



STAFF REPORT ACTION REQUIRED

World Cities Culture Forum

Date:	February 4, 2014
To:	Economic Development Committee
From:	General Manager Economic Development and Culture
Wards:	All
Reference Number:	

SUMMARY

The World Cities Culture Forum is an initiative of the Mayor of London, Boris Johnson. It was founded in 2012 by London, New York, Shanghai, Paris, Tokyo, Sydney, Johannesburg and Istanbul. It now includes 21 member cities from around the world with new members including Amsterdam, Berlin, Bogotá, Buenos Aires, Hong Kong, Los Angeles, Montreal, Mumbai, Rio de Janeiro, São Paulo, Seoul, Singapore and Toronto. The World Cities Culture Report 2013 (WCCR) examines the cultural offer of 21 of the world's greatest cities. The WCCR gathered evidence on 60 cultural indicators, assessing both the supply of and demand for culture and reported on the thinking of cultural policymakers in those cities. The level of detail of the cultural data collected across the cities is unprecedented and represents an achievement in this field of research.

In November 2013, senior policymakers from the partner cities met in Istanbul for the three-day World Cities Culture Summit hosted by the Istanbul Provincial Directorate of the Turkish Ministry of Culture and Tourism. By bringing together their cultural expertise and knowledge, the participating cities have created a new unique research and policy forum to address the role that culture plays in their cities and to strengthen their policy response to the challenges they face.

Based on the collective knowledge and latest evidence assembled at the Istanbul summit it was agreed that economic globalization, unchecked property development and fiscal austerity could threaten the cultural ecosystem of great cities. However, the conclusion of World Cities Culture Summit 2013 was that none of this is inevitable - that world cities can flourish in the 21st century if city leaders have the confidence, imagination and strength of will to make it happen.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The General Manager of Economic Development and Culture recommends that:

1. The City of Toronto continue to participate in the World Cities Culture Forum
2. The City of Toronto employ the knowledge and the latest evidence assembled by the World Cities Culture Forum when designing future cultural policies and projects.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

The 2014 financial impact of continued participation in the World Cities Culture Forum including the research program, new publications and participation in the annual summit is approximately \$10,000.00 to be funded through the approved 2014 Cultural Services Operating Budget.

The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

ISSUE BACKGROUND

The World Cities Culture Forum serves both as a platform for cooperation between world cities and as a source of information and experience for those who are able to contribute and learn more about the critical role that culture can play in urban development. It was founded in 2012 by London, New York, Shanghai, Paris, Tokyo, Sydney, Johannesburg and Istanbul. The Forum builds on the World Cities Culture Report initiative established by the Mayor of London as a legacy project of the 2012 London Olympic Games.

The London Cultural Strategy Group, an official body of London City Hall and the Greater London Authority whose members are appointed by the Mayor to develop strategic policy in the capital city in regard to culture, media, sport, arts, heritage and tourism, generously supported the 2012 and 2013 project. BOP Consulting were the project consultants who co-ordinated and produced the World Cities Culture Report 2013 and the policy briefing as follow up. BOP Consulting also facilitated the World Cities Culture Summit in November 2013.

Toronto city staff were involved in the initial briefing and planning of the research; collaborated with the consultant in the contextual and qualitative data collection; drafted the City of Toronto's portrait as well liaised closely with the consultants on the analysis before the reporting out of the World Cities Culture Report 2013. City staff also made a presentation highlighting the City of Toronto as a creative capital at the three-day summit (with C.E.O. Tim Jones from Artscape).

COMMENTS

Background on Toronto as a Creative Capital

It is now a given for most Torontonians that we live in a city whose cultural vitality not only enhances our neighbourhoods and quality of life but where that vitality is a fundamental part of our economic success. That understanding and the sheer breadth of the cultural scene in all its vitality and diversity wasn't always there but is a result of three decades of cultural advocacy in Toronto.

In the early 1980's, Toronto was really only beginning to emerge from its days as a 'provincial backwater'. But the idea of Toronto as the creative capital it is now was hard for most people to conjure. In 1982 the Toronto Arts Council's grant budget was under \$300,000.00 and that was distributed to approximately a hundred groups. There was also funding directly from the City to the two theatres that operated in the city-owned St. Lawrence Centre. Together with the TAC grant money the total funding towards arts and culture in Toronto did not amount to a million dollars.

Toronto's cultural landscape significantly changed over the years through the hard work of arts activists, political will, and the quantification of the data that showed that the arts were a major contributor to the city's economy and employment. City staff reports such as *The Creative City – A Workprint (2001)*, *Culture Plan for the Creative City (2004)* and *Creative Capital Gains – An Action Plan for Toronto (2011)* set out to enhance Toronto's place as an international cultural centre and to increase the role of culture in the economic and social development of the city. To achieve this, City Council set the goal to raise our per capita investment in culture to \$25 per capita. Significant progress has been made towards this goal in 2013 and 2014 and Council has approved a phase-in plan that reaches the target by 2017.

World Cities Culture Report

The World Cities Culture Report 2013 is the first time that the City of Toronto has been involved and the first time that the richness of the data has been brought together with such an in-depth policy analysis. What the data shows is that culture is essential to a thriving world city. It is hoped that the WCCR will help to point toward ways of making policy and strategy in this area more effective and robust.

<https://www.london.gov.uk/sites/default/files/WCCR2013.pdf>

The report includes portraits of the participating cities and Toronto is described as

"...a rising power on the world's cultural stage. Its museums, theatres and above all its film festival have become important venues on their art-form's global circuits. The city has pursued an ambitious programme to upgrade its cultural infrastructure, reflecting its growing confidence in its cultural strengths. Toronto

is a hugely diverse city: for example, almost half its population is foreign-born. Ensuring that this diversity is reflected in both the production and consumption of culture has become an important goal of cultural policy in the city."

Refer to Attachment No 1 for the complete City of Toronto portrait within the World Cities Culture Report.

The WCCR notes that culture is multi-dimensional and multi-layered and that no serious analysis can reduce a city's culture to a single overall 'score' or ranking. Comparing cities' culture is valuable as it helps us understand more about their similarities and differences, relative strengths and our perceptions of culture's role in urban life. To be meaningful, it is necessary to look at a wide variety of data to get a sense of the broad range of cultural activity. Examining 60 measures, the World Cities Culture Report 2013 includes both formal culture, which is defined as activity taking place in permanent 'cultural' venues such as museums, theatres and galleries, and informal culture, which takes place in other venues such as pubs, restaurants and outdoor festivals. The report reviewed data on production, consumption and cultural infrastructure.

The report focused on 21 world cities that are also commonly regarded as leaders in culture. The report is not suggesting that these are necessarily the world's 21 most culturally important cities. Nor is it a ranking. The purpose is not to say which cities are currently 'top', even less is to prescribe what world cities should do in terms of culture. Instead, it is to try and understand the role that culture plays within a successful world city.

The data comparing Toronto to the other participating cities does however tell us is that while many of the cities in the study are strikingly diverse, Toronto leads the way with 49% of its population being foreign-born followed by New York City at 37%. Furthermore, a review of the 60 indicators in the World Cities Culture Report 2013 shows that per capita Toronto is well-served for cinema screens with the most number of cinema screens per million population. As far as film festivals being an indicator of the role film plays in a city's culture, Toronto scores extremely well with many film festivals and the Toronto International Film Festival (TIFF) regarded as one of the most prestigious film festivals by the global film industry. Also, on a per capita basis, Toronto has the highest number of book loans from public libraries compared to the other cities in the World Cities Culture Report.

There were many lessons learned from reviewing the World Cities Culture Report and participating in the Summit. For example:

- Amsterdam plans to maximize the economic impact of culture and creative industries. One of the main objectives the city has set itself for 2020 is to make Amsterdam home to the fastest-growing creative sector in Europe. The Amsterdam Economic Board, which is a partnership between government, industry and academia, released a Knowledge and Innovation agenda in 2011,

designed to significantly improve the regional economy. The Board also supports top-quality education at the professional level to further the growth of the creative sector including the CreativeCampus, a virtual and physical campus for applied and basic scientific research in the creative industries.

- Bogotá's creativity is applied to address its urban issues such as congestion and the environment. For almost forty years, the big avenues of the city have been closed to car traffic on Sundays and official holidays and converted into 'Cicovía', a 121 km temporary bicycle lane enjoyed by one million of the city's inhabitants. This, together with other initiatives such as ecological housing, an innovative metro-like bus system Transmilenio and other progressive urban interventions, shows the city's increasingly environmental awareness and creative edge.
- Culture in Buenos Aires is a key resource for economic and social development with long standing neighbourhood cultural programmes engaging audiences of all ages and backgrounds across the city by providing free access to cultural services. The value of culture for tourism has long been recognized by local authorities and private agencies looking to attract national and international visitors. The Tango Festival in Buenos Aires is the most popular festival in the city with 600,000 people attending each year. In 2009 UNESCO officially designated tango as part of the intangible cultural heritage of humanity. Buenos Aires has been rewarded with the title of UNESCO City of Design, through public-private collaboration, the city of Buenos Aires has been able to harness the energy and innovation of its design sector for development initiatives on a local, regional and international level.
- Hong Kong ranks as one of the great urban success stories of the 20th century and the government spends US \$387 M a year on culture (excluding capital projects), running libraries, museums and performance venues as well as supporting festivals and arts development. The Academy for Performing Arts, the only tertiary institution in Hong Kong specialising in the performing arts, has been established since 1984 and support continues for graduate and post-graduate programmes in the arts at more generalist universities. There is also a new programme being implemented to train arts administrators and museum curators which will cost the Hong Kong government US \$19.3 M over the next five years.
- And while Los Angeles is believed to have the largest number of working artists of any American metropolitan region, it lacks the kind of artist-centred policies around training, career planning, marketing and space provision that many other American cities have adapted. L.A. is in the process of addressing this issue.
- In Istanbul, one of the simplest ideas presented was by the sage museum director of Sakip Sabanci Müzesi, where an Anish Kapoor exhibition is currently showcased. She described "Taxi Days" whereby Istanbul's 22,000 taxi drivers are invited on a designated weekend to visit the museum free of charge thereby allowing these individuals and their families to enjoy and become familiar with the location/institution and subsequently inform and direct tourists.

- The culture of Johannesburg has been profoundly shaped by years of apartheid. How to deal with what has been handed down from that time remains the single greatest challenge to the city's cultural policymakers and is largely driven by an agenda that sees its key output being its capacity to impact favourably on social cohesion; the reduction of poverty and the rapid transformation of the apartheid City legacy.
- London is a city that combines a sense of history with cutting-edge creativity and a dynamic pop culture. During 2012, as with all Olympic host cities, London experienced tourism displacement which had an adverse affect on visitor numbers to the city's cultural institutions. However, London's global image improved as a direct result of hosting the 2012 Games and the Cultural Olympiad. Informal street culture continues to be a major source of strength. The last decade has seen a growth in festivals, carnivals and fairs. Other strengths of London include the high quality of design, art and fashion schools: the London Design Festival celebrated its tenth anniversary in 2012 and the model has been copied elsewhere.
- Seoul has adaptively reused city-owned industrial heritage properties with great success – such as, the repurposing of the old Seoul Railway Station into a major cultural space; the Defence Security Command Centre has been reopened as a branch of the National Museum of Modern and Contemporary Art; the city's old water intake and pumping station is now being transformed into the Street Arts Centre and a number of dilapidated industrial plants have been recast as Seoul Art Spaces.
- There is a willingness to blur the boundaries between subsidized and commercial culture in Shanghai more than in many of the other world cities according to the research with culture and creativity's contribution to innovation-led growth being a priority. This notion has underpinned the development of more than 100 creative clusters in the city. These include *1933*, a giant former abattoir and factory which mixes commercial creative industries with offices, high-end retail and food; and the M50 art cluster based in a former textile mill and now home to more than 120 galleries and studios.
- Drawing on its designation as a UNESCO City of Design in 2006, Montreal's cultural policy makes determined efforts to ensure that culture is embedded into the development of its physical surroundings. In a city where cultural identity is so bound up with language, developing a coherent response to the cultural challenges that all large urban centres face can be fraught. Montreal has a long history of fostering fringe and alternative cultural activities which it sees as an essential source of cultural dynamism. Cirque du Soleil, for instance, which is based in Montreal is now the largest theatrical producer in the world, founded by two former street performers.
- New York City's Materials for the Arts which in 2012 alone diverted from the waste stream over a million pounds of materials valued at over (US) \$5 M by recirculating donated, durable goods free of charge to NYC's public schools and not for profit cultural community. Furthermore, NYC's non-profit sector has

responded well so far to the challenges and opportunities posed by technology. Initiatives like the Metropolitan Opera's pioneering use of HD video to live stream performances have increased audience interest and attendance and many arts organizations are successfully using social media to market their programmes and increase access. What is perhaps most striking about the approach of the NYC government to supporting culture is its clear understanding of the interconnectedness of different forms and scales of cultural activity and its willingness to cross the boundaries between profit and non-profit organizations.

- Paris launched in 2010 La Gaîté Lyrique, a new cultural institution dedicated to all forms of digital and urban culture. Located in a 150 year-old building in the heart of Paris, the venue combines heritage and architecture with an aim to create a building where amenities constitute a 'toolbox' for artists who wish to make use of it including a resource centre, a café, programmes and artistic productions and new technology for the use of artists. However, the reality of central Paris – its high rents and protected architecture and heritage sites – make developing more creative and cultural industries and activities there difficult. Many of the most interesting efforts to encourage creativity in the city are therefore taking place in peripheral districts of Paris. Two examples – the European City of Cinema, provides a comprehensive support service for film production and is set up in a disused power station in Saint-Denis, at the heart of the creative cluster known as the "Territoire de la Création". As well there is the Le Centquatre, a building in the multicultural but poor 19th century arrondissement which used to house a state funeral parlour but now is home to a mix of spaces and a range of artists who are given studios in the building for several months in return for allowing the public to see their works in progress.
- RioFilme is a company owned by the City of Rio de Janeiro but run as a private corporation with the mission of helping and sustaining the development of the audiovisual industry in Rio and in Brazil through co-producing and co-distributing films/cultural initiatives. The years leading up to the 2016 Olympics give Rio a unique chance to showcase and improve its cultural infrastructure. A large scale urban redevelopment program is underway in the harbour area. It aims to revitalize public spaces and improve the provision of urban public services. Culture infrastructure is a key component of the program and a new high-tech science and environmental museum, known as the Museum of Tomorrow, designed by architect Santiago Calatrava will open in 2015.
- Sydney began as a community of strangers with wildly varying backgrounds and skills brought together through adverse circumstances. Increasing recognition and celebration of Aboriginal and Torres Strait islander heritage and contemporary culture is planned while physical and metaphorical connections between once isolated formal cultural institutions are underway. Furthermore, Sydney became the home of the federal government's Creative Industries Innovation Centre, in recognition of the contribution of the creative industries to Australia's GDP- a comparable share to that of Canada, the United States and France.

CONCLUSION

The WCCR points out that the 21 participating cities are global cultural hubs not because their share of cultural activities is growing fastest – in some cases cultural activities may be growing faster in smaller cities or towns – but because they can afford to 'specialize' in culture, providing the infrastructure of commissioning, distribution, management and other professional functions that enable these sectors to get their products to market.

To date, world cities theory has paid relatively little attention to culture. But in fact the entwining of cultural policy with other urban policies is characteristic of all world cities. Culture is embedded in wider social, economic and political relations. Participating in culture can therefore have a potentially wide set of positive outcomes beyond entertainment and the aesthetic – from creating and retaining identity, building social cohesion, fostering community development and civic participation to enhancing wellbeing and generating economic value.

Three decades of cultural advocacy in Toronto has paid dividends. We are considered by our peers to be a world city. However, there is still so much work to do to ensure that Toronto does not slip behind other world cities. The Forum aims to build a stronger evidence base about the wide-ranging ways in which culture impacts on a world city and its inhabitants through its continuing research program. By assembling their cultural expertise and knowledge, the participating cities have created an effective research and policy forum to address the role that culture plays in their cities and to strengthen their policy responses to the challenges they face. The City of Toronto has much to contribute and learn as part of the World Cities Culture Forum.

CONTACT

Lori Martin
Senior Cultural Affairs Officer, Cultural Services
Economic Development and Culture
Tel: (416) 392-5225
Fax: (416) 392-5600
lmartin2@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Michael H. Williams
General Manager, Economic Development and Culture

ATTACHMENT

Attachment 1: City of Toronto Portrait in World Cities Culture Report