



AUDITOR GENERAL'S REPORT ACTION REQUIRED

Reliable Data is Needed for Effective Fleet Management

Date:	April 18, 2013
To:	Audit Committee
From:	Auditor General
Wards:	All
Reference Number:	

SUMMARY

The Auditor General's 2013 Work Plan included a review of City fuel use. The objective of this review was to determine if there are adequate controls in place to monitor fuel used by the City's fleet.

This report contains six recommendations along with a management response to each of the recommendations. The implementation of these recommendations will improve monitoring and oversight of the City's fleet and fuel use.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Auditor General recommends that:

1. City Council request the Director, Fleet Services to ensure all City fuel sites are operating in compliance with corporate operating procedures and standards.
2. City Council request the Director, Fleet Services, in consultation with the Deputy City Managers, to assign and document roles and responsibilities for monitoring fuel use for all City vehicles.
3. City Council request the Director, Fleet Services report to Government Management Committee, by December 31, 2013, on steps that can be implemented to significantly improve the accuracy of vehicle odometer readings including any revisions necessary to odometer reading criteria for identifying unusual meter readings.

4. City Council request the Director, Fleet Services, in consultation with divisional staff, to develop fuel and vehicle usage exception reports that allow divisional managers to easily identify unusual usage patterns for further examination.
5. City Council request the Director, Fleet Services, in consultation with divisional staff, to develop appropriate procedures and reporting mechanisms for examining and reporting back on action taken, on items identified in fuel and vehicle usage exception reports. The procedures should include reporting all exceptions, and divisional actions taken, to the appropriate Deputy City Manager.
6. City Council request the Director, Fleet Services conduct a review of the City's green fleet vehicles and report to Council on the progress on the City's Green Fleet Plan.

Financial Impact

The implementation of recommendations in this report will result in operating efficiencies. However, any resources required or potential cost savings resulting from implementing the recommendations in this report is not determinable at this time.

ISSUE BACKGROUND

In 2012, approximately 3.6 million litres of unleaded fuel and 10.3 million litres of diesel were dispensed at various City fuel sites with about 85 per cent of that passing through sites controlled by Fleet Services. The total cost of this fuel in 2012 was approximately \$14.4 million.

COMMENTS

This report contains six recommendations along with a management response to each of the recommendations. The implementation of these recommendations will strengthen oversight and improve the City's fleet management and use of fuel.

The Auditor General's report entitled "Reliable Data is Needed for Effective Fleet Management" is attached as Appendix 1. Management's response to each of the recommendations contained in the report is attached as Appendix 2.

CONTACT

Jerry Shaubel, Director, Auditor General's Office
Tel: 416-392-8462, Fax: 416-392-3754, E-mail: jshaubel@toronto.ca

Mayssa Mirshak, Audit Manager, Auditor General's Office
Tel: 416-392-0886, Fax: 416-392-3754, E-mail: mmirshak@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Jeff Griffiths, Auditor General

13 FTS 01

ATTACHMENTS

Appendix 1: Review of Reliable Data is Needed for Effective Fleet Management

Appendix 2: Management's Response to the Auditor General's Review of Reliable Data is Needed for Effective Fleet Management

AUDITOR GENERAL'S REPORT

Reliable Data is Needed for Effective Fleet Management

April 18, 2013

Jeffrey Griffiths, C.A., C.F.E.
Auditor General



TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
BACKGROUND	2
AUDIT OBJECTIVES, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY	4
AUDIT RESULTS	5
A. IMPROVEMENT NEEDED IN OVERSIGHT OF CITY FUEL SITES	5
A.1. Fleet Services Needs to Monitor Compliance with Corporate Standards at All City Fuel Sites	5
A.2. Ensuring Effective Management of Vehicles Allocated to City Divisions	7
B. EFFECTIVE MANAGEMENT REQUIRES GOOD INFORMATION AND REPORTS	7
B.1. Odometer Records Are Not Reliable	7
B.2. Develop and Implement Relevant Information Reports for Managers to Effectively Monitor City Vehicles and Equipment	9
CONCLUSION	13

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Auditor General's 2013 Audit Work Plan included a review of City fuel use.

Fleet Services oversees 46 fuel sites

As of March 2013, Fleet Services oversees 46 fuel sites, of which 20 are managed by Fleet Services and 26 by City divisions. There are plans to close seven of these sites, four in 2013 and three in 2014.

In 2012, approximately 3.6 million litres of unleaded gasoline and 10.3 million litres of diesel were dispensed at various City fuel sites with about 85 per cent of that passing through sites managed by Fleet Services

Audit objective

The primary objective of this audit was to determine if there are adequate controls in place to monitor fuel used by the City's fleet.

Absence of reliable odometer data makes it impossible to efficiently and effectively monitor fuel use

It is extremely difficult to conduct any meaningful analysis of fuel usage due to a lack of accurate vehicle meter (odometer and hour meter) information. From an audit perspective, the absence of such data makes it impossible to implement a system of continuous monitoring of information. From a management perspective, the absence of accurate meter information makes it extremely difficult to control and manage fuel usage. In the management of any fleet operations, accurate meter readings is a basic and fundamental control.

We also noted additional potential improvements in Fleet Service's management of the City's fuel and vehicle use.

- Increased oversight in the day to day operation of all City fuel sites
- Development and documentation of roles and responsibilities
- Development of fuel usage exception reports
- Ongoing analysis and review of vehicle performance

Conclusion

This report contains six recommendations. Implementation of these recommendations will improve monitoring and oversight of the City's fuel sites and fuel use.

BACKGROUND

In 2006 Fleet Services were mandated to monitor compliance at City fuel sites

In July 2006, City Council adopted a report titled “Review of the City’s Corporate Organizational Structure for Fleet Management and Services.”

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/2006/agendas/council/cc060725/pof6rpt/cl004.pdf>

One of the report’s recommendations mandated Fleet Services to establish operating procedures and standards as well as monitor compliance with their implementation at all City fuel sites.

Fleet Services oversee 46 fuel sites

In 2003, the City owned and operated 105 fuel sites. Since then, Fleet Services has worked with other divisions to reduce the number of fuel sites to lower operating costs and environmental risk. As of March 2013, the City has 46 fuel sites. Twenty sites are managed by Fleet Services and 26 by City divisions. Fleet Services has responsibility for oversight of fuel sites managed by divisions. There are plans to close seven sites, four in 2013 and three in 2014.

Currently, eight Fleet-managed fuel sites have been automated. The automation allows for reliable fuel tank data to be efficiently captured in order to monitor and control the City’s fuel supplies. Two additional sites are to be upgraded each year until such time as all are fully automated.

In 2012 3.6 million litres unleaded and 10.3 litres diesel were dispensed at City fuel sites

In 2012, approximately 3.6 million litres of unleaded fuel and 10.3 million litres of diesel were dispensed at various City fuel sites with about 85 per cent of that passing through sites controlled by Fleet Services. The total cost of this fuel in 2012 was approximately \$14.4 million.

Fleet Services uses a Divisional information system to track fuel supply and vehicle utilization. The eight fully automated fuel sites transmit information about fuel levels at the site, volume of fuel used and notify staff when fuel needs to be ordered. The other 38 fuel sites require staff to measure fuel volumes daily and to confirm tank fuel levels. Monitoring fuel levels to determine how much has been received relative to how much has been used and how much is left is critical information to detect potential tank leaks or missing fuel supplies.

Unreliable meter data impacts ability to evaluate fuel use

Monitoring fuel used by individual vehicles is also an important fuel management control. Fuel used by vehicles is impacted by kilometers driven (the odometer), and hours that the vehicle motor is used to run equipment attached to the vehicle, (hours meter). While certain reports currently exist to assist in managing fuel use, their usefulness is currently limited due to unreliable vehicle meter data.

In 2012, the Toronto Atmospheric Fund funded a one-time study aimed at helping the City reduce its fuel costs and green house gas emissions. The study, conducted by Fleet Challenge Ontario, examined ownership and operating costs based on vehicle age, odometer data, maintenance cost vs. vehicle age, and vehicle reliability. The resulting report, titled “The City of Toronto – Fleet Services Operational Efficiency Plan (OEP)” is available on the City’s web site.

http://www.toronto.ca/fleet/pdf/oep_finalreport.pdf

Automated odometer recording technology being considered

The 2013 to 2022 Capital Program includes funding to automate the recording of vehicle odometer data. This will improve the accuracy of records related to vehicle usage, reports and analysis. Fleet Services anticipates that automating the recording of vehicle odometer data will allow for more meaningful management information and more effective evaluation of vehicle performance.

AUDIT OBJECTIVES, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

The Auditor General's 2013 Audit Work Plan included a review of Fleet Services Division controls over the corporate fleet's fuel usage.

Is City fuel use being adequately monitored?

The primary objective of this audit was to determine if there are adequate controls in place to monitor fuel used by the City's fleet.

This review examined fuel transactions and odometer data recorded between January 1, 2012 and December 31, 2012 as well as management reports available on vehicle utilization.

Audit methodology

Our audit methodology included the following:

- review of minutes from City Council and Committee meetings
- interviews with Fleet Services staff
- review and analysis of City fuel site transaction data
- review of commercial fuel card transactions
- tour of fueling stations
- review of previous City audits
- review of 2012 consultant report titled *Fleet Services Operation Efficiency Plan*
http://www.toronto.ca/fleet/pdf/oep_finalreport.pdf
- review of audits conducted in other jurisdictions
- examination of various fleet management reports
- the City's fuel purchasing program approved by Council on October 24 and 25, 2011
<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2011/gm/bgrd/backgroundfile-41274.pdf>

Compliance with generally accepted government auditing standards

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

AUDIT RESULTS

A. Improvement Needed in Oversight of City Fuel Sites

There is room for improvement in compliance monitoring

Fleet Services is mandated to develop operating standards and procedures for City operated fuel sites. In addition, the Division is to implement procedures to monitor compliance with the established standards. While Fleet Services has developed standards and procedures, there is room for improvement in monitoring compliance in cooperation with the other divisions managing fuel sites on a day-to-day basis.

A.1. Fleet Services Needs to Monitor Compliance with Corporate Standards at All City Fuel Sites

Daily tracking of fuel supply required

For fuel sites that are not automated, daily dipstick readings are a key control to monitor fuel levels. City policy requires daily measurement of fuel volumes. These measurements, in combination with fuel delivery slips and dispensing records, should be reconciled on a daily and weekly basis to help detect missing fuel.

In addition to the City's policy, Environment Canada's code of practice for fuel tanks requires daily measuring and reconciliation of fuel quantities every day based on the City's fuel usage activity.

Automated sites or "superstations" do not require manual dipstick measurements as all volumes are automatically measured and recorded in real-time.

Variance in fuel volume must be tracked and investigated

A variance in fuel volume can occur for a number of reasons:

- tank leaks
- overstated volume on fuel delivery
- misappropriation of fuel
- external temperature variations causing fuel volume to expand or contract

Failure to conduct daily dipstick readings can delay the detection of problems and make it more difficult to pinpoint the source of discrepancies.

Fuel Sites Not Managed by Fleet

Fleet Services manages 20 fuel sites, other City divisions manage 26 fuel sites

Fleet Services monitors the fuel supplies, deliveries and volumes dispensed at 20 City fuel sites on a daily basis. Policies and procedures are in place to guide the other City divisions, which own and manage the other 26 City fuel sites, on daily activities required to monitor fuel use.

Presently, Fleet Services oversight of other divisions fuel sites is limited to coordinating mandatory inspections and to deal with any problems related to the City's fuel tanks. For example, Fleet Services deals with the Technical Standards and Safety Authority, which inspects the City fuel sites every three years. In addition, Fleet Services is responsible for initiating service calls when fuel tank leaks are detected at any of the 26 fuel sites managed by other divisions.

Monitoring fuel sites is a core responsibility for Fleet Services

Fleet Services does not receive or review any fuel information from the other divisions to ensure they are performing in accordance with corporate standards. Fuel site controls may be improved through Fleet Services taking a more active role in ensuring that all City fuelling sites are operating in accordance with City policies and procedures.

Fuel Sites Managed by Fleet Services

Inconsistent compliance with daily fuel volume reading requirement

We conducted a review of the daily reconciliation process for fuel sites managed by Fleet Services. We tested daily fuel volume readings at six non-automated sites. Two of the sites had the expected readings. However, for the other four sites, there were only 9 readings when there should have been 20. These sites are therefore non-compliant with both City policy and Environment Canada requirements.

Recommendation:

- 1. City Council request the Director, Fleet Services to ensure all City fuel sites are operating in compliance with corporate operating procedures and standards.**

A.2. Ensuring Effective Management of Vehicles Allocated to City Divisions

Divisional staff are in best position to assess day to day use of fuel

Fleet Services has adequate controls in place to ensure they know how much fuel is pumped from a fuel tank. However, Fleet Services is not able to determine if fuel dispensed to a vehicle or ancillary equipment is appropriate based on normal business use. Only divisional staff are familiar with the day to day operations to assess if a vehicle showing, for example, three fill ups in one day or low mileage, is reasonable based on the work related activities.

Policies and procedures do not address divisional staff responsibilities

The Corporate Fuel Handling and Dispensing Policy and Procedures does not provide clear guidance on the specific roles and responsibilities of staff in City divisions in effectively managing allocated equipment and vehicles. The roles and responsibilities of divisional staff need to be clarified to enhance control over vehicle fuel use.

Recommendation:

- 2. City Council request the Director, Fleet Services, in consultation with the Deputy City Managers, to assign and document roles and responsibilities for monitoring fuel use for all City vehicles.**

B. Effective Management Requires Good Information and Reports

B.1. Odometer Records Are Not Reliable

Accurate odometer information is needed to effectively manage fleet

Virtually every function dealing with fleet vehicle management is dependent upon accurate vehicle odometer mileage. Without reliable data it is not possible to accurately determine:

- level of vehicle utilization
- vehicle efficiency
- maintenance schedules
- inappropriate use of vehicles
- misappropriation of fuel

Odometer data is captured when vehicles are refueled and serviced

Odometer data is generally captured when a vehicle refuels and when it is brought into the garage for servicing.

When a vehicle is brought in to Fleet Services for maintenance, odometer data is supposed to be checked and corrected in the system. While we did not review servicing events as part of this review, it is our understanding from discussions with staff that there is room for improvement in the accuracy of recording odometer readings when a vehicle is serviced.

Vehicle refuelling is much more frequent than servicing and the best opportunity to record accurate odometer readings. Odometer information at each fill up, if accurate, can provide much more timely and meaningful data.

17% of fuel transaction records had odometer data flagged as a probable error

In 2012, seventeen per cent of the 208,000 fuelling transactions were flagged as “bad meter”. This means that the odometer reading entered was in excess of a reading anticipated using standard criteria defined by Fleet Services. We noted that some vehicles were flagged repeatedly throughout the year. There were 2,106 individual vehicles with at least one “bad meter” recording in 2012. We found additional instances where unusual odometer data was recorded but not flagged as they were within the expected reading based on the criteria.

“Bad meter” readings are generally a result of one of two issues. First, the vehicle operator does not enter the correct meter reading or, Fleet Services standardized criteria are not appropriate for a particular vehicle.

Interim solution needed to improve accuracy of odometer data

Fleet Services is currently in the initial stages of a pilot project which would, once fully implemented, greatly reduce these inaccuracies. Fleet Services are investigating automation that would enable wireless capture of vehicle odometer data. The pilot, even if successful however, will take several years to fully implement across the City. Action needs to be taken in the interim to ensure staff enter more accurate odometer data.

In addition, Fleet Services standard criteria need to be reviewed to ensure they are effective in assisting in identifying unusual meter readings.

Operational management can help improve odometer accuracy

Operational management are a primary avenue for addressing the inaccurate information entered by drivers. Addressing inaccurate odometer readings on a timely basis will help correct the problem over time. Taking steps to manage those vehicles/operators with high incidences of bad meters would address a significant component of the inaccurate odometer reading problem.

Recommendation:

- 3. City Council request the Director, Fleet Services report to Government Management Committee, by December 31, 2013, on steps that can be implemented to significantly improve the accuracy of vehicle odometer readings including any revisions necessary to odometer reading criteria for identifying unusual meter readings.**

B.2. Develop and Implement Relevant Information Reports for Managers to Effectively Monitor City Vehicles and Equipment

Exception Reports

Reports on fueling activities can be enhanced to allow operational management to focus on unusual or questionable transactions.

Existing reports sometimes too cumbersome

A number of management reports are accessible on Fleet Services' intranet site. However, some of these reports can be very large and encompass too much information, making it difficult if not impossible for divisional staff to detect anomalies.

More user friendly reports needed

One example is the Daily Multiple Fuel Transactions report. This report lists all City vehicles and equipment that had more than one fuelling transaction that day. Each user needs to generate this report daily, and then scan it for their own vehicles and equipment, which may or may not even be on the report. A more user friendly report design, transmitted automatically to the division would make it easier to use and more likely that it would be used.

Exception reports can help in identifying issues

In addition, there were no exception reports identifying fuel fill ups where volume of fuel dispensed exceeded vehicle fuel tank capacity. We used specialized audit software and tested all transactions in 2012 and found 11 instances where the volume exceeded tank capacity. The excess over tank capacity ranged from 4 to 90 litres.

Eleven transactions out of over 200,000 are not significant in terms of potentially lost fuel. Further, an excess four litres in one fill up may not warrant an investigation, however 90 litres over capacity, even as a one-time occurrence, should be reviewed. This is just one example of the possible benefits of exception reports. In this example, the exceptions highlight areas for management attention and would require minimal staff time to follow up on, at most, 11 exceptions.

Well designed reports, especially exception reports, can be useful and effective in assisting divisional management to ensure that City resources are used as intended. They can also be used to support meaningful planning and evaluation. However, cumbersome reports which either contain too much or not the right kind of information will often be overlooked.

Instructions on use of reports help ensure successful implementation

Where appropriate, instructions and directions on use of the reports can also ensure consistency in application and more successful use.

Underutilized Vehicle Report

In 2012, 441 City owned vehicles were identified as underutilized

Fleet Services produces and distributes a quarterly low utilization report on all vehicles with odometer usage of less than 7,500 km over a rolling 12 month period. Divisions are not required to provide a response to these reports. In 2012, 441 City owned and 14 rental vehicles assigned to various divisions were identified as low utilization.

In addition, the report included seven rental vehicles which logged more than 7,500 km. Fleet Services indicated that they include these in order to highlight to divisions that while additional vehicles were being rented, some City vehicles remain underutilized. Fleet Services suggested that there are opportunities for a vehicle sharing program that would be a much more cost-effective option for the City. For example, some vehicles are only used in the winter by one division while another may have use for them in the summer months. Rather than renting vehicles for the summer, Fleet Services could simply reassign the otherwise idle vehicles.

Various reasons why vehicle may appear to be underutilized

Divisional staff advised us that there are various reasons for the apparent low usage:

- staff assigned the vehicle are on sick leave
- vehicle used as a spare
- vehicle is used daily but within a small geographic area
- seasonal nature of program

Some vehicles are primarily used to transport a secondary piece of equipment, such as a pump. Staff would therefore use the vehicle to travel to the work destination which may be a short distance, but then use the secondary equipment all day. This type of use would not be reflected in a report which only captures distance travelled. Divisional staff advised that alternate measures such as hours of engine use would be more meaningful for certain types of vehicles.

Vehicle utilization was not intended as a focus of this review and as such we did not investigate any further. We have noted this as a matter that we will review in the near future.

Fleet Efficiency Analysis

One-time efficiency study conducted in 2012

Fleet Services is currently developing a report to assist in the ongoing evaluation of vehicle efficiency. The report will contain analysis similar to that contained in “The City of Toronto – Fleet Services Operational Efficiency Plan (OEP)” study, a one-time study that was based on 2010 data. The development and implementation of this kind of report on an ongoing basis will help in analyzing the efficiency of the City’s fleet and highlight issues requiring management attention.

Monitoring efficiency should be ongoing

The initial version of the Fleet Services report contained details on each vehicle such as the year, make and model as well as the total fuel volumes compared with kilometers travelled. Maintenance and repair costs were not captured or analyzed. Including these would provide a more meaningful measurement of overall vehicle performance.

Once the report has been implemented, defined protocols will also be required such as:

- who is to receive the reports
- how frequently they will be generated
- how will they be used

Recommendations:

- 4. City Council request the Director, Fleet Services, in consultation with divisional staff, to develop fuel and vehicle usage exception reports that allow divisional managers to easily identify unusual usage patterns for further examination.**
- 5. City Council request the Director, Fleet Services, in consultation with divisional staff, to develop appropriate procedures and reporting mechanisms for examining and reporting back on action taken, on items identified in fuel and vehicle usage exception reports. The procedures should include reporting all exceptions, and divisional actions taken, to the appropriate Deputy City Manager.**

Green Fleet Vehicles

Initial Green Fleet Plan 2004-2007

In 2004, Toronto City Council adopted the Green Fleet Transition Plan 2004-2007. The Plan was to transition the City's vehicles and equipment to lower environmental impact alternatives such as biodiesel, natural gas and hybrid electric vehicles.

***Last update was
for 2009
progress on the
Green Fleet Plan***

In January 2008, a report titled “Green Fleet Plan 2008-2011” committed to annual updates on progress on the plan. The last annual update was for the year 2009. Staff advise that due to limited resources, there has not been a formal evaluation of the performance of these vehicles since 2009.

http://www.toronto.ca/fleet/pdf/annual_update_2010.pdf

In addition to analyzing the reduction in emissions, a cost benefit analysis needs to be conducted to review the economics of purchasing biodiesel, natural gas and hybrid electric vehicles.

Recommendation:

- 6. City Council request the Director, Fleet Services conduct a review of the City’s green fleet vehicles and report to Council on the progress on the City’s Green Fleet Plan.**

CONCLUSION

This report presents the results of our review of Fleet Services controls over City fleet fuel usage. The report contains six recommendations.

Addressing the recommendations in this report will enhance the quality of reporting as well as strengthening controls, improve accountability and enhance the overall effectiveness of fuel site management.

**Management's Response to the Auditor General's Review of
Reliable Data is Needed for Effective Fleet Management**

Rec No.	Recommendations	Agree (X)	Disagree (X)	Management Comments: <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	Action Plan/Time Frame
1.	City Council request the Director, Fleet Services to ensure all City fuel sites are operating in compliance with corporate operating procedures and standards.	X			<p>In the short-term Fleet Services will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Write a corporate procedure defining roles and responsibilities for fuel site management, including daily dips, to be followed by all Divisions who manage fuel sites at their yards, to ensure consistency with current practices at Fleet-managed fuel sites (3 months). • Require Divisions to provide their fuel reconciliation records directly to Fleet Services, begin random inspections of fuel sites to ensure procedures are being followed and prepare a summary of the findings to the DCMs (6 months). • Continue working toward the goal of reducing the number of City fuel sites to 25 Super Sites by upgrading key sites and closing smaller and/or aging fuel sites. (Four closures are planned for 2013 and three for 2014.) • Examine industry best practices and adopt applicable procedures (3 months). • Review all aspects of fuel operations and the city's future role in this area (Ongoing).

Rec No.	Recommendations	Agree (X)	Disagree (X)	Management Comments: <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	Action Plan/Time Frame
2.	City Council request the Director, Fleet Services, in consultation with the Deputy City Managers, to assign and document roles and responsibilities for monitoring fuel use for all City vehicles.	X			<p>In the short-term Fleet will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Consult with Division Heads to assign and document roles and responsibilities to monitor fuel usage more closely for all city vehicles (3 months). • Develop and provide fuel use exception reports to assist User Divisions to monitor fuel usage (3–6 months). <p>In the medium-term, Fleet Services will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Investigate the practicality of alternatives for upgrading the fuel management system (6-9 months)

Rec No.	Recommendations	Agree (X)	Disagree (X)	Management Comments: <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	Action Plan/Time Frame
3.	<p>City Council request the Director, Fleet Services report to Government Management Committee, by December 31, 2013, on steps that can be implemented to significantly improve the accuracy of vehicle odometer readings including any revisions necessary to odometer reading criteria for identifying unusual meter readings.</p>	X			<p>In the short-term, Fleet Services will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Identify vehicles that repeatedly enter incorrect meter (odometer and hour) readings, provide this information to User Divisions to identify problem areas in an effort to develop solutions (3-6 months). • Initiate a process for assessing, and if necessary revising, the criteria used for identifying unusual meter readings (3-6 months). • Monitor an initiative undertaken by Fleet Services in 2013 that requires vehicle maintenance technicians to update the meter record before the system allows them to close a work order (3-6 months). <p>In the medium-term, Fleet Services will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • As part of a longer term project, investigate the practicality of solutions to automate meter inputs (9 months).

Rec No.	Recommendations	Agree (X)	Disagree (X)	Management Comments: <i>(Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)</i>	Action Plan/Time Frame
4.	City Council request the Director, Fleet Services, in consultation with divisional staff, to develop fuel and vehicle usage exception reports that allow divisional managers to easily identify unusual usage patterns for further examination.	X			<p>In the short-term Fleet will:</p> <p>As part of recommendation 2 (above) Fleet Services will consult with divisional staff to assign and document roles, and develop fuel and vehicle exception reports that allow Divisional Managers to more easily monitor and act on unusual fuel use patterns (3-6 months).</p>

Rec No.	Recommendations	Agree (X)	Disagree (X)	Management Comments: (Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)	Action Plan/Time Frame
5.	<p>City Council request the Director, Fleet Services, in consultation with divisional staff, to develop appropriate procedures and reporting mechanisms for examining and reporting back on action taken, on items identified in fuel and vehicle usage exception reports. The procedures should include reporting all exceptions, and divisional actions taken, to the appropriate Deputy City Manager.</p>	X			<p>In the short-term Fleet Services will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop procedures for managing fuel and vehicle exception reports including reporting back on actions taken by the User Divisions (3-6 months). • Bring low utilization vehicles, long-term rental vehicles and other areas of concern with vehicle and fuel resources to the attention of the DCMs in consultation with the Chief Corporate Officer as appropriate (3-6 months). • Work closely with User Divisions to address low-utilization vehicles and develop solutions such as providing information on opportunities to share vehicles across the Corporation to improve overall utilization while reducing the need for rentals (6-9 months).
6.	<p>City Council request the Director, Fleet Services conduct a review of the City's green fleet vehicles and report to Council on the progress on the City's Green Fleet Plan.</p>				<p>Fleet Services will consult with the Key User Divisions, conduct a review of the City's green fleet vehicles and provide a progress report on the City's Green Fleet Plan to Government Management Committee (9 months).</p>