M TORONTO

STAFF REPORT ACTION REQUIRED

2131 Yonge St and 32 Hillsdale Avenue East – Official Plan Amendment and Zoning Amendment Applications – Request for Directions Report

Date:	October 31, 2013
То:	Toronto and East York Community Council
From:	Director, Community Planning, Toronto and East York District
Wards:	Ward 22 – St. Paul's
Reference Number:	13 105888 STE 22 OZ

SUMMARY

This application proposes to redevelop the subject site at 2131 Yonge Street and 32 Hillsdale Avenue. The current use, a large retail store (The Art Shoppe), is to be demolished.

The proposed mixed commercial-residential redevelopment consists of a 38-storey (123.85 metres) north tower and a 29-storey (98.70 metres) south tower (excluding mechanical penthouses). The height in storeys of both towers includes a common 6-storey base. The north tower includes a proposed restaurant on the 38th floor.

A total of 693 residential units are proposed and 497 parking spaces plus 3 car-share spaces are provided in an underground garage. The total proposed gross floor area is approximately 9.0 times the lot area. The lot includes the parkette on Hillsdale Avenue East which is owned by the applicant and leased to the City.

The base consists of retail uses on floors 1 and 2, residential units on floors 3 to 5 and a residential amenity level on the 6^{th} floor.

The applicant has appealed to the Ontario Municipal Board prior to Council making a decision on their request for Official Plan and



Staff report for action – Request for Directions Report – 2131 Yonge Street

zoning amendments. This report reviews and recommends refusal of the application to amend the Official Plan and Zoning By-law.

The proposed development on a site outside of the Yonge-Eglinton Urban Growth Centre (UGC) is not consistent with the Provincial Policy Statement and neither does it conform to the Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe or the Official Plan.

The proposed massing and tower heights of 38 storeys (124 metres) and 29 storeys (99 metres) on a lot abutting a *Neighbourhoods* designated area does not fit its built or planned context. The proposal does not comply with the policies of the Official Plan, including Section 4.5 which requires transition between areas of different intensity and scale (by stepping down in height among other methods), particularly towards lower scale *Neighbourhoods*.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Planning Division recommends that:

- 1. City Council refuse application 13 105888 STE 22 OZ for Official Plan and Zoning Bylaw Amendment at 2131 Yonge Street and 32 Hillsdale Avenue East for the following reasons:
 - a. the site is not within the Yonge-Eglinton Urban Growth Centre;
 - b. the proposal is not consistent with the Provincial Policy Statement, does not conform to the Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe and is not consistent with the Official Plan;
 - c. the proposal is inconsistent with the Council-approved Tall Buildings Design Guidelines; and
 - d. the proposal represents an over-development of the site.
- 2. City Council authorize the City Solicitor together with City Planning and other appropriate staff to appear before the Ontario Municipal Board in support of City Council's decision to refuse the application.
- 3. City Council authorize City Planning in consultation with the Ward Councillor to secure services, facilities or matters pursuant to Section 37 of the Planning Act as may be required by the Chief Planner should the proposal be approved in some form by the Ontario Municipal Board.

Financial Impact

The recommendations in this report have no financial impact.

Pre-Application Consultation

Pre-application consultation meetings were held with the applicant on April 18, 2011 and September 16, 2012 to discuss the proposed redevelopment concept. Staff indicated that proposals presented by the applicant at those meetings exceed supportable heights and densities.

Before the application was submitted in January of 2013 and before the land was purchased by the current owner in October of 2011, a letter from the Manager of Midtown Section Community Planning Division (dated June 18, 2011) informed the applicant that staff did not support a large scale development on the site which is outside of the Yonge-Eglinton Urban Growth Centre.

A pre-application consultation meeting with the applicant was held by the Ward Councillor on November 2, 2012. The applicant presented two 30-plus storey towers with a 6-storey base to the Ward Councillor, representatives of local resident associations and City staff.

The Ward Councillor asked the applicant to revise its proposal to respond to the resident associations' comments and concerns regarding height, density and massing of this proposal on a site outside of the Urban Growth Centre and abutting a Neighbourhoods designation. An additional meeting was unable to be held until February 19, 2012, after submission of the applicant's rezoning application. No revisions were made to the application to address these concerns respecting height, density and massing.

The application includes a request to amend the Yonge-Eglinton Secondary Plan to establish the site as a new mixed use area (mixed use area F) which includes policies that support its proposed development.

ISSUE BACKGROUND

Proposal

This is an application to amend the Official Plan and Zoning By-law to permit the construction of a mixed-use development consisting of a 38 and a 29-storey tower that include a 6-storey base (refer to Attachment No. 8).

The proposed development contains 693 residential units, 497 parking spaces and 3 car share spaces. The building base contains 2 storeys of retail (floors 1 & 2) with 4 storeys of residential units above. A restaurant and outdoor patio seating is proposed for the 38^{th} floor of the north tower.

The proposed density is approximately 9.0 times the lot area.

Site and Surrounding Area

The site comprises the full block on the east side of Yonge Street between Soudan Avenue and Hillsdale Avenue East. It is an assembly of two properties, 2131 Yonge Street and 32 Hillsdale Avenue East. The site is currently occupied by a 2-storey, single use retail store (The Art Shoppe) which is no longer open.

Vehicular access to a customer parking lot and loading area is from Soudan Avenue at the north end of the site. A smaller staff parking area, shipping door and garbage storage area is located at the south end of the building and accessed from Hillsdale Avenue East.

The Hillsdale Avenue Parkette is located at 32 Hillsdale Avenue East. The parkette land is owned by the applicant and under 50-year lease (until 2033) to the City for public use as a park.

Surrounding uses are as follows:

North: directly north, on the north side of Soudan Avenue is an 8-storey office building at 2161 Yonge Street and a 6-storey office building at 30 Soudan Avenue. To the north of these buildings are the 2 Minto Midtown towers, a 39-storey south tower and a 54-storey north tower, with commercial uses at grade along Yonge Street. Immediately north of the Minto Midtown development is a 6-storey office building which is under application for rezoning to permit a 56-storey mixed commercial-residential building. Beyond that are 3 buildings ranging from 2 to 8-storeys (at southeast corner of Yonge and Eglinton).

To the northwest of the site is a commercial development known as Canada Square comprised of 3 office buildings (some with commercial frontages) at grade on Yonge Street and some with internal retail stores (no Yonge Street frontage). Canada Square includes an 18-storey office building at the northwest corner of Yonge Street and Berwick Avenue, a 6-storey office building north of that and a 17-storey office building at the southwest corner of Yonge Street and Eglinton Avenue.

The rest of the lands within the area bounded by Yonge Street, Eglinton Avenue West, Duplex Avenue and Berwick Avenue include the vacant TTC bus barns and a new development consisting of 20 townhouses on the east side of Duplex Avenue and a 17storey apartment building at the corner of Duplex and Berwick Avenues which is currently under construction.

The block between Yonge Street, Eglinton Avenue West, Duplex Avenue and Berwick Avenue was the subject of a City-initiated review and public consultation process for the Official Plan policy and zoning regulations which govern its redevelopment. The resulting Official Plan amendment included most of these lands within the Urban Growth Centre. The area-specific rezoning allows maximum, as-of-right heights at the southwest corner of Yonge Street and Eglinton Avenue West of 120 metres (approx. 39 storeys) and an 85 metre height (approx. 28 storeys) on lands south of that to Berwick Avenue.

South: the full block on Yonge Street (east and west sides) from Hillsdale Avenue East to Manor Road has 2 and 3-storey mixed use buildings with retail at grade and apartments and/or offices above. Most properties in this block on the east side of Yonge Street are part of a lot with approved zoning (July 1998) to permit the redevelopment of a 7-storey mixed commercial-residential building.

- East: immediately east of the site is a large area designated *Neighbourhoods* which stretches east to Laird Drive. This *Neighbourhoods* area consists of a number of stable, low-scale neighbourhoods including Davisville Village and Leaside. The prevailing context of housing in these neighbourhoods is 2 and 3-storey, single and semi-detached houses. For example, the property immediately east of the site at 29 Soudan Avenue is a detached 2-storey house, and the property immediately east of the site on Hillsdale Avenue is a detached 2.5- storey house.
- West: directly west, across Yonge Street, is a block of 2 and 3-storey mixed commercial-residential buildings (between Berwick Avenue and Hillsdale Avenue West). South of this block, also on the west side of Yonge Street, is a similar row of low, mixed commercial-residential buildings. Both blocks have an auto-repair shop at the corner (northwest and southwest corners) of Yonge Street and Hillsdale Avenue. The auto-repair shop at the southwest corner (2112 2114 Yonge Street) is currently under application for zoning approval to construct a mixed use, mid-rise building of 9 storeys. To the west of both of these blocks is the TTC open subway track which provides a width of undevelopable area between the Mixed Use designation on the west side of Yonge Street and the Neighbourhoods designation beyond the subway open cut.

Provincial Policy Statement and Provincial Plans

The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) provides policy direction on matters of provincial interest related to land use planning and development. The PPS sets the policy foundation for regulating the development and use of land. The key objectives include: building strong communities; wise use and management of resources; and protecting public health and safety. City Council's planning decisions are required to be consistent with the PPS.

The Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe provides a framework for managing growth in the Greater Golden Horseshoe including: directions for where and how to grow; the provision of infrastructure to support growth; and protecting natural systems and cultivating a culture of conservation. City Council's planning decisions are required to conform, or not conflict with the Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe.

Section 2.2.3(6) of the Growth Plan requires that all municipalities (subject to the Growth Plan) "develop and implement through their Official Plans and supporting documents, a strategy and policies to phase in and achieve intensification and the intensification target." Section 2.2.4 identifies Urban Growth Centres (UGC's) as areas that will be planned to "accommodate a significant share of population and employment growth".

The Yonge-Eglinton Urban Growth Centre is identified on the land use map attached to the Yonge-Eglinton Secondary Plan (refer to Attachment 6: Yonge-Eglinton Secondary Plan). Policies to regulate intensification have been incorporated into the Secondary Plan as is required by the Growth Plan. The site is located outside of the south boundary of the UGC at Soudan Avenue.

Official Plan

Mixed Use Neighbourhoods – Section 4.5

The site is primarily located within a *Mixed Use Areas* designation of the Official Plan. However, a small portion of the site fronting on Soudan Avenue is designated *Neighbourhoods* and the parkette fronting on Hillsdale Avenue, owned by the applicant and leased to the City, is designated *Parks* (refer to Attachment 5: Official Plan).

The Official Plan policies include a list of criteria that direct the design and orientation of new development within *Mixed Use Areas*, particularly *Mixed Use Areas* that abut *Neighbourhoods* designations. These criteria are intended to minimize the impact of new mixed use development on abutting *Neighbourhoods*. Criteria are found in Section 4.5.2 of the Plan and include:

- locate and mass new buildings to provide a transition between areas of different development intensity and scale, as necessary to achieve the objectives of this Plan, through means such as providing appropriate setbacks and/or a stepping down of heights, particularly towards lower scale *Neighbourhoods*;
- locate and mass new buildings so as to adequately limit shadow impacts on adjacent Neighbourhoods, particularly during the spring and fall equinoxes;
- locate and mass new buildings to frame the edges of streets and parks with good proportion and maintain sunlight and comfortable wind conditions for pedestrians on adjacent streets, parks and open spaces;
- provide an attractive, comfortable and safe pedestrian environment;
- provide good site access and circulation and an adequate supply of parking for residents and their visitors;
- locate and screen service areas, ramps and garbage storage to minimize the impact on adjacent streets and residences; and
- provide indoor and outdoor recreation space for building residents in every significant multi-unit residential development.

Built Form – Section 3.1.2

The *Built Form* section of the Official Plan provides similar list of criteria to those found in the *Mixed Use Areas* policies to ensure that new development will be massed to fit harmoniously into its existing and/or planned context and to limit its impacts on neighbouring streets, parks, open spaces and properties. The list of built form criteria are found in Section 3.1.2.3.

Avenues – Section 2.2.3

The site is also located on a section of Yonge Street that is identified as an 'Avenue' on Map 2 of the Official Plan. Avenues are corridors along major streets where re-urbanization is anticipated to occur on an incremental basis. Avenue Studies are intended to precede major development on mixed use segments of the Avenues.

Section 2.2.3.3(a) of the Official Plan allows that some development may be permitted on an Avenue prior to an Avenue Study, subject to a review of the implications of the proposed development on the segment of the Avenue in which it is located and on the greater *Neighbourhood*. Section 2.2.3.3(b) of the Plan sets out the general parameters of the Segment Review for testing whether (or not) a development proposal will have adverse impacts on the specific Avenue Segment and the greater neighbourhood area in which it is located. The parameters include:

- an assessment of the impacts of the incremental development of the entire Avenue segment at a similar form, scale and intensity, appropriately allowing for distinguishing circumstances (the potential of the proposal to be a catalyst for changing the established development context on the Avenue);
- consideration of whether incremental development of the entire Avenue Segment would adversely impact any adjacent *Neighbourhoods* or *Apartment Neighbourhoods* (impact on abutting land use designations);
- consideration of whether the proposed development is supportable by available infrastructure; and
- the requirement that the segment study will be considered together with any amendment to the Official Plan or Zoning By-law at the statutory public meeting for the proposed development.

The applicant submitted an Avenue Segment Study which identifies two potential "soft" sites on Yonge Street between Soudan Avenue and Merton Street, which it suggests could also be assembled for tall building redevelopment proposals. As both sites back onto *Neighbourhoods* areas, their redevelopment for comparable tall buildings would have negative impacts on the *Neighbourhoods* areas similar to the proposed development. Approval of the proposed tower development would encourage such assemblies and tall building proposals on this Avenue Segment.

Yonge-Eglinton Secondary Plan

The site is within the Yonge-Eglinton Secondary Plan area. The Secondary Plan includes policies to minimize conflicts between buildings and uses in Mixed Use Areas and abutting *Neighbourhoods*, *Apartment Neighbourhoods* and *Parks* and *Opens Space Areas* in terms of land use, scale of buildings and traffic and access (Section 2.4).

Map 21-1 of the Secondary Plan (refer to Attachment 6: Yonge-Eglinton Secondary Plan) shows that subject site is located outside of the Secondary Plan special policy *Mixed Use Areas*, so the *Mixed Use Areas* policies of the Official Plan apply.

A number of General policies of the Secondary Plan also apply to the subject site, as follows:

Section 2.4

It is a primary objective to maintain and reinforce the stability of *Neighbourhoods* and to minimize conflicts among uses in *Mixed Use Areas, Neighbourhoods, Apartment Neighbourhoods and Parks and Open Space Areas* in terms of land use, scale and vehicular movement.

Section 2.7

In order to ensure that the form of buildings promotes a compatible physical and land use relationship between development within the various land use designations and between sites in abutting land use designations, and that all new buildings within Yonge-Eglinton Secondary Plan area form a positive visual relationship to the street, it is an objective of this Secondary Plan to:

- (a) maintain the existing scale of developments within stable *Neighbourhoods* and protect such areas from overshadowing from buildings located in abutting *Mixed Use Areas* and *Apartment Neighbourhoods*;
- (b) secure a transition in height and scale from developments in *Mixed Use Areas* and *Apartment Neighbourhoods* and in particular to those sites which abut a *Neighbourhoods* area;
- (c) require that development on those portions of land which project into adjacent *Neighbourhoods* will be designed in a manner so as to be of a height and scale consistent with the abutting residential uses; and
- (d) ensure that developments of the greatest height, density and scale are situated within *Mixed Use Area* 'A' and that developments of a lesser scale that are contextually appropriate and compatible with adjacent areas will occur in *Mixed Use Areas* 'B', 'C' and 'D'.

Section 5.0 – Yonge-Eglinton (Urban Growth) Centre

The Province's Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe contains policies to direct a significant portion of future population and employment growth into a number of intensification areas called Urban Growth Centres (UGCs). Under the policies of the Growth Plan, municipalities were required to delineate the boundaries of the UGC's within their Official Plans. The Yonge-Eglinton Secondary Plan was recently amended through an extensive public process (Official Plan Amendment No. 116, adopted by By-law 623-2010) to delineate the boundary of the Yonge-Eglinton Urban Growth Centre (refer to Attachment 6: Yonge-Eglinton Secondary Plan).

The policies of Section 5.0 of the Yonge-Eglinton Secondary Plan provide specific guidance with respect to the areas of the Secondary Plan to which intensification should be directed. Policies are:

5.2 Within the Yonge-Eglinton Centre the highest heights, densities and scale of development will be within Mixed Use Area 'A' on the blocks at the four quadrants of the intersection of Yonge Street and Eglinton Avenue.

- 5.3 The heights, densities and scale of development will decrease along Eglinton Avenue East with increasing distance from the Yonge-Eglinton intersection within the Yonge-Eglinton Centre.
- 5.7 New development in the Yonge-Eglinton Centre will be compatible with maintaining the character of surrounding Neighbourhoods.

The site of the proposed development is outside of the area identified for growth and defined as the Yonge-Eglinton Urban Growth Centre by the Secondary Plan.

Zoning

Under By-law 438-86, most of the site is zoned MCR T3.0 C2.0 R2.5 except for a small portion at its easterly edge stretching from Soudan Avenue to Hillsdale Avenue that is zoned R2 Z0.6 (refer to Attachment 7: Zoning).

The MCR zoning classification permits residential uses including apartment buildings and a range of retail, service and office commercial uses. The height limit for the MCR zoned portion of the site is 16 metres or approximately 5.5 storeys. The maximum mixed use as-of-right density is 3 times the lot area.

The R2 zoning classification permits a wide range of residential uses. The permitted building height for the R2 zoned portion of the site is 9 metres. The maximum residential as-of-right density is 0.6 times the lot area.

Restrictive exception 12(2)119(iv) requires that buildings constructed on lots within a MCR district in this area do not penetrate a 60 degree angular plane which is projected from the *lot* line facing an R district and from a line 10 metres from the *lot* line facing a public highway.

Site Plan Control

The proposed development is subject to Site Plan Control. A site plan application has not been submitted. Staff will request that any approval by the Ontario Municipal Board on this rezoning and Official Plan Amendment application be conditional upon site plan approval.

Reasons for Application

Official Plan Amendment

The site is irregular shaped and most of it is designated *Mixed Use Areas*. The parkette portion of the site fronting onto Hillsdale Avenue is designated *Parks*. A small area north of the parkette on the south side of Soudan is shown as *Neighbourhoods* (refer to Attachment 5: Official Plan).

The applicant points out that the land use designation boundaries on the Official Plan land use maps are intended to be general except where they reference a specific policy (or policies) or coincide with distinguishable features (e.g. roads). The applicant's position is that the entire site (Hillsdale Parkette excepted) currently functions as *Mixed Use Areas* and is intended to be

designated *Mixed Use Areas*. The applicant proposes to clarify that intent with an amendment to the Yonge-Eglinton Secondary Plan (given that the Secondary Plan prevails over the Official Plan in the event of a conflict).

The applicant's proposed official plan amendment would not only re-designate the small area of the site currently within the *Neighbourhoods* designation. It would also create a new site-specific Secondary Plan designation (mixed use area 'F') with new planning and development policies that apply to the entire site. The mixed use area 'F' policies would allow the proposed redevelopment by differentiating the site as an exception in terms of Official Plan policy from the rest of the *Avenue* segment on Yonge Street. The applicant proposes that the mixed use area 'F' be regarded as:

- suitable for mixed use intensification; and
- appropriate for tall buildings subject to providing a transition in height outside of the Urban Growth Centre from Mixed Use Area 'A' to the mid-rise development along the east side of Yonge Street south of Soudan Avenue.

Zoning Amendment

The applicant requested amendments to the provisions of Zoning By-law 438-86 to permit the proposed development with heights of 123.85 metres and 98.70 metres excluding the mechanical penthouses (north and south towers respectively) and a density of 9.0 times the lot area. A maximum of 16 metres in height and a total of 3.0 times the lot area for a mixed use building is permitted by the Zoning By-law.

The applicant also requires zoning amendments to permit the proposed towers to penetrate a 60 degree angular plane as projected from the *lot* line facing the 'R' district to the east and as projected from a line 10 metres from Yonge Street, Soudan Avenue and Hillsdale Avenue.

Other areas of non-compliance (e.g. parking, amenity space, landscaped open space) were determined by Toronto Buildings through its zoning review of the application and provided to the applicant.

Community Consultation

A community consultation meeting held at North Toronto Collegiate on May 29, 2013 was attended by approximately 70 people.

In addition to their concerns with respect to the proposed height and density, residents at the meeting or who contacted staff raised additional concerns which included: the site's location outside of the UGC, shadow impacts on the neighbourhoods, subway crowding and the volumes of vehicular traffic on the local neighbourhood streets (Hillsdale and Soudan Avenue), the inappropriateness of the proposed transition in height and density from the Minto towers, and the general need to have more planning initiatives for the local area such as the Yonge-Eglinton Focus Review and the Midtown in Focus study.

Agency Circulation

The application was circulated to all appropriate agencies and City divisions. Responses received have been used to assist in evaluating this application.

COMMENTS

This proposal raises significant issues of inconsistency with provincial and municipal planning policy. Fundamentally, it fails to comply with the planned context for the Yonge-Eglinton area which has a boundary that was established to separate larger scale and higher density development within the Yonge-Eglinton Urban Growth Centre from the typically mid-rise scale and lower density development in other areas of the City. It also raises significant concerns with excessive density and intensity of use that put additional pressure on a *Neighbourhood* to the east as well as on an already intensified Apartment Neighbourhood to the north.

Provincial Policy Statement and Provincial Plans

Staff reviewed the proposed development for consistency with the PPS and for conformity with the Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe. As stated in the Provincial Policy Statement (Policy 4.5) the Official Plan is the most important vehicle for implementation of the PPS. Comprehensive, integrated and long term planning is best achieved through municipal Official Plans which shall identify Provincial interests and set out appropriate land use designations and policies. The PPS speaks to managing and directing land use to achieve efficient development and land use patterns.

Places to Grow, the Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe is the Provincial document that identifies areas to which municipalities are to direct growth through their official plan policies. These growth areas are referred to as Urban Growth Centres (UGCs). The City implemented the Growth Plan, as required, through a recent amendment to the Official Plan.

The Yonge-Eglinton Secondary Plan area is currently experiencing significant growth. The minimum growth target required by the Provincial Growth Plan for each of the Urban Growth Centres in the City (including the Yonge-Eglinton UGC) is 400 residents and jobs combined per hectare by the year 2031 or sooner. The growth plan states that if this minimum target is exceeded, the new level of residents and jobs will become the minimum target for the centre.

As of the 2006 City of Toronto Employment Survey and the 2006 Statistics Canada Census, the Yonge-Eglinton area had exceeded the initial minimum and had approximately 475 residents and jobs combined per hectare.

Map 21-1 of the Yonge-Eglinton Secondary Plan shows the boundaries of the Yonge-Eglinton (urban growth) Centre. Section 5.0 of the Yonge-Eglinton Secondary Plan establishes policies which direct the highest heights and densities within the Yonge Eglinton Centre to the four quadrants at the intersection of Yonge Street and Eglinton Avenue.

As indicated in subsequent sections of this report, the proposed development fails to comply with key policies of the Official Plan and the Yonge-Eglinton Secondary Plan and therefore is not

consistent with Section 4.5 of the PPS. This report also demonstrates that the proposal does not conform to and conflicts with Section 2.2.3 and 2.2.4 of the Growth Plan as implemented by Section 5.0 of the Yonge-Eglinton Secondary Plan.

Land Use

This application proposes the construction of 693 residential units in a mixed-use building consisting of two towers (38 and 29 storeys) including a 6-storey base. Levels 1 and 2 of the base are to contain commercial uses. Levels above the second floor in the base and in both towers are primarily dedicated to residential use or residential amenities. A restaurant is proposed for the 38th floor of the north tower.

Mixed-use buildings are permitted in the MCR zoning and the *Mixed Use* designations and the *Avenues* overlay for the site. However this application:

- proposes to greatly exceed the maximum height and density permitted by By-law 438-86 which is 16 metres and 3.0 times the lot area respectively. The proposed density is approximately 3.5 times that of the largest existing or approved building in the 6 blocks on the east side of Yonge Street south of the UGC to Davisville Avenue. The proposed height is more than 13 times taller than the approximately 2 to 3-storey buildings in the *Neighbourhoods* area immediately east of the site (refer to the Height, Density, Massing section of this report for a table indicating actual heights and densities in the area);
- proposes to construct a large number of residential units (693) which, if permitted, would provide insufficient transition in intensity and scale to the *Neighbourhoods* area of much lower development intensity to the east.
 - Official Plan policy 4.5.2(c) requires new development to provide appropriate transition between areas of different development intensity and scale. Development "intensity" refers to the number of units, residents, visitors, cars and all other aspects of urban life that will be intensified or introduced into an area if large developments such as this are approved. In other words, it is the intensity of the use of the land. The scale of the development refers to the built form.
 - The proposed 693 new units bring a high intensity of use to a *Mixed Use Area* without transition to an abutting a low density residential neighbourhood. The proposed built form of a 38 and a 29 storey tower does not transition to the existing scale of 2-storey detached houses immediately east of the site; and
- fails to be massed and designed to fit harmoniously into its existing and/or planned context and limit its impact on neighbouring streets, parks, open spaces and properties. The site is outside of the Yonge-Eglinton UGC. Its existing context is comprised of primarily 2 to 3 storey mixed use buildings in a residential neighbourhood. Its planned context in Provincial and City policies is reflected in recently approved developments at 1955-1985 Yonge Street and 2008 Yonge Street which are 5.1 and 5.7 times their respective lot areas.

The preambles or non-policy text and sidebars of the Official Plan are intended to clarify the policies of the Plan.

The preamble to Section 2.2.3, Avenues: Re-urbanizing Arterial Corridors, of the Official Plan indicates that re-urbanization land use proposals are anticipated and encouraged on the Avenues but such development is to be subject to the neighbourhood protection and other policies of the Plan. The Avenues preamble qualifies that statement by indicating that, "development along the Avenues will generally be at a much lower scale than in the Downtown and, most often at a lower scale than in the Centres." This site is a case where a much lower scale is appropriate as it is outside of the UGC and abuts a low scale residential neighbourhood.

The preamble to Section 3.1.2, Built Form, states that, "developments must be conceived not only in terms of the individual building site and program but also in terms of how that site, building and its facades fit within the existing and/or planned context of the neighbourhood and the City." The site, if viewed in isolation, is large enough to physically accommodate a two tower form of development but its context of a low to mid-rise mixed use area and a low density residential neighbourhood is unsuitable for the proposed towers.

One of the underlying principles of the Official Plan is the need to protect the stability of the low density residential neighbourhoods. This principle is central to the former and current City of Toronto Official Plans. The transition policies of *Mixed Use* Section 4.5.2(c) of the 'in effect' Official Plan are intended to ensure that a gradual buffer is maintained between high density, intense forms of development (such as the proposed 38 and 29-storey towers) and the City's low density residential neighbourhoods. The 60 degree angular plane required in By-law 438-86 addresses transition from higher forms of development to stable residential neighbourhoods.

The preamble to Section 3.1.3, Built Form-Tall Buildings indicates that "tall buildings are desirable in the right places but they don't belong everywhere. When poorly located and designed, tall buildings can physically and visually overwhelm adjacent streets, parks and neighbourhoods." The Tall Buildings Design Guidelines, which are discussed in later sections of this report, set out the principles of site organization and tall building design and location for sites that are appropriate for tall buildings in accordance with Official Plan policies.

Density, Height, Massing

Section 3.1.2.3 (Built Form) of the Official Plan states that new development will be massed and its exterior façade designed to fit harmoniously into its existing and/or planned context and limit its impact on neighbouring streets, parks, open spaces and properties.

At 9.0 times its lot area and at a height of approximately 124 metres to the top of its 38-storey tower, the proposed development relates to the context of the Minto towers which are north of the site within the Mixed Use Area 'A' of the Urban Growth Centre and which back onto an *Apartment Neighbourhood*. However, the proposal fails to relate to or fit within its existing and planned context of 1 to 2-storey houses in the *Neighbourhood* to the east and 2 to 10-storey mixed use buildings to the south in the *Mixed Use Area* on Yonge Street.

Section 5.2 of the Yonge-Eglinton Secondary Plan states that within this Centre, the highest height and density and scale of development will be within Mixed Use Area 'A' on the blocks within the four quadrants at the intersection of Yonge Street and Eglinton Avenue. The subject site is neither located within those blocks nor within the Yonge-Eglinton Urban Growth Centre. The following table indicates the density and height of the proposed development compared with representative examples of buildings recently approved, under construction or occupied which are in proximity to the site. All of these developments are within the Yonge Street *Avenue* and *Mixed Use Area* and back onto *Neighbourhoods* (not *Apartment Neighbourhoods*) designations as does the subject site.

Address	Status of Development	Height	Density (f.s.i.)	Official Plan Designation
2131 Yonge St, & 32 Hillsdale Ave. East (subject site)	-2 towers -rezoning application -appealed to OMB	-38 & 29 storeys -124 metres & 99 metres	9.0x (note: includes the Hillsdale Parkette – lands proposed to be dedicated to the City)	Mixed Use
2112 – 2114 Yonge St.	-mid-rise -rezoning application -ongoing	-9 storeys -28 metres	7.69x	Mixed Use
1955 – 1985 Yonge St., 3 Belsize Dr. & 18-22 Millwood Rd.	-mid-rise -rezoning approved -site plan approval pending	-9 storeys -32 metres	5.1x	Mixed Use & Neighbourhoods (3 Belsize)
2008 Yonge St.	-mid-rise -rezoning approved -under construction	-10 storeys -36 metres	5.7x	Mixed Use

The above table includes all mixed use rezoning applications submitted within approximately the past 10 years on both sides of Yonge Street between Eglinton Avenue and the south boundary of the Davisville *Apartment Neighbourhoods* designation.

All buildings within this representative study area are of a mid-rise building form and are far lower in height than the proposed 38 and 29-storey towers.

All of the representative buildings are also lower in density than the proposed building. It is noted that the calculation of the density of the proposed building would be higher if the public park was excluded from the site area. The park is adjacent to the redevelopment portion of the site and is owned and leased to the City by the applicant. Given that the applicant proposes to convey the Hillsdale Parkette to the City to partially satisfy its parkland dedication requirements, these lands should not be used to calculate density nor as part of the building's setback to the east lot line.

Sun, Shadow, Wind

Sections 3.1.2.3(e) and 4.5.2(d) of the Official Plan require that: development in *Mixed Use Areas* will locate and mass new buildings so as to adequately limit shadow impacts on adjacent *Neighbourhoods*, particularly during the spring and fall equinoxes; and that new buildings will be located and massed to fit harmoniously into their existing and/or planned context and maintain sunlight and comfortable wind conditions for pedestrians on adjacent streets, parks and open spaces.

The site is located at the southeast corner of Yonge Street and Soudan Avenue. It is across Soudan Avenue from existing taller buildings in the *Mixed Use Areas* and *Apartment Neighbourhoods* (both within the Urban Growth Centre) at the northwest and northeast corners of Yonge Street and Soudan Avenue. There are no tall buildings to the immediate west of the site (the southwest corner of Yonge Street and Berwick Avenue). The site abuts a large *Neighbourhoods* area to the east which is subject to the *Neighbourhoods* protection policies of the Official Plan.

A review of the shadow study submitted by the applicant shows no shadows cast onto the *Neighbourhoods* area to the east of the site from surrounding existing buildings until late afternoon on September 21^{st} and to a lesser degree on June 21^{st} . All shadow on the *Neighbourhoods* area to occur earlier on these dates would be new shadow from the proposed towers.

The proposed twin towers start to shadow the *Neighbourhoods* to the east after 1:18 p.m. on September 21st. The shadows extend significantly deeper into the *Neighbourhoods* area than the as-of-right shadow shown in the applicant's shadow study, particularly during the late afternoon on the fall equinox (September 21st) and to a lesser degree on June 21st. By 6:18 p.m. on September 21st, the north tower shadow extends beyond Mt Pleasant Road. Late afternoon is the time of day that back yards in the *Neighbourhoods* area are most commonly used as outdoor living space.

In addition, shadow impacts on the *Neighbourhoods* area are intensified by the proposed dualtower scheme. Shadow from the southerly tower is the first to sweep the *Neighbourhoods* area and then is followed by the shadow cast by the north tower. The proposed twin towers on the site do not adequately limit the shadow impacts on adjacent Neighbourhoods. The proposed development does not comply with the sun and shadow policies of the Official Plan.

Traffic Impact, Access, Parking

The applicant's transportation consultant submitted a Traffic, Parking and Loading Study dated December 2012. In that study, the consultant concluded that the proposed development with 693 residential units and 7,163 m2 of retail floor area would have no noticeable traffic impact on the local road network. The consultant's conclusion assumed that Soudan Avenue would be widened on the south side to implement a dedicated westbound left turn lane.

Engineering and Construction Services has identified the need for additional information and analysis with respect to the applicant's proposed Traffic Impact Assessment. Issues that are required to be addressed include (but are not limited to) existing traffic volumes, background developments and analysis periods.

Transportation Planning has requested a broader range of traffic evaluation which includes other developments which are proposed, approved or under construction in the area. Consequently Transportation Planning has requested further information with respect to trips generated by the proposed grocery store use on the second floor.

With respect to parking, a total of 500 parking spaces are proposed for the development. Of those spaces: 383 would be for the residents of the building; 42 for their visitors; 72 for commercial parking; and 3 car-share spaces.

While Engineering and Construction Services has determined that the proposed number of parking spaces is insufficient, it is unable to establish the exact parking requirements for the proposed development since the site statistics do not provide sufficient detail with respect to the number of bachelor units and the gross floor areas of individual non-residential uses. Engineering and Construction Services also requires additional information with respect to the ability of loading vehicles to be able to enter and exit the site in a forward motion.

The applicants are aware of these information requirements with respect to traffic, access and parking.

Open Space/Parkland, Community Services and Facilities

The Official Plan contains policies to ensure that Toronto's system of parks and open spaces are maintained, enhanced and expanded. Map 8B to the Toronto Official Plan shows local parkland provisions across the City. The site is in an area with 0 to 0.42 hectares of local parkland per 1,000 people, the lowest quintile of current provision of parkland. This is a parkland priority area per the City Wide Parkland Dedication By-law 1020-2010.

The application proposes 693 residential units and 7,163m2 of non residential uses on a site with a net area of 6,255m2. At the alternative rate of 0.4 hectares per 300 units specified in By-law 1020-2010, the parkland dedication requirement is 0.924 hectares or 169.2% of the site area. However, for sites that are less than 1 hectare in size, a cap of 10% is applied to the residential use while the non-residential use is subject to a 2% parkland dedication. In total, the parkland dedication requirement is 562m2.

The applicant is proposing to convey the existing leased parkette to the City to satisfy a portion of their required parkland dedication. The parkette is located on the north side of Hillsdale Avenue on the east portion of the development site and has an area of 464.4m2. The 97.6m2 balance of the parkland dedication requirement is to be provided as a cash-in-lieu payment. The actual amount of cash-in-lieu to be paid would be determined at the time of issuance of the building permit.

The proposed parkland dedication would secure the existing leased parkette as a permanent public park. The proposed conveyance is acceptable to Parks, Forestry and Recreation.

If this application is approved the following conditions of approval are recommended by Parks, Forestry and Recreation:

Parkland Dedication

- 1. The Owner will be required to convey the lands currently being leased to the City as a parkette (464.4m2 portion of the development site located on the north side of Hillsdale Avenue) to the City as a permanent park. The land to be conveyed as parkland shall be free and clear, above and below grade, of all physical obstructions and easements, encumbrances and encroachments, including surface and subsurface easements, unless otherwise approved by the General Manager, Parks, Forestry & Recreation.
- 2. The 97.6m2 shortfall in the parkland dedication requirement is to be satisfied as a cashin-lieu payment.
- 3. The Owner is required to convey the parkland to the City prior to the issuance of the first above grade building permit for the development.
- 4. Prior to conveyance of the parkland, the Owner agrees to pay for the costs of the Parkland dedication and the preparation and registration of all relevant documents. The Owner shall provide, to the satisfaction of the City Solicitor, all legal descriptions and applicable reference plans for the Parkland dedication.

Environmental Site Assessment

5. Prior to conveyance of the parkland, the Owner shall be responsible for an environmental site assessment of the Parkland and any associated costs or remediation works required as a result of that assessment. Such assessment or remediation shall ensure that the Parkland will meet all applicable laws, regulations and guidelines respecting sites to be used for public park purposes, including City Council policies respecting soil remediation of sites. A qualified environmental consultant acceptable to the Engineering and Construction Services shall prepare the environmental site assessment. Prior to transferring the Parkland to the City, the environmental site assessment shall be peer reviewed by an environmental consultant retained by the City at the Owner's expense (the "Peer Reviewer"), and the transfer of the Parkland shall be conditional upon the Peer

Reviewer concurring with the Owner's environmental consultant that the Parkland meets all applicable laws, regulations and guidelines for public park purposes.

Base Park Improvements

- 1. Prior to conveyance of the parkland, the Owner at its expense, will be responsible for base park construction and installation of the Parkland. The base park improvements may include the following:
 - (i). fencing (where deemed necessary) to the satisfaction of Parks, Forestry and Recreation;
 - (ii). all necessary drainage systems including connections to the municipal services as required; and
 - (iii). water connection, minimum 50mm and backflow shutoff valve and water meter to the street line.

All work is to be completed to the satisfaction of the General Manager of Parks, Forestry and Recreation.

- 1. In the event the Owner cannot complete the base park improvements prior to conveyance of the parkland the Owner shall submit a financial guarantee in the form of an irrevocable letter of credit, made payable to the Treasurer of the City of Toronto, in an amount equal to 120% of the value of the cost of the base park improvements. Such amount is to be to the satisfaction of the General Manager of Parks, Forestry and Recreation.
- 2. At the time the base park improvements have been completed, the Owner will provide certification from their landscape architect certifying all work has been completed. At that time, the submitted letter of credit for park improvements will be released subject to the satisfaction of the General Manager of Parks, Forestry and Recreation, less 20% of the total value which will be retained for a two year period as a performance guarantee.

No credit against development charges is available for Base Park Improvements

3. The Owner acknowledges that they shall not be entitled to any development charge credit for their costs to design and construct the base park improvements.

Limiting Distance

4. The Owner may be required to enter into a Limiting Distance Agreement with the City in order to comply with the requirements of the Ontario Building Code. Prior to the issuance of any above grade building permits, the owner will be required to provide information to the appropriate staff in Parks, Forestry and Recreation as to whether or not they are subject to a Limiting Distance Agreement. If they require entering into a Limiting Distance Agreement, the City may require compensation for the affected area.

The applicant has provided an inventory of community services and facilities which serve the area surrounding the site bounded by Yonge Street, Mt Pleasant Rd., Keewatin Avenue and Merton Street. Staff reviewed the applicant's inventory and, if this application or a modified scheme is approved by the OMB, will recommend that Section 37 funds be secured for the provision of community services or facilities that are lacking in the area.

City-Wide Tall Building Design Guidelines

In May 2013, Toronto City Council adopted the updated city-wide Tall Building Design Guidelines and directed City Planning staff to use these Guidelines in the evaluation of all new and current tall building development applications. The guidelines establish a unified set of performance measures for the evaluation of tall building proposals to ensure that they fit within their context and minimize their local impacts as required by the Official Plan. The citywide Guidelines are available at <u>http://www.toronto.ca/planning/tallbuildingdesign.htm</u>

Policy 1 in Section 5.3.2, Implementation Plans and Strategies for City-Building, the Official Plan states that Guidelines will be adopted to advance the vision, objectives, and policies of the Plan. Urban Design guidelines are specifically intended "to provide a more detailed framework for built form and public improvements in growth areas." The Tall Building Design Guidelines serve this policy intent, helping to implement Chapter 3.1, "The Built Environment" and other policies within the Plan related to the design and development of tall buildings in Toronto.

The intent of the Guidelines has not been met with this application. Particularly, but not exclusively, with respect to the following:

1. Fit and Transition in Scale

Section 1.3 of the Tall Buildings Design Guidelines, Fit and Transition in Scale, is intended to ensure that tall buildings fit within the existing or planned context and provide an appropriate transition in scale down to lower-scaled buildings, parks and open space. The Guidelines explain that this may be achieved through application of: angular planes; horizontal separation distances and other building envelope controls such as stepping down of heights and building setbacks.

Guideline 1.3(c) requires that the proposed development, "promote fit and transition in scale between tall buildings and lower-scaled buildings, parks and open spaces on the block or across the street by: accommodating all aspects of fit and transition within the tall building development site; including base buildings that relate directly to the height and typology of the existing or planned streetwall context; and, on larger sites, providing lower scale buildings or open space to achieve horizontal separation distance."

The proposed 38-storey, north tower is approximately 12 metres from the side yard property line of the first house to the east of the site and does not provide appropriate transition down to the lower-scaled buildings of the Neighbourhoods area to the east. The building base is also out of context and is discussed below.

Guideline 1.3(d) clarifies that, "appropriate fit and transition in scale may mean that not all sites are suitable for tall buildings, or that the existing or approved massing and scale of a tall building on one site can be applied or used as a reference point for redeveloping a neighbouring site."

In other words, an existing tall building is not a precedent for approval of another tall building proposed on a nearby site. The full context of the proposed redevelopment site must be acknowledged and the proposal must comply with all other applicable Official Plan policies and Design Guidelines.

In this case, tall buildings are located in proximity to the site to its northwest and northeast. However, the presence of existing 2-storey houses of the *Neighbourhoods* area abutting the site to the east requires that the *Neighbourhoods* areas protection policies and guidelines of the Official Plan and the Tall Building Design Guidelines apply.

2. Base Building Scale and Height

The proposed building base is 6 storeys in height. The Tall Building Design Guidelines require that for such sites where the adjacent base building context is lower scale and not anticipated to change, the proposed building base should provide a transition in height down to its lower scale neighbours which are 2-storey houses to the east and 2 to 3-storey mixed use buildings on both sides of Yonge Street. The proposed building should match at least a portion of its base with the low scale and height of the adjacent buildings.

3. Tower Floorplates

The Design Guidelines recommend tall and slender towers (for tall building sites) which: lessen shadow impact on the neighbourhood; allow sunlight penetration and City views to the proposed development and to the adjacent existing buildings; and allow sky views from the proposed development and from existing adjacent buildings. A maximum tower floorplate size of 750 m2 is recommended to achieve these objectives.

The north tower is 836 m2 (floors 7 - 12) and 725 m2 (floors 13 - 35). The south tower is 869 m2 (floors 7 - 12) and 717 m2 (floors 13 - 29). The portion of both buildings which most impacts the pedestrian realm (floors 7 - 12) is significantly above the maximum floorplate area. As discussed in the Sun, Shadow, Wind section of this report, the size of these tower floorplates, their building heights and their proximity to one another will cause the towers to cast two separate shadows over the *Neighbourhoods* area to the east in relatively quick succession.

Servicing

The applicant has provided a functional servicing report (FSR). Engineering and Construction Services identified the need for revisions and additional information with respect to the servicing of the site.

Toronto Green Standard

On October 27, 2009 City Council adopted the two-tiered Toronto Green Standard (TGS). The TGS is a set of performance measures for green development. Tier 1 is required for new development. Tier 2 is a voluntary, higher level of performance with financial incentives. Achieving the Toronto Green Standard will improve air and water quality, reduce greenhouse

gas emissions and enhance the natural environment.

Should a proposed development be approved by the Ontario Municipal Board, the applicant would be required to meet Tier 1 of the TGS.

Section 37

Section 37 of the Planning Act allows the City to enter into an agreement with an applicant to grant an increase in height and/or density (over and above that which is permitted by the Zoning By-law) in return for certain community benefits to be provided for by the applicant. Details of a Section 37 Agreement between the applicant and the City would be established if the project is approved by the Ontario Municipal Board (OMB).

However, since this application in its present form is not considered good planning and has not been recommended for approval, no discussions about the quantum of the community benefits have taken place with the applicant. In the event that this application is brought before the OMB and the OMB grants additional density and/or height beyond that which is permitted in Zoning By-law 438-86, the City will request that the OMB withhold its final order until the City has an agreement with the applicant to secure the appropriate community benefits. Such benefits could include contributions (as deemed appropriate by City Council) for:

- 1. neighbourhood improvements to the Yonge-Eglinton area as recommended by the Parks and Open Space and Streetscape Master Plan which is currently under study through the Midtown in Focus initiative;
- 2. the acquisition, design and construction of the new park which is to be developed south of the TTC bus barns at Yonge Street and Eglinton Avenue West; and
- 3. local community services and facilities.

Tenure

All proposed residential units are to be condominium.

Conclusion

This application is not consistent with the Provincial Policy Statement, does not conform to the Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe and is not consistent with the Official Plan.

The proposed development fails to comply with the planned context. It proposes a larger scale, high density form of development which is unanticipated beyond the boundary of the Yonge-Eglinton Urban Growth Centre in an area where mid-rise scale, less intense development is appropriate.

The consideration of changes to the planned context in order to allow such major development outside of the Yonge-Eglinton Urban Growth Centre should be part of a comprehensive review, not by individual applications on an ad hoc basis.

The proposed massing and tower heights do not fit the existing and planned context and are not appropriate redevelopment of the site. The proposed intensity of use, density and scale (e.g. tower height, base building height and tower floorplates) result in a built form that fails to provide transition to the low scale residential neighbourhood immediately east of the site.

CONTACT

Tim Burkholder, Senior PlannerTel. No.(416) 392-0412Fax No.(416) 392-1330E-mail:tburk@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Gregg Lintern, MCIP, RPP Director, Community Planning Toronto and East York District

(p:\2013\Cluster B\pln\teycc\25702842045) - vc

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1: Site Plan Attachment 2: North and East Elevations Attachment 3: South and West Elevations Attachment 4: Roof Plan Attachment 5: Official Plan Attachment 6: Yonge-Eglinton Secondary Plan Attachment 7: Zoning Attachment 8: Application Data Sheet Attachment 1: Site Plan





Attachment 2: North and East Elevations



Attachment 3: South and West Elevations

Not to Scale 03/01/2013

File # 13_105888

Attachment 4: Roof Plan





Attachment 5: Official Plan



Attachment 6: Yonge-Eglinton Secondary Plan





Application Type	Official P Rezoning	lan Amendment &	& Application Nu		mber: 13 105		88 STE 22 OZ		
Details	OPA & Rezoning, Standard		Application Date:		e:	January 15, 2013			
Municipal Address:	2131 YONGE ST & 32 HOLLY ST EAST								
Location Description:	PLAN 800 LOTS 1 TO 4 PT LOT 5 AND PLAN 866 LOTS 6 TO 10 AND 12 PT LOTS 14 AND 16 **GRID S2204								
Project Description:	Proposed new mixed use commercial residential building approximately 56, 418.00 square metres. The proposal contemplates a base consisting of primarily retail commercial uses and a food store. Residential units are proposed with a top floor restaurant in the north tower.								
Applicant:	Agent:	Agent:		Architect:			Owner:		
2292446 ONTARIO LIMITED	McCarthy	McCarthy Tetrault		architectsAlliance			2292446 ONTARIO LIMITED		
PLANNING CONTROLS									
Official Plan Designation:	Mixed Us	Mixed Use Areas		Site Specific Provision:					
Zoning: MC		MCR T3.0 C2.0 R2.5		Historical Status:					
Height Limit (m):		Site Plan Control Area:							
PROJECT INFORMATION	[
Site Area (sq. m):		6255.2	Height:	Storeys:	3	38			
Frontage (m):	86.4			Metres:		123.82			
Depth (m):		73.3							
Total Ground Floor Area (sq. 1	m): 2937					Tota	al		
Total Residential GFA (sq. m)	49255			Parking Spaces:		500			
Total Non-Residential GFA (s	q. m): 7163			Loading Docks		5			
Total GFA (sq. m):	56418								
Lot Coverage Ratio (%):		47							
Floor Space Index:		9							
DWELLING UNITS FLOOR AREA BREAKDOWN (upon project completion)									
Tenure Type: Condo					Above Grade		Below Grade		
Rooms: 0		Residential GFA (sq. m):			49255		0		
Bachelor:	53	53 Retail GFA (se		sq. m):			0		
1 Bedroom:	470 Office GFA ((sq. m):		0		0		
2 Bedroom:	170 Industrial GF		FA (sq. m):		0		0		
3 + Bedroom:	0 Institutional/Other GFA (sq.			q. m):	0		0		
Total Units:	693								

Tim Burkholder, Senior Planner

(416) 392-0412

Attachment 8: Application Data Sheet

PLANNER NAME:

TELEPHONE:

CONTACT: