Report Title: City Purchasing Card (PCard) Program - Improving Controls Before Expanding the Program

#### Report Date: October 27, 2009

#### **Recommendation:**

- 006 The Treasurer, in consultation with Heads of Divisions participating in the PCard Program, ensure that cardholder reconciliation of purchase logs with PCard system records is consistently implemented.
- 008 The Treasurer ensure that PCard documents, including purchase logs and receipts, are stored in a secure manner to prevent unauthorized access.
- 013 The Treasurer develop standards or guidelines for providing food and/or beverages at staff meetings and functions.

Division: Children's Services

Report Title: Review of Children's Services (Day Care Fees)

Report Date: June 30, 2007

#### **Recommendation:**

005 The General Manager, Children's Services Division, develop a business case to consider the costs and the benefits of Toronto Children's Services Operating Criteria.

Division: City Manager's Office

Report Title: Audit of City's Performance in Achieving Access, Equity and Human Rights Goals

#### Report Date: October 14, 2008

- 002 City Council request all Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations to report to Council by June 2009 whether they have developed a human rights policy and related complaint procedures, whether the policy and procedures are in keeping with provisions in the City's policy and procedures, and implementation of these policies and procedures.
- 005 The Executive Director of the Human Resources Division, in view of current changes to the Ontario Human Rights Code, review the current level of resources in the City's Human Rights Office to ensure that it is adequately resourced to carry out its responsibilities.
- 006 The Executive Director of the Human Resources Division consider adapting the Fraud and Waste Hotline complaint management system for use by the Human Rights Office to improve efficiency in complaint in-take and management functions.
- 012 The City Manager, in developing a corporate civic engagement strategy, identify and advise Council on the need for establishing formal civic engagement mechanisms connecting the City's diverse population groups with City government. Steps to be undertaken should include but not be limited to:

- Review and address past operational issues encountered by the Community Advisory Committees, the Working Groups, and the Roundtable on Access, Equity and Human Rights;
- (b) Assess current needs for providing opportunities for specific population groups to advise City Council of issues specific to the groups; and
- (c) Periodically evaluate formal civic engagement structures to identify and address issues affecting their effectiveness.

#### Report Title: Environmental Issues and Audit Plan

#### Report Date: May 30, 2002

#### **Recommendation:**

- 001 the Chief Administrative Officer, in consultation with the Chair of the Toronto Inter-departmental Environment Team (TIE), review the recommendations of the Environmental Plan and:
  - develop corporate environmental priorities based on an evaluation of current environmental risks and the potential for environmental health benefits and cost savings to the City;
  - (b) set objectives, targets and time frames for environmental initiatives, that are achievable, clearly defined and measurable;
  - (c) refine the monitoring and reporting system recently developed to evaluate progress on the targets and objectives set, and to document those environmental initiatives which have been completed;
  - (d) assign an appropriate lead for each environmental initiative, with the responsibility for developing an implementation plan, co-ordinating activities, and defining and achieving expected deliverables or outcomes;
  - (e) develop a process for incorporating environmental initiatives into departmental business plans and the annual budget process; and
  - (f) include in an annual environmental report to City Council, the status of environmental initiatives, results achieved to date as well as the challenges and priorities in both the short and long-term in implementing the Environmental Plan;

and report thereon to the Policy and Finance Committee;

#### Division: Employment & Social Services

#### Report Title: Recovery of Social Assistance Overpayments, Toronto Social Services

Report Date: June 2, 2005

#### **Recommendation:**

003 The General Manager, Toronto Social Services, establish appropriate performance measures in relation to collection follow-up procedures for all overpayments relating to Ontario Works clients. Such performance measures be subject to supervisory review and appropriate management action. The ongoing monitoring of collection activities be reviewed and evidence of such review be contained in all files.

- 007 The General Manager, Toronto Social Services, evaluate the reporting capabilities of the current management information systems in order to ensure that the needs of the Inactive Overpayments Unit are addressed. The functionality of such a system should include:
  - automated receipt issuance when a recovery is processed;
  - automated consolidation of daily funds received and processed;
  - outstanding overpayment account balance information;
  - standardized collection letters;
  - automated bring forwards;
  - tracking of post-dated repayment cheques;
  - automated priority ranking of accounts; and
  - performance reports indicating key financial ratios such as overpayment recoveries compared to outstanding overpayments.
- 013 The General Manager, Toronto Social Services, review and measure the impact created by the implementation of full portability of overpayments on the administration of social assistance and report the current and projected operational impact to the Community Services Committee and the Ministry of Community and Social Services.

#### Division: Facilities Management

## Report Title: Maintenance and Administrative Controls Review – Facilities and Real Estate

## Report Date: September 16, 2005

#### **Recommendation:**

- 012 The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer take appropriate steps to:
  - (a) develop and implement results based performance indicators measuring the productivity of building maintenance and cleaning services;
  - use performance indicators to compare internally between building locations and previous performance or externally with other leading local government and private sector organizations;
  - (c) incorporate performance measures into service level agreements with City-user divisions; and,
  - (d) implement a process to track service delivery against agreed upon benchmarks.

#### Division: Fire Services

#### Report Title: Fire Services Operational Review

Report Date: January 13, 2006

- 019 The Fire Chief and General Manager review and take necessary steps to:
  - (a) ensure the implementation of a proactive and enhanced preventive maintenance program for firefighting vehicles and equipment; and

- (b) monitor and minimize fire vehicle downtime and service disruptions associated with unscheduled and unexpected repairs.
- 033 The City Manager ensure coordination of Fleet Services, Toronto Fire Services and other City fleet operations in establishing common performance measures and standard for fleet operations City-wide.

#### Division: Human Resources

#### Report Title: Effectively Managing the Recruitment of Non-Union Employees in the Toronto Public Sector

#### Report Date: June 19, 2009

#### **Recommendation:**

- 002 The Executive Director of Human Resources take steps to implement the action plans related to employment equity contained in the Toronto Public Service People Plan 2008 - 2011. The action plans to provide specific deliverables as well as a time frame for such deliverables. Regular progress reports be provided to City Council. In developing its specific plans, the Executive Director of Human Resources consult with the Toronto Police Services as well as other appropriate employers in order to ensure that its action plans represent best practices.
- 003 The Executive Director of Human Resources ensure the City's external recruitment strategy includes outreach to diverse community groups. Evidence of such activities be documented in the files.
- 007 The Executive Director of Human Resources direct all staff involved in the hiring process that documentation relating to conflict of interest declarations be completed and retained.
- 009 The Executive Director of Human Resources direct all staff involved in the hiring process to follow and comply with City policies on employment references.
- 013 The Executive Director of Human Resources review the current extent and timing of quality reviews of hiring files. Consideration be given to conducting a certain number of such reviews on current open hiring files.
- 014 The Executive Director of Human Resources ensure all current and new divisional hiring supervisors and managers attend the "Basics of Staffing" training course
- 015 The Executive Director of Human Resources review acting assignments to ensure such assignments comply with Corporate policy. The Executive Director of Human Resources review the documentation requirements for acting assignments of non-union employees to ensure Corporate records include written documentation detailing the terms and conditions of acting assignments.

#### Division: Information & Technology

#### Report Title: Review of Information Technology Training

Report Date: 05/11/2009

#### **Recommendation:**

001 The Chief Information Officer in consultation with the Executive Director, Human Resources Division take steps in accordance with the "People Plan" to identify common computer skills which apply to "jobs across all divisions" to assist in the development of a training program for new and current employees.

- 006 The Chief Information Officer implement a charge-back policy for training courses similar to the Human Resources Division policy. The policy should charge divisions for registered employees that fail to attend courses without prior notification.
- 007 The Chief Information Officer in consultation with the Executive Director, Human Resources Division investigate the long term use of the SAP Human Resources Information System as the repository for employee training records.

# Report Title: Review of Disposal of Surplus IT Equipment - Security, Environmental and Financial Risks

#### Report Date: 02/05/2009

#### **Recommendation:**

- 001 The Chief Information Officer re-evaluate the agreement with the vendor who is currently providing information technology asset disposal services. Such re-evaluation take into account the experience of the vendor particularly in the area of data security and environmental concerns and where appropriate ensure that the vendor is capable of providing the level of service required.
- 002 The Chief Information Officer review all provisions in the agreement with the third party information technology asset disposal vendor and direct the vendor to comply with all provisions in the agreement. Further policies, procedures be established to ensure that the City is able to confirm compliance. Regular audits including the development of audit programmes be conducted to confirm compliance. Documentary evidence of all such compliance audits be retained and approved by supervisory staff.
- 003 The Chief Information Officer, on a random basis, confirm that hard drives submitted to the auctioneer have been successfully erased. Specialized data recovery tools be used to determine whether or not hard drives have been successfully deleted.
- 004 The Chief Information Officer ensure that disposal processes for surplus information technology assets are in conformance with regulatory procedures and all such disposals are supported by an adequate audit trail for subsequent verification by City staff.

#### Report Title: Integrated Business Management System

#### Report Date: January 16, 2009

- 006 The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer review current levels of training available to IBMS users, and solicit input from divisional users in relation to training effectiveness. Deficiencies in regard to training identified by users be appropriately addressed.
- 008 The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer develop security plans, standards and related staff responsibilities for managing and overseeing IBMS security.
- 010 The Chief Information Officer develop formal written procedures for granting, changing or removing IBMS user access.
- 012 The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer and City Clerk review the record retention policy for all IBMS related records. Such a review include the establishment of policies and procedures for archiving IBMS records.

#### Report Title: Internet Access Review

Report Date: July 31, 2007

#### **Recommendation:**

004 The Chief Information Officer take appropriate steps to ensure Internet connections of all City computers are consistently configured so that Internet logs record all Internet activity of all users but exclude visits to City internal sites.

#### Division: Parks, Forestry & Recreation

Report Title: Parks, Forestry and Recreation - Review of Internal Controls at the East York Curling Club

Report Date: April 27, 2010

#### **Recommendation:**

- 001 The General Manager of Parks, Forestry and Recreation, evaluate the City's ongoing role in the management of facilities such as the East York Curling Club. The evaluation determine the most effective operating model taking into account community involvement in the facility as well as the management of core programs and other ancillary services.
- 002 The General Manager of Parks, Forestry and Recreation, develop an accountability framework which includes formal operating agreements for groups operating programs at any City owned curling facility.
- 004 The General Manager of Parks, Forestry and Recreation review the internal control deficiencies identified at the East York Curling Facility and establish a process whereby such control deficiencies are reviewed and addressed by the Parks, Forestry and Recreation Compliance Unit.
- 005 The General Manager of Parks, Forestry and Recreation review the recommendations contained in this report for applicability to the other two Parks, Forestry and Recreation curling facilities, and where appropriate, such recommendations be implemented.

# Report Title:Parks, Forestry and Recreation – Capital Program – The Backlog in Needed<br/>Repairs Continues to Grow

#### Report Date: January 23, 2009

- 004 The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation report to Budget Committee, as recommended by Council, by November 2009, on the outcome of the Capital Budget Task Force. Such report to include:
  - (a) issues identified and factors contributing to project delays
  - (b) recommendations to address issues identified and minimize delays
  - (c) status, timelines and responsibility of implementation of each of the recommendations being made.
- 006 The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer require all major projects for new infrastructure include future capital maintenance costs for reporting under financial implications at the time of project approval.

Division: Purchasing & Materials Management

#### Report Title: Process for Non-Competitive Procurement (Sole Sourcing) Needs Improvement

#### Report Date: May 22, 2009

#### **Recommendation:**

- 001 The Treasurer report annually to Government Management Committee a summary of all sole source purchases including divisional purchase orders, as well as sole source purchases reported to the Standing Committees and Council.
- 002 The Treasurer require that staff in the Purchasing and Materials Management Division report significant inappropriate sole source activity to senior divisional staff in order to address performance and training issues of divisional staff.
- 003 The Treasurer require that the reasons for all sole source purchases, including those purchases approved in Standing Committee and Council reports, are recorded in the financial information system on a consistent basis.
- 004 The Treasurer ensure policies and procedures to control and monitor the new \$50,000 limit on divisional purchase orders are finalized and issued to divisional staff as soon as possible. Such procedures should address the justification and documentation requirements for sole source purchases.
- 005 The Treasurer ensure that sole source procedures clearly state that solicitation of informal bids is not permitted. Similarly, for non emergency situations, vendors should not start work before purchase orders are approved and wherever possible, the first phase of multi-phased projects should undergo a competitive procurement process.
- 006 The Treasurer re-emphasize to divisional management the importance of identifying procurement requirements and ensure that this information is communicated to the Purchasing and Materials Management Division and City Legal on a timely basis. This process would allow for sufficient lead time, such that both the Purchasing and Materials Management Division and City Legal can schedule their respective resources to meet divisional timelines.
- 007 The Treasurer develop and communicate guidelines to assist divisional staff in identifying contractual relationships where the potential exists that the contractor could be deemed an employee by the Canada Revenue Agency.
- 008 The City Manager direct City divisions to report back to the Treasurer on any consulting/contractor arrangements that may pose a significant risk of being deemed City employees by the Canada Revenue Agency.

#### Division: Revenue Services

#### Report Title: Controls Over Parking Tags Need Strengthening

#### Report Date: January 27, 2010

- 003 The Treasurer re-evaluate the criteria supporting the discretionary cancellation of parking tags. Policies and procedures concerning the preparation and retention of documentation in support of cancellations be developed. Supporting documentation be randomly reviewed by supervisory staff. In addition, management reports be developed and reviewed on an ongoing basis to identify anomalies and trends.
- 005 The Treasurer review the parking enforcement process as it relates to the issue and cancellation of parking tags for delivery and courier vehicles. Such a review include an evaluation of best

practices in other Canadian and US jurisdictions. If required, amendments to provincial legislation be requested.

- 006 The Treasurer direct all staff that parking tag adjustments processed through the Parking Tag Management System are appropriately documented and that each adjustment be accompanied by an appropriate audit trail. Such documentation be reviewed on a random basis by supervisory staff.
- 008 The Treasurer review the parking tag collection process, prioritise those receivables which relate to individuals and entities who have significant receivables owing on multiple plates and consider conducting corporate searches to identify these entities. Once identified the appropriate follow-up process be conducted including the use of collection agencies specifically directed to these accounts.
- 010 The Treasurer review the extent of receivables submitted to collection agencies such that collection agencies are provided information on entities who have parking tags owing on more than one vehicle. Finally, the Treasurer consider providing collection agencies with more up to date receivable information.
- 011 The Treasurer, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, review the current cheque processing system so that payments relating to tags in plate denial status and payments which have previously been made are identified more easily by those staff receiving payment. Such a process would reduce the administrative process of issuing refund cheques.
- 012 The Treasurer review the merits of amending the cheque collection process so that NSF fees are clearly identified and subsequently collected. Amendments to provincial legislation be requested, if required.
- 013 The Treasurer develop a formal change control process. Application development should be separate from system administration, and developers should not install their own programs to the production environment.

## Report Title: Payment of Utility Charges

#### Report Date: December 11, 2009

- 001 The Deputy City Manager & Chief Financial Officer consider assigning responsibility for hydro and natural gas accounts management to the Energy and Waste Management Office. At the same time the reallocation of resources should be evaluated
- 005 The City Manager assign one City unit responsibility for developing and implementing a process for updating and verifying street lighting related hydro costs
- 009 The Executive Director of the Facilities & Real Estate Division take appropriate steps to minimize duplication of energy consumption review efforts performed by City staff on behalf of City agencies such as the TTC and the Toronto Community Housing Corporation.
- 010 The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer assign responsibility for the management of cable television services. The specific responsibilities include:
  - a. the renegotiation of a corporate cable television service discount plan for all users
  - b. the maintenance of an inventory of cable television plans
  - c. the rationalization of such cable television plans commensurate with requirements.
- 011 The City Manager forward this report to the City's major Agencies, Boards and Commissions in order to ensure that the issues raised in this report are addressed by them where appropriate.

Division: Solid Waste Management Services

#### Report Title: Solid Waste Management Services – Review of Major Contracts

#### Report Date: February 9, 2007

#### **Recommendation:**

- 011 The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer, in consultation with the other Deputy City Managers and the City Solicitor:
  - a. review the appropriate standard content of performance bonds and insurance certificates and the appropriateness and criteria for deviations from such standards in light of relevant risk exposure, including the respective roles of the Legal Services Division and Corporate Finance's Insurance and Risk Management section in deciding on any deviation of submitted documents;
  - b. review and take necessary steps to ensure current administrative policies and procedures, including clarifying the roles and responsibilities of City Finance and City divisions in the safekeeping, recordkeeping and administration of performance bonds, letters of credit, and insurance certificates, are effective in protecting the City from claims, risks and losses in connection with activities performed by City contractors; and
  - c. issue written directives to clearly communicate relevant corporate policies and procedures to staff.

#### Division: Technical Services

#### Report Title: Contract Management – Reconstruction of The Queensway -Eastbound Lanes

#### Report Date: July 28, 2006

#### **Recommendation:**

- 016 The Executive Director, Technical Services Division, take steps to ensure compliance with policies and procedures in relation to:
  - documenting the daily work completed in the Field Inspector's Daily Work Report;
  - documentation of monthly field meetings;
  - preparation of the Deficiency List and List of Incomplete Items on achieving substantial completion;
  - confirmation of final inspection before release of final payment; and
  - obtaining statutory declaration and WSIB clearance as required by the procedures manual.

#### Division: Toronto Water

Report Title: Protecting Water Quality and Preventing Pollution – Assessing the Effectiveness of the City's Sewer Use By-law

#### Report Date: October 10, 2008

#### **Recommendation:**

019 The General Manager, Toronto Water, take steps to ensure that all financial terms of surcharge agreements are complied with. Interest on overdue payments owed to the City should be charged

according to the terms of the surcharge agreement. Agreements should set interest rates in accordance with the rate prescribed by the Municipal Code.

#### Report Title: Toronto Water – Wastewater Treatment Phase Two

#### Report Date: September 21, 2007

#### **Recommendation:**

- 003 The General Manager, Toronto Water Division, in consultation with the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management and the Executive Director, Policy, Planning, Finance and Administration, devise a procurement plan to ensure blanket contracts are issued for repetitive purchases.
- 007 The General Manager, Toronto Water Division, assign a contract lead to all contracts and ensure that all staff participating in contracts are aware of the relevant contract provisions and their responsibilities in managing the contract. These responsibilities include:
  - a. ensuring that goods delivered and payments comply with contract provisions; and
  - b. obtaining and retaining relevant contract documents.
- 011 The General Manager, Toronto Water Division, require that detailed checking of invoices and receiving documents be performed for high value and complex contracts to ensure that amounts billed to the City agree with the contract terms.
- 013 The General Manager, Toronto Water Division, ensure that there is a segregation of duties between ordering, receiving and the recording of goods and services. Where feasible, the same individual should not both order and receive goods and record these transactions in the accounting system.
- 014 The General Manager, Toronto Water Division, develop a consistent approach to maintaining purchasing records in the wastewater plants such as centrally in each work area.

#### Report Title: Management of Construction Contracts – Toronto Water and Sewer Emergency Repair Contracts

#### Report Date: July 30, 2007

#### **Recommendation:**

011 The General Manager, Toronto Water, ensure that extra work is awarded through authorized change directives and that separate inspector reports are used for recording work pertaining to extra work orders.

#### Report Title: Toronto Water – Wastewater Treatment Phase One

#### Report Date: July 16, 2007

#### **Recommendation:**

011 The General Manager, Toronto Water Division, review the use of alternate rate assignments to ensure that such assignments are necessary and properly processed in accordance with policies and procedures as well as the provisions in the collective agreement.

Division: Transportation Services

#### Report Title: Contract Management Procedures-Transportation Services Division

#### Report Date: March 19, 2001

- 001 the Commissioner of Works & Emergency Services, take the necessary action to strengthen quality assurance over projects by:
  - (a) developing a harmonized quality assurance program, for implementation by the 2001 construction season, which includes inspection and quality testing guidelines and standards to effectively manage road maintenance contracts. The program should take into account the need for more frequent, independent verification of truckload weights and regular material quality testing;
  - (b) designing a form for documenting and reporting on the completion of required lab tests and related results on each project for review by district road operation managers and supervisors;
  - (c) providing staff training to ensure that all inspectors are aware of the Transportation Services Division's inspection, testing and documentation requirements, as well as management expectations in this regard;
  - (d) regularly monitoring staff adherence to the harmonized quality assurance program;
  - (e) considering the rotation of inspectors, as appropriate;

Division:	Accounting Services
Report Title:	City Purchasing Card (Pcard) Program - Improving Controls Before Expanding the Program

Report Date: October 27, 2009

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
001	<ul> <li>The Treasurer, in conjunction with Heads of Divisions participating in the PCard program, develop and implement clear and effective procedures to:</li> <li>a. Reduce the number of monthly transactions with outstanding documents or approvals</li> <li>b. Follow up on transactions with outstanding documents or approvals in a consistent manner</li> <li>c. Recover the City's GST rebates from PCard purchases</li> <li>d. Ensure cancellation of individual PCards according to policy</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>a. PCard procedures for Divisional follow up, review and documentation of errors, discrepancies, and outstanding items have been documented and reviewed with Divisional coordinators. Beginning April 1, 2011, divisional staff will undertake compliance reviews and share results with PCard Administration.</li> <li>b. Per a. above, procedures are in place for monthly divisional reviews and random review by PCard Administration.</li> <li>c. Procedures have been put in place in Accounting Services for review of all items without HST references and recovery of all HST. All prior amounts were calculated in April 2011 and recovered through the April HST return.</li> <li>d. The PCard cancellation policy was reviewed and updated in August 2010. An annual self-</li> </ul>
		updated in August 2010. An annual self- assessment checklist will be developed and implemented prior to December 2011 to allow each PCard Coordinator to attest to all critical functions. These will be monitored by PCard Administration.
002	The Treasurer validate employment status of all current cardholders. Further, in consultation with Heads of Divisions participating in the PCard program, the Treasurer develop and implement clear and effective procedures to address the timely cancellation of PCards upon employment termination or extended leave	PCard procedures developed regarding timely cancellation of PCards for employees terminated or on extended leaves – issued August 2010. Quarterly inactivity reports provided to Authorizing Managers beginning November 2010. Adequacy of existing procedures to be assessed in 2011, with any additional procedures to be undertaken by PCard divisions to be developed by September 30, 2011.
003	The Treasurer, in conjunction with Heads of Divisions participating in the PCard program, develop and implement effective review, monitoring, and follow-up procedures, at the divisional and Corporate levels, to ensure compliance with PCard policies and procedures.	Divisional Compliance Policy and Procedure completed October 2010. Enhanced Divisional compliance reviews required beginning April 2011, with documentation supplied to PCard Administration

City Divisions		
<b>Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented</b>		

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
004	Heads of Divisions participating in the PCard program ensure that a divisional approval list outlining cardholders and their respective approval supervisors is developed and routinely reviewed for appropriateness.	The Cardholder Profile Database was expanded to include documentation of authorizing managers. The one remaining division will complete their documentation in May 2011.
005	The Treasurer, in consultation with Heads of Divisions participating in the PCard Program, ensure adequate controls are incorporated into the PCard approval process to detect inappropriate authorization and minimize the risk of unauthorized alterations to purchase logs.	PCard Program Roles and Responsibilities documentation has been updated, as well as enhanced training to ensure that approved documents are not provided back to employees who sought the approval. In addition to reviews at the PCard Administration level, compliance reviews at the Divisional level have been implemented beginning April 2011.
007	The Treasurer, in consultation with Heads of Divisions participating in the PCard program, develop procedures whereby management staff have regular access to information on the total number and types of PCard purchases made for their office/unit	Distribution of reports has been included in PCard participants' roles and responsibilities. Accounting Services will provide all reports to Divisions in May 2011, and will provide ongoing assistance on reporting to Divisional coordinators upon request.
009	<ul> <li>The Treasurer undertake the necessary steps to improve effectiveness of PCard training. Such steps should include, but not be limited to:</li> <li>a. Ensuring the training includes a review of the importance of individual roles and responsibilities in the control framework</li> <li>b. Providing refresher training where</li> </ul>	Overview training was updated effective November 2010, and delivered beginning November 1, 2010. An online testing tool to identify those requiring refresher training has been developed and is undergoing testing for implementation in June 2011.
010	needed. The Treasurer undertake the necessary steps to improve efficiency of the PCard process, including steps to explore the feasibility of using the PCard system to generate purchase logs for cardholders, and re-assess what information is necessary for cardholders to provide in the purchase logs	New reporting tools are being updated and implemented effective September 2011. Feasibility of producing purchase logs will be reviewed during the update, with implementation, if feasible, by December 2011.
011	The City Manager ensure that the Expense Claim Policy for Staff of the City of Toronto (March 10, 1998) is reviewed, updated, and made accessible to staff.	An updated Business Expense policy has been drafted and is currently being reviewed. Implementation is anticipated in May 2011.

City Divisions
<b>Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented</b>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
012	The Treasurer develop and implement measures to improve compliance with Corporate policies and procedures pertaining to business expenses.	The updated Business Expense policy, anticipated for May 2011, will include compliance and reporting requirements.
014	The Treasurer undertake the necessary steps to improve cardholder compliance with Corporate purchasing policies and procedures. Such steps should include, but not be limited to:	PCard holders must have Purchasing training in addition to PCard training. The online assessment and refresher training tool referred to in 009 will be implemented in June 2011
	a. Ensuring cardholders receive adequate training in purchasing policies and procedures.	Compliance monitoring is done at the PCard Administration level and will be enhanced at the Divisional level in April 2011.
	<ul> <li>Monitoring PCard purchases to identify non- compliance with purchasing policies.</li> </ul>	
015	The Treasurer ensure that PCard purchases are regularly monitored and analysed to identify opportunities for blanket contract.	With new reporting capabilities anticipated for September 2011, available information will be compiled and reviewed for blanket contract opportunities.
016	The City Manager review the current sundry expense policy and consider integrating the requirement to reduce the sundry expense claim when meals are provided at conferences or business meetings, or when meals are paid for by the City.	Per 011, the updated expense policy scheduled for May 2011, will address meals at conferences.
017	The Treasurer, in conjunction with Heads of Divisions participating in the PCard program, develop and implement procedures to reduce the number of inactive or low usage cards, and cancel inactive cards where necessary.	Reports of card inactivity have been generated and sent to Divisional management in November 2010 and April 2011. Inactive and low-use cards are reviewed and cancelled, where appropriate.
018	The Treasurer develop and implement strategies to promote and expand the use of PCards by City divisions. Such strategies should include, but not be limited to:	PCard Program Administration Unit continues to work with the PCard provider and divisions to determine expansion possibilities for the program. However, it should be noted that the majority of opportunities lie with the software upgrade and implementation of the
	<ul> <li>a. Analyzing divisional purchasing patterns to identify potential areas for expansion</li> <li>b. Developing and implementing measures to increase the use of PCards by</li> </ul>	PO module. The expectations for the completion of the upgrade and implementation of the PO module will be September 2011.
	divisions c. Setting performance goals for the City based on the number of participating divisions and yearly PCard purchase volume.	No expansion has been undertaken pending completion of the controls and additional reporting. Strategy to be completed by September 30, 2011

City Divisions		
<b>Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented</b>		

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
019 The Treasurer ensure adequate contract review and management practices for the PCard program including:	review and management practices for the	The RFP for PCard service is almost complete and ready for posting. Once the vendor has been chosen, all recommendations regarding contracting will be
	a. A thorough review of the contractual terms and rebate rates and volume tiers	implemented. A new contract will be in place for August 23, 2011.
	b. Retaining a copy of the final contract.	
020	The Treasurer, in conjunction with Heads of Divisions participating in the PCard	The strategy will be in place by September 30, 2011.
	program, develop a long term strategy for continuous improvement of the PCard program including:	User group established. Meetings are held on a quarterly basis. Smaller and more frequent meetings are held when warranted (new or changed policies or
	a. Establishment of a City-wide User Group	procedures).
	<ul> <li>Regular reviews and updates of policies and procedures.</li> </ul>	Program material to be reviewed every two (2) years. Goals monitoring to begin once strategy is completed by September 30, 2011.

## Division: City Manager's Office

## Report Title: Audit of City's Performance in Achieving Access, Equity and Human Rights Goals

## Report Date: October 14, 2008

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
004	The City Manager, in consultation with the City Solicitor, review the existing complaint protocol of the Integrity Commissioner in order to ensure that Councillor related human rights and harassment complaints are dealt with in a manner consistent with other complaints and is in the best interest of the public.	In consultation with the City Manager and City Solicitor, the Integrity Commissioner is reviewing the existing a) Code of Conduct, b) the Code of Conduct – Complaint Protocol for Members of Council, c) this recommendation and will be reporting in her Annual Report, expected to go forward to City Council in July 2011, on the provision in the Code of Conduct – Complaint Protocol that ensures that City Councillor human rights related complaints are dealt with in a manner consistent with other complaints and in the best interest of the public.
007	The City Manager increase the profile of the Human Rights Office in order to ensure the general public and City employees are aware of its role and mandate. The increased profile be accomplished by providing additional information on the Human Rights Office via the City's Web site. Consideration also be given to revising the Web page to accommodate a process whereby human rights complaints can be	The Human Rights public web page was updated and reported in the previous status report. Implementation of an on-line complaint form is being implemented as part of recommendation no. 6 above – to be completed by June of 2011. Further, the relocation of the Human Rights functions into a new division in the City Manager's Office has escalated the profile of the office.

City Divisions		
<b>Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented</b>		

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	submitted online.	
008	The City Manager, in consultation with the City's Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations, consider creating a consolidated Human Rights Office Web page for receiving human rights or harassment related complaints or enquiries concerning services and practices of the City's Divisions, Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations.	<ul> <li>The Human Rights Office will undertake the following: (311 has agreed to this approach)</li> <li>a) Confirm the contact information of ABCC staff who can respond to employee and service recipient human rights issues and complaints</li> <li>b) Work with 311 to incorporate the above noted contact information in their knowledge base</li> <li>c) Update the Human Rights Office Web page to alert ABCC employees and service recipients that they can contact 311 if they have a human rights concern and they will be referred to the appropriate staff person at the ABCC.</li> <li>Implementation is expected to complete by December 2011</li> </ul>
017	<ul> <li>The Executive Director of the Human Resources Division take steps to increase the workforce survey response rate among new City employees. Such steps should include, but not be limited to:</li> <li>(a) Improving the survey distribution method;</li> <li>(b) Improving the communication of the purpose and benefits of the survey to new City employees.</li> </ul>	Employment Equity Staff attended a Pension and Benefit divisional meeting at the invitation of the Director to explain the purpose of the survey and the responsibility of the division to disseminate the survey to new hires. A revised workforce survey is being conducted among all TPS employees between May 26 – June 30, 2011. Following the survey period, the new survey and communications about the survey will be distributed to Payroll staff for distribution to new hires. The Employment Equity Unit will also hold an information session with relevant payroll staff to explain the importance of the survey. The participation rate of new hires will be tracked quarterly with Payroll staff allowing the Employment Equity unit to follow-up should the response rate decline. Note: the OEDHR is now responsible for the Employment Equity Survey.
020	The City Manager determine the feasibility and merit of establishing a corporate fund for employment accommodation. Where appropriate, divisional budgets be adjusted to reflect this change. Such a review take into account the practices of other organizations.	In 2010 a working group of representatives from operational divisions came forward with recommendations to improve the results of the job placement process where accommodations were required. A report to the Employee and Labour Relations Committee in May 2011 will outline the recommendations, including a corporate placement process for injured workers that is fiscally responsible.

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
021	The Executive Director of the Human Resources Division develop strategies, objectives and action plans to increase employees' awareness of human rights and diversity issues in the workplace. Further, the Executive Director ensure diversity and human rights training is considered a corporate priority in developing training strategies, goals and objectives under the City's Learning Strategy 2008-2011.	Between June 2008 and December 2010, 3217 Supervisors Managers and Senior Managers have completed Human Rights training. This exceeds the original target of 2500 because of the ongoing need to train new Supervisors and Managers.
		In November 2010 the Executive Director of the Human Resource Division sent a letter to all General Managers and Executive Directors stressing that all staff and in particular Supervisors attend Human Rights training. Corporate funds were used to train 283 people in November and December 2010.
		There has been a break in the training because there were no successful proponents in the RFP that was issued in 2010. A sole source contract has been prepared that will allow Human Rights training to resume in May 2011.
022	The City Manager report to Council on the development of a Toronto Urban Aboriginal Strategy and an Aboriginal Office by June 2009.	In August 2009 City Council adopted the report entitled 'Development of an Urban Aboriginal Strategy for Toronto'. This report gave a broad outline for development of a strategy as well as the time frame and process to be used.
		In September/October 2011 the City Manager will be reporting to the Executive Committee on the City's Urban Aboriginal Action Plan.
025	The City Manager consider the following for further improving divisional action planning in relation to access, equity and human rights:	The divisional action planning and reporting on implementation results are under review and the length of the planning and reporting cycles will be considered as part of this review.
	<ul> <li>(a) Shortening the planning cycle from three to two years; and</li> <li>(b) Requesting divisions to link implementation status to planned activities on an annual basis.</li> </ul>	The plan is to link and integrate the action planning and reporting on implementation results. Beginning in October 2011, and on an annual basis, the planned activities and implementation results will be submitted to Council in the same report.
027	The City Manager establish a formal process whereby access, equity and human rights initiatives and accomplishments by the City's major Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations is systematically tracked and reported to City Council on a periodic basis.	The newly established OEDHR is in the process of completing a divisional plan for reporting which will be adapted to the ABCC's. The target date for completion is Fall 2011.

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
028	City Council request the City major Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations to complete an access, equity and human rights action plan consistent with divisional action plans by 2010. The City Manager should facilitate the planning process and report to City Council on implementation status.	As discussed above, the newly established OEDHR is in the process of completing a divisional plan for reporting which will be adapted to the ABCC's. The target date for completion is Fall 2011.

## Division: Facilities Management

## Report Title: Maintenance and Administrative Controls Review – Facilities and Real Estate

Report Date: September 16, 2005

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
002	The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer ensure priorities are established on a City-wide basis for the capital repair of City-owned buildings. All divisional capital repair budgets should be evaluated and priorities established irrespective of budget responsibilities.	The Facilities Transformation Project (FTP) will consolidate all capital repair budgets for City-owned Buildings with Facilitites Management (FM). A number of program capital budgets have already been transferred to FM, which facilitates priorities being established on a City-wide basis, but the FTP project will not be completed until 2014.
004	The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer give priority to the completion of an implementation plan for facilities maintenance standards including: (a) a process to monitor compliance with	The FTP project is underway and will be completed by 2014. It will address compliance with legislative requirements for facilities maintenance, funding, staffing and operational requirements of all City divisions and maintenance standards for speciality
	legislative requirements;	facilities.
	<ul> <li>(b) funding, staffing and operational requirements of the Facilities and Real Estate Division and all other City divisions;</li> </ul>	The facilities maintenance plan is also reliant on the implementation of the SAP Plant Maintenance Module – Preventative Maintenance which is scheduled to roll out in 2012.
	<ul> <li>(c) the development of specific facilities maintenance standards, if necessary, for speciality facilities such as water treatment plants and arenas; and</li> </ul>	
	(d) timelines for implementation.	
013	The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer take appropriate steps to:	The Facilities Management Division determines the complete state of good repair backlog for all corporate buildings and establishes funding priorities for the state of good repair backlog. Also, refer to
	(a) determine the complete state of good repair backlog for all City-owned	recommendation #14 regarding CAMS.

City Divisions
<b>Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented</b>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	<ul> <li>buildings;</li> <li>(b) develop City-wide funding priorities for the state of good repair backlog; and</li> <li>(c) ensure that approved capital projects are completed on a timely basis.</li> </ul>	Other Division's backlog will be prioritzed as responsibilities are transferred under the Facilities Transformation Project.
014	The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer ensure that a database of the physical condition of all City-owned buildings is developed and forms the basis for a long-term capital plan. In addition, building condition assessments should be completed for all City-owned buildings using criteria based on industry standards and best practices developed by the Facilities and Real Estate Division.	Facilities Management Division has completed building condition assessments on all corporate facilities. This information is being loaded in a new Capital Asset Management System, (CAMS). As other City-owned facilities are transferred via the FTP to FM, BCA's will be incorporated in the new CAMS data base. This will not be completed until 2014.
016	The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer take appropriate steps to establish a maintenance plan for each City building that: (a) includes both capital and operating repairs for current and future years;	The Facilities Management Division is on track to implement a Capital Asset Management software solution and a Preventative Maintenance software solution to address the recommendations outlined in 16 a, b, c. These applications will be operationalized over the next two years.
	<ul> <li>(b) addresses building deficiencies identified in building condition assessments; and</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>(c) effectively coordinates maintenance and repair activities between the Design, Construction and Asset Preservation and Facilities Operations Units of the Facilities and Real Estate Division.</li> </ul>	
017	The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer ensure that all necessary building information is incorporated into the SAP Plant Maintenance and Asset Management Modules to assist in maintenance planning and repair decisions and provide a record of regulatory inspections.	Core building data variables to be incorporated into the SAP Plant Maintenance – Preventative Maintenance Module have been identified including: maintenance planning, and regulatory inspection requirements. The requisite information will be incorporated into this SAP module for implementation in 2012.
028	The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer ensure the SAP Plant Maintenance Module be used to schedule and track preventive maintenance services.	The Facilities Management Division plans to introduce the SAP Plant Maintenance Module - Preventative Maintenance functionality to schedule and track preventive maintenance services in 2012.

Division: Fire Services

## Report Title: Fire Services Operational Review

Report Date: January 13, 2006

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
023	The Fire Chief and General Manager take steps to ensure cost-effective management of the Mechanical Division including:	(a) Timeline: Q2 of 2011 Action Plan: With a full year of accurate M5 data, the system will be able to produce a viable list of job standards, and / or average repair times, for some of the common labour components.
	<ul> <li>(a) establishing and maintaining formal, written and enforceable job standards and monitor compliance with those standards; and</li> <li>(b) ensuring accurate tracking of repair time by utilizing the capability built into the M4 Fleet Management Information System.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>The various performance measures to be tracked as a result of the EFMCC Fleet Study will aid in the development of job standards and the calculations required to indicate the staff efficiency level.</li> <li>(b) Completed Action Plan: Staff members are regularly reminded that all job lines are to be scanned on and off when using the system, capturing all of the labour in its separate components. Captains are required to assure compliance.</li> </ul>
030	The Fire Chief and General Manager take appropriate steps to ensure implementation of adequate inventory controls, including:	(a) Completed. Action Plan: TFS has converted to the NAPA parts consignment contract, with all items received in SAP, entered into M5 when used and subsequently reconciled.
	<ul> <li>(a) utilizing available system features for tracking inventory usage;</li> </ul>	(b) Completed. Action Plan: A new ID card system has been installed
	<ul> <li>(b) assigning a staff position to monitor receipts and issuance of parts inventory and restricting physical access to the stockroom to authorized personnel;</li> </ul>	in the store room at Toryork, and the system is live. Access is only by authorized personnel. TFS have "accommodated" a modified duty staff member to act as store room clerk until a permanent position is
	<ul> <li>(c) recording all parts and labour in the M4 Fleet Management Information System, including unit cost, vendor information and labour hours; and</li> </ul>	approved. The shop Captains duties have been reorganized to have one Captain assigned to all parts inventory and record keeping. (c) Completed.
	<ul> <li>(d) establishing policies and guidelines to provide for an annual inventory process and periodic surprise physical counts of items and ensuring that discrepancies</li> </ul>	Action Plan: the implementation of the M5 system has meant the addition of this information to the database. (d) Time line: Q4 2011.
	are adequately investigated and resolved.	Action Plan: The NAPA program is a consignment based system requiring monthly audits to reconcile inventory counts. The SOG's reference the need for collection of all work order data, includes parts

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
		charges and will further include a procedure for periodic surprise physical counts and resolution of discrepancies.
032	The Deputy City Manager ensure the Mechanical Division of Toronto Fire Services:	(a) Completed Action Plan: TFS has defined three Performance Measures that the members of the EFMCC will track. They are Service Level, Efficiency and Customer Service.
	<ul> <li>(a) establish clear and measurable objectives and performance goals;</li> <li>(b) coordinate with Fleet Services in establishing efficiency and effectiveness performance measures to evaluate progress toward those goals; and</li> <li>(c) regularly measure and report on progress in achieving performance goals.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>(b) Completed Action Plan: The Executive Fleet Management Coordinating Committee (EFMCC) continues to meet monthly to discuss coordination efforts. All groups are measuring the same indicators in the same way, not to compare to each other, but for uniformity.</li> <li>(c) Time line: Q2 2011 Action Plan: The measures to be tracked are Service Level, Efficiency, and Customer Service, each of which breaks down into separate sub-topics Accurate data is available from 2010 statistics and will form the baseline for tracking progress.</li> </ul>

#### Division: Fleet Services

## Report Title: Fleet Operations Review – Phase Two

## Report Date: April 11, 2005

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
007	The City Manager report to the Administration Committee, upon completion of the Yards Rationalization Study, on the status of the recommended closures of the maintenance garages located at 875 Eastern Avenue, 1008 Yonge Street, 1401 Castlefield Avenue and 30 Northline Road.	<ul> <li>Phase 1 of the Yards Consolidation Study was completed and the surplus properties transferred to Build Toronto by Council. None of the four yards in question were located in the Phase 1 area.</li> <li>The current disposition of the yards includes:</li> <li>875 Eastern maintenance facility has been transferred to PF&amp;R 1008 Yonge, 1401 Castlefield and 30 Northline maintenance yards will be retained to service vehicles and equipment belonging to Tpt, SWMS, Toronto Water and PF&amp;R.</li> </ul>
		These yards will be taken into account with the Real Estate audit, currently under way which will address the remaining yards in the City. It is intended to submit a further report on disposition of the yards upon completion of the Real Estate audit.

Division:	Human Resources
Report Title:	Effectively Managing the Recruitment of Non-Union Employees in the Toronto Public Sector
Report Date:	June 19, 2009

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
001	The City Manager be required to fully address the recommendations relating to hiring contained in the Bellamy Report. The Executive Director of Human Resources also be required to ensure that the quality control of hiring files include a monitoring process to address the Bellamy recommendations.	The Director, Strategic Recruitment, Compensation & Employment Services and the Director, HR Standards & Decision Support to meet with Internal Audit to determine the feasibility of modifying the QA process to address Bellamy recommendations. Meeting to be scheduled for June 2011.
004	The City Manager in consultation with the City unions give priority to the development of a workplace survey for union staff. Such a survey be consistent with the non-union workforce survey. The results of the survey be reported to City Council and be used as a basis for addressing the City's employment equity hiring goals.	The workforce survey has been developed. Efforts continue to engage the unions in implementing the survey. Plans for a spring 2011 survey of the workforce are on-going. The workforce survey will begin on May 26, 2011.
005	The Executive Director of Human Resources in consultation with the City Solicitor evaluate the feasibility, benefits and risks of adopting a City-wide Corporate hiring policy.	Consultation process between Human Resources and City Solicitor is underway.
006	The Executive Director of Human Resources direct all staff to complete the appropriate screening documentation for all employee applicants. All such documentation be retained in hiring files.	The Director, Strategic Recruitment, Compensation & Employment Services and the Managers, Strategic Recruitment & Employment Services, discussed on several occasion in 2010, the results of the AG's review on the hiring process, and each manager then addressed the recommendations with their staff, to ensure that the recommendations are being met.
		A formal communication from the Executive Director, HR will be sent, as a follow-up/reminder, to all staff, in June 2011.
008	The Executive Director of Human Resources direct all staff involved in the hiring process to ensure that there is an adequate level of documentation in all hiring files to support hiring decisions. Such documentation is critical in any potential hiring dispute.	The Director, Strategic Recruitment, Compensation & Employment Services and the Managers, Strategic Recruitment & Employment Services, discussed on several occasion in 2010, the results of the AG's review on the hiring process, and each manager then addressed the recommendations with their staff, to ensure that the recommendations are being met.

City Divisions
<b>Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented</b>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
		A formal communication from the Executive Director, HR will be sent, as a follow-up/reminder, to all staff, in June 2011.
010	The Executive Director of Human Resources direct all staff to ensure that a fully executed copy of the current employment agreement is obtained and retained in the employee's Corporate human resources file.	The Director, Strategic Recruitment, Compensation & Employment Services and the Managers, Strategic Recruitment & Employment Services, discussed on several occasion in 2010, the results of the AG's review on the hiring process, and each manager then addressed the recommendations with their staff, to ensure that the recommendations are being met.
		A formal communication from the Executive Director, HR will be sent, as a follow-up/reminder, to all staff, in June 2011.
011	The Executive Director of Human Resources develop Corporate standards which requires the written evaluation of newly hired non- union City employees during the six-month probationary period.	HR staff are currently working on finalizing a tool to support management in implementing this recommendation. To be completed in spring, 2011.
012	The Executive Director of Human Resources develop a hiring benchmark to measure the time required to complete the hiring process for non-union employees and monitor the performance of each hiring unit against the established benchmark. The Division	A hiring benchmark was established in 2005, and results of the AG's review in 2009 demonstrated that the City was meeting this target for internal job competitions (which, on average, were concluded within 69 days) but not for external competitions.
	evaluate the current hiring process to determine where "bottlenecks" in the process occur. Steps be taken to address these areas.	A hiring slow-down, which began in late 2009, has impacted the ability to revisit benchmarks for external recruitment and evaluate performance and progress in achieving these benchmarks. Notwithstanding the above, the HR division has undertaken the development of a divisional strategic plan. One of the priority directions adopted is that HR practices be simple, fast and smart. The recruitment process is being reviewed to ensure that the process meets these objectives; where appropriate, new approaches will be adopted.
016	The City Manager forward this report to the City's Agencies, Boards and Commissions. Further, the City Manager request that relevant recommendations contained in this report be implemented.	Human Resources is working with the Strategic and Corporate Policy Division to determine how best to approach this recommendation.

Division: Information & Technology

Report Title: Review of Information Technology Training

Report Date: 05/11/2009

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and
		Action Plan/Time Frame
002	The City Manager ensure divisional learning plans are prepared as required by the City "People Plan" and submitted to the Information and Technology Division.	HR division has provided the attached spreadsheet titled " <i>People Plan- Baseline Performance Measures</i> ". HR has also facilitated workshops in Sept 2010 to inform I&T Client Relationship Management teams how to assist divisions in their development of divisional learning plans.
		HR will encourage all divisions to submit their divisional learning plans and will provide training to the divisions, I&T Training Unit and Client Relationship Management Teams to enable I&T's ability to support divisions in the development of their IT learning requirements.
		Completion date: Dec. 2011
003	The City Manager review the evaluation process relating to the effectiveness of Information and Technology training particularly in regards to the impact of enterprise-wide information and technology training for on-the-job performance as well as its impact on the City as a whole	HR is working with I&T Training & Education unit to facilitate intact team training on Evaluation process. The evaluation of I & T training's impact on the City as a whole should form part of the performance indicator development exercise in #004. This should be jointly considered with I & T when its training evaluation process is reviewed and for their implementation in Dec. 2011.
		Completion date: Dec. 2011
004	The Chief Information Officer develop performance indicators to measure the efficiency and effectiveness of the Information and Technology Training and Education Unit and training courses provided by the Unit.	Current key performance indicators (KPIs) are already in place: # of courses offered, # of classes scheduled, # of classes delivered, attendance rate, training participants' feedback, I&T Client Satisfaction survey. The interim e-registration function for IT Training targeted for fall 2011 will provide further KPI on IT Training unit's efficiency.
		The overall efficiency and effectiveness KPIs for IT Training will be reviewed as part of the planned divisional IT Performance Measures which is targeted to be completed by Dec 2012 and will be part of the LMS project implementation.
		Completion date: Dec. 2012
005	The Executive Director, Human Resources Division ensure enterprise wide courses resulting in corporate wide benefit have priority when the on-line self service system is implemented	HR implemented a soft launch of an on-line self service system in February 2011 and an official launch in March 2011 (interim solution pending the eLearning Strategy recommendations). A post implementation review will be conducted prior to next steps taken. I&T

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and
		Action Plan/Time Frame
		has already started the implementation planning of the same e-registration function with specific requirements for IT training this fall for city staff to use in registering their IT training, leveraging the approach that HR used and migrate to the corporate Learning Management System (LMS) solution when it is implemented in HR as part of the eLearning (ELI) project.
		Completion date: Sep. 2011

# Report Title: Review of Disposal of Surplus IT Equipment - Security, Environmental and Financial Risks

Report Date: 02/05/2009

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
005	The Chief Information Officer ensure that receipts from the sale of equipment are reconciled to the actual equipment sold.	The Chief Information Officer shall implement a procedure to ensure that each item of surplus equipment destroyed is matched to an individual certificate of destruction. (The equipments serial number or other unique identifier will be utilized if/when present). Additionally the CIO will liaison with PMMD to clearly document Roles and Responsibilities as they pertain to the reconciliation process. Risk Management and Information Security (RMIS) will at a minimum perform reviews of the reconciliation on bi annual bases. We anticipate the above being in place by the end of Q3 2011

## Report Title: Integrated Business Management System (IBMS)

## Report Date: January 16, 2009

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
002	The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer require that divisions identify business risks relating to the IBMS Information Technology System. The Chief Information Officer review all such risks and ensure strategies and processes are in place to address all such risks.	The I&T Risk Management & Information Security group agreed to lead a project to address this issue via external consultants. Report and recommendations expected to be produced in Q4 2011 for review by the CIO and City Manager. Completion date: Q1 2012

City Divisions Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and
		Action Plan/Time Frame
003	The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer and divisions develop IBMS performance measures. Such measures be used to monitor ongoing performance. Where	IBMS User Group re-constituted and asked to address this issue. Initial response back to Steering Committee expected in Q2 2011. Initial Service Level Agreement (SLA) will not include this response.
	performance does not meet such measures, corrective action be taken.	Assumption is that the recommendations may (but not definitely) require significant system changes.
		Completion date: Q4 2012
004	The City Manager and Chief Information Officer as part of the IBMS governance process give priority to the development of IBMS business continuity plans. Such plans should include disaster and recovery planning.	The I&T Division (led by the RM&IS Section) is in the process of planning for the implementation of a Business Continuity Plan / Disaster Recovery Plan (BCP/DRP) for the I&T Division. The DRP portion, when implemented, will provide the ability to support divisional BCP/DRP requirements. Recent 2010 budget cuts have severely limited enhancements to divisional disaster recovery solutions for 2-3 years. Completion date: Q4 2013
005	The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer develop and formalize service level agreements for information technology services provided to City Divisions by the Information and Technology Division.	SLA expected to be completed in Q2 2011 for Municipal Licensing & Standards (MLS) and Toronto Building (TB). City Planning scheduled for completion in Q4 2011. Completion date: Q2 2011
007	The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer develop and implement a change management protocol for IBMS. Such a protocol take into account the SAP change management protocol.	Updated Change Management (CM) protocols originally planned for January 2011 to align with change in IBMS support protocols to support SLA and CM. Insufficient funding for new support protocols so CM plan being reviewed again. Protocols to be submitted for approval to the Steering Committee in Q2 2011. Completion date: Q2 2011

City Divisions Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and
		Action Plan/Time Frame
009	The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer be required to conduct periodic reviews of current IBMS user security to ensure access is compatible with user roles. Such review should also include an analysis of the last date of use. Dormant users should be eliminated from system access.	<ul> <li>a) A review of user profiles and roles by the IBMS User Group and other divisional designates will be done every two years beginning in 2011;</li> <li>b) Every quarter, all users that have not logged in within the prior six months are contacted along with their manager. If they do not login within two weeks, their account is disabled;</li> </ul>
	eliminated nom system access.	c) The IBMS team receives a monthly report from Human Resources outlining staff changes in the three primary user divisions as well as PPFA and the DCM "B" office. This information is used to disable or modify accounts.
		Completion date: Q4, 2011.
011	The City Manager and Chief Information Officer develop as a priority an electronic interface between IBMS and the City's SAP Financial System. Such an interface	PPFA is working with MLS and TB to update business procedures so this link can be implemented. Testing of I&T work ongoing. Expected to go live in Q3 2011.
	would reduce the requirement for manual analysis and processing	Completion date: Q2 2011
013	The Chief Information Officer obtain a copy of the System source code for the current release of the System software and ensure future releases are accompanied with System software under the terms of the agreement.	Ongoing negotiations with the vendor on this issue as well as Legal, Contract Management Office and the Risk Management and Information Security team within I&T. Resolution expected in Q3 2011. I&T is also reviewing source code escrow policies at
		an enterprise level.
		Completion date: Q4 2011
014	The City Manager conduct a review of related System users in the City and its Agencies, Boards and Commissions and update the existing software maintenance contract as required.	New CMO lead for this contract is planning to initiate contract review process in Q2 2011. Completion date: Q4 2011
015	The City Manager ensure staff from business units perform the procedure for revising service fees maintained in IBMS and that the process be appropriately documented.	There are many potential components of the Fee revision process – Fee rate, Effective Date, Fee Category and Subcategory, Service unit (e.g. Sq metre; per hour; each item), related legislation, minimum and maximum.
		Procedures are established for IBMS fee revisions and they continue to evolve and will be formalized as a policy with PPFA and IBMS divisions prior to the next round of fee increases.
		Completion date: Q4, 2011.

## Report Title: Disaster Recovery Planning for City Computer Facilities

Report Date: March 3, 2008

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and
		Action Plan/Time Frame
002	The City Manager implement a disaster recovery and business continuity program that includes divisional roles and responsibilities, resource and training requirements, and simulation and plan maintenance schedules.	The Disaster Recovery program has been initiated. The Tiffield Data Centre is operational with core IT infrastructure in place, and IT services such as Internet, email, SAN storage, etc. recoverable in the event of a disaster to Don Mills data centre.
		The function of DR/BCP strategy is now assigned to the newly established (2009) Manager, Risk Management & Information Security (RM&IS). It was determined that a review of the current DR strategy, plus the development of a BCP program would be developed with consulting assistance. An RFP was issued in 2010 and work commenced in Q1, 2011.
		Completion date: Q3 2011
005	The Chief Information Officer review the backup and storage procedures of City information technology units for:	The I&T Division currently backs up its data on a nightly basis and sends the backup media offsite daily to an external storage provider.
	<ul> <li>(a) compliance with acceptable standards and practices for data backup and storage requirements; and</li> </ul>	RM&IS will review the backup and storage procedures of City information technology units with a view towards compliance with acceptable standards and practices for data backup and storage requirements.
		Completion Date: December 31, 2011
	(b) provide divisions with the opportunity to participate in existing data storage arrangements within the City or with the outside service provider.	Divisions currently using I&T's external offsite data storage provider are Policy, Planning, Finance & Administration & Toronto Public Health. Other divisions have been able to participate since the completion of the IT
		Transformation process. Q2 2010.
		The I&T Division Disaster Recovery Plan currently promotes the use of Storage Area Network (SAN)-to- SAN replication between data centres as a real-time, high-availability alternative to reliance on tape backups for disaster recovery. SAN-SAN replication has been tested for Oracle databases, Unix volumes, and Netware volumes, and has been awaiting reliable high-speed network bandwidth before continuing implementation for critical data. SAN archiving with data de-duplication is a complementary technology

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and
		Action Plan/Time Frame
		which is being explored to further reduce reliance on tape-based backup technology. High-speed network bandwidth is expected in Q1-2 2011.
		Completion date: Q4, 2011
006	The City Manager, in consultation with the	As noted in Management Response #002, the I&T
	Chief Information Officer, direct divisions to test information technology disaster recovery plans on a regular basis.	Division (lead by the RM&IS Section) is in the process of planning for the
		implementation of a Business Continuity Plan /
		Disaster Recovery Plan (BCP/DRP) for the I&T
		Division. The DRP portion, when implemented, will provide the ability to support divisional BCP/DR requirements. Recent 2010 budget cuts have severely limited enhancements to divisional disaster recovery solutions for 2-3 years.
		Completion date: Q4, 2013
007	The Chief Information Officer develop disaster recovery testing guidelines and provide training necessary to ensure cross-	Guidelines have been created for testing the I&T Division Disaster Recovery program.
	divisional consistency.	The ability to fulfill this requirement is linked to the completion of the BCP/DR project. (Being lead by RMIS). Once completed we will be in a position to accommodate the expansion of scope required to support divisional BCP/DRP requirements.
		Completion date: Q4, 2013

## Report Title: Internet Access Review

Report Date: July 31, 2007

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
002	The Chief Information Officer, in consultation with the Executive Director of Human Resources Division and the City Solicitor, implement systematic Internet usage monitoring for compliance with the City's Acceptable Use Policy, including:	October 22-23, 2007.Council directed the Chief Information Officer to undertake a Feasibility Study to explore the impacts of Recommendation 2. July 2008-October 2008. Results of the feasibility study highlighted both the significant labour effort and the expected increase on the I&T Division's operating budget if the I&T Division was to proceed.
		These consultations and the feasibility study results

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
		were included in the Response to Employee Internet Usage Review Staff Report which was received for information at the Government Management Committee on October 23, 2008.
		IT further obtained Legal services' opinion on January 21, 2009 regarding a proposal to continuously monitor employee Internet use.
	a. developing criteria for Internet use that may not be in compliance with the policy, particularly relating to Internet time, bandwidth usage and visits or attempts to visit inappropriate sites;	<ul> <li>(a) IT website displays a list of blocked site categories. Social network/Media guidelines now in place, signed off by the City Manager and implemented in Q3 2010.</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>b. utilizing appropriate analysis tools to generate exception reports identifying users with Internet activity deemed to be inappropriate according to established criteria;</li> </ul>	(b) Appropriate tools are in place and internet activity exception reports are generated on request. I&T has established 2 thresholds - top 10 categories and top 10 web sites visited by web users. New monitoring thresholds and associated procedures based on Legal's opinions and recommendations will be established.
	<ul> <li>providing Divisional management with detailed reports and technical support to facilitate review of apparent violations of the City's Acceptable Use Policy;</li> </ul>	enterprise configuration level. In order to comply with the Acceptable Use Policy, the
	<ul> <li>d. establishing written procedures outlining the types and frequency of management reports on Internet usage and the responsibility for review and follow-up of such reports; and</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>(d) The I&amp;T Division supports the recommendation of Legal Services. Procedures or governance are being addressed at this time and are targeted for completion at the end of the Q1 2012.</li> </ul>
	e. communicating to all City staff reiterating the City's Acceptable Use Policy, clarifying the responsibility of the City and users, and advising of the procedures in place to monitor compliance with the Policy.	(e) Systems Monitoring is already available under the Acceptable Use Policy which is published on the city intranet.

## Report Title: Management of City Information Technology Assets

## Report Date: January 26, 2006

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
005	The Chief Corporate Officer, subsequent to the implementation of the Enterprise Information Technology Management System, be required to coordinate periodic asset inventory counts. Any inaccuracies discovered during the inventory count be investigated and appropriate adjustments made accordingly, subject to supervisory review and approval.	Current inventory review is underway for desktop hardware and other hardware currently being tracked in Maximo. Discrepancies are being investigated and corrected. A complete plan for software asset management is under development and will include a process to ensure all City software (Corporate and Divisions) is captured and verified. Completion date: Q4 2012

## Report Title: Telecommunication Services Review

#### Report Date: January 31, 2005

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
009	The Commissioner, Corporate Services, in consultation with the service providers, ensure that an appropriate level of cellular telephone billing information is provided to all departments. Departments ensure that controls are in place for the recovery of non- business related calls;	Cellular telephone billing information is provided to Divisions on as requested basis. The Telecom Expense Management System (TEMS) has been implemented to validate all service providers' billing. Cellular billing information will be provided to all Divisions.
		Policies have been published regarding divisional responsibility for recovering costs for personal use of land line and cellular phone calls in February 2009 and is reviewed annually with the Divisions. Completion Date: Q3-2011

Division:	Parks, Forestry & Recreation
Report Title:	Parks, Forestry and Recreation – Capital Program – The Backlog in Needed Repairs Continues to Grow

Report Date: January 23, 2009

No.		Recommendation	Management's Comments and
			Action Plan/Time Frame
001	The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, develop a comprehensive master service and infrastructure plan, incorporating the Division's "Our Common Grounds" strategy and all related studies being developed or planned pertaining to parks and recreation facilities, and report to the Community Development and Recreation Committee by June 30, 2010. Such master plan to include, but not limited to:		The implementation of this recommendation is in progress. Expected completion by December 2011.
	a.	specific action plans, timelines and responsibility for implementation	
	b.	estimated costs and potential funding sources or partnership opportunities to be explored	
	C.	reporting on the status of the master implementation plan as part of the annual capital budget submission.	
002		e General Manager, Parks, Forestry and creation, take appropriate steps to	
	a.	develop criteria for determining when a City facility is considered to be no longer cost-effective to maintain, taking into consideration such factors as utilization, ongoing operating and capital maintenance costs, location, and proximity to other facilities, community impact and changing demographics	Currently in place. Capital projects are reviewed by PF&R Branches to ensure they are still applicable. Recreation Service Plan and the Parks Plan will provide further support in determining and confirming facilities and infrastructure priorities.
	b.	where practical, incorporate the criteria developed into the capital asset management system	In place.

City Divisions		
<b>Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented</b>		

No.	Recommendation		Management's Comments and	
			Action Plan/Time Frame	
	C.	compile a comprehensive inventory of all facilities that are no longer cost- effective to maintain based on criteria developed in (a.)	The Capital Projects Section has developed the PRIORITY RANK FACTOR (PCR) which drives the state of good repair project priority in the Capital Asset Management (CAMP) budget. Each project listed in the CAMP budget is assigned a PCR. The PCR is the sum of the various rankings applied to each asset that include the FACILITY CONDITION INDEX (FCI), PRIORITY FACTOR (PF) and RANK FACTOR (RF).	
	d.	identify opportunities for consolidation of operations within existing facilities or potential new ones and recommend facility closures, if warranted	In progress, pending the completion of the Recreation Service Plan in 2011.	
	e.	determine the full financial implications of either maintaining, enhancing or closing facilities, including any potential program changes resulting from each option	In progress, pending the completion of the Recreation Service Plan in 2011.	
	f.	where a facility closure is recommended, develop alternate accommodation for viable affected programs	In progress, pending the completion of the Recreation Service Plan in 2011.	
	g.	conduct appropriate community consultations of any planned actions.	In progress, pending the completion of the Recreation Service Plan in 2011.	
003	dev wid rep Aud "Ma Rev Sep frar	e City Manager give priority to the velopment and implementation of a City- le prioritization framework for capital airs, as previously recommended in an ditor General's report entitled aintenance and Administrative Controls view – Facilities and Real Estate" dated otember 2005. Further, the priority nework be enhanced by including all new bital projects.	A standardized City-wide capital project prioritization framework/tools/matrix has been developed by FPD, as detailed in the City's Capital Budget and Plan Submission Guidelines and Instruction Manual (Capital Manual), to ensure that the highest priority and best capital expenditure alternatives are selected and that these capital investment decisions are integrated with the City's strategic plans. While standardized ranking tools have been developed and are available for use by City Programs,	
			it has not been mandated that they be used to rank projects.	

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and
		Action Plan/Time Frame
		The intention to fully implementing the New and Expansion Ranking as part of the 2012 Capital Budget Process has been delayed due to work pressure associated with the Service Review Program which will help determine Core Services and may redefine capital priorities. Full implementation will begin with the 2013 Capital Budget and Plan development.
005	The City Manager, review the funding allocation between state of good repair projects and service improvement or growth- related projects, both at the division and city- wide levels, and take appropriate steps to develop a sustainable long-term strategy to reduce the current and projected state of good repair backlog.	Corporately FPD, as part of the 10-year capital budget process, reviews all City Programs and ABCs asset inventory and assess the allocation of funds between service improvements / growth and state-of-good- repair spending and backlog. The Capital Budget and Plan Submission Guidelines and Instructions Section E, Asset Inventory and SOGR Backlog section require all City Programs and ABCs to work with FPD to develop an asset inventory and state-of-good- repair backlog strategy to assist them in meeting unmet capital maintenance needs.
		The City Manager and CFO, as part of the Administrative Budget Review process, reviews the funding allocations between state-of-good-repair projects and service improvements or growth-related projects.
		With regards to Backlog, there is a generous amount of information in the FPD Analyst Notes on the 2011 - 2020 Capital Budget and Plan. Note that all the analyst notes are posted on the City's Website. In addition, we do provide a corporate summary on Backlog (see Section titled "State of Good repair (SOGR) Backlog) in the Corporate Budget Summary Report that goes to Council, which is available on the City's Website.
		During the CM and CFO reviews of each City Program and Agency Capital Budget, emphasis is always placed on the allocation of funding between SOGR and Growth; as well as on the SOGR and SOGR Backlog trends during the 10-year term. You will note in the very first two Tables of the Analyst Notes attached and discussion in the section "State of Good Repair (SOGR) Backlog, the significant focus placed on SOGR and SOGR-Backlog.

City Divisions		
<b>Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented</b>		

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and
		Action Plan/Time Frame
		As yet, a formal "sustainable long-term strategy" has not been developed. This will be done as part of the 2013 Capital Budget and Planning Process.
007	The City Manager, in consultation with the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation and the Director, Toronto Office of Partnerships, develop, for approval by Council, a comprehensive City-wide policy on naming rights and other private funding arrangements, such policy to	In progress. Toronto Office of Partnerships has been directed by Budget Committee to report to Executive Committee March 2011 a report with proposed policies on sponsorship and naming rights for the purpose of revenue generation.
	a. consider all existing policies related to:	
	i. Parks and Recreation Naming and Renaming Policy	In progress. Will be included in the Corporate Naming Policy, if adopted by Council.
	ii. Donations policy	Donations Policy currently exists.
	iii. Advertising	The current Corporate Policy on advertising deals with the purchase of advertising and not selling. It is not part of the Sponsorship or Naming Rights policies going before Executive Committee, March 2011. However, following approval of these policies by Council, amendments to the policy on advertising will follow.
	iv. Unsolicited bids	A policy on unsolicited proposals currently exists as does a Corporate process.
	v. Sponsorships and partnerships	In progress. Toronto Office of Partnerships has been directed by Budget Committee to report to Executive Committee March 2011 a report with proposed policies on sponsorship and naming rights for the purpose of revenue generation.
	b. include guidelines on	
	<ul> <li>eligibility criteria for facilities to be considered for naming rights</li> </ul>	Following the adoption of a naming rights policy by Council, eligibility criteria will be established in consultation with operating Divisions.
	ii. responsibility and control processes for securing and accepting naming rights or other private funding arrangements	Following the adoption of a naming rights policy by Council, control processes for securing and accepting naming rights or other private funding will be established.

City Divisions		
<b>Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented</b>		

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and
		Action Plan/Time Frame
	<li>iii. the creation of endowment, or similar funds, to offset future maintenance and repair costs for new facilities put in place under this policy.</li>	In progress. Parks, Forestry and Recreation, and The Toronto Office of Partnerships are currently looking at the possibility of endowment/maintenance funds for new parks.
008	The Director, Toronto Office of Partnerships, in consultation with appropriate divisional staff, identify all potential projects and facilities that may benefit from naming rights or other private funding arrangements and, with the approval of Council, pursue such funding according to corporate guidelines.	Following the adoption of a naming rights policy by Council, the Toronto Office of Partnerships will consult with appropriate divisional staff to identify potential projects and facilities that could benefit from naming rights, and with the approval of Council, pursue funding according to Corporate guidelines.
009	The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, give priority to completing the development and implementation of the work order system for Parks, Forestry and Recreation Division to provide the tracking of both operating and capital costs of each facility.	In progress. Capital budget request to build on the existing systems and inventory and develop a PF&R Work Order Management System.
010	The City Clerk, in consultation with the City Solicitor, clarify Council procedures with respect to recommendations at Community Councils on matters that are contrary to Council policy, and consider requiring that such recommendations state explicitly that a Council policy is being contravened.	Completed. City Clerk has revised training materials to clarify procedures and to emphasize options for City officials to bring information to Council's attention.

Division: Real Estate Services

## Report Title: Review of the Administration of Leases on City Owned Property

Report Date: July 8, 2006

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
002	The City Manager, at the conclusion of the review of the governance structure relating to the City's property maintenance program, give consideration to how the recommendations resulting from the governance review may have relevance to the management of the City's lease portfolio.	The implications of the recommendations are currently being considered. It is expected that the implementation will be complete by June 2011.
No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
-----	--	--
019	The City Manager ensure that eligibility reviews conducted for below-market tenants include, where practical, a site visit and a review of other required documentation such as the lease agreement and financial statements. Evidence of completion of the eligibility review, including copies of documentation, should be retained in the lease file.	<ul> <li>The eligibility review for organizations who occupy city-owned space at below-market rent has the following components: <ul> <li>Site Visit</li> <li>Eligibility Review</li> <li>Review of financial information</li> <li>Organizational Assessment</li> </ul> </li> <li>Documentation also includes application information, eligibility and assessment checklists, audited financial statements, and the organization's letters patent.</li> <li>The internal process related to the lease renewals as well as new lease negotiations has been jointly developed by Legal, SDF&amp;A, PF&amp;R, EDF&amp;A, and F&amp;RE divisions. It ensures that the copies of relevant documentation are available in the lease file.</li> </ul>

### Division: Revenue Services

## Report Title: Controls Over Parking Tags Need Strengthening

Report Date: 27/01/2010

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
002	The Treasurer review the practices currently adopted by 407 International Inc. in connection with the collection of out-of- province receivables. Such a review also include the practices of other jurisdictions. Further, the Treasurer review the potential use of collection agencies. If required, requests for amendments to provincial legislation be made in order to facilitate the collection of out-of-province receivables.	Staff met with representatives from 407 ETR on October 7 <sup>th</sup> , 2010 to discuss best practices and collection issues related to out-of-province vehicles. The 407 ETR utilizes a private collection agency to pursue out-of-province offenders. Staff is now pursuing an RFI to determine the feasibility of contracting with private firms to assist with collection of out-of-province vehicles. Completed by: March 2011
004	The Treasurer, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, review the potential of automating certain aspects of the documentation requirement process as it pertains to pre-court filing documents and request for trials. Such a process should be conducted in consultation with the City Solicitor in order to ensure that the automation of certain processes is not contrary to legislation and, if required, amendment to the provincial legislation be	At present, changes to the <i>Provincial Offences Act</i> are required to allow pre-court filing and request for trial processes to be automated. The Province has advised that with the recent enactment of the <i>Good</i> <i>Government Act</i> , their work plan for 2011 is focused entirely on implementing changes stemming from these legislative amendments. Staff will continue to pursue automation; however, changes are not expected before 2012 or beyond. Completed by: Dec 2012

City Divisions
<b>Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented</b>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	requested.	
007	The Treasurer review the current plate denial process. Such a review take place in consultation with the Ministry of Transportation and focus on the reasons why significant receivables continue to be outstanding beyond the two-year licence plate renewal period. Improvements identified be implemented in order to maximize the effectiveness of the plate denial system	Staff have contacted the Ministry of the Attorney General's Office (MAG), Defaulted Fines Control Centre regarding this issue. MAG staff advised that due to current workload, a meeting could not occur until early 2011. As such, City of Toronto staff are awaiting a meeting date from MAG and will follow up in early 2011. Completed by: Dec 2012
009	The Treasurer review the possibility of providing collection agencies with specific information including the names and addresses of individuals and companies with outstanding parking tags. Amendments to provincial legislation be requested, if required	Current legislation and the terms of the Ministry of Transportation's Authorized Requestor Agreement prevents the City of Toronto, and all other municipalities in Ontario, from sharing or providing name and address information obtained from the Ministry of Transportation to any third party, including collection agencies. In order to do, changes to the <i>Provincial Offences Act</i> and the City's Agreement are required. Discussions are continuing with the Province (Supervisor, Defaulted Fines Control Centre) Completed by: Dec 2012
014	The Treasurer develop and implement a formal access control and review process. A review of user access should occur periodically and unauthorized users deleted from the authorized user list.	Underway. Revenue Services will be implementing formal access control and review process to control access to the Parking Ticket Management System (PTMS), including periodic reviews to identify and prevent access by unauthorized users of the system by March 2011.
		Completed by: Apr 2011

## Report Title: Payment of Utility Charges

Report Date: December 11, 2009

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
002	The Deputy City Manager & Chief Financial Officer develop a control framework to ensure the cost effective administration of hydro and natural gas invoice payments. Such framework should include, but not be limited to the following:	
	a. a clear definition of the roles and	Fully implemented

City Divisions
<b>Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented</b>

No.		Recommendation	Management's Comments and
			Action Plan/Time Frame
		responsibilities of the Accounts Payable Unit, the Energy and Waste Management Office and City divisional managers. The roles and responsibilities to include areas such as processing hydro and natural gas invoices, including following up on billing exceptions, dispute resolution and	EWMO has instituted a process whereby roles and responsibilities have been clearly identified, specifying that EWMO will review all hydro and gas bills to ensure correctness and follow up on billing exceptions. The resulting framework has been distributed to all division heads
		reporting protocols, as required	Under implementation
	b.	the establishment of protocols for effecting and reporting on energy	The process for metering changes - including new
		metering changes, including new meter account set ups, de-activations, replacements, relocations and record keeping requirements	meter account set ups and de-activations- has been documented and distributed to all division heads. Local distribution companies have been notified that all metering changes are now processed by EWMO.
			The challenges faced by EWMO include that it takes time for division staff to adopt the change in process and also, that it has been difficult to have a single divisional contact appointed by every division to deal with utility-related matters.
			The contingency plan to make the process work includes the following:
			<ul> <li>Changes to the "Utility Account Form" have been implemented as per AG's recommendations. A contact person from EWMO has been identified on the form to make it easier for divisions to contact EWMO with questions or concerns.</li> </ul>
			<ul> <li>Make the new process and new "Utility Account Form" attached to it widely known and available: The process and form will be posted on the intranet under "EWMO" and it will be announced as part of the "Monday News" email.</li> </ul>
			<ul> <li>Follow up on the request for divisions to appoint a single contact for utility-related matters.</li> </ul>
			To be completed in 2011
	c.	procedures for ensuring ongoing verification of hydro charges relating to street lighting by a staff person familiar	90% Implemented Quarterly spot checks have been done and
		with the operations	documented for two accounts for verification of hydro charges related to street lighting.

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and
		Action Plan/Time Frame
		As per AG's recommendations, the accounts that are checked need to be rotated. Rotation will start with the next quarterly spot check. The need for rotation has been incorporated into the Framework.
		To be completed in 2011
		Under implementation
	<ul> <li>reporting requirements for the Energy and Waste Management Office to communicate energy consumption fluctuations for divisional follow-up as required.</li> </ul>	EWMO is currently developing a standard divisional energy report to be sent periodically. The different divisional structures and needs encountered in the City pose a challenge when it comes to developing a meaningful and concise report.
		As stated in recommendation 2b, EWMO will follow up with divisions to have a divisional contact appointed for all utility-related matters, including revision of energy reports.
		As per AG's recommendation, once the report is developed and divisional contacts have been appointed, EWMO will educate report-recipients on how to read and make use of the energy reports.
		To be completed in 2011
003	The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer review and make appropriate revisions to Accounting Services' Cost Centre Billing Procedure to include the revised utility payment control framework	Draft Interface Cost Centre Billing Procedure, for Utilities completed February 7, 2011. To be completed by March 31, 2011.
004	The Executive Director of Facilities & Real Estate Division take appropriate steps to ensure the Energy and Waste Management Office maintains a complete and accurate database on all hydro and natural gas meters billable to City divisions. The database be updated as required.	Under Implementation The process was initiated in 2010. Modifications and updates - <u>to be completed in 2011</u> .
006	The Executive Director of Facilities & Real	Under Implementation
	Estate Division take necessary steps to complete, on a sample basis, ongoing	This activity will be completed in 2011.
	recalculations of major hydro and natural gas bills for accuracy and consider using the	The TTC application has been reviewed. After a close look it was established that it wouldn't be practical for

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and
		Action Plan/Time Frame
	specific software currently used by the TTC	the City to use the same one (the maintenance of the application requires a knowledgeable programmer to make changes and update various parameters).
		EWMO has created a simpler spreadsheet to do quarterly spot check recalculation of major electricity and natural gas accounts.
		Recalculation is already being done.
007	The Executive Director of Facilities & Real Estate Division to ensure that identified energy billing anomalies are promptly analyzed and satisfactorily resolved with the provider on a timely basis. Further, a system be developed to track outstanding refund requests.	Under Implementation Billing anomalies are currently being identified and reported to the provider by EWMO as documented in the Framework. The system to track outstanding refund reports will be completed in 2011.
008	The Executive Director of the Facilities & Real Estate Division take appropriate steps to expedite enrolment in the consolidated billing services plan all hydro invoices, and request from Toronto Hydro data in a format that facilitates input to the Energy and Waste Management Office's energy meter database.	Under implementation Enrolment in the consolidated billing program has been documented and implemented. A new consolidated billing service provider has been selected by EWMO to start in June, therefore, establishment of a ready-to work data format is under discussion and it hasn't been fully defined yet.
		Definition of a data format that will allow EWMO to streamline the uploading process will be completed in 2011

**City Divisions Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented** 

## Report Title: Hostel Operations Review – Community and Neighbourhood Services

Report Date: June 20, 2004

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
017	the Commissioner, Community and Neighbourhood Services, review the Out of the Cold Program, with a view to:	Will be addressed through 2012 budget process.
	<ul> <li>(a) evaluating the costs and benefits of the program;</li> </ul>	
	(b) reporting to the Community and Neighbourhood Services Committee, together with a recommendation on the future direction of the program both in the short-term and the long-term based on the evaluation; and	

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	<ul> <li>(c) in the interim, provide clear direction as to how the program fits into the overall City shelter system, including:</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>the City's role in the provision of the support services by the agency running the program; and</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>(ii) the City's role in the provision of emergency shelter services by the participating community organizations, particularly with respect to the applicability of the City's Shelter Standards to these organizations;</li> </ul>	
018	the Commissioner, Community and Neighbourhood Services, assess the reliability of the financial information in the Hostel Utilization System currently used by the City-operated shelters and ensure that any information that is required to be carried forward to the new Shelter Management Information System, currently under development, is complete and accurate;	SMIS Financial pilot implemented. Full roll out anticipated June 16 of 2011.
024	the Commissioner, Community and Neighbourhood Services, develop a policy that clearly establishes standard rates for maintenance fees for emergency shelter users. Such policies determine at what income levels maintenance fees become due. The policy be applied consistently to both City-operated and purchased service shelters. Internal controls commensurate with the level of fees collected be established.	Will be addressed through the 2012 budget process.

#### Division: Technical Services

#### Report Title: Management of Construction Contracts – Leaside Bridge Structure Rehabilitation Contract

#### Report Date: March 23, 2007

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
009	The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer consider the implementation of a policy for the recovery of	To be completed by the end of 2011.

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	administration fees relating to the management of contracts by the City on behalf of third parties. Such a policy be included in the Technical Services Capital Works Projects Procurement and Administration Procedures Manual.	Action Plan/Time Frame A set of third party cost recovery procedures was developed in 2007 and included in the Technical Services Capital Works Projects Procurement and Administration Procedures Manual. The Executive Director of Technical Services also issued a memo on May 10, 2007 reminding staff to follow the procedures. In his memo dated December 22, 2010, the Executive Director of Technical Services proposed a third party engineering fee structure and a cost recovery policy to the Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer. Technical Services will continue to collaborate with the
		Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer, on finalizing the fees recovery policy and seek Council approval in 2011.

#### Division: Toronto Water

# Report Title: Toronto Protecting Water Quality and Preventing Pollution – Assessing the Effectiveness of the City's Sewer Use By-law

#### Report Date: October 10, 2008

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
004	The General Manager, Toronto Water review inspection and sampling targets to ensure that they are reasonable given risks to pollute and the staff resources available and report to City Council by September 2009 on recommended targets and resources required to meet those targets.	Toronto Water initiated an internal program review that included reviewing the inspection and sampling targets identified in its operational practice along with a re- organization in late 2008. In efforts to continue to gain efficiency, TW reviewed the EM&P workload yearly since 2008 to determine where improvements can be achieved. In 2010 a re-alignment of workload was implemented. TW is assessing its re-alignment and the revisions to sampling and inspection metrics made in 2009 and early 2011.
		Completed by: 2012

City Divisions
<b>Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented</b>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
006	The General Manager, Toronto Water develops and implement tailored inspection checklists for certain industries to ensure that industry specific risks are addressed on a consistent basis.	A new annual streamlined inspection form was developed and approved for use by staff in 2 <sup>nd</sup> Quarter of 2009. Automotive template has been completed and in use. Existing dental template is in use. In 2010, an inspection report template was developed and finalized for use in restaurant sector inspections. Other sector inspection reports will be drafted and for implementation in 2012 at the latest.
007	The General Manager, Toronto Water, in consultation with the City Legal Division, reassess the City's authority to enforce the implementation of pollution prevention plans. Should it be determined that no such authority exists, the General Manager consider whether seeking such authority is necessary.	Toronto Water consulting with Legal Services. Completed by: 2012
010	<ul> <li>The General Manager, Toronto Water, develop criteria and procedures to guide the review and approval of pollution prevention plans including verification of the accuracy of the plan by:</li> <li>comparing the plan to recent sampling results;</li> <li>comparing the current plan to the previous plan to determine whether targets for reducing pollutants were being met; and</li> <li>requesting companies to provide supporting documentation with their pollution prevention plans.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Action, if any, to be taken with respect to this recommendation will be dependent upon the results of Legal Services review of the City's authority to enforce the implementation of the pollution prevention plans.</li> <li>Toronto Water is already comparing pollution prevention plans to current sample results routinely for larger industries.</li> <li>As of 2010 3<sup>rd</sup> Quarter, TW requires updated P2 plans from companies discharging Subject Pollutants that were not previously noted in P2 Plans or where sampled discharge levels were found higher than reported in previous P2 Plans</li> <li>Completed by: 2012</li> </ul>
014	The General Manager, Toronto Water, assess the feasibility of using infraction notices to enforce the Sewer Use By-law.	Toronto Water in discussion with Legal Services. Toronto Water amended the Sewers Bylaw in July 2010 to allow issuance of "Orders to Discontinue Activity and Comply". The Orders were utilized in 2010 following the amendment and in 2011. Completed by: 2012

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
021	The General Manager, Toronto Water Division, in consultation with the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards Division, and the City Solicitor, review areas where reciprocal inspections between the two divisions would be possible and if appropriate, establish a written protocol governing such inspections.	Toronto Water continued discussions with staff from the Municipal Licensing and Standards Division to review potential for reciprocal inspections. TW and MLS conducted joint special inspections. Also, referrals between both Divisions occurred in 2010.
		Completed by: 2012
022	The General Manager, Toronto Water, prior to the development or acquisition of any new work management system, re-evaluate in detail all reporting requirements relating to inspection, sampling and enforcement activities. Such an evaluation be conducted in concert with all users. Further, development of any new system be required to incorporate detailed performance measurement reporting as well as the reporting requirements outlined in this report.	Toronto Water initiated the internal review in late 2007 and signed a contract with enfoTech Consultants (supplier of PACs EM&P Works Management System) for the development of a new web based application "iPACS". This version will be more user friendly and will have configurable reports and front end user screens. The application will provide EM&P management with more tools to monitor performance of the Unit.
	reporting requirements outlined in this report.	iPacs will be fully available by August 2011.

## Report Title: Toronto Water – Wastewater Treatment Phase Two

#### Report Date: September 21, 2007

No.		Recommendation		Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
001	The General Manager, Toronto Water Division, take appropriate steps to ensure compliance with the City's purchasing policies such as: (a) discontinue the practice of using DPOs		an de loc	part of the new service delivery model, purchasing d payables functions have been transferred to dicated PPFA staff that are now situated at various ations across the division to provide support to ronto Water on a full time basis.
	(4)	for repetitive purchases where the use of a blanket contract would be more appropriate;	a.	Process is in place to establish blanket contracts where warranted.
	(b)	ensure that DPOs are prepared prior to ordering goods and services;	b.	Practice is in place and overseen by dedicated PPFA staff.
	(C)	ensure that three quotes are obtained where required;	c.	Practice is in place and overseen by dedicated PPFA staff.
	(d)	discontinue the practice of splitting DPOs to keep the purchase amount below the maximum of \$7,500 for a DPO or below the \$3,000 limit for three quotes; and	d.	Policy communicated to front line managers and supervisors. PPFA staff will provide oversight.

City Divisions
<b>Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented</b>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and
		Action Plan/Time Frame
	<ul> <li>(e) take steps to identify areas of continued non compliance and impose an appropriate discipline for non compliance with City policies.</li> </ul>	e. PPFA staff to report where DPO splitting is suspected and disciplinary action to be taken.
		See attached "Toronto Water Purchasing/Payable Process" and "Purchasing Decision Method Guideline".
008	The General Manager, Toronto Water Division, ensure that all staff involved in managing and developing contracts receive appropriate training to effectively carry out their responsibilities.	Administration of blanket contracts is now part of the service delivery model with dedicated PPFA support staff that have been trained to perform this function for Toronto Water.
		Further training to be developed.
		December 31, 2011
009	The General Manager, Toronto Water Division, require that supervisory staff with contract management responsibilities evaluate and document vendor performance both during a contract and at its conclusion.	A new Contractor Performance Evaluation process has been developed by Toronto Water and is currently being piloted in areas of Toronto Water and Technical Services. Discussions between Toronto Water, Legal Services and PMMD have been ongoing to decide how PMMD will take ownership of this evaluation process for all City divisions.
		See attached "Contractor Performance Evaluation Form", "Contractor Performance Evaluation Guidelines and Definitions" and "Contractor Performance Evaluation Pairwise Matrix".

#### Report Title: Management of Construction Contracts – Toronto Water and Sewer Emergency Repair Contracts

#### Report Date: July 30, 2007

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
014	The General Manager, Toronto Water, ensure contractor performance issues are consistently documented and monitored. Significant contractor performance issues that can not be resolved through the regular contract management process should be communicated to Purchasing and Materials Management for consideration in future contract award decisions.	The development of a Contractor Performance Evaluation tool has been completed. District Contract Services staff started to use the new evaluation tool in April, 2011. Implementation including training on use for all Toronto Water Project Managers will be completed by December 2011.

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
015	The General Manager, Toronto Water, expedite the review and assessment of existing work management systems, including an assessment of the SAP Plant Maintenance Module. Following the selection of a work management system, its implementation should be expedited and the cost benefits of its integration with SAP be	As a City E-Management initiative to align effort and resources to maximize efficiencies and to rationalize WMS applications spanning Cluster B, the City-wide Work Management Systems (WMS) Community of Practice committee was moved under the leadership of the corporate Information & Technology Division.
	evaluated.	Solid Waste Management, Transportation Services and Toronto Water are currently first for the review and recommendations for moving to fewer WMS applications are expected to be completed by December 2011.

# Report Title: Toronto Water – Wastewater Treatment Phase One

Report Date: July 16, 2007

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
008	<ul> <li>The General Manager, Toronto Water Division, ensure that:</li> <li>(a) divisional staff, independent of the payroll input process, review and verify the accuracy and completeness of payroll transactions; and</li> <li>(b) Toronto Water staff do not input their own payroll data into the payroll system.</li> </ul>	Except for the wastewater treatment plants, all other Toronto Water work locations have transferred the time keeping data entry activities to staff of the PPFA Division located at 505 Richmond Street. Due to PPFA staff hiring issues, the remaining locations are not expected to be completed until April 2011. Although some payroll data entry is still performed by Toronto Water staff, no individual inputs their own payroll data.
013	The General Manager, Toronto Water Division, require that an evaluation of the use of the work management system be conducted following implementation of the system at each plant location. In addition, timely action should be taken to correct problems that are identified during the evaluation process.	Currently, Toronto Water is implementing an Asset Reliability Improvement Program that included the re- build of the Works Management System. Corrective measures in all plants have been made and the implementation is approximately 70% completed. Weekly Conference Calls and SAP Staff Attendance data is reviewed and compared against system usage (samples attached). The system has had issues corrected and simplification initiatives have occurred for end users (samples of work effort attached related to the key areas for improvement). Performance metrics related to usage (work management) have recently been implemented (samples attached) and an audit will be conducted representing all plants targeted for August 2011. The target completion date for all plants using the new WMS set-up is July 2011.

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
015	The General Manager, Toronto Water Division, expedite the review and assessment of the existing work management systems and the SAP Plant Maintenance Module and consider the feasibility of creating an interface between the selected system and the SAP Financial Information system.	A City-wide Work Management Systems Community of Practice committee was created for this item to align effort and resources to maximize efficiencies. The group had several meetings in 2010 and reviewed the initiative to rationalize WMS applications spanning Cluster B. This effort was moved over to the WMS Community of Practices Working Group under City E- Business, a Corporate IT lead initiative (memo and presentation attached).
		Objective of the committee is to review and rationalize current work management systems, find potential cross-divisional efficiencies (including integration options to SAP financials) beneficial to the development of service plans and e-business initiatives. Solid Waste, Transportation and Toronto Water are currently first for the review that is expected to be completed by September 2011.

Division: Transportation Services

#### Report Title: Toronto Maintenance Management System Application Review

Report Date: March 30, 2004

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
013	<ul> <li>the Commissioner, Works and Emergency Services, ensure that:</li> <li>(a) a business continuity plan that integrates operational needs with the technology component of the Toronto Maintenance Management System is prepared, and that such a plan is documented and tested on a regular basis; and</li> <li>(b) this plan be incorporated into the departments overall disaster recovery plan;</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>(a) The Division has developed a procedural flow chart as part of the business continuity plan. The flow chart includes staff actions to be performed in the event of a TMMS system outage and restart procedures, however two (2) additional items where recommended Arrangements will be made to include the following:</li> <li>1. Add an action item prior to start up, with checklist to ensure system integrity not corrupted due to outage.</li> <li>2. Add action item for Manager's approval required before timesheets are submitted to payroll after every known system outage of more than 72 hours</li> <li>Include the information in TTEP as part of annual tabletop walkthrough training session, post on website with preamble document</li> <li>The above items will be in place by October 2011.</li> </ul>

## **City Divisions Public Recommendations – No Longer Relevant**

Division:	Parks, Forestry & Recreation
Report Title:	Parks, Forestry and Recreation - Review of Internal Controls at the East York Curling Club
Report Date:	27/04/2010

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
003	The General Manager of Parks, Forestry and Recreation, until such time as a different operating model is implemented, request that the members of the Club's volunteer Executive Board:	Board now operates programs through a permits model, implemented for the 2010-2011 Season; therefore PFR is not required to request financial information from the Club.
	<ul> <li>Provide a financial report on a periodic basis, regarding funds held in the Board's bank accounts and the expenditures made using these funds.</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>Provide access, upon request, to review documents and records to substantiate the completeness of receipts and the appropriateness of expenditures.</li> </ul>	

#### Division: Revenue Services

## Report Title: Controls Over Parking Tags Need Strengthening

## Report Date: January 27, 2010

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
001	The Treasurer, in consultation with the City Solicitor, request amendments to provincial legislation pertaining to the issue of parking tickets related to drive-away vehicles. The requested amendments allow parking tags to be mailed directly to registered vehicle owners.	This recommendation was not approved by Council.