May 20th, 2010

To: Members of the Toronto Preservation Board

RE: 691 Scarlett Road (St Matthias Anglican Church)

Heritage Toronto strongly supports the staff recommendation to refuse this application to demolish 691 Scarlett Road.

We believe that this is an important issue, both because of the importance of this structure, but even more importantly because requests to demolish designated buildings potentially threaten the integrity of the designation process.

Designation should mean more than a mere 90 day barrier to demolition of buildings which have been through an extensive process already to obtain designation under the Ontario Heritage Act.

The already existing backlog of structures awaiting consideration for listing or designation will grow even more rapidly if city staff have to spend precious time defending buildings already on the list.

Regarding the details of this particular structure, the staff report is comprehensive and we do not need to repeat the points that have been well argued within it.

However, we would like to reiterate the staff comment about the discrepancy between the Building Condition Assessment and the photographs in the staff report, and note that over the last few years we have witnessed an increasing number of expert reports to the Board which are disputed by other experts, making decision-making a real challenge.

Peggy Mooney
Executive Director