Alterations to Designated Heritage Properties Within the Harbord Village Phase 2 Heritage Conservation District – 562, 564 and 566 Spadina Crescent

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date:</th>
<th>November 15, 2013</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| To:      | Toronto Preservation Board  
           Toronto and East York Community Council |
| From:    | Acting Director, Urban Design, City Planning Division |
| Ward:    | Ward 20 Trinity-Spadina |
| Reference Number: | P:\2013\Cluster B\PLN\HPS\TEYCC\January 15 2014\teHPS45 |

**SUMMARY**

This report recommends that City Council refuse the proposed alterations to the contributing heritage buildings in accordance with the Harbord Village Phase 2 Heritage Conservation District Plan (“the Plan”).

The applicant has submitted an Application to Alter a Designated Structure under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act and a Notice of Receipt was issued on October 31, 2013. The decision of City Council must be provided to the applicant prior to January 30, 2014 which is ninety days from the issuance of a Notice of Receipt.

**RECOMMENDATIONS**

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council refuse the alterations to the heritage properties at 562, 564 and 566 Spadina Crescent under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, in accordance with plans and drawings prepared by JCI Architects, dated April 11, 2013, date-stamped received by Heritage Preservation Services September 16, 2013, and on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services; and the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), prepared by MW Hall Corporation, dated April 15, 2013, date-stamped received by Heritage Preservation Services October 31, 2013, and on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.
2. If the owner appeals City Council’s decision to refuse the application for alterations to the heritage properties at 562, 564 and 566 Spadina Crescent under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, City Council authorize the City Solicitor and the necessary City staff to attend the Ontario Municipal Board hearing in opposition to the appeal.

**Financial Impact**
There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report

**DECISION HISTORY**
The properties at 562, 564 and 566 Spadina Crescent are contributing properties located within the Harbord Village Phase 2 Heritage Conservation District ("the District"), designated by City Council by By-law No. 28-2011 on December 16, 2010. The designation by-law is registered on title of all properties located within the District.

**ISSUE BACKGROUND**

**Properties**
Constructed as a three unit row, the two-storey flat-roofed structures at 562, 564 and 566 Spadina Crescent have been identified in the Plan as contributing to the heritage character of the District in that they retain sufficient original heritage fabric to allow for preservation or restoration. According to historic maps, the buildings appear to have been constructed sometime between 1903 and 1913. Contextually, the significant elements of the District include its fine grain pattern of development and the eclectic diversity of the built form.

**Proposal**
The decision of City Council must be provided to the applicant prior to January 30, 2014 which is ninety days from the issuance of a Notice of Receipt.

The applicant proposes to alter the contributing heritage properties by constructing third storey gable-roofed additions thereby changing their original height and form as flat-roofed, two-storey buildings. The proposal would also result in modifications to the windows, doors and porches.

**COMMENTS**
The HCD Plan provides clear direction for additions to properties within the District as follows:

- Alterations to the rear of properties must not be higher than the ridge of the main rooftop line of the property as seen from any point on the public sidewalk on the opposite side of the street.
- Additions and alterations which erode the heritage features or character of contributing buildings will not be permitted

- Additions must not overwhelm the original building

- Additions which are visible from the street or public sidewalk should be compatible in material, window and door openings and general proportion with the main building

The proposed new third storey gable-roofed additions atop the existing flat roofed two-storey buildings would be fully visible and completely change the original height, form and roof style of the contributing heritage buildings. Further, the HCD Plan directs that the restoration of lost heritage features must be supported by documentation and the applicant has provided no evidence to support new gabled third storeys.

Historic maps and aerial photographs indicate that the properties exhibit a flat roof condition from 1913 to the present time, thus disproving any speculation that the buildings may have been a bay and gable design at an earlier time. There do not appear to have been any significant alterations made to the buildings relating to their roof shape, footprint or window and door openings.

The proposal would further result in modifications to the windows, doors and porches – all of which are in contravention of the Plan. Replacement windows must match originals in size, proportion, division and location. The applicant proposes to relocate two of the windows on the main elevations and replace all windows with new. The drawings submitted with the application show windows that do not match the originals.

New replacement doors should match the original or, where original doors have been lost, should be based on archival evidence from adjoining properties by the same builder. The proposed new doors, as shown on the drawings, do not comply with the requirements in the HCD Plan.

The HCD Plan provides detailed requirements for porches such as wood construction, matching original or being in the same character of porches of houses constructed by the same builder or of the same style in the area. The proposed new porches do not satisfy any of the above requirements in the HCD Plan relating to porches.

The Plan's Heritage Value Statement identifies the area's eclectic diversity of its built form as significant. While the subject buildings are two storeys and are of a later and more modest construction than adjacent properties on Spadina Crescent, they represent the evolution of the area in response to the rapid growth of Toronto at the time. As such,
the contributing heritage properties at 562-566 Spadina Crescent should be conserved and not radically modified so as to eradicate their original form and integrity.

Staff's recommendation to refuse the application is supported by the Harbord Village Phase 2 HCD Advisory Committee.

CONTACT
Mary L. MacDonald, Acting Manager
Heritage Preservation Services
Tel: 416-338-1079; Fax: 416-392-1973
E-mail: mmacdon7@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

_______________________________
James Parakh
Acting Director, Urban Design
City Planning Division

ATTACHMENTS
Attachment No. 1 – Location Map
Attachment No. 2 – Photograph 562-566 Spadina Crescent East Elevation
Attachment No. 3 – Photograph 562 Spadina Crescent & Adjacent Building
Attachment No. 4 - Proposal Rendering
Attachment No. 5 – Proposed East Elevation
Attachment No. 6 – Proposed North Elevation
PHOTOGRAPH: 562 SPADINA CRESCENT & ADJACENT BUILDING

ATTACHMENT NO. 3