M TORONTO

STAFF REPORT ACTION REQUIRED

Alterations to a Designated Heritage Property, Amendment of Designating By-law and Authority for a Heritage Easement Agreement – 1 Spadina Crescent

Date:	May 26, 2014
То:	Toronto Preservation Board Toronto East York Community Council
From:	Director, Urban Design, City Planning Division
Wards:	Ward 20 - Trinity-Spadina
Reference Number:	P:\2014\Cluster B\PLN\TEYCC\PHTE14059

SUMMARY

This report recommends that City Council approve the proposed alteration of 1 Spadina Crescent. Located at the top of Spadina Avenue in the centre of Spadina Crescent just north of College Street, the property contains the former three-storey Knox College which was built in 1875 and designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act on March 17, 1976.

The property is the subject of a site plan application that proposes interior renovation and exterior restoration of the existing building, the removal of a number of rear additions and a new three-storey rear addition. The designated building and the new addition will be home to the University of Toronto's Daniels Faculty of Architecture, Landscape and Design (DFALD).

This report also recommends that City Council amend former City of Toronto By-law 89-76, designating the property at 1 Spadina Crescent (former Knox College, Spadina Military Hospital and Toronto Connaught Laboratories) under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, to revise the Reasons for Designation in accordance with the 2005 changes to the Ontario Heritage Act, and to grant authority for a heritage easement agreement. When a heritage easement agreement is secured for a property designated prior to 2005 it is the City's practice to amend the designating by-law to describe the cultural heritage values and attributes of the property as set out in the 2005 amendments to the Ontario Heritage Act.

Alterations to a Designated Heritage Property, Designation Amendment and Authority to Enter into an HEA - 1 Spadina Crescent

RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Planning Division recommends that:

- 1. City Council approve the alterations to the heritage property at 1 Spadina Crescent, in accordance with Section 33 of the Ontario Heritage Act, with such alterations to the property at 1 Spadina Crescent to be substantially in accordance with the drawings prepared by Adamson Associates Architects, dated November 19, 2013 and on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), prepared by ERA Architects Inc., dated November 19, 2013 and on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, all subject to and in accordance with a Conservation Plan satisfactory to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services and subject to the following additional conditions:
 - a. Prior to final site plan approval, the owner shall:
 - i. Provide a Conservation Plan, prepared by a qualified heritage consultant, that is consistent with the conservation strategy set out in the Heritage Impact Statement for the property located at 1 Spadina Crescent, dated November 19, 2013, and all to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
 - ii. Provide Final Site Plan drawings including drawings related to the approved Conservation Plan to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services; and
 - iii. Enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement with the City for the property at 1 Spadina Crescent to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services and the City Solicitor.
 - b. Prior to the issuance of any permit for the property at 1 Spadina Crescent, including a heritage permit or a building permit, but excluding permits for repairs, maintenance or restoration of the existing heritage building, the owner shall:
 - i. Provide full building permit drawings, including notes and specifications for the conservation and protective measures keyed to the approved Conservation Plan, including a description of materials and finishes, to be prepared by the project architect and a qualified heritage consultant, all to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;

- Provide a Lighting Plan that describes how the former Knox College will be sensitively illuminated to enhance its heritage character, to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
- iii. Provide an Interpretation Plan for 1 Spadina Crescent, to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services; and
- iv. Provide a Letter of Credit, including provision for upwards indexing, in a form and amount and from a bank satisfactory to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services to secure all work included in the approved Interpretation Plan.
- c. Prior to the release of the Letter of Credit the owner shall provide a letter of substantial completion prepared and signed by a qualified heritage consultant confirming that the interpretive work has been completed in accordance with the approved Interpretation Plan, all to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.
- 2. City Council state its intention to amend former City of Toronto By-law No. 89-76 to revise the Reasons for Designation in accordance with the Statement of Significance: 1 Spadina Crescent (Knox College) attached as Attachment No. 8 to the report (May 26, 2014) from the Director, Urban Design, City Planning Division to explain the cultural heritage value or interest of the property and describe its heritage attributes.
- 3. If there are no objections to the proposed amendment in accordance with the Ontario Heritage Act, City Council authorize the City Solicitor to introduce the necessary bill in Council amending designating By-law No. 89-76.
- 4. If there are objections in accordance with the Ontario Heritage Act, City Council direct the City Clerk to refer the proposed amendment to the Conservation Review Board.
- 5. If the proposed amendment is referred to the Conservation Review Board, City Council authorize the City Solicitor and appropriate staff to attend any hearing held by the Conservation Review Board in support of Council's decision to amend the designating by-law.
- 6. City Council grant authority for the execution of a Heritage Easement Agreement under Section 37 of the Ontario Heritage Act with the owners of the property at 1 Spadina Crescent (Knox College).

7. City Council authorize the City Solicitor to introduce the necessary bill in Council authorizing the entering into of a Heritage Easement Agreement for the property at 1 Spadina Crescent (Knox College).

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY

The property located at 1 Spadina Crescent was listed on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties on June 20, 1973 and designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act by former City of Toronto By-law No. 89-76.

ISSUE BACKGROUND

The property at 1 Spadina Crescent, which is located within the traffic circle on Spadina Avenue north of College Street, contains the former Knox College. The proposal for the building involves the renovation of interior spaces, the restoration of exterior features, the removal of newer rear additions, the removal of the original kitchen wing on the west elevation and the addition of a three-storey addition behind the designated building. The proposal is subject to Site Plan Control (SPA 13 268218).

The Conservation Strategy has been developed with reference to the Parks Canada *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada*, the Ministry of Culture's Ontario Heritage Toolkit and the Burra Charter.

BACKGROUND

Policy Framework

Official Plan

Section 3.1.5 of the City of Toronto Official Plan directs that significant heritage resources will be conserved by listing properties of architectural and/or historic interest on the City's Inventory of Heritage Properties; designating properties; entering into conservation agreements with owners of heritage properties; and designating areas with a concentration of heritage resources as heritage conservation districts. The Plan directs the adoption of guidelines to maintain and improve the character of such districts.

Provincial Policy Statement and Ontario Heritage Act

In reference to the Province of Ontario's 2005 Provincial Policy Statement, Section 2.6.1 states: "Significant built heritage resources *and* significant cultural heritage landscapes *shall be* conserved."

Under Section 33 of the Ontario Heritage Act, an owner must obtain a permit from the municipality alter a designated property. If Council refuses the application the owner may appeal the decision to the Conservation Review Board.

Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada

On March 3, 4 and 5, 2008, Council adopted Parks Canada's *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada (Standards and Guidelines)* as the document guiding planning, stewardship and conservation approach for all listed and designated heritage resources within the City.

http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2008/cc/decisions/2008-03-03-cc17-dd.pdf

Reasons for Designation

Following research and evaluation according to Regulation 9/06, it has been determined that the building known historically as Knox College at 1 Spadina Crescent is worthy of designation for the site's design, associative, historical and landmark values. The amended Statement of Significance (Reasons for Designation) contains the statement of cultural heritage value and the list of heritage attributes that relate to Ontario Regulation 9/06, the provincial criteria prescribed for municipal designation following the 2005 amendments to the Ontario Heritage Act (Attachment No. 8). The Heritage Property Research and Evaluation Report that identifies and evaluates the heritage resources on the property at 1 Spadina Crescent containing Knox College can be found in Attachment No. 9.

Knox College is valued as a rare and excellent example of a High Victorian Gothic style college building in Toronto designed by the firm of Smith & Gemmell. It is historically associated with the 1840s reformation of the Presbyterian Church and the creation of a new seminary in Toronto. Named for John Knox, the reformation leader of the Scottish church, Knox College is the first purpose built seminary for the newly reformed Scottish Free Presbyterian church. As the location of the Spadina Military Hospital in World War 1 where Amelia Earhart was a volunteer and as the location of Connaught Laboratories from 1943 to accelerate the production of vaccines for soldiers at the front, the site is associated with support for the well being of Canadian forces in both World Wars. Connaught Laboratories was also distinguished for the development and production of polio vaccines in the 1950s. Contextually, the site has preserved the original form of Crescent Gardens laid out on Spadina Avenue in the 1830s. Terminating the northwards vista of Spadina Avenue, Knox College has been valued as a prominent Toronto landmark since its building was announced in the press in 1873 and it continues to be "an adornment for the City."

The Statement of Significance comprises the Reasons for Designation, which is the Public Notice of Intention to Designate and will be advertised on the City of Toronto's web site in accordance with the City of Toronto Act provisions and served on the property owners and on the Ontario Heritage Trust according to the provisions of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Proposal

The alteration of the former Knox College consists of two phases. Phase I alterations are currently underway and include interior renovations and restoration of the existing building as well as any necessary repair work to accommodate students, staff and faculty. No changes to the building envelope will occur beyond repair and reinforcement of the structure. This work is scheduled to be completed in the summer of 2014.

Phase II proposes the removal of a number of additions on the north elevation including the original 1875 kitchen wing, 1914 military wing and later additions. A new three storey building to the north of the existing heritage structure is proposed. The new building will consist of a curtain wall glazing system and texture precast concrete panel cladding. A number of modifications are proposed along the north perimeter wall of the existing heritage building to accommodate connections to the proposed new construction.

The new and existing structures will be connected along the north perimeter wall of the existing heritage building. The existing courtyard area will be filled with a large, double-height auditorium. North of the auditorium, the first two floors of the new building will consist of fabrication space, flexible undergraduate studio/lecture space and critique rooms. The third floor contains graduate studio space.

Portions of the roof including the mechanical penthouse are taller than the existing heritage building and will be slightly visible from the south. The large mechanical penthouse required for HVAC equipment and elevator overrun is located on the roof within the former courtyard area immediately to the north of the existing heritage building. The roof of the proposed mechanical penthouse is flat and clad with precast pavers. The walls of the mechanical penthouse are clad with a light coloured roofing membrane. The roof assembly to the north of the mechanical penthouse is articulated to allow for natural light penetration into the third floor graduate studio space. The roof of the proposed new building is made up of a combination of extensive green roof and walkable surfaces, skylights, and membrane roof assembly.

COMMENTS

Heritage Preservation Services has reviewed plans and drawings and the Heritage Impact Assessment (1 Spadina Crescent DFALD Phase II), prepared by ERA Architects Inc. dated November 19, 2013 and received November 28, 2013, as well as renderings prepared by NADAAA Inc. which were presented to the November 14, 2013 University of Toronto Design Review Panel, and NADAAA Inc. drawings dated November 19, 2013. Overall, the Heritage Impact Assessment reflects the conservation strategy that has been arrived at through discussion with the City.

Under the Parks Canada *Standards and Guidelines*, the proposed conservation treatment for the proposal is a combination of rehabilitation and restoration. A significant investment in exterior restoration is currently being undertaken by the University of Toronto under Phase I of this project. The proposed Phase II rehabilitation has been planned with precision, creativity and detail. The exterior restoration (previously

Alterations to a Designated Heritage Property, Designation Amendment and Authority to Enter into an HEA - 1 Spadina Crescent

approved by heritage permit) and subtle interior transformation offsets the sizable but compatible addition to the north.

The low-scale massing of the addition maintains important views from north and the south, and the connection between old and new has been sensitively designed to ensure maximum retention of the original roof forms and seamless physical and visual transition. The flowing, peaked roof design is a very successful design move that is both fully modern and highly compatible and the design employed for maximizing natural light responds to the forms and geometries of the historic building and provides an optimal, modern response. Additionally, the height and massing of the proposed new building respects the height and massing of other heritage buildings in the area and the design of the south landscape is appropriate in that it maintains visibility and views to the primary elevation and provides a contemporary foil to the heritage building.

Staff appreciate the extensive work that was done at the city's request to explore the feasibility of retaining the 1875 kitchen wing and military wing within the project. Given the differing floor levels, slender, warren-like hallway connections and the key programmatic requirement of introducing a multi-storey auditorium in an atrium-like condition, we concur that retention of these features is not feasible. However, HPS is particularly concerned about the loss of this heritage fabric as it relates to two important social aspects of the building's history.

As a mitigation measure, the City will secure a robust interpretation program throughout the building that indentifies and explores Knox College's varied and interesting history, with particular emphasis on cultural and social historical themes, socially stratified occupation (users and workers) and the variety of uses over the years. The Interpretation Strategy contained in the HIA provides a good basis for the program and the full plan should be finalized prior to final site plan approval and implemented as a post-approval condition.

CONCLUSION

The rehabilitation of this landmark property has been long-awaited and the proposed new addition and exterior restoration provide a fantastic opportunity for on-site awareness of heritage conservation, design and practice for the Daniels Faculty of Architecture, Landscape and Design. The University of Toronto, NADAAA Inc. and ERA Architects Inc. are to be commended for achieving something that is very difficult: designing a bold, modern addition to a landmark heritage building with subtly and elegance.

While the removal of the original 1875 kitchen wing and 1914 military wing is unfortunate, the quality of the project and the improvements to the existing heritage building will offset these changes and revitalize one of the city's most important buildings. As a condition of approval, HPS are recommending that the applicant enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement with the City and execute an extensive interpretation program in conjunction with the related Site Plan approval.

CONTACT

Mary L. MacDonald, Acting Manager Heritage Preservation Services Tel: 416-338-1079; Fax: 416-392-1973 E-mail: <u>mmacdon7@toronto.ca</u>

SIGNATURE

Harold Madi Director Urban Design City Planning Division

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment No. 1 - Location Map, 1 Spadina Crescent

Attachment No. 2 – Photographs

Attachment No. 3 – Proposed Site Plan

Attachment No. 4 – Proposed Elevations

Attachment No. 5 – Proposed Elevations

Attachment No. 6 - Proposed Rendering

Attachment No. 7 - Proposed Rendering

Attachment No. 8 – Statement of Significance (amended Reasons for Designation)

Attachment No. 9 - Heritage Property Research and Evaluation Report

LOCATION MAP: 1 SPADINA CRESCENT (KNOX COLLEGE)



This location map is for information purposes only; the exact boundaries of the property are <u>not</u> shown.

The arrow marks the site of Knox College

ATTACHMENT NO. 2

PHOTOGRAPHS: 1 SPADINA CRESCENT (KNOX COLLEGE)



Knox College, principal south elevation facing Spadina Avenue, 1885 (*Toronto Reference Library, Baldwin Room, E5-54*)



Knox College, aerial view, 201 (ERA Architects Inc. screen shot, 2013-02-07 at 11.43.37

Alterations to a Designated Heritage Property, Designation Amendment and Authority to Enter into an HEA - 1 Spadina Crescent



South elevation



North (rear) elevation





Front Elevation



Rear Elevation



East Elevation



Alterations to a Designated Heritage Property, Designation Amendment and Authority to Enter into an HEA - 1 Spadina Crescent

West Elevation PROPOSED RENDERING: 1 SPADINA CRESCENT

ATTACHMENT NO. 6



Rendering of the proposed front elevation



Rendering of the proposed rear elevation

Alterations to a Designated Heritage Property, Designation Amendment and Authority to Enter into an HEA - 1 Spadina Crescent

ATTACHMENT NO. 7



Aerial view of the proposed rear addition.

The 1875 Kitchen Wing (to be demolished) is outlined

Knox College

Former City of Toronto By-law No. 89-76 designating the property at 1 Spadina Crescent (Knox College, later the Spadina Military Hospital, Spadina House and the University of Toronto Connaught Medical Laboratories Spadina Division) under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act is amended to revise the Reasons for Designation to describe the site's cultural heritage values and attributes as set out in the 2005 amendments to the Ontario Heritage Act.

Description

The property at 1 Spadina Crescent is designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for its cultural heritage value, and meets the provincial criteria prescribed for municipal designation under all three categories of design, associative and contextual values. Located at the top of Spadina Avenue just north of College Street, the building known historically as the Knox College was completed in 1875 as a 3-storey seminary building.

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

Knox College has cultural heritage value as a rare and excellent example of a High Victorian Gothic style college building in Toronto. The building is particularly distinguished by the high degree of artistic merit and craftsmanship evident in the variety and complexity the composition of its form and massing with its dominant tower, asymmetrical second tower, projecting wings and steeply pitched roofs as well as in the intricately detailed elements including the variety of windows, stained glass, chimneys, finials, buttresses and unique string and belt courses. The combination of buff brick and stone are typical characteristics of the Gothic revival styles in Toronto.

Historically, the property is valued for its associations with Knox College, as the first purpose-built complex for this institution which emerged in Canada West in the 1840s, and for the site's historical associations with the architects Smith & Gemmel (James Avon Smith and John Gemmell) whose 40 year partnership (1872-1910) produced a significant body of ecclesiastical work in Toronto and across Canada. Designed at the beginning of the partnership, Knox College remains one of their most prominent projects. Knox College is also associated with the Canadian war effort for World War I, as the site of the care for soldiers (in 1918 Amelia Earhart was a nurse's aide through the Volunteer Aid Detachment organization) and for World War II, as the location of accelerated production of vaccines for the front. The property is further valued for its association with Connaught Laboratories from 1943-1972 which was internationally recognized as a

leader in the development and production of vaccines including insulin, penicillin and in the 1950s the anti-polio vaccine.

Contextually Knox College has cultural heritage value as it is visually and historically linked to the evolution of the City of Toronto and the growth of the Spadina and University of Toronto neighbourhood; Its functions and presence have been a significant contributor to both. Its distinctive late 19th century architectural form and dominant tower contributes to the character of the area where it is an important local landmark and a significant feature on the neighbourhood's skyline. Situated at the heart of Spadina Crescent, it maintains the original circular form of Crescent Gardens and the original street pattern which dates back to the 1830s.

Knox College is valued for its contribution to a distinctive and historic urban pattern in the City of Toronto by terminating the northern vista of an avenue and facing south towards Lake Ontario as do numerous other prominent institutions including Old City Hall, the Ontario Legislature Building and Upper Canada College. Terminating the northwards vista of Spadina Avenue, Knox College has been valued as a prominent Toronto landmark since its building was announced in the press in 1873 and it continues to be "an adornment for the City."

Heritage Attributes

The heritage attributes of the building known historically as the Knox College at 1 Spadina Crescent are:

Exterior:

- The placement, setback and orientation of the building at the centre of Spadina Crescent block, facing southward down Spadina Avenue to the lake
- The open grassed and planted space around the building as it extends on the east, south and west sides
- The scale, form and massing on the three-storey E-shaped plan with east and west side wings, west dining room wing and east lecture hall wing above a raised stone base with a central projecting tower and higher central block and second east tower
- The masonry construction and with buff brick and stone cladding, and metal detailing
- The stone elements including the base, belt courses, string courses, window sills and arched brick corbels at the eaves, buttress caps and drip moulds, dormer elements including stone coping and carved drip moulds and keystones, carved stone elements such as those on the tower and the south, east and west entrances and the stone columns featured at doors and between window openings
- The gable roofs of the building with the dormer windows and approximately 12 chimneys with their decorative stone and brick trim and coursing
- The main tower roof clad in copper with finials, stepped parapets, wood arcade

- The second tower roof with its brick and stone gables and finials and mansard shape
- The main stair case roof with its dormer and metal trim
- The wooden sash windows with their curved lancet forms, 5 light sash over 2 and featuring the circular motif in the upper sash
- The dormer windows with their pointed arched brick openings or brick and stone arched openings, stone sills and gable pediments with stone trim or stone coping

Interior:

- The entry vestibule with its groin vaulted oak ceiling and carved stone bosses and wainscoting
- The corridors with their arches
- The staircase with its wood handrails, wood balustrade and other decorative elements such as the drop pendants
- The library space with its raised central room
- The reclaimed space of the lecture hall with its exposed curved timber trusses with decorative infill panels
- The museum with its exposed timber trusses
- The original millwork including the baseboards, window frames, sash and sills, doors, door frames and transoms

ATTACHMENT NO. 9

HERITAGE PROPERTY RESEARCH AND EVALUATION REPORT



KNOX COLLEGE 1 SPADINA CRESCENT, TORONTO

Prepared by:

Heritage Preservation Services City Planning Division City of Toronto

May 2014

1. DESCRIPTION



Above: G. Gascard *City of Toronto Bird's Eye View from the Northern Railway elevator*, 1876, detail showing Knox College (#3) at the top of Spadina Crescent a year after completion of construction (Toronto Public Library, TRL, J. Ross Robertson Collection, JRR 745); Cover: Knox College, photograph of the south elevation, 1882 (Toronto Reference Library, Baldwin Room, 986-9-6)

1 Spadina Crescent: Knox College				
ADDRESS	1 Spadina Crescent			
WARD	Ward 20 (Trinity-Spadina)			
LEGAL DESCRIPTION	PT Park Lots 15 16			
NEIGHBOURHOOD/COMMUNITY	Spadina/University of Toronto			
HISTORICAL NAME	Knox College			
CONSTRUCTION DATE	1874-5			
ORIGINAL OWNER	Presbyterian Church			
ORIGINAL USE	Seminary			
CURRENT USE*	Educational facility at the University of Toronto			
ARCHITECT/BUILDER/DESIGNER	Smith & Gemmel			
DESIGN/CONSTRUCTION	Masonry construction, brick cladding with stone, wood and			
	metal detailing			
ARCHITECTURAL STYLE	High Victorian Gothic			
ADDITIONS/ALTERATIONS	See Section iii			
CRITERIA	Design/Physical, Historical/Associative and Contextual			
HERITAGE STATUS	Designated under Part IV, Section 29, Ontario Heritage			
	Act, former City of Toronto BY-law No. 89-76			
RECORDER	Heritage Preservation Services: Marybeth McTeague			
REPORT DATE	May 2014			

Alterations to a Designated Heritage Property, Designation Amendment and Authority to Enter into an HEA – 1 Spadina Crescent

2. BACKGROUND

This research and evaluation report describes the history, architecture and context of the portion of the property at 1 Spadina Crescent known historically as Knox College, which was designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act in 1976 by former City of Toronto By-law No. 89-76. The report includes an evaluation of the property according to Ontario Regulation 9/06, the criteria for municipal designation prescribed by the Province of Ontario following the 2005 amendments to the Ontario Heritage Act. The conclusions of the research and evaluation are found in Section 4 (Summary).

Key Date	Historical Event
1793	As part of the granting of the Park Lot Estates by John Graves Simcoe, Lot 15
	is granted to William Willcocks and Lot 16 to Q. Baby
1800	Peter Russell, purchased Park Lots 15 and 16 adjacent to his farm Petersfield at
	Lot 14
1808	Russell dies and his wife Elizabeth inherits his property
1822 With Elizabeth's death her cousin Phoebe Willcocks Baldwin inherits	
	including Lot 15 and 16
1836	William Warren Baldwin (Phoebe's husband and a self-taught architect) lays
	out Spadina Avenue between Lots 15 and 16
1838	W W Baldwin deeds the Crescent Gardens (Spadina Crescent) as a park to the
	city
1873	The Knox College Board decides to build larger accommodation for the
	college and holds an architectural competition. Baldwin's granddaughter sells
	the property at Crescent Gardens to Knox College. Smith & Gemmell win the
	competition.
1874	On April 2 nd the foundation stone is laid for the new Knox College building at
	Crescent Gardens (now 1 Spadina Crescent)
1875	On October 6 the college opens its doors to students
1885	Knox College affiliates with the University of Toronto
1915	Knox College moves to new premises on King's College Circle
1916-1923	The building at 1 Spadina Crescent is occupied by the Spadina Military
_	Hospital. Additions are made to the college building
1923-1930's	Spadina House is occupied by the Department of Health
1943	The University of Toronto Connaught Medical Laboratories purchases the
	property and manufactures to assist the Department of National Defence in the
	production of penicillin, and a serum for the treatment of shock on the site.
-	Extensive alterations and additions are made to the building
1972 to the	Following the sale of the Connaught Laboratories, the former Knox College
present	building is occupied by the University of Toronto for a variety of educational
	uses. An animal laboratory is constructed on the site in the 1980s. At the time
	of writing this report the site is being redeveloped with a major addition.
1976	The property is designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage
	Act by former City of Toronto By-law #89-76

i. HISTORICAL TIMELINE

i. HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

Spadina Avenue and Spadina Crescent

The property at 1 Spadina Crescent containing Knox College¹ (Image 1) originated as part of a design for a grand avenue starting at William Warren and Phoebe Baldwins's house north of the second Concession Road (now Bloor Street) and continuing down to Lake Ontario. When the Town of York (Toronto) was founded in 1793 the surrounding land was divided and granted to military, clergy and other officials. A series of narrow park lots, typically of one hundred acres stretching from Lot Street (now Queen) just north of the town up to the second concession road (now Bloor) were laid out. Spadina Crescent straddles Lots 15 and 16 which were originally owned by William Willcocks and Q. Baby respectively. In 1808 Peter Russell, who owned Lot 14, purchased these two additional lots. After his death and that of his wife Elizabeth, the land was inherited by Phoebe Willcocks Baldwin in 1822. Phoebe's husband, William Warren Baldwin, the first civilian doctor in York, a lawyer and a self-taught architect had already constructed a house in 1818 on Lot 24 immediately north of the second concession (Bloor Street) which spanned the top of lots 15 and 16. He called the house Spadina after the Ojibwa phrase *ishpadinaa* meaning hill or high place.

Following Phoebe's inheritance, Lots 15 and 16 were subdivided into residential lots and a grand avenue planned as the centrepiece. In 1836 Spadina Avenue, named for the Baldwin home, was laid out with its extraordinary grand width of 132', twice that of the average Toronto street. A tree-lined boulevard with formal gardens such as Crescent Gardens (now Spadina Crescent), it provided a vista from the Baldwin House north of present day Bloor Street down to Lake Ontario. (Image 2 and 3) Surrounding streets named for the family include: Baldwin, Willcocks, Russell, Phoebe, Heyden (now Sussex) Sullivan, St George, Maria (now Soho), and Augusta. In 1838 Baldwin deeded Crescent Gardens as a park to the City. However as certain conditions had not been met by the City in 1873 his grand-daughter sold the circular Crescent Gardens to Knox College.² The site was just to the west of the University of Toronto. (Image 4)

Knox College

Knox College was founded in 1844 following a divisive disagreement in the Church of Scotland in 1843 over state control which resulted in the creation of the Free Church of Scotland. In Canada several Presbyterian congregations and ministers left the Church of Scotland and aligned with the new Free Church. As Queen's College, the seminary in Kingston remained aligned with the Church of Scotland a group of students and clergy defected and established a new seminary associated with the Free Church in Toronto. The new seminary was named for the leader of the Scottish Reformation and founder of the

¹ The property was later known as the Spadina Military Hospital (1915-1923), Spadina House (1923-1943) and the University of Toronto Connaught Laboratories, Spadina Division (1943-1972) ² Arthur, p 220.

Alterations to a Designated Heritage Property, Designation Amendment and Authority to Enter into an HEA - 1 Spadina Crescent

Presbyterian Church, John Knox (1514-1572). A man of deeply held religious convictions he was imprisoned, forced into exile and returned to Scotland to challenge the influence of Mary Queen of Scot's mother upon the local church. He created a new order of service which was adopted by the reformed Church of Scotland. In 1856 Dr. Michael Willis, who had founded the Anti-Slavery Society of Canada in 1851, was appointed the first principal of Knox College. In 1858 Knox College received the authority to confer degrees. In 1861 the college absorbed the United Presbyterian Theological College from London. In 1885 it was officially affiliated with the University of Toronto and students took non-theological courses at the university. In 1969 Knox College became a founding member of the Toronto School of Theology which is a federation of seven colleges within the University of Toronto.

Knox College Site History

Initially Knox College had just 14 students and was accommodated in three row houses known as Ontario Terrace on Front Street.³ With expanded numbers they relocated to Elmsley Villa in 1855. With the incorporation of the Presbyterian College from London in 1861 the demand for space increased. In 1873 the College Board, with the sanction of the Presbyterian Assembly, embarked upon the purchase of a site and a fund-raising campaign for the new building. Support was received from congregations throughout the province and the site at 1 Spadina Crescent, then known as Crescent Gardens, was purchased. An architectural competition was held in April and the winners, Smith & Gemmell, announced in July. Final drawings were produced in August of 1873 and tenders called for on August 22.⁴ A ceremony for the laying of the foundation stone was held on April 2nd 1874 and it was remarked on that occasion that most of the woodwork and stonework were already prepared and assembled on the site ready for construction to commence.⁵ The college building was declared completed in late August 1875 and students were to be admitted on October 6th of that year.⁶

In 1915 the college relocated to new premises on King's College Circle giving it a more immediate geographic unity with the University of Toronto. After that the building served as a barracks and then as the Spadina Military Hospital during World War 1. In 1918 through the Volunteer Aid Detachment Amelia Earhart (1897-1937) worked as a nurse's aide.⁷ From 1923 through to the 1930s, the building was being used by the provincial Department of Health. By 1943 the college building had been abandoned for several years and was purchased by the University of Toronto for its Connaught Medical Laboratories for the urgent development and production of penicillin and a serum for the treatment of shock for the Department of National Defence. Connaught Laboratories Ltd.

³ The Mail, April 3, 1874, p 4. This article which marked the laying of the foundation stone included the talk given by Rev. Professor Cavan who provided the history of the college and the building program. ⁴ The Globe, August 22, 1873, p.3 Tenders were due on September 5, 1873.

⁵ The Mail, April 3, 1874, p 4.

⁶ The Mail, August 25, 1875, p 4.

⁷ Amelia Earhart http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Amelia Earhart accessed May 15, 2014

now known as Sanofi Pasteur Ltd. has been and continues to be a leading supplier of vaccines in Canada. The laboratories were initially founded in 1913 by Dr John G. Fitzgerald, the Professor of Hygiene at the University of Toronto to facilitate the production of vaccines for diphtheria, pertussis and tetanus for the broad public. In 1914 the laboratory affiliated with the University of Toronto and was named for Prince Arthur, Duke of Connaught and Governor General of Canada (1911-1916). Following the discovery of insulin at the University of Toronto in 1921 by Frederick Banting and Charles Best, Connaught was the first laboratory to produce large-scale quantities of insulin. Connaught pioneered the combined diphtheria-pertussis-tetanus vaccine. In the 1950s it was one of the primary leaders in the development and production of a polio vaccine.

Mathers and Haldenby undertook the substantial renovations of the college for laboratory production purposes which included underpinning to create a basement and the provision of a well, which was required for large quantities of water and the introduction of consistent temperature controls. In 1972 Connaught Laboratories was sold by the University to the Canada Development Corporation and was subsequently re-sold to a sequence of European pharmaceutical corporations, the Canadian division of which is known as Sanofi Pasteur Ltd. ⁸ After the sale in 1972 the University of Toronto devoted the property to a variety of purposes and academic departments including the Department of Psychology which built the animal laboratory between 1988 and 1990. At the time of writing this report the site is being rehabilitated and extended to include the new Daniels Faculty of Architecture, Landscape and Design.

Smith and Gemmell Architects

James Avon Smith (1832-1918) emigrated to Canada from Scotland in 1850 and apprenticed with the architect William Thomas. Smith went into partnership with John Bailey from approximately 1858-1862 before working on his own until 1870. In that year he went into partnership with William Gemmell (1846-1872) and took on his brother John Gemmell (1850-1915) as an apprentice. After William died accidentally in 1872, John became Smith's partner. This prolific partnership of nearly 40 years produced designs for a variety of building types but was especially well-known for their ecclesiastical work⁹ including the Church of the Redeemer (1878-9), College Street Presbyterian (United) Church (1884-5), Morningside-High Park Presbyterian Church (1915-7), and St Paul's United Church (1886) with its innovative cast iron vaults. All of these properties are included on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties. Knox College, undertaken in the first year of their partnership, remains one of their most prominent commissions.

⁸ Connaught Laboratories, <u>http://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/en/article/sanofi-pasteur-limited/</u> accessed 15 May 2014.

⁹ Throughout his entire career Smith is credited with designing almost 100 churches across the province.

ii. ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

Archival and contemporary photographs of Knox College are found on the cover and in Sections 2 and 6 of this report.

The architectural style of the college is High Victorian Gothic. As Eric Arthur was to write in Toronto: No Mean City:

Following the incorporation of the city a change came to the architecture of Toronto...It was a change in taste brought about by the Romantic movement, a movement that was felt most strongly in the Western Hemisphere and left its mark on architecture as well as on literature, painting and music. Romanticism has been said to 'consist in a high development of a poetic sensibility toward the remote as such. It idealizes the distant both of time and place... 10

When it came to church architecture and other religious buildings, Gothic was seen to be the only acceptable style from the past:

...only the Middle Ages provided the architecture that pointed to God in pinnacles and soaring spires. For most people the architecture of the Middle Ages suggested piety and the feeling of reverence and awe And elderly professors... could find equally convincing arguments in favour of Gothic as the only style compatible with learning in the new land.¹¹

Furthermore, religious theorists and architects such as the English A W N Pugin would assert a link between the Gothic Revival architecture and a "good moral Christian English life."¹²

In Toronto at this time the application of Gothic was inter-denominational, being featured on the new Roman Catholic St Michael's Cathedral (1848) and the Anglican St James Cathedral (1850-1). Following the schism in the Church of Scotland new Presbyterian churches were being built in Toronto such as Knox's Church (1847-8) and the Jennings Church (1848). These churches, as well as St. Michael's cathedral and its adjacent bishop's palace, were all designed by William Thomas with whom, as noted above, James Smith had apprenticed in 1850. These buildings were not only Gothic Revival in style they were also clad in buff brick with white stone details. A few other ecclesiastical colleges had been designed during this period in a Gothic style including Trinity College (1851-2) and St. Michael's College (1855-6). The closest precedent for Knox College in terms of plan and general massing is likely University College (1856) by Cumberland and Storm, although it is more Romanesque in style. All of these projects were built of buff brick with white stone trim.

¹⁰ Arthur, p. 75 ¹¹ Op cit.

¹² Kalman, p 279

By the 1870s the Gothic Revival had evolved to become High Victorian Gothic. While still Gothic in essence and featuring the trademark elements such as tall pointed windows, spires, buttresses and finials, the difference in High Victorian Gothic architecture is evident in a more complex and picturesque form, more steeply pitched rooflines, more elaborate and richly detailed elements and greater variety and complexity.

In September 1873 the Canadian Illustrated News published an image of the proposed college. (Image 5) The plans and elevations for the building reveal it as designed on a symmetrical E-shaped plan with the most important functions expressed as projecting volumes. (Images 6-11) The building is three stories high and built of buff brick with stone details and foundation. Its longest elevation of 230 feet, featuring a taller projecting central bay (housing the entrance, senate room, library and museum) with a dominant tower of 130 feet high faces south down Spadina Avenue. The east and west wings extend forward terminating the ends of the south elevation. The wings are intersected by a dining room on the west and a lecture hall with cloister on the east. They enclose a courtyard where the third prong of the E houses the grand staircase. One asymmetrical feature in the massing of the building is the second minor tower enclosing the stair case adjacent to the lecture hall. The other is the service wing beyond the dining hall which introduced a looser more functional quality to the otherwise symmetrical plan. Steeply raked gable roofs and dormers originally clad in slate,¹³ chimneys buttresses and pinnacles featured at the corners further establish the Gothic vocabulary. The composition of the building balances a picturesque complexity typical of the High Victorian Gothic style with a clear sense of order and hierarchy appropriate to a newly reformed religious institution. (Images 12-15)

The complexity and variety of the building's massing was matched in its details. While the building is primarily clad in buff brick, stone is featured in a variety of details as outlined in the Mail:

The building will be constructed of white brick with stone base, cornices, belts, strings, sills and door steps, molded drips to windows with carved bases, stone angle columns to tower with carved capitals. All the gable copings also will be of stone with iron terminals. The windows of the lecture hall will have stone jambs and sill resting on moulded stone strings, with mould drip and bosses over them.¹⁴

The details were especially elaborately treated on the primary focus of the building, the tower and central bay which housed the main entrance, library and museum. The main entrance was richly detailed with its projecting stone gabled frame, columns with Corinthian-derived capitals, buttresses, stone quoins, stone and brick voussoirs with a roll moulding and the trefoil arched form of the doorway with its pointed transom lights. (Images 16 and 17) Delicate foliage carving is featured in the archway and on the column capitals. A quatrefoil in the gable is inscribed with the date 1874. (Image 18)

¹³ The Mail, op cit.

¹⁴ The Mail, April 3, 1874, p. 4.

Alterations to a Designated Heritage Property, Designation Amendment and Authority to Enter into an HEA - 1 Spadina Crescent

The rose window above at the second level is similarly set within a pointed arched recess flanked with columns. The third level features a small arcade of pointed windows with columns in between. (Image 19) Rondels carved with shields are set below a row of long corbels supporting the tower roof with its stepped parapets and finials at the base, wooden arcade at the centre and what was once an iron finial at the top. (Image 20) Originally the copper cladding was done with diagonal standing seams (Image 12) but these were replaced by 1895 with vertical ones.

On the east and west elevations, though of lesser importance, the side entrances were distinguished by stone surrounds, and at roof level paired window in dormer gables. (Image 20) The east tower with its hipped roof and steep richly ornamented parapet gables, pinnacles and walls of decorative brick work made a dramatic counterpoint to the main tower. (Image 21)

The arrangement of the windows and dormer windows which are all Gothic with their pointed openings in groupings of pairs and triplets in an array of arched, pointed-arched and flat headed frames increases the sense of order with variety evident in the building's massing and composition. (Images 9-12 as above) Each floor level features a different treatment for the window frames as they become progressively smaller as they ascend. The dormer windows added to the variety. (Image 22) All clear glass windows had double hung sash with five over two lights. The upper lights featured an unusual circular motif at the centre. The woodwork was also painted a darker tone than the stone. Stained glass was featured throughout the building including the transom light of the main entry, the library windows, museum windows and main stair hall. (Images 26 and 36) The lecture hall in the east originally had double-story single lancet windows and rose windows in the gable end walls signalling its importance and dramatic triple volume internal space. (Images 9, 11 and 27)

The Gothic verticality of the building is tempered by the stone belt courses which emerge just below the window sills and just at spring point of the arched openings and whose double profiles created effective horizontal shadows across the surface of the building. One of the most interesting and functional aspects of the stone belt courses is the way they were designed to curve out and around the rain water leaders to secure them in place. Another horizontal feature is the band of decorative brick arches just below the eaves a minor variation on the dramatic corbels on the towers. (Image 23)

The Interior

The vestibule lobby featured a groin vaulted ceiling "with oak moulded ribs resting on carved stone corbels."¹⁵ (Image 24) On axis to the entry was the oak staircase with its stained glass windows. (Images 25 and 26) The lecture hall which was three stories high also featured an exposed timber hammer beam structure featuring curved arches and circular-section beams with Gothic tracery. (Images 27, 28 and 29) Apart from the

¹⁵ Op cit

Alterations to a Designated Heritage Property, Designation Amendment and Authority to Enter into an HEA - 1 Spadina Crescent

lecture hall and dining hall other rooms of note included the library set above the entry in the tower (Images 30 and 31) – Library) and above it the museum with exposed timberbeam roof. (Images 32 and 33) As the plans indicate the college included a senate room, lecture rooms, class rooms, secretarial rooms and a housekeeper's suite, as well as accommodation for the 80 residential students and the servants. "Bathrooms and other conveniences on each story for the use of the professors and students"¹⁶ were included adjacent to the main stairs. The plans indicate additional water closets for students were located outside at the north end of the cloister and those for servants were in the service yard. The building was to be steam heated and had gas lighting.

Setting

The building was set at the heart of the circle known as Spadina Crescent which is a surviving element of the original layout of Spadina Avenue as designed by William Warren Baldwin in the 1830s. Its symmetrical formal front faces south towards Spadina Avenue while the more functional north side with quadrangle and service buildings whose drawing was labelled "Rear Elevation" faced north up Spadina Avenue. (Image 11) The building was surrounded by a green space, initially a lawn with planting and a wooden fence with wooden gates at the front and also to the quadrangle enclosure. (Cover Image and Image 34) Photographs indicate that the front wood gates had been replaced at least as early as 1903 with more formal wrought iron ones (Image 35) and a circular drive was inserted. None of these elements survive today.

Alterations

Goad's Atlas of 1884 shows the footprint of the college as it was built and how it corresponds with the original plans. (Image 36) By 1913 Goad's indicates that an extension to the college took place in the courtyard prior to this year. (Image 37) After the departure of Knox College in 1915, the building underwent a series of transformations as it accommodated new uses including the medical care of soldiers in World War I and the speedy production of vaccines and serum for soldiers in World War II. The first set of post-Knox alterations occurred between 1918 and 1923 when the building was converted into a military hospital and a two story extension was added wrapping around the lecture hall to the north and east and into the quadrangle. During this time the lecture hall was subdivided with three floor levels and the double story windows removed. (Image 39) Goad's of 1924 indicates minor additions to the service wing as well. (Image 38) Further additions were made during the Connaught laboratories use from 1943-1972 including the underpinning of the building to create a basement, the digging of a well for substantial provision of water required in the production of vaccines (Image 40) and the addition of an elevator and various loading areas in the quadrangle and on the north and west sides of the 1920s addition. (Image 41) Finally an animal laboratory was added by the University of Toronto's Department of Psychology between 1988 and 1990.

¹⁶ Op cit.

Alterations to a Designated Heritage Property, Designation Amendment and Authority to Enter into an HEA - 1 Spadina Crescent

Fortunately these alterations were primarily contained within the courtyard and on the north side of the complex with flat roofs that were lower than the original gable peaks and towers. (Image 42) The main south wing and most of the east and west wings, up to and including the lecture hall and the dining hall wings, have been preserved and the principle original views of the complex remain largely unchanged and its landmark quality remains intact. Many of the interior spaces such as the main entry hall and staircase, the library and museum spaces all survive. The greatest loss was the subdivision of the great lecture hall into three levels and the removal of the double height lancet windows. It is currently proposed that a portion of the lecture hall will be reinstated although not to its original three story height and some of the curved wood roof trusses will be restored and revealed.

iii. CONTEXT

The Knox College Locations and the 1 Spadina Crescent Site

Prior to the site at 1 Spadina Crescent, the college had four locations including three row houses on Front Street and at Elmsley Villa from 1856 until the new College building opened on Spadina Crescent in 1875. In locating Knox College on this site which terminates the vista of the southern half of Spadina Avenue in 1873, the Presbyterian Church provided the college with a visual prominence and landmark presence in the city that it had not had in the previous 30 years of its existence. In locating it as a terminating feature of a northward vista up an avenue it followed a pattern that had been established throughout the nineteenth century for public institutions and residential estates in the Town of York/City of Toronto. Today the most prominent examples of this pattern are City Hall (1885-1899), the Ontario Legislature Buildings (1886-1892) and Upper Canada College (1891) but these, of course, did not exist at the time of the purchase of Spadina Crescent. However numerous other institutions such as the original east wing of Osgoode Hall (1829) at the top of York Street, Trinity College (1851) at the top of Strachan Avenue, The Normal School (1851-2) at the top of Bond Street, and grand houses such as the Grange (1818) at the top of John Street had contributed to the pattern. (Image 43)

The other characteristic of the siting of these institutions was their setting within a green space which enabled them to be appreciated from many directions. As Knox College was located at the heart of the Spadina Crescent circle the viewpoints were multiple. Still it is evident that the south façade terminating the northward vista of Spadina Avenue was the most important. In September 1873 the Canadian Illustrated News published an illustration of the College (Image 5) announcing:

Another addition is being made to the architectural adornments of the city of Toronto in the new Knox College building now being erected on the Crescent at the head of Spadina Avenue.¹⁷

Before construction had begun, the significance of this project to the city as a whole was recognized and its location at the top of the southern portion of Spadina Avenue an important part. It is significant for preserving the original William Warren Baldwin plan for Spadina Avenue and Crescent Gardens which was an important element in the centre of the avenue and one which Baldwin had thought important enough to deed to the City. Today, while Spadina Avenue continues to evolve and change, Knox College has for more than 140 years been a constant landmark and continues to be an "architectural adornment of the city." (Images 44 and 45)

3. EVALUATION CHECKLIST

The following evaluation applies <u>Ontario Regulation 9/06 made under the Ontario</u> <u>Heritage Act: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest</u>. While the criteria are prescribed for municipal designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, the City of Toronto uses it when assessing properties for inclusion on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties. The evaluation table is marked "N/A" if the criterion is "not applicable" to the property or X if it is applicable, with explanatory text below.

Design or Physical Value	
i. rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method	
ii. displays high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit	
iii. demonstrates high degree of scientific or technical achievement	

Rare, Unique and Early Example of a Style and Type with a High Degree of Craftsmanship –

Knox College has cultural heritage value as a rare and excellent example of a High Victorian Gothic style college building in Toronto. The building is particularly distinguished by the high degree of artistic merit and craftsmanship evident in the variety and complexity the composition of its form and massing with its dominant tower, asymmetrical second tower, projecting wings and steeply pitched roofs as well as in the intricately detailed elements including the variety of windows, stained glass, chimneys, finials, buttresses and unique string and belt courses The combination of buff brick and stone are typical characteristics of the Gothic revival styles in Toronto.

Historical or Associative Value	
i. direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or	X

¹⁷ Canadian Illustrated News, August 1873, p 162, 164.

institution that is significant to a community	
ii. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an	Χ
understanding of a community or culture	
iii. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder,	Х
designer or theorist who is significant to a community	

Institutions -

Historically, the property is valued for its associations with Knox College, as the first purpose-built complex for this institution which emerged in Canada West in the 1840s. It is also associated with the Canadian war effort for both World War 1 as the site of the care for soldiers and for World War II as the location of accelerated production of vaccines for the front. In 1918 Amelia Earhart was a nurse's aide through the Volunteer Aid Detachment organization. The property is further valued for its association with Connaught Laboratories from 1943-1972 which was internationally recognized as a leader in the development and production of vaccines including insulin, penicillin and in the 1950s the anti-polio vaccine.

Understanding of a community and culture- The cultural heritage value of Knox College is also reflected in the site's connection to an institution of significance in the cultural life of Toronto during the second half of the 19th century. The form of the building, its allocation of internal spaces and the prominence given to particular ones including the lecture hall, library, museum and dining hall conveys an understanding of the life of the Presbyterian seminary community at that time.

Architect - Knox College has value for the site's historical associations with the firm of Smith & Gemmel (James Avon Smith and John Gemmell) whose 40 year partnership (1872-1910) produced a significant body of work which though concentrated in Toronto extended across the country. While their work included a wide variety of commissions, they were best known for the extensive ecclesiastical work. Designed at the beginning of the partnership Knox College remains one of their most prominent projects.

Contextual Value	
i. important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area	X
ii. physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings	X
iii. landmark	X

Defines the Character of an Area and Surroundings Contextually Knox College has cultural heritage value as it is visually and historically linked to the evolution of the city of Toronto and the growth of the Spadina/University of Toronto neighbourhood as its functions and presence have been a significant contributor to both. Its distinctive late 19th century architectural form and dominant tower contributes to the character of the area where it is an important local landmark and a significant feature on the neighbourhood's skyline. Situated at the heart of Spadina Crescent, it maintains the original circular form of Crescent Gardens and the original street pattern which dates back to the 1830s.

Landmark – Knox College is valued for its contribution to a distinctive and historic urban pattern in the City of Toronto by being terminating the northern vista of an avenue and facing south towards Lake Ontario along with numerous other prominent institutions including Old City Hall, the Ontario Legislature Building, and Upper Canada College. Situated at the top of Spadina Avenue with its dramatic tower Knox College has been valued as a prominent Toronto landmark since its building was announced in the press in 1873 and it continues to be "an adornment for the City."

4. SUMMARY

Following research and evaluation according to Regulation 9/06, it has been determined that the building known historically as Knox College at 1 Spadina Avenue is worthy of designation for the site's design, associative, historical and landmark values. Knox College is valued as a rare and excellent example of a High Victorian Gothic style college building in Toronto designed by the firm of Smith & Gemmell. It is historically associated with the 1840s reformation of the Presbyterian Church and the creation of a new seminary in Toronto. Named for John Knox, the reformation leader of the Scottish church, Knox College is the first purpose built seminary for the newly reformed Scottish Free Presbyterian church. As the location of the Spadina Military Hospital in World War I, where Amelia Earhart was a volunteer and as the location of Connaught Laboratories from 1943 to accelerate the production of vaccines for soldiers at the front, the site is associated with support for the well being of Canadian forces in both World Wars. Connaught Laboratories was also distinguished for the development and production of polio vaccines in the 1950s. Contextually the site has preserved the original form of Crescent Gardens laid out on Spadina Avenue in the 1830s. Terminating the northwards vista of Spadina Avenue, Knox College has been valued as a prominent Toronto landmark since its building was announced in the press in 1873 and it continues to be "an adornment for the City."

SOURCES

Primary Sources

Browne, H. J., *Plan of the City of Toronto*, 1862. (City of Toronto Archives) *Canadian Illustrated News*, August 1873, p 162, 164. (Toronto Reference Library)
Cane, James, *Topographical Map of the City and Liberties of Toronto*, 1842. (City of Toronto Archives.)
Connaught Laboratory Archives Images (provided by ERA Architects Inc.)
Gascard, G. *City of Toronto Bird's Eye View from the Northern Railway elevator*, 1876 (Toronto Public Library, TRL, J. Ross Robertson Collection, JRR 745).
Knox College Archives Photos (digital copies provided by ERA Architects, Inc.) *The Globe*, August 22, 1873, p.3 Tender call for Knox College
Goad Charles E. *Atlas of the City of Toronto and Suburbs*, 1884, 1890, 1899, 1903, 1913, 1924. (City of Toronto Archives)

Smith & Gemmel Drawings for Knox College, August 1873. (digital copies provided by ERA Architects Inc.)

The Mail, April 3, 1874, p. 4 (Toronto Reference Library)

The Mail, August 25, 1875, p. 4 (Toronto Reference Library)

Wesbroom, W., City of Toronto, 1886, Bird's Eye View (Toronto Reference Library)

Secondary Sources

Amelia Earhart <u>http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Amelia Earhart</u> accessed May 15, 2014 Arthur, Eric, *Toronto: No Mean City*, 3rd ed., revised by Stephen A. Otto, 1986 Connaught Laboratories Ltd./Sanofi Pasteur Ltd.

http://www.sanofipasteur.ca/node/17302

http://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/en/article/sanofi-pasteur-limited/ accessed May 15, 2014

Dendy, William, Lost Toronto, 2nd ed., 1993

Donegan, Rosemary with Rick Salutin introduction, Spadina Avenue, 1985.

Kalman, Harold. A History of Canadian Architecture, Vol.1, Toronto, 1994

ERA Architects, "Heritage Impact Assessment, 1 Spadina Crescent", 2013, revised 2014.

Kalman, Harold, A History of Canadian Architecture, Vol. 1, 1994

Lundell, Liz, The Estates of Old Toronto. 1997

Richardson, Douglas. "The Campus in the Nineteenth Century: toward a visual history through architectural drawings, and archival photographs." Exhibition and catalogue at the Justina M Barnicke Gallery, Hart House, University of Toronto, 1987

"John Knox" http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/John_Knox

Accessed may 10, 2014

Knox College, Toronto

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Knox College, Toronto

accessed May 10, 2014

"Smith, James Avon" entry in *The Biographical Dictionary of Architects in Canada*, 1800-1950, <u>http://www.dictionaryofarchitectsincanada.org/architects/view/1313</u> Accessed May 11, 2014 5. IMAGES, - **arrows** mark the location of the property on some of the images below



1. <u>City of Toronto Property Data Map</u>: showing the location of the property at 1 Spadina Crescent north of the intersection of College Street and Spadina (ERA Architects Inc.)



2. <u>Topographical Map of the City and Liberties of Toronto</u>, detail, Cane, 1842: showing Spadina Avenue stretching from the Second Concession Road (top of

Alterations to a Designated Heritage Property, Designation Amendment and Authority to Enter into an HEA - 1 Spadina Crescent

map, now Bloor Street) to the lake shore. Crescent Gardens are marked with an arrow. (*City of Toronto Archives*)



3. <u>Topographical Map of the City and Liberties of Toronto, detail, Cane, 1842:</u> showing Spadina Avenue as laid out in 1836 with its series of formal gardens; the arrow at the left marks Crescent Gardens. The second arrow indicates the location of Knox College at Elmsley Villa prior to 1875 (*City of Toronto Archives*)



4. <u>Browne, H. J., Plan of the City of Toronto, 1862:</u> showing Crescent Gardens (left) and the proximity to the newly completed University College. Note at the right the encroachment of what would be Bay Street upon the Elmsley Villa site where

Alterations to a Designated Heritage Property, Designation Amendment and Authority to Enter into an HEA – 1 Spadina Crescent
Knox College was located until 1875. (City of Toronto Archives)



5. <u>Canadian Illustrated News, 13 September, 1873, p.164</u>: showing the New Knox College viewed from the south east (*Toronto Public Reference Library*)



6. <u>Smith & Gemmel, Ground Floor Plan, August 1873:</u> showing the principle organization of the College plan described as an E with a symmetrical south front with projecting central bay and tower, two projecting outer wings at the east and west, with the further projection of the main lecture hall from the east wing and dining hall from the west side. Beyond the dining hall the service areas were located and behind the lecture hall a cloister provided

access to the quadrangle and toilet block at the north east end. The third prong of the E was provided by the projecting staircase also flanked by lavatories and ablutions facilities. Other accommodation included the senate room, visitor's room, professor's rooms, secretaries room, class rooms, lecture halls, and housekeepers room



7. <u>Smith & Gemmel, Knox College First Floor Plan, August 1873:</u> showing the library including the tower and the gallery overlooking the lecture hall (upper left), reading rooms and student rooms



8. <u>Smith & Gemmel, Knox College Second Floor Plan, August 1873:</u> showing the museum including the tower, students' rooms and bathrooms adjacent to the main stair



9. <u>Smith & Gemmel, Knox College East Elevation and CrossSection, August 1873</u>: showing the East façade with the second tower, lecture hall, secondary entrance and stone and copper details. The section shows the entry and grand stair library above and museum with roof trusses including the tower. It also shows the elevations of the service wing; the



one on the far right was built with a second story. Note that the service windows do not have the five over two sash of the other rooms

10. <u>Smith & Gemmel, Knox College West Elevation and CrossSection, August 1873:</u> showing the west façade with the dining room wing, secondary entrance, servants yard and accommodation (without the second floor). The middle cross section shos the interior of the Lecture with its elaborate hammer beam roof with circular tie beams and gallery. The top section shows the elevation of the courtyard with the cloister



11. <u>Smith & Gemmel, Knox College Rear Elevation, August 1873:</u> showing the north faces of the complex including at from left to right the lecture hall, the service quadrangle wall with gate, the central block with staircase tower (the windows are not shown as built), the service wings and dining hall wing , the façade with the dining room wing, secondary entrance, servants yard



12. <u>Knox College, south-east facades:</u> photographed in 1885 (Toronto Reference Library, Baldwin Room, E5-54)



13. Knox College, south facade: photographed in 2013 (ERA Architects Inc.)



14. <u>Knox College East Façade</u>: showing at right the flat-roofed 1918-1923 addition during the military hospital phase and the alteration to the lecture hall which saw the insertion of two additional floor levels and the removal of the original double height lancet windows (compare Images 9 and 11)(*ERA Architects Inc.*)



15. <u>Knox College West Façade</u>: showing at left the addition of a one story building in the service yard (ERA Architects Inc.)



16. <u>Knox College, Detail of Central Bay and Tower with Main Entrance</u>: photograph from 1943 showing the Corinthian columns resting on buttresses at the corner of the tower, flanking the entry and at the second floor rose window and between adjacent pairs of windows. Note original sash with five over two lights at the ground level (*Connaught Laboratory Archives, ags327.*)



17. <u>Knox College, Main Entry Door, Detail:</u> showing wood lintel with band of Gothic trefoil motif below lobed pointed arched transom light with three pointed arched lights, carved stone details in column capitals and arch as well as the circular moulded brick alternating with stone to provide a roll moulding at the edge of the arched opening. (*Heritage Preservation Services May 2014*)



18. <u>Knox College Tower Main Entry Door and Second Floor Rose Window:</u> showing the projecting stone gable roofed frame with adjacent buttresses, stone keystones adjacent to the columns and linen fold panelling in the door panels. The date in the quatrefoil in the gable reads 1874. Note the dark colour of door and window at left and the square window inserted in the rose window at the second floor. (Connaught Laboratories Archives, ACC0116, 1943 and ERA Architects Inc.)



19. <u>Knox College Tower Third Floor Windows:</u> showing the columns, and recessed windows of the museum which would have had stained glass (ERA Architects Inc.)



20. <u>Knox College Main Tower and East Entrance</u>: showing the details of the tower rondels with carved shields, pronounced long corbels, parapets and finials, wooden arcade and vertically seamed copper roof and stone door case, quatrefoil panels and transom light of east entry door (*ERA Architects Inc.*)



21. <u>Knox College, East Tower:</u> details of the east tower, east façade and south and west sides of the roof (ERA Architects Inc.)



22. <u>Knox College, south façade dormer and west façade dormer:</u> showing the variety in stone and brick work detailing. Note the west dormer window is original with its five over two double hung sash and featuring the circular muntin motif. (*ERA Architects Inc.*)



23. <u>Knox College, west façade and belt course and downspout detail</u>: showing the stone belt courses and integration of downspouts as well as the corner buttresses, finials and corbel detail at the roof eaves (*ERA Architects Inc.*)



24. <u>Knox College, Entry Vestibule:</u> showing the oak groin vaulted ceiling with stone bosses terminating the ribs and the tracery of the inner vestibule door (*Heritage Preservation Services, May 2014*)



25. <u>Knox College Entry and Main Staircase</u>: showing the archways, balustrade and stained glass windows. (*Knox College Archives, G-324-FC*)



26. <u>Knox College Main Staircase</u>: showing the balustrade and stained glass windows (Connaught Laboratory Archives ACC0111, 1943)



27. <u>Knox College, main lecture hall:</u> during Knox College occupation, 1875-1915 showing the triple volume hall with double-height lancet windows and hammer beam roof with circular section tie-beams (*Knox College Archives G-324-FC*)



28. <u>Knox College, main lecture hall:</u> showing the lecture hall subdivided for medical and laboratory uses with a second floor level and shorter lancet windows. Note circular tie beams still present (*Connaught Laboratory ArchivesAcc0131, 1943*)



29. <u>Knox College, Main Lecture Hall</u>: showing the 3rd level of the lecture hall as currently divided and during construction/renovation. (*Heritage Preservation Services, May 2014*)



30. <u>Knox College, Library, First Floor</u>: showing the library space with the raised room within the tower walls with original mouldings and furnishings during Knox College occupation (*Knox College Archives G-324-FC*)



31. <u>Knox College, Library, First Floor:</u> showing the library space with the raised room within the tower walls and the rose window during current renovations (*Heritage Preservation Services, May 2014*)



32. <u>Knox College, Museum, Second Floor:</u> showing the museum space as originally occupied and the exposed wooden trusses (*Heritage Preservation Services, May 2014*)



33. <u>Knox College, Museum, Second Floor:</u> showing the museum space with the smaller room within the tower walls and the exposed wooden trusses. Note the former arched windows

in the tower room that were subsequently modified with square headed ones (compare image 19) (*Heritage Preservation Services, May 2014*)



34. Knox College: showing wooden gates and fence in a photograph dated 1885-1895. (City of Toronto Archives, Fonds 1478, Item 0020, photo by F. W. Micklethwaite



35. <u>Knox College, Wrought Iron Gates:</u> photograph dated 1908 showing the wrought iron gates and formal drive and planting that replaced the earlier wooden gates. Note also the

stained glass in the upper windows of the library, the museum and in the transom light of the main entrance as well as the solid panelled doors. (*City of Toronto Archives, Fonds 1244, Item 321*)



36. <u>Goad's Atlas, 1884:</u> showing Knox College as completed almost a decade after opening in 1875. The symmetrical plan is evident on the southern half while various accretions begin on the northern side in the courtyard and with the extension of the service areas of laundry and kitchen at the north west (*City of Toronto Archives*)



37. <u>Goad's Atlas 1913:</u> showing Knox College with additions of both brick and wood construction in the courtyard even prior to the College's relocation to King's College Circle. (*City of Toronto Archives*)



38. <u>Goad's Atlas1924:</u> showing the college building now identified as Spadina House and with numerous additions and alterations on the north side. (*City of Toronto Archives*)



Solution 29. <u>Knox College East Elevation</u>: showing the addition north of the lecture hall c 1918-1923 and the removal of the full height lancet windows with the internal subdivision of the hall with additional floor level (*Connaught Laboratory Archives, ACC0844, 1943*)



40. <u>Knox College, third floor of the dining room wing(above) and main floor room</u>: showing the occupation of the college building by Connaught Laboratories, 1943-1972 (Connaught Laboratory Archives, ACC0517A, ACC0272, ACC0519A)



41. Knox College, East side of the Quadrangle: showing the removal of the original cloister and the introduction of loading bays for the laboratories after 1943. (Connaught Laboratory Archives, ACC0256)



42. <u>1 Spadina Crescent, aerial view</u>: showing the college complex from the northwest with the various accretions from 1918-23, 1943-72 and 1988-90. Most of the alterations and infill took place on the north side and in the quadrangle which was always determined by more functionalist concerns. The important elements of the original college building from the lecture hall on the east, the entire southern block and the dining hall wing in the west have all been retained. The additions have also been flat-roofed and lower than the original roofscape so that the primary silhouette and landmark quality from the south at least has been preserved. (*Tom Podolec Bing Images* http://www.bing.com/images/search?q=1+spadina+crese.

15&sp=3&sk=SC2#view=detail&id=FA224533AF82F4785ECF940051AD2A58D62C18B6&selectedIndex=24 Accessed May 20, 2014



43. <u>H. J. Browne, Plan of the City of Toronto, 1862 (detail)</u>: showing the various institutions set on north south vertical axis at the top of streets facing down towards Lake Ontario (from left to right) Trinity College, The Grange, Osgoode Hall, the Normal School (*City of Toronto Archives*)



44. <u>W. Wesbroom, City of Toronto, (detail) 1886:</u> bird's eye view showing the Knox College set in the open and green expanse of Spadina Crescent and terminating the axis of Spadina Avenue. (*Toronto Reference Library, Baldwin Room*)



45. <u>Spadina Avenue northwards toward 1 Spadina Crescent</u>: showing the landmark quality of Knox College building in terminating the vista (*City of Toronto Archives, Series 372, ss0058, Item 1443*)