Alterations to a Heritage Property, Intention to Designate under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act and Authority to Enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement – 1183 Dufferin Street (Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church)

Date: March 25, 2014
To: Toronto Preservation Board
    Toronto & East York Community Council
From: Director, Urban Design, City Planning Division
Wards: Ward 18 – Davenport
Reference Number: P:\2014\Cluster B\PLN\TEYCC\TE14019

SUMMARY

This report recommends that City Council approve the proposed alterations and rear addition to the property located at 1183 Dufferin Street (Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church). The applicant is proposing to convert an existing place of worship into 14 residential units, with a rear addition and a one level below-grade garage for 11 parking spaces.

Following the evaluation of the site according to Ontario Regulation 9/06, the criteria prescribed for municipal designation, the report also recommends that City Council state its intention to designate the property at 1183 Dufferin Street (Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church) under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for its cultural heritage value. While the building was damaged by fire in January 2014, the evaluation determined that the building retains and continues to effectively communicate its cultural heritage values and attributes.
RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council approve the proposed alterations to the existing church building and construction of a new rear addition on the heritage property at 1183 Dufferin Street substantially in accordance with the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) prepared by James Bailey Architect dated March 1, 2012 and Addendum dated March 24, 2014 including the drawings prepared by Torplan Consultants Incorporated dated January 16, 2014, subject to the following conditions:

   a. Prior to the introduction of the necessary Bills in Council for the Zoning By-law Amendment, the owner shall:

      i. Enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement with the City for the property at 1183 Dufferin Street, to be registered on title;
      ii. Provide a Conservation Plan prepared by a qualified heritage consultant that is consistent with the conservation strategy set out in the Heritage Impact Statement dated March 1, 2012 and Addendum dated March 24, 2014 for the property at 1183 Dufferin Street prepared by James Bailey Architect, to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services; and

   b. That prior to final Site Plan Approval:

      i. The owner shall provide final site plan drawings including drawings related to the approved conservation plan to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
      ii. Provide a detailed landscape plan for the subject property;
      iii. Submit a Lighting Plan that describes how the heritage property will be sensitively illuminated to enhance its heritage character to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
      iv. The owner shall complete all heritage related pre-approval conditions contained in a Notice of Approval Conditions for Site Plan Control;
      v. The related Zoning By-law amendment shall be in full force and effect; and

   c. That prior to the issuance of any heritage permit the owner shall:

      i. Provide full building permit drawings, including notes and specifications for the conservation and protective measures keyed to the approved Conservation Plan, including a description of materials and finishes, to be prepared by the project architect and heritage consultant to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
ii. Provide a Letter of Credit, indexed annually, in a form and amount satisfactory to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services to secure all work included in the Conservation Plan, Lighting Plan and Landscape Plan; and

d. That prior to the release of the Letter of Credit, the owner shall provide a letter of substantial completion prepared and signed by a qualified heritage consultant confirming that the conservation work has been completed in accordance with the Conservation Plan and has maintained an appropriate standard of conservation, to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.

2. City Council state its intention to designate the property at 1183 Dufferin Street (Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church) under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, in accordance with the Statement of Significance: 1183 Dufferin Street (Reasons for Designation) attached as Attachment No. 4 to the report (March 25, 2014) from the Director, Urban Design, City Planning Division.

3. If there are no objections to the designation in accordance with Section 29(6) of the Ontario Heritage Act, City Council authorize the City Solicitor to introduce the bill in Council designating the property under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

4. If there are objections in accordance with Section 29(7) of the Ontario Heritage Act, City Council direct the City Clerk to refer the designation to the Conservation Review Board.

5. If the designation is referred to the Conservation Review Board, City Council authorize the City Solicitor and appropriate staff to attend any hearing held by the Conservation Review Board in support of Council's decision on the designation of the property.

6. City Council grant authority for the execution of a Heritage Easement Agreement under Section 37 of the Ontario Heritage Act with the owner of the property at 1183 Dufferin Street (Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church).

7. City Council authorize the City Solicitor to introduce the necessary bill in Council authorizing the entering into of a Heritage Easement Agreement for the property at 1183 Dufferin Street (Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church).

Financial Impact
There are no financial implications resulting from adoption of this report

DECISION HISTORY
City Council included this property on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties on May 23, 2006. The Council decision can be found at the following link:
At its meeting of October 10, 2012, Toronto and East York Community Council considered a report entitled 1183 Dufferin Street- Official Plan Amendment and Zoning Amendment Applications – Preliminary Report. Their decision can be found at the following link:


BACKGROUND

Development Proposal

The applicant is proposing to convert an existing place of worship into 14 residential units, with a rear addition and a one level below-grade garage for 11 parking spaces.

The report from the Director of Planning for Toronto and East York on the related OPA/Rezoning applications will be before Toronto and East York Community Council and Toronto City Council for consideration in conjunction with this report.

Policy Framework

Planning Act and Provincial Policy Statement

The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) provides policy direction on matters of provincial interest related to land use planning and development. The PPS sets the policy foundation for regulating the development and use of land. The key objectives include: building strong communities; wise use and management of resources; and, protecting public health and safety. City Council’s planning decisions are required to be consistent with the PPS.

The Planning Act and associated Provincial Policy Statement guide development in the Province and they include provincial interests regarding heritage resources as described in the Provincial Policy Statement issued under the authority of Section 3 of the Planning Act. The Planning Act requires that all decisions affecting land use planning matters "shall be consistent with" the Provincial Policy Statement. The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) provides direction on matters of provincial interest related to land use planning and development, and promotes the provincial policy-led planning system.

Provincial Policy Statement 2.6.1 states that "Significant built heritage resources and cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved". Properties designated under Part IV of the Act or included on the City's Inventory of Heritage Properties comprise "significant built heritage resources".

In the PPS 2014, "conserved" is defined as "identification, protection, management and use of built heritage resources, cultural heritage landscapes and archaeological resources in a manner that ensures their cultural heritage value or interest is retained under the Ontario Heritage Act". This may be achieved by the implementation of recommendations set out in a conservation plan, archaeological assessment, and/or
heritage impact assessment. Mitigative measures and/or alternative development approaches can be included in these plans and assessments.

**Official Plan**

Section 3.1.5 of the City of Toronto Official Plan (2005), states that significant heritage resources will be conserved. The interpretation policies of the Plan provided that use of the term "will" is prescriptive, to be interpreted as equivalent to "shall".

The heritage policies of the Official Plan were revised and approved by Council (OPA 199, By-law No. 468-2013) at its meeting of April 3, 2013, followed by approval from the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing. These policies give additional direction and clarity and include definitions for as follows:

**Alteration:** is any change to a property on the Heritage Register, in any manner including its restoration, renovation, repair or disturbance, or a change, demolition or removal of an adjacent property that may result in any change to a property on the Heritage Register.

**Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada**

In 2008 Toronto City Council adopted the Parks Canada document *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada* as the official document guiding planning, stewardship and conservation approach for all listed and designated heritage resources within the City of Toronto.

Of the nine standards that the Parks Canada *Standards and Guidelines* encourages for rehabilitation projects, the following standards offer relevant guidance for heritage conservation, rehabilitation and restoration in this instance:

- Conserve the *heritage value* of a historic place. Do not remove, replace, or substantially alter its intact or repairable *character-defining elements*. Do not move a part of a *historic place* if its current location is a *character-defining element*

- Conserve heritage value by adopting an approach calling for minimal intervention

- Find a use for an historic place that requires minimal or no change to its character-defining elements

- Evaluate the existing condition of *character-defining elements* to determine the appropriate *intervention* needed. Use the gentlest means possible for any intervention. Respect *heritage value* when undertaking an intervention.

- Maintain *character-defining elements* on an ongoing basis. Repair character-defining elements by reinforcing their materials using recognized conservation methods. Replace in kind any extensively deteriorated or missing parts of character-defining elements, where there are surviving *prototypes*.
• Make any intervention needed to preserve character-defining elements physically and visually compatible with the historic place and identifiable on close inspection. Document any intervention for future reference.

**Additional Standards Relating to Rehabilitation**

• Repair rather than replace character-defining elements. Where character-defining elements are too severely deteriorated to repair, and where sufficient physical evidence exists, replace them with new elements that match the forms, materials and detailing of sound versions of the same elements. Where there is insufficient physical evidence, make the form, material and detailing of the new elements compatible with the character of the historic place.

• Conserve the heritage value and character-defining elements when creating any new additions to an historic place or any related new construction. Make the new work physically and visually compatible with, subordinate to and distinguishable from the historic place.

• Create any new additions or related new construction so that the essential form and integrity of an historic place will not be impaired if the new work is removed in the future.

**Additional Standards Relating to Restoration**

• Repair rather than replace character-defining elements from the restoration period. Where character-defining elements are too severely deteriorated to repair and where sufficient physical evidence exists, replace them with new elements that match the forms, materials and detailing of sound versions of the same elements.

• Replace missing features from the restoration period with new features whose forms, materials and detailing are based on sufficient physical, documentary and/or oral evidence.

**COMMENTS**

**Heritage Resource**

The property at 1183 Dufferin Street contains the building known historically as Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church (1912), which was the second church built in this location and occupied by the congregation for over 80 years. The site was listed on the City's heritage inventory in 2006.

Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church has cultural heritage value as an early 20th century Neo-Gothic styled church in the Dovercourt neighbourhood that was designed by the important Toronto architect, W. R. Gregg and distinguished by its architectural detailing that includes a prominent corner tower and other medieval-inspired features. Contextually, Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church is valued for its historical and visual...
links to the Dovercourt community where it stands as an important reminder of the development of the neighbourhood and as a local landmark.

**Impact of fire**
The owner has submitted an OPA/Rezoning application and on January 21, 2014 submitted a Site Plan application to the city for re-development of the property. However, on January 31, 2014, a fire occurred at the property. The site came under control of the Ontario Fire Marshall (OFM) who directed that portions of the building be partially demolished to facilitate the OFM investigation. This partial demolition included removal of the main roof and upper sections (the gables) of the walls of both the primary west elevation (facing Dufferin Street) and the east elevation.

On February 11, 2014 the site was released by the OFM to the owner.

On Wednesday February 12, 2014 Toronto Building issued an Order to Remedy Unsafe Building. The order required the owner to retain the services of a professional engineer to review the fire damaged building and to provide a report that addresses a number of concerns and in particular to "include recommendations on the method to reconstruct the failed portion of the fire damaged areas" and that the engineer's report be "prepared in consultation with a Heritage Architect ensuring that the reconstruction and repair work is consistent with the heritage attributes of the building".

On February 21, 2014 the owners' consultant, NCK Engineering Ltd provided a Damage Assessment Report to Toronto Building that included analysis and recommendations based on fire damage to the roof and ground floor framing system along with the impact of the damage on the stability of the remaining north and south walls of the church building.

On March 4, 2014 a meeting was held between the owner and city staff to discuss the findings and recommendations of the engineering report which includes dismantling of the north and south walls to 3m above the finished floor of the existing church. At the time of this meeting, the heritage consultant stated that he had not had time to review and comment on the engineers' analysis. It was agreed that a further meeting needed to be held at the site and on March 6, 2014, city staff and the owner met to see the impact of the fire and to discuss the condition of each of the heritage attributes of the building and an appropriate strategy for conservation.

**Revised Conservation Strategy**
As per Council approved heritage policies, the proposed conservation strategy is one of rehabilitation and restoration.

On March 24, 2014, the owners' heritage consultant James Bailey Architect provided an Addendum to the Heritage Impact Assessment dated March 1, 2012 that responds to the concerns raised by city staff on the impacts of the fire to the current development application.
As a result of damage to the building by the fire and water, the heritage consultant does not recommend bracing the walls and instead agrees with the dismantling strategy recommended by the engineering consultant. The Addendum to the Heritage Impact Assessment of March 1, 2012 provides a revised conservation strategy for the rehabilitation and restoration of the heritage attributes including, but not limited to, the full restoration of the Dufferin Street elevation using salvaged brick, stone and amber glass from the north, south and east elevations of the building, the restoration and rehabilitation of the north and south elevations with salvaged and new brick as well as stone, and reconstruction of the main roof.

**Proposed alterations**

City staff have worked with the applicant on the proposed alterations to the church with a view to retaining the heritage attributes and to convert the use of the building from a single use to a condominium development with 14 residential units. While the fire has complicated matters in the short term, the longer term conservation remains generally the same.

The applicant wishes to provide entries into all condominium units from the exterior of the building. In this regard, the west (Dufferin Street) elevation including the square tower at the northwest corner will be fully retained and restored and existing doors on this elevation will become entrances for two of the condominium units.

In order to provide new entrances to the units along the north and south elevations, the existing three-part Tudor window openings will be altered such that the width of the original windows will be retained, but increased in length (above and below the existing openings) to include entrance doors and windows to provide natural light into the units. The arch at the top of the new window openings will match that of the original Tudor windows. Additionally, a new deck will be constructed along the length of the north and south walls with amenity areas for each of the condominium units along a common walkway. Along these side elevations, the brick buttresses with stone trim will be restored to match the existing architectural features affected by the fire.

The east (rear) elevation will be carefully dismantled so that the bricks from this wall may be used to restore the west elevation. A new addition will be added to the church on the east side of the building and will be constructed of glass and metal of a colour to match the brick of the existing church and will be of similar height to the existing church tower that forms part of the west elevation.

All materials, including the replacement brick, for the proposed alterations to the church will be reviewed and approved by Heritage Preservation Services.

**Heritage Evaluation and Designation**

A location map (Attachment No. 1) and photograph (Attachment No. 2) are attached.
Staff have completed the attached Heritage Property Research and Evaluation Report (Attachment No. 5) and determined that the property at 1183 Dufferin Street meets Ontario Regulation 9/06, the criteria prescribed for municipal designation. The property at 1183 Dufferin Street has design, associative and contextual values as a fine example of a Neo-Gothic-styled ecclesiastical building designed by the important Toronto architect W. R. Gregg that is historically and visually related to the Dovercourt neighbourhood where it stands as a local landmark.

Although the property at 1183 Dufferin Street was damaged by fire in January 2014, the evaluation determined that Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church retains its integrity as a cultural heritage resource that continues to effectively communicate its cultural heritage values and attributes.

The Statement of Significance (Attachment No. 4) comprises the Reasons for Designation, which is the Public Notice of Intention to Designate and will be advertised on the City of Toronto’s web site in accordance with the City of Toronto Act provisions and served on the property owners and the Ontario Heritage Trust according to the provisions of the Ontario Heritage Act.

CONCLUSION
For the reasons discussed in this report, Heritage Preservation Services recommends that City Council approve the proposed alterations and rear addition to the property located at 1183 Dufferin Street.

While the building was damaged by fire in January 2013, the heritage evaluation determined that the building retains and continues to effectively communicate its cultural heritage values and attributes. As such, HPS recommends that Council state its intention to designate the property at 1183 Dufferin Street and authorize entering into a Heritage Easement Agreement with the owner.

CONTACT
Sherry Pedersen, Preservation Coordinator
Heritage Preservation Services
Tel: 416-338-1089; Fax: 416-392-1973
E-mail: speders@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Harold Madi
Director, Urban Design
City Planning Division
ATTACHMENTS
Attachment No. 1- Location Plan: 1183 Dufferin Street
Attachment No. 2- Photos: 1183 Dufferin Street
Attachment No. 3- Architectural drawings for the proposed development
Attachment No. 4 – Statement of Significance (Reasons for Designation)
Attachment No. 5 – Heritage Property Research and Evaluation Report
The arrow indicates the footprint of the building at 1183 Dufferin Street. The outlined area shows the limits of the heritage property.

This location map is for information purposes only; the exact boundaries of the property are not shown.
Street facing elevation of the Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church
Source: TOBuilt
Photos of the church taken after the fire of January 2014 - Dufferin Street elevation

Photo taken from the laneway at the rear of the church showing damage to the main roof
STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE:  1183 DUFFERIN STREET
(REASONS FOR DESIGNATION)

Description

The property at 1183 Dufferin Street is worthy of designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for its cultural heritage value, and meets the provincial criteria prescribed for municipal designation under the three categories of design, associative and contextual values. Situated on the east side of Dufferin Street, north of Bloor Street West between Shanly and Hallam Streets in Dovercourt, Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church (1912) was the second church built in this location by the congregation (in existence 1908-1993). The site was listed on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties in 2005.

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church is valued for its design as a fine representative example of an early 20th century institutional building with Neo-Gothic styling in the Dovercourt neighbourhood. Dating to the World War I era when Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church was planned, the style was particularly popular for ecclesiastical and educational buildings with its medieval-inspired detailing, including buttresses and arched openings. Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church displays the hallmarks of the style, and is particularly notable for its highly visible corner tower and chimney.

The cultural heritage value of Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church is also linked to its associations with Toronto architect W. R. Gregg. Apart from a mid-career partnership with his brother (architect Alfred H. Gregg), Gregg oversaw a lengthy solo practice during which he produced a variety of residential, industrial and institutional buildings from the Women's Medical College in Cabbagetown (1889) to the Canadian Order of Foresters' Hall on College Street (1910). Of the more than 20 churches he designed for Presbyterian congregations in Ontario, the one at 1183 Dufferin Street is an important extant example in Toronto and followed Gregg's earlier commission for Dovercourt Road Presbyterian Church (a recognized heritage property in the adjoining Dufferin Grove neighbourhood), whose parishioners assisted in establishing Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church.

Contextually, the property at 1183 Dufferin Street is valued for its historical and visual relationship to its surroundings on Dufferin Street at the west end of Dovercourt, the formerly unincorporated community that developed around Dovercourt Park prior to its annexation by the City of Toronto in 1910. Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church remains a significant surviving institutional building associated with the origins of the neighbourhood.

With its distinctive tower that is viewed on Dufferin Street and from within the Dovercourt neighbourhood, Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church is a local landmark.
Heritage Attributes

The heritage attributes of the property at 1183 Dufferin Street are:

- The building known historically as Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church
- The placement, setback and orientation of the building on the site
- The asymmetrical plan that rises one extended storey above a stone foundation, with a tower at the northwest corner
- The materials, with red brick cladding and brick, stone and wood detailing
- The steeply-pitched gable roof, which was damaged by fire in January 2014
- The principal (west) facade, under the gable end of the roof where the main entrance is placed in an enclosed gable-roofed porch with extended eaves, stone coping and buttresses
- The detailing on the main entrance, where paired doors and a transom are set in a Tudor-arched opening with stone quoins and a keystone, and a lancet opening with stone detailing is placed in the apex of the gable
- The fenestration on the west wall, with a trio of oversized Tudor-arched window openings with stone detailing beneath a pair of diminutive flat-headed openings with louvers and stone lintels and sills (the portion of the wall with the paired openings was included in the Reasons for Listing (2006) and removed after the 2014 fire)
- The detailing on the square tower, with the secondary entrance on the west wall (which copies the detailing from the main entry), the pair and trio of flat-headed window openings with stone lintels and sills, the corner buttresses, the crenellated parapet, and the tall brick chimney (south)
- The side elevations (north and south) where brick buttresses with stone trim organize three-part Tudor-arched window openings

The rear (east) wall and the single-storey shed-roofed addition, are not identified as heritage attributes.
HERITAGE PROPERTY RESEARCH AND EVALUATION REPORT

DUFFERIN STREET PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH
1183 DUFFERIN STREET, TORONTO

Prepared by:
Heritage Preservation Services
City Planning Division
City of Toronto

March 2014
1. DESCRIPTION

Above: 1183 Dufferin Street, March 2014, showing the damage resulting from the January 2014 fire (Heritage Preservation Services); cover: Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church, 2006 when the property was listed on the City's heritage inventory (Heritage Preservation Services)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1183 Dufferin Street: Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ADDRESS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WARD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LEGAL DESCRIPTION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEIGHBOURHOOD/COMMUNITY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HISTORICAL NAME</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONSTRUCTION DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ORIGINAL OWNER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ORIGINAL USE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CURRENT USE*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARCHITECT/BUILDER/DESIGNER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DESIGN/CONSTRUCTION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARCHITECTURAL STYLE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADDITIONS/ALTERATIONS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRITERIA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HERITAGE STATUS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECORER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REPORT DATE</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2. BACKGROUND

This research and evaluation report describes the history, architecture and context of the property at 1183 Dufferin Street and applies evaluation criteria to determine whether it merits designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act. The conclusions of the research and evaluation are found in Section 4 (Summary).

i. HISTORICAL TIMELINE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Date</th>
<th>Historical Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1885</td>
<td>The Land Security Company registers Plan 622 for the lands northeast of Bloor Street West and Dufferin Street (replacing its previous subdivision registered in 1882 as Plan 520)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1908</td>
<td>Dovercourt Road Presbyterian Church supports a mission in the Bloor/Dufferin area to its north</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1908 Sept</td>
<td>A building permit is issued for a frame church, which is built on land owned by gardener Patrick O’Brien on the east side of Dufferin Street, opposite Armstrong Avenue (Image 8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1908 Nov</td>
<td>The first church and Sunday School are in use according to church records</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1909 May</td>
<td>Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church occupies part of O’Brien’s property and has an assessed value of $500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1910</td>
<td>The City of Toronto absorbs Dovercourt and the neighbouring Earls court district as the “North Dovercourt Annex”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1911 May</td>
<td>The trustees of Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church are recorded as the owners of the site in the assessment rolls</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1911 June &amp; Nov</td>
<td>Architect W. R. Gregg is referenced in the Contract Record as the architect for a new church on the site</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1911 Nov</td>
<td>The building permit is issued for the new church (Image 8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1912 May</td>
<td>The cornerstone is laid for the second church (the original church remains on the site according to the assessment rolls)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1912 Oct</td>
<td>The new church is dedicated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1912</td>
<td>The update to Goad’s Atlas illustrates the second church</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1913 July</td>
<td>The new church is valued at $15,000 in the assessment rolls</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1925</td>
<td>Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church decides not to join the newly-formed United Church of Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church amalgamates with Dovercourt-St. Paul’s Presbyterian Church under the name St. Paul’s Presbyterian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>The church trustees sell the Dufferin Street site</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>The House of Prayer buys the property</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>The site is listed on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>A fire damages the church</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ii. HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

Dovercourt

The property at 1183 Dufferin Street is located in Dovercourt, the Toronto neighbourhood bounded by Dufferin Street (west), Bloor Street West (south), Ossington
Avenue (east) and the railway tracks (north). The subject site originated as part of Lot 30 in Concession 2 west of Yonge Street, which was one of the farm lots surveyed in York Township north of the Town of York (Toronto) in the late 18th century. As illustrated on the historical maps in Section 6 (Images 2 and 3), by the mid 1800s the tract was subdivided into smaller parcels. However, the development of Dovercourt as a suburban area was delayed until the 1880s when the first horse-drawn street railway was extended west along Bloor Street to Dovercourt Road. This coincided with the completion of the Ontario and Quebec Railway’s line through York Township, which ran parallel to and north of Bloor Street West. The railway “brought more people, land subdivisions and factories” with the development of residential communities that were initially filled with inhabitants of English, Irish and Scottish origin.

In 1882, the Land Security Company registered “Dovercourt” as a plan of subdivision south of the railway tracks (Image 4). Founded in 1874 as the Toronto House Building Society, the company specialized in acquiring and subdividing vast tracts of land adjoining the railway lines in the city’s west end. In Dovercourt, the Land Security Company reserved a six-acre parcel as a “public square” that became Dovercourt Park (Image 9). The gradual development of the residential community in the late 19th and early 20th centuries can be traced on Goad’s Atlases (including those attached as Images 5-7). Dovercourt (together with Earlscourt) was annexed by the City of Toronto in 1910, which brought improved municipal services to the community and introduced important institutional buildings to the neighbourhood in the form of schools and churches.

Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church

A Presbyterian congregation was founded in Dovercourt in 1908 as a mission of Dovercourt Road Presbyterian Church (located in the Dufferin Grove neighbourhood to the south), two years before the community was annexed by the City of Toronto. Following the issuance of a building permit in September 1908, a modest frame church was completed on the east side of Dufferin Street, opposite Armstrong Avenue. With the growth of both the community and the congregation, the second Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church was commissioned in 1911 and dedicated the following year.

During the 20th century, the congregation of Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church endured two World Wars, the amalgamation of other local Presbyterian congregations with the United Church of Canada in 1925, the Great Depression of the 1930s, and the post-World

---

1 The community is also referred to as Dovercourt Village and Dovercourt Park
2 When the City of Toronto was incorporated in 1834, Dufferin and Bloor Streets were the west and north boundaries, respectively, for “The Liberties”, suburban lands identified for future annexation
3 In 1892, this service was extended along Bloor to Dufferin and north along the latter street
4 Beginning in the 1880s and continuing into the 21st century, the Canadian Pacific Railway operates the Ontario and Quebec Railway under a long-term lease
5 Byers, 4
6 Examples of the Land Security Company’s projects included the King/Dufferin lands now known as Liberty Village and the Lansdowne/Dufferin lands that were first developed with factories and housing for the Canadian General Electric Company and its subsidiary
During its history, Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church also served the neighbourhood to the west that is now known as Wallace-Emerson (after the major streets).

Dovercourt-St. Paul's was a previous amalgamation of Dovercourt Road Presbyterian (in Dufferin Grove) and St. Paul's Presbyterian (Seaton Village, east of Dovercourt); when the latter churches merged with the Dufferin Street Presbyterian as St. Paul's Presbyterian Church, the name of the oldest congregation was adopted (St. Paul's continued from 1993 to 2005).

Typical of architectural firms that accepted a variety of commissions, Smith and Gemmell designed Anglican, Methodist and Baptist churches in Toronto.

After the brothers ended their professional association, A. H. Gregg formed a new partnership with A. Frank Wickson.

Located at 700 Dovercourt Road, the property was listed on the City's heritage inventory in 1990.
Rather than the pointed-arch motif identified with the Gothic Revival, Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church displays Tudor arches, also known as depressed or four-point arches, which is another hallmark of the Neo-Gothic style.

Rising one extended storey, the church features an asymmetrical plan with a tower at the northwest corner. Above a raised stone foundation, the structure is clad with red brick and trimmed with brick, stone and wood. The main body of the church is covered by a steeply-pitched gable roof (portions of which were destroyed by fire in January 2014, leaving the steel roof structure exposed, as shown in photographs in Sections 2 and 6). On the principal (west) façade, the main entrance is placed in an enclosed gable-roofed porch with extended eaves, stone coping and buttresses. The doors and transom are set in a Tudor-arched opening with stone quoins and a keystone beneath a lancet window. Above the entry, the west wall contains a trio of oversized Tudor-arched window openings with stone detailing. The pair of diminutive openings with flat heads, louvers and stone lintels and sills originally found near the apex of the gable were removed following the January 2014 fire, but are documented in photographs, including the one shown on the cover of this report.

The side elevations (north and south) have three-part Tudor-arched window openings organized by brick buttresses with stone trim. The square tower has the secondary entrance to the church on its west wall (which copies the detailing from the main entry), as well as flat-headed window openings with lintels and sills, buttresses, a crenellated parapet and, on the south end, an extended brick chimney. The rear (east) wall, which had a round window and chimney that were removed after the January 2014 fire, and the single-storey shed-roofed addition are not identified as heritage attributes.

iv. CONTEXT

The location of the property at 1183 Dufferin Street is shown on the property data map attached as Image 1 below. The archival photograph appended as Image 10 shows Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church after World War II where the building and its tower and chimney stand out among the residential buildings lining Dufferin Street at that time.

Dufferin Street Baptist Church is found on the east side of the street, south of present-day Hallam Street at the west end of the predominantly residential neighbourhood along and east of Dufferin Street. Directly north of the subject property, Dufferin Street Baptist Church (1918) at 1219 Dufferin is also listed on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties. The (Anglican) Church of St. Mary and St. Cyprian’s (1913) at 40 Westmoreland and Dovercourt Public School (1916) anchoring the corner of Bartlett and Hallam Streets are other institutional buildings in Dovercourt that are recognized on the City’s heritage inventory. The latter churches are illustrated in Image 11, with the school shown in Image 12.

---

12 Maitland, 186
3. EVALUATION CHECKLIST

The following evaluation applies Ontario Regulation 9/06 made under the Ontario Heritage Act: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest. While the criteria are prescribed for municipal designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, the City of Toronto uses it when assessing properties for inclusion on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties. The evaluation table is marked “N/A” if the criterion is “not applicable” to the property or X if it is applicable, with explanatory text below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Design or Physical Value</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i. rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii. displays high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii. demonstrates high degree of scientific or technical achievement</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Representative Example of a Style and Type** – Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church is valued for its design as a fine representative example of an early 20th century institutional building with Neo-Gothic styling in the Dovercourt neighbourhood. Dating to the World War I era when Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church was planned, the style was particularly popular for ecclesiastical and educational buildings with its medieval-inspired detailing, including buttresses and arched openings. Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church displays the hallmarks of the style, and is particularly notable for its highly visible corner tower and chimney.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Historical or Associative Value</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i. direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Architect** – The cultural heritage value of Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church is also linked to its associations with Toronto architect W. R. Gregg. Apart from a mid-career partnership with his brother (architect Alfred H. Gregg), Gregg oversaw a lengthy solo practice during which he produced a variety of residential, industrial and institutional buildings from the Women's Medical College in Cabbagetown (1889) to the Canadian Order of Foresters' Hall on College Street (1910). Of the more than 20 churches he designed for Presbyterian congregations in Ontario, the one at 1183 Dufferin Street is an important extant example in Toronto and followed Gregg’s earlier commission for Dovercourt Road Presbyterian Church (a recognized heritage property in the adjoining Dufferin Grove neighbourhood), whose parishioners assisted in establishing Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church.
**Contextual Value**

| i. important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area | N/A |
| ii. physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings | X |
| iii. landmark | X |

**Surroundings** – Contextually, the property at 1183 Dufferin Street is valued for its historical and visual relationship to its surroundings on Dufferin Street at the west end of Dovercourt, the formerly unincorporated community that developed around Dovercourt Park prior to its annexation by the City of Toronto in 1910. Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church remains a significant surviving institutional building associated with the origins of the neighbourhood.

**Landmark** – With its distinctive tower that is viewed on Dufferin Street and from within the Dovercourt neighbourhood, Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church is a local landmark. Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church is a local landmark.

4. **SUMMARY**

Following research and evaluation according to Regulation 9/06, it has been determined that the property at 1183 Dufferin Street has design, associative and contextual values. Located on the east side of Dufferin Street, south of Hallam Street, Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church (1912) is a fine example of a Neo-Gothic-styled ecclesiastical building designed by the important Toronto architect W. R. Gregg that is historically and visually related to the Dovercourt neighbourhood where it stands as a local landmark.

Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church was damaged by fire on January 31, 2014, which destroyed much of the roof and necessitated the removal of the upper portions of the west and east walls, under the apexes of the gables. However, the majority of the architectural features remain intact, including the landmark tower, and Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church retains its integrity as a cultural heritage resource that continues to effectively communicate its cultural heritage values and attributes.

5. **SOURCES**

**Archival Sources**

Abstract Indices of Deeds, Plan 622, Block O, Part Lots 18-20  
Archival Photographs, City of Toronto Archives, Series 372, Items 206 and 2148  
Assessment Rolls, City of Toronto, 1908-13, Ward 6, Divisions 3 and 4  
Building Permit #12476 (September 9, 1908) and #31455 (November 9, 1911), City of Toronto Archives  
City of Toronto Directories, 1909 ff.  
Goad’s Atlases, 1884-1923  
Miles’ Illustrated Historical Atlas of the County of York, 1878  
Plan of Dovercourt, 1882, Toronto Reference Library, Item 77

Alterations to a Heritage Property, Intention to Designate and HEA – 1183 Dufferin Street 28
Tremaine’s Map of the City of Toronto and County of York, 1860

Secondary Sources

Byers, Nancy, and Barbara Myrvold, *St. Clair West in Pictures*, 2nd ed., revised and expanded, 1999
Congregational Records, Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church, Presbyterian Church in Canada Archives
*Contract Record*, June 14, 1911 and November 1, 1911
"50th Anniversary - Dufferin Street Presbyterian, 1908-1958," Presbyterian Church in Canada Archives
Kennedy, R. L. “Ontario and Quebec,”
http://www.trainweb.org/oldtimetrains/OandQ/history.htm
Mulvany, Charles P., *History of Toronto and the County of York, Ontario*, Vol. 1, 1885
Patterson, Cynthia, Carol McDougall and George Levin, *Bloor-Dufferin in Pictures*, 1986
6. IMAGES – The arrows mark the location of the subject property. Maps and atlases are followed by photographs.

1. City of Toronto Property Data Map: showing the location of the property at 1183 Dufferin Street. To the east (right), Dovercourt Park is the large unnamed open space bounded by Southview, Westmoreland, Fernbank and Bartlett that contains the Dovercourt Boys' and Girls' Club building.
2. Tremaine’s Map of the City of Toronto and County of York, 1860: showing the intersection of present-day Bloor Street West and Dufferin Street and the future Dovercourt neighbourhood to the northeast (right)

3. Miles’ Illustrated Atlas of the County of York, 1878: showing the initial subdivision of the lands in Dovercourt, west of Seaton Village
4. **Plan of Dovercourt, 1882:** the subdivision was registered again in 1885 as Plan 622 (a revision of Plan 520 above) and the church was later built in Block O on parts of Lots 18-20 (Toronto Reference Library, Item 77)
5. Goad's Atlas, 1884: Dovercourt is illustrated on the first Goad's atlas for this part of the city, showing the original street names and present-day Dovercourt Park reserved as a "public square"

6. Goad's Atlas, 1890: the next update to Goad's atlas illustrates the progress of the development of the Dovercourt neighbourhood
7. Goad's Atlas, 1910 revised to 1912; showing Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church (1912) in place on the east side of Dufferin Street, south of Hallam Street in Dovercourt where the initial development of the neighbourhood is complete
8. Building Permits, Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church, 1908 and 1911: showing the permits for the original wood frame building (above) and the current church (below). Neither person named as the architect on the permits is identified in the Biographical Dictionary of Architects in Canada, 1800-1950 (City of Toronto Archives)
9. **Archival Photograph, Dovercourt Park, 1913:** showing the large park surrounded by residential buildings following the annexation of Dovercourt by the City of Toronto (the church in the background is not the subject building, but rather the Methodist church that once occupied the corner of Westmoreland Avenue and Hallam Street (City of Toronto Archives, Series 372, Item 206)

10. **Archival Photograph, Dufferin Street, 1951:** showing Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church on the east side of the street with its visible tower and chimney (right) (City of Toronto Archives, Series 372, Item 2148)
11. Photographs, Dovercourt Churches: showing the (Anglican) Church of St. Mary the Virgin and St. Cyprian (1913) at 40 Westmoreland Avenue (above) and Dufferin Street Baptist Church (1916) at 1219 Dufferin Street (below). Both properties are listed on the City’s heritage inventory and 40 Westmoreland is designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act by By-law 84-2008 (Heritage Preservation Services)
12. **Photograph, Dovercourt Public School (1916), 228 Hallam Street:** the site of another important institutional building in the Dovercourt neighbourhood from the same era as Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church that is also recognized on the City’s heritage inventory (Heritage Preservation Services)

13. **Photograph, Dufferin Street, January 2014:** showing the fire that damaged Dufferin Street Presbyterian Church on January 31, 2014 (http://www.torontolife.com/tag/dufferin-street-presbyterian-church/)
14. Current Photographs, 1183 Dufferin Street, March 2014: showing the north elevation (top left), the south elevation (top right), the rear or east wall and shed-roofed addition (centre), and the view north along the east side of Dufferin Street with the context of the church (below) (Heritage Preservation Services)