243 Perth Ave – Official Plan Amendment and Zoning Amendment Applications – Final Report

Date: August 9, 2012
To: Toronto and East York Community Council
From: Director, Community Planning, Toronto and East York District
Wards: Ward 18 – Davenport
Reference Number: 11 296294 STE 18 OZ

SUMMARY

This application proposes to convert the existing church at 243 Perth Avenue into 26 residential units and build a new 4-storey, 14-unit residential building on the existing surface parking lot north of the church. A one-storey connection between the church and the new building will be built adjacent to the existing one-storey vestibule at the northwest corner of the church. Twenty parking spaces are located under the new building with access from the laneway to the east of the site.

This infill residential project will conserve an important heritage resource, and has heights, massing and scale appropriate for the site.

This report reviews and recommends approval of the applications to amend the Official Plan and Zoning By-law.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council amend the Official Plan, for the lands at 243 Perth Avenue substantially in accordance with the draft Official Plan.
Amendment attached as Attachment No. 11 to the report from the Director of Community Planning, Toronto and East York District (August 9, 2012).

2. City Council amend Zoning By-law 438-86 for the lands at 243 Perth Avenue substantially in accordance with the draft Zoning By-law Amendment attached as Attachment No. 12 to the report from the Director of Community Planning, Toronto and East York District (August 9, 2012).

3. City Council authorize the City Solicitor to make such stylistic and technical changes to the draft Official Plan Amendment and draft Zoning By-law Amendment as may be required.

4. Prior to introducing the necessary Bills for enactment, City Council require the applicant to:
   
a) submit to the Executive Director of Technical Services for review and acceptance, a revised water supply analysis, wherein the calculated Fire Flow is compared with the results of the Fire Hydrant Flow test to verify that the water pressures and flows are adequate to service this development for domestic and fire-fighting purposes;

b) submit to the Executive Director of Technical Services for review and acceptance a revised Functional Servicing Report which either demonstrates that sanitary capacity is available within the adjacent combined sewer system to service the proposed development, or identifies the required offsite works to provide capacity to service the proposed development; and

c) submit a revised Site Servicing and Stormwater Management Report, to the satisfaction of the Executive Director Technical Services, to demonstrate the feasibility of meeting City of Toronto Wet Weather Flow Management Plan requirements.

5. City Council require that the owner shall provide for any improvements to the municipal infrastructure in connection with the site servicing assessment, should it be determined that upgrades are required to the infrastructure to support this development.

Financial Impact
The recommendations in this report have no financial impact.

DECISION HISTORY
The Preliminary Report for this application can be found at:

The report that went to the Toronto Preservation Board on this application on July 5, 2012 can be found at:
ISSUE BACKGROUND

Proposal
This proposal is to convert the existing church at 243 Perth Avenue into 26 residential units and build a new 14-unit, four-storey building on the existing surface parking lot to the north. The building will be joined by a one-storey vestibule at the northwest corner of the existing church. The total gross floor area of the project is 3,835 square metres, with a total density of 2.3 times the area of the lot. Twenty parking spaces, including three for visitors, are located under the new building with access from the lane to the east of the site.

The forty residential units include ten 1-bedroom units, twenty 1-bedroom plus den units, four 2-bedroom units and six 2-bedroom plus den units. The two units located on the ground floor of the new building facing Perth Avenue have individual entrances from the street, while access for the rest of the units is from a shared vestibule/lobby between the church and the new building. Attachments 1-7 are drawings of the proposal and Attachment 10 is the Application Data Sheet.

As part of the approval of this project the church will be designated and the owner will enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement with the City to secure the important historic features of the church building.

Site and Surrounding Area
The 1,737 square metre site is located on the northeast corner of Wallace and Perth Avenues. The historically-listed Perth Avenue Methodist Church currently occupies the site along with a 30-car surface parking lot on the northern portion of the site.

The site is located in a stable, low-scale neighbourhood and surrounding the site in all four directions are detached, semi-detached and row houses, 2 and 2 ½ storeys in height. Southwest of the site is a new 134 unit townhouse development.

Provincial Policy Statement and Provincial Plans
The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) provides policy direction on matters of provincial interest related to land use planning and development. The PPS sets the policy foundation for regulating the development and use of land. The key objectives include: building strong communities; wise use and management of resources; and, protecting public health and safety. City Council’s planning decisions are required to be consistent with the PPS.

The Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe provides a framework for managing growth in the Greater Golden Horseshoe including: directions for where and how to grow; the provision of infrastructure to support growth; and protecting natural systems and cultivating a culture of conservation.
City Council’s planning decisions are required by the Planning Act, to conform, or not conflict, with the Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe.

**Official Plan**

The property is designated *Neighbourhoods* in the Official Plan. *Neighbourhoods* are considered physically stable areas made up of residential uses in lower scale buildings such as detached houses, semi-detached houses, duplexes, triplexes and townhouses, as well as interspersed walk-up apartments that are no higher than four storeys. Parks, low scale local institutions, home occupations, cultural and recreational facilities and small-scale retail, service and office uses are also provided for in *Neighbourhoods*. Low scale local institutions play an important role in the rhythm of daily life in *Neighbourhoods* and include such uses as places of worship.

A key objective of the Official Plan is to guide new development to respect and reinforce the general physical patterns in a *Neighbourhood*.

Policy 4.1.5 in the Plan states:

"Development in established Neighbourhoods will respect and reinforce the existing physical character of the neighbourhood, including in particular:

a) patterns of streets, blocks and lanes, parks and public building sites;
b) size and configuration of lots;
c) heights, massing, scale and dwelling type of nearby residential properties;
d) prevailing building type(s);
e) setbacks of buildings from the street or streets;
f) prevailing patterns of rear and side yard setbacks and landscaped open space;
g) continuation of special landscape or built-form features that contribute to the unique physical character of a neighbourhood; and
h) conservation of heritage buildings, structures and landscapes."

The proposal does not meet the requirements of Policy 4.1.5 with respect to physical patterns and prevailing building type because it is for the conversion of an existing building, and it proposes a new apartment building which is not typical in this neighbourhood.

Several policies regarding heritage conservation encourage the conservation and re-use of heritage properties, including but not limited to:

- entering into conservation agreements with owners;
- requiring a Heritage Impact Statement where the development entails an amendment to the Official Plan and/or Zoning By-law; and
- allowing Council to permit additional gross floor area in excess of what is permitted in the Zoning By-law on lands with certain designations and subject to certain conditions.
Zoning
This site is zoned R2 Z0.6 which permits a variety of residential uses and some non-
residential uses such as places of worship and public schools at a density of 0.6 times the
area of the lot. The height limit is 12 metres.

Site Plan Control
A Site Plan Control application has been submitted.

Reasons for Application
The Neighbourhoods designation encourages new development to reflect and reinforce
the existing physical character of the surrounding neighbourhood. Although the proposal
includes reuse of the church building for residential purposes, it also includes a new
residential building and the overall proposal would results in a residential built form that
is of a different character than the surrounding neighbourhood. Therefore, the proposal
requires an Official Plan Amendment.

The proposal does not conform to the existing zoning restrictions. A Zoning By-law
amendment is required for development standards such as, density, height, building
depth, and setbacks.

Community Consultation
A community consultation meeting was held on February 21, 2012 with Planning staff,
the applicant, the local Councillor and about 50 members of the community. Following
presentations by Planning staff and the architect, the floor was opened up for comments
and questions from the community. The following issues were raised:

Design of the new building – The design of the new building is quite modern, and does
not try to duplicate the style of the church. Concerns were raised about how a modern
design can fit into an established older neighbourhood, as well as the need for the new
building to respect the historic church and not detract from its prominence.

Height and massing of the new building – The new building is proposed to be 4 storeys
and will extend further back on the site than the existing houses to the north. The impact
of this building on those houses to the north, as well as the impact on the streetscape of
Perth Avenue needs to be considered.

Privacy and Overlook - Concerns were raised about locations of windows in the new
building, especially to the north, to minimize overlook into the backyards of the houses
on Perth. The terraces on the new building were also flagged as a concern.

Alterations to the heritage building – Questions were raised about the number of
alterations proposed for the church, including the large windows in the roof.

Tree Preservation – There are a number of trees on the site that are in good shape and the
community wanted to ensure that they would be preserved.
All of these issues raised at the meeting are addressed in the Comments section of the report.

**Agency Circulation**
The application was circulated to all appropriate agencies and City divisions. Responses received have been used to assist in evaluating the application and to formulate appropriate by-law standards.

**COMMENTS**

**Provincial Policy Statement and Provincial Plans**
The proposal is consistent with the PPS and it conforms and does not conflict with the Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe.

**Land Use**
The proposal introduces new residential uses into a *Neighbourhood* which is appropriate and encouraged.

**Heritage**
The applicant, their heritage consultant and Heritage Preservation staff worked closely together to ensure that the alterations to the historically-listed church were appropriate. As part of the redevelopment of the church into residential units the church building will be designated, and the owner will enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement to secure the key historic elements of the building.

The proposed alterations including the enlargement of window and door openings, replacing existing glazing, adding new windows and doors, creating below grade patios and the creation of a new glazed vestibule linking the church to the new building to the north, were found to be appropriate by staff. The report to the Toronto Preservation Board on this application can be found at the following link:  

**Height and Massing**
The height and massing of the church is remaining the same, with the addition of some dormers in the roofline and the addition of a one-storey vestibule linking the church with the new building to the north. This vestibule is located at the northwest corner of the existing church building.

The new building which will be constructed on the surface parking lot north of the church will be four storeys in height with parking located underneath. The first three storeys are 11.9 metres high, within the 12 metre height limit that currently exists on the site. The fourth storey adds another 3.4 metres for a total height of 15.3 metres. Given that the fourth storey extends higher than the existing height limit the footprint of the fourth storey has been minimized as much as possible, and it has been set back as much as possible from all the edges of the building.
The building, for the first three-storeys, is located 1.2 metres from the north property line, 3 metres from the east property line, and 10 metres from the west property line. The fourth storey is much smaller than the floors below. It is 8.5 metres from the east property line, 5 metres from the north property line and 11 metres from the east property line.

Given the increased setbacks for the fourth floor, as well as the smaller footprint, staff are satisfied that the height and massing is appropriate.

**Overlook and Privacy**

One of the concerns raised at the community meeting was overlook from the balconies and terraces on the north side of the new building towards the houses, and the backyards of the houses to the north. The terraces that are shown facing north on the roof of the third floor, with access from the fourth floor will be eliminated. The only windows that will be permitted on the north façade of the building will be those that are translucent (such as glass block), or those that are not at eye-level so there will be no overlook into the backyards of the houses to the north. These details will be secured through Site Plan Approval.

**Sun and Shadow**

A Shadow Study was submitted by the applicant and was reviewed by staff. There will be some additional shadowing on the 2 properties directly to the north of the church building but staff have deemed it acceptable.

**Traffic Impact, Access, Parking**

Since the existing church property is becoming designated as part of the approval of this application, only the new building is required to comply with parking requirements. The requirement, based on the 12 proposed units would be 11 resident spaces and 2 visitor parking spaces. The applicant is providing 20 parking spaces on-site, including 3 for visitors, with access from the laneway to the east. Transportation Services staff have reviewed the proposed parking and the Traffic Impact Study that was submitted by the applicant and have found it to be acceptable.

As part of Site Plan Approval the owner will be conveying to the City a 0.98 metre portion of the property to widen the lane to the east of the property.

Once the building is designated a loading space will not be required on-site. Through Site Plan Approval the applicant and city staff will work together on a waste management plan for the site.
Amenity Space
The applicant has provided 70 square metres of indoor amenity space in the ground floor of the church building and 80 square metres of outdoor amenity space on the west side of the site. Although the indoor amenity space does not meet the general by-law requirement staff believe it provides sufficient space and amenity for the residents of the building.

Building Design
There were some comments made at the community meeting about the modern design of the new building. Some people at the meeting believed that the design of the new building should be more in keeping with the architecture of the church building, as well as with the character of the existing houses in the neighbourhood. Staff have reviewed the design of the new building, and the site specific Zoning By-law will address the overall massing of the building (height and setbacks), but the details of the design will be secured through Site Plan Approval.

It is possible for a building with a modern design to fit harmoniously next to a historic building. In fact, some would say that it is important to distinguish between those structures that are historic, and those built more recently, and one way to do this is through a modern interpretation. However, to ensure compatibility staff will be reviewing carefully the fenestration, materials, landscaping and specific design features of the new building to make sure it complements the church. The detailed elevations, as well as the type and colour of the building materials will be secured through Site Plan Approval.

Unit Size and Type
The proposal is for a total of 40 residential units. Of these, ten are 1-bedroom, twenty are 1-bedroom plus den, four are 2-bedroom and six are 2-bedroom plus den. The units range in size from 50 square metres to 115 square metres with an overall average size of 75 square metres. In looking at the appropriateness of the development for a variety of owners, including families, staff considered not only the number of bedrooms in the units, but also the overall size of the units and the range of different units available. Staff believe that the proposal has a wide range of options for a wide range of potential owners.

Open Space/Parkland
The Official Plan contains policies to ensure that Toronto's system of parks and open spaces are maintained, enhanced and expanded. Map 8B of the Toronto Official Plan shows local parkland provisions across the City. The lands which are the subject of this application are in an area with 0.42 to 0.78 hectares of local parkland per 1,000 people. The site is in the second lowest quintile of current provision of parkland. The site is in a parkland priority area, as per the City Wide Parkland Dedication By-law 1020-2010.

The application proposes 34 residential units on a site with a net area of 1,737m2. At the alternative rate of 0.4 hectares per 300 units specified in By-law 1020-2010, the parkland
The dedication requirement is 0.045 hectares or 26% of the site area. However, for sites that are less than 1 hectare in size, a cap of 10% is applied to the residential use. In total, the parkland dedication requirement is 174m².

The applicant proposes to satisfy the parkland dedication requirement through cash-in-lieu. This is appropriate as an on-site parkland dedication requirement of 174m² would not be of a useable size. The actual amount of cash-in-lieu to be paid will be determined at the time of issuance of the building permit.

**Streetscape**

The church has been part of this community for a century, and its prominence on the corner of Wallace and Perth will continue. The new building to the north of the church has been designed to fit into the character of the residential street, while allowing the church to remain prominent.

The two units on the ground floor of the new building have entrances directly to the street with small yards, steps up to a porch and then individual entry doors. The building lines up with the houses to the north and is then stepped back on the ground floor to provide views through to the church. These individual entries and porches continue the rhythm of the street and echo the character that is so prominent in the neighbourhood.

The applicant is currently proposing to maintain one large tree that currently exists on the site, and is planting 10 more around the perimeter of the site. The details of the tree preservation and new tree planting will be secured through Site Plan Approval.

**Toronto Green Standard**

On October 27, 2009 City Council adopted the two-tiered Toronto Green Standard (TGS). The TGS is a set of performance measures for green development. Tier 1 is required for new development. Tier 2 is a voluntary, higher level of performance with financial incentives. Achieving the Toronto Green Standard will improve air and water quality, reduce green house gas emissions and enhance the natural environment.

The applicant is required to meet Tier 1 of the TGS. The site specific zoning by-law will secure performance measures for the following Tier 1 development features: Automobile Infrastructure and Cycling Infrastructure. Other applicable TGS performance measures will be secured through the Site Plan Approval process.

**Development Charges**

It is estimated that the development charges for this project will be $323,330.00. This is an estimate. The actual charge is assessed and collected upon issuance of the building permit.
Conclusion
The approval of this application will ensure the protection of an important community heritage resource, while introducing a new residential building that is compatible with the surrounding neighbourhood.

CONTACT
Sarah Phipps, Senior Planner
Tel. No. (416) 392-7622
Fax No. (416) 392-1330
E-mail: sphipps1@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

__________________________________________
Raymond David, Director
Community Planning, Toronto and East York District

(p:\2012\Cluster B\pln\TEYCC\20358440065.doc) - at

ATTACHMENTS
Attachment 1: Site Plan
Attachment 2: South Elevation
Attachment 3: West Elevation
Attachment 4: North Elevation
Attachment 5: East Elevation
Attachment 6: North Elevation – Church Building
Attachment 7: South Elevation – New Building
Attachment 8: Official Plan
Attachment 9: Zoning By-law
Attachment 10: Application Data Sheet
Attachment 11: Draft Official Plan Amendment
Attachment 12: Draft Zoning By-law
Attachment 1: Site Plan
Attachment 2: South Elevation
Attachment 3: West Elevation
Attachment 4: North Elevation
Attachment 5: East Elevation
Attachment 6: North Elevation – Church Building
Attachment 7: South Elevation – New Building
Attachment 8: Official Plan
Attachment 9: Zoning By-law
Attachment 10: Application Data Sheet

Application Type: Official Plan Amendment & Rezoning
Application Number: 11 296294 STE 18 OZ

Details: OPA & Rezoning, Standard
Application Date: October 20, 2011

Municipal Address: 243 PERTH AVE
Location Description: PLAN M13 PT LOT 231 **GRID S1801
Project Description: Official Plan and Zoning By Law Amendment to permit the conversion of the existing (heritage structure) place of worship into a residential apartment building containing 26 dwelling units, and a new 4-storey residential building on the existing parking lot containing 12 dwelling units. Twenty parking spaces are located under the new building to serve the development.

Applicant: Greg Dell
Agent: Joseph Caricari
Architect:
Owner:

PLANNING CONTROLS
Official Plan Designation: Neighbourhoods
Zoning: R2 Z0.6
Height Limit (m): 12
Site Specific Provision:
Historical Status: Y
Site Plan Control Area: Y

PROJECT INFORMATION
Site Area (sq. m): 1,737.66
Frontage (m): 45.72
Depth (m): 38
Height: Storeys: 4
Metres: 15.3

Total Ground Floor Area (sq. m):
Total Residential GFA (sq. m): 3,013
Parking Spaces: 20
Total Non-Residential GFA (sq. m): 0
Loading Docks 0
Total GFA (sq. m): 3,835
Lot Coverage Ratio (%): 61%
Floor Space Index: 2.2

DWELLING UNITS
Tenure Type: Condo
Rooms: 0 Residential GFA (sq. m): 2,424
Bachelor: 0 Retail GFA (sq. m): 0
1 Bedroom: 30 Office GFA (sq. m): 0
2 Bedroom: 10 Industrial GFA (sq. m): 0
3 + Bedroom: 0 Institutional/Other GFA (sq. m): 0
Total Units: 40

FLOOR AREA BREAKDOWN (upon project completion)

Above Grade Below Grade
Residential GFA (sq. m): 2,424 589
Retail GFA (sq. m): 0 0
Office GFA (sq. m): 0 0
Industrial GFA (sq. m): 0 0
Institutional/Other GFA (sq. m): 0 0

Contact: Planner Name: Sarah Phipps, Senior Planner
Telephone: (416) 392-7622
Attachment 11: Draft Official Plan Amendment

Authority: Toronto and East York Community Council Item [ ] as adopted by City of Toronto Council on _____, 2012.

Enacted by Council: _____, 2012

CITY OF TORONTO

BY-LAW No. ~ 2012

To adopt Amendment No. 196 to the Official Plan for the City of Toronto respecting the lands known municipally in the year 2012 as 243 Perth Avenue

WHEREAS authority is given to Council under the Planning Act, R.S.O. 1990, c.P. 13, as amended, to pass this By-law;

WHEREAS Council of the City of Toronto has provided adequate information to the public and has held at least one public meeting in accordance with the Planning Act;

The Council of the City of Toronto HERBY ENACTS as follows:

1. The attached Amendment No. 196 to the Official Plan is hereby adopted pursuant to the Planning Act as amended.

ENACTED AND PASSED this ~ day of ~ A.D. 2012

ROB FORD, ULLI S. WATKISS, Mayor City Clerk

(Corporate Seal)
AMENDMENT NO. 196 TO THE OFFICIAL PLAN

LANDS MUNICIPALLY KNOWN IN THE YEAR 2012 AS
243 Perth Avenue

The Official Plan of the City of Toronto is amended as follows:

1. Chapter 7, Site and Area Specific Policies, is amended by adding Site and Area Specific Policy No. 385 for the lands known municipally in 2012 as 243 Perth Avenue as follows:

385. 243 Perth Avenue

A building that contains a maximum of 40 residential units and one level of parking is permitted, provided the building includes the church building that existed on site in 2012 is converted to contain 26 of the residential units.

2. Chapter 7, Map 32, Site and Area Specific Policies, is revised to add the lands known municipally in 2012 as 243 Perth Avenue shown on the map above as Site and Area Specific Policy No. 385.
Attachment 12: Draft Zoning By-law Amendment

Authority: Toronto and East York Community Council Item – as adopted by City of Toronto Council on ~, 20~
Enacted by Council: ~, 20~

CITY OF TORONTO

Bill No. ~
BY-LAW No. ~-20~

To amend ~ Zoning By-law No. ~, as amended,
With respect to the lands municipally known as,
243 Perth Ave

WHEREAS authority is given to Council by Section 34 of the Planning Act, R.S.O. 1990, c.P. 13, as amended, to pass this By-law; and

WHEREAS Council of the City of Toronto has provided adequate information to the public and has held at least one public meeting in accordance with the Planning Act;

The Council of the City of Toronto HEREBY ENACTS as follows:

1. None of the provisions of Section 4(2), 4(4), 4(6)(c), 4(12), 4(14), 6(3) Part I 1, 6(3) Part II 3.F(i)(1)(a), 6(3) Part II 4, 6(3) Part II 5, 6(3) Part II 6, and 6(3) Part III 1(a) of Zoning By-law No. 438-86, being, "A By-law to regulate the use of land and the erection, use, bulk, height, spacing of and other matters relating to buildings and structures and to prohibit certain uses of lands and the erection and use of certain buildings and structures in various area of the City of Toronto", as amended, shall apply to prevent the erection and use of an addition to and the conversion and renovation of the existing place of worship to a residential building on the lands delineated by heavy lines on the attached Map 1 provided:

   a. The lot consists of those lands delineated by the heavy lines on Map 1 attached to and forming part of this By-law;

   b. No portion of any above grade building or structure to be erected or used on the lot shall extend beyond the building envelope delineated by the heavy lines on Map 2 attached to and forming part of this By-law, except for the following:

      i. eaves and cornices shall be permitted to project no more than 0.45 metres beyond the heavy lines on Map 2;

      ii. balconies shall be permitted to project from the north side of the existing church building, and the west side of the new building 1.6 metres from the wall to which they are attached; and
iii. canopies;

c. The *height* of the building on the *lot* shall not exceed the maximum *heights* as shown on Map 2 attached to and forming part of this By-law except the following:

   i. railings, stairways, handrails, landscaping elements, structures related to the parking area, and planters;

d. A maximum of 40 *dwelling units* shall be permitted on the *lot*; of which no more than 26 units shall be contained within the existing *place of worship* to be converted into a *residential building* and not more than 14 units shall be contained within the addition to the existing *place of worship*;

e. The maximum permitted *residential gross floor area* on the *lot* shall not exceed 3,835 square metres

f. A minimum of 20 *parking spaces* shall be provided on the *lot*, including a minimum of 3 *parking spaces* for visitors;

g. A minimum of 70 square metres of indoor *residential amenity space* shall be provided within the building in a multi-purpose room containing a kitchen and a washroom; and

h. A minimum of 80 square metres of outdoor *residential amenity space* shall be provided on the *lot* and it is not required to be adjoining or directly accessible from the indoor *residential amenity space*.

2. Despite any future severance, partition, or division of the *lot*, the provisions of this By-law shall apply to the whole of the *lot* as if no severance, partition or division occurred.

3. Within the lands shown on Map 1 attached to this By-law, no person shall use any land or erect or use any building or structure unless the following municipal services are provided to the *lot line* and the following provisions are complied with:

   a. all new public roads have been constructed to a minimum of base curb and base asphalt and are connected to an existing public highway, and

   b. all water mains and sanitary sewers, and appropriate appurtenances, have been installed and are operational

ENACTED AND PASSED this ~ day of ~, A.D. 20~.

ROB FORD, 
Mayor

ULLI S. WATKISS, 
City Clerk

(Corporate Seal)
NOTE: All dimensions are in metres.
NOTE: H denotes height in metres above established grade. All dimensions are in metres.