



Knowles

A Hill International Company

October 17, 2011

**City of Toronto, Request for Quotation No. 6033-11-3186
Provision of collection, transportation and off-loading of Garbage, Bulky Items, Recyclable Materials, Organic Materials and Yard Waste from curb side collected single family homes, Multi-residential locations, day collection commercial locations, Charities, Institutions and Religious Organizations (CIROs), and Agencies, Boards, Commissions, Departments (ABC&Ds) in the area bounded by Yonge Street to the east, the Humber River to the west, Steeles Avenue to the north and Lake Ontario to the south.**

Knowles Consulting Services Inc. (Knowles) was engaged by the City of Toronto as Fairness Advisor to provide independent oversight throughout the procurement process to select a Supplier for the Provision of collection, transportation and off-loading of Garbage, Bulky Items, Recyclable Materials, Organic Materials and Yard Waste from curb side collected single family homes, Multi-residential locations, day collection commercial locations, Charities, Institutions and Religious Organizations (CIROs), and Agencies, Boards, Commissions, Departments (ABC&Ds) in the area bounded by Yonge Street to the east, the Humber River to the west, Steeles Avenue to the north and Lake Ontario to the south. Knowles participated in the validation of the procurement process and provided oversight throughout the process.

According to the City's guidelines the following chart summarizes our involvement and findings:

Stage	Task	Fair (Yes/ No)
1	Review of Request for Quotation (RFQ) documentation	Yes
2	Review draft Q&A responses and confirm publication	Yes
3	Review draft addenda and confirm publication	Yes
4	Ensure that Bidders were notified of Bidders' information meetings and site visits with adequate notice	Yes
5	Attend Bidders' information meetings and site visits to confirm proper conduct	Yes
6	Ensure that the procurement process, communication with the City and basis for selection were clearly stated in the	Yes

Stage	Task	Fair (Yes/ No)
	RFQ	
7	Attend public opening of bids and record quotes	Yes
	Obtain confirmation that mandatory requirements check was performed	Yes
8	Confirm that the procurement process and basis for selection stated in the RFQ were respected	Yes
9	Attend debriefing of bidders as required	Pending

Observations and Findings

The City of Toronto's Purchasing and Materials Management Division (PMMD) and Solid Waste Division staff managed the RFQ process. PMMD and the Solid Waste Division prepared the draft and final RFQ documentation and addenda, responded to proponent questions, conducted Bidders' information meetings as well as site visits and consulted Knowles as Fairness Advisor for potential and actual fairness issues. In accordance with the RFQ, all communications with the City during the open period were conducted in writing by email with a designated buyer in the Purchasing and Materials Management Division (PMMD) and a deadline for questions was established. Responses were provided by way of addenda to the RFQ.

Four Bidders submitted five separate, timely quotations in response to the RFQ. All five quotations met all mandatory submission requirements. One quotation was rejected because the submission was qualified: the Bidder took exception to the City's terms and conditions. The four conforming quotations were less than the minimum cost savings threshold of \$25,975,030.00 per annum stipulated in the RFQ. The four quotations were ranked in order of price and the lowest was selected by City staff for negotiation of a Contract.

Conclusion

As the Fairness Advisors for Request for Quotation No. 6033-11-3186, we certify that the RFQ procurement process was, in our opinion, fair, open and transparent and that Bidders received consistent treatment. Furthermore, we are not aware of any issues that would impair the fairness of this procurement.

Yours truly,
Knowles Consultancy Services Inc.



Don Solomon