Demolition of a Designated Heritage Property in the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District and Construction of a Replacement Structure – 4 Astley Avenue

Date: June 24, 2014
To: Toronto Preservation Board
Toronto and East York Community Council
From: Director, Urban Design, City Planning Division
Wards: Ward 27 – Toronto Centre-Rosedale
Reference Number: P:\2014\Cluster B\PLN\TEYCC\TE14101

SUMMARY

This report recommends that City Council approve the demolition of a designated non-contributing heritage property in the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District (NRHCD) and the construction of a replacement structure under Section 42 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

The proposal is to demolish an existing 1 ½-storey brick building and to construct a new 3-storey brick building of a modern architectural style. The existing property was evaluated as an "unrated" structure in the NRHCD and, as per the District Plan, is not considered to be of national, provincial, citywide or contextual heritage significance and does not contribute to the heritage character of the heritage conservation district.
RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council approve the application to demolish 4 Astley Avenue, an "unrated" structure in the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District in accordance with Section 42 of the Ontario Heritage Act subject to the owner, prior to the issuance of a demolition permit, submitting photo-documentation of the existing structure at 4 Astley Avenue to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.

2. City Council approve the replacement building as shown in the plans and elevations submitted by the applicant and prepared by CS&P Architects Inc., date stamped "Received" by Heritage Preservation Services on June 18, 2014 and on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, and that the replacement structure be constructed substantially in accordance with the submitted plans, subject to the following condition:
   a. Prior to the issuance of any heritage permit for the replacement structure located at 4 Astley Avenue, the applicant will provide final building permit drawings and a landscape plan to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.

Financial Impact
There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY
Council adopted the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District (NRHCD) on September 30, 2004 (By-law 749-2004).


There have been no previous reports to Council regarding the property at 4 Astley Avenue under the Ontario Heritage Act.

ISSUE BACKGROUND
The property known as 4 Astley Avenue is located on a corner site within the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District (NRHCD). 4 Astley Avenue is an "unrated" property in the NRHCD.

As per the NRHCD guidelines, unrated buildings are “… not of national, provincial, citywide or contextual heritage significance and do not contribute to the heritage character of South Rosedale or they are buildings which are too recent to be accurately evaluated for their heritage value”. Additionally, "demolition of an unrated building will generally be permissible if the replacement building, as shown in the building permit
application, is acceptable under these guidelines and the zoning by-law". New buildings within the NRHCD should contribute to and not detract from the variety and heritage character of the district, they should be compatible with the heritage buildings in terms of scale, massing height, setback, and entry level, and the height of the building should be compatible with that of its neighbours.

COMMENTS
Heritage Preservation Services (HPS) staff have reviewed the proposal against the NRHCD guidelines and have worked with the applicant on the overall design of a new 3-storey house within the "St. Andrew's College Lands" of this district. The property is located on a corner site fronting onto Astley Avenue to the east with a side yard facing Douglas Drive to the south. Of interest is that there are no houses located across the street on Douglas Drive. Instead, the property overlooks Chorley Park.

The proposed replacement structure is designed in a Modern architectural style, a style that exists in the NRHCD. The materials proposed for this house were selected from a palette within the neighbourhood and includes brick, wood and stucco. The site is narrow along Astley Avenue and parking is not possible at the front of the house. An existing driveway is located along Douglas Drive and the new site plan proposes a driveway in the same location. Higher percentage of windows are proposed on the south elevation to take advantage of views onto Chorley Park and the material change along this elevation serves to divide the house into two sections so that the proportions represent the narrower frontages of houses along Douglas Drive.

For these reasons, HPS supports the application to demolish the existing unrated property and recommends approval of the proposed replacement structure as it will be an appropriate addition to the existing streetscape of Astley Avenue and Douglas Drive in the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District.

CONTACT
Sherry Pedersen, Preservation Coordinator East
Heritage Preservation Services
Tel: 416-338-1089; Fax: 416-392-1973
E-mail: speders@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

___________________________
Harold Madi
Director, Urban Design
City Planning Division
ATTACHMENTS
Attachment 1: Location Map – 4 Astley Avenue
Attachment 2: Photograph – 4 Astley Avenue
Attachment 3: Site Plan- 4 Astley Avenue
Attachment 4: Elevations – Proposed Replacement Building, 4 Astley Avenue
Attachment 5: Context Elevation – Proposed Replacement Building, 4 Astley Avenue