

## **Car-Share Vehicle Parking Areas – Pilot Evaluation and Expansion**

<b>Date:</b>	March 15, 2012
<b>To:</b>	Public Works and Infrastructure Committee
<b>From:</b>	Acting General Manager, Transportation Services
<b>Wards:</b>	All Wards
<b>Reference Number:</b>	Pw2012030te.top.doc

### **SUMMARY**

---

City Council directed Transportation Services to initiate a pilot program to delineate on-street Car- Share Vehicle Parking Areas (CVPAs) at its meeting of September 14, 2009. A total of 20 on-street parking spaces designated exclusively for use by car-share vehicles were implemented, comprising 6 locations in the downtown area. These spaces have been fully operational with appropriate enforcement authority in place since July 2010.

The pilot revealed some initial issues related to the use of the car-share vehicle parking areas by vehicles not authorized to park in these areas, which caused some difficulties for the car-share companies and their members. These difficulties were resolved and the on-street car-share vehicle parking pilot program has been successful, is supported by the car-share companies, and has shown itself to be a viable and sustainable transportation initiative. This report is requesting Council's approval to continue and expand the program. This report outlines an application process, identifies criteria that each suggested CVPA must satisfy to receive approval and recommends adoption of a three-tiered prorated annual permit fee that takes into consideration competing demands for curb-space and market value of a parking space in Toronto.

### **RECOMMENDATIONS**

---

**The Acting General Manager, Transportation Services recommends that:**

1. City Council authorize the implementation of the on-street car-share vehicle parking program on the terms and conditions as generally described in the report from the Acting General Manager of Transportation Services dated March 15, 2012 and titled "Car-Share Vehicle Parking Areas – Pilot Evaluation and Expansion", and Appendix A thereto, including the installation of Car-Share

Vehicle Parking Areas in accordance with the installation criteria, the establishment of a tiered parking permit, and the introduction of fees.

2. City Council authorize staff to take whatever action is necessary, including the submission of the necessary bills to amend the appropriate by-laws.

## **Financial Impact**

Approval of a Car-share Vehicle Parking Program under the proposed operational model will provide revenue to the City of between \$708.84 and \$4,400.84 per car-share vehicle parking permit (hereafter referred to in this report as the "permit") per year, subject to the type and number of permits issued. Assuming the maximum number of spaces is implemented, the annual revenue could be in the range of \$29,000.00 to \$48,000.00 for the first year of the program, increasing in subsequent years as the program is further expanded. If the participating car-share organizations/companies choose to purchase supplementary permits to allow multiple vehicles to share use of a single space, the potential revenue generated could be greater.

All costs that would be incurred for assessment of an application for a CVPA, installation and/or removal of the required signs and pavement markings, and issuing and/or replacement for the permits will be covered by the fees charged to the applicant.

The recommended tier structure compensates the potential loss of revenue to the City should issuance of car-share vehicle permits result in a loss of designated residential parking spaces and/or existing parking spaces controlled by parking machine/meter.

Estimated revenues and costs are not included in the 2012 Approved Budget, but should the expansion of this pilot program be approved and projections are verified through actual experience, the budget will be adjusted accordingly, through the quarterly variance reporting.

The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

## **DECISION BACKGROUND**

At its meeting of September 30 and October 1, 2009, City Council authorized Transportation Services to initiate a pilot program to identify parking spaces at several locations exclusively for the use of car-share vehicles, establish a new class of car-share parking permit, and to issue such permits to car-share organizations/companies at a cost of \$200.00 for each permit plus applicable taxes for the duration of the pilot program (Item PW26.3). The permit fee under the pilot was intended only to cover the installation cost of signs.

Council Link:

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/pw/bgrd/backgroundfile-23243.pdf>

A separate report entitled, "Installation of Car-share Vehicle Parking Areas – Various Streets in the Downtown Area (Sustainable Transportation Initiative)" was submitted to Toronto and East York Community Council at its meeting of September 15, 2009 for approval to delineate 6 car-share vehicle parking areas, providing a total of 20 parking spaces spread over a total of 5 streets in the downtown area (Item TE27.84).

Council Link:

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/te/bgrd/backgroundfile-22107.pdf>

A report entitled "Car-Share On-Street Parking – Harrison Garden Boulevard" was also submitted to North York Community Council at its meeting of November 10, 2009 for approval to delineate 1 car-share vehicle parking area, providing 2 parking spaces in the North York Centre area. (Item NY29.43).

Council Link:

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2009/ny/bgrd/backgroundfile-25227.pdf>

## **COMMENTS**

### **Pilot Evaluation**

The initial six Car-Share Vehicle Parking Areas in the downtown area were installed in March 2010 for use by the two for-profit car-share companies operating in Toronto at that time. An additional CVPA with 2 spaces was installed in the North York Centre. The areas were identified by a combination of advisory and regulatory signs. The regulatory/advisory signs were subsequently augmented with signs that provided contact information for the two car-share companies. Within a few months of installation, it became apparent that individual parking stalls had to be delineated to ensure that all vehicles authorized to park in a specific CVPA at any given time could fit within the defined area. These pavement markings were added in the Fall of 2010.

### **Initial Operational/Enforcement Issues:**

While the pilot program was initiated in March 2010, approval of set fines for offences created by the pilot program was not received from the Senior Regional Justice, Ontario Court of Justice until July 2010. In the period between the installation of the CVPA spaces and the approval of the set fines, some enforcement issues were experienced.

These involved car-share vehicles being ticketed while legally parked in their designated CVPA. Also, concerns were expressed about tickets being received for parking car-share vehicles in areas outside but nearby the vehicle's designated CVPA. This was sometimes necessary when a car-share user returned the vehicle to its designated "home" CVPA only to discover an unauthorized vehicle parked in the CVPA space intended for use by that car-share vehicle. Until set fine approval, there was no specific offences in place that allowed the unauthorized vehicle parked in the CVPA to be ticketed. An enforcement protocol was developed to address this situation.

Issues also were reported about film permits being issued for production vehicles to occupy an area of roadway where a CVPA is located. The car-share companies recognize the economic impact of the film production industry in Toronto and have indicated that they will temporarily relocate their vehicles to parking lots provided that they are contacted and asked to do so. This allows production vehicles to occupy the street or enables a film shoot to take place on the street. The Toronto Film and Television Office was made aware of these issues and they now specifically make production companies aware of CVPAs where a conflict could occur and advise them to contact the car-share company to make arrangements for the removal of the cars.

#### Feedback from Care-Share Companies:

In spite of the initial operational and enforcement issues, the car-share companies are generally pleased with the on-street program and have expressed interest in expanding to other areas across the City. Information provided by the car-share companies indicates that:

- Utilization of vehicles parked in on-street spaces compared to those located in off-street locations is higher;
- Membership in areas with on-street car-share spaces nearby has increased significantly faster than overall membership growth, during the past year;
- Members of the car-share organizations indicate that many have sold their primary vehicle or have avoided buying a second vehicle because of the convenience of using a shared vehicle.
- The public profile and recognition of car-sharing in general has been enhanced by the presence of on-street spaces and has allowed for more wide-spread promotion of car-sharing;
- A member survey has shown that members tend to gravitate to on-street CVPAs because they are easy to find, making the amenity much more convenient; and
- On-street parking areas provide high visibility and are well lit compared to off-street locations in surface parking lots or parking garages, which has enhanced the feeling of safety and sense of comfort felt by vehicle users.

Since implementation of the pilot program, the City has been approached by an additional firm with a slightly different business model for car sharing. Rather than renting a vehicle on an hourly basis from a specific location and returning it to that same location, members would rent a vehicle by the minute from one location and end their trip rental at any other parking space designated for their car-share vehicles. Their business is therefore geared to shorter trips with rentals of much shorter duration. This model is also being contemplated by other car-share companies operating in Toronto.

### **Rationale for Expansion**

Further expansion of the on-street car-share vehicle parking initiative will provide the City with a reasonable revenue stream through the issuance of permits. Residents of the City also will receive value from this initiative through the opportunity to reduce their

transportation costs, the use of a car-share vehicle as an alternative to individual car ownership and the convenience of a car when needed without the operating costs.

However, to realize these benefits car-share vehicles must be highly visible, readily accessible and easily reachable by public transit, cycling or walking, hence the benefit of providing CVPA's at acceptable locations across the City.

### **Criteria for Expansion**

There are numerous competing curb lane demands in neighbourhoods across the City. Therefore, the impact of identifying car-share vehicle parking areas on other road uses such as: curb-lane deliveries; "Pay-and-display" parking, residential permit parking; public transit operations, taxicab stands, road maintenance and general on-street parking must be considered. Given these various demands, we recommend capping the number of new car-share vehicle parking spaces that will be designated to a maximum of 40 spaces per year (10-20 CVPA locations, subject to the number of spaces at each area). The loss of revenue generated through "Pay-and-display" parking and residential permit parking must also be considered if designating a CVPA in a residential neighbourhood with overnight permit parking or in an area controlled by parking machines/meters.

The minimum criteria for approval of a CVPA are detailed in Appendix A. These criteria are similar to those used by Transportation Services to assess potential areas to initiate the pilot program. The objective of these minimum criteria is to ensure that the designation of a CVPA does not unduly affect the safety and efficient operation of the roadway on which it is located. Also, CVPA's within areas with on-street residential permit parking will not be located in front of people's homes or in areas that are wait-listed. Agreement of the Ward Councillor is also required to ensure that any affected area residents and businesses may be consulted.

### **Application Process**

A car-share company will be responsible for submitting an application to Transportation Services, with an accompanying drawing that clearly shows the location where they are requesting installation of a CVPA. The drawing must provide all applicable measurements that will tie the location into the nearest intersection and the size of the CVPA. A separate application must be submitted for each requested CVPA.

Once an application is received, Transportation Services staff will review it to ensure that the criteria for installation are met. In the event that applications are received from competing car-share companies at about the same time for the same general location, staff will review both applications and determine in consultation with the companies if it is feasible to meet a compromise that satisfies both applicants.

If the installation criteria for a CVPA are satisfied, Transportation Services will seek approval, from Community Council and/or City Council as applicable, to amend the parking regulations on the requested street to designate the space. Upon approval, and upon payment of the installation fee, Transportation Services staff will arrange for installation of signs and pavement markings and issue the permits.

## **Proposed Car-Share Vehicle Parking Permit Fees**

The proposed fee structure for permits is detailed in Appendix A. Transportation Services is recommending a three-tier permit structure for on-street car-share vehicle parking spaces, with the appropriate tier determined by whether or not the requested location will have an impact on a residential permit parking area or is within an area where parking is currently controlled by a parking machine/meter. A supplementary permit will also be available for each additional vehicle that could potentially use the car-share vehicle parking space. There will be an application fee for each CVPA requested, and the applicant will be responsible for the cost of signs and pavement markings required to delineate the area. There will also be a replacement fee in the event of a lost/stolen permit. Following is the explanation for each of these fees.

### Application Fee

An initial non-refundable application fee of \$150.00 will apply to each application submitted for a new CVPA. This fee is to cover the administration costs of staff time to conduct a site assessment and if appropriate, report to Community Council for approval to install the CVPA. Only one CVPA per application is allowed although this CVPA may include more than one parking space.

The estimated cost for fabrication, and installation of the signs and pavement markings required to designate the area as a Car-Share Vehicle Parking Area is \$300.00. The car-share company would be responsible for the actual cost of changes required upon approval of the Car-Share Vehicle Parking Area.

### Tier 1 Permit = \$708.84

A Tier 1 Permit is the base permit fee for one space within a Car-share Vehicle Parking Area.

A parking space is considered to occupy an area of 5.5 metres in length by 2.0 metres in width, or an area of 11.0 square metres. For the purpose of calculating this base permit fee, we recommend applying the same fee as currently authorized for enclosing a section of the public right-of-way for construction purposes, that being \$5.37 per square metre per month.

This permit is issued where the designated CVPA will not impact on, or cause a reduction in, the number of residential permit parking spaces or Pay-and-display parking spaces on a street.

### Tier 2 Permit = \$1,284.60

A Tier 2 Permit is issued for each space within a designated CVPA that will eliminate or cause a reduction in the number of parking spaces in a designated residential permit parking area. This fee incorporates the base fee outlined in Tier 1 above and recognizes and accounts for the potential loss of revenue to the City through the elimination of the fee that would have been charged for an annual residential parking permit. (\$575.76)

### Tier 3 Permit = \$4,400.84

A Tier 3 Permit is issued for each space within a designated CVPA that will eliminate an existing parking space in an area where parking is controlled by a parking machine/meter. This fee recognizes and accounts for the average loss of revenue to the City through the elimination of a parking space in an area where revenue would have been generated through payment of an hourly parking fee. The permit fee is based on the base fee outlined in Tier 1 above plus the average annual revenue generated by a pay for use parking space (calculated using a rate of \$1.00 per hour for each hour when the parking machine is in operation based on operational hours totalling 71 hours per week).

### Supplementary Permit = \$50.00

Should the car-share organization/company choose to allow multiple vehicles to make use of their CVPAs, they will be allowed to purchase a Supplementary Permit for each vehicle. Each Supplementary Permit will be issued for an administration fee of \$50.00.

### Replacement Fee = \$28.00

All permits are non-refundable and non-transferrable. However, a lost or stolen permit will be replaced or reissued for an administration fee of \$28.00.

The annual fee for each tier of permit applies to the fiscal year (December 1 to November 30) and is pro-rated monthly. All of the above fees are subject to applicable taxes and an annual inflationary increase.

## **Logistics**

The delineation of the CVPA will differ slightly from the method used for the areas chosen for the pilot project. The area will not be numbered, nor will the permits or spaces be license plate-specific to the vehicle. The company name to which the space has been permitted will be clearly identified on the sign.

The Car-Share Vehicle Parking Permit will be in the form of a window decal. The permits will display the company name to ensure that only those cars for which a permit has been issued may use the space. The permit must be affixed to the lower left-hand corner of the windshield of the car-share vehicle.

This change will allow the car-share company/organization to reallocate vehicles to different spaces without amending the conditions of the permit. It will also allow the car-share company/organization to allow multiple vehicles to use their designated Car-Share Vehicle Parking Areas.

All of the spaces designated as CVPAs under the pilot program will be retained, but will be subject to the new permit fees and conditions.

## **Regulatory Amendments**

Except in the case of a permit issued under Chapter 925 of the Toronto Municipal Code (Permit Parking) or in the case of a vehicle displaying an accessible or disabled person parking permit, parking is allowed for a maximum period of three hours unless otherwise signed on all streets in Toronto.

To facilitate the operation of an on-street car-share parking permit program it is necessary to amend the traffic by-laws to exempt car-share vehicles when parked in their designated CVPA from the three-hour maximum parking restriction. As part of the amendments made to facilitate the pilot program in the downtown area the former City of Toronto Municipal Code was amended to allow a car-share vehicle with a car-share parking permit to park for an indefinite amount of time in its designated CVPA while not in use. Expanding the program will require making a similar amendment to the City of Toronto Municipal Code – Chapter 950, Traffic and Parking. Of particular note, this might require rescinding the general "No Parking, from 2:00 a.m. to 6:00 a.m., from December 1 to March 31" regulation at any site-specific CVPA locations approved for installation in the former City of North York area.

## **CONTACT**

Jacqueline White, P.Eng.,  
Acting Director, Transportation Services  
Toronto and East York District  
Phone: 416-392-7714  
Fax: 416-392-1920  
e-mail: [jwhite@toronto.ca](mailto:jwhite@toronto.ca)

## **SIGNATURE**

Andrew Koropeski, P.Eng.  
Acting General Manager, Transportation Services

## **ATTACHMENT**

Appendix A - On-street Car-Share Vehicle Parking Installation Criteria and Permit Fees

P:\2012\Cluster B\TRA\Toronto and East York District\TOP\pw2012030te.top.doc – bmk