121464

Copy: Vincent Rodo
Sameh Ghaly
Michael Roche
Mitch Stambler
Vince Cosentino

February 4, 2013

Councillor Denzil Minnan-Wong
City of Toronto
Toronto City Hall
100 Queen Street West
Suite C55
Toronto, Ontario
M5H 2N2

Dear Councillor Minnan-Wong:

This letter is in response to your recent request for a report or data source that the TTC would use to determine and compare the operating costs of subway and light rail transit (LRT).

Accurate, reliable data for LRT will necessarily include various elements of the overall operating concept including vehicle headway, train size, operators per train, service levels, loading standards, feeder bus costs, multi-modal facilities costs, fare collection procedures, and line-specific ridership projections. The overall LRT operating concept is now being developed by Metrolinx.

At this point, it is estimated that a network analysis could be undertaken in 2018. This timeframe is based on the terms and conditions contained in the Master Agreement for the implementation of the Toronto LRT Program. Data for all of the above-noted elements that are required to conduct a comprehensive LRT network analysis are not expected to be available until the entire LRT network has been in revenue service for a reasonable period of time. Below are four relevant excerpts from the agreement:

On June 29, 2012, the Province of Ontario approved Metrolinx's transit plan and set construction timelines for the following Projects:

- *The Eglinton Crosstown LRT from Black Creek to Kennedy Station, in respect of which work is already underway and is to be completed by 2020.*
- *The Scarborough RT replacement and extension to Sheppard Avenue, in respect of which work is to begin in 2014 and be completed by 2020.*
- *The Finch West LRT from the Toronto-York-Spadina Subway extension to Humber College, in respect of which work is to begin in 2015 and to be completed by 2020.*

REÇU/RECEIVED
05-02-2013
Cog 13490

- *The Sheppard East LRT from Don Mills station to east of Morningside Avenue, in respect of which work is to begin in 2017 and to be completed by 2021.*

Two years before the anticipated launch of revenue service on the LRTs in 2020, the Parties will develop an operating and maintenance agreement . . .

Operations will be delivered by the TTC, on behalf of Metrolinx, over an initial 10 year operating agreement, which could be extended by mutual agreement. Under this arrangement, the TTC will, under contract with Metrolinx, operate the four LRT lines . . .

Over the longer term, it will also be required that Metrolinx, the City of Toronto and the TTC enter into a second operating agreement under the Master Agreement. This second operating agreement will include:

- *a methodology to estimate the number of riders that board the four Metrolinx transit lines and transfer onto the TTC, and board the TTC and transfer onto the four Metrolinx transit lines, in order to appropriately share fare box revenue,*
- *description of the broader commercial arrangements,*
- *the treatment of any savings in the provision of existing TTC services along the four Metrolinx transit lines,*
- *the setting of fares, and*
- *the treatment of any required operating subsidies on the four Metrolinx transit lines.*

The terms of the second operating agreement will be finalized at least two years in advance of the launch of revenue service for any of the Metrolinx projects.

In the absence of comprehensive TTC LRT data, comparisons of TTC's subway with LRT in other cities are neither simple nor advisable for several reasons as explained below:

- Canadian-based data for light rail transit are not readily available. Data from CUTA for individual transit agencies is aggregated – breakdowns by vehicle mode are not available. Moreover, only three Canadian transit agencies – Calgary, Edmonton, and Ottawa, operate a light rail component and each of these operations is small in comparison to the eventual LRT network at the TTC.

- U.S.-based data for heavy rail (subway) and light rail transit are available, however, comparisons involving either TTC heavy rail vs. U.S. light rail or U.S. heavy rail vs. U.S. light rail are not recommended due to differences in accounting standards, how operating cost data are segmented by Canadian and U.S. transit agencies, and differences in the network design, operating environment, and size of operations of light rail networks across the U.S.

The TTC will be pleased to share the results of all future LRT analyses as they become available.

Sincerely,

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY

A. BYFORD

Andy Byford
Chief Executive Officer

42-81-81

Copy: TTC Chair Karen Stintz