



STAFF REPORT ACTION REQUIRED

Employment Equity Workforce Survey among Union and Non-Union Staff: Response Rate and Representation Rate - 2011

Date:	October 10, 2012
To:	Employee and Labour Relations Committee Executive Committee
From:	City Manager
Wards:	All
Reference Number:	

SUMMARY

This report documents the response rate to the Workforce Survey administered in 2011 and discusses the representation of the four designated groups within the Toronto Public Service (TPS).

On January 26, 2010 City Council received an information report titled “Workforce Survey among Non-Union Staff: Response Rate and Representation Rate” and requested the City Manager to submit a further report to the Employee and Labour Relations Committee upon completion of an Employment Equity Workforce Survey. This report is intended to assist the TPS in implementing the Employment Equity policy within the context of Goal # 3 of the People Plan to “attract and retain a skilled, high performing and diverse workforce” as well as the City’s commitment to diversity as outlined in its Diversity & Positive Workplace Strategy.

Significant progress has been made in strengthening foundational elements of the Employment Equity program that are key to successfully meeting the city’s equity goals. The following has resulted in a significant upsurge in survey participation:

- Increased organizational strategic priority has been placed on equity, diversity and inclusion with the establishment of the Office of Equity, Diversity and Human Rights in 2011;
- Stronger communications from senior management and union executives about the workforce survey has raised awareness of the importance of the survey; and
- Improved survey distribution methodology including the participation of union members and divisional champions has achieved a considerable improvement in the response rate.

Response Rate:

46.4% of the active workforce responded to the survey with divisional responses varying widely between 35.0% and 90.6%. This represents a 13.3% increase compared to first workforce survey conducted in 2003-2005, which achieved a 33.1% response rate. These encouraging results demonstrate that with strong support from leaders within the TPS and Unions, the City has been able to make measurable progress in meeting its goals.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Manager recommends that City Council:

1. Receive the report for information

Financial Impact

This report will have no financial impact beyond what has already been approved in the current year's budget.

The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

DECISION HISTORY

The present document responds to a request from City Council (January 26, 2010) to report on an updated Employment Equity Workforce Survey as soon as possible following completion of the survey. This report provides details on the results of the 2011 survey among active union and non-union employees. It is intended to assist the TPS in implementing the Employment Equity Policy within the context of Goal # 3 of the People Plan to "attract and retain a skilled, high performing and diverse workforce" as well as support the City's commitment to diversity as outlined in its Diversity & Positive Workplace Strategy.

http://insideto.toronto.ca/hrweb/people_plan/index.htm

<http://insideto.toronto.ca/edhr/dp-workplace-strategy.htm>

A report on the results of the first post-amalgamation Toronto Public Service (TPS) workforce survey was submitted to the Employee and Labour Relations Committee (ELR) on August 21, 2006. The report indicated an overall response rate of 33.1% and included a recommendation from the City Manager and Executive Director of Human Resources that divisions/work units with return rates less than 50% be re-surveyed, in order to address the low response rate. In 2007 the Employment Equity Unit, formerly in the Human Resources Division, segmented the workforce and conducted a workforce survey among active non-union employees which resulted in a 75.4% response rate - a significant increase compared to the previous result of 58.0%. This result was reported to the ELR Committee on November 26, 2009. The Committee recommended to the

Executive Committee: “that Council receive for information the Workforce Survey among Non-Union Staff: Response Rate and Representation Rate set out in the report (September 30, 2009) from the Executive Director of Human Resources”. This report committed to surveying unionized employees as a next step.

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/2006/agendas/committees/elr/elr060912/it001.pdf>

In response, the Executive Committee issued the following recommendations on January 4, 2010:

1. City Council receive for information the Workforce Survey among Non-Union Staff: Response Rate and Representation Rate set out in the report (September 30, 2009) from the Executive Director of Human Resource.
2. City Council request the City Manager to submit a further report to the Employee and Labour Relations Committee, as soon as possible, when the Employment Equity Workforce Survey is complete.

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2010.EX39.7>

City Council adopted this item on January 26, 2010.

<http://www.toronto.ca/divisions/pdf/dp-ws-dec09.pdf>

ISSUE BACKGROUND

In 2011, the Employment Equity Unit was transferred from the Human Resources Division to the newly established Office of Equity, Diversity and Human Rights (OEDHR). OEDHR conducted a Count Yourself In Workforce survey between May 26-June 30, 2011 among all active union and non-union employees in the Toronto Public Service. This report documents the results of this survey.

The City of Toronto committed to a policy of fairness and full equity in employment for four designated groups (identified in the policy as women, visible minorities, Aboriginal Peoples and persons with a disability) in 2000 when the Employment Equity policy was adopted. A key component of the policy is the requirement to conduct voluntary employment equity surveys with the overall goal of measuring representation of the four designated groups in the workforce and track progress within the TPS in achieving a workforce that reflects the community that is served. For the Toronto Public Service, this is achieved by comparing the representation within the workforce to the labour market availability on the designated groups who are qualified for jobs within in the Toronto Census Metropolitan Area (CMA). According to Human Resources Skills Development Canada, labour market availability refers to the share of designated group members in the workforce from which the employers could hire.

<http://wi.toronto.ca/intra/hr/policies.nsf/9fff29b7237299b385256729004b844b/755a03e5d9c008fd85256927004b786c?OpenDocument>

<http://www12.statcan.ca/census-recensement/2006/dp-pd/hlt/97-550/Index.cfm?TPL=P1C&Page=RETR&LANG=Eng&T=207&CMA=535&S=0&O=A&RPP=25>

http://www.hrsdc.gc.ca/eng/labour/equality/employment_equity/tools/annual_reports/2009/page02.shtml

Workforce data provides a benchmark for the City to track representation of designated group members within the TPS workforce over time. The data is used to develop and implement programs and activities to close gaps between representation in the workforce and the Toronto CMA estimates of the labour pool availability of designated groups. The TPS does not set hiring quotas. Instead, Toronto workforce Census data is used as a guide for the organization to assess whether the workforce inside the TPS is representative of labour force availability in the Toronto labour market where most city hiring is expected to be done.

Despite 20 months of numerous customized attempts to engage low response units, the response rate to the inaugural 2003-2005 survey, at 33.1% fell far below the TPS benchmark of 80% rendering the interpretation of data unreliable. The Human Rights Commission recommends a response rate of 80% to ensure the statistical validity of the data analysis. All unions were invited to sign a joint letter explaining the purpose of the survey. CUPE Local 416 did not sign, resulting in the lowest return rate among the unions.

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/2006/agendas/committees/elr/elr060912/it001.pdf>
http://www.chrc-ccdp.ca/publications/chapter_822_chapitre-eng.aspx
<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2010.EX39.7>
http://www.hrsdc.gc.ca/eng/labour/equality/employment_equity/tools/review/report/main.shtml

COMMENTS

The City as an employer has goals to reflect the diversity of the communities it serves at all levels of the workforce; and to achieve a positive workplace based on equity and human rights principles and practices. This is a shared responsibility of all divisions with the Office of Equity, Diversity and Human Rights (OEDHR) and the Human Resources Division providing corporate leadership to the Toronto Public Service. Achieving a robust response rate to the survey is key to measuring the City's progress in meeting these goals.

In recent years, the City has made significant progress in strengthening foundational elements of the Employment Equity program that are key to successfully meeting the city's equity goals. A few successes are highlighted below:

- Since 2009 the CUPE Local 416 Collective Agreement has included a Letter of Agreement that provides the basis for an ongoing partnership on employment equity and diversity related issues between the union and the City;
- The Employment Equity unit and the Human Resources division have partnered with Locals 79 and 416 since 2008 on a Joint Equity Symposium, a one day educational event on equity related topics for approximately 115 union shop stewards who participate each year, providing an excellent opportunity to share information that ultimately strengthens the equity environment for all TPS employees;
- In 2010, discussions between the Employment Equity unit, Human Resources senior management team and executive members of CUPE Local 416 resulted in the union

formally participating in the 2011 Count Yourself In Workforce Survey for the first time. As a result, more than one third (38.8%) of the union's members participated in the survey, thus providing a starting point for ongoing collaboration towards achieving mutual equity goals;

- Discussions were also held with the executive members of Local 79 in 2010-2011 to request their formal participation in the survey. Although the survey took place before the discussions could be concluded, over one-third (32.1%) of L79 union members participated, representing a significant first step in re-building the union's support for the survey.

Survey Dissemination Methodology

The Count Yourself In Workforce Survey is available on the TPS Intranet year-round. In 2011, the Employment Equity Unit launched a communication campaign to engage senior management and all employees in participating in the Count Yourself In Workforce survey. Information about the purpose of the survey, the importance of participating and the confidentiality of the data was disseminated to Senior Management, Managers, Supervisors and all employees. In addition, meetings were held with the Presidents and executive members of CUPE Locals 416 and 79 and the City of Toronto Administrative Professional Supervisory Association (COTAPSA) the professional organization representing some non-union employees. These efforts resulted in a deeper understanding of the purpose and importance of the survey.

The survey questionnaire and accompanying material were distributed from the City Manager to all employees via email where possible and in hard copy where necessary during the survey period from May 26 - June 30, 2011. The following steps were taken to boost participation: the City Manager transmitted emails and a voice mail message to all employees to encourage participation; promotional flyers were prominently displayed in workplaces across the organization; and reminders were sent at the mid-point and towards the end of the survey period. Since many L416 employees do not have regular access to the TPS intranet site, four members of the union were given special permission to assist by distributing hardcopies of the survey to their members. Completed surveys were either mailed directly to the Employment Equity unit or collected in sealed envelopes and forwarded to the Employment Equity unit by the union members who were assisting.

Response Rate

46.4% of the active workforce responded to the survey with divisional responses varying widely between 35.0% and 90.6% (see Chart 1). This represents a substantial increase of 13.3% compared to 2003-2005 when all active union and non union employees were last surveyed. Despite this positive trend, the response in 2011 falls significantly below the TPS benchmark of 80% and the data cannot be construed as statistically significant. However, Response Rate data provides information which can be used to follow-up with low response divisions to increase the response rate over time.

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/2006/agendas/committees/elr/elr060912/it001.pdf>

A number of factors contributed to the wide divisional variance of response rates:

- The TPS is a uniquely complex organization with a large workforce of union and non-union employees distributed geographically across the City of Toronto posing

logistical challenges in communicating with these groups. This is compounded by the fact that significant numbers of unionized employees (for example, many CUPE L416 outside workers and front line staff in L79), do not have regular access to the City's online resources making it difficult to reach them. Further study is required to better understand whether the organization's structure or other factors are impeding the dissemination of the survey.

- The 2011 survey was a first attempt to re-engage the unionized workforce in the survey in an effort to build a response rate towards the TPS goal of 80%. It is anticipated that with a continuous focus, a high response rate can be achieved over time. Within the TPS this is best demonstrated in Toronto Fire Services which has placed a strategic focus on Employment Equity resulting in a response rate of 81.2% among unionized employees. The efforts of the division demonstrate that with a sustained focus, a broadly dispersed unionized employee population, with somewhat limited access to the internet, can meet response rate targets despite logistical challenges;

Chart 1: Count Yourself In Workforce Survey-Response Rate

Active Union and Non-Union Employees at March 15, 2012

Service Area/Division/Office	* Total # Active Employees	Response Rate Active Employees	
		#	%
**Special Reporting Relationships	906	381	42.1%
City Manager's Office	340	308	90.6%
Citizen Focused A	12,602	4,416	35.0%
Citizen Focused B	8,204	5,070	61.8%
Internal Focused Services	2,250	1,093	48.6%
Total Active Employees	24,302	11,268	46.4%

*Active employees: All active union and non-union employees excluding part-time recreation workers

** Special Reporting Relationships include: Auditor General's Office, City Clerk's Office, Integrity Commissioner's Office, Legal Services, Lobbyist Registrar's Office and Office of the Ombudsman

The response rate was analyzed by union affiliation. Indicators are positive:

- Local 3888 shows the highest response rate (81.2%) reflecting the divisions' on-going commitment to tracking the representation of designated group members within Toronto Fire Services as part of their strategic workforce planning process;

- The response rate of non-union employees compares favourably to a similar 2007 survey (75.1 in 2011 vs 75.4% in 2007). These rates represent a significant increase over the 2003-05 survey (58.0%);
- Although the response rate for CUPE Locals 79 (32.1%) and 416 (38.8%) are significantly lower than the other employee populations, these results point to a positive trend. As a result of relationship building efforts made by the Human Resources Division in 2010 where the Employment Equity unit was located at the time, the survey now enjoys formal support of CUPE L416. The Human Resources Division and the Office of Equity, Diversity and Human Rights where the Employment Equity unit is currently located, held a number of discussions with union leaders in 2010 and 2011 to develop a formal relationship with regard to Employment Equity. Discussions are on-going and approximately one third of active L79 members responded to the survey. The Toronto Public Service now has a good foundation to launch future efforts to increase the response rate.

Chart 2: Count Yourself In Workforce Survey-Response Rate by Affiliation

Active Union and Non-Union Employees at March 15, 2012

Affiliation	* Total # Active Employees	Response Rate Active Employees	
		#	%
*CUPE Local 79	13,019	4,181	32.1%
CUPE Local 416	4,309	1,671	38.8%
Local 3888	2,951	2,396	81.2%
Non-Union Employees	4,023	3,020	75.1%
Total by Affiliation	24,302	11,268	46.4%

*Active employees: All active union and non-union employees excluding part-time recreation workers

Designated Group Membership (DGM)

The Employment Equity Policy (2000), states that “(t)he citizens of Toronto are best served by a public service which reflects the diversity of the community which it serves”. As a result, a primary objective of the policy is to measure the representation of the four designated groups within the TPS workforce to determine whether the workforce is reflective of the communities we serve. Where gaps exist, the Employment Equity policy mandates the TPS to identify and remove barriers that hinder the full participation of DGMs. Since the response rate to the present 2011 survey at 46.4% falls significantly below the 80% benchmark, the data cannot be construed as representative of the workforce. As a result, on-going efforts are required to boost the response to the survey.

The Count Yourself In Workforce Survey indicates the following:

Women

Almost half of the respondents to the Count Yourself in Workforce survey (48.4%) were women. This figure exactly matches the 2006 Toronto CMA labour force availability and may be considered positive indicator of the overall representation of women within the Toronto public service. The City can be proud of this result given that many

organizations continue to struggle to achieve equity in gender representation 30 years after the enactment of the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms.

http://www.ryerson.ca/content/dam/diversity/resources/factsheets/Women_Factsheet_Sep11.pdf

Visible Minority

There is a need for further study on the representation of visible minorities within the Toronto Public Service given that the 46.4% response rate does not provide a confidence level of statistically significant results. As the response rate increases, the City will be able to track the representation of visible minorities against labour force availability currently at 40.5% according to the 2006 Census for the Toronto CMA. Future surveys will place more emphasis on reaching the significant number of employees who are widely dispersed across the city and who do not have regular access to online tools – including front line employees and outside workers. It is expected that this approach will boost the response rate and provide a stronger result that more accurately reflects the representation of visible minorities within the TPS.

<http://www.conferenceboard.ca/temp/249e05a6-3760-4a6f-a8af-246af40962e9/067-07-Diversity%20Outlook%202006-web.pdf>

Aboriginal Peoples

Future surveys will need to address challenges posed by Census data for Aboriginal Peoples. It is anticipated that the availability estimate may continue to be viewed as not accurately reflective of the Aboriginal population in the Toronto CMA. It is widely accepted that for historic reasons Aboriginal Peoples are undercounted in the Census. For instance, the 2006 Census data indicates that the Aboriginal population in the Toronto CMA is 31,910 compared to estimates by Aboriginal service providers of 70,000. As a result, interpretation of workforce data will continue to require extreme caution.

<http://www.nativechild.org/images/pdf/TARP-FinalReport-FA-All%20oct%2025%202011.pdf>

According to the City Council's Statement of Commitment to Aboriginal Communities of Toronto, City of Toronto recognizes and respects the unique status and cultural diversity among the Aboriginal communities of Toronto. The City as an employer commits to implementing employment practices to ensure that opportunities for employment are accessible to Aboriginal people, and develop programs and activities to meet the needs of Aboriginal employees.

http://www.toronto.ca/diversity/pdf/backgroundfile-30867_and_30866.pdf

People with Disabilities

Ensuring that the Toronto Public Service workforce is representative of persons living with a disability will remain a key focus area given the legislative focus of the Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act (AODA) and the changing demographics of the City.

Overall, this report demonstrates that the City has made significant progress in increasing the response rate to the survey. As a result of support from leaders within the TPS and

unions, and with the response rate trending upward, it is anticipated that the TPS will continue to make progress in meeting its goal of an 80% response rate.

CONTACT

Uzma Shakir
Director
Office of Equity, Diversity & Human Rights
Phone: 416-392-1108
ushakir@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Joseph P. Pennachetti
City Manager