



11 April 2011

**City of Toronto, Request for Proposals No. 9105-10-7033 for:
The Provision of Administrative and Underwriting Services for Employee Benefits Plans for the City of Toronto, Toronto Police Services, and Toronto Transit Commission**

PPI Consulting Limited (PPI) was engaged by the City of Toronto to provide independent oversight throughout its procurement process to select a Supplier for **the provision of administrative and underwriting services for employee benefits plans for the City of Toronto, Toronto Police Services, and Toronto Transit Commission (RFP # 9105-10-7033)**. PPI participated in the validation of the procurement process, all mandatory submission requirements, and provided oversight during the evaluation of Proposals.

According to the City's guidelines the following chart summarizes our involvement and findings:

Stage	Task	Fair (Yes/ No)
1	Review of the Request for Proposal (RFP) documentation	Yes
2	Review draft Q&A responses	Yes
3	Review draft addenda before being published	Yes
4	Evaluator orientation: Confirm conflict of interest forms have been completed by all evaluators	Yes
5	Validate mandatory submission requirements of Bidders proposals	Yes
6	Attend Selection Committee Completeness of Proposal mandatory requirements evaluation sessions	Yes
7	Attend Selection Committee rated requirements evaluation sessions	Yes
8	Review financial summaries and evaluation of pricing	Yes
9	Review final evaluation results	Yes

Observations and Findings

The City of Toronto's Purchasing and Materials Management (PMMD) team managed the RFP procurement process. In consultation with the City of Toronto, Toronto Police Services and the Toronto Transit Commission, PMMD prepared the draft and final RFP documentation, addenda, responded to proponent questions, and consulted with PPI as Fairness Consultant for all potential and actual fairness issues. PMMD also engaged subject matter experts (SMEs), including insurance consultants and

financial specialists, to support the mandatory and rated requirements for this initiative. These SMEs identified relevant standards, including insurance standards, informing the RFP.

Three Bidders submitted Proposals in response to the RFP thereby allowing for a competitive procurement process to take place. The entire evaluation team declared no conflicts of interest with the Bidders. The evaluation process and criteria described in the procurement documents were applied consistently and equitably.

There were three stages of the evaluation – Stage 1 – Mandatory Documentation and Technical Requirements, Stage 2 – Rated Technical Requirements, and Stage 3 - Cost Evaluation. The evaluation team consisted of 10 evaluators from the City of Toronto, Toronto Police Services, and the Toronto Transit Commission bringing a level of expertise required to evaluate the Proposals accurately. The evaluation team first evaluated each Proposal to ensure compliance with the Mandatory Documentation and Technical requirements. The evaluation team determined that one of the three Bidders didn't meet these requirements and was deemed non-compliant. The remaining two Bidders moved onto the evaluation of the rated requirements phase. The evaluation team utilized technical advisors to provide a technical, comprehensive, neutral summary on certain sections of the Proposals as determined by the evaluation team. The two compliant Bidders met the minimum threshold, 75%, required to move onto the next phase of the evaluation and had their pricing proposal opened and evaluated. The evaluation team determined that one Bidder was non-compliant during the costing evaluation as the Bidder submitted pricing that was in contravention of the instructions contained within the price bid form. The cost evaluation was completed for the remaining compliant proposal.

There were no unresolved issues at any stage of this procurement.

The successful Bidder was selected based on meeting the minimum mandatory documentation and technical requirements, meeting the minimum threshold, and having the lowest cost to provide the requested services for the City of Toronto, Toronto Police Services, and the Toronto Transit Commission

Conclusion

As the Fairness Consultant for RFP # 9105-10-7033 - The Provision of Administrative and Underwriting Services for Employee Benefits Plans for the City of Toronto, Toronto Police Services, and Toronto Transit Commission, we certify that the principles of openness, fairness, consistency and transparency have been, in our opinion, properly established and maintained throughout all the stages of the procurement process. Furthermore, we were not made aware of any issues that emerged during the process that would impair the fairness of this initiative.



Justin Lau
Fairness Consultant
for PPI Consulting Ltd.