Alteration of a Designated Heritage Property – 111 St. Clair Avenue West

Date: March 10, 2014
To: Toronto Preservation Board
    Toronto East York Community Council
From: Director, Urban Design, City Planning Division
Wards: Ward 22 - St. Paul's
Reference Number: P:\2014\Cluster B\PLN\TEYCC\TE14022

SUMMARY

This report recommends that City Council approve the proposed alteration of 111 St. Clair Avenue West (Imperial Oil Building). The property at 111 St. Clair Avenue West, which is located on the south side of the street, east of Avenue Road, contains the former headquarters of the Imperial Oil Company (now Imperial Oil Limited) which was designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act on October 4, 2012 (By-law No. 1234-2012).

The property is the subject of a development application that proposes to convert the former office building for use as a residential condominium. The applicant is also proposing alterations to the building's first floor interior to accommodate retail and residential uses. The building's reasons for designation includes exterior and interior features.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council approve the proposed alteration of the designated heritage property at 111 St Clair Avenue West under Section 33 of the Ontario Heritage Act contained within the drawings by Landini Associates, dated October 29th, 2013 and date stamped received January 8th, 2014, and drawings by Fiorino Design, dated October 2013 and date stamped received on January 8th, 2014, and on file with Heritage Preservation Services, subject to the following conditions:
a. Prior to site plan approval, the applicant will provide a Conservation Plan and final site plan drawings to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;

b. Prior to the release of any heritage permit for the retail conversion, the applicant will provide full building permit drawings, including notes and specifications for the conservation and protective measures, keyed to the approved Conservation Plan, including a description of materials and finishes, to be prepared by the project architect and heritage consultant to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services; and

c. Prior to the registration of the Imperial Plaza Condominiums, the applicant will provide a letter of substantial completion for all of the conservation work completed on the building, prepared and signed by a qualified heritage consultant confirming that the conservation work has been completed in accordance with approved plans and drawings and has maintained an appropriate standard of conservation, to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.

Financial Impact
There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY
The property located at 111 St Clair Avenue West was listed on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties on Feb 3, 2005. City Council designated the property under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act on October 4, 2012.


ISSUE BACKGROUND
The property at 111 St Clair Avenue West, which is located on the south side of the street, east of Avenue Road, contains the former headquarters of the Imperial Oil Company (now Imperial Oil Limited). The building is being converted from offices to a mixed-use building, including a condominium and retail spaces and is subject to Site Plan Control (SPA 11 184256).

The applicant has obtained building permits related to the residential rehabilitation of the building. Changes to the exterior signage, exterior limestone work and window replacement, temporary materials hoist, rooftop alteration and alterations to the lobby ceiling were all obtained prior to the heritage designation of the building, although heritage staff worked with the owner and project architects on the project design and approved related interior demolition and building permits. The only heritage approval that remains outstanding is the renovation of the interior spaces.
The Conservation Strategy is being developed with reference to the Parks Canada Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places, the Ministry of Culture's Ontario Heritage Toolkit and the Burra Charter.

BACKGROUND

Policy Framework

Official Plan
Section 3.1.5 of the City of Toronto Official Plan directs that significant heritage resources will be conserved by listing properties of architectural and/or historic interest on the City’s Inventory of Heritage Properties; designating properties; entering into conservation agreements with owners of heritage properties; and designating areas with a concentration of heritage resources as heritage conservation districts. The Plan directs the adoption of guidelines to maintain and improve the character of such districts.

Provincial Policy Statement and Ontario Heritage Act
In reference to the Province of Ontario’s 2005 Provincial Policy Statement, Section 2.6.1 states: “Significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved.”

Under Section 33 of the Ontario Heritage Act, an owner must obtain a permit from the municipality alter a designated property. If Council refuses the application the owner may appeal the decision to the Conservation Review Board.

Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada
On March 3, 4 and 5, 2008, Council adopted Parks Canada’s Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada (Standards and Guidelines) as the document guiding planning, stewardship and conservation approach for all listed and designated heritage resources within the City.


Reasons for Identification
The property at 111 St. Clair Avenue West is designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for its cultural heritage value, and meets the criteria for municipal designation prescribed by the Province of Ontario under the three categories of design, associative and contextual value.
The Reasons for Designation include (but are not limited to):

- On the interior, the two-storey entrance hall where the walls have Lorado Chioso marble cladding and gold mosaic tiles, and the flooring is pink and gray Tennessee marble

- In the entrance hall, flanking the passage to the elevator lobby where they are visible from St. Clair Avenue West, the two monumental murals portraying "The Story of Oil"

Proposal

The proposed alteration consists of changes to the first floor interior space. The first floor will consist of a central lobby and elevator lobby with new retail space on each side. The lobby will feature an open atrium to the basement on the south side of the ground floor. Both retail spaces are entered from the front lobby and sliding grills will be installed to act as a barrier between the retail space and the lobby after business hours. The existing marble flooring will be removed in both retail spaces, but will be maintained in the central lobby space. Other features that will be maintained include three large wall clocks and a post office box embedded in the lobby's wall.

Proposed alterations to the character defining features include new openings in the north wall of the east and west commercial areas of the entrance hall, to expand the space available for two retail tenants (LCBO and Nutshell). Marble cladding from the removed portions of the wall will be salvaged for reuse in the finishing of new openings. A portion of the existing marble floor will be salvaged for future re-use. In the entrance hall, flanking the passage to the elevator lobby are two monumental murals portraying "The Story of Oil." These murals are being preserved.

COMMENTS

The proposed alterations to the first floor interior space of the Imperial Oil Building necessitates a number of alterations to character defining features to accommodate for new retail space but are a part of a larger conservation strategy for the building. In addition to the proposed alterations to the interior marble wall cladding and existing marble floor, changes to the front lobby, elevator lobby, entrance vestibule and ceiling are incorporating heritage preservation strategies. Conservation work has been completed on the façade and a rooftop addition has been sensitively added to the building.

The applicant has proposed a comprehensive strategy to mitigate the impacts that the alterations will have on the building. Care has been taken to ensure that materials are salvaged for re-use where possible and that key features, such as the murals, are protected and preserved. Additionally, efforts have been made to ensure that the heritage integrity of the first floor space has been maintained. This will allow the public to perceive the alterations in a way that distinguishes the alterations from the heritage fabric.
Great care has been taken to respect the heritage character of the entire building. The proposed alterations to the first floor are expected to maintain this level of preservation.

CONTACT
Mary L. MacDonald, Acting Manager
Heritage Preservation Services
Tel: 416-338-1079; Fax: 416-392-1973
E-mail: mmacdon7@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

_______________________________
Harold Madi
Director Urban Design
City Planning Division

ATTACHMENTS
Attachment No. 1 – Location Map
Attachment No. 2 – Rendering
Attachment No. 3 – Floor Plan
Attachment No. 4 – Floor Plan
Attachment No. 5 – Interior Elevations
The arrow marks the location of the heritage building at 111 St Clair Avenue West. This location map is for information purposes only; the exact boundaries of the properties are not shown.
Rendering of North and East Elevation
East Commercial Area
West Commercial Area
INTERIOR ELEVATIONS: 111 ST. CLAIR AVENUE WEST

ATTACHMENT NO. 5

East Commercial Area

West Commercial Area