



Knowles

A Hill International Company

April 19, 2013

**City of Toronto, Request for Proposals No. 3907-12-3192  
Green Lane Landfill Operation, Maintenance and Construction Services  
Fairness Advisor's Report**

---

Knowles Consulting Services Inc. (Knowles) was engaged by the City of Toronto as Fairness Advisor to provide independent oversight throughout the procurement process to select a service provider for the provision of Green Lane Landfill operations, maintenance and construction services for a 7-year Term commencing on March 1, 2014. Knowles participated in the validation of the procurement process and provided oversight throughout the process.

According to the City's guidelines the following chart summarizes our involvement and findings:

<b>Stage</b>	<b>Task</b>	<b>Fair (Yes/ No)</b>
1	Review of Request for Proposals (RFP) documentation	Yes
2	Ensure that the procurement process, communication with the City and basis for selection were clearly stated in the RFQ	Yes
3	Review draft Q&A responses and confirm publication	Yes
4	Review draft addenda and confirm publication	Yes
5	Ensure that Proponents were notified of Proponents' meetings and site visits with adequate notice	Yes
6	Attend Proponents' meetings and site visits to confirm proper conduct	Yes
7	Review of the evaluation criteria;	Yes
8	Ensuring that Selection Committee members (evaluators) were briefed on best practices	Yes
9	Obtain confirmation that mandatory requirements check was performed	Yes
10	Attend Selection Committee consensus evaluation sessions	Yes
11	Monitoring and reporting of any deviations from the	Yes

Stage	Task	Fair (Yes/ No)
	process established in the RFP, conflicts of interest or the exercise of undue influence over the process	
13	Attendance at debriefings	Pending

### Observations and Findings

The City of Toronto's Purchasing and Materials Management Division (PMMD), Solid Waste Management Services and Engineering and Construction Services staff managed the RFP with the support of Golder Associates Ltd., an engineering consulting firm. These three City organizations prepared the draft and final RFP documentation and addenda, responded to proponent questions, conducted Proponents' information meetings as well as site visits and consulted Knowles as Fairness Advisor for potential and actual fairness issues. In accordance with the RFP, all communications with the City during the open period were conducted in writing by email with a designated buyer in PMMD and a deadline for questions was established. Responses were provided by way of addenda to the RFP.

Two Proponents submitted timely Proposals in response to the RFP. Both Proposals met all mandatory submission requirements and were evaluated according to the RFP. The two quotations were ranked in order of score and the highest ranking was recommended by City staff for negotiation towards a Contract.

### Conclusion

As the Fairness Advisors for Request for Proposals No. 3907-12-3192, we certify that the RFP procurement process was, in our opinion, fair, open and transparent and that Proponents received consistent treatment. Furthermore, we are not aware of any issues that would impair the fairness of this procurement.

Yours truly,  
Knowles Consultancy Services Inc.



Don Solomon