



**AUDITOR GENERAL'S
REPORT
ACTION REQUIRED
With Confidential Attachment**

**Red Light Camera Program – Although Red Light
Cameras Have Contributed to a Reduction in Accidents,
Opportunities Exist to Improve Financial Results and
Program Effectiveness**

Date:	August 25, 2011
To:	Audit Committee
From:	Auditor General
Wards:	All
Reason for Confidential Information:	This report involves the security of property belonging to the City or one of its agencies, boards, and commissions. This report is about litigation or potential litigation that affects the City or one of its agencies, boards, and commissions.
Reference Number:	

SUMMARY

Red light cameras are used in many jurisdictions around the world to enhance enforcement efforts aimed at the reduction in red light running and the resulting accidents. The City of Toronto's program was initiated in November 2000 with the installation of 10 cameras rotating between 38 intersections. Currently, the City has 87 cameras operating among 114 locations.

The Auditor General's 2010 Work Plan included a review of the effectiveness of the Red Light Camera program. The objectives were to determine if the cameras were effective in reducing the number and severity of accidents related to red light running. Controls over the laying of charges and collection of fines as well as the costs and revenues associated with the program were also reviewed.

The audit report contains 10 recommendations along with a management response to each of the recommendations. The implementation of these recommendations will improve the overall effectiveness of the City's Red Light Camera program and has the potential to increase revenue by approximately \$2.5 million.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Auditor General recommends that:

1. City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services, review the current Red Light Camera evaluation process to ensure that it is current, complete and as effective as possible. Such a review include an analysis of evaluation practices in other major North American Cities. The General Manager, Transportation Services, update the 2006 evaluation of the Red Light Camera program.
2. City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services, as required by the operating agreement with the Province of Ontario, report to the Province on the collision history of monitored sites.
3. City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services, re-evaluate the current location of all red light cameras based on predetermined criteria. The results of this evaluation be compared to an even distribution of cameras on a ward-by-ward basis as requested by Council. Such information be reported to City Council.
4. City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services, as requested in April 2008, report back to Council “with an update on the status of the red light camera operations”. In preparing the report, information detailing financial results of the Red Light Camera program be provided as well as revised estimates for future program costs and revenues.
5. City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services, explore opportunities for program cost sharing with other parties benefiting from the Red Light Camera program, particularly the Province of Ontario and the motor vehicle insurance industry.
6. City Council request the City Solicitor in consultation with the General Manager, Transportation Services, and the Chief of Police request the Province of Ontario to amend legislation to permit Parking Enforcement Officers to issue tickets in relation to licence plate visibility.
7. City Council request the Treasurer, as part of the review of the enforcement of parking tags issued to out-of-province vehicles, include in the review the City’s current inability to issue tickets for red light camera offences.
8. City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services, ensure that all road markings at red light camera intersections are maintained to the extent necessary to allow the issuance of tickets for red light violations.
9. City Council request the Director, Court Services, in consultation with the City Solicitor report back to Council by December 2012 on the impact of the Early Resolution procedures and on other options, including administrative penalties, if the number of trials requested in relation to red light camera charges does not decrease substantially.

10. City Council request the Director, Court Services and City Solicitor, in accordance with the request of Council, report back to Council “on the average in-court fine” for red light camera infractions.
11. City Council adopt the recommendation contained in Attachment 1 to this report.
12. City Council authorize the public release of the information contained in the Attachment 1 to this report at the discretion of the City Solicitor in consultation with the General Manager, Transportation Services.

Financial Impact

The revenue generating opportunities identified in this report are in some cases dependant on other parties. However, the implementation of the recommendations will provide the impetus to address issues which will ultimately result in approximately \$2.5 million in additional revenue.

CONTACT

Jerry Shaubel, Director, Auditor General’s Office

Tel: 416-392-8462, Fax: 416-392-3754, E-mail: JShaubel@toronto.ca

Mayssa Mirshak, Audit Manager, Auditor General’s Office

Tel: 416-392-0886, Fax: 416-392-3754, E-mail: MMirshak@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Jeff Griffiths, Auditor General

10-TSD-01

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 – Confidential Information: Red Light Camera Program

Appendix 1: Red Light Camera Program – Although Red Light Cameras Have Contributed to a Reduction in Accidents, Opportunities Exist to Improve Financial Results and Program Effectiveness

Appendix 2: Management’s Response to the Auditor General’s Red Light Camera Program – Although Red Light Cameras Have Contributed to a Reduction in Accidents, Opportunities Exist to Improve Financial Results and Program Effectiveness