



**STAFF REPORT
ACTION REQUIRED**

**Alterations to a Designated Heritage Property and
Authority to Enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement
– 150 Symes Road**

Date:	June 19, 2014
To:	Toronto Preservation Board Etobicoke York Community Council
From:	Director, Urban Design, City Planning Division
Wards:	Ward 11 - York South-Weston
Reference Number:	P:\2014\Cluster B\PLN\EYCC\EY14094

SUMMARY

This report recommends that City Council endorse the conservation strategy generally described in this report for the designated property at 150 Symes Road (Symes Road Incinerator) in conjunction with an application to amend the Official Plan and the existing Zoning By-law in order to facilitate the redevelopment of the site and rehabilitate the historic incinerator, provided the Symes Road Incinerator is retained, conserved and subject to a Heritage Easement Agreement. Should City Council endorse this strategy, staff recommend that Council require the owner to enter into and register a Heritage Easement Agreement with the City and authorize staff to take the necessary steps to enter into such Heritage Easement Agreement, to ensure the long-term protection of 150 Symes Road.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council approve the alterations to the property at 150 Symes Road, in accordance with Section 33 of the Ontario Heritage Act, to allow for the rehabilitation of the property in accordance with the plans and drawings prepared by Jedd Jones Architect Ltd. dated June 5, 2014 and the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) prepared by Philip Goldsmith Architect dated May 23, 2013, both on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services and subject to the following conditions:

- a. Prior to the issuance of Final Site Plan approval, the owner shall have:
 - i. Entered into and registered a Heritage Easement Agreement for the property at 150 Symes Road substantially in accordance with the Heritage Impact Assessment prepared by Philip Goldsmith Architect dated May 23, 2013 and subject to and in accordance with the herein required Conservation Plan, all to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, including registration of such agreement to the satisfaction of the City Solicitor.
 - ii. Provided a Conservation Plan, prepared by a qualified heritage consultant, that is consistent with the conservation strategy set out in the Heritage Impact Assessment for the property at 150 Symes Road prepared by Philip Goldsmith Architect dated May 23, 2013 to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.
 - iii. Completed all heritage-related pre-approval conditions contained in a Notice of Approval Conditions for Site Plan Control to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.
 - iv. Provided Final Site Plan drawings including drawings related to the approved Conservation Plan to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.
 - v. The related Zoning By-law and Official Plan amendments giving rise to the proposed alterations shall be in full force and effect in a form and with content acceptable to the City Council, as determined by the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning in consultation with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.
- b. Prior to the issuance of a Heritage Permit, the owner shall have:
 - i. Provided full building permit drawings, including notes and specifications for the protective measures keyed to the approved Conservation Plan, including a description of materials and finishes, to be prepared by the project architect and heritage consultant to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.
 - ii. Provided a Letter of Credit, indexed annually, in a form and amount satisfactory to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services to secure all work included in the Conservation Plan.
- c. Prior to the release of the Letter of Credit, the owner shall have:

- i. Provided a letter of substantial completion prepared and signed by the heritage consultant confirming that the conservation work has been completed in accordance with the Conservation Plan and has maintained an appropriate standard of conservation, to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.
 - ii. Provided replacement Heritage Easement Agreement photographs to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.
2. City Council grant authority for the execution of a Heritage Easement Agreement under Section 37 of the Ontario Heritage Act with the owner of the property at 150 Symes Road.
3. City Council authorize the City Solicitor to introduce the necessary bills in Council authorizing the entering into of the Heritage Easement Agreement.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY

A preliminary report on the planning application was adopted without amendment by the Planning and Growth Management Committee at its meeting of October 22, 2013 recommending that staff review the additional uses proposed by this application and that City Planning staff hold a community consultation meeting. The preliminary report for this application can be found at:

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2013/pg/bgrd/backgroundfile-62377.pdf>

The property at 150 Symes Road is designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act by By-law No. 73-2014, enacted by City Council on January 30, 2014.

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/bylaws/2014/law0073.pdf>

BACKGROUND

Heritage Resource

The designation by-law covers only that part of the redevelopment site on which the historic incinerator is situated, extending west to just east of the existing garage building.

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

The Symes Road Incinerator is a well-crafted excellent representative example of a public works building designed with Art Deco features, which is particularly distinguished by its pyramidal massing, banding and linear decoration that are hallmarks of the style. It is part of a collection of civic architecture in the former City of Toronto with Art Deco styling that dates to the early 1930s and includes the landmark Horse Palace at Exhibition Place.

The Office of the City Architect designed the Symes Road Incinerator in a collaboration between Chief Architect J. J. Woolnough, his assistant and successor K. S. Gillies, and

their chief designer, architect Stanley J. T. Fryer. During the early 1930s, this team produced an impressive series of civic buildings that were characterized and distinguished by Art Deco styling and included the Symes Road Incinerator.

Contextually, the property at 150 Symes Road is historically associated with its surroundings as a notable survivor from the industrial enclave anchored by the former Ontario Stockyards that developed in the early 20th century along St. Clair Avenue West, west of Weston Road in West Toronto.

Heritage Attributes

The heritage attributes of the property at 150 Symes Road are:

- The Symes Road incinerator
- The materials, with brick cladding and brick, stone, metal and glass detailing
- The scale, form and massing of the near-square three-storey plan, with the two-storey section set back from and rising above the single-storey podium that is angled at the northeast corner
- The base with window openings, which is raised on the rear (west) elevation with ramps and openings for cargo doors
- The cornices along the rooflines of the first and third stories and, at the east end, the chimney
- On the principal (east) façade, the entrance block where the main entry is asymmetrically placed
- The main (east) entry, which is set in a stone frontispiece where paired doors and a transom are flanked by narrow sidelights and surmounted by a metal canopy, the datestone incised "1933", and linear stone detailing
- The secondary opening at the north end of the east façade
- The fenestration on all elevations, with flat-headed openings and, in the third storey, distinctive round windows
- The Art Deco detailing that includes the distinctive horizontal banding
- The original placement and setback of the Symes Incinerator near the southwest corner of Symes Road and Glen Scarlett Road where it is viewed from both streets

Development Proposal

The applicant proposes to redevelop the site for employment uses by constructing three new one and two storey buildings on the west and north portions of the site and rehabilitating both the service garage and the historic incinerator. The redevelopment is proposed to be phased with the rehabilitation of the service garage and historic incinerator to occur first.

Policy Framework

Planning Act and Provincial Policy Statement

The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS), 2014 provides policy direction on matters of provincial interest related to land use planning and development. These policies support

the goal of enhancing the quality of life for all Ontarians. Key policy objectives include: building strong, healthy communities; wise use and management of resources; and protecting public health and safety. The PPS recognizes that local context and character is important. Policies are outcome oriented, and some policies provide flexibility in their implementation provided that provincial interests are upheld. City Council's planning decisions are required to be consistent with the PPS.

The Planning Act and the associated Provincial Policy Statement guide development in the Province and they include provincial interests regarding heritage resources as described in the Provincial Policy Statement issued under the authority of Section 3 of the Planning Act. The Planning Act requires that all decisions affecting land use planning matters "shall be consistent with" the Provincial Policy Statement. The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) provides direction on matters of provincial interest related to land use planning and development, and promotes the provincial policy-led planning system.

Provincial Policy Statement 2.6.1 directs that "Significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved." Properties included on the City's Inventory of Heritage Properties are considered to be significant in this context. In the PPS 2014, *conserved* is defined as "the identification, protection, use and/or management of built heritage resources in a manner that ensures their cultural heritage value or interest is retained under the Ontario Heritage Act."

Official Plan

Policy 3.1.5.2 of the Official Plan states that "Heritage resources on properties listed on the City's Inventory of Heritage Properties will be conserved."

At its meeting of April 3, and 4, 2013, Toronto City Council adopted amendments to the Official Plan heritage policies. By-law 468-2013 enacting these policies has been appealed to the Ontario Municipal Board. While the amendments are not yet in force, HPS has also considered the proposal within the context of these amended policies.

The Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada

In 2008 Toronto City Council adopted the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada as the official document guiding planning, stewardship and conservation approach for all listed and designated heritage resources within the City of Toronto.

COMMENTS

Proposed Conservation Strategy

The property at 150 Symes Road has been abandoned since 1996 and the majority of the conservation work will address the resulting vandalism. The applicant has indicated his commitment to the conservation and reuse of the historic incinerator as a primary objective of the overall proposal.

The new one and two storey buildings are proposed to be located at the western half of the site, the closest being approximately 33m from the historic incinerator. They are proposed to be designed in a simple contemporary industrial style with windows and pre-finished metal siding.

The majority of the impacts to the heritage property occur to the window and other openings and to the truck access ramp on the west elevation.

The proposed conservation strategy includes the following interventions:

- Existing window openings would receive new windows
- Existing truck doors would be removed and new glazing installed
- The former basement truck door, since removed, be altered to accommodate a new large window
- The former opening for connection to the now demolished chimneys would be re-opened with windows installed
- A new window well would be introduced on the east side
- The existing ramp would be mostly removed with a portion to remain as a stair landing

Assessment of Heritage Impacts

HPS has considered the proposal in the context of the Provincial Policy Statement 2014, the existing City of Toronto Official Plan Policies, Council adopted amendments to the Official Plan Policies and the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada.

The location of the new buildings, along with their one and two storey heights, is respectful of the Symes Road Incinerator and will have no adverse impact on its heritage attributes.

It is recognized that the existing multi-lighted steel windows are in very poor condition and that high-performance replacement windows will be required. The applicant is proposing new metal windows in a contemporary design that reflects the original division proportions. This approach, while not replicating the original, will provide a sympathetic yet legible alternative that makes it clear the windows are contemporary.

The large truck door openings are to be replaced with glazing as they are no longer required to accommodate trucks. The original size of the openings and the steel door transoms will remain. The former basement truck door has already been altered and its replacement with a window has little impact on its integrity.

The chimneys were demolished in the 1970s and the rehabilitation of its former connection to the building as a new window has no adverse impact.

The west elevation ramp leading up to the large service opening will also no longer be required and a portion of it will be retained and re-used with a stair, as access to the

building. Unique ground paving will be introduced from the remnant ramp outward to indicate the location and importance of the original ramp.

The masonry will be cleaned and conserved, the roofing and gutters will be replaced and general repairs will be undertaken.

CONCLUSION

The proposed rehabilitation of the historic Symes Road Incinerator retains its heritage attributes while allowing for new uses. The proposed alterations contained within the Official Plan Amendment and Rezoning application for 150 Symes Road as described in this report and, subject to the conditions set forth in the recommendations of this report, are consistent with the Provincial Policy Statement, the City of Toronto Official Plan Heritage Policies, the City of Toronto Official Plan revised Heritage Policies (By-law 468-2013), and the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada.

CONTACT

Mary L. MacDonald, Acting Manager
Heritage Preservation Services
Tel: 416-338-1079; Fax: 416-392-1973
E-mail: mmacdon7@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Harold Madi
Director, Urban Design
City Planning Division

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment No. 1 – Location Map
Attachment No. 2 – Site Plan, 150 Symes Road
Attachment No. 3 – Archival Photographs, 150 Symes Road
Attachment No. 4 – Photographs, East and West Elevations, 150 Symes Road
Attachment No. 5 – Photographs, East and West Elevations, 150 Symes Road
Attachment No. 6 – Proposal: East and West Elevations, 150 Symes Road
Attachment No. 7 – Proposal: North and South Elevations, 150 Symes Road