses Keele Street, including tanker trucks. Upon completion of the TYSSE, and ultimately the Finch West LRT, there will be no at-grade modifications to the Keele/Finch intersection compared to the existing geometric configuration. It was agreed by the meeting attendees that, due to the extension of Tangiers Road, it is expected that some tanker trucks will utilize Tangiers Road, thereby reducing the volume of tanker trucks travelling through the Keele/Finch intersection.

CONTACT

Martin D. Maguire, P. Eng.
Manager, Transit Projects
Transportation Services Division
Telephone: 416-392-8508 Email: mmaguir@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Gary Welsh, P. Eng.
General Manager, Transportation Services