



June 10th, 2011

Ms. Bronwen Smith
 Solid Waste Management Services
City of Toronto
 35 Vanley Crescent
 Building 500, 3rd Floor
 Toronto, ON M3J 2B7

Subject: Final Procurement Fairness Attestation Report – Completion of Evaluation

Bronwen:

P1 Consulting was engaged as the Fairness Monitor Consultant to review and monitor the processes of communication, evaluation and decision-making associated with the procurement process for the Single Stream Recyclable Material Processing Contract by the City of Toronto (RFP #9150-11-3066). Our role related to ensuring openness, fairness, consistency and transparency of the procurement process.

P1 Consulting hereby presents its procurement fairness attestation to the City of Toronto, describing how the procurement process has complied with openness, fairness and transparency requirements. The following chart summarizes our involvement and findings:

Stage	Task	Fair (Yes / No)
1.	Review draft Request for Proposals (RFP) documentation to identify potential inconsistencies or lack of clarity in the RFP and provide feedback to the City	Yes
2.	Ensure that project meetings (mandatory or not) were clearly identified in the RFP and confirmed there were no meetings related to the procurement that the Proponents were not notified of	Yes
3.	Ensure that: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The time and place of the closing were clearly identified in the RFP • The submissions were logged and recorded upon receipt, clearly identifying those that were submitted on time • The pricing (Cost of Services) was contained in a separate envelope and the Mandatory requirements were adhered to for the proposals that were evaluated 	Yes Yes Yes
4.	Attend Proponent's information meetings	Yes
5.	Attend site visits	Yes
6.	Ensure that answers were made available to all Proponents for all questions that were submitted	Yes
7.	Review communications with Proponents, including questions and responses, prior to them being issued as addenda	Yes
8.	Review addenda	Yes
9.	Ensure that the evaluation criteria and process were included in the RFP	Yes
10.	Review evaluation and scoring procedures and documents with respect to clarity and consistency	Yes
11.	Ensure that the evaluation criteria were applied consistently and fairly	Yes
12.	Confirm confidentiality commitments by all Evaluators	Yes
13.	Attend internal meetings related to the evaluation process	Yes
14.	Ensure that the composition of the evaluation committee adhered to the evaluation process	Yes
15.	Attend and facilitate Evaluation Consensus sessions	Yes
16.	Ensure that the Cost of Services Envelopes were opened only for Proponents who met the achieved or exceeded the minimum Technical Score	Yes

P1 Consulting Inc.



Stage	Task	Fair (Yes / No)
17.	Review evaluation results (technical and financial)	Yes
18.	Attend debriefing sessions related to RFP as required	Pending
19.	Provide a report of the conclusion of the procurement process(s) on the fairness, openness and transparency of the process	Yes

Observations and Findings

The project team in the Solid Waste Service Management division prepared complete documentation related to the Single Stream Recyclable Materials processing in Toronto. They responded positively to all fairness comments and questions and there were no unresolved issues during the procurement. The procurement specialist supporting this initiative from the City of Toronto’s Purchasing department performed their responsibilities well and contributed to the success of this procurement process.

The evaluation process and criteria described in the RFP were applied consistently and equitably. In the final evaluation discussions the evaluators demonstrated that they had been diligent in their responsibilities, that they were able to support their individual evaluation assessments they did not appear to have any bias for or against any Proponent. The evaluation team reached consensus scores on all criteria for all proposals.

Conclusion

As the Fairness Monitor Consultant for the Single Stream Recyclable Materials Processing Contract (RFP 9150-11-3066), issued by the City of Toronto, we certify that the principles of openness, fairness, consistency and transparency have been, in our opinion, properly established and maintained throughout the procurement process. Furthermore, we were not made aware of any issues that emerged during the process that would impair the fairness of this initiative.

P1 Consulting Inc.



Louise Panneton
Lead Fairness Monitor Consultant

c.c.: Jill Newsome, Fairness Monitor Consultant – P1 Consulting

