

Annex Residents' Association

April 14, 2014

Janette Gerrard 2nd floor, West Tower, City Hall 100 Queen Street West Toronto, ON M5H 2N2 email: jgerrar@toronto.ca

phone: 416-338-5848 fax: 416-397-0111

Dear Ms. Gerrard:

Re: 50 Boswell Avenue, Agenda Item PB Board Mtg April 16, 201430.1 Preservation

On behalf of the Annex Residents Association, I met with Guy Zimmerman from Heritage Preservation Services, consulted with Andrew Pruss the architect from ERA, and met with the home owner, Victoria Foley.

We wish to support the proposal of the owner and architect for the following reasons:

- 1. The house was listed as non-contributing in the Heritage Conservation District Study for the East Annex Heritage Conservation District because it was not in its original state in 1991, and there appear to be no images of what the house originally looked like. Only its date in the 1910-1920 period would indicate that it likely was Edwardian or slightly later in style:
- 2. Boswell is described as eclectic in its architecture in the HCD report, and that surely is the case, and possibly more so now than even in 1991 when the report was prepared, so it is difficult to understand what would be historically consistent;
- 3. Given the current appearance of the house, the proposal of ERA Architects would rationalize the appearance of the house, by both being referential albeit not imitative to the architectural period in which it was built and to the neighbouring buildings. The building immediately to the east, which is one of the remaining mainly historically intact heritage structures, is from a much earlier period. The scale of the proposed designed for 50 Boswell does not overwhelm the building to the east.

In reference to our first point, the images on the next page show examples of the boxy Edwardian-style houses in the Annex, which could serve as a reference. They are: top row left 143 Madison (late 1923 to 1939) and right 152 Madison (1910) and bottom row left 138 Madison (1903) and right 195 Madison (1907).

Unfortunately, few houses in the Annex still have their original window glass. Multi-pane windows were historically common for the period and so the ERA proposal takes the window style back to one that is more accurate. Please also note that none of the houses illustrated below show the disproportionately large porch style of 50 Boswell. While the porch at 50 Boswell may have existed in 1991, we question if it were part of the original architecture because it is stylistically inconsistent with the Edwardian architecture of the Annex. Houses of an earlier era do have porches of similar style. What is definitely inconsistent with common features of houses in the Annex is a mid-block, fully detached house with the main entrance to the side as is now the

case with 50 Boswell. While the existing front door may be authentic, it no longer makes sense visually.









With regards to the second and third points, the photos that follow show neighbouring structures and those on the same short block (Boswell is only one block in length). The extended windows proposed for 50 Boswell are not consistent with Edwardian architecture, but are consistent with other houses on the street.

The photo to the left shows 50 Boswell in its current form with the neighbouring house to the west and the photo on the right shows the houses across the street.





The following photos show other buildings on the street. The photo to the left shows a modernized apartment building and the one to the right shows a classic Yorkville-style house (far left) next to modern houses.





And here is the proposal for 50 Boswell, which we feel relates to other non-contributing and contributing buildings on the street.



While we respect the recommendations of Heritage Preservation Services staff and their efforts to preserve our heritage neighbourhood, which is under intense development pressures, we respectively disagree this time with their decision to disallow the design changes recommended for 50 Boswell Avenue.

Yours sincerely,

Sandra Shaul, Chair, Heritage Committee Annex Residents Association 6 Kendal Av Toronto, ON M5R 1L6 416-923-5809 sandra.shaul@sympatico.ca