

---

## 2013 BUDGET BRIEFING NOTE

### Toronto Fire Services Operating Budget

---

#### Issue/Background:

- At its meeting on December 4, 2012, Budget Committee requested the following:
  - That the Fire Chief provide a confidential briefing note consisting of the cuts mapped out to identify current levels and reduced service levels proposed in the 2013 budget; and
  - That the Fire Chief provide a confidential briefing note outlining first response times and second response time, and the proposed changes be mapped by district.
- The confidential items in the business cases presented at the time were made public on December 7, negating the need for confidentiality on these briefing notes. Both motions are addressed herein.
- Toronto Fire Services responded to a total of 10,248 fire calls in 2011, down 9.4% from 2005 (the first year of reporting available from the Records Management system).
- In 2011, Toronto Fire responded to a total of 145,334 emergency incidents, representing 276,261 vehicle runs. This includes a total of 86,380 medical calls.
- In 2012, response protocols were changed for medical calls meaning that Fire Services will respond to approximately 45,000 fewer calls over the course of a year. This will bring annual emergency responses down to approximately 100,000 incidents per year, and vehicle responses to approximately 230,000.
- Annual dollar loss data for the Fire Services shows some improvements. Dollar loss in 2012 is trending towards \$50 million annually, similar to losses sustained in 2006. Fire loss had peaked as high as \$70-75 million in 2007 and 2008, but has been trending downwards since that time.
- As part of the 2012 operating budget process, Council approved the deferred hiring of 68 positions. This measure required vehicles to be taken out of service on a daily basis due to vacant positions. Through 2012 (to date), there have been an average of 5.6 vehicles out of service every day in Toronto. The specific vehicles taken out of service change on a daily basis, has resulted in a number of issues with staff movements, and has affected response times City-wide, with different areas of the City affected differently, each day. This 2013 proposal seeks to formalize this measure by identifying the vehicles to be taken out of service permanently, to quantify the specific service changes, and to minimize the staff movements resulting from carrying a number of vacancies. The overall impact on response times City-wide will be marginal, as an equivalent number of vehicles are already removed

from the system daily in our current statistics. In addition, vehicles taken out of service on a more random basis, as is currently the practice, often results in the loss of vehicles in higher priority areas with significant call volumes. By identifying the specific vehicles to be taken out of service permanently, Fire Services has the ability to potentially improve response times through the identification of vehicles with lower call volumes, and in areas of the City where other vehicles and stations have the ability to pick up the extra calls.

- Despite the number of vacant positions, the Fire Services has been making improvements in response times by focusing on the areas that are under the control of TFS, including dispatch times and turnout times. The total response time for a first-in arriving vehicle was 7 minutes and 17 seconds year to date in 2012, compared to 7 minutes and 39 seconds in 2011.

### **Key Points:**

- The 2013 proposed Base Budget for Toronto Fire Services includes \$12.705 million in reductions required to meet the budget target of a 0% increase over the 2012 approved budget. Several options were reviewed by management to determine potential reductions that did not impact staffing, however, with salaries and benefits making up 92% of actual spending, it is impossible to achieve the required savings without staff reductions. It must be noted that the reductions proposed for the 2013 operating budget for Fire Services excludes the impact of the salary increases for Local 3888 pending an arbitration award.
- Non-salary reductions totalling \$2.008 million were taken before any consideration of staff reductions.
- Reduction options to achieve the balance required include the deletion of three existing vacant non-union administrative assistant positions (representing a savings of \$0.166 million), and 101 full time positions from Local 3888 in Fire Services, as follows:
  - The reorganization of support sections will allow for various functions to be combined and will provide opportunities to streamline services. The re-organization will result in the deletion of ten permanent positions and the conversion of one Captain's position to a first class fire fighter position to be permanently assigned to the Mechanical Division (reduction of \$1.286 million).
  - Conversion of four firefighting Captain assigned to the Fire Boat to four fire cause investigators (reduction of \$0.071 million)
  - Removal of District 12 in North Command, resulting in the deletion of eight permanent positions, including four District Chiefs (DC) (one per platoon), and four Fireground Incident Technicians (FITS), one per DC (reduction of \$0.957 million).
  - Removal of five front line emergency response vehicles from the operations division on a permanent basis, representing a reduction of 83 positions (reduction of \$8.217 million).
- All staff reductions proposed can be accommodated within existing vacant positions. No layoffs will occur, however, some staff will be required to transfer to existing vacant positions in other areas. This will be reviewed with the Toronto Professional Fire Fighters Association, as staff movements of this kind are not anticipated in the collective agreement.

**Support Division Reductions**

- A reorganization of support sections will allow for various functions to be combined and will provide opportunities to streamline services, resulting in the reduction of 10 full time positions, as follows:
  - Elimination of Recruit Induction (one District Chief and six Captains)
  - Merge Health and Safety and Emergency Planning (reduction of one District Chief)
  - Merge Public Information and Recruitment and Outreach (reduction of one District Chief)
  - Delete vacant Captain’s position in Public Information; create fire fighter position in Mechanical to be responsible for face fit testing, an important Health and Safety issue for TFS (currently staffed through modified duties when available).

**Operations Division Reductions**

- The remaining 91 positions are being deleted from the operations division.
- The elimination of District 12 in North Command will result in the deletion of eight permanent positions, including four District Chiefs (DC) (one per platoon), and four Fireground Incident Technicians (FITS) (one per DC). The tasks, responsibilities and emergency responses currently assigned to these positions will be reassigned to the other three District Chiefs in North Command. In 2011 District 12 responded to 1,613 emergency calls, down from 1,744 in 2010. These runs will be redistributed to the three other DC's within the North Command, or absorbed by DC's in other Commands where the calls are close to the Command borders. The projected increase in call volumes for the other District Chiefs within North Command will bring up call volume levels at the same level as some of the busier District Chiefs within the City. The average response time of District Chiefs in North Command is projected to increase by 24 seconds.
- Five front line emergency response vehicles will be deleted from the operations division on a permanent basis. This represents a reduction of 83 operations staff, and reassignment of the remaining 17 staff assigned to these vehicles to assist with staffing levels on other vehicles, which may keep more trucks in service on a daily basis.
- The vehicles proposed for deletion include:

Truck	Address	Ward	# of Truck Runs				
			2011	2010	2009	2008	2007
P424	426 Runnymede Rd.	13	1,350	1,342	1,335	1,331	1,333
P413	1549 Albion Rd.	1	1,676	1,560	2,145	1,603	1,896
P215*	5318 Lawrence Ave. E.	44	720	698	689	653	725
A324*	840 Gerrard St. E.	30	908	936	829	996	1,032
P213*	7 Lapsley Rd.	42	1,690	1,599	1,735	1,486	1,500

\*Stations 215 and 213 will be quinted, which means the vehicles in the stations will have the capacity to run as either a pumper or an aerial, depending on the nature and location of individual calls. Station 324 will also be considered for quinting, pending further analysis.

- Four of the five vehicles identified represent secondary trucks in existing fire stations, and do not result in station closures. The removal of P424 includes a recommendation to close the fire station, which has been recommended through various studies over the years, starting with the Toronto Fire Department Master Fire Plan completed in 1987, the 1999 KPMG study, and most recently in the 2007 Master Fire Plan. Station 424 is located in an area of the City that is well-served with fire facilities and enjoys a higher level of service than is typical in other areas. Three other fire stations are located within 2km of Station 424 that will remain available to serve the citizens of the area.
- The 2012 approved operating budget included deferred hiring of 68 positions. This measure required vehicles to be taken out of service on a daily basis due to vacant positions. Through 2012 (to date), there have been an average of 5.6 vehicles out of service every day in Toronto. The specific vehicles taken out of service change on a daily basis, resulted in a number of issues with staff movements, and affected response times City-wide, with different areas of the City affected differently, each day. This 2013 proposal seeks to formalize this measure by identifying the vehicles to be taken out of service permanently, to quantify the specific service changes, and to minimize the staff movements resulting from carrying a number of vacancies. The overall impact on response times City-wide will be marginal, as an equivalent number of vehicles are already removed from the system daily in our current statistics. In addition, vehicles taken out of service on a more random basis, as is currently the practice, often results in the loss of vehicles in higher priority areas with significant call volumes. By identifying the specific vehicles to be taken out of service permanently, Fire Services has the ability to potentially improve response times through the identification of vehicles with lower call volumes, and in areas of the City where other vehicles and stations have the ability to pick up the extra calls.
- Projections of response time increases can only be done based on average response times, as modelling software restricts reporting in percentiles. Toronto Fire Services typically reports response times based on 90<sup>th</sup> percentiles, as this is how the National Fire Protection Association (NFPA) response time standards are defined. In 2011, the average response time was 4:52 (dispatch to arrival), while the 90<sup>th</sup> percentile response time was 6:47, which indicates the difference in the two measurements.
- City wide, the reduction of five vehicles results in an increase in the average response time of one second for the first responding pumper, and five seconds for the second responding pumper. First-in aerial response time will increase by two seconds. The impact on response times is greater for individual areas impacted by vehicle reductions. The projected increases in average response times for first responding pumpers, second responding pumpers, and first responding aerials are included as Appendix 1A and 1B.
- TFS has included the purchase of predictive modeling software in its 2013 capital budget. This software works in conjunction with the Fire Services' computer aided dispatch system to aid in the deployment of fire vehicles to mitigate gaps in coverage and improve response times, which will assist in reducing the impact of reductions on response times.
- The 2013-2022 TFS capital plan includes the development of four new stations to service areas of the City that have been identified as under-served, most recently in the 2007 Master Fire Plan. These stations remain in the ten year capital plan. Toronto Fire Services had

included in its resource base sufficient apparatus to re-allocate vehicles to new station developments included in the approved capital plan, as provided in the 1999 KPMG study and the 2007 Master Fire Plan. The removal of vehicles as a result of this reduction will eliminate TFS' ability to staff new stations in the future within its current complement. Existing business cases will be resubmitted through the 2014 budget process to include the operating impact of a vehicle and appropriate staffing for each of the new stations.

---

**Prepared by:** Debbie Higgins, Deputy Fire Chief/Director, Fire Services, 416-338-9055,  
dhiggin@toronto.ca

**Further information:** Debbie Higgins, Deputy Fire Chief/Director, Fire Services,  
416-338-9055, dhiggin@toronto.ca

**Date:** December 11, 2012

Attachment