



**AUDITOR GENERAL'S
REPORT
ACTION REQUIRED**

**Review of Coordinated Street Furniture Contract –
Public Realm Section, Transportation Services Division**

Date:	February 3, 2012
To:	Audit Committee
From:	Auditor General
Wards:	All
Reference Number:	

SUMMARY

In 2007, the City of Toronto entered into a 20 year Agreement with Astral Media Outdoor LP for the supply, manufacture, installation, and maintenance of over 25,000 street furniture elements. The coordinated street furniture comprises a range of transit shelters, litter/recycling receptacles, tourist/area information pillars, public notice structures, benches, bicycle parking stands, multi-publication boxes, and automated public washrooms.

In 2008, Toronto City Council mandated that the Public Realm Section be created within the Transportation Division. One of the responsibilities of the Public Realm Section is to oversee the installation new furniture and to ensure that the terms of the contract with Astral Media are complied with.

The Auditor General's 2011 Work Plan included a review of the management of the Coordinated Street Furniture contract. The objective of the review was to assess the adequacy and effectiveness of controls and processes in place to ensure compliance with the contract.

This report includes 11 recommendations. The implementation of these recommendations will improve the overall effectiveness of the Coordinated Street Furniture contract management. Attached to this report is a management response to each of the recommendations.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Auditor General recommends that:

1. City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services, report to Council through the Executive Committee on the implementation of the Street Furniture Program including revenue, completion rate, installation locations, public complaints and maintenance issues.
2. City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services consolidate and implement a Program Policy and Procedures Manual to ensure consistent and on-going management of the Street Furniture Program. At a minimum, the manual should include:
 - a. Street furniture approval, construction and inspection requirements
 - b. Criteria for prioritizing shelter installation
 - c. Complaint protocol.
3. City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services develop and implement performance measurement system and standards for the Coordinated Street Furniture Program that provides information related to cost, productivity and performance trends.
4. City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services request Astral Media to submit quarterly maintenance reports satisfactory to the City. At a minimum, reports should include the following information:
 - a. Location of street furniture
 - b. Weekly maintenance activity
 - c. Date and time completed
 - d. Summary of work completed.
5. City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services ensure monthly complaint reports are prepared and submitted to the City by Astral Media. At a minimum, reports should include:
 - a. Location of the site
 - b. Complaint description
 - c. Date received and completed
 - d. Summary of work completed.
6. City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services ensure Astral Media develop and maintain an adequate management information system that effectively reports on the status of all street furniture including but not limited to:
 - a. Tracking of permit and approval process
 - b. Tracking of roll-out and installation process
 - c. Tracking of day-to-day maintenance program.
7. City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services take appropriate steps to ensure Astral Media provide an annual report on the implementation status

of environmental benefits on a timely basis. Further, the General Manager, Transportation Services should review the results of the independent assessment and ensure requirements of the agreement are fulfilled.

8. City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services complete the transfer of data to update the system with the current information for planning and installation of street furniture.
9. City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services take steps to ensure the accuracy of the street furniture information system. Reconciliation of City records to Astral Media inventory records should take place periodically.
10. City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services complete efforts to identify and develop standard management reports supporting day to day and long term information requirements.
11. City Council request the Director, Strategic Communications ensure free advertising available through the Astral Media contract is utilized to the fullest extent.

Financial Impact

The recommendations in this report have no financial impact. The implementation of recommendations in this report will enhance the overall controls over contract management.

COMMENTS

This report provides the results of the Auditor General's review of the Coordinated Street Furniture contract managed by Transportation Services. This review was conducted as part of the Auditor General's 2011 Work Plan.

The Auditor General's report entitled "Review of the Coordinated Street Furniture Contract – Public Realm Section, Transportation Services Division" is attached as Appendix 1. Management's response to each of the recommendations contained in the report is attached as Appendix 2.

CONTACT

Alan Ash, Director, Auditor General's Office
Tel: 416-392-8476, Fax: 416-392-3754, E-mail: AAsh@toronto.ca

Angela Rafalovich, Audit Manager, Auditor General's Office
Tel: 416-397-4622, Fax: 416-392-3754, E-mail: arafalo@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Jeff Griffiths, Auditor General
11-TSD-01

ATTACHMENTS

- Appendix 1: Review of Coordinated Street Furniture Contract – Public Realm Section, Transportation Services Division

- Appendix 2: Management’s Response to the Auditor General’s Review of Coordinated Street Furniture Contract – Public Realm Section, Transportation Services Division