

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations –Fully Implemented**

Division: Accounting Services
Report Title: City Purchasing Card (PCard) Program - Improving Controls Before Expanding the Program
Report Date: October 27, 2009

Recommendation:

- 001 The Treasurer, in conjunction with Heads of Divisions participating in the PCard program, develop and implement clear and effective procedures to:
- a. Reduce the number of monthly transactions with outstanding documents or approvals
 - b. Follow up on transactions with outstanding documents or approvals in a consistent manner
 - c. Recover the City's GST rebates from PCard purchases
 - d. Ensure cancellation of individual PCards according to policy.
- 002 The Treasurer validate employment status of all current cardholders. Further, in consultation with Heads of Divisions participating in the PCard program, the Treasurer develop and implement clear and effective procedures to address the timely cancellation of PCards upon employment termination or extended leave.
- 003 The Treasurer, in conjunction with Heads of Divisions participating in the PCard program, develop and implement effective review, monitoring, and follow-up procedures, at the divisional and Corporate levels, to ensure compliance with PCard policies and procedures.
- 004 Heads of Divisions participating in the PCard program ensure that a divisional approval list outlining cardholders and their respective approval supervisors is developed and routinely reviewed for appropriateness.
- 005 The Treasurer, in consultation with Heads of Divisions participating in the PCard Program, ensure adequate controls are incorporated into the PCard approval process to detect inappropriate authorization and minimize the risk of unauthorized alterations to purchase logs.
- 007 The Treasurer, in consultation with Heads of Divisions participating in the PCard program, develop procedures whereby management staff have regular access to information on the total number and types of PCard purchases made for their office/unit.
- 009 The Treasurer undertake the necessary steps to improve effectiveness of PCard training. Such steps should include, but not be limited to:
- a. Ensuring the training includes a review of the importance of individual roles and responsibilities in the control framework
 - b. Providing refresher training where needed.
- 011 The City Manager ensure that the Expense Claim Policy for Staff of the City of Toronto (March 10, 1998) is reviewed, updated, and made accessible to staff.
- 014 The Treasurer undertake the necessary steps to improve cardholder compliance with Corporate purchasing policies and procedures. Such steps should include, but not be limited to:
- a. Ensuring cardholders receive adequate training in purchasing policies and procedures.

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations –Fully Implemented**

- b. Monitoring PCard purchases to identify non- compliance with purchasing policies.
- 016 The City Manager review the current sundry expense policy and consider integrating the requirement to reduce the sundry expense claim when meals are provided at conferences or business meetings, or when meals are paid for by the City.
- 019 The Treasurer ensure adequate contract review and management practices for the PCard program including:
 - a. A thorough review of the contractual terms and rebate rates and volume tiers
 - b. Retaining a copy of the final contract.
- 020 The Treasurer, in conjunction with Heads of Divisions participating in the PCard program, develop a long term strategy for continuous improvement of the PCard program including:
 - a. Establishment of a City-wide User Group
 - b. Regular reviews and updates of policies and procedures.

Division: City Manager's Office

Report Title: Audit of City's Performance in Achieving Access, Equity and Human Rights Goals

Report Date: October 14, 2008

Recommendation:

- 004 The City Manager, in consultation with the City Solicitor, review the existing complaint protocol of the Integrity Commissioner in order to ensure that Councillor related human rights and harassment complaints are dealt with in a manner consistent with other complaints and is in the best interest of the public.
- 007 The City Manager increase the profile of the Human Rights Office in order to ensure the general public and City employees are aware of its role and mandate. The increased profile be accomplished by providing additional information on the Human Rights Office via the City's Web site. Consideration also be given to revising the Web page to accommodate a process whereby human rights complaints can be submitted online.
- 008 The City Manager, in consultation with the City's Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations, consider creating a consolidated Human Rights Office Web page for receiving human rights or harassment related complaints or enquiries concerning services and practices of the City's Divisions, Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations.
- 021 The Executive Director of the Human Resources Division develop strategies, objectives and action plans to increase employees' awareness of human rights and diversity issues in the workplace. Further, the Executive Director ensure diversity and human rights training is considered a corporate priority in developing training strategies, goals and objectives under the City's Learning Strategy 2008-2011.
- 025 The City Manager consider the following for further improving divisional action planning in relation to access, equity and human rights:
 - a. Shortening the planning cycle from three to two years; and
 - b. Requesting divisions to link implementation status to planned activities on an annual basis.

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations –Fully Implemented**

Division: City Planning
Report Title: City Planning Division-Community Benefits Secured Under Section 37 or 45 of The Planning Act
Report Date: March 31, 2011

Recommendation:

- 003 The Chief Planner ensure all community benefits secured through Section 37 of the Planning Act are included in the re-zoning by-law.
- 004 The Chief Planner conduct an annual review of balances in the Sections 37 and 45 reserve funds to ensure divisions are advised of any funds secured and received.
- 007 The Chief Planner ensure that consideration is given to applying an appropriate inflationary index to the funds secured under Sections 37 and 45 of the Planning Act which are payable at a future date.

Division: Corporate Finance
Report Title: Insurance and Risk Management
Report Date: April 26, 2010

Recommendation:

- 001 The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer review the draft Risk Management Policies and Procedures Manual and ensure that it is current, revised to take into account emerging or changed circumstances, reviewed by all stakeholder groups, finalized and widely circulated to all relevant staff.
- 002 The Director, Corporate Finance, in consultation with the City's insurance advisors, evaluate the risks and benefits of increasing the City's level of self insurance. The results of the evaluation be reported to City Council.
- 004 The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer review and, if appropriate, recommend to Council revisions to the delegated financial authority limits for the settlement of insurance claims.
- 007 The Director, Corporate Finance, review the financial thresholds for reporting insurance claims to the Claims Review Group.
- 010 The City Solicitor in consultation with the Director, Corporate Finance, prepare a cost-benefit analysis to determine if it would be advantageous to transfer a certain level of legal services currently provided by external private sector legal firms to internal solicitors. Such an exercise be conducted prior to the next City budget cycle.
- 012 The Director, Corporate Finance, review the current fee structure arrangement with the adjuster in order to determine whether or not there would be cost savings in minimizing flat fee charges.

City Divisions
Public Recommendations –Fully Implemented

- 013 The Director, Corporate Finance, complete the implementation of the Insurance and Risk Management staffing changes approved in the 2009 City budget.
- 016 The Director, Corporate Finance, consider the need to record, in the claim files, costs related to adjusting services provided by City staff.
- 018 The Director, Corporate Finance complete a comprehensive listing of properties and insured values for the 2011 insurance renewal process.
- 019 The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer report at least once each term of Council on appropriate relevant information relating to significant uninsured risks.

Division: Deputy City Manager and CFO
Report Title: Management of Capital Project 129 Peter Street
Report Date: May 31, 2010

Recommendation:

- 002 The City Manager direct all staff that under no circumstances should capital lease agreements be negotiated prior to consultation with the Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer. The City Manager further advise all staff that potential lease agreements only be consummated after compliance with City policy.
- 004 The City Manager direct staff, when requesting Council approvals for additional financing, to include complete project costs, including management fees and direct salary costs, and budget information as well as estimated project completion dates in all reports.
- 006 The City Manager, in consultation with the Executive Director, Facilities Management, require that project charters be prepared for all capital projects. Project charters should define the scope of work, objectives, key deliverables, and project timelines and be approved in writing by both the Design, Construction and Asset Preservation section and the client division.
- 010 The Director, Design, Construction and Asset Preservation, comply with the City's asbestos management policy that requires tender documents include a building asbestos assessment report and building asbestos record. In addition, if necessary and practical, an intrusive asbestos survey should be completed prior to commencing renovations or construction work to confirm the presence of asbestos in the building.
- 011 The City Manager direct all staff involved in the design of major construction and renovation projects to ensure that all tender and design documents are complete and signed off by the Facilities Management Division and incorporate the scope of work as agreed with the client division.

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations –Fully Implemented**

Division: Facilities Management
Report Title: Facilities Management Division Energy Efficiency Office (EEO)-Management of Energy Loans and Grants Funded by the Ontario Power Authority
Report Date: March 4, 2011

Recommendation:

- 001 The Director, Energy and Strategic Initiatives, ensure that project results on individual loans are accurate and complete based on third party evaluations where available or a detailed analysis of energy savings information submitted by organizations.
- 002 The Director, Energy and Strategic Initiatives, ensure that annual reports are submitted to City Council on the achievements of each energy loan program. The annual report should include greenhouse gas reductions generated by the loan programs, success or failure in meeting targets, the number of loans and their dollar value.
- 003 The Director, Corporate Finance, should implement a formal documented credit screening process for energy loans that includes an analysis of cash flow, debt capacity and the ability to repay the loan. In addition, the credit screening analysis should be forwarded to the Energy Efficiency Office to be placed in individual loan files.
- 005 The Director, Energy and Strategic Initiatives, ensure that briefing notes presented for loan approval specify loan security terms and include accurate and complete project data supported by an appropriate level of verification by an energy consultant or engineering firm.
- 006 The Director, Energy and Strategic Initiatives, ensure that each project file clearly documents the project for which the loan is being approved and the energy savings attributable.
- 007 The Director, Energy and Strategic Initiatives, in consultation with the City Solicitor, give consideration to amending the standard loan agreement to include the charging of interest on late loan payments.
- 008 The Director, Accounting Services, in consultation with the Director, Energy and Strategic Initiatives, monitor the loan repayments on a regular basis and take timely action to follow up late loan payments.
- 010 The Director, Energy and Strategic Initiatives, request that, where appropriate, future agreements with funding partners require that the City be provided with reports arising from relevant program evaluations or audits undertaken by the funding partners.

Division: Fire Services
Report Title: Fire Services Operational Review
Report Date: January 13, 2006

Recommendation:

- 023 The Fire Chief and General Manager take steps to ensure cost-effective management of the Mechanical Division including:
- a. establishing and maintaining formal, written and enforceable job standards and monitor

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations –Fully Implemented**

- compliance with those standards; and
- b. ensuring accurate tracking of repair time by utilizing the capability built into the M4 Fleet Management Information System.
- 030 The Fire Chief and General Manager take appropriate steps to ensure implementation of adequate inventory controls, including:
- a. utilizing available system features for tracking inventory usage;
 - b. assigning a staff position to monitor receipts and issuance of parts inventory and restricting physical access to the stockroom to authorized personnel;
 - c. recording all parts and labour in the M4 Fleet Management Information System, including unit cost, vendor information and labour hours; and
 - d. establishing policies and guidelines to provide for an annual inventory process and periodic surprise physical counts of items and ensuring that discrepancies are adequately investigated and resolved.
- 032 The Deputy City Manager ensure the Mechanical Division of Toronto Fire Services:
- a. establish clear and measurable objectives and performance goals;
 - b. coordinate with Fleet Services in establishing efficiency and effectiveness performance measures to evaluate progress toward those goals; and
 - c. regularly measure and report on progress in achieving performance goals.

Division: Fleet Services
Report Title: Fleet Operations Review – Phase Two
Report Date: April 11, 2005

Recommendation:

- 007 The City Manager report to the Administration Committee, upon completion of the Yards Rationalization Study, on the status of the recommended closures of the maintenance garages located at 875 Eastern Avenue, 1008 Yonge Street, 1401 Castlefield Avenue and 30 Northline Road.

Division: Human Resources
Report Title: Effectively Managing the Recruitment of Non-Union Employees in the Toronto Public Sector
Report Date: June 19, 2009

Recommendation:

- 016 The City Manager forward this report to the City's Agencies, Boards and Commissions. Further, the City Manager request that relevant recommendations contained in this report be implemented.

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations –Fully Implemented**

Division: Information & Technology
Report Title: Governance and Management of City Computer Software Needs Improvement
Report Date: January 7, 2011

Recommendation:

- 001 The City Manager provide clarification to City divisional management regarding the role and responsibility of the Chief Information Officer as the single point of authority for managing City-wide and division-specific software.
- 002 The City Manager, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer and the City's Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations, to incorporate Police Information Technology Support Service Review the need for the development of closer coordination, wherever possible, in the acquisition and management of software. Closer coordination with the Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations has the potential for significant cost savings.
- 005 The Chief Information Officer review existing City information technology related policies, procedures and software asset management best practices. Additional policies, procedures and processes should be implemented where needed, to ensure City software is managed in a consistent, cost-effective and controlled manner.
- 007 The Chief Information Officer ensure project goals, benefits and expectations for the Information Technology Asset Management System are clear, measurable and documented.
- 008 The Chief Information Officer provide regular reports to the Business Advisory Panel on project progress.
- 010 The City Manager:
- a. communicate to staff regarding the need to comply with the 2007 directive to summarize software license agreement terms and conditions; and
 - b. instruct divisional management to provide contract summaries to the Corporate Information and Technology Division.
- 011 The Chief Information Officer develop a plan for the Finance and Administration Unit to effectively promote good contract management practices for software license agreements.
- 012 The Chief Information Officer include software management service level expectations in formal service level agreements between operating divisions and the Information and Technology Division.
- 013 The Chief Information Officer clarify the respective roles and responsibilities of divisional and corporate staff responsible for managing compliance with software agreement provisions.
- 014 The Chief Information Officer implement:
- a. a formal City-wide process for granting system administrative rights and privileges; and
 - b. formalize a system for reviewing system administrative access rights and privileges on a periodic basis.

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations –Fully Implemented**

Report Title: Review of the City SAP Competency Centre

Report Date: June 15, 2010

Recommendation:

003 The Chief Information Officer establish a formal process for the SAP Competency Centre to develop and maintain the Integrated SAP Work Plan as part of the existing SAP governance model.

Report Title: Governance and Management of City Wireless Technology Needs Improvement

Report Date: April 20, 2010

Recommendation:

001 The Chief Information Officer ensure current and future wireless projects undertaken by City divisions are administered under the Information Technology Governance Framework.

002 The Chief Information Officer ensure measures to provide a consultative and collaborative role on wireless projects undertaken by City Agencies, Boards and Commissions are implemented.

004 The Chief Information Officer complete a review of City-wide information technology policies to ensure policies are prepared, approved and reviewed on a regular basis.

008 The Chief Information Officer ensure information technology inventory records are complete and controls are working as intended.

Report Title: Review of Information Technology Training

Report Date: 05/11/2009

Recommendation:

002 The City Manager ensure divisional learning plans are prepared as required by the City “People Plan” and submitted to the Information and Technology Division.

003 The City Manager review the evaluation process relating to the effectiveness of Information and Technology training particularly in regards to the impact of enterprise-wide information and technology training for on-the-job performance as well as its impact on the City as a whole.

005 The Executive Director, Human Resources Division ensure enterprise wide courses resulting in corporate wide benefit have priority when the on-line self service system is implemented.

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations –Fully Implemented**

Report Title: Review of Disposal of Surplus IT Equipment - Security, Environmental and Financial Risks

Report Date: 02/05/2009

Recommendation:

005 The Chief Information Officer ensure that receipts from the sale of equipment are reconciled to the actual equipment sold.

Report Title: Integrated Business Management System

Report Date: January 16, 2009

Recommendation:

011 The City Manager and Chief Information Officer develop as a priority an electronic interface between IBMS and the City's SAP Financial System. Such an interface would reduce the requirement for manual analysis and processing.

Report Title: Internet Access Review

Report Date: July 31, 2007

Recommendation:

002 The Chief Information Officer, in consultation with the Executive Director of Human Resources Division and the City Solicitor, implement systematic Internet usage monitoring for compliance with the City's Acceptable Use Policy, including:

- a. developing criteria for Internet use that may not be in compliance with the policy, particularly relating to Internet time, bandwidth usage and visits or attempts to visit inappropriate sites;
- b. utilizing appropriate analysis tools to generate exception reports identifying users with Internet activity deemed to be inappropriate according to established criteria;
- c. providing Divisional management with detailed reports and technical support to facilitate review of apparent violations of the City's Acceptable Use Policy;
- d. establishing written procedures outlining the types and frequency of management reports on Internet usage and the responsibility for review and follow-up of such reports; and
- e. communicating to all City staff reiterating the City's Acceptable Use Policy, clarifying the responsibility of the City and users, and advising of the procedures in place to monitor compliance with the Policy.

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations –Fully Implemented**

Report Title: Telecommunication Services Review

Report Date: 1/31/2005

Recommendation:

009 The Commissioner, Corporate Services, in consultation with the service providers, ensure that an appropriate level of cellular telephone billing information is provided to all departments. Departments ensure that controls are in place for the recovery of non-business related calls;

Division: Parks, Forestry & Recreation

Report Title: Parks, Forestry and Recreation Division - Concession Agreements Review

Report Date: January 19, 2011

Recommendation:

001 The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, develop written procedures for follow-up on past due accounts.

002 The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, revise concession cost and property tax billing and collection practices to include more timely collection.

003 The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, develop a process to evaluate concession payment terms for new or existing agreements at the time of renewal to include, where appropriate, terms requiring more frequent payments.

004 The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, implement a process, where applicable, to validate concessionaire reported sales by City staff on a periodic basis.

005 The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, develop written procedures for collecting concession payments.

006 The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, explore other collection methods including pre-authorized payment, electronic fund transfer, on-line banking and the use of post-dated cheques.

007 The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, in consultation with the City Solicitor, review new and existing concession agreements at the time of renewal, for opportunities to standardize management control clauses.

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations –Fully Implemented**

**Report Title: Parks, Forestry and Recreation Division-Controls Over Ferry Service Revenue
Need Strengthening**

Report Date: April 26, 2010

Recommendation:

- 001 The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, evaluate options for alternative payment methods including the use of debit and credit cards at sales counters and vending machines, as well as Web-based sales.
- 003 The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, conduct a business process review of the Ferry Service/Marine Operations and evaluate options to upgrade or replace the existing information technology system for submission to the 2011 information technology capital process. The review should include:
- a. Integration of the point of sale system with other related City systems, such as the debit and credit card system and the SAP financial system.
 - b. An evaluation of the CLASS management information system as it relates to meeting the needs of Marine Operations.
- 005 The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, ensure staff are appropriately trained on computer systems routinely used and user manuals are available to staff for training and ready reference. Further, the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, determine corporate requirements for future computer system support and maintenance in the event of system failure.
- 008 The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, review current ticket and dock procedures. Periodic comparisons between tickets sold and the number of patrons recorded as ferry passengers should be conducted, and unusual deviations investigated.

**Report Title: Parks, Forestry and Recreation – Capital Program – The Backlog in Needed
Repairs Continues to Grow**

Report Date: January 23, 2009

Recommendation:

- 005 The City Manager, review the funding allocation between state of good repair projects and service improvement or growth-related projects, both at the division and city-wide levels, and take appropriate steps to develop a sustainable long-term strategy to reduce the current and projected state of good repair backlog.

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations –Fully Implemented**

Division: Real Estate Services
Report Title: Review of the Administration of Leases on City-owned Property
Report Date: July 8, 2006

Recommendation:

019 The City Manager ensure that eligibility reviews conducted for below-market tenants include, where practical, a site visit and a review of other required documentation such as the lease agreement and financial statements. Evidence of completion of the eligibility review, including copies of documentation, should be retained in the lease file.

Division: Revenue Services
Report Title: Administration of Municipal Land Transfer Tax, Revenue Services Division
Report Date: June 16, 2010

Recommendation:

- 001 The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer:
- a. review with the Province the potential of coordinating audit resources in order to conduct a joint audit of Teranet Enterprises Inc.'s systems
 - b. in consultation with the Province, give consideration to requesting Teranet Enterprises Inc. to provide to the City and the Province an independent auditor's report on controls at a service organization (Canadian Institute of Chartered Accountants Handbook Section 5970 report).
- 004 The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer request Teranet Enterprises Inc. to ensure that only those fees approved by City Council are charged on municipal land transfer tax transactions. Further, Revenue Services Division establish a process to ensure Teranet complies with the provisions contained in the Municipal Land Transfer Tax By-law No. 1423-2007.
- 006 The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer review the level of ongoing resources required in order to effectively audit the various documentation provided by third parties to support the payment and rebate of municipal land transfer tax. Such a process be conducted in collaboration with the Province in order to leverage the current provincial audit program.
- 007 The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer consider the possibility of recovering staff costs relating to the processing of manual rebate and refund applications on electronically registered conveyances.

Report Title: Controls Over Parking Tags Need Strengthening
Report Date: January 27, 2010

Recommendation:

002 The Treasurer review the practices currently adopted by 407 International Inc. in connection with the collection of out-of-province receivables. Such a review also include the practices of other jurisdictions. Further, the Treasurer review the potential use of collection agencies. If required,

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations –Fully Implemented**

requests for amendments to provincial legislation be made in order to facilitate the collection of out-of-province receivables

- 004 The Treasurer, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, review the potential of automating certain aspects of the documentation requirement process as it pertains to pre-court filing documents and request for trials. Such a process should be conducted in consultation with the City Solicitor in order to ensure that the automation of certain processes is not contrary to legislation and, if required, amendment to the provincial legislation be requested.
- 007 The Treasurer review the current plate denial process. Such a review take place in consultation with the Ministry of Transportation and focus on the reasons why significant receivables continue to be outstanding beyond the two-year licence plate renewal period. Improvements identified be implemented in order to maximize the effectiveness of the plate denial system.
- 009 The Treasurer review the possibility of providing collection agencies with specific information including the names and addresses of individuals and companies with outstanding parking tags. Amendments to provincial legislation be requested, if required.
- 014 The Treasurer develop and implement a formal access control and review process. A review of user access should occur periodically and unauthorized users deleted from the authorized user list.

Division: Shelter, Support & Housing Administration

Report Title: Hostel Operations Review – Community and Neighbourhood Services

Report Date: June 20, 2004

Recommendation:

- 018 the Commissioner, Community and Neighbourhood Services, assess the reliability of the financial information in the Hostel Utilization System currently used by the City-operated shelters and ensure that any information that is required to be carried forward to the new Shelter Management Information System, currently under development, is complete and accurate;

Division: Technical Services

Report Title: Review of the Management and Funding for Inactive Landfill Sites

Report Date: February 3, 2011

Recommendation:

- 001 The Deputy City Manager responsible for Solid Waste Management, in consultation with the Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer, review the current and ongoing status of the Perpetual Care Reserve Fund with an emphasis on maintaining its long-term viability to fund at least ongoing operating costs. Any action to increase the level of revenue to the fund be reported to City Council along with details of the unfunded liability.
- 002 The Executive Director of Technical Services Division ensure that the City receives all the royalty revenues to which it is entitled. In this context management should:

City Divisions
Public Recommendations –Fully Implemented

- a. obtain and retain consistent documentation supporting royalty payments;
 - b. document evidence of appropriate verification and review of royalty payments; and
 - c. exercise contract right by periodic request of financial statements or conducting audits to verify the accuracy of royalty payments.
- 003 The Executive Director of Technical Services Division formalize procedures to ensure accurate and complete performance and tracking of annual site inspections including sites to be inspected, date completed, actions taken and evidence of supervisory review.
- 004 The Executive Director Technical Services Division ensure that documentation is maintained for all recommendations made by external consultants. Supporting documentation should include action taken on all recommendations.

Division: Toronto Building

Report Title: Administration of Development Funds, Parkland Levies and Education Development Charges

Report Date: June 16, 2010

Recommendation:

- 004 The Director of the Affordable Housing Office, in consultation with the Chief Building Official, review procedures to ensure that information provided in regard to exemptions from development charges for non-profit housing projects is accurate and complete.
- 007 The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, in consultation with the City Solicitor, develop a corporate policy which formalizes the parameters that should be applied when determining the parkland dedication requirement for developments covered by the Etobicoke Motel Strip Secondary Plan.
- 008 The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation ensure that in the future, where parkland dedication fees are set out in negotiated agreements that amounts calculated and collected are in accordance with such agreements and appropriate documentation is maintained for all agreements.
- 009 The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation review negotiated parkland dedication fees for projects where the developer still owns the building. This review should ensure the correct amounts were collected and assess the feasibility of recovering any uncollected funds.
- 010 The General Manager, Parks, Forestry & Recreation in establishing cash payments in lieu of parkland, set up a process to ensure that land appraisals are current and in compliance with the requirements of the applicable by-law.
- 011 The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer, in consultation with the Chief Building Official, enter into discussions with the Toronto Catholic District School Board with a view to implement, where feasible, consistent definitions and policies affecting development charge calculations.

City Divisions
Public Recommendations –Fully Implemented

012 The City Treasurer and the Chief Building Official ensure there is a regular reconciliation of development charges financial information in IBMS and SAP. An interface between the two systems should be considered.

013 The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer review those development charge reserve funds which have been in existence since prior to amalgamation to determine how these funds can best be used.

Division: Toronto Environment Office

Report Title: Toronto Environment Office - Review of Administration of Environmental Grants

Report Date: January 17, 2011

Recommendation:

003 The Director, Toronto Environment Office, revise the process for evaluating project proposals to include a numerical scoring of individual proposals based on program guidelines and priorities. The results of the evaluation process should be documented in the project file.

004 The Director, Toronto Environment Office, ensure adequate resources are applied to implement a more effective grant monitoring system that includes:

- a. timely follow-up of overdue progress reports;
- b. regular communication and visits with grant recipients;
- c. ensuring funds are being used in accordance with conditions of the grant;
- d. taking appropriate action where monitoring highlights problems or deficiencies in the use of funds;
- e. a determination as to the appropriateness of providing ninety per cent of the grant at the commencement of the project; and
- f. ensuring adequate resources are allocated to the management of all facets of the grant management process.

005 The Director, Toronto Environment Office, amend the conditions in all funding agreements so that the release of funding is more closely tied to the progress of each individual project.

007 The Director, Toronto Environment Office, in consultation with the City Solicitor, amend the standard agreement for the Eco-Roof Incentive Program to allow City staff to periodically inspect green roofs in accordance with the roofs specific design service life. Such amendment also allow for the repayment of grants, if green roof inspections determine that a roof has not been satisfactorily maintained.

008 The Director, Toronto Environment Office, ensure that, where appropriate, future agreements with funding partners require that the City be provided with the results of any audits of the grant program undertaken by the funding partners.

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations –Fully Implemented**

Division: Toronto Water
Report Title: Protecting Water Quality and Preventing Pollution – Assessing the Effectiveness of the City’s Sewer Use By-law
Report Date: October 10, 2008

Recommendation:

022 The General Manager, Toronto Water, prior to the development or acquisition of any new work management system, re-evaluate in detail all reporting requirements relating to inspection, sampling and enforcement activities. Such an evaluation be conducted in concert with all users. Further, development of any new system be required to incorporate detailed performance measurement reporting as well as the reporting requirements outlined in this report.

Report Title: Toronto Water – Wastewater Treatment Phase Two
Report Date: September 21, 2007

Recommendation:

001 The General Manager, Toronto Water Division, take appropriate steps to ensure compliance with the City’s purchasing policies such as:

- a. discontinue the practice of using DPOs for repetitive purchases where the use of a blanket contract would be more appropriate;
- b. ensure that DPOs are prepared prior to ordering goods and services;
- c. ensure that three quotes are obtained where required;
- d. discontinue the practice of splitting DPOs to keep the purchase amount below the maximum of \$7,500 for a DPO or below the \$3,000 limit for three quotes; and
- e. take steps to identify areas of continued non compliance and impose a appropriate discipline for non compliance with City policies.

Report Title: Toronto Water – Wastewater Treatment Phase One
Report Date: July 16, 2007

Recommendation:

008 The General Manager, Toronto Water Division, ensure that:

- a. divisional staff, independent of the payroll input process, review and verify the accuracy and completeness of payroll transactions; and
- b. Toronto Water staff do not input their own payroll data into the payroll system.

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations –Fully Implemented**

Report Title: Transportation Services - Review of Winter Maintenance Services

Report Date: April 26, 2011

Recommendation:

- 001 The City Manager, in consultation with the General Manager, Transportation Services, ensure that the service review of Transportation Services include winter maintenance service levels, with a view to:
- a. Determining the incremental cost of providing higher standard of service than legislated and providing additional winter maintenance services, such as clearing residential windrows, bike lanes, trail paths and transit lanes;
 - b. Determining the implications arising from any service level increases or decreases, including any potential liability exposure; and
 - c. Prioritizing services that could be reduced or discontinued to effect cost savings.
- 003 The City Manager, in consultation with the General Manager, Transportation Services, ensure that winter maintenance costs are included in the financial impact statements for changes such as road developments, bike lanes, trail paths and transit lanes.
- 005 The General Manager, Transportation Services, in consultation with the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management Division and the City Solicitor, explore the possibility of modifying the current winter maintenance contract award process by:
- a. Allowing the opening of all submitted bids; and
 - b. Reserving the City's right to award contracts in a manner that gives the City the lowest possible price while respecting the principles of a fair and open procurement process.

Report Title: Toronto Maintenance Management System Application Review

Report Date: March 30, 2004

Recommendation:

- 013 the Commissioner, Works and Emergency Services, ensure that:
- a. a business continuity plan that integrates operational needs with the technology component of the Toronto Maintenance Management System is prepared, and that such a plan is documented and tested on a regular basis; and
 - b. this plan be incorporated into the departments overall disaster recovery plan;

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

Division: Accounting Services

Report Title: City Purchasing Card (Pcard) Program - Improving Controls Before Expanding the Program

Report Date: October 27, 2009

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|---|
| 010 | The Treasurer undertake the necessary steps to improve efficiency of the PCard process, including steps to explore the feasibility of using the PCard system to generate purchase logs for cardholders, and re-assess what information is necessary for cardholders to provide in the purchase logs. | Despite the implementation of an upgraded reporting system in December 2011, this item cannot be implemented unless all credit card merchants convert to Level 3 Point-Of-Sale (POS) merchants, which provide complete purchase details, including tax breakdown. Accounting Services will review the approval process by December 31, 2012 to determine if there are other efficiencies available. |
| 012 | The Treasurer develop and implement measures to improve compliance with Corporate policies and procedures pertaining to business expenses. | The new policy was developed through reviews and involvement of the Finance and Administration Corporate Team (FACT). Ongoing reviews, amendments, and compliance matters will be reviewed at FACT semi-annually. |
| 015 | The Treasurer ensure that PCard purchases are regularly monitored and analysed to identify opportunities for blanket contract. | PCard staff run reports monthly, and PMMD staff will commence running reports on a quarterly basis for distribution to PMMD Managers and the Client Divisions to identify opportunities for blanket contracts. |
| 017 | The Treasurer, in conjunction with Heads of Divisions participating in the PCard program, develop and implement procedures to reduce the number of inactive or low usage cards, and cancel inactive cards where necessary. | The PPAU will remind Divisions to review their PCard programs, on a semi-annual basis. Divisions are required to advise their plans to cancel unnecessary cards or reduce/increase limits where appropriate. PPAU focuses on areas with a significant number of inactive cards. Based on the heightened reviews, all areas have reduced the number of cards within their Divisions with the areas with the largest number of inactive cards reducing the number by 12% and 23% as of April 2012. It should be noted that Divisions have the option of retaining cards for emergency purposes or to address purchases that can only be processed via the internet. PPAU has provided Divisional programs with reports enhanced to include card expiry date and date of last transaction. The reports are made available for staff use. |
| 018 | The Treasurer develop and implement strategies to promote and expand the use of PCards by City divisions. Such strategies should include, but not be limited to: a. Analyzing divisional purchasing patterns | Phase 1 of software upgrade completed. Go-Live December 2011. Improved reporting to identify card usage and inactivity. PPAU continues to work with divisions to optimize card usage. Phase 2 of software upgrade to begin in 2012 and will include the PCard |

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|--|
| | <p>b. Developing and implementing measures to increase the use of PCards by divisions</p> <p>c. Setting performance goals for the City based on the number of participating divisions and yearly PCard purchase volume.</p> | Purchase Order module. The PO module may significantly increase PCard usage as well as ensure compliance with PMMD policies and procedures. A strategy will be put in place by September 30, 2012. |

Division: City Manager's Office

Report Title: Audit of City's Performance in Achieving Access, Equity and Human Rights Goals

Report Date: October 14, 2008

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|--|
| 017 | <p>The Executive Director of the Human Resources Division take steps to increase the workforce survey response rate among new City employees. Such steps should include, but not be limited to:</p> <p>(a) Improving the survey distribution method;</p> <p>(b) Improving the communication of the purpose and benefits of the survey to new City employees.</p> | Through a collaborative effort with Payroll, steps have been taken to ensure that all new hires are provided with the survey and understand the importance of completing each survey. Employment Equity staff have met with Payroll Supervisors, have provided advice on the importance of having new hires complete the form, directed Payroll staff to ensure that this form is provided to all new hires during the documentation process and that they are reminded to submit the form. Note: the OEDHR is now responsible for the Employment Equity Survey. |
| 020 | The City Manager determine the feasibility and merit of establishing a corporate fund for employment accommodation. Where appropriate, divisional budgets be adjusted to reflect this change. Such a review take into account the practices of other organizations. | In 2010 a working group of representatives from operational divisions came forward with recommendations, including a corporate placement process for injured workers that is fiscally responsible, to improve the results of the job placement process where accommodations were required. Funding was confirmed as part of the 2012 Budget process. Timeline for completion - 2012 |
| 022 | The City Manager report to Council on the development of a Toronto Urban Aboriginal Strategy and an Aboriginal Office by June 2009. | In August 2009 City Council adopted the report entitled 'Development of an Urban Aboriginal Strategy for Toronto'. This report gave a broad outline for development of a strategy as well as the time frame and process to be used. A report on this item will be transmitted to the June 20, 2012 Executive Committee meeting. The Aboriginal Affairs Committee was reconstituted for the first time on October 25, 2011 and is an integral part of the creation of the Urban Aboriginal Strategy/Framework. They are part of the planning for this Framework and will provide valuable input. Timeline for completion – June 2012. |

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|--|
| 027 | The City Manager establish a formal process whereby access, equity and human rights initiatives and accomplishments by the City's major Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations is systematically tracked and reported to City Council on a periodic basis. | The Office of Equity, Diversity and Human Rights has begun the process of addressing ABC board orientations as well as the need to track and report equity, diversity and human rights initiatives and achievements in partnership with the Strategic and Corporate Policy division. This is expected to be completed by December 31, 2012 |
| 028 | City Council request the City major Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations to complete an access, equity and human rights action plan consistent with divisional action plans by 2010. The City Manager should facilitate the planning process and report to City Council on implementation status. | Please see response to # 27. |

Division: City Planning

Report Title: City Planning Division-Community Benefits Secured Under Section 37 or 45 of The Planning Act

Report Date: March 31, 2011

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|--|
| 001 | The Chief Planner assess the status of community benefits secured since amalgamation (January 1, 1998) under Sections 37 and 45 of the Planning Act to provide an appropriate level of assurance that all cash and significant non-cash benefits that should have been received, have been received and report any uncollectible benefits to Council. | Partially implemented. Report on cash benefits secured since amalgamation scheduled for the March 22/12 Planning & Growth Management Committee. Report on non-cash benefits secured since amalgamation will be forwarded in 2013 Q4. |
| 002 | The Chief Planner develop and implement a monitoring process to ensure receipt of all non-cash community benefits secured under Sections 37 and 45 of the Planning Act. | Chief Planner will report to Planning and Growth Management Committee on non-cash benefit monitoring process. (2012 Q4). |
| 005 | The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer in consultation with the Chief Planner develop monitoring controls to enable effective administration of any letters of credit secured in relation to Sections 37 and 45 of the Planning Act. | In progress. The monitoring controls have been developed and have been incorporated into the new L/C computer system that is in the process of being implemented by Corporate Finance and IT. Employee training has commenced. |
| 006 | The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer in consultation with the Chief Planner consider providing appropriate | In progress. The new L/C computer system contains this read-only |

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|--|
| | Planning Division staff with read only access to the letter of credit database. | feature and it is in the process of being implemented by Corporate Finance and IT. |

Division: Corporate Finance

Report Title: Insurance and Risk Management

Report Date: April 26, 2010

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|---|
| 003 | The Director, Corporate Finance, review the possibilities of changing the current insurance fronting arrangement. Such a review include consultation with staff of the Toronto Transit Commission. The Director, Corporate Finance also be requested to communicate the results of this review with the City's agencies, boards and commissions. | <p>(April 13, 2011) Report from the Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer on the 2011 – 2012 Insurance Program Renewal which recommended a process for changing the current fronting arrangement: http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2011.GM3.16</p> <p>A review of the possibilities of changing the current insurance fronting arrangement has been initiated. Council authorized the filing of an application with the Financial Services Commission of Ontario (FSCO) to obtain a license to undertake the business of insurance solely for the purpose of self-insuring coverage. Funds have been authorized for the retention of the appropriate legal expertise to assist with the application to FSCO. It is anticipated that the application process would be completed in time for the June 1, 2013 insurance renewal process. Consultation with staff of the Toronto Transit Commission has taken place. The results of this review will be communicated out to the City's agencies, boards, and commissions following the application process to FSCO.</p> |
| 005 | The Director, Corporate Finance, establish a process to monitor City divisional response time to insurance adjuster requests for information and report results to Divisions where significant delays occur. The City Manager take appropriate action if response times are not appropriately addressed. | <p>Included in Recommendation 13.0 (6) of the (October 17, 2011) Report from the Ombudsman, submitting an Investigation Report, headed "Potholes, Floods and Broken Branches: How the City handles your Claims" tabled with City Council at its meeting on October 24 and 25, 2011 (CC13.1)</p> <p>http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2011.CC13.1</p> <p>"That the City review the current system for requesting reports and establish service standards appropriate to the type of claim, with a view to achieving streamlining, coordination, standardization and efficiencies." Staff has responded as requested to Government Management Committee</p> <p>http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2012.GM10.17 that IRM is developing a</p> |

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|---|
| | | reporting system to respond to both Auditor General and Ombudsman recommendations using its risk management information system, STARS, to track unanswered requests for reports from divisions greater than 30 days. The report will be forwarded to and reviewed with divisions on a monthly basis. Time line for completion is Q2, 2012. |
| 006 | The Director, Corporate Finance perform regular reviews of the time spent on adjusting services for the same category of claims. Any files which result in an inordinate amount of time and as a result incur excessive costs be discussed with the third party adjuster. | Insurance & Risk Management currently performs monthly audits on adjusting services invoices, however to address the recommendation that a comparison be completed of time spent on the same category of claims, a report is in development using STARS database to capture comparison. Time line for completion is Q2, 2012. |
| 008 | The Director, Corporate Finance, review the Loss Control Notice process to ensure all Notices are issued when required, divisional responses are received and progress on corrective action is monitored by Insurance and Risk Management staff. | Not fully implemented. All divisions but Transportation now receive LCNs. Due to the volume of Transportation claims a separate process is being developed to communicate loss control advice. Time line for completion is Q2, 2012. |
| 009 | The Director, Corporate Finance, ensure appropriate action is taken on loss prevention recommendations identified by the insurer. For recommendations not addressed, specific reasons for not doing so be documented and approved in writing. | Insurance & Risk Management is working with property insurer FM Global to directly involve affected divisions in using the insurer's website/inspection database. Division staff will add comments into the database on recommendations that cannot be addressed for capital budget reasons and for other impediments they face in implementation. Training to divisions will be required. Implementation will take several more months, time line to completion Q3, 2012. |
| 011 | The Director, Corporate Finance, consider the development of a process whereby all legal bills are analyzed and scrutinized on a performance review basis. Such a process include evaluations of time spent on specific legal files, the level of lawyer expertise assigned to each file along with review of hourly rates. The review process be documented along with evidence of any follow up on apparent irregularities. | The development of the required process has been absorbed in revisions to the Risk Management Information System (RMIS) and to be released with an upcoming RFP. Legal firms will submit bills quarterly through a new format into the RMIS that will identify lawyer's year of call, hourly rate, file/task delegation and type of claim to simplify analysis to ensure time spent on task and level of lawyer assigned to task is appropriate. Time line to completion is Q1, 2013. |
| 015 | The Director, Corporate Finance, complete the implementation of an automated process to update the Risk Management Information System quarterly for the cost of all legal services. | Our review of management's response and the supporting documentation did not confirm that recommendation has been implemented. Last conversion was conducted on January 23, 2012 which included Q1, Q2 and Q3 2011. The division is 6 month behind in reconciling of billing fees. Management stated that they have been experiencing issues with the legal fee conversion. There have been |

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|---|
| | | times that the required data was not contained on the spreadsheets provided by the 8 law firms and City Legal requiring manual follow-up and corrections before the data could be successfully converted. Costs of legal fees have not been uploaded to the Risk Management System for the last 6 months |
| 020 | The Director, Corporate Finance, in consultation with appropriate senior management, consider the cost-effectiveness of consolidating the current City of Toronto insurance program to include certain other City Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations. | Report dated September 9, 2011 from the City Manager entitled, "Core Services Review – Final Report to Executive Committee" approved by Council at: http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2011.EX10.1 presented results of the KPMG study. Recommendation 11 directs the City Manager to review the remaining efficiency related opportunities as set out in Appendix E of the KPMG Core Services Review, to determine whether and in what manner implementation is appropriate through the 2012, 2013 and 2014 Operating Budget. Opportunity 21 of Appendix E directs the City Manager to examine the potential to rationalize Corporate Finance services across City agencies and corporations. |

Division: Deputy City Manager & CFO

Report Title: Management of Capital Project 129 Peter Street

Report Date: May 31, 2010

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|---|
| 001 | The City Manager direct all staff to prepare reports which contain accurate and complete financial impact statements. Such reports to address all financial implications both capital and operating. Reports relating to capital acquisitions contain information on required future state of good repair budgetary requirements. | Projected completion 2012/2013 subject to directive from City Manager. |
| 003 | The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer propose amendments to the Financial Control By-law requiring that final total capital project costs for all major capital projects are reported to the appropriate Standing Committee. Such reporting include a comparison of costs to budget as well as a comparison of actual completion date to projected completion date. | The Financial Control By-Law review will take place during 2012 with all recommended changes, including this one, to be sent for Council approval for 2013. |

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|---|
| 005 | The City Manager direct that the Design, Construction and Asset Preservation section of the Facilities Management Division be designated as the lead project manager for all renovation projects. The role of client divisions be clearly defined. | Projected completion in 2012. |
| 007 | The City Manager, in consultation with the City Clerk, give consideration to the development of a process or a protocol which would enable Councillors, when considering Motions, to be advised of the financial implications of such Motions. If this is not possible prior to decisions being made then consideration be given to providing this information at a subsequent meeting. | On-going discussions with City Manager's staff - Response outstanding. |
| 008 | The Executive Director, Facilities Management, in consultation with the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management, project managers and external consultants, ensure that project design documents are complete and as accurate as possible prior to tender issue. | Facilities Transportation Project completion in 2014 will facilitate consolidation of Divisional capital programs for facilities under Executive Director, Facilities Management. |
| 009 | The Executive Director, Facilities Management, be given sole authority to make decisions on the method by which accessibility requirements be incorporated in all relevant tender documents. The design of construction and renovation projects be required to comply with the City's Accessibility Design Guidelines and any new requirements under the Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act, 2005. | Facilities Transportation Project completion in 2014 will facilitate consolidation of Divisional capital programs for facilities under Executive Director, Facilities Management. |
| 012 | The Executive Director, Facilities Management, on a case by case basis, evaluate the need to conduct detailed building condition assessments prior to tendering major construction and renovation projects. The results of assessments be adequately documented and conveyed to project management staff. | Projected completion in 2012. |
| 013 | The City Manager direct that Design, Construction and Asset Preservation staff consult with Divisions at the design stage of all projects. Appropriate sign off of all drawings be standard practice by Design, | Projected completion in 2012 subject to directive from City Manager. |

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented**

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|--|
| | Construction and Asset Preservation staff in consultation with Division staff. Such a process be incorporated into the Project Charter. | |
| 014 | The Executive Director, Facilities Management, ensure that contractor invoices and change orders are calculated in accordance with the terms of the relevant contract. Further, the Executive Director, Facilities Management, take action as warranted after consultation with the City Solicitor to recover any excess change order amounts paid to the 129 Peter Street contractor. | Pending the outcome of litigation. |

Division: Facilities Management

Report Title: Facilities Management Division Energy Efficiency Office (EEO)-Management of Energy Loans and Grants Funded by the Ontario Power Authority

Report Date: March 4, 2011

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|--|
| 004 | The Director, Energy and Strategic Initiatives consider developing a project ranking system in the event that loan demand exceeds funds available. | To be implemented in 2012. |
| 009 | The Director, Energy and Strategic Initiatives, require that future loan agreements include a clause relating to the ownership of carbon credits. The wording of the clause should be developed in consultation with the City Solicitor. | To be implemented in 2012 |

Report Title: Payment of Utility Charges

Report Date: November 12, 2009

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|---|
| 002 | <p>The Deputy City Manager & Chief Financial Officer develop a control framework to ensure the cost effective administration of hydro and natural gas invoice payments. Such framework should include, but not be limited to the following:</p> <p>a. a clear definition of the roles and</p> | <p>The framework has been distributed to all division heads.</p> <p>The process for metering changes - including new meter account set ups and de-activations- has been documented and distributed to all division heads.</p> <p>Local distribution companies have been notified that all metering changes are now processed by EWMO.</p> |

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|---|
| | <p>responsibilities of the Accounts Payable Unit, the Energy and Waste Management Office and City divisional managers. The roles and responsibilities to include areas such as processing hydro and natural gas invoices, including following up on billing exceptions, dispute resolution and reporting protocols, as required</p> <p>b. the establishment of protocols for effecting and reporting on energy metering changes, including new meter account set ups, de-activations, replacements, relocations and record keeping requirements</p> <p>c. procedures for ensuring ongoing verification of hydro charges relating to street lighting by a staff person familiar with the operations</p> <p>d. reporting requirements for the Energy and Waste Management Office to communicate energy consumption fluctuations for divisional follow-up as required.</p> | <p>Bill verification is completed as an ongoing exercise.</p> <p>However, reporting requirements for the Energy and Waste Management Office to communicate energy consumption fluctuations for divisional follow-up as required. To be completed in 2012.</p> |
| 003 | The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer review and make appropriate revisions to Accounting Services' Cost Centre Billing Procedure to include the revised utility payment control framework. | Draft Interface Cost Centre Billing Procedure, for Utilities completed in 2011. Final version to be completed in 2012. |
| 004 | The Executive Director of Facilities & Real Estate Division take appropriate steps to ensure the Energy and Waste Management Office maintains a complete and accurate database on all hydro and natural gas meters billable to City divisions. The database be updated as required. | Project to be completed in 2012. |
| 006 | The Executive Director of Facilities & Real Estate Division take necessary steps to complete, on a sample basis, ongoing recalculations of major hydro and natural gas bills for accuracy and consider using the specific software currently used by the TTC. | Project to be completed in 2012. |
| 007 | The Executive Director of Facilities & Real Estate Division to ensure that identified energy billing anomalies are promptly | Project to be completed in 2012. |

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|--|
| | analyzed and satisfactorily resolved with the provider on a timely basis. Further, a system be developed to track outstanding refund requests. | |
| 008 | The Executive Director of the Facilities & Real Estate Division take appropriate steps to expedite enrollment in the consolidated billing services plan all hydro invoices, and request from Toronto Hydro data in a format that facilitates input to the Energy and Waste Management Office's energy meter database. | A new consolidated billing service provider has been selected and data format is under discussion. Definition of a data format that will allow EWMO to streamline the uploading process will be completed in 2012 |

Report Title: Maintenance and Administrative Controls Review – Facilities and Real Estate

Report Date: September 16, 2005

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|---|
| 002 | The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer ensure priorities are established on a City-wide basis for the capital repair of City-owned buildings. All divisional capital repair budgets should be evaluated and priorities established irrespective of budget responsibilities. | The Facilities Transformation Project (FTP) will consolidate all capital repair budgets for City-owned Buildings with Facilities Management (FM). A number of program capital budgets have already been transferred to FM, which facilitates priorities being established on a City-wide basis, but the FTP project will not be completed until 2014. |
| 004 | The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer give priority to the completion of an implementation plan for facilities maintenance standards including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) a process to monitor compliance with legislative requirements; (b) funding, staffing and operational requirements of the Facilities and Real Estate Division and all other City divisions; (c) the development of specific facilities maintenance standards, if necessary, for speciality facilities such as water treatment plants and arenas; and (d) timelines for implementation. | The FTP project is underway and will be completed by 2014. It will address compliance with legislative requirements for facilities maintenance, funding, staffing and operational requirements of all City divisions and maintenance standards for speciality facilities. |
| 013 | The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer take appropriate steps to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) determine the complete state of good | Facilities Management Division determines the complete state of good repair backlog for all corporate buildings and establishes funding priorities for the |

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented**

| No. | Recommendation | Management’s Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|--|
| | <p>repair backlog for all City-owned buildings;</p> <p>(b) develop City-wide funding priorities for the state of good repair backlog; and</p> <p>(c) ensure that approved capital projects are completed on a timely basis.</p> | <p>state of good repair backlog. Also, refer to recommendation #14 regarding CAMS.</p> <p>Other Division's backlog will be prioritized as responsibilities are transferred under the Facilities Transformation Project</p> |
| 014 | <p>The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer ensure that a database of the physical condition of all City-owned buildings is developed and forms the basis for a long-term capital plan. In addition, building condition assessments should be completed for all City-owned buildings using criteria based on industry standards and best practices developed by the Facilities and Real Estate Division.</p> | <p>The FTP project is underway and will be completed by 2014. It will address compliance with legislative requirements for facilities maintenance, funding, staffing and operational requirements of all City divisions and maintenance standards for speciality facilities.</p> <p>The facilities maintenance plan is also reliant on the implementation of the SAP Plant Maintenance Module – Preventative Maintenance which is scheduled to roll out in 2013.</p> |
| 016 | <p>The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer take appropriate steps to establish a maintenance plan for each City building that:</p> <p>(a) includes both capital and operating repairs for current and future years;</p> <p>(b) addresses building deficiencies identified in building condition assessments; and</p> <p>(c) effectively coordinates maintenance and repair activities between the Design, Construction and Asset Preservation and Facilities Operations Units of the Facilities and Real Estate Division.</p> | <p>Facilities Management Division is on track to implement a Capital Asset Management software solution and a Preventative Maintenance software solution to address the recommendations outlined in 16 a,b,c. These applications will be operationalized over the next year.</p> |
| 017 | <p>The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer ensure that all necessary building information is incorporated into the SAP Plant Maintenance and Asset Management Modules to assist in maintenance planning and repair decisions and provide a record of regulatory inspections.</p> | <p>Core building data variables to be incorporated into the SAP Plant Maintenance – Preventative Maintenance Module have been identified including: maintenance planning, and regulatory inspection requirements. The requisite information will be incorporated into this SAP module for implementation in 2013.</p> |
| 028 | <p>The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer ensure the SAP Plant Maintenance Module be used to schedule and track preventive maintenance services.</p> | <p>Facilities Management Division plans to introduce the SAP Plant Maintenance Module - Preventative Maintenance functionality to schedule and track preventive maintenance services in 2013</p> |

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

Division: Human Resources

Report Title: Effectively Managing the Recruitment of Non-Union Employees in the Toronto Public Sector

Report Date: June 19, 2009

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|---|
| 001 | The City Manager be required to fully address the recommendations relating to hiring contained in the Bellamy Report. The Executive Director of Human Resources also be required to ensure that the quality control of hiring files include a monitoring process to address the Bellamy recommendations. | <p>In December 2009, the Executive Director, Human Resources directed all division heads to ensure awareness of their role in implementing recommendations related to the Bellamy Report. HR staff were reminded of this expectation via an e-mail distributed, in Dec. 2009, from Exec. Director, HR, to all staff. A memo from Exec. Director HR was issued in January 2012 to remind all staff of this on-going obligation to ensure complete documentation in hiring files.</p> <p>(Hardcopy of Dec. 2009 & Jan. 2012 communications attached).</p> <p>HR's QA process is a monitoring process that helps to ensure that the Bellamy recommendations are implemented. In 2012 further review of this QA process will be undertaken and necessary amendments made to ensure that a monitoring process exists for all of the Bellamy recommendations.</p> |
| 004 | The City Manager in consultation with the City unions give priority to the development of a workplace survey for union staff. Such a survey be consistent with the non-union workforce survey. The results of the survey be reported to City Council and be used as a basis for addressing the City's employment equity hiring goals. | <p>A City workplace survey of unionized staff was undertaken in the spring of 2011. Reporting of the results of the survey was delayed to the 3rd Quarter, 2012, due to a number of factors, including: changes in the organizational structure that resulted in the Employment Equity unit moving from the Human Resources Division to the Office of Equity, Diversity and Human Rights; staffing changes; training needs arising from the organizational changes; and systems issues with SAP which have now been identified and fixed.</p> <p>Timeline for completion - 2012</p> |
| 005 | The Executive Director of Human Resources in consultation with the City Solicitor evaluate the feasibility, benefits and risks of adopting a City-wide Corporate hiring policy. | <p>Consultation with City Legal is on-going. A wide array of policies and guidelines are currently in place that support all aspects of the City's hiring process. HR continues to consider the merits of a single corporate policy and expects to finalize the consultation and reach a conclusion by the end of the 2nd quarter, 2012. Timeline for completion June 2012</p> |
| 006 | The Executive Director of Human Resources direct all staff to complete the appropriate screening documentation for all employee | <p>This was first communicated to staff via an e-mail from Executive Director to all staff in December 2009. As part of the on-going commitment to this direction, a</p> |

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented**

| No. | Recommendation | Management’s Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|---|
| | applicants. All such documentation be retained in hiring files. | communication was issued in January, 2012. |
| 008 | The Executive Director of Human Resources direct all staff involved in the hiring process to ensure that there is an adequate level of documentation in all hiring files to support hiring decisions. Such documentation is critical in any potential hiring dispute. | This was first communicated to staff via an e-mail from Executive Director to all staff in December 2009. As part of the on-going commitment to this direction, a communication was issued in January, 2012. |
| 010 | The Executive Director of Human Resources direct all staff to ensure that a fully executed copy of the current employment agreement is obtained and retained in the employee’s Corporate human resources file. | This was first communicated to staff via an e-mail from Executive Director to all staff in December 2009. As part of the on-going commitment to this direction, a communication was issued in January, 2012. |
| 011 | The Executive Director of Human Resources develop Corporate standards which requires the written evaluation of newly hired non-union City employees during the six-month probationary period. | HR finalized the development of a tool in late 2011. The tool is now being distributed to hiring managers on an as-needed basis, for newly hired non-union employees. |
| 012 | The Executive Director of Human Resources develop a hiring benchmark to measure the time required to complete the hiring process for non-union employees and monitor the performance of each hiring unit against the established benchmark. The Division evaluate the current hiring process to determine where “bottlenecks” in the process occur. Steps be taken to address these areas. | <p>A hiring benchmark was established in 2005, and the time required to complete the hiring process was monitored against this benchmark for a period of time and before being discontinued. Results of the AG's review in 2009 demonstrated that the City was meeting the established target for internal job competitions (concluded, on average, within 69 days) but not for external competitions. In 2012, HR has determined that as part of meeting customer service standards, it will again monitor the time required to complete the hiring process to determine if there are opportunities to find any bottlenecks and to identify appropriate measures to address any such bottlenecks.</p> <p>It should also be noted that through the implementation of the HR division's strategic plan, efforts to ensure that HR practices are simple, fast and smart have been undertaken. As a way to better manage the timelines, the HR staffing representative, upon receiving the approved staffing requisition, establishes jointly with the hiring division all the key dates, in order to ensure the process is kept on track. This includes determining when the position will be posted, when the screening process will be completed and when assessments will be carried out. By establishing these timelines up front, this minimizes delays along the way of trying to find time in the calendar of hiring managers, interview panel participants, because the dates have been set earlier on.</p> |

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented**

Division: Information & Technology

Report Title: Governance and Management of City Computer Software Needs Improvement

Report Date: January 7, 2011

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|---|
| 003 | The Chief Information Officer prepare a Software Asset Management Plan. Such plan to address the role of information technology governance committees, accountability, policies, procedures, practices and divisional coordination related to managing software. | The ITAM Master Management Plan which will include all the stakeholders' plans and related documents such as polices, processes and procedures, roles and responsibilities, is currently being developed. This is an ongoing document, and the first edition is expected to be published in July 2012. |
| 004 | The Chief Information Officer ensure the City Information Technology Risk Management Program includes a periodic risk assessment to identify, assess and implement processes to address software related risk. | A robust Information Technology Risk Management Program will be incorporated into the Software Asset Management Plan noted in the response to Recommendation 2. To be completed By Q4 2012 |
| 006 | The Chief Information Officer determine resources and processes necessary to update and maintain the Information Technology Asset Management System prior to implementation. | (1) Requests and briefing notes were sent to request proper staffing resources for the ITAM. The ITAM group will need a minimum of 5 staff to function. Processes in place as of January 2012. (2) Was able to have a temp Support Assistant C and a contractor as a Business Analyst until November 2011, and an internal resource on secondment which will run until June 2012. (3) Had an ETSS position approved. Unable to hire the suitable candidate through internal and external postings. Worked with HR to look for a suitable candidate through Workopolis. (4) In the process of acquiring a contractor as Software License Analyst for 12 months. (5) Assigned an Operations System Analyst area to work as the Tool |
| 009 | The Chief Information Officer review current practices followed by divisions and take steps to standardize management controls to ensure effective processes are in place to track, reconcile and monitor City-wide software compliance. | Current practices by divisions will be reviewed towards standardized management controls. (1) Comments were received as a result of the distribution of the IT Asset Management Work Plan and they are being consolidated. (2) Incorporated the comments and action plans from these stakeholders onto the ITAM Master Management Plan To be completed By Q4 2012 |

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented**

Report Title: Review of the City SAP Competency Centre

Report Date: June 15, 2010

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|---|
| 001 | <p>The City Manager, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, review the current reporting structure and relationships between divisional SAP representatives and the Competency Centre with a view to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. minimizing delays in the completion of SAP projects b. ensuring that the ownership of certain SAP modules is clarified and workable c. ensuring that there is an appropriate segregation of duties between SAP divisional staff and the SAP Competency Centre. | <p>This item was tabled at the SAP Steering Committee in April. The processes associated with this item will be reviewed and presented to the SAPSC for adoption through 2012</p> |
| 002 | <p>The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer formalize a policy to require adherence to SAP best practices for all City-wide SAP projects, and implement quality assurance measures to ensure such practices are followed.</p> | <p>This item was tabled at the SAP Steering Committee in April. The processes associated with this item will be reviewed and presented to the SAPSC for adoption through 2012</p> |
| 004 | <p>The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer establish a formal process for ensuring those assigned accountability for overseeing SAP projects understand the City SAP environment and have sufficient knowledge and expertise in SAP best practice and methodology.</p> | <p>This item was tabled at the SAP Steering Committee in April. The processes associated with this item will be reviewed and presented to the SAPSC for adoption through 2012</p> |
| 005 | <p>The Chief Information Officer include SAP Competency Centre service level expectations in formal service level agreements currently being prepared between operating divisions and the Information and Technology Division.</p> | <p>This will be aligned with the timetable for the IT transformation initiative</p> |
| 006 | <p>The City Manager establish a process for maintaining a single repository for SAP related issues and risks, and the Chief Information Officer establish a formal process for collecting, addressing and reporting on such risks.</p> | <p>This item was tabled at the SAP Steering Committee in April. The processes associated with this item will be reviewed and presented to the SAPSC for adoption through 2012</p> |

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|--|
| 007 | The Chief Information Officer develop SAP Competency Centre performance measures and standards. Such measures and standards should monitor ongoing performance. | A proposal to acquire and implement an ESMS solution is underway now. Upon approval, this project will have a 2-3 year implementation. |

Report Title: Governance and Management of City Wireless Technology Needs Improvement

Report Date: April 20, 2010

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|---|
| 003 | The Chief Information Officer prepare a comprehensive City-wide IT Wireless Plan and periodically review the plan to ensure that it is current and relevant. | Concurrent planning activities are underway. A City wide wireless policy, will be developed by Q4 2012 and the standards will be created to support the policy developed. |
| 005 | The Chief Information Officer implement City-wide wireless standards and develop procedures to provide for periodic review to ensure the accuracy and relevancy of wireless standards. | The implementation of City-wide wireless standards and the development of procedures to provide a periodic review to ensure the accuracy and relevancy of wireless standards are underway. Completion date Q4 2012 |
| 006 | The Chief Information Officer develop a comprehensive IT Security Manual as a ready reference for City staff. | The Risk Management and Information Security (RM&IS) group, in consultation with the Strategic Planning, Policy and Standards group, will undertake a refresh of the existing information security policy and will produce a new comprehensive IT Security Policy by the end of Q2 2012. Information security standards, procedures and guidelines will be developed and published by the end of Q4 2012. These will form the basis for a comprehensive IT Information Security Manual and will serve as a ready reference for all City staff. |
| 007 | The Chief Information Officer implement additional measures to further reduce the risk of unauthorized access to City wireless technology. | The I&T Division proposes a two-phase approach: Phase 1: Starting in Q3 2010, RM&IS has worked with TIS to review existing processes to determine where to infuse "best in class" Information Security / IT Risk Management methodologies. Phase 2: RM&IS will submit a business case to enable further enhancements in 2012. |

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented**

Report Title: Review of Information Technology Training

Report Date: November 5, 2009

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|--|
| 004 | The Chief Information Officer develop performance indicators to measure the efficiency and effectiveness of the Information and Technology Training and Education Unit and training courses provided by the Unit. | I&T division have acquired Price Waterhouse Coopers service to assist the division with the development of IT performance measurements, including I&T Training & Education. Completion date: Dec. 2012 |

Report Title: Integrated Business Management System (IBMS)

Report Date: January 16, 2009

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|--|
| 002 | The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer require that divisions identify business risks relating to the IBMS Information Technology System. The Chief Information Officer review all such risks and ensure strategies and processes are in place to address all such risks. | IT Risk Management and Information Security group was directed by the CIO to assist in a project to address this issue via external consultants. In Q1 2012 a third-party vendor was hired to conduct a Threat Risk Assessment (TRA) to identify, assess and document the potential business risks to IBMS. A RFQ was released in December 2011 and a vendor was selected to begin this work early February 2012. |
| 003 | The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer and divisions develop IBMS performance measures. Such measures be used to monitor ongoing performance. Where performance does not meet such measures, corrective action be taken. | IBMS User Group re-constituted and asked to address this issue. Initial response back to Steering Committee expected in Q2 2011. Initial Service Level Agreement (SLA) will not include this response. Assumption is that the recommendations may (but not definitely) require significant system changes. The IBMS User Group initiated this work in Q3, 2011. However, it is not yet completed. |
| 004 | The City Manager and Chief Information Officer as part of the IBMS governance process give priority to the development of IBMS business continuity plans. Such plans should include disaster and recovery planning. | The I&T Division (led by the RM&IS Section) has planned the implementation of a Business Continuity Plan / Disaster Recovery Plan (BCP/DRP) for the I&T Division. The DRP portion, when implemented, will provide the ability to support divisional BCP/DRP requirements. Recent 2010 budget cuts have severely limited enhancements to divisional disaster recovery solutions for 2-3 years. The Office of Emergency Management has the mandate and has begun a separate project to address Enterprise BCP planning. They will be contacted in Q1, 2012 to understand if and how this initiative would |

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|--|
| | | address this audit recommendation |
| 005 | The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer develop and formalize service level agreements for information technology services provided to City Divisions by the Information and Technology Division. | <p>Service Level Agreement expected to be completed in Q2 2011 for Municipal Licensing & Standards (MLS) and Toronto Building (TB). City Planning scheduled for completion in Q4 2011.</p> <p>Municipal Licensing & Standards Service Level Agreement is in final client review awaiting signoff. Toronto Building Service Level Agreement and City Planning Service Level Agreement were initiated in Q1 2011 but are now on hold due to recent SLM resources constraint.</p> <p>2012 SLM Plan: Service Level Agreement priorities in discussion due to resources constraint in the SLM unit.</p> |
| 007 | The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer develop and implement a change management protocol for IBMS. Such a protocol take into account the SAP change management protocol. | <p>Updated Change Management (CM) protocols originally planned for January 2011 to align with change in IBMS support protocols to support SLA and CM. Insufficient funding for new support protocols so CM plans being reviewed again. Protocols to be submitted for approval to the Steering Committee in Q2 2011.</p> <p>No Change Management protocols have been submitted to the Steering Committee for review & approval. The effort to finalize these protocols will resume in Q1, 2012.</p> |
| 009 | The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer be required to conduct periodic reviews of current IBMS user security to ensure access is compatible with user roles. Such review should also include an analysis of the last date of use. Dormant users should be eliminated from system access. | The process associated with addressing this recommendation will be reviewed by the IBMS Steering Committee for adoption through 2012. |
| 013 | The Chief Information Officer obtain a copy of the System source code for the current release of the System software and ensure future releases are accompanied with System software under the terms of the agreement. | <p>Ongoing negotiations with the vendor on this issue as well as Legal, Contract Management Office and the Risk Management and Information Security team within I&T. Resolution expected in Q3 2011. I&T are also reviewing source code escrow policies at an enterprise level.</p> <p>This recommendation will be addressed through the upcoming contract negotiations to revise the existing contracts between the City and the Vendor. These negotiations are schedule to begin in February 2012</p> |

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented**

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|--|
| | | with a commitment from the City's Contract Management office, Legal and I&T Division |
| 014 | The City Manager conduct a review of related System users in the City and its Agencies, Boards and Commissions and update the existing software maintenance contract as required. | <p>New CMO lead for this contract is planning to initiate contract review process in Q2 2011.</p> <p>Contract negotiations between the City and the Vendor are schedule to begin in February 2012 with a commitment from the City's Contract Management office, Legal and I&T Division.</p> |
| 015 | The City Manager ensure staff from business units perform the procedure for revising service fees maintained in IBMS and that the process be appropriately documented. | <p>There are many potential components of the Fee revision process – Fee rate, Effective Date, Fee Category and Subcategory, Service unit (e.g. Sq metre; per hour; each item), related legislation, minimum and maximum. These components are maintained in an IBMS feature called ValidLookup. This area of the system is also used for a number of other IBMS Application Administration parameters. There is no user-friendly interface that would allow business users to enter new fee rates into IBMS. Developing such an interface would be a considerable activity. Moving the fee parameters out of the ValidLookup feature would be an even greater development exercise, as all fee-related programming would have to be rewritten.</p> <p>Action/Implementation Plan: As of Jan 1, 2010, the following procedure was established for IBMS fee revisions:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Designated business user sends new Fee details to IBMS Application Administrator (AA). 2. IBMS Application Administrator adds new Fee information to ValidLookup in IBMS Development database, ensuring that his/her name and the date/time are captured. 3. IBMS Application Administrator prepares reports summarizing all changes, with a side-by-side comparison of current and new fees. The report also reflects the Application Administrator's name, and date/time each change was made. The reports are sent to the designated business user. 4. Business user reviews the new fees and signs the report indicating approval to implement the new fees as described. 5. Upon receipt of formal approval, the IBMS Application Administrator prepares an "export package" to add the new fees to Production (Live) IBMS and all other IBMS databases consistently and |

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented**

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|----------------|--|
| | | <p>accurately.</p> <p>6. Initial Fee details, report of revised fees, and approval from the business user are saved in an IT support task folder in IBMS.</p> <p>7. On the first business day in which the new fees are in effect, actual fees calculated in Production IBMS are reviewed and confirmed via manual calculation by the Business unit and by IT staff (including IBMS Application Administrator).</p> <p>This procedure continues to evolve and will be formalized as a policy with Policy Planning Finance Administration and IBMS divisions prior to the next round of fee increases.</p> <p>Policy Planning Finance Administration division has deferred the completion of a new fee policy until Q1, 2012.</p> |

Report Title: Disaster Recovery Planning for City Computer Facilities

Report Date: March 3, 2008

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|---|
| 002 | <p>The City Manager implement a disaster recovery and business continuity program that includes divisional roles and responsibilities, resource and training requirements, and simulation and plan maintenance schedules.</p> | <p>The I&T Division has implemented a new disaster recovery and business continuity program for the I&T Division. The I&T Division is also supporting the Office of Emergency Management in its creation of a City-wide business continuity program for all Divisions. The Office of Emergency Management (OEM) is working to build a foundation to integrate business resumption plans and recovery strategies. Great progress has been made so far due to collaborative efforts; however a comprehensive Business Continuity Program will take several years to develop. This is no longer a CIO mandate, it belongs to the OEM. A Business Continuity Policy has been adopted by the Toronto Emergency Management Program Committee (TEMPC). The policy is intended to formalize the Business Continuity Program for the City of Toronto and includes a governance structure for developing maintaining and testing Business Continuity Plans. Completed by: Q4-2015</p> |

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented**

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|--|
| 005 | <p>The Chief Information Officer review the backup and storage procedures of City information technology units for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) compliance with acceptable standards and practices for data backup and storage requirements; and (b) provide divisions with the opportunity to participate in existing data storage arrangements within the City or with the outside service provider. | <p>The I&T Division currently backs up its data on a nightly basis and sends the backup media offsite daily to an external storage provider. RM&IS is reviewing backup and storage procedures of City Information Technology units to ensure compliance with acceptable standards and practices. RMIS will work with TIS and the divisions to formalize the processes going forward.</p> |
| 006 | <p>The City Manager, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, direct divisions to test information technology disaster recovery plans on a regular basis.</p> | <p>Within the new I&T Division BC/DR program, I&T has created a process to test BC and DR plans within the I&T Division. The I&T Division is also supporting the Office of Emergency Management's City-wide BC/DR program. This includes testing. Completed by: Q4-2015</p> |
| 007 | <p>The Chief Information Officer develop disaster recovery testing guidelines and provide training necessary to ensure cross-divisional consistency.</p> | <p>The new I&T Division BC/DR Program includes DR testing guidelines and a process for the scheduling of DR tests within the I&T Division. The Office of Emergency Management will be developing the City-wide BC/DR program and the I&T Division will be able to support Divisional testing at that time. Completed by: Q4-2015</p> |

Report Title: Management of City Information Technology Assets

Report Date: January 26, 2006

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|--|
| 005 | <p>The Chief Corporate Officer, subsequent to the implementation of the Enterprise Information Technology Management System, be required to coordinate periodic asset inventory counts. Any inaccuracies discovered during the inventory count be investigated and appropriate adjustments made accordingly, subject to supervisory review and approval.</p> | <p>The new HP tool: Asset Inventory Application (DDMI) has been implemented and is in pre-production, with production planned for July 2012.</p> <p>Estimated completion date: Q4 2012</p> |

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented**

Division: Parks, Forestry & Recreation
Report Title: Parks, Forestry and Recreation Division-Controls Over Ferry Service Revenue Need Strengthening
Report Date: April 26, 2010

| No. | Recommendation | Management’s Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|--|
| 002 | <p>The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, develop an automated cash reconciliation process. The process should include daily variance tracking of cash shortages and overages, and should report accumulated variances by month, year and cashier. The process should also provide for investigation and reconciliation of unusual variances. Mandatory supervisory review should include sign-off on all reconciliations and variances. Variance reports should be retained in accordance with required record retention time frames.</p> | <p>The cash reconciliation is done at the Ferry Docks on a daily basis with full participation of Rafik Jaffer and William White, Supervisor Marine Services and Waterfront Parks (who have no cash handling duties). Any discrepancies are investigated and cleared immediately. Full variance tracking documentation is kept at the Ferry docks management office. The existence of the cash handling control at the Ferry Docks relieves the requirement for similar duplicate controls at the Revenue Management Office</p> <p><u>AG's Comments:</u></p> <p>During our review of bank deposits and revenue records, we noted variances between Ferry Services records and Finance records. These variances could not be resolved by the time of completion of our fieldwork. We understand one key staff member responsible for keeping track of Finance records and variances was absent due to sick leaves, and as a result the variances remained unexplained.</p> <p>We acknowledge that internal controls over tracking of cash variances at Ferry Services have improved. However, we noted individual cashier's monthly variances exceed \$1,000 and management stated this as tolerable risk. We concluded this recommendation as not fully implemented and will follow-up this recommendation in next year's follow-up cycle. Unexplained variances may reflect cash exposures. Finance has agreed to review their spreadsheet in coordination with Ferry Services.</p> |
| 004 | <p>The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, implement an interim process to independently reconcile point of sale revenues with bank deposits.</p> | <p>Since both Ferry docks and Revenue Management Office process tickets for ferry services, it would be an incompatible function for PF&R to reconcile sale revenues with bank deposits. Currently the bank reconciliation is handled by Corporate Accounting at Metro Hall 21st floor. This arrangement satisfies the principle of internal control relating to separation of duties. As such the current bank reconciliation process should be continued.</p> |

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented**

| No. | Recommendation | Management’s Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|---|
| | | <p><u>AG's Comments:</u></p> <p>During our review of bank deposits and revenue records, we noted variances between Ferry Services records and Finance records. These variances could not be resolved by the time of completion of our fieldwork. We understand one key staff member responsible for keeping track of Finance records and variances was absent due to sick leaves, and as a result the variances remained unexplained. Contrary to the management assertion, we concluded this recommendation as not fully implemented and will follow-up this recommendation in the next follow-up cycle.</p> |
| 006 | <p>The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, evaluate options for automating the ferry service ticket inventory.</p> | <p>PF&R will review in 2012. Still require some manual ticket dispensing of cash, debit and credit passenger ticket purchases due to large volumes of passengers.</p> |
| 007 | <p>The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, evaluate options for:</p> <p>a. Automating ticket cancellation and refund processes.</p> <p>b. Implementing a process to analytically review cancelled tickets and refunds.</p> <p>Further, the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, implement a process to ensure reasons for ticket and ferry pass cancellations and refunds are appropriately documented and are subject to supervisory approval.</p> | <p>a. Still performed manually by Marine Coordinator and Supervisor, followed up with a Memo to Revenue/Finance Division. Analytical review of cancelled tickets performed by the Marine Coordinator.</p> <p>b. Audit recommendations implemented</p> <p><u>AG's Comments:</u> Auditor General follow-up only those recommendations that are fully implemented. This will be followed-up in next year's follow-up cycle.</p> |
| 009 | <p>The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, develop a process to review and monitor vendor contracts and ensure contracts are renewed on a timely basis.</p> <p>In addition, the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, develop a process to periodically bill and follow-up on outstanding revenues on a timely basis.</p> | <p>Partially implemented – Expected to be fully implemented by December 2012</p> |

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|---|
| 010 | The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, evaluate controls on system data and change management processes, and ensure corporate requirements are followed for current and future computer systems. | PF&R is working with I&T on the development of adequate controls, processes and standards related to data, change management and corporate requirement. These requirements will be included in the solution procurement process scheduled to occur in 2012 with deployment completed in 2013. |

Report Title: Parks, Forestry and Recreation – Capital Program – The Backlog in Needed Repairs Continues to Grow

Report Date: January 23, 2009

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|---|
| 001 | The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, develop a comprehensive master service and infrastructure plan, incorporating the Division's "Our Common Grounds" strategy and all related studies being developed or planned pertaining to parks and recreation facilities, and report to the Community Development and Recreation Committee by June 30, 2010. Such master plan to include, but not limited to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. specific action plans, timelines and responsibility for implementation b. estimated costs and potential funding sources or partnership opportunities to be explored c. reporting on the status of the master implementation plan as part of the annual capital budget submission. | In progress. Pending report submission and City Council approval by the end of 2012. |
| 002 | The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, take appropriate steps to <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. develop criteria for determining when a City facility is considered to be no longer cost-effective to maintain, taking into consideration such factors as utilization, ongoing operating and capital maintenance costs, location, and proximity to other facilities, community | a. As reported in 2011: Currently in place. Capital projects are reviewed by PF&R Branches to ensure they are still applicable. In addition, a Recreation Facilities Strategic Plan will be developed in 2013 to help guide further decision-making based on outcomes from the Corporate Efficiency Review, Core Service Review and information from the PF&R Service Plans. |

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented**

| No. | Recommendation | Management’s Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|---|
| | <p>impact and changing demographics</p> <p>b. where practical, incorporate the criteria developed into the capital asset management system</p> <p>c. compile a comprehensive inventory of all facilities that are no longer cost-effective to maintain based on criteria developed in (a.)</p> <p>d. identify opportunities for consolidation of operations within existing facilities or potential new ones and recommend facility closures, if warranted</p> <p>e. determine the full financial implications of either maintaining, enhancing or closing facilities, including any potential program changes resulting from each option</p> <p>f. where a facility closure is recommended, develop alternate accommodation for viable affected programs</p> <p>g. conduct appropriate community consultations of any planned actions.</p> | <p>b. As reported in 2011: Currently in place.</p> <p>c. As reported in 2011: The Capital Projects Section has developed the PRIORITY RANK FACTOR (PCR) which drives the state-of-good repair project priority in the Capital Asset Management (CAMP) budget. Each project listed in the CAMP budget is assigned a PCR. The PCR is the sum of the various rankings applied to each asset that include the FACILITY CONDITION INDEX (FCI), PRIORITY FACTOR (PF) and RANK FACTOR (RF).</p> <p>d. In progress. A Recreation Facilities Strategic Plan will be developed in 2013 to help guide further decision-making based on outcomes from the Corporate Efficiency Review, Core Service Review and information from the PF&R Service Plans.</p> <p>e. As above.</p> <p>f. As above</p> <p>g. As above</p> |
| 003 | <p>The City Manager give priority to the development and implementation of a City-wide prioritization framework for capital repairs, as previously recommended in an Auditor General’s report entitled “Maintenance and Administrative Controls Review – Facilities and Real Estate” dated September 2005. Further, the priority framework be enhanced by including all new capital projects.</p> | <p><u>Management Comments:</u> Implemented</p> <p><u>AG’s Comments:</u></p> <p>We consider this recommendation not fully implemented. A framework has been developed and is included in the capital budget manual. To date, the framework has only been applied on a divisional basis. In our view, cross divisional priorities should be assessed by the City Manager for prioritization on a City wide basis and eventually for resource allocation recommendations to Council.</p> |
| 007 | <p>The City Manager, in consultation with the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation and the Director, Toronto Office of Partnerships, develop, for approval by Council, a comprehensive City-wide policy on naming rights and other private funding arrangements, such policy to</p> <p>a. consider all existing policies related to:</p> <p>i. Parks and Recreation Naming and</p> | <p>Reference is made to Report EX12.2 City Council approved Naming Rights & Sponsorship Policy in December 2011</p> <p>a. i) As above</p> <p>ii) As reported in 2011: Donations Policy currently exists.</p> <p>lii) The current Corporate Policy on advertising deals</p> |

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented**

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|--|
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Renaming Policy ii. Donations policy iii. Advertising iv. Unsolicited bids v. Sponsorships and partnerships <p>b. include guidelines on</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. eligibility criteria for facilities to be considered for naming rights ii. responsibility and control processes for securing and accepting naming rights or other private funding arrangements iii. the creation of endowment, or similar funds, to offset future maintenance and repair costs for new facilities put in place under this policy. | <p>with the purchase of advertising and not selling. It is not part of the Sponsorship or Naming Rights policies. Amendments to the policy on advertising is expected to be completed by the Autumn 2012.</p> <p>iv) As reported in 2011: A policy on unsolicited proposals currently exists as does a Corporate process.</p> <p>v) Reference is made to Report EX12.2 City Council approved Naming Rights & Sponsorship Policy in December 2011</p> <p>b. i) In progress. Consultation with operating Divisions expected to be completed Spring 2012.</p> <p>ii) In progress. Consultation with operating Divisions expected to be completed Spring 2012.</p> <p>iii) In progress. PF&R and TOP are currently looking at the possibility of endowment/maintenance funds for new parks. Expected report to be completed summer 2012</p> <p>b. i) In progress. Consultation with operating Divisions expected to be completed Spring 2012.</p> <p>ii) In progress. Consultation with operating Divisions expected to be completed Spring 2012.</p> <p>iii) In progress. PF&R and TOP are currently looking at the possibility of endowment/maintenance funds for new parks. Expected report to be completed summer 2012</p> |
| 008 | <p>The Director, Toronto Office of Partnerships, in consultation with appropriate divisional staff, identify all potential projects and facilities that may benefit from naming rights or other private funding arrangements and, with the approval of Council, pursue such funding according to corporate guidelines.</p> | <p>In progress. Consultation with operating Divisions expected to be completed Spring 2012. Report to Council for approval required.</p> |
| 009 | <p>The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, give priority to completing the development and implementation of the work order system for Parks, Forestry and Recreation Division to provide the tracking of both operating and capital costs of each facility.</p> | <p>In progress. This is a Capital project to implement a PF&R Work Order Management System.</p> <p>PF&R's previous work completed to-date is being used to expedite the rationalization project.</p> <p>Report on rationalization of work management processes and systems is due the second quarter in 2012 with an RFP for solution to be executed by the 4th quarter in 2012</p> |

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented**

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|---|
| 010 | The City Clerk, in consultation with the City Solicitor, clarify Council procedures with respect to recommendations at Community Councils on matters that are contrary to Council policy, and consider requiring that such recommendations state explicitly that a Council policy is being contravened. | The City Manager is currently reviewing alternatives for implementing this recommendation with a report expected by December 2012 |

Division: Real Estate Services

Report Title: Review of the Administration of Leases on City Owned Property

Report Date: July 8, 2006

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|---|
| 002 | The City Manager, at the conclusion of the review of the governance structure relating to the City's property maintenance program, give consideration to how the recommendations resulting from the governance review may have relevance to the management of the City's lease portfolio. | The implications of the recommendations continue to be under review by Real Estate Services and Parks, Forestry & Recreation. |

Division: Revenue Services

Report Title: Administration of Municipal Land Transfer Tax, Revenue Services Division

Report Date: June 16, 2010

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|---|
| 002 | The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer formalize policies and procedures designed to mitigate the risk of errors in the services rendered by Teranet Enterprises Inc. | Revenue Services in conjunction with Internal Audit completed a review of the MLTT program (2nd Qtr 2011), and staff are still working with Internal Audit on formalizing/refining internal operational policies, procedures and internal controls for completion in the 2nd Qtr 2012. |
| 003 | The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer request from Teranet Enterprises Inc. its Compliance Monitoring Report. The Compliance Monitoring Report be reviewed to ensure it is independent, can be relied upon and any areas of concern are adequately addressed. | City Legal Services, Corporate Finance and Revenue Services met with Teranet Inc. on November 04, 2010, and were advised that the City would be included and benefit from an annual COBIT system compliance monitoring. Revenue staff were recently advised by Teranet and the Office of the Auditor General of Ontario that Ernst and Young completed an "Agreed Upon Procedures" report for fiscal 2011-2012, intends |

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|--|
| | | to have a S.5970 report done for 2012-13 and a specific IT Teraview Systems Report (to be completed in Q3/Q4 of 2012) inclusive of compliance monitoring performed by the external independent auditor retained by Teranet. Once provided, Revenue staff with Corporate Finance and Legal Services will review the report to ensure it is an independent assessment, it can be relied upon and it addresses any areas of concern. |
| 005 | The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer complete a sample review of municipal land transfer tax rebates granted by Teranet Enterprises Inc. during the seven-month period ending August 31, 2008 to ensure that the City's rebate eligibility criteria were met. | Revenue Services staff have completed a review of 376 audit files (from the "Audits to be Completed" files from Teranet and the "Disallowance" report). Based on the experience and outcomes of the above review, staff are undertaking a review of 38 additional (10% of the original sample) manual rebate files. Further, Revenue staff will review an additional sampling of MLT rebates granted and refunded by Teranet, where said rebates were fully completed by Teranet and did not require any additional supporting documentation or follow-up. (Completion to be finalized 2nd Qtr 2012) |
| 008 | The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer encourage prompt payment by developing policies to implement interest, financial penalties and other enforcement measures permitted by the Municipal Land Transfer Tax By-law No. 1423-2007. | Revenue Services in conjunction with Internal Audit completed a review of the MLTT program (2nd Qtr 2011). Interest and penalty are being consistently applied in accord to the MLTT By-law, while staff are still working with Internal Audit on formalizing/refining internal operational policies and procedures for interest, penalty and enforcement measures consistent to the MLTT By-law and Provincial MOR guidelines. (2nd Qtr 2012 completion.) |
| 009 | <p>The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer:</p> <p>a. in consultation with the City Solicitor, review the Municipal Land Transfer Tax By-law No. 1423-2007 to identify any provisions requiring clarification or amendment, and report to City Council, if necessary, on any revisions identified</p> <p>b. develop clear written guidelines to ensure consistent application of provisions in the Toronto Municipal Land Transfer Tax By-law No. 1423-2007 by staff of the Revenue Services Division.</p> | <p>a.) Revenue Services and Corporate Finance met with Legal Services on September 16, 2010 to review and identify any necessary By-law revisions. Through this review, there are not any revisions required.</p> <p>b.) Once Revenue Services has finalized the interest and penalty procedures and operational process guidelines, we will undertake a further review and update to the existing MLTT Program handbook of operational procedures to ensure consistent application of the MLTT By-laws and program details. (Estimated completion late 2nd Qtr 2012)</p> |

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

Division: Shelter, Support & Housing Administration

Report Title: Hostel Operations Review – Community and Neighbourhood Services

Report Date: June 20, 2004

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|---|
| 017 | <p>the Commissioner, Community and Neighbourhood Services, review the Out of the Cold Program, with a view to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) evaluating the costs and benefits of the program; (b) reporting to the Community and Neighbourhood Services Committee, together with a recommendation on the future direction of the program both in the short-term and the long-term based on the evaluation; and (c) in the interim, provide clear direction as to how the program fits into the overall City shelter system, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) the City's role in the provision of the support services by the agency running the program; and (ii) the City's role in the provision of emergency shelter services by the participating community organizations, particularly with respect to the applicability of the City's Shelter Standards to these organizations; | <p>Report will be brought forward to Council in 2012.</p> |
| 024 | <p>the Commissioner, Community and Neighbourhood Services, develop a policy that clearly establishes standard rates for maintenance fees for emergency shelter users. Such policies determine at what income levels maintenance fees become due. The policy be applied consistently to both City-operated and purchased service shelters. Internal controls commensurate with the level of fees collected be established.</p> | <p>Original expectation was that this would be addressed through the Corporate User Fee report and policy that went forward in 2011. This did not occur so SSHA will bring forward a report to council in 2012.</p> |

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

Division: Technical Services

Report Title: Management of Construction Contracts – Leaside Bridge Structure Rehabilitation Contract

Report Date: March 23, 2007

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|---|
| 009 | <p>The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer consider the implementation of a policy for the recovery of administration fees relating to the management of contracts by the City on behalf of third parties. Such a policy be included in the Technical Services Capital Works Projects Procurement and Administration Procedures Manual.</p> | <p>As part of the corporate user fee report going forward to the Executive Committee to be considered with the 2012 Operating Budget, this fee has been recommended for a further more comprehensive review during 2012 to assess its viability and impacts.</p> <p>Background</p> <p>The third parties include, but are not limited to TTC, City divisions other than Transportation Services and Toronto Water, other City agencies, BIAs, utility companies, and provincial and federal agencies</p> <p>Technical Services estimates that a total fee of 18.3% of the third party construction costs represents an adequate cost recovery. The fee of 13.5% of construction costs is currently charged for design and construction work on TTC projects, but Technical Services does not have a policy in place to recover costs incurred for work performed on behalf of other third parties. As a result, costs are not equitably and consistently recovered.</p> <p>As part of the City's corporate user fee review in the fall of 2011, it was established that the intent of this fee is to establish a fair distribution of costs, since most of the third party costs are borne by the two major City Programs, Transportation Services and Toronto Water. There may also be a potential for additional revenue from outside clients such as Toronto Hydro. However, the impact that the introduction of this fee could have on other City programs budgets could not be determined without further analysis. For example, a fee increase from 13.5% to 18.3% would represent additional pressure for the TTC's Operating Budget.</p> |

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

Division: Toronto Building

Report Title: Administration of Development Funds, Parkland Levies and Education Development Charges

Report Date: June 16, 2010

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|---|
| 001 | The Chief Building Official, in consultation with the General Manager of Parks, Forestry and Recreation, implement controls to prevent the issuance of a building permit until parkland dedication fees have been paid. | <p>Automated controls have been put in place to prevent the issuance of Building Permits until parkland dedication fee is paid.</p> <p>Automated controls for part permits for foundations and for conditional permits to prevent the issuance of part permits would add additional controls that are not in keeping with required business rational for part permits.</p> <p>The Park Levy Appraisal form does include information/explanation on exemptions. The exemption information is captured on forms and allows for future reporting.</p> <p>Consideration could be given to controls to added controls on structural permits.</p> |
| 002 | The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer review the infrastructure construction price index currently used by the City of Ottawa in order to determine whether or not a similar index should be used to adjust annual development charge rates at the City of Toronto. | The potential for a custom index will be examined in greater detail as part of the City's DC by-law review that is currently in progress and is anticipated to be completed by spring 2013. Based on discussions with Statistics Canada, fairly detailed (historical) project cost data is required to develop the index at an initial cost of ~\$45,000 and ~\$7,500 for future annual updates. It has been estimated that had the City used the Ottawa index, DC revenue collections could have been lower by almost \$20 million over a six-year period from 2004 to 2009. |
| 003 | The Chief Building Official, in consultation with the City Solicitor, review the feasibility of including in conditional permit agreements, additional fees payable when terms are not met. | This item has been reviewed with Legal and confirmation will be provided. |
| 005 | The Chief Building Official and the Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer review those areas of the by-law which are the subject of staff misinterpretation and ensure that such areas are addressed either through amendments to the by-law, policies and procedures manual or through additional staff training. | <p>Information was provided on e-mail clarification on by-law implementations that was shared with staff when issues arose.</p> <p>The training that was provided to staff addressed the areas of concern;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - inappropriate application of residential unit rates; - incorrect by-law used to calculate non-residential charges; |

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|--|
| | | <p>- incorrect application of reductions for redevelopments;</p> <p>- incorrect rates used for development charges on subdivisions</p> <p>Also of note that these areas of concerns were isolated occurrences.</p> <p>In addition back ground study is underway for a new DC By-law. Toronto Building Staff (working group) has meet with staff from Special Project and the Consultant to provide input on changes to the by-law as part of this review to simplify administration.</p> |
| 006 | The Chief Building Official evaluate the current audit process to ensure development charge calculations are verified to supporting documentation. Consideration be given to an audit process prior to the issuance of a building permit. | Current audit process is being reviewed and updated and reflected in management performance planners 2012 to include verification of information used for calculations. |

Division: Toronto Environment Office

Report Title: Toronto Environment Office - Review of Administration of Environmental Grants

Report Date: January 17, 2011

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|--|
| 001 | The City Manager review the City's various environmental grant programs to ensure they are structured and managed as efficiently and effectively as possible. The results of the review, along with any recommendations, be reported to Executive Committee. | Will be completed as part of 2013 operating budget. |
| 002 | The Director, Toronto Environment Office, ensure that each grant file is complete and contains all relevant documentation. Further, the Director, Toronto Environment Office document in each project file the assessment of the impact of any reductions to grant requests on the organization's ability to complete the project as proposed. | TEO will continue improve its project files. This recommendation is projected to be completed by 2013. |
| 006 | The Director, Toronto Environment Office, ensure grant program progress and results are reported to Council during 2011. | Delayed to later half of 2012. |

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

Division: Toronto Water

Report Title: Toronto Protecting Water Quality and Preventing Pollution – Assessing the Effectiveness of the City’s Sewer Use By-law

Report Date: October 10, 2008

| No. | Recommendation | Management’s Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|---|
| 004 | The General Manager, Toronto Water review inspection and sampling targets to ensure that they are reasonable given risks to pollute and the staff resources available and report to City Council by September 2009 on recommended targets and resources required to meet those targets. | EM&P is on target for sampling of High Potential industries. The sampling targets for High and Medium potential industries were reviewed in 2011 and changes made to the Medium potential facility sampling from one sampling event every two months to once a quarter. This change is effective as of October 1, 2011. EM&P will be monitoring the effectiveness of the new MP metric in Q4 2012 |
| 006 | The General Manager, Toronto Water develops and implement tailored inspection checklists for certain industries to ensure that industry specific risks are addressed on a consistent basis. | Work started on developing inspection templates for the Dry Cleaning and Auto Body Refinishing Sectors. These inspection forms are expected to be completed by September 30, 2012 and are the only remaining forms required to be completed. |
| 007 | The General Manager, Toronto Water, in consultation with the City Legal Division, reassess the City’s authority to enforce the implementation of pollution prevention plans. Should it be determined that no such authority exists, the General Manager consider whether seeking such authority is necessary. | Legal Services has provided a draft opinion in which TW will be discussing with Legal Services by end of Q2 2012. |
| 010 | <p>The General Manager, Toronto Water, develop criteria and procedures to guide the review and approval of pollution prevention plans including verification of the accuracy of the plan by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - comparing the plan to recent sampling results; - comparing the current plan to the previous plan to determine whether targets for reducing pollutants were being met; and - requesting companies to provide supporting documentation with their pollution prevention plans. | <p>In Q3 2012 TW will review the Legal Services opinion noted above in AG recommendation 007. The P2 Plan requirement now forms part of a Notice of Violation where Subject Pollutants are involved. TW Bylaw officers check for P2 requirements when there are sample violations.</p> <p>In 2011, changes were made to the P2 Plan Summary 2 Year update form and two sector P2 Plan forms (dry cleaning/laundry and printing which are sectors EM&P can monitor sewer discharge concentrations). The changes have made it easier to compare the new and old P2 Plans data.</p> <p>The comparison is performed by TW Research Analyst whose role relates to P2 Plan reviews.</p> |
| 014 | The General Manager, Toronto Water, assess the feasibility of using infraction notices to enforce the Sewer Use By-law. | In Q2 2012 EM&P will review the experiences of municipalities in Ontario that use infraction notices for sewer use offences. |

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|---|
| | | Legal Services has raised concerns with the use of infraction notices for Toronto's Sewers Bylaw which already has high penalties available. |
| 021 | The General Manager, Toronto Water Division, in consultation with the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards Division, and the City Solicitor, review areas where reciprocal inspections between the two divisions would be possible and if appropriate, establish a written protocol governing such inspections. | TW and MLS are meeting in late May 2012 to discuss and establish reciprocal inspections between both Divisions involving the automotive sector. |

Report Title: Toronto Water – Wastewater Treatment Phase Two

Report Date: September 21, 2007

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|--|
| 008 | The General Manager, Toronto Water Division, ensure that all staff involved in managing and developing contracts receive appropriate training to effectively carry out their responsibilities. | Administration of blanket contracts is now part of the service delivery model with dedicated PPFA support staff that have been trained to perform this function for Toronto Water. PPFA staff and Water staff have completed training on \$50K Informal Call process. Further training for TW staff managing contracts will be provided as required. Completed by: Dec.31, 2012 |
| 009 | The General Manager, Toronto Water Division, require that supervisory staff with contract management responsibilities evaluate and document vendor performance both during a contract and at its conclusion. | The Major Capital Works group as well as the Contract Administration Group are currently using the Contractor Evaluation form. Currently this form is used as a tool to communicate deficiencies to Vendors. Legal Services are working on the development of a Corporate Contractor Evaluation Form for all City Divisions based on the form used by Toronto Water. Once this form is available, it can be used when performance issues cannot be resolved through the regular contract management process. This information will be forwarded to PMMD for consideration of future contract awards and for seeking Council approval. |

**City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented**

Report Title: Management of Construction Contracts – Toronto Water and Sewer Emergency Repair Contracts

Report Date: July 30, 2007

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|--|
| 014 | The General Manager, Toronto Water, ensure contractor performance issues are consistently documented and monitored. Significant contractor performance issues that can not be resolved through the regular contract management process should be communicated to Purchasing and Materials Management for consideration in future contract award decisions. | All 2011 contracts in District Contract Services were subject to the Contractor Performance Evaluation in accordance with the instructions issued April 18, 2011. Training on the new Performance Management Tool in Toronto Water for all TW Project Managers did not take place as anticipated in 2011. Contract Services Project Managers will continue with the pilot evaluations and all scores will be maintained by the Managers office until such time as protocols and training is established for all TW. Full implementation is expected by the end of 2012. |
| 015 | The General Manager, Toronto Water, expedite the review and assessment of existing work management systems, including an assessment of the SAP Plant Maintenance Module. Following the selection of a work management system, its implementation should be expedited and the cost benefits of its integration with SAP be evaluated. | End of 2011 update - During 2011 the above effort moved forward to a point of issuing a E-Business RFP however in late 2011 no vendors passed the RFP scoring and the project was found to be under a major delay. TW along with Solid Waste, Transportation, and Parks, Forestry & Recreation formed a working group in October 2011 to focus on aligning both WMS applications and business improvement opportunities related to resource management, cross divisional efficiencies including the rationalization of WMS applications/set-up and support. A contract was awarded the week of Dec 23, 2011(via roster assignment) to address the above with a deliverable date of May 2012 for the final report for business improvement opportunities spanning the Division and WMS rationalization options (including SAP application and integration considerations). The Work Plan is to select one or fewer WMS applications based on cost justification and meeting business requirements by mid 2012 with the actual implementation beginning in 2013. |

Report Title: Toronto Water – Wastewater Treatment Phase One

Report Date: July 16, 2007

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|---|--|
| 013 | The General Manager, Toronto Water Division, require that an evaluation of the use of the work management system be | End of 2011 Update – All Plants are currently using the newly set up WMS application. The application is set up with all equipment and planned work loaded |

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|--|
| | conducted following implementation of the system at each plant location. In addition, timely action should be taken to correct problems that are identified during the evaluation process. | and plans are in place to implement legislative work in these two plants during the first half of 2012. Completed by: July 2012 |
| 015 | The General Manager, Toronto Water Division, expedite the review and assessment of the existing work management systems and the SAP Plant Maintenance Module and consider the feasibility of creating an interface between the selected system and the SAP Financial Information system. | End of 2011 update - During 2011 the above effort moved forward to a point of issuing a E-Business RFP however in late 2011 no vendors passed the RFP scoring and the project was found to be under a major delay. TW along with Solid Waste, Transportation, and Parks, Forestry & Recreation formed a working group in October 2011 to focus on aligning both WMS applications and business improvement opportunities related to resource management, cross divisional efficiencies including the rationalization of WMS applications/set-up and support. A contract was awarded the week of Dec 23, 2011(via roster assignment) to address the above with a deliverable date of May 2012 for the final report for business improvement opportunities spanning the Division and WMS rationalization options (including SAP application and integration considerations). The Work Plan is to select one or fewer WMS applications based on cost justification and meeting business requirements by mid 2012 with the actual implementation beginning in 2013. Completed by: January 2013 |

Division: Transportation Services

Report Title: Transportation Services - Review of Winter Maintenance Services

Report Date: April 26, 2011

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|---|
| 002 | The General Manager, Transportation Services, re-confirm with City Council, the City's winter maintenance service levels that would serve as basis for the next winter maintenance contracts (for 2015 and on), before initiating the Request for Quotation process. | This would be undertaken in 2014 prior to seeking quotations for service for the next term of contracts beginning in late 2015. |
| 004 | The General Manager, Transportation Services, in conjunction with the Chief Corporate Officer, give priority to updating | An update to the division's Snow Disposal Strategy is underway. A consultant has been retained in conjunction with the Facilities & Real Estate Division. |

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|------------|---|---|
| | <p>the long-term strategy for snow disposal operations, including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Determining the optimal number and location of snow dump and snow melting sites; b. Developing timelines for the acquisition and development of snow dump sites; and c. Reporting on the updated snow disposal plan to the Public Works and Infrastructure Committee by September 2012. | <p>The update is expected to be completed in 2012.</p> <p>Staff are working collaboratively on reviewing the inventory of surplus City-owned lands to determine their suitability for snow storage.</p> |
| 006 | <p>The General Manager, Transportation Services, on a pilot program basis, implement performance measures using available information such as GPS and salt usage data to assess whether approved service standards are met or exceeded, efficient employment of resources or other useful information for management.</p> | <p>Pilot projects involving greater use and real-time monitoring of equipment using GPS, and improved salt inventory methods are planned for 2012.</p> |
| 007 | <p>The Manager, Insurance and Risk Management, and divisional staff review their respective roles in investigating claims and ensuring adequate preventive measures are in place to minimize occurrence and related costs, including</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Establishing monitoring procedures at the division level to identify risk areas and analyze trends; b. Determining the appropriate level of detail that should be provided by Insurance and Risk Management to divisions to facilitate such analysis; and c. Utilizing GPS information as required for claims investigation to establish that the appropriate level of service has been provided. | <p>Division staff continue to meet with Insurance & Risk Management staff to improve the claims investigation and monitoring process.</p> <p>The KPMG SES also made recommendations in this regard.</p> <p>The Division has recently formed a working group on Field Investigation with the objective of improving the claims investigation process through consistent staff training and resourcing.</p> |

City Divisions
Public Recommendations – No Longer Relevant

Division: Corporate Finance
Report Title: Insurance and Risk Management
Report Date: April 26, 2010

| No. | Recommendation | Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame |
|-----|--|--|
| 014 | The Director, Corporate Finance, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, interface the Risk Management Information System operated by the City with the claims database managed by the adjuster. | In 2010, a business process review conducted by Corporate I&T did not support the option to develop an interface between the City's Risk Management System and the claims database managed by the adjuster. Instead, a new business model was approved by senior management that supports the adjusters having direct access into the City's database. An RFP for new business solution will be issued early 2012 with implementation in early 2013. |
| 017 | The Director, Corporate Finance ensure that user division staff are included in at least an advisory role with the Claims Working Group. | The Claims Working Group has been disbanded. The Claims Working Group was created to deal with the data integrity processes with the current Risk Management System application, CS STARS. In 2010, a business process review conducted by Corporate I&T suggested a new business model be implemented requiring improved business processes and technology. An RFP for new business solution will be issued early 2012 with implementation in early 2013. |