

Supplementary Report – 57 Bond Street

Date:	February 6, 2012
To:	Toronto and East York Community Council
From:	Acting Director, Policy & Research, City Planning Division
Wards:	Toronto Centre-Rosedale – Ward 27
Reference Number:	P:\2012\Cluster B\PLN\HPS\TEYCC\February 14 2012\teHPS16

SUMMARY

At its meeting of January 16, 2012, the Toronto Preservation Board adopted PB9.2 and recommended to the Toronto and East York Community Council that City Council state its intention to designate the property at 57 Bond Street (St. Michael's Cathedral) under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act. The applicant deputed at the Toronto Preservation Board meeting and indicated that representatives of the Archdiocese of Toronto wished to consult with heritage staff on the contents of the Reasons for Designation.

Staff have met with representatives of the Archdiocese of Toronto and have revised the Reasons for Designation to clarify that the fixed items that are also considered liturgical objects are excluded from the heritage attributes identified on the interior of St. Michael's Cathedral. It is understood that the chattels or moveable objects that are considered liturgical objects by the Archdiocese are not eligible for designation and are not identified in the Reasons for Designation.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. That the original Reasons for Designation (Attachment No. 1) in the staff report dated December 20, 2011 be replaced with the Revised Reasons for Designation (Attachment No. 2) dated February 6, 2012.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY

At its meeting of January 16, 2012, the Toronto Preservation Board adopted the recommendations in the staff report entitled "Intention to Designate under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act – 57 Bond Street."

ISSUE BACKGROUND

Staff have met with representatives of the Archdiocese of Toronto to discuss their concerns about the heritage attributes described in the original Reasons for Designation (Attachment No. 1). The property owner wants to ensure that certain features that are "fixed" on the interior of St. Michael's Cathedral and regarded as "liturgical objects" by the Archdiocese of Toronto be excluded from the Reasons for Designation. Other elements that are considered "chattel" or moveable are not eligible for designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act and are excluded from the heritage attributes.

COMMENTS

Staff have revised the Reasons for Designation as Attachment No. 2 to specify which "liturgical objects" are excluded from the heritage attributes. As a result of the discussions with the Archdiocese of Toronto's representatives, staff have also removed the reference to the decorative painting on the interior of the nave that was described as a heritage attribute in the original Reasons for Designation. This decorative painting ("frescoes") was included among the "fixed" elements described as "liturgical objects" by the Archdiocese of Toronto. Staff have further investigated the origins of the decorative paintings that were part of updates to the interior in 1937 and determined that they are not a key element of the design or an important aspect of the evolution of the Cathedral.

Staff are satisfied that the Revised Reasons for Designation reflect the key values and attributes of the property, which will be monitored by heritage staff as the site undergoes conservation work as part of its phased "2002 St. Michael's Cathedral Renewal Master Plan".

CONTACT

Mary L. MacDonald, Acting Manager
Heritage Preservation Services
Tel: 416-338-1079
Fax: 416-392-1973
E-mail: mmacdon7@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Kerri A. Voumvakis, Acting Director
Policy and Research
City Planning Division

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment No. 1 – Original Reasons for Designation (December 20, 2011)
Attachment No. 2 – Revised Reasons for Designation (February 6, 2012)

St. Michael's Cathedral

Description

The property at 57 Bond Street is worthy of designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for its cultural heritage value, and meets the criteria for municipal designation prescribed by the Province of Ontario under the three categories of design, associative and contextual values. St. Michael's Cathedral (1845-48, with subsequent additions) is located on the northeast corner of Bond and Shuter Streets. The site was listed on the inaugural City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties in 1973.

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

St. Michael's Cathedral has associative value as an institution of significance in Toronto that contributed to the formation and evolution of the Roman Catholic Archdiocese of Toronto (originally the Diocese) and the development of the Roman Catholic community and its institutions in the city. The construction of the Cathedral building is associated with Michael Power, the first Bishop of Toronto, and John Elmsley and other community leaders who provided funding.

St. Michael's Cathedral is historically associated with the career of the English-trained architect William Thomas who was one of the most important practitioners in 19th-century Toronto. Designing more than 30 churches in Canada, St. Michael's Cathedral is among Thomas's first and largest commissions in Toronto and an early example of his work in the city. With the additions to the Cathedral, beginning with the spire in 1865, other important Toronto architectural firms were engaged, among them Gundy and Langley and Joseph Connolly.

As the oldest surviving Roman Catholic Church in Toronto, St. Michael's Cathedral is a rare extant example of its type and style. The design value of St. Michael's Cathedral relates to its status as the first church in Toronto to be correctly designed in the Gothic Revival style according to medieval prototypes and encouraged by the ecclesiology movement in mid-19th century England. The Cathedral typifies Gothic Revival design in its siting, cruciform shape, dominant tower, buttresses, steeply pitched gable roof, and pointed-arch openings. The church complex displays a high degree of craftsmanship related to its richly detailed decorative brickwork, cut stone, and stone carvings, as well as stained glass windows dating from 1858 and afterward that were executed by notable Canadian and European firms.

Contextually, St. Michael's Cathedral is landmark in Toronto by virtue of its presence as the city's Roman Catholic Cathedral and its symbolic meaning to practitioners. The Cathedral is historically, physically, functionally and visually related to its surroundings where it forms an institutional enclave at Bond and Shuter Streets with the neighbouring

Bishop's Palace, St. John's Chapel, St. Michael's Choir School and St. Michael's Hospital. In the neighbourhood east of Yonge Street, the Cathedral contributes to a precinct of important church complexes in downtown Toronto, with St. James' (Anglican) Cathedral on King Street East and Metropolitan United (formerly Methodist) Church directly south on Queen Street East.

Heritage Attributes

The heritage attributes on the exterior of St. Michael's Cathedral are:

- The scale, form and massing of the Cathedral structure
- The cruciform plan with abbreviated north and south transepts
- The materials, with brick masonry on a stone foundation
- The steeply pitched gable roof with slate cladding and dormer windows (added in 1890)
- At the west end, the square tower with paired stone buttresses, the octagonal metal spire, and the pinnacles
- On the west facade, the triple entrance with the central entry placed at the base of the tower
- The detailing on the entrances, featuring pointed arch openings with stone reveals and carved faces that contain paired wood doors with half sidelights, and the wood tracery and stained glass in the entries and the clerestory windows above
- On the side elevations (north and south), the buttresses with stone pinnacles that extend through the gable roof and organize the pointed arched window openings and rose windows containing stained glass
- The monumental stained glass window on the east wall depicting Christ on the Cross (1858)
- The abbreviated south transept, with the centrally located pavilion under a gable end and a rose window
- The rear (east) wall, which displays buttresses and a central projecting bay that contains a large stained glass window flanked by smaller examples
- On the east wall, the entrance that is placed in a single-storey sacristy (1914 with a 1924 extension) with a slate-clad shed roof, a centre gable, statuary niche and trefoil windows
- The decorative brick detailing, with splayed door and window openings, octagonal turrets, cornices on the side elevations (north and south), and the raking cornices on the gable ends (east and west)
- The cut stone trim on the plinth, coping stones, door and window reveals, hood moulds and pinnacles
- The ornamental sculpture with carved stone gargoyles, crosses and faces at the west entrance
- The orientation of the building on the property, with the main entrance on the west and the sanctuary to the east
- The open space adjoining the south, west and north ends of the Cathedral
- At the west end, the iron fence with gates that dates to the 1890s

The heritage attributes on the interior of St. Michael's Cathedral are:

- The organization of the interior with the narthex (west), the nave with the centre aisle and north and south side aisles, the north and south transepts with the Chapels of Our Blessed Lady and the Sacred Heart and, at the east end, the sanctuary and L-shaped sacristy
- The vaulted ceiling with the hammer beam and truss roof structure above the nave and side aisles, respectively, which are separated by clustered columns with pointed arches and carved faces
- ~~The decorative paintings on the wall and ceilings~~
- At the west end of the nave and above the narthex, the choir and organ gallery, which has been altered
- Beneath the nave and sanctuary, the crypt

The following interior elements are considered fixed "liturgical" objects that are not identified as heritage attributes in the Reasons for Designation:

- **The tabernacle, confessionals, fixed altars including the main east altar and its cross and the side Altars of the Blessed Virgin and the Sacred Heart, commemorative plaques and relics, Stations of the Cross and statuary, the baptismal font, ambo (or pulpit), reredos (or altar screen), and light fixtures**
- **The frescoes or decorative paintings on the walls and ceiling of the nave that date to 1937**

Original Reasons for Designation (December 20, 2011), showing the revisions struck out and highlighted in bold text, to be replaced by the Revised Reasons for Designation (February 6, 2012)

St. Michael's Cathedral

Description

The property at 57 Bond Street is worthy of designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for its cultural heritage value, and meets the criteria for municipal designation prescribed by the Province of Ontario under the three categories of design, associative and contextual values. St. Michael's Cathedral (1845-48, with subsequent additions) is located on the northeast corner of Bond and Shuter Streets. The site was listed on the inaugural City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties in 1973.

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

St. Michael's Cathedral has associative value as an institution of significance in Toronto that contributed to the formation and evolution of the Roman Catholic Archdiocese of Toronto (originally the Diocese) and the development of the Roman Catholic community and its institutions in the city. The construction of the Cathedral building is associated with Michael Power, the first Bishop of Toronto, and John Elmsley and other community leaders who provided funding.

St. Michael's Cathedral is historically associated with the career of the English-trained architect William Thomas who was one of the most important practitioners in 19th-century Toronto. Designing more than 30 churches in Canada, St. Michael's Cathedral is among Thomas's first and largest commissions in Toronto and an early example of his work in the city. With the additions to the Cathedral, beginning with the spire in 1865, other important Toronto architectural firms were engaged, among them Gundy and Langley and Joseph Connolly.

As the oldest surviving Roman Catholic Church in Toronto, St. Michael's Cathedral is a rare extant example of its type and style. The design value of St. Michael's Cathedral relates to its status as the first church in Toronto to be correctly designed in the Gothic Revival style according to medieval prototypes and encouraged by the ecclesiology movement in mid-19th century England. The Cathedral typifies Gothic Revival design in its siting, cruciform shape, dominant tower, buttresses, steeply pitched gable roof, and pointed-arch openings. The church complex displays a high degree of craftsmanship related to its richly detailed decorative brickwork, cut stone, and stone carvings, as well as stained glass windows dating from 1858 and afterward that were executed by notable Canadian and European firms.

Contextually, St. Michael's Cathedral is landmark in Toronto by virtue of its presence as the city's Roman Catholic Cathedral and its symbolic meaning to practitioners. The Cathedral is historically, physically, functionally and visually related to its surroundings where it forms an institutional enclave at Bond and Shuter Streets with the neighbouring

Bishop's Palace, St. John's Chapel, St. Michael's Choir School and St. Michael's Hospital. In the neighbourhood east of Yonge Street, the Cathedral contributes to a precinct of important church complexes in downtown Toronto, with St. James' (Anglican) Cathedral on King Street East and Metropolitan United (formerly Methodist) Church directly south on Queen Street East.

Heritage Attributes

The heritage attributes on the exterior of St. Michael's Cathedral are:

- The scale, form and massing of the Cathedral structure
- The cruciform plan with abbreviated north and south transepts
- The materials, with brick masonry on a stone foundation
- The steeply pitched gable roof with slate cladding and dormer windows (added in 1890)
- At the west end, the square tower with paired stone buttresses, the octagonal metal spire, and the pinnacles
- On the west facade, the triple entrance with the central entry placed at the base of the tower
- The detailing on the entrances, featuring pointed arch openings with stone reveals and carved faces that contain paired wood doors with half sidelights, and the wood tracery and stained glass in the entries and the clerestory windows above
- On the side elevations (north and south), the buttresses with stone pinnacles that extend through the gable roof and organize the pointed arched window openings and rose windows containing stained glass
- The monumental stained glass window on the east wall depicting Christ on the Cross (1858)
- The abbreviated south transept, with the centrally located pavilion under a gable end and a rose window
- The rear (east) wall, which displays buttresses and a central projecting bay that contains a large stained glass window flanked by smaller examples
- On the east wall, the entrance that is placed in a single-storey sacristy (1914 with a 1924 extension) with a slate-clad shed roof, a centre gable, statuary niche and trefoil windows
- The decorative brick detailing, with splayed door and window openings, octagonal turrets, cornices on the side elevations (north and south), and the raking cornices on the gable ends (east and west)
- The cut stone trim on the plinth, coping stones, door and window reveals, hood moulds and pinnacles
- The ornamental sculpture with carved stone gargoyles, crosses and faces at the west entrance
- The orientation of the building on the property, with the main entrance on the west and the sanctuary to the east
- The open space adjoining the south, west and north ends of the Cathedral
- At the west end, the iron fence with gates that dates to the 1890s

The heritage attributes on the interior of St. Michael's Cathedral are:

- The organization of the interior with the narthex (west), the nave with the centre aisle and north and south side aisles, the north and south transepts with the Chapels of Our Blessed Lady and the Sacred Heart and, at the east end, the sanctuary and L-shaped sacristy
- The vaulted ceiling with the hammer beam and truss roof structure above the nave and side aisles, respectively, which are separated by clustered columns with pointed arches and carved faces
- At the west end of the nave and above the narthex, the choir and organ gallery, which has been altered
- Beneath the nave and sanctuary, the crypt

The following interior elements are considered fixed "liturgical" objects that are not identified as heritage attributes in the Reasons for Designation:

- The tabernacle, confessional, fixed altars including the main east altar and its cross and the side Altars of the Blessed Virgin and the Sacred Heart, commemorative plaques and relics, Stations of the Cross and statuary, the baptismal font, ambo (or pulpit), reredos (or altar screen), and light fixtures
- The frescoes or decorative paintings on the walls and ceiling of the nave that date to 1937

The Revised Reasons for Designation (February 6, 2012) are intended to replace the original Reasons for Designation (December 20, 2011)