



**AUDITOR GENERAL'S  
REPORT  
ACTION REQUIRED  
with Confidential Attachment**

**Auditor General's Status Report on Outstanding Audit  
Recommendations for City Divisions**

<b>Date:</b>	June 5, 2015
<b>To:</b>	Audit Committee
<b>From:</b>	Auditor General
<b>Wards:</b>	All
<b>Reason for Confidential Information:</b>	<b>Reasons for confidentiality</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. This report involves the security of property belonging to the City or one of its agencies and corporations.</li><li>2. This report is about litigation or potential litigation that affects the City or one of its agencies and corporations.</li></ol>
<b>Reference Number:</b>	

**SUMMARY**

---

This report provides information regarding the implementation status of audit recommendations contained in various reports issued by the Auditor General to City divisions. On an annual basis, the Auditor General reviews the implementation status of outstanding audit recommendations and reports the results of the review to Council through the Audit Committee.

The Auditor General has issued 1,534 recommendations since January 1, 1999. Management has fully implemented 89 per cent or 1,361 of these 1,534 recommendations.

Since July 1, 2009 the Auditor General has issued various reports containing a total of 599 recommendations. Since that time, 14 of these recommendations have been identified by the Auditor General as no longer relevant, leaving 585 relevant recommendations. Factors such as reorganizations and changes in business practices and service levels can cause some recommendations to no longer be relevant.

The results of our review indicate management has fully implemented 423 or 72 per cent of the applicable recommendations made by the Auditor General during the five year period from July 1, 2009 to June 30, 2014.

Although management has made good progress on implementing audit recommendations, 39 recommendations have been outstanding for over three years. Eleven of these recommendations have been outstanding for over five years. Management is taking steps to implement these recommendations.

Continued efforts to implement outstanding recommendations will provide additional benefit to the City through cost savings, improved controls, additional revenue and enhanced service delivery.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS**

---

### **The Auditor General recommends that:**

1. City Council receive this report for information.
2. City Council authorize the public release of the recommendation contained in Confidential Attachment 1 at the discretion of the City Solicitor in consultation with the City Manager.

### **Financial Impact**

This is a summary report. The recommendations in this report have no financial impact. However, there are significant savings and additional revenues generated as a result of implementation of various audit recommendations. Although the benefits from all audit recommendations cannot be quantified, we have included a number of highlights to illustrate the financial benefits and improved operational efficiencies of implementing many of our audit recommendations.

Since 2010, total one-time and projected five-year cost savings and revenue increases are approximately \$235.6 million. The cumulative costs of operating the Auditor General's Office since 2010 were approximately \$19.9 million. In simple terms, for every \$1 invested in the Auditor General's Office the return on investment was approximately \$11.8. The Auditor General reports annually to Council on the activities of the Office and savings achieved. The 2014 Annual Report demonstrating the Value of the Auditor General's Office is available at:

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2015/au/bgrd/backgroundfile-76348.pdf>

The identification of cost savings and additional revenue is only one component of the role of the Auditor General. Equally important is the ongoing evaluation of internal controls, risk management and governance processes in order to ensure City resources are adequately protected.

## **ISSUE BACKGROUND**

In accordance with the Auditor General's 2015 Work Plan, we have completed a review of the implementation status of audit recommendations issued by the Auditor General's Office. On an annual basis, the Auditor General provides a listing of outstanding audit recommendations to management. Management responds with information detailing the action taken on recommendations implemented as well as progress made on those not fully implemented.

The Auditor General reviews information provided by management to determine the accuracy of management assertions related to each recommendation considered as fully implemented or no longer relevant. The results of this review are communicated to Council through the Audit Committee.

This report relates only to City divisions reporting to the City Manager and does not include reports and recommendations relating to City Agencies and Corporations. The status of recommendations related to City Agencies and Corporations is reported under separate cover.

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

## **COMMENTS**

### **Results of the Auditor General's Review**

Table 1 below contains cumulative results for all recommendations contained in reports issued by the Auditor General's Office during the five year period from July 1, 2009 to June 30, 2014.

**Table 1: Status of Outstanding Recommendations as of June 30, 2014**

<b>Status of Recommendations</b>	<b>As of June 30, 2014</b>
Fully Implemented	423
Not Fully Implemented	162
No Longer Relevant	14
<b>Total</b>	<b>599</b>
Fully Implemented as a percentage of total recommendations excluding those no longer relevant	72%

The results of our review indicate that management has fully implemented 423 or 72 per cent of the 585 recommendations made by the Auditor General since July 1, 2009.

Recommendations no longer relevant relate to areas or programs where reorganizations and changes in business practices and service levels have rendered them as no longer relevant.

### **Listing of Outstanding Recommendations**

Confidential Attachment 1 lists the status of confidential recommendations.

Attachment 2 contains public recommendations considered to be fully implemented, not fully implemented or no longer relevant.

Upon receipt of this report, recommendations reported as implemented or no longer relevant will not be reported to City Council in the future. All recommendations reported as not fully implemented will be included in subsequent follow-up reviews until implemented.

A few examples of noteworthy recommendations implemented and not fully implemented are provided below.

### **Noteworthy Recommendations Implemented**

1. Engineering and Construction Services - Management of Construction Contracts - Leaside Bridge Structure Review, 2007

The objective of this review was to assess controls over the award and management of construction contracts. This report included 11 recommendations. These recommendations were related to strengthening contract provisions, improving quality control and warranty inspection processes, streamlining payment and approval processes.

All of the recommendations in this report have now been implemented. One recommendation relating to the development and implementation of a policy for the recovery of administration fees for management of contracts by the City on behalf of third parties was outstanding in the last follow-up cycle.

Our review indicates that management has implemented this recommendation and has developed a policy to charge an administration fee of 18.3% on third party construction contracts. The 2015 budgeted amount for administration fees related to third party construction contracts is \$1.37 million.

## 2. Emergency Medical Services - Payroll and Scheduling Processes Require Strengthening, 2013

The Auditor General completed a review of Toronto Paramedic Services, (formerly Emergency Medical Services) in 2013. The review resulted in 12 recommendations. This report identified a number of opportunities to strengthen controls over the administration and management of EMS scheduling and payroll processes.

Management has fully implemented 9 of the 12 recommendations and actions are underway for the remaining three recommendations. One of the recommendations dealt with reconciliation and adjustment of long outstanding pay variances.

Management has reviewed and cleared outstanding pay variances for over 200 staff and, as a result, has recovered a net amount of \$10,000 from staff in cash and 1079 hours in terms of work hours. At an average salary rate of \$40 per hour, the 1079 hours equates to approximately \$43,000. In total the recovery has amounted to \$53,000. Management is still reviewing pay variances and there will be more adjustments when the review is completed for the balance of approximately 100 staff.

## **Noteworthy Recommendations Not Fully Implemented**

### Transportation Services - Inventory Controls Over Traffic Control Devices in Transportation Services Need to be Improved (2012)

The objective of this review was to assess the effectiveness of Transportation Services' controls to safeguard the inventory of parts required to maintain and install electrical traffic signal devices. The report contained nine recommendations for effective inventory control, cost savings and ensure the safekeeping of the City's \$6.7 million worth of these parts.

All but two of the recommendations in this report have now been implemented. One of these recommendations is partially implemented and work is continuing in 2015.

In implementing this audit recommendation, Purchasing Material Management Division conducted reviews with a number of divisions in the City to identify if any had a significant level of inventory and how that inventory is stored. As a result of these

reviews, the Office of Emergency Management (OEM) consolidated the storage of Emergency Supplies, which were being stored in rented facilities, into the City's warehouse operations. Management reported that this action resulted in savings of \$48,000 per year from the rental costs which were no longer required. Additional savings may be expected when this recommendation is fully implemented.

## **Auditor General's Verification of Implementation Status**

During this year's follow-up process management reported that 146 recommendations had been implemented. In performing our verification procedures on the effectiveness of implementation, we determined that for 38 of those recommendations, the steps taken did not fully address the issues identified in the recommendation. Management agreed with our assessment and has indicated the additional steps that will be taken to fully implement the recommendations.

## **CONCLUSION**

The results of this review indicate management continues to make progress in implementing outstanding audit recommendations. While we have identified a number of recommendations that have been outstanding for over three years and in certain cases over five years, management has indicated steps being taken and time frames for their implementation.

## **CONTACT**

Alan Ash, Director, Auditor General's Office  
Tel: 416-392-8476, Fax: 416-392-3754, Email: [AAsh@toronto.ca](mailto:AAsh@toronto.ca)

Jerry Shaubel, Director, Auditor General's Office  
Tel: 416-392-8462, Fax: 416-392-3754, Email: [JShaubel@toronto.ca](mailto:JShaubel@toronto.ca)

Syed Ali, Sr. Audit Manager, Auditor General's Office  
Tel: 416-392-8438, Fax: 416-392-3754, Email: [SAli4@toronto.ca](mailto:SAli4@toronto.ca)

## **SIGNATURE**

---

Beverly Romeo-Beehler, Auditor General

## **ATTACHMENTS**

- Attachment 1: Confidential Information:  
City Divisions – Confidential Recommendation Fully Implemented
- Attachment 2: City Divisions, Public Recommendations – Fully Implemented  
City Divisions, Public Recommendations – Not Fully Implemented  
City Divisions, Public Recommendations – No Longer Relevant

**CITY DIVISIONS  
PUBLIC RECOMMENDATIONS – FULLY IMPLEMENTED**

**Division:** 311 Toronto

**Report Title:** Procurement of 311 Toronto's Information Technology System -  
Lessons for Future Procurement Processes

**Report Date:** June 13, 2012

**Recommendations:**

- 001 City Council request the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management Division, to review and enhance the existing Purchasing and Materials Management review process such that inaccurate or questionable information on purchase request documents is identified and addressed prior to approval of the purchase request documents.
- 003 City Council request the City Manager, in consultation with the Director, Purchasing and Material Management Division, to take necessary steps to ensure that, where a contract service is not acquired under a fixed price agreement, the unit pricing, labour rates, and estimated labour hours are established prior to commencing the contract services, and the hours of contract services are tracked and documented.
- 008 City Council request the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management Division, to ensure adequate proposal evaluation processes are explicitly stated and detailed in the current purchasing policies and procedures in keeping with a fair and transparent procurement process.
- 009 City Council request the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management Division, in consultation with the Director, Corporate Finance Division, to ensure that Request for Proposals for significant dollar purchases are adequately evaluated to assess each proponent's financial viability. All documents pertaining to the financial viability evaluation are properly organized, retained, and disposed of in accordance with the City's record retention policy.

**Division: Accounting Services**

**Report Title: City Accounts Payable - Payment Controls and Monitoring Require Improvement**

**Report Date: January 17, 2013**

**Recommendations:**

- 002 City Council request the City Manager to issue instructions to City division heads for timely resolution of outstanding accounts payable queries.
- 008 City Council request the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management to further enhance divisional purchasing coordination through improved reporting and feedback with City divisions in order to facilitate consolidating purchases.
- 009 City Council request the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management, in consultation with the management of City Agencies and Corporations, review and consider the benefits of consolidating purchases with City Agencies and Corporations.
- 010 City Council request the Director, Accounting Services to ensure purchasing compliance reports are provided to respective divisions on a periodic basis and followed-up with non-compliant divisions.
- 011 City Council request the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management, in consultation with the City Solicitor, to ensure that a conflict of interest declaration is included in the sole source process including all future sole source contracts. Further, the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management, in consultation with City division heads and the City Solicitor, as necessary, evaluate whether existing sole source vendors should be contacted to provide a conflict of interest declaration.

**Division: City Manager's Office**

**Report Title: Review of Training, Conference and Related Travel Expenses**

**Report Date: February 07, 2014**

**Recommendations:**

- 001 City Council request the Director, Accounting Services and divisional management to ensure travel and conference claims are completed and expenses are reimbursed according to the Business Expense Policy.
- 002 City Council request the City Clerk to ensure that Councillors claims are reimbursed according to the Constituency Services and Office Budget Policy.



**Report Title: Review of Infrastructure Stimulus Funding - Opportunities Exist to Improve Controls Over Construction Projects**

**Report Date: October 05, 2011**

**Recommendation:**

009 City Council request the City Manager direct appropriate divisions to ensure staff managing construction projects adhere to operating procedures requiring payments against contingency be supported by change orders. Further, that change directives, RFQ issued by divisions, and/or change orders be approved by the appropriate signing authority prior to commencement of extra or additional work.

**Report Title: Audit of City's Performance in Achieving Access, Equity and Human Rights Goals**

**Report Date: October 14, 2008**

**Recommendations:**

017 The Executive Director of the Human Resources Division take steps to increase the workforce survey response rate among new City employees. Such steps should include, but not be limited to:

- (a) Improving the survey distribution method, and
- (b) Improving the communication of the purpose and benefits of the survey to new City employees.

027 The City Manager establish a formal process whereby access, equity and human rights initiatives and accomplishments by the City's major Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations is systematically tracked and reported to City Council on a periodic basis.

**Division: Employment & Social Services**

**Report Title: Toronto Employment and Social Services - Review of Employment Services Contracts**

**Report Date: September 30, 2013**

**Recommendations:**

001 City Council request the General Manager of Employment and Social Services to review the performance outcome criteria specified in contracts with providers of employment services, with a view to ensuring they are realistic, measurable and achievable.

004 City Council request the General Manager of Employment and Social Services to

review the referral process in order to improve the acceptance rate of participants into employment assistance activities. At a minimum, pre-screening tools provided by agencies should be used by Employment and Social Services caseworkers.

- 005 City Council request the General Manager of Employment and Social Services to ensure client service plans are updated on a timely basis for employment assistance activities and status changes.
- 006 City Council request the General Manager of Employment and Social Services to explore the opportunity to automate updates on employment assistance activities within the new provincial information system to be implemented for the Ontario Works program.
- 007 City Council request the General Manager of Employment and Social Services to explore how Toronto Employment and Social Services can efficiently analyze annual financial statements submitted by agencies.
- 008 City Council request the General Manager of Employment and Social Services to revise administrative controls to ensure payments for funeral services are properly authorized and in compliance with legislation and corporate policies.

**Division:** Engineering & Construction Services  
**Report Title:** Management of Construction Contracts – Leaside Bridge Structure Rehabilitation Contract  
**Report Date:** March 23, 2007

**Recommendations:**

- 009 The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer consider the implementation of a policy for the recovery of administration fees relating to the management of contracts by the City on behalf of third parties. Such a policy be included in the Technical Services Capital Works Projects Procurement and Administration Procedures Manual.

**Division:** Financial Planning  
**Report Title:** Financial Planning Analysis and Reporting System (FPARS) - A Large Scale Business Transformation/Information Technology Project  
**Report Date:** May 2, 2013

**Recommendations:**

- 001 City Council request the City Manager to ensure that prior to the development of large scale information technology projects, a detailed review of all Auditor

General's recommendations be conducted. Specific check lists be developed and signed off by senior staff attesting to the fact that all Auditor General's recommendations have been considered.

- 004 City Council request the Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer to report in detail to Council on the estimated costs to implement the capital budget component of the Financial Planning, Analysis and Reporting System.
- 005 City Council request the Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer, the Director, Financial Planning and the Chief Information Officer review and approve detailed cost estimates for large scale information technology projects for accuracy and reasonableness prior to submission to the Budget Committee and Council. Such a review include a financial analysis to identify, quantify and document anticipated financial and operational benefits for implementation. Further, the review should be clearly documented and approved.
- 006 City Council request the Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer and the Chief Information Officer to ensure that existing or prospective "off-the-shelf" software applications are thoroughly researched and investigated prior to developing a custom solution for future large scale information technology projects.
- 009 City Council request the City Manager direct all City Divisions to ensure documentation is maintained for issues and recommendations made by external consultants. Supporting documentation should include action taken on issues identified and related recommendations.

**Division: Fire Services**

**Report Title: Toronto Fire Services - Improving the Administration and Effectiveness of Firefighter Training and Recruitment**

**Report Date: September 16, 2013**

**Recommendation:**

- 006 City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to review the recruit training program for operational efficiencies that can yield opportunity cost savings, while, at the same time, meet Divisional diversity goals. The review should include, but not be limited to:
- a. Ensuring recruits are placed in the training program reflecting their qualifications; and
  - b. Evaluating the feasibility of eliminating the general stream by adding the Pre-Service Firefighter Education and Training Program Certificate as a minimum recruitment requirement.

- 007 City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to ensure mandatory training courses are conducted for the full amount of time as prescribed in the Collective Agreement. Such time requirements and expectations be communicated to all staff, including all training staff and firefighters.
- 010 City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to ensure that corrective action be taken, and documented, for cancelled in-service training when determined to be required. Additionally, the commitment to minimizing in-service training cancellations be communicated to all staff.
- 020 City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to review the Toronto Fire Services' Annual Self-Contained Breathing Apparatus Certification Program to ensure all standards and requirements are incorporated. Any changes to the program be communicated to and understood by all staff. The program as outlined in the standard operating guideline be updated accordingly.
- 021 City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to develop and implement a process to ensure opportunities for course feedback are made available to course participants, and the feedback reviewed by management. The Division Chief, Professional Development and Training, or designate, to review all feedback and to ensure suggestions are considered and where appropriate incorporated into future training courses.
- 024 City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, in consultation with appropriate Professional Development and Training staff, to review and update all standard operating guidelines that relate to training processes and procedures, and ensure that current practices and requirements are accurately and appropriately documented. Any updated guidelines be communicated to all staff in a timely manner.
- 028 City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to ensure that external training requests are approved before enrolment.

**Division:** Fleet Services  
**Report Title:** Reliable Data is Needed for Effective Fleet Management  
**Report Date:** April 18, 2013

**Recommendation:**

- 001 City Council request the Director, Fleet Services to ensure all City fuel sites are operating in compliance with corporate operating procedures and standards.
- 004 City Council request the Director, Fleet Services, in consultation with divisional staff, to develop fuel and vehicle usage exception reports that allow divisional managers to easily identify unusual usage patterns for further examination.

**Division:** Human Resources  
**Report Title:** Effectively Managing the Recruitment of Non-Union Employees in the Toronto Public Sector  
**Report Date:** June 19, 2009

**Recommendation:**

005 The Executive Director of Human Resources in consultation with the City Solicitor evaluate the feasibility, benefits and risks of adopting a City-wide Corporate hiring policy.

012 The Executive Director of Human Resources develop a hiring benchmark to measure the time required to complete the hiring process for non-union employees and monitor the performance of each hiring unit against the established benchmark. The Division evaluate the current hiring process to determine where “bottlenecks” in the process occur. Steps be taken to address these areas.

**Division:** Information & Technology  
**Report Title:** IT Service Desk Unit - Opportunities for Improving Service and Cost - Effectiveness  
**Report Date:** September 18, 2013

**Recommendation:**

008 City Council request the Chief Information Officer to explore the option of allowing users to check on the status of their service request directly through access to the IT Service Desk Unit’s incident tracking system.

**Report Title:** eCity Initiative - Improvements Needed in Governance, Management and Accountability  
**Report Date:** October 4, 2012

**Recommendations:**

001 City Council request the Chief Information Officer in consultation with the Business Executive Committee ensure that the IT governance framework is aligned with the strategic goals and objectives of the eCity Integrated Work Plan once it has been finalized.

002 City Council request the City Manager in consultation with the Business Executive Committee assess the relevance and role of the Service Office and if necessary to finalize the Service Office organizational alignment.

- 003 City Council request the Chief Information Officer in consultation with the Business Executive Committee review the relevancy of the eService Strategic Plan recommendations and update the plan accordingly.
- 004 City Council request the Chief Information Officer in consultation with the Business Executive Committee develop an accountability framework to manage the implementation of the eService Strategic Plan.
- 007 City Council request the Chief Information Officer in consultation with the Business Executive Committee develop an accountability framework to manage the implementation of the eManagement Strategy to ensure a successful outcome and maximize the value for money from the consulting contract.

**Report Title: Review of the City SAP Competency Centre**  
**Report Date: June 15, 2010**

**Recommendations:**

- 001 The City Manager, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, review the current reporting structure and relationships between divisional SAP representatives and the Competency Centre with a view to:
- a. minimizing delays in the completion of SAP projects
  - b. ensuring that the ownership of certain SAP modules is clarified and workable
  - c. ensuring that there is an appropriate segregation of duties between SAP divisional staff and the SAP Competency Centre.
- 002 The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer formalize a policy to require adherence to SAP best practices for all City-wide SAP projects, and implement quality assurance measures to ensure such practices are followed.

**Report Title: Review of Management and Oversight of the Integrated Business Management System (IBMS)**  
**Report Date: January 16, 2009**

**Recommendations:**

- 002 The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer require that divisions identify business risks relating to the IBMS Information Technology System. The Chief Information Officer review all such risks and ensure strategies and processes are in place to address all such risks.

- 003 The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer and divisions develop IBMS performance measures. Such measures be used to monitor ongoing performance. Where performance does not meet such measures, corrective action be taken.
- 004 The City Manager and Chief Information Officer as part of the IBMS governance process give priority to the development of IBMS business continuity plans. Such plans should include disaster and recovery planning.
- 005 The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer develop and formalize service level agreements for information technology services provided to City Divisions by the Information and Technology Division.
- 014 The City Manager conduct a review of related System users in the City and its Agencies, Boards and Commissions and update the existing software maintenance contract as required.
- 015 The City Manager ensure staff from business units perform the procedure for revising service fees maintained in IBMS and that the process be appropriately documented.

**Division:** Municipal Licensing and Standards  
**Report Title:** Municipal Licensing and Standards, Investigation Services Unit - Efficiencies Through Enhanced Oversight  
**Report Date:** January 30, 2013

**Recommendations:**

- 006 City Council request the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards to review opportunities to increase the use of standard checklists on remote devices used by Municipal Standards Officers.
- 009 City Council request the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards and the Chief Information Officer to enhance the Municipal Licensing and Standards Division billing process for enforcement activities in a manner that ensures such information is readily available to enforcement staff. Such enhancements to ensure:
- a. billings are done on a timely basis
  - b. billings are complete and accurate
  - c. billing information is readily available in IBMS
  - d. the process is automated to increase efficiencies.
- 012 City Council request the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards to establish adequate policies, procedures to ensure recovery of remedial costs incurred

by the City.

013 City Council request the Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer to clarify with divisional staff the requirement to report all account write-offs to City Council

**Report Title: Toronto Animal Services - Licence Compliance Targets Need To Be More Aggressive**

**Report Date: October 05, 2011**

**Recommendations:**

004 City Council request the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards formalize a plan to expand Toronto Animal Services' ability to provide animal adoption services by increasing the number of partnerships with veterinary clinics and pet supply stores.

**Division: Parks, Forestry & Recreation**

**Report Title: Parks, Forestry and Recreation Division - Review of the Management of the City's Golf Courses**

**Report Date: September 25, 2012**

**Recommendations:**

005 City Council request the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation Division review opportunities to make more effective use of information technology in the following areas:

- a. the updating of the City's website including the need to develop an online tee time registration system; and
- b. the development of a point of sale cash system which is integrated with the City's financial information system.

The review be conducted in consultation with the City's Information Technology Division, other Canadian golf courses, both municipal and non municipal and the National Golf Foundation.

009 City Council direct the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation Division to develop a process for the ongoing evaluation of vendors in the golf courses. Consideration be given to the development of a customer survey.



**Report Title: Parks, Forestry and Recreation Division-Controls Over Ferry Service Revenue Need Strengthening**

**Report Date: April 26, 2010**

**Recommendations:**

006 The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, evaluate options for automating the ferry service ticket inventory.

007 The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, evaluate options for:

- a. Automating ticket cancellation and refund processes.
- b. Implementing a process to analytically review cancelled tickets and refunds.

Further, the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, implement a process to ensure reasons for ticket and ferry pass cancellations and refunds are appropriately documented and are subject to supervisory approval.

010 The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, evaluate controls on system data and change management processes, and ensure corporate requirements are followed for current and future computer systems.

**Division: Purchasing & Materials Management**

**Report Title: The Charbonneau Commission - An Opportunity for the City to Re-evaluate its Procurement Practices**

**Report Date: February 7, 2014**

**Recommendation:**

002 City Council request the Director of Purchasing and Materials Management to meet with the Federal Competition Bureau to determine the Bureau's Investigation process particularly as it relates to:

- a. the criteria for referring specific cases to the Bureau
- b. the level of evidence required by the Bureau
- c. the results of individual investigations

**Division:** Real Estate Services  
**Report Title:** Appraisal Services Unit - Opportunities for Improving Economy, Efficiency and Effectiveness  
**Report Date:** January 25, 2013

**Recommendations:**

006 City Council request the Chief Corporate Officer to document Appraisal Services' operational policies and procedures, and ensure that any policies regarding the usage of external appraisers is aligned with the City's Conflict of Interest Policy.

**Division:** Revenue Services  
**Report Title:** Administration of Municipal Land Transfer Tax, Revenue Services Division  
**Report Date:** June 16, 2010

**Recommendations:**

- 002 The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer formalize policies and procedures designed to mitigate the risk of errors in the services rendered by Teranet Enterprises Inc.
- 003 The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer request from Teranet Enterprises Inc. its Compliance Monitoring Report. The Compliance Monitoring Report be reviewed to ensure it is independent, can be relied upon and any areas of concern are adequately addressed.
- 005 The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer complete a sample review of municipal land transfer tax rebates granted by Teranet Enterprises Inc. during the seven-month period ending August 31, 2008 to ensure that the City's rebate eligibility criteria were met.
- 008 The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer encourage prompt payment by developing policies to implement interest, financial penalties and other enforcement measures permitted by the Municipal Land Transfer Tax By-law No. 1423-2007.
- 009 The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer:
- a. in consultation with the City Solicitor, review the Municipal Land Transfer Tax By-law No. 1423-2007 to identify any provisions requiring clarification or amendment, and report to City Council, if necessary, on any revisions identified

- b. develop clear written guidelines to ensure consistent application of provisions in the Toronto Municipal Land Transfer Tax By-law No. 1423-2007 by staff of the Revenue Services Division.

**Division:** Shelter, Support & Housing Administration  
**Report Title:** Hostel Operations Review – Community and Neighbourhood Services  
**Report Date:** June 20, 2004

**Recommendation:**

017 the Commissioner, Community and Neighbourhood Services, review the Out of the Cold Program, with a view to:

- (a) evaluating the costs and benefits of the program;
- (b) reporting to the Community and Neighbourhood Services Committee, together with a recommendation on the future direction of the program both in the short-term and the long-term based on the evaluation; and
- (c) in the interim, provide clear direction as to how the program fits into the overall City shelter system, including:
  - (i) the City's role in the provision of the support services by the agency running the program; and
  - (ii) the City's role in the provision of emergency shelter services by the participating community organizations, particularly with respect to the applicability of the City's Shelter Standards to these organizations;

**Division:** Social Development, Finance & Administration  
**Report Title:** Municipal Grants - Improving the Community partnership and Investment Program  
**Report Date:** January 21, 2013

**Recommendation:**

003 City Council request the General Manager of Shelter Support and Housing Administration to revise the application process for the Homeless Initiatives Fund to ensure agency performance objectives are clear and are subsequently compared to actual performance.

**Division:** Solid Waste Management Services  
**Report Title:** District 2 Curbside Collection contract - Review of Cost Savings and Opportunities for Improving Contract Monitoring  
**Report Date:** February 06, 2014

**Recommendations:**

- 001 City Council request the City Manager to report actual cost savings achieved on District 2 curbside collections as requested by Council.
- 003 City Council request the General Manager, Solid Waste Management Services, to implement a systematic approach for conducting and documenting daily on-road inspections, which ensures that:
- a. random on-road inspections are reasonably distributed amongst all vehicles;
  - b. vehicles are selected from a complete and accurate vehicle fleet listing; and
  - c. significant performance deficiencies are followed up to ensure that appropriate corrective action was taken.
- 004 City Council request the General Manager, Solid Waste Management Services, to conduct periodic analyses of the overall on-road inspection results. Where recurring deficiencies are identified, corrective action be taken where appropriate.
- 005 City Council request the General Manager, Solid Waste Management Services, to ensure that contract monitoring staff use the available GPS technology to verify Contractor performance, and document such use.
- 010 City Council request the General Manager, Solid Waste Management Services, to establish a standard process for documenting meetings and other informal correspondence with the Contractor regarding performance or compliance issues. Additionally, evidence of ongoing communications be retained in a central location.
- 012 City Council request the General Manager, Solid Waste Management Services, to document detailed procedures for District 2 Contract monitoring and administrative activities. The documentation requirements for each activity be specified as part of the detailed procedures.
- 013 City Council request the General Manager, Solid Waste Management Services, to direct all District 2 Contract monitoring staff to conduct monitoring and administrative activities in accordance with the documented procedures.

- 014 City Council request the General Manager, Solid Waste Management Services, to remind relevant staff of the need to thoroughly review Contractor invoices prior to payment.
- 015 City Council request the General Manager, Solid Waste Management Services, to ensure that the details and payment structure for any future contingency work are documented as soon as practicable.

**Division: Toronto Building**

**Report Title: Toronto Building - Improving the Quality of Building Inspections**  
**Report Date: January 15, 2014**

**Recommendations:**

- 001 City Council request the Chief Building Official and Executive Director, and the City Solicitor to complete the review of the Dormancy Policy.
- 008 City Council request the Chief Building Official and Executive Director to take steps to increase the use of remote technology for recording inspection activity while on a job site.

**Report Title: Administration of Development Funds, Parkland Levies and Education Development Charges**  
**Report Date: June 16, 2010**

**Recommendations:**

- 001 The Chief Building Official, in consultation with the General Manager of Parks, Forestry and Recreation, implement controls to prevent the issuance of a building permit until parkland dedication fees have been paid.

**Division: Toronto Paramedic Services**  
**Report Title: Emergency Medical Services - Payroll and Scheduling Processes Require Strengthening**  
**Report Date: October 3, 2013**

**Recommendations:**

- 001 City Council request the Chief and General Manager, Emergency Medical Services, develop a process for timely review and adjustment of outstanding payroll variances. The process should be documented and communicated to respective staff. Further, documentation should be updated to include staff

responsibilities and time lines to ensure required pay variance adjustments are performed on a timely basis.

- 002 City Council request the Chief and General Manager, Emergency Medical Services, develop an action plan with timelines to expedite the implementation of the Internal Audit report recommendation to review and adjust existing accumulated pay variances.
- 004 City Council request the Chief and General Manager, Emergency Medical Services, develop a process for periodic analysis and reporting of staff overtime and absenteeism.
- 005 City Council request the Chief and General Manager, Emergency Medical Services, to review scheduling staff turnover and develop policies and guidelines to retain experienced schedulers. Where and if appropriate, new schedulers should be selected based on their ability to perform on a long term basis.
- 006 City Council request the Chief and General Manager, Emergency Medical Services, to develop a process for periodic review and reporting of shift exchanges, particularly staff with a high shift exchange frequency.
- 007 City Council request the Chief and General Manager, Emergency Medical Services, to expand monitoring processes to new paramedic schedules in relation to emergency service call volume patterns and make scheduling modifications as needed.
- 008 City Council request the Chief and General Manager, Emergency Medical Services, develop a process for periodic review of information technology user access to ensure system access aligns with related job duties.
- 010 City Council request the Chief and General Manager, Emergency Medical Services, to communicate information technology policies and procedures relating to user ID and password confidentiality. In addition, the practice of using generic or shared IDs should be discontinued. Valid users should have a unique information technology user ID.
- 011 City Council request the Chief and General Manager, Emergency Medical Services, develop a process to log user access changes with respective effective dates.

**Division:** Transportation Services  
**Report Title:** Local Road Resurfacing - Improvements to Inspection Process  
Required to Minimize Incorrect Payments to Contractors  
**Report Date:** September 25, 2013

**Recommendations:**

- 001 City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services Division, to ensure that inspectors are provided guidelines and training on appropriate measuring practices.
- 002 City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services Division, to ensure that cost sheets completed by inspectors include all measurements and appropriate notations to allow for an accurate determination of work done.
- 003 City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services Division, to give consideration to recovering overpayments made to various contractors.
- 004 City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services Division, to assess whether the measuring wheels currently in use meet the standard for quality, accuracy and dependability required by the division and take corrective action as required.
- 005 City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services Division, to ensure that inspectors maintain comprehensive and accurate measurements and records in their field books for all work done.
- 006 City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services Division, to ensure that inspectors check that work order numbers have been coded correctly on cost sheets and that supervisors randomly spot check work order numbers when approving cost sheets. Evidence of any review should be documented.

**Report Title:** Local Road Resurfacing - Contract Management Issues  
**Report Date:** May 10, 2013

**Recommendations:**

- 003 City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services to ensure that proper supporting documentation is prepared and management approval is obtained for extra work orders.
- 014 City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services to ensure that approved capital funds are only used for local road resurfacing work.

**Report Title: Inventory Controls Over Traffic Control Devices in Transportation Services Need to be Improved**

**Report Date: April 25, 2012**

**Recommendations:**

- 004 City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services, in consultation with the City Treasurer, to ensure the value of traffic control devices inventory is included in the City's financial records.
- 006 City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services, in consultation with the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management, to develop and implement performance indicators and metrics for inventory management.

**Report Title: Front Yard and Boulevard Parking - Improvements Needed to Enhance Program Effectiveness**

**Report Date: February 7, 2012**

**Recommendation:**

- 004 City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services to ensure that overdue accounts are charged interest in the manner prescribed by the Corporate Accounts Receivable Collection policies and procedures

**Report Title: Review of Coordinated Street Furniture Contract - Public Realm Section, Transportation Services Division**

**Report Date: February 3, 2012**

**Recommendations:**

- 004 City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services request Astral Media to submit quarterly maintenance reports satisfactory to the City. At a minimum, reports should include the following information:
- a. Location of street furniture
  - b. Weekly maintenance activity
  - c. Date and time completed
  - d. Summary of work completed.
- 008 City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services complete the transfer of data to update the system with the current information for planning and installation of street furniture.



**Report Title: Red Light Camera- Although Red Light Cameras Have Contributed to a Reduction in Accidents, Opportunities Exist to Improve Financial Results and Program Effectiveness**

**Report Date: August 25, 2011**

**Recommendations:**

- 001 City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services, review the current Red Light Camera evaluation process to ensure that it is current, complete and as effective as possible. Such a review include an analysis of evaluation practices in other major North American Cities. The General Manager, Transportation Services, update the 2006 evaluation of the Red Light Camera program.
- 005 City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services, explore opportunities for program cost sharing with other parties benefiting from the Red Light Camera program, particularly the Province of Ontario and the motor vehicle insurance industry.

**Report Title: Transportation Services - Review of Winter Maintenance Services**

**Report Date: April 26, 2011**

**Recommendation:**

- 004 The General Manager, Transportation Services, in conjunction with the Chief Corporate Officer, give priority to updating the long-term strategy for snow disposal operations, including:
- a. Determining the optimal number and location of snow dump and snow melting sites;
  - b. Developing timelines for the acquisition and development of snow dump sites; and
  - c. Reporting on the updated snow disposal plan to the Public Works and Infrastructure Committee by September 2012.

**CITY DIVISIONS  
PUBLIC RECOMMENDATIONS – NOT FULLY IMPLEMENTED**

**Report Title: 311 Toronto - Full Potential For Improving Customer Service Has Yet To Be Realized**  
**Report Date: October 17, 2011**

<b>No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Management’s Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame</b>
002	City Council request the Deputy City Managers, in consultation with the Director of 311, to conduct a comprehensive review of business processes of the call centers operated by Solid Waste Management, Municipal Licensing and Standards, and Urban Forestry, with a view to streamlining processes to effect a consolidation of operations.	Business processes reviews for Service Requests will be conducted as part of the implementation and integration of a new Work Order Management solution in 2015/2016. As part of the initial development of 311, comprehensive reviews of all lines of business were completed for Municipal Licensing Standards, Solid Waste and Urban Forestry. 311 Toronto continues to complete additional Business Process Reviews as divisional business changes to improve processes and take over additional lines of business.
003	City Council request the Director, 311 Toronto Division, in consultation with the General Managers/Executive Director of Solid Waste Management, Transportation Services, Toronto Water, Municipal Licensing and Standards, and Parks, Forestry and Recreation, to improve the service request status information such that customers are provided with accurate and clear status information on-line.	311 Toronto is in the process of completing enhancements to status information for service requests to improve customer service. While the enterprise wide new Work Management System initiative (target implementation date of 2017) is part of the long-term success strategy for service request status improvements, 311 will be implementing a transitional work around to provide better information to the customer by Q2, 2015.
012	City Council request the Director, 311 Toronto Division, in consultation with the Chief Financial Officer, to ensure that the inter-departmental charges to divisions are based on updated and accurate information supporting the basis for funding and cost recoveries.	311 Toronto has met with Divisions and financial planning and more accurate cost recovery (inter-departmental charges) will be included as part of the 2016 budget.

**Division:** Accounting Services  
**Report Title:** City Accounts Payable - Payment Controls and Monitoring Require Improvement  
**Report Date:** January 17, 2013

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
003	<p>City Council request the Chief Corporate Officer to develop a process to ensure outstanding accounts payable queries are promptly resolved in order to obtain vendor discounts.</p>	<p>The implementation of the new mobile work order system is "in progress" and expected to be fully rolled out by the end of the year (2015). In addition, through a recent upgrade to the Pcard program module (Xponential), this will provide an integrated payment solution (end to end) with the mobile application to expedite the processing of vendor invoices once approved. With the leveraging of these new tools and functionality, this will result in improvements to the payment cycle time of invoices and further opportunities to capture discounts offered by city vendors.</p> <p>To ensure active management of early payment discounts, Corporate Accounts Payable continues to send out weekly reports to AP divisional leads on discounts still available that have not yet been captured.</p> <p>The Manager and Supervisor of Business Support met with Managers, Supervisors and Processing Clerks at the districts in September and October of 2013 to stress the importance of capturing discounts, review business processes and discuss best practices. The districts were also provided with statistics of discounts captured for their individual areas and the division as a whole.</p> <p>Since May 2013, Business Support distributes weekly discount reports broken down by district location that show available discounts (amount and # of days available to process) to the Director, Manager, and Processing Clerks. Business Support also co-ordinates the resolution of any payment issues with Accounts Payable.  Completion date: December 1, 2015</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
007	City Council request the Director, Accounting Services to evaluate existing vendor accounts and payment monitoring reports with regard to improving reporting efficiency and effectiveness.	<p>Based on several projects noted (FPARS, Supply Chain Management), we still do not have the improved reporting that we expect to see once the full Business Intelligence capabilities are put in use.</p> <p>We hope to see reporting improvements by the end of the year.</p> <p>For the payable report re: possible duplicate payments, the process is working. Our exposure to duplicate payments is low and has been validated through annual third party audits (payable recovery reviews).</p> <p>Targeted completion date: December 1, 2015</p>

**Report Title: Review of The Management of the City's Divisional Accounts Receivable**

**Report Date: April 12, 2012**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
001	City Council request the City Manager to review the current management of all City-wide receivables. Such a process should be a part of the ongoing shared service review. The review should include an evaluation of centralizing the collection efforts of all outstanding receivables.	<p>Accounts Receivable is not one of the areas initially considered for the shared services review (see staff report dated Feb. 1, 2013 considered at Audit Committee on Feb. 15, 2013 and adopted by City Council on April 3, 2013.</p> <p><a href="http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2013.AU10.12">http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2013.AU10.12</a></p>
003	City Council request the Treasurer to review current SAP management reports pertaining to the management of receivables. The reports should contain relevant and current information and include performance management information.	<p>A request for new A/R reports was submitted on May 27<sup>th</sup> 2014 requesting new aging reports as well as a report based on status of receivable. This status will be tracked in a new field with 20 available descriptors such as "disputed", "collection phone calls made (1<sup>st</sup>, 2<sup>nd</sup>, 3<sup>rd</sup>)", "collection emails sent (1<sup>st</sup>, 2<sup>nd</sup>, 3<sup>rd</sup>)" etc.</p> <p>A significant number of change requests in SAP have been made and are in sequence to be completed along with other SAP request.</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
007	City Council request the Treasurer to assess the feasibility of using the City SAP Financial System to the fullest extent in tracking actions taken on customer accounts sent to Legal Services and collection agencies.	The status field request noted above includes indicators for accounts placed with legal, 1 <sup>st</sup> placement with a collection agency, 2 <sup>nd</sup> collection agency replacement, as well as indicators of partial payments in each of these categories. As mentioned a request has been made to enable reporting of these indicators.

**Report Title: City Purchasing Card (Pcard) Program - Improving Controls Before Expanding the Program**  
**Report Date: October 27, 2009**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
018	<p>The Treasurer develop and implement strategies to promote and expand the use of PCards by City divisions. Such strategies should include, but not be limited to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Analyzing divisional purchasing patterns to identify potential areas for expansion</li> <li>b. Developing and implementing measures to increase the use of PCards by divisions</li> <li>c. Setting performance goals for the City based on the number of participating divisions and yearly PCard purchase volume.</li> </ul>	<p>To promote the expansion of the use of PCards and alignment with operational payable needs of city divisions, we have developed a PCard Strategy Framework that includes six pillars:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Active Program Management</li> <li>2. Optimize Purchasing Card Deployment</li> <li>3. Extend Purchasing Card Usage within the Procure-to-Pay Environment – online payments, mandatory purchases</li> <li>4. Corporate VCard Program (virtual)</li> <li>5. Performance Reporting (KPIs/Metrics)</li> <li>6. Achieving compliance &amp; control while cutting costs and risks</li> </ol> <p>Work packages, deliverables and key activities that have occurred in 2014:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Upgraded PCard system platform to version 3.9</li> <li>2. Developed PCard Key Performance Metrics Dashboard in Q3 2014 (shared with AP divisional reporting leads)</li> <li>3. Configured, tested and ready to implement the PCard PO module for 2015. Will allow enhanced functionality for PCard payments against established contracts on SAP (drawdown);</li> <li>4. Improved communications and user training material resulting in lower compliance issues;</li> <li>5. Introducing a virtual PCard to streamline</li> </ol>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
		<p>payables processes</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>6. Improved financial integrity and appropriate controls (100% reviews)</li> <li>7. Working with PMMD to identify PCard payment opportunities for online purchases from city vendors,</li> <li>8. PCard deployment for emergency procurement (OEM)</li> <li>9. Investigated opportunities to further increase spend (mandate/highly recommend):               <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Memberships (renewals) payments</li> <li>b. Conference and training expenditures;</li> <li>c. Subscriptions</li> </ol> </li> </ol> <p>Tangible benefits have already been realized with the implementation of our new PCard Strategy Framework which included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- a projected PCard spend of \$9 million for 2014 (a 25% increase from 2013);</li> <li>- a projected 25% increases cash rebate in 2014 from 2013;</li> <li>- Average transaction value per active PCard has increased by 29% in Q3 (to \$269)</li> </ul> <p>Total # of transactions for active PCards has increased in Q3 2014 by 6.4% (1,952).</p>

**Division:** City Manager's Office

**Report Title:** Review of Training, Conference and Related Travel Expenses

**Report Date:** February 07, 2014

**Recommendations:**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
003	City Council request the Director, Accounting Services Division to review the issues identified in this report, particularly the policies adopted by other organizations and, where appropriate, incorporate revisions into the Business Expense Policy.	Accounting Services is investigating the policies / best practices of other organizations. To be completed by March 2015.

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
004	City Council request the Director, Organizational Development and Workforce Planning review the capacity of the corporate learning management system to provide periodic reports to senior management on training and conference hours and costs by employee groups.	Human Resources is reviewing the capacity of the corporate learning management system (ELI) to record and report on external training and conference hours by employee group. The capacity will be determined by the 3rd quarter 2015. If the system can be configured to do this then Divisions will be able to generate reports for senior management in the first quarter, 2016. The City's financial system (SAP) is the official and appropriate source of record for tracking costs to attend conferences.
005	<p>City Council request the Treasurer, in consultation with the City Clerk, to:</p> <p>a. consider planning and coordinating trips by simultaneously booking hotels and transportation for a group of employees and Councillors attending the same event;</p> <p>b. evaluate the feasibility of developing a hotel directory similar to those used by other large organizations; and</p> <p>c. negotiate similar discount rates as those used by other large organizations.</p>	Accounting Services is in consultation with the City clerk, reviewing the provincial arrangements for using a travel management company to coordinate trips and book hotels. To be completed by March 2015.
006	City Council request the City Manager to develop a strategy for training and conference needs and ensure that budget and actual costs are aligned.	By the 2nd quarter 2015, the Human Resources Corporate learning unit will start an assessment of training needs to inform both divisional and corporate budgets. The assessment will identify divisional, corporate and legislated priorities and inform a strategy to align budget and actual costs.

**Report Title: Review of Infrastructure Stimulus Funding - Opportunities Exist to Improve Controls Over Construction Projects**

**Report Date: October 05, 2011**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
007	City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services and General Manager, Parks Forestry and Recreation, ensure all staff managing	<p>Parks, Forestry, and Recreation has fully implemented this recommendation.</p> <p>Efforts have been made by Transportation</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	<p>construction projects, sufficiently document actions taken to respond to test results failing to meet specifications.</p>	<p>Services towards achieving compliance with the audit recommendations. However, the recommendations have not been fully implemented yet.</p> <p>A plan is being developed to implement all recommendations fully by June 2016.</p>
008	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services and General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, establish and implement procedures to ensure staff adhere to quality assurance procedures including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Materials testing and inspections</li> <li>b. Final inspections and deficiency lists</li> <li>c. Weight verification.</li> </ul> <p>Additional training be provided regarding the level of documentation retained to demonstrate compliance with policies and procedures.</p>	<p>Parks, Forestry, and Recreation has fully implemented this recommendation.</p> <p>Efforts have been made by Transportation Services towards achieving compliance with the audit recommendations. However, the recommendations have not been fully implemented yet. A plan is being developed to implement all recommendations fully by June 2016.</p>
011	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services, establish procedures for review of significant variances from estimated quantities and approval in accordance with signing authorities. Such procedures to include issuance of change directives and change orders be required for variances exceeding acceptable tolerances.</p>	<p>Efforts have been made towards achieving compliance with the audit recommendations. However, the recommendations have not been fully implemented yet. A plan is being developed to implement all recommendations fully by June 2016.</p>



**Division:** City Planning  
**Report Title:** City Planning Division-Community Benefits Secured Under Section 37 or 45 of The Planning Act  
**Report Date:** March 31, 2011

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
001	The Chief Planner assess the status of community benefits secured since amalgamation (January 1, 1998) under Sections 37 and 45 of the Planning Act to provide an appropriate level of assurance that all cash and significant non-cash benefits that should have been received, have been received and report any uncollectible benefits to Council.	Resources have been assigned to initiate the review of the non-cash benefits in the second quarter of 2015. Work plan to undertake the review is under development in advance of the work to commence in Q2.  To be completed by 2015 Q4.
002	The Chief Planner develop and implement a monitoring process to ensure receipt of all non-cash community benefits secured under Sections 37 and 45 of the Planning Act.	Resources have been assigned in Q2 to develop and implement a monitoring process of the non-cash benefits. To be completed by 2015 Q4.

**Division:** Deputy City Manager & CFO  
**Report Title:** Management of Capital Project 129 Peter Street – Shelter, Support and Housing Administration, Facilities Management and Real Estate Divisions  
**Report Date:** May 31, 2010

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
001	The City Manager direct all staff to prepare reports which contain accurate and complete financial impact statements. Such reports to address all financial implications both capital and operating. Reports relating to capital acquisitions contain information on required future state of good repair budgetary requirements.	Financial Planning will ensure that the Financial Control BY-Law is amended to include reporting framework that outlines all financial implications of acquisitions. Council approval of By-Law is planned for Q4 2015. In addition, Financial Planning will send out a reminder letter to all staff to outline reporting requirements relating to financial implications.
003	The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer propose amendments to the Financial Control By-law requiring that final total capital project costs for all major capital projects are	City staff developed a reporting framework for all major capital projects in 2013. The Financial Control By-Law changes reflecting the reporting framework have yet to be approved by Council. Anticipated completion time is end of 2015.

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	reported to the appropriate Standing Committee. Such reporting include a comparison of costs to budget as well as a comparison of actual completion date to projected completion date.	
007	The City Manager, in consultation with the City Clerk, give consideration to the development of a process or a protocol which would enable Councillors, when considering Motions, to be advised of the financial implications of such Motions. If this is not possible prior to decisions being made then consideration be given to providing this information at a subsequent meeting.	City Manager has determined that it is not always possible to advise financial implications during consideration of Motions for fear of impeding the progress of Council. The City Manager recommends that a separate report be provided subsequently through Budget Committee, Executive Committee, and Council where there is insufficient funding, or increased future year funding commitments, or altered project scope perceived to be inconsistent with Council intent. This process started in October 2013 and City staff have yet to evaluate this process.
009	The Executive Director, Facilities Management, be given sole authority to make decisions on the method by which accessibility requirements be incorporated in all relevant tender documents. The design of construction and renovation projects be required to comply with the City's Accessibility Design Guidelines and any new requirements under the Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act, 2005.	Facilities Design and Construction (formerly DCAP) is preparing a Consultant call to compare the City's Accessibility Guidelines to the prevailing Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act standards. The comparison of the documents is scheduled for completion by fall of 2014. In the meantime, facilities staff will update its Project Management Manual to refer to the prevailing AODA standards.
012	The Executive Director, Facilities Management, on a case by case basis, evaluate the need to conduct detailed building condition assessments prior to tendering major construction and renovation projects. The results of assessments be adequately documented and conveyed to project management staff.	The Facilities Design and Construction staff will implement new process(es) in 2015 to complete this recommendation.
013	The City Manager direct that Design, Construction and Asset Preservation staff consult with Divisions at the design stage of all projects. Appropriate sign	The Facilities Design and Construction staff will implement new process(es) in 2015 to complete this recommendation.

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	off of all drawings be standard practice by Design, Construction and Asset Preservation staff in consultation with Division staff. Such a process be incorporated into the Project Charter.	
014	The Executive Director, Facilities Management, ensure that contractor invoices and change orders are calculated in accordance with the terms of the relevant contract. Further, the Executive Director, Facilities Management, take action as warranted after consultation with the City Solicitor to recover any excess change order amounts paid to the 129 Peter Street contractor.	The litigation relating to 129 Peter St. has finally come to an end. But the first part of the recommendation has not yet been completed. New process(es) will be put in place in 2015 to ensure that invoices are paid in accordance with contract terms.

**Division: Employment & Social Services**

**Report Title: Toronto Employment and Social Services - Review of Employment Services Contracts**

**Report Date: September 30, 2013**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
002	City Council request the General Manager of Employment and Social Services to conduct thorough reviews of agencies not meeting performance outcomes in order to develop adequate Action Plans to improve future outcomes. For agencies consistently unable to meet performance outcomes, consideration be given to seeking alternate methods or providers for the service.	<p>This recommendation was implemented as part of the 2014- 2015 RFP process for Purchase of Employment Services. TESS developed baseline and target performance expectations for the key outcomes of each program as detailed in the Program Criteria.</p> <p>The complete implementation of this recommendation takes into account the monitoring that will occur throughout 2015. For agencies consistently unable to meet performance outcomes consequences include reduction of allocated seats and not having their contract renewed for the following year. Timeline: Q4 2015</p>
003	City Council request the General Manager of Employment and Social Services to conduct an independent	TESS is committed to ensuring its employment assistance programs are effective and help participants to enhance their employability and

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	<p>evaluation of the Division's employment assistance programs and report back on their effectiveness in assisting participants to sustain long term employment.</p>	<p>find and keep jobs over the long-term. TESS also recognizes the importance of high quality research and evaluation to support that end.</p> <p>TESS conducted a joint employment services review with the Ministry of Training, Colleges and Universities (MTCU), that examined the range of employment services. The results of this review were used to inform the redesign of the division's employment services.</p> <p>TESS agrees there needs to be a further evaluation of employment services and will be completing a comprehensive assessment of its purchase of service employment programs to assess their effectiveness in supporting social assistance recipients to obtain stable employment.</p> <p>This recommendation will be added to the division's 2015 - 2016 work plan.</p> <p>Timeline: 2016</p>

**Report Title: Toronto Employment and Social Services - Income Verification Procedures Can Be Improved**

**Report Date: October 6, 2012**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
007	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Employment and Social Services, in consultation with the City Solicitor, to review and resolve the differences between the Ontario Works Directive and the Toronto Municipal Code, relating to records retention for allegations of fraud that are deemed to be unfounded or unsupported.</p>	<p>The City Clerk's Office is expected to propose to Council revisions to Chapter 217 of the Municipal Code. The amendments will be added to the "Amendment to Records Retention Schedule A" report. A date to attend Council has not been scheduled. Timeline: in progress</p>

**Division:** Facilities Management  
**Report Title:** A Mid-Term Review of the Union Station Revitalization: Managing Risks in a Highly Complex Multi-Year, Multi-Stage, Multi-Million Dollar Project  
**Report Date:** October 2, 2012

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
001	<p>City Council request the Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer to implement additional status reporting for large capital projects, including the Union Station Revitalization including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Additional detail in capital budget and capital variance reports; and</li> <li>b. Separate status reporting to City Council for large capital projects. Thresholds on milestone slippage and cost escalation should be developed to determine the frequency and extent of such reporting.</li> </ul>	<p>In 2014 and beginning in the 2015 Capital Budget process, City divisions will provide additional detail on major capital projects in the form of stand-alone reports, updates in the quarterly variance reports, Budget Briefing Notes and/or updates in the Budget Analyst Notes. Capital Budget Guidelines now have thresholds on milestone slippage and cost escalation to determine frequency and extent of reporting on major capital projects. Separate status reporting to City Council will occur when the cost of the project has exceeded 10% of its original cost and/or if project delays exceed 12 months as compared to the schedule identified when the project was first approved.</p>
004	<p>City Council request the Executive Director, Facilities Management to report to City Council annually on the actual progress of the Union Station Revitalization project against the baseline schedule for each stage of construction. Such reports to include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Explanations for significant delays;</li> <li>b. Plans to make up for schedule delays; and</li> <li>c. Identification of any significant costs resulting from the implementation of schedule recovery plans.</li> </ul>	<p>2016 Project Stage 1 Complete</p> <p>Overall project milestone schedule updates are provided as part of Council reporting under Item #001.</p> <p>Original baseline schedule for Stage 1 of construction has changed, and Stages content has been combined, so that original baseline staging is no longer relevant to reporting Stage progress measurement here forward.</p> <p>Current "works" schedule, which is contractually non-compliant is being reported on by the GC/CM. This remains a disputed item between the GC/CM and the City, and the City is withholding full payment for serviced undelivered.</p> <p>City is in progress to engage a new General Contractor forward. Combined Stage 2/3 schedule will be available once new contract is awarded to</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
		a new General Contractor and overall schedule reporting will continue as part of the Council reporting under Item #001.
005	<p>City Council request the Executive Director, Facilities Management to obtain and monitor adherence to the General Contractor/ Construction Manager's critical path schedule. Monitoring activities should include:</p> <p>a. Identification, analysis and resolution of any deficiencies or impracticalities in the critical path schedule;</p> <p>b. Written communication of any disagreement with delays reported and changes made to the critical path schedule; and</p> <p>c. Tracking of the causes of delays.</p>	<p>2016 Project Stage 1 Complete</p> <p>City continues meeting with GC/CM multiple times per week in order to push critical deliverable items and report weekly to City Senior Management. Seemingly, the current Construction Manager/Constructor will never provide the contractually mandated resource loaded critical path project schedule, base-line or otherwise, now after 5 years of engagement.</p> <p>Updated "works" schedule including critical task items is updated and reported upon monthly however this "works" schedule remains contractually non-compliant and does not address the City's requirements; City is withholding appropriate payment for this incomplete service.</p> <p>Significant documentation being exchanged between</p> <p>owner/consultant and GC/CM instructing the development and management of a contractually compliant schedule but without effect. Funds withheld in relation to this non-compliance item. This remains a disputed item between the GC/CM and the City and as such, within the context of the original recommendation staff has addressed this recommendation.</p> <p>The City is moving to replace the current Constructor for Stages 2/3 construction forward.</p>
006	<p>City Council request the City Manager to ensure that the responsible City division develop and implement, for all significant and complex capital projects, an enhanced process for assessing and managing project risks. The risk assessment should be comprehensive prior to the start of the project and be continuously reviewed and updated.</p>	<p>Council adopted a Facilities Management "Approval of Major Capital Projects" report GM 26.4 on December 16, 2013. The report outlines a four phase approach to guide the process for addressing project risk noted in recommendation # 6 for Facilities Management related projects. This process will be reviewed with other City Divisions and adopted or modified as appropriate.</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
008	City Council request the Deputy City Manager responsible for the oversight of significant and complex capital projects where the Construction Manager model is being used, to ensure that the Construction Manager is engaged in sufficient time to allow for an effective review of design and contract documents.	Council adopted a Facilities Management "Approval of Major Capital Projects" report GM 26.4 on December 16, 2013. The report outlines a four phase approach to guide the process for addressing project risk noted in recommendation # 8 for Facilities Management related projects. This process will be reviewed with other City Divisions and adopted or modified as appropriate.
009	City Council request the Executive Director, Facilities Management, in consultation with the City Solicitor, to ensure adherence to procedures for the retention of critical and other relevant records related to the head lease, design, construction, and contract administration of the Union Station Revitalization.	On-going. City project staff continues to work diligently to ensure that critical project priorities and deliverables are being addressed.  Majority of required documentation has been collected and retained. Temporary resources were brought in to assist process. Document control position was filled in February 2014. Remainder of documents and procedures will be in place by the end of 2016. Foregoing is disputed by Carillion, and subject to judicial resolution in due course.
010	City Council request the Executive Director, Facilities Management, to implement procedures to ensure trade contracts are accurately and completely scoped prior to issuing competitive tenders.	On-going. City project staff continues to work diligently to ensure that project priorities and deliverables are being addressed. Contract documents being issued earlier to allow for proper input. Staff changes implemented by GC/CM have improved the completeness of recently tendered subcontract work. GC/CM has received sufficient time to ensure that future stages are more properly tendered. Formal Procedures are to be completed in 2015.
012	City Council request the Executive Director, Facilities Management to ensure controls are implemented to verify, on a periodic random test basis, labour costs against source documents such as time sheets or services records.	2016 Project Stage 1 Complete.  City project staff continues to work diligently to ensure that critical project priorities and deliverables are being addressed.  Consultant and third party resources are being utilized to review monthly progress payments and document submissions. Payment in only made for work certified by the consultant. Site field records have/are being retained by the City, to the extent that these records have been provided.

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
		<p>Considerable documentation has been exchanged between the Owner and the GC/CM requesting compliance with City's and AG's requirements but to limited effect. The City continues to request this information in monthly correspondence. This remains a disputed item between the GC/CM and the City and as such, within the context of the original recommendation staff has addressed this recommendation. The City continues to perform random and spot checks within the limits of current resources.</p>
013	<p>City Council request the Executive Director, Facilities Management to ensure controls are implemented to monitor the Reimbursable General Accounts. Controls should include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Authorization of work plans for significant components in accordance with the Phase 2 Agreement including monthly forecast to completion; and</li> <li>b. Timely comparison of the total amounts billed by component to budgets in the Phase 2 Agreement and investigation of any significant variances.</li> </ul>	<p>2016 Project Stage 1 Complete.</p> <p>City project staff continues to work diligently to ensure that critical project priorities and deliverables are being addressed.</p> <p>To address the concerns identified the City has, since 2012 initiated deliberate and prescriptive cutbacks to Phase 2 Reimbursable General Accounts billing. Considerable documentation has been exchanged between the Owner and the GC/CM requesting compliance with City's and AG's requirements but to no effect. This remains a disputed item between the GC/CM and the City and as such, within the context of the original recommendation staff has addressed this recommendation.</p> <p>The City continues to withhold full payment in this dispute, and documents that related payments made are under protest and subject to future judicial or other review.</p> <p>City is engaging a new Contractor for Stage 2/3 construction forward.</p>
014	<p>City Council request the Executive Director, Facilities Management to implement procedures to reduce design errors and omissions. Such procedures to include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Ensuring that design work is properly reviewed and authorized;</li> </ul>	<p>On-going. City project staff continue to work diligently to ensure that project priorities and deliverables are being addressed.</p> <p>Additional reviews of design work being undertaken.</p> <p>Only limited site survey work has been initiated</p>



No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	<p>b. Ensuring the Prime Consultant and General Contractor/Construction Manager carry out surveys of the site;</p> <p>c. Ensuring the General Contractor/Construction Manager performs a review to confirm the "constructability" of the design; and</p> <p>d. Evaluating the performance of the Prime Consultant at frequent intervals.</p>	<p>by CM.</p> <p>Adequate time has been provided to the GC/CM to perform constructability reviews, scope gap analysis, design completion and site conditions review.</p> <p>Informal reviews occur as needed at site and Consultant's office. Foregoing is disputed by Carillion, and subject to judicial resolution in due course.</p>
016	<p>City Council request the Executive Director, Facilities Management to ensure previously approved change orders are reviewed to ensure compliance with the terms of the Master Agreement and, where applicable, change orders are revised and credits owing to the City for pricing errors are obtained.</p>	<p>Adjustments to previously approved changes have been made and appropriate credits have been received on significant cost Change Orders. Forward, this will continue for all COs on the two schedule "L" affected electrical and mechanical subcontracts to their estimated completion in 2016.</p>
017	<p>City Council request that the Executive Director Facilities Management expedite the identification of and billing for additional work undertaken and paid for by the City for third parties.</p>	<p>On-going. City project staff continue to work diligently to ensure that project priorities and deliverables are being addressed. Additional staff resources have been approved and posted in 2013 to improve recoveries; however segregation of supporting documentation from the GC/CM requires improvement.</p>
018	<p>City Council request the Executive Director, Facilities Management to ensure adherence to operating procedures for change orders and change directives. Adherence should be evidenced in the official records retained in the City's possession.</p>	<p>Official records of all duly authorized change orders and change directives to date are in the City's possession; this will continue to project completion 2016. All CO/CD's forward are signed off by the Prime Consultant and two City staff even when within the authority limit of one single manager.</p>
019	<p>City Council request the Executive Director, Facilities Management to enforce the General Contractor/Construction Manager's adherence to key controls in their "Project Quality Management Plan" within the agreed lump sum amount for</p>	<p>On-going. City project staff continues to work diligently to ensure that project priorities and deliverables are being addressed. Project Quality Management Plan has been updated however progress on this is still required as CM appears unable to fully implement as per their submitted and approved plan. City staff have documented</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	Fixed General Accounts and Fee Price.	this and continue to request of and work with Carillion for improvement. This is disputed by Carillion, and subject to judicial resolution in due course.
020	City Council request the Executive Director, Facilities Management to establish a process to track and follow up on issues, deficiencies, and non-conformance identified through site reviews, inspections, and testing.	Site Review reports process has been changed to reflect documentation of close out of issues identified. Deficiency lists are being created and tracked for any areas being completed. Process continues to be refined and improved within 2015.

**Report Title: Review of the Energy Retrofit Program at Community Centres and Arenas**

**Report Date: March 26, 2012**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
001	<p>City Council request the Director, Energy and Strategic Initiatives to address the deficiencies relating to the energy management system with the objective of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Ensuring that energy savings are appropriately quantified;</li> <li>b. Ensuring that Phase IV performance guarantees have been met and appropriate adjustments, if any, are made in payment to the Contractor.</li> </ul>	<p>The Project Performance Period (2 years) starts after Construction Completion Certificate is signed by the City and the Consultant. During the Performance Period, Energy savings reports will be provided on quarterly basis. These reports will have indicated the performance of the measures implemented. There are a number of factors that influence changes in energy &amp; cost savings (longer hours of operation, staff turnover, other capital work, lack of maintenance contracts); EWO staff will communicate with PF&amp;R staff to document and confirm what has changed. Although it is too early to tell, EWO staff are confident that the performance guarantee will be met and that no payment adjustment to the contractor is warranted at this time.</p>
002	City Council request the Director, Energy and Strategic Initiatives to report to Council on the financial results of the program.	A report will be prepared for City Council by end of year 2015.
003	City Council request the Director, Energy and Strategic Initiatives, to provide appropriate operations staff with detailed facility by facility reporting of energy savings achieved as a result of the Energy Retrofit Program. Where such	This recommendation is partially complete. The Energy and Waste Office anticipates that this recommendation will be completed by the end of 2015 when they have upgraded the energy management database to produce regular reporting and secured a BAS maintenance

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	savings have not met objectives, appropriate remedial action, where feasible, be taken to maximize energy savings.	contract to monitor savings status.
004	City Council request the Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer in consultation with the Director, Energy and Strategic Initiatives and General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation to report to Council on remedial steps that can be taken to alleviate unintended negative financial impacts of the Energy Retrofit Program on individual recreational facilities.	A staff report will be prepared for City Council by the end of 2015.
005	<p>City Council request the Director, Energy and Strategic Initiatives, in consultation with the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation to review alternatives and implement effective support and maintenance of building automation systems. The alternatives should include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Centralized monitoring of building automation systems;</li> <li>b. Establishing in house building automation system expertise;</li> <li>c. Additional and ongoing training for staff responsible for monitoring and maintaining building automation systems; and</li> <li>d. Reviewing equipment not currently connected to each building automation system to determine if it would be advantageous to control the equipment through the building automation system.</li> </ul>	EWO provided one round of training to PFR staff on how to operate BAS in January 2014 and added 10 buildings to the central monitoring system. Staff are preparing to tender for maintenance/service contract in early 2016 subject to budget approval.

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
006	City Council request the Director, Energy and Strategic Initiatives in consultation with the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation to track costs specifically attributable to support and maintenance of building automation systems, where feasible, and include this information in any analysis of the net benefits achieved.	The Energy and Waste Office (EWO) staff are working with PF&R to develop a RFQ for securing maintenance/service contract for all BAS systems installed in the retrofit projects. As soon as a service contract is in place, EWO will determine the costs related to maintaining the systems. The implementation timeline has yet to be determined.

**Report Title: The Deep Lake Water Cooling Project - Total City Costs and Benefits  
Need to Be Reported**  
**Report Date: October 10, 2011**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
002	City Council request the Executive Director, Facilities Management, to conduct an evaluation of City facilities to determine whether or not financial and environmental benefits from deep lake cooling have been achieved.	Report is on track to be completed by Q3 2015.

**Report Title: Payment of Utility Charges**  
**Report Date: November 12, 2009**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
002	<p>The Deputy City Manager &amp; Chief Financial Officer develop a control framework to ensure the cost effective administration of hydro and natural gas invoice payments. Such framework should include, but not be limited to the following:</p> <p>a. a clear definition of the roles and responsibilities of the Accounts Payable Unit, the Energy and Waste Management Office and City divisional managers. The roles and responsibilities to include areas such as processing hydro and natural gas invoices, including following up on</p>	<p>(a) and (c) - Implemented (b) Not implemented - For new accounts, EWMO is contacted by AP when a utility bill for a new account is received. EWMO contacts corresponding division for cost centre in order to enable bill payment and adds the new account to our list in order to receive regular consumption &amp; cost reports. For changes and cancellation of existing accounts two processes have been set up with Enbridge and Toronto Hydro to ensure EWMO contact members are notified. EWMO will have evidence of the abovementioned for AG office to close this issue by end of Q4 2015. (d) Not implemented - EWMO has been generating and reviewing every performance reports to internal city clients. Evidence is available and will be provided to AG</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	<p>billing exceptions, dispute resolution and reporting protocols, as required</p> <p>b. the establishment of protocols for effecting and reporting on energy metering changes, including new meter account set ups, de-activations, replacements, relocations and record keeping requirements</p> <p>c. procedures for ensuring ongoing verification of hydro charges relating to street lighting by a staff person familiar with the operations</p> <p>d. reporting requirements for the Energy and Waste Management Office to communicate energy consumption fluctuations for divisional follow-up as required.</p>	<p>office to close this issue by end Q4 2015.</p>
003	<p>The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer review and make appropriate revisions to Accounting Services' Cost Centre Billing Procedure to include the revised utility payment control framework.</p>	<p>To support a controlled and structured payable process, Accounting Services, Corporate Accounts Payable is in the process of finalizing an official "Utility Payment Procedure" for payment processing. The draft procedure will be shared with the Energy and Waste Management office and other stakeholders if needed, for information and input with the understanding that this procedure will be finalized and implemented by the end of 2013. EWMO to follow up with Accounts Payable department for status of this recommendation and have evidence ready for AG review by Q4 2015.</p>
004	<p>The Executive Director of Facilities &amp; Real Estate Division take appropriate steps to ensure the Energy and Waste Management Office maintains a complete and accurate database on all hydro and natural gas meters billable to City divisions. The database be updated as required.</p>	<p>The current mechanism for verification of meters billable to the City is met through confirmation of account ownership from corresponding divisions through their provision of a cost centre to pay for the associated billed invoices. Evidence of associated correspondence will be made available for review to the AG office by the end of Q4 2015.</p>

**Report Title: Maintenance and Administrative Controls Review – Facilities and Real Estate**

**Report Date: September 16, 2005**

No.	Recommendation	Management’s Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
004	<p>The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer give priority to the completion of an implementation plan for facilities maintenance standards including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) a process to monitor compliance with legislative requirements;</li> <li>(b) funding, staffing and operational requirements of the Facilities and Real Estate Division and all other City divisions;</li> <li>(c) the development of specific facilities maintenance standards, if necessary, for speciality facilities such as water treatment plants and arenas; and</li> <li>(d) timelines for implementation.</li> </ul>	<p>(a) The SAP Plant Maintenance Module - mobile infrastructure project implementation started in 2014 with a pilot project rolled out to 2 districts. The software for asset tagging system will be available in 2016 for uploading in 2017.</p> <p>(b) and (c ) A new cross-Divisional team FMSSC (Facility Management Service Standards Committee) was formed to develop facilities maintenance standards for application across all City Divisions. A copy of the Terms of Reference is attached (dated July 2013) – confirming the team's mandate.</p> <p>(c) Standards will be developed by FMSSC by 2017 for implementation in 2018.</p> <p>(d) Will have a Facility Operations baseline (pilot) in 2015.</p>
013	<p>The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer take appropriate steps to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) determine the complete state of good repair backlog for all City-owned buildings;</li> <li>(b) develop City-wide funding priorities for the state of good repair backlog; and</li> <li>(c) ensure that approved capital projects are completed on a timely basis.</li> </ul>	<p>Facilities Management determines the complete State of Good Repair backlog for all buildings in the FM portfolio (approximately 433 Buildings) and establishes funding priorities for the State of Good repair backlog. Also, refer to recommendation #14 regarding CAMS.</p> <p>Other City Divisions that have transferred SOGR budgets are included in the FM Capital Budget Submission. There are additional City Divisions that will transfer their SOGR budgets to FM in the future and will be included in the FM Capital Budget Submission at that time.</p>
014	<p>The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer ensure that a database of the physical condition of all City-owned buildings is developed and forms the basis for a long-term capital plan. In addition, building condition assessments should be completed for all City-owned buildings using criteria based on industry</p>	<p>Facilities Management has completed building condition assessments for all buildings in the FM portfolio (approximately 433 Buildings). The capital assessment data is input into a Capital Asset Management System, (CAMS) to perform prioritization and sensitivity analysis.</p> <p>Other City Divisions that have transferred SOGR</p>

<b>No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame</b>
	standards and best practices developed by the Facilities and Real Estate Division.	budgets are included in the FM Capital Budget submission. There are additional City Divisions that will transfer their SOGR budgets to FM in the future and will be included in the Building Condition Assessment Program at that time.
016	<p>The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer take appropriate steps to establish a maintenance plan for each City building that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) includes both capital and operating repairs for current and future years;</li> <li>(b) addresses building deficiencies identified in building condition assessments; and</li> <li>(c) effectively coordinates maintenance and repair activities between the Design, Construction and Asset Preservation and Facilities Operations Units of the Facilities and Real Estate Division.</li> </ul>	Facilities Management has implemented a Capital Asset Management software solution as a first step. The Preventative Maintenance software solution was piloted in 2014 and will be fully implemented in 2017.
017	The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer ensure that all necessary building information is incorporated into the SAP Plant Maintenance and Asset Management Modules to assist in maintenance planning and repair decisions and provide a record of regulatory inspections.	The SAP Plant Maintenance Module - mobile infrastructure project implementation started in 2014 with a pilot project rolled out to 2 districts. The software for asset tagging system will be available in 2016 for uploading in 2017.
028	The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer ensure the SAP Plant Maintenance Module be used to schedule and track preventive maintenance services.	Facilities Management plans to introduce the SAP Plant Maintenance Module - Preventative Maintenance functionality to schedule and track preventive maintenance services in 2015 – 2017.

**Division:** Financial Planning  
**Report Title:** Financial Planning Analysis and Reporting System (FPARS) - A Large Scale Business Transformation/Information Technology Project  
**Report Date:** May 2, 2013

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
007	<p>City Council request the Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer, the Director, Financial Planning and the Chief Information Officer to ensure that upon project completion, a final “close-out” report is submitted to City Council. Such reports should include comparisons of budget to actual timelines, costs, actual benefits achieved and where applicable, a description of anticipated benefits not realized.</p>	<p>A final "close-out" report will be submitted to City Council upon project completion which will compare budget to actual timelines, costs, actual benefits achieved and, where applicable, a description of anticipated benefits realized. The cost and benefit estimates will be the subject of a post implementation review after the systems and related processes become rooted and fully operational.</p> <p>A decision was made by the project to delay the implementation of Enterprise Performance Management (EPM) functionality to 2014 and 2015 to ensure that the project is currently exploring the full potential of the new SAP performance and reporting functionality offered from the SAP Business Warehouse and Business Intelligence tools and its ability to deliver reporting, analytics and score-carding solutions for the City prior to engaging in the final activity of this project. Completion Date: Q3 2016</p>
008	<p>City Council request the Chief Information Officer to establish minimum documentation standards required in support of information technology projects. Standards should include one documentation repository in projects where various project leads exist. In addition, a formal process for collecting, addressing and reporting project risks and a formalized business change request process should be in place.</p>	<p>The Chief Information Officer is in the process of establishing and approving the minimum documentation standards required in support of information technology projects. The Standards will include one documentation repository in projects where various project leads exist. It is currently the Enterprise Project Management solution (EPM).</p> <p>In addition to the Enterprise Project Management solution (EPM), a formal process for collecting, addressing and reporting project risks and a formalized business change request process will be in place.</p> <p>Information and Technology Division has implemented the Enterprise Project Management</p>



No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
		<p>solution (EPM) as the authoritative centralized repository of project documents, risks and issues for all IT managed projects.</p> <p>The process will be formalized via a three step process. First IT division approval and a directive from the Chief Information Officer for IT to adopt this as the professional standard. Then it will be presented to the Business Executive Committee (BEC) for approval as a city wide standard and best practice, The final step will require a directive from the City Manager to implement this process on a city wide basis for all projects in consideration where various project leads exist. Completion Date: Q4 2015</p>

**Division:** Fire Services  
**Report Title:** Toronto Fire Services - Improving the Administration and Effectiveness of Firefighter Training and Recruitment  
**Report Date:** September 16, 2013

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
001	City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to update and finalize the multi-year Fire Master Plan in a timely manner, ensuring the plan addresses firefighter training and recruitment issues. The plan be flexible to accommodate Toronto Fire Services' service priorities and changing workforce.	Master Fire Plan will be tabled at the March 23, 2015 meeting of the Community Development and Recreation Committee (CDRC.)
002	City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to ensure that all of the issues identified in this report are incorporated into the updated Fire Master Plan where applicable.	Master Fire Plan will be tabled at the March 23, 2015 meeting of the CDRC
003	City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to take the necessary steps to evaluate the goals and activities of the Professional Development and Training	Master Fire Plan will be tabled at the March 23, 2015 meeting of the CDRC. A: KPIs are collected on a monthly basis and updated on a monthly basis; will be aligned with Master Fire Plan.

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	<p>Division. Such steps should include but not be limited to:</p> <p>a. Developing and using relevant and consistent key performance indicators that are aligned with the strategic goals of the Fire Master Plan;</p> <p>b. Determining the reporting requirements of training goals and activities, such as content, frequency, and recipients; and</p> <p>c. Ensuring necessary tools and information for measuring, monitoring and reporting activities consistently are available.</p>	<p>B: PDT Division Chief and Deputy Chief are updated on a quarterly basis.</p> <p>C: Cornerstone/LMS is not yet fully functional. Functionalities will be rolled out in phases; expected Q4 2015.</p>
004	<p>City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to ensure that diversity efforts are aligned with service priorities, and specific goals and action plans be incorporated into the Fire Master Plan.</p>	<p>Master Fire Plan will be tabled at the March 23, 2015 meeting of the CDRC.</p>
005	<p>City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to evaluate Toronto Fire Services' diversity initiatives to determine whether these programs are successful in meeting Toronto Fire Services' diversity goals and are cost-effective. Additionally, the Centennial College partnership agreement be reviewed on an annual basis to ensure compliance with all terms and conditions of the agreement, including insurance policy requirements.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Annual report on Diversity expected in Q4 2015.</li> <li>- Discussions with Centennial College regarding partnership are ongoing.</li> </ul>
008	<p>City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to review all mandatory training course lesson plans and daily agendas to ensure training-related</p>	<p>All 2014 mandatory courses cross checked by January 14, 2015. Supervisory check to be conducted to confirm.</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	activities and time requirements are accurately reflected and updated accordingly.	
009	City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, together with Professional Development and Training and Operations Division Chiefs, to conduct a review into the underlying reasons for the lack of instructor availability, and evaluate ways to address those reasons.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- New delivery concept of Field Training Instructor (FTI) on hold as of June 2014. This will be discussed in upcoming collective bargaining.</li> <li>- SOG T-COOR updated to minimize in-service training cancellations.</li> </ul>
011	City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to ensure that trainer-facilitators are certified by the Ontario Fire College, proper records are maintained, and documentation is submitted to the Ontario Fire College when required.	TFS will be submitting PD&T instructors training records to OFMEM by December 31, 2015.
012	City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to ensure that all shift training instructors are qualified and trained for the delivery of programs in accordance with internal standard operating guidelines and the Collective Agreement. Further, management take further steps to identify and formalize specialty training requirements. In addition, all qualification records be standardized and adequately maintained.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- FCC 14-10 Posting for Shift Training Instructors issued January 23, 2014.</li> <li>- Shift Training Instructors/Collective Agreement 2009</li> <li>- SOG T- COOR created and published July 22, 2014</li> <li>- SOG T- SHIF draft created.</li> <li>- Supervisor/DC checklist to track &amp; confirm qualifications pending.</li> </ul>
013	<p>City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to ensure that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Lesson plans align with the course syllabus;</li> <li>b. Lesson plans exist for every course in the program; and</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Draft SOG for Recruit Coordinator created and includes Audit Requirements 13 and 26. Once current Recruit Class is completed, the SOG will be updated, vetted and finalised by PD&amp;T District Chiefs. The SOG will then go out for 90 days review process and then published.</li> </ul>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	c. Lesson plans are updated on a regular basis.	
015	City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to ensure mandatory online training is completed on a timely basis. When firefighters fail to complete mandatory online training requirements, appropriate corrective action be taken. Any such corrective actions be incorporated into the standard operating guideline, and reiterated in staff communications.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- "Report Locker" for Platoon Chiefs update was available through Coursemill. The same capability is not available in Cornerstone/LMS. However, Platoon Chiefs will be able to query the status of online training completion as well as Instructor Led Training.</li> <li>- This process is not yet in place as Cornerstone/LMS is not fully functional. Functionalities will be rolled out in phases; expected Q4 2015.</li> </ul>
016	City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, in consultation with appropriate Professional Development and Training Division and Operations Division staff, to review the progress reporting process, and determine the appropriate types, frequency and content of reports needed to ensure mandatory online training requirements are met. Further, the standard operating guideline be updated accordingly.	Once Cornerstone/LMS is fully functional, reports will be configured (type of report, frequency, content) to assist staff in meeting mandatory on-line training requirements. Functionalities will be rolled out in phases; expected Q4 2015.
017	City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to ensure regular progress reports coincide with training due dates and be provided to appropriate staff on a timely basis. Progress reports be stored and accessible to appropriate staff.	Once Cornerstone/LMS is fully functional, Platoon Chiefs will be trained to access reports on due dates. Functionalities will be rolled out in phases; expected Q4 2015.
018	City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to ensure requirements for the Toronto Fire Services' Annual Self-Contained Breathing Apparatus Certification Program are complied with on a timely basis, and corrective action be taken where instances of non-compliance are identified.	Cornerstone/LMS is currently being configured to ensure conformity with Annual SCBA Certification, whereby non-compliance will be flagged and appropriate corrective measures/actions to be taken by the Platoon Chiefs.
019	City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services	PD&T responsible for TFS Annual Records keeping through electronic records management.

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	Division, to formalize and retain all individual firefighter annual Self-Contained Breathing Apparatus certification records to ensure that successful completion of the annual certification program is verifiable.	Cornerstone/LMS is currently being configured to maintain electronic records for Annual SCBA Certification.
022	City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to undertake a detailed review of National Fire Protection Agency's standard on Recommended Practices for Fire Service Training Reports and Records to ensure Toronto Fire Services' standard operating guidelines are aligned with recommended practices, where appropriate, and standard operating guidelines are updated accordingly.	TFS Acting Division Chief Audit Group finds no gap when compared to recommended practices: NFPA 1401; comparison document to be finalized.
023	City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to consult the City's Human Resources Division, the Ontario Fire Marshal, and other municipal fire services and consider whether Toronto Fire Services can benefit from evaluation methodologies being used elsewhere.	Contact with other Departments re and Evaluation Methodologies is ongoing.
025	<p>City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to develop and implement a records management policy. The policy should include, but not be limited to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Ensuring standard operating guidelines dealing with records management practices and procedures are consistent and align with City policies; and</li> <li>b. Ensuring standard operating guidelines are complied with, such as obtaining and maintaining all required documentation on file.</li> </ul>	SOG for records management to be developed using Training Records NFPA 1401- Section 21 GN 7 -3 as template. Will request assistance from Corporate Information Management Services.

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
026	City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to develop and implement a quality assurance process to verify the completeness, accuracy, and consistency of training records and ensure internal guidelines are followed.	SOG for records management to be developed.
027	City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to ensure automatic external defibrillator certification documents are maintained appropriately, and filed in an orderly and timely manner, and the electronic record be updated at the same time.	Cornerstone/LMS is currently being configured to ensure conformity with AED recertification. Non-compliance will be flagged and appropriate corrective measures/actions taken.
029	City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to ensure that shift training instructors submit payment requests on a timely basis. Further steps be taken to ensure that payments are accurately processed and supporting documentation is properly maintained.	Draft SOG Policy for STIs created. The SOG will be vetted and finalised by PD&T District Chiefs. It will then go out for 90 days review process and then published
030	City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to define the information and reporting needs of the Professional Development and Training Division and, in consultation with Information and Technology Division, assess the merits and feasibility of implementing system enhancements to improve functionality in order to meet those needs.	Information and reporting needs will be identified once Cornerstone/LMS is fully functional. Functionalities will be rolled out in phases; expected Q4 2015.
031	City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to ensure controls are implemented that provide for timely, complete, and accurate data entry. Further, controls should include a data entry verification process.	SOG T- COOR (July 21, 2014) has been updated to include quality assurance process for data entry. ILT Staff, when directed, will create a print-out and attach to the original entry sheet to confirm accurate data entry.  - Work ongoing.
032	City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to consider the use of integrated technology devices, such as	Consideration for integrated technology will be feasible once Cornerstone/LMS is fully functional. Functionalities will be rolled out in phases; expected Q4 2015.

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	barcode scanners, to improve the timeliness, completeness, and accuracy of training attendance records.	

**Division:** Fleet Services  
**Report Title:** Reliable Data is Needed for Effective Fleet Management  
**Report Date:** April 18, 2013

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
002	City Council request the Director, Fleet Services, in consultation with the Deputy City Managers, to assign and document roles and responsibilities for monitoring fuel use for all City vehicles.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Roles and responsibilities for monitoring fuel use has not been formalized to date at the DCM level</li> <li>• Fuel use exception reports for Class 1 and 2 vehicles that have higher than expected L/100 KM usage have been distributed and additional exception reports are being developed</li> <li>• Revised time for completion: End of Q2 2015 for automated Fleet sites</li> <li>• We have completed requirements for 26% of the divisions, which represents 88% of the volume.</li> </ul>
005	City Council request the Director, Fleet Services, in consultation with divisional staff, to develop appropriate procedures and reporting mechanisms for examining and reporting back on action taken, on items identified in fuel and vehicle usage exception reports. The procedures should include reporting all exceptions, and divisional actions taken, to the appropriate Deputy City Manager.	<p>Fleet Services continues to develop appropriate procedures and reporting mechanisms for examining any exceptions to vehicle and fuel use such as fuelling incidents above tank capacity and multiple fuelling transactions within a specified time period</p> <p>A Client Director will be requested to assist Fleet with the following responsibilities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• investigating exceptions and reporting back on actions taken</li> <li>• assisting with a summary of the exceptions and actions taken to be circulated to the DCM's as necessary</li> </ul> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Revised time for completion: End of Q3 2015</p>
006	City Council request the Director, Fleet Services conduct a review of the City's green fleet vehicles and report to Council on the progress on the City's Green Fleet	The task of reviewing the City's green vehicles was addressed in the City of Toronto's Consolidated Green Fleet Plan 2014 – 2018 as adopted by City Council on June 10 - 12, 2014 as

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	Plan.	<p>GM30.12.</p> <p>The City's green vehicles will be evaluated, and a report will be presented in Q2 2016. This is an in-depth comprehensive analysis which requires the Green Fleet Coordinator role that is being presented for approval as part of the 2015 Budget. This role is anticipated to be approved and filled in mid-2015.</p> <p><a href="http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewPublishedReport.do?function=getCouncilAgendaReport&amp;meetingId=7853">http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewPublishedReport.do?function=getCouncilAgendaReport&amp;meetingId=7853</a></p>

**Division: Information & Technology**

**Report Title: IT Service Desk Unit - Opportunities for Improving Service and Cost - Effectiveness**

**Report Date: September 18, 2013**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
001	<p>City Council request the City Manager, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, to undertake an assessment of divisional level service desk functions. Such an assessment consider the transfer of divisional service desks to the IT Service Desk Unit. Further the review consider operational need, resource requirements and service levels.</p>	<p>This initiative is being included in the IT Infrastructure Shared Service Review. A recommendation with action plan is targeted for Q3, 2015.</p>
002	<p>City Council request the Chief Information Officer to review the IT Service Desk Unit's first level resolution rate to determine if efficiencies can be gained by bringing the rate more in line with the industry average.</p>	<p>Assessment is underway with expected completion of assessment at Q4, 2015.</p>
003	<p>City Council request the Chief Information Officer to enhance IT Service Desk Unit's operations through the development and use of additional industry best practice performance metrics.</p>	<p>Development of additional performance metrics is underway. Expected completion: Q2, 2015.</p>



No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
004	City Council request the Chief Information Officer to implement proactive problem management for the IT Service Desk Unit to improve the efficiency and cost-effectiveness in providing information technology support.	I&T Division has initiated development of a Problem Management Process. A function to support this is being designed. Problem Management process design completion is expected by Q3, 2015. A new function within I&T to implement the function is similarly expected to be established by Q3, 2015.
005	City Council request the Chief Information Officer to ensure that staff comply with City procedures and administrative practices governing IT Service Desk Unit activity.	Development of revised Tier 2 Service Desk procedure is underway. Communication will be distributed once completed. Expected completion: Q1, 2015.
006	City Council request the Chief Information Officer to ensure management reports designed to track and monitor service requests are distributed to appropriate individuals for review and corrective action where required. Evidence of such review and action taken should be documented and reported to the Chief Information Officer.	Development of additional Tier 2 team lead reports, tracking procedure and distribution process is underway. Expected completion: Q2, 2015.
007	City Council request the Chief Information Officer to make it mandatory within the project management framework to include the IT Service Desk Unit as a project member should there be an expectation that the IT Service Desk Unit will be providing support to new IT initiatives.	The Project Management Revised IT Governance is underway and will address this. Expected completion: Q1, 2015. The Service Desk internal intake procedures for on boarding of new services has been completed (Q1, 2014).
009	City Council request the Chief Information Officer to review staff scheduling to ensure that the number of staff available is appropriately matched to service demand levels.	The Service Desk increased 8:00am shift by two new staff in September 2014, but the benefit was negated by two other staff leaving the Service Desk. Two more additional new staff were hired and trained, the Service Desk increased early morning staffing level from 12 to 14 staff starting January 12, 2015. The Service Desk Operations had only three months data to work with and it is still too early to determine whether the demand spike has been fully addressed. The staffing level and call volume levels will be reassessed at the end of Q4, 2015 and annually after that.

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
010	City Council request the Chief Information Officer to review internal IT Division work tasks being referred to the IT Service Desk Unit to ensure that is an appropriate and efficient use of IT Service Desk Unit resources.	IT work management system has been implemented in Q2 2014 to ensure adherence. Development of revised ITSM processes and implementation of self service is underway. Expected completion: Q1, 2015.
011	City Council request the Chief Information Officer to put in place a process for the timely collection and analysis of user feedback in relation to the IT Service Desk Unit.	Initial customer satisfaction survey has been completed. Assessment of automated feedback options to commence shortly. Expected completion: Q2, 2015.

**Report Title: Electronic Data - Standardizing Data Formats Across City Information Systems**

**Report Date: January 9, 2013**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
001	City Council request the Chief Information Officer and the City Clerk to review current data standards and, in consultation with City divisions, develop a plan for implementing uniform data standards across the City.	The Information & Technology Division and City Clerks will develop a plan for implementing uniform data standards.  Expected Completion: December 2016.
002	City Council request the Chief Information Officer and the City Clerk to recommend the data standards to City agencies and corporations for adoption.	As uniform data standards are developed, they will be forwarded to the City Manager's Office to be included in the governance discussions between the City and its agencies and corporations.

**Report Title: eCity Initiative - Improvements Needed in Governance, Management and Accountability**

**Report Date: October 4, 2012**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
006	City Council request the Chief Information Officer in consultation with the Business Executive Committee develop performance measures for the eCity Vision that are relevant, reliable and measurable.	Draft eCity strategy performance measures have been developed with an approval targeted for the Q3 2015 through the IT Governance framework.

**Report Title: Governance and Management of City Computer Software Needs Improvement**

**Report Date: January 7, 2011**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
004	The Chief Information Officer ensure the City Information Technology Risk Management Program includes a periodic risk assessment to identify, assess and implement processes to address software related risk.	The IT Service Management program roadmap has undergone a significant review which has set a more realistic time line and includes recently resourcing new certified team members (Jun 2014).  The Asset Management process is on target to be completed 2015-Q4 with reporting to commence in 2016-Q1

**Report Title: Review of the City SAP Competency Centre**

**Report Date: June 15, 2010**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
004	The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer establish a formal process for ensuring those assigned accountability for overseeing SAP projects understand the City SAP environment and have sufficient knowledge and expertise in SAP best practice and methodology.	All SAP projects managers and leads will be assessed by the SAP Architect, the SAP Project Managers will be accountable to the SAP Architect for all technical project deliverables. All project Managers will be required to have demonstrated experience with SAP project delivery methodology. This will be implemented as part of the SAP Governance by Q2 2015
005	The Chief Information Officer include SAP Competency Centre service level expectations in formal service level agreements currently being prepared between operating divisions and the Information and Technology Division	The SAP Service Centre is identifying current services being provided to the City this will be enhanced with the addition of the services being provided by divisions for SAP modules. By Q3 2015
006	The City Manager establish a process for maintaining a single repository for SAP related issues and risks, and the Chief Information Officer establish a formal process for collecting, addressing and reporting on such risks.	A repository is provided by SAP that keeps track of all technical issues, We are implementing a services intake process that will log all requests that are reported and risk identified through regular monitoring of service request, projects, and other changes. By Q3 2015
007	The Chief Information Officer develop SAP Competency Centre performance	SAP Service Centre performance measures will be established based on the Services defined and

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	measures and standards. Such measures and standards should monitor ongoing performance.	SLA established during 2015, by Q4 2015 performance measures will begin to be utilized for management purposes.

**Report Title: Governance and Management of City Wireless Technology Needs Improvement**

**Report Date: April 20, 2010**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
003	The Chief Information Officer prepare a comprehensive City-wide IT Wireless Plan and periodically review the plan to ensure that it is current and relevant.	The Information & Technology Division will develop a comprehensive plan and implement a periodic timeline for review of the plan.  Expected completion: December 2016
005	The Chief Information Officer implement City-wide wireless standards and develop procedures to provide for periodic review to ensure the accuracy and relevancy of wireless standards.	The Information & Technology Division has drafted a Wireless Network Standard that is in the review process with planned completion Q3, 2015.
006	The Chief Information Officer develop a comprehensive IT Security Manual as a ready reference for City staff.	The Information & Technology Division has drafted an IT Security Policy that is currently in consultation with City stakeholders with planned completion and approval Q4 2015.
007	The Chief Information Officer implement additional measures to further reduce the risk of unauthorized access to City wireless technology.	The Information & Technology Division utilizes a combination of Administrative and Compensating controls to address this finding. An example of a compensating control is the ability to use technology to detect rogue access points on the Corporate network.  In 2014 the Information & Technology Division initiated a Threat Risk Assessment (City of Toronto Corporate Wireless Network Access - Security Review) and the results are currently being considered for potential actions to be confirmed by Q2 2015.

**Report Title: Review of Management and Oversight of the Integrated Business Management System (IBMS)**

**Report Date: January 16, 2009**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
007	The City Manager in consultation with the Chief Information Officer develop and implement a change management protocol for IBMS. Such a protocol take into account the SAP change management protocol.	IT Change management process is being updated and completed by June 30th, 2015

**Report Title: Disaster Recovery Planning for City Computer Facilities**

**Report Date: April 3, 2008**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
002	The City Manager implement a disaster recovery and business continuity program that includes divisional roles and responsibilities, resource and training requirements, and simulation and plan maintenance schedules.	<p>This mandate now belongs to the Office of Emergency Management (OEM).</p> <p>The OEM has partnered with the I&amp;T Division to develop a new City-wide Business Continuity Management program.</p> <p>The program has been approved by the Emergency Management Working Group and the Toronto Emergency Management Program Committee (TEMPC).</p> <p>A comprehensive Business Continuity Program will take several years to develop; however, the current commitment is to complete Business Impact Analyses (BIA) and draft Business Continuity Plans (BCPs) for all Divisions by Q4 2015.</p> <p>The OEM has partnered with the I&amp;T Division to develop a new City-wide Business Continuity Management program.</p> <p>The program has been approved by the Emergency Management Working Group and the</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
		<p>Toronto Emergency Management Program Committee (TEMPC).</p> <p>A comprehensive Business Continuity Program will take several years to develop; however, the current commitment is to complete Business Impact Analyses (BIA) and Business Continuity Plans (BCPs) for all Divisions by the end of 2014.</p> <p>Completion date: Q4 2015</p>
005	<p>The Chief Information Officer review the backup and storage procedures of City information technology units for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) compliance with acceptable standards and practices for data backup and storage requirements; and</li> <li>(b) provide divisions with the opportunity to participate in existing data storage arrangements within the City or with the outside service provider.</li> </ul>	<p>(a) Procedure review should be completed by Q4 2015.</p> <p>(b) The following Divisions are currently using I&amp;T's external offsite data storage provider: Policy, Planning, Finance &amp; Administration &amp; Toronto Public Health.</p> <p>This service has been available to all other divisions since Q2 2010.</p>
006	<p>The City Manager, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, direct divisions to test information technology disaster recovery plans on a regular basis.</p>	<p>The memo has been drafted and currently resides with the Chief Information Officer who is working in conjunction with the City Manager to have it issued. Completion date: Q2 2015</p>
007	<p>The Chief Information Officer develop disaster recovery testing guidelines and provide training necessary to ensure cross-divisional consistency.</p>	<p>As the new City-wide BCM program is developed, and the I&amp;T Division determines its long-term Data Centre strategy, disaster recovery testing guidelines will be determined and rolled-out to all divisions. A training strategy will also be developed to ensure cross-divisional consistency. Completion date: Q4 2016</p>

**Division:** Municipal Licensing and Standards  
**Report Title:** Municipal Licensing and Standards, Investigation Services Unit - Efficiencies Through Enhanced Oversight  
**Report Date:** January 30, 2013

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
001	<p>City Council request the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. review and, where appropriate, amend individual and organizational performance objectives particularly those pertaining to emergency complaints</li> <li>b. develop a quality assurance program to ensure that there is an ongoing review of staff's performance against objectives</li> <li>c. ensure that appropriate action is taken to address performance which does not meet the established standard.</li> </ul>	<p>Managers and Supervisors monitor and review staff performance with respect to investigations being conducted/actions taken and meet with staff to discuss their performance and workload on a monthly basis at a minimum. Ongoing review of performance standards and adjustments to these standards is being undertaken in Q1 2015 and will be fully implemented by Q2 2015. Supervisors training program is in development by ML&amp;S that will assist the Supervisors in developing the necessary skills to address performance issues. To be completed Q3 2015.</p>
002	<p>City Council request the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. develop and document organizational expectations for recording the progress and closure of investigations</li> <li>b. develop a management oversight process to ensure that policies and procedures and expectations are complied with. Particular emphasis be placed on the review of all emergency related complaints. The oversight process include appropriate levels of documentation and evidence of supervisory approval</li> <li>c. develop a process to ensure that investigations are assigned to</li> </ul>	<p>Once the objective with respect to closure of investigations is determined, Management will be able to establish a process. Management has begun discussions with IT on how to generate required reports from IBMS. An SOP has been recently drafted which outlines the process for Supervisor regarding assigning work when an officer is away for a period of time, either due to extended vacation and/or illness. To be completed Q3 2015.</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	<p>appropriate staff with particular emphasis on reallocating files from staff who are absent for significant periods of time.</p>	
003	<p>City Council request the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. develop and implement a formal training plan for all Municipal Standards Officers</li> <li>b. maintain documentation relating to training received for all Municipal Standards Officers</li> <li>c. training records be reviewed by management on a regular basis to confirm that all Municipal Standards Officers have received an appropriate level of training.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. A comprehensive training plan was developed and implemented in 2013 for all new MSOs and carried forward into 2014.</li> <li>b. SAP is being used to track training. The Division also maintains a Course Calendar and Divisional Course listing.</li> <li>c. An inventory of staff training and identified training requirements based on needs was completed. Training matrix, by position, is under development. To be completed Q3 2015.</li> </ul>
004	<p>City Council request the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. review the ongoing allocation of workload of Municipal Standards Officers with a view to ensuring there is an equal distribution of work load</li> <li>b. consider changing the current hours of work to correspond better with the times when most owners of properties are available</li> <li>c. re-evaluate the requirement for Municipal Standards Officers to physically attend the office at the beginning and end of every shift.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. A Manager of Business Performance and Change Initiatives has been hired, who will be assisting with the necessary workload analysis. This work is expected to be completed by Q2 -2015.</li> <li>b. Investigation Services will be implementing extended work hours</li> </ul> <p>To be completed Q4 2015.</p>
008	<p>City Council request the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards to report back to Council, as</p>	<p>The review of the pilot is on-going and the results will be provided to Financial Planning Division prior to the 2016 Budget process to re-evaluate</p>



No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	outlined in the 2013 budget request, on the results of the pilot project providing corporate vehicles to Municipal Standards Officers.	the pilot project and to determine requirements, including adding new vehicles in replacement of the MSO's pilot vehicles. To be completed Q4 2015.
010	City Council request the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards, in consultation with the City Solicitor, to make the necessary changes to the Municipal Code to allow for the waiving of fees where appropriate.	Discussions have commenced with Legal Services to determine the appropriate approach to address this request. More review of the statutes is required. To be completed Q1 2015.
011	City Council request the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards to ensure that re-inspection fees are billed to property owners as required by the Municipal Code.	<p>The Division together with IBMS staff reviewed the re-inspection fee process and automated the billings to occur on a monthly basis. Supervisors review the re-inspection fees for invoicing and authorize release. Review of IBMS exception reporting is to be undertaken to determine if oversight tools can be developed to identify when fees are not applied. To be completed Q2 2015.</p> <p>Review of IBMS exception reporting is to be undertaken to determine if oversight tools can be developed to identify when fees are not applied.</p>

**Report Title: Toronto Animal Services - Licence Compliance Targets Need To Be More Aggressive**

**Report Date: October 05, 2011**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
001	City Council request the Executive Director, Municipal Licensing and Standards to revisit the 2005 Dog and Cat Licensing Strategy Report and provide Council with an updated plan of action. This process be part of the upcoming review of licensing revenues due in 2012. Realistic but aggressive licence compliance targets for 2012 and onwards be established. Such compliance rates be incorporated into future operating budgets. Comparisons of actual compliance rates to target rates be monitored and reported to City	<p>Reports have been submitted to Licensing and Standards</p> <p>Committee in 2012 and 2013 that address Toronto</p> <p>Animal Services plan of action and efforts in increasing licensing of animals, including introduction of the rewards program and microchip program. In addition, Toronto Animal Services reorganised its operation in 2011 with dedicated staff efforts in animal care and enforcement.</p> <p>Realistic revenue projections are included in the</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	Council annually.	<p>2013 Budget and a target of 10% increase in licensing targets for 2014 has been projected. This recommendation also responds to the need to revisit the 2006 Licensing Strategy which was supported by appropriate public education and enforcement activities.</p> <p>In January 2014 BluePaw was launched to further support new licenses and improve licensing compliance.</p>

**Division:** Parks, Forestry & Recreation  
**Report Title:** Parks, Forestry and Recreation – Capital Program – The Backlog in Needed Repairs Continues to Grow  
**Report Date:** January 23, 2009

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
001	<p>The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, develop a comprehensive master service and infrastructure plan, incorporating the Division's "Our Common Grounds" strategy and all related studies being developed or planned pertaining to parks and recreation facilities, and report to the Community Development and Recreation Committee by June 30, 2010. Such master plan to include, but not limited to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. specific action plans, timelines and responsibility for implementation</li> <li>b. estimated costs and potential funding sources or partnership opportunities to be explored</li> <li>c. reporting on the status of the master implementation plan as part of the annual capital budget submission.</li> </ul>	<p>A Recreation Facilities Strategic Plan is in progress with a target report submission and City Council approval date of December 2015.</p> <p>A Corporate Partnership Strategy is being developed in consultation with all Divisions for 2015.</p> <p>Capital projects may be identified as priorities in which case partnership opportunities will be explored. In addition, the TOP office and PF&amp;R continually look for partnerships with the private sector (unsolicited proposals), to secure opportunities for service improvements and state-of-good repair projects with the PF&amp;R Division.</p>
002	<p>The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, take appropriate steps to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. develop criteria for determining</li> </ul>	<p>As reported in 2011: Currently in place. Capital projects are reviewed by PF&amp;R Branches to ensure they are still applicable.</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	<p>when a City facility is considered to be no longer cost-effective to maintain, taking into consideration such factors as utilization, ongoing operating and capital maintenance costs, location, and proximity to other facilities, community impact and changing demographics</p> <p>b. where practical, incorporate the criteria developed into the capital asset management system</p> <p>c. compile a comprehensive inventory of all facilities that are no longer cost-effective to maintain based on criteria developed in (a.)</p> <p>d. identify opportunities for consolidation of operations within existing facilities or potential new ones and recommend facility closures, if warranted</p> <p>e. determine the full financial implications of either maintaining, enhancing or closing facilities, including any potential program changes resulting from each option</p> <p>f. where a facility closure is recommended, develop alternate accommodation for viable affected programs</p> <p>g. conduct appropriate community consultations of any planned actions.</p>	<p>In addition, a Recreation Facilities Strategic Plan will be developed in 2013 to help guide further decision-making based on outcomes from the Corporate Efficiency Review, Core Service Review and information from the PF&amp;R Service Plans.</p> <p>As reported in 2011:</p> <p>Currently in place.</p> <p>As reported in 2011:</p> <p>The Capital Projects Section has developed the PRIORITY RANK FACTOR (PCR) which drives the state-of-good repair project priority in the Capital Asset Management (CAMP) budget. Each project listed in the CAMP budget is assigned a PCR. The PCR is the sum of the various rankings applied to each asset that include the FACILITY CONDITION INDEX (FCI), PRIORITYFACTOR (PF) and RANK FACTOR (RF).</p> <p>In progress. A Recreation Facilities Strategic Plan will be developed in 2015 to help guide further decision-making.</p> <p>As above.</p>
007	<p>The City Manager, in consultation with the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation and the Director, Toronto Office of Partnerships, develop, for approval by Council, a comprehensive City-wide policy on naming rights and other private funding arrangements, such policy to</p> <p>a. consider all existing policies related to:</p> <p>i. Parks and Recreation Naming and Renaming Policy</p>	<p>i)Reference is made to Report EX12.2 City Council approved Naming Rights &amp; Sponsorship Policy in December 2011.</p> <p>ii)As reported in 2011: Donations Policy currently exists.</p> <p>iii) An Advertising policy has been drafted and reviewed by a number of Divisions. The policy will go forward to Council in the second quarter of 2015.</p> <p>Iv)As reported in 2011:</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>ii. Donations policy</li> <li>iii. Advertising</li> <li>iv. Unsolicited bids</li> <li>v. Sponsorships and partnerships</li> </ul> <p>b. include guidelines on</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i. eligibility criteria for facilities to be considered for naming rights</li> <li>ii. responsibility and control processes for securing and accepting naming rights or other private funding arrangements</li> <li>iii. the creation of endowment, or similar funds, to offset future maintenance and repair costs for new facilities put in place under this policy.</li> </ul>	<p>A policy on unsolicited proposals and a corporate process is in place.</p> <p>V. Reference is made to Report EX12.2 City Council approved Naming Rights &amp; Sponsorship Policy in December 2011.</p> <p>b. Guidelines have been developed and will be used to create an initial short list of naming opportunities through the Corporate Partnership Strategy process. Research on best practices of North American municipalities is underway. Report is scheduled for Summer 2013.</p> <p>Maintenance guidelines have been drafted and are released to relevant Divisions.</p>
009	<p>The General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation, give priority to completing the development and implementation of the work order system for Parks, Forestry and Recreation Division to provide the tracking of both operating and capital costs of each facility.</p>	<p>This is a Capital project to implement a PF&amp;R Work Order Management System.</p> <p>PF&amp;R's Work Management System acquisition and implementation is now part of an enterprise initiative.</p>

**Division: Purchasing & Materials Management**

**Report Title: The Charbonneau Commission - An Opportunity for the City to Re-evaluate its Procurement Practices**

**Report Date: February 6, 2014**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
001	<p>City Council request the Director of Purchasing and Materials Management review the upcoming report of the Commission of Inquiry on the Awarding and Management of Public Contracts in the Construction Industry, otherwise known as the Charbonneau Commission. Such a review determine whether recommendations pertaining to</p>	<p>The Charbonneau Commission has not released its final report at this time. Once the final report is released in 2015, PMMD will begin review of it in accordance with the recommendation.</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	<p>establishing measures to identify, reduce and prevent collusion and corruption in the awarding and managing of public contracts in the construction industry have relevance to the City of Toronto.</p>	
003	<p>City Council request the City Manager in consultation with the City's Agencies and Corporations to develop a protocol for the distribution and sharing of fraud investigation related reports. Such a process ensure that, as a minimum, recommendations contained in all such fraud investigation reports be shared with Senior Management at the City as well as its Agencies and Corporations.</p>	<p>On June 24, 2014 the City Manager sent a memorandum to the Deputy City Managers and Divisions Heads as well as a memorandum to Chairs and Administrative Heads of City Agencies and Corporations regarding Audit recommendations made as a result of investigations that have relevance throughout the city. The memorandums provided links to relevant reports, including 'The Charbonneau Commission – An Opportunity for the City to Re-evaluate its Procurement Practices', and highlighted key recommendations. Management was advised of their collective responsibility to implement relevant recommendations. The memorandums also provided links to the City policies relevant to the administration of contract management and procurement.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 14-PMM-1.AR-003 (A) Deputy City Managers and Division Heads - Audit reports have Relevance</li> <li>• 14-PMM-1.AR-003 (B) Chairs &amp; Administrative Heads (Agencies &amp; Corps) - Audit reports have Relevance</li> </ul> <p>The City Manager's Office, through its Corporate Intergovernmental and Agency Relations Unit, committed to developing relevant tools and materials to be made publicly available for all City Agencies and Corporations by the first quarter of 2015.</p> <p>Beginning in January 2015, the City Manager issued an annually communication to Deputy City Managers, Division Heads and Chairs and Administrative Heads of City Agencies and Corporations, reminding them of their collective responsibility to review and implement, where appropriate, all recommendations adopted by City Council as a result of reports issued by the City's Accountability Officers.</p>

**Report Title: City Stores: Maximize Operating Capacity to Be More Efficient**  
**Report Date: October 5, 2012**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
003	City Council request the City Manager, through the Shared Services review, to explore ways to maximize purchasing power and rationalize materials handling for items commonly purchased by the City, its Agencies and Corporations.	<p>The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer has been given carriage of the Shared Services file. The DCM/CFO in Q1 2014 is hiring a project manager to work on the implementation plan of Shared Services which will be reported to Council for 2015.</p> <p>In addition, PMMD has formed a "Co-operative Purchasing Group" with the TTC, TCHC, TPS, TPL and Exhibition Place which meets monthly to review potential joint purchasing opportunities. The Co-operating Purchasing Group has been meeting since Sept, 2012. During those meetings, items that could be purchased through City Stores is noted for consideration.</p>
004	City Council request the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, to develop and implement an online system for ordering goods from City and Divisional stores.	<p>This is part of the Supply Chain Management Transformation Project (formerly the E-Procurement Project) which is looking at the entire supply chain for improvements through leveraging technology. The current status is that a Consultant has provided a Fit-Gap Analysis, Business Case and suggested Implementation Plan. Staff are currently working on identifying what can be done with respect to online catalogue within the existing capital budget, and on developing the further business case for the other aspects of supply chain technology.</p> <p>Timeline – Q3, 2015</p>
005	City Council request the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management, in consultation with the Chief Information Officer, to review the costs and benefits associated with integrating scanning technology into existing City and Divisional store operations.	PMMD, I&T and Toronto Fire Services (TFS) initiated a pilot project to introduce scanners into the TFS warehouse. Although there are benefits to the scanning technology, it cannot integrate into the existing SAP platform without turning on additional modules. These additional modules are part of e-Procurement and a final business case is being developed on next steps of that project by end of Q2 2015.

**Division:** Social Development, Finance & Administration  
**Report Title:** Municipal Grants - Improving the Community Partnership and Investment Program  
**Report Date:** January 21, 2013

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
004	City Council request the City Manager to ensure City staff overseeing grant programs document explanations for unusual financial information.	SDFA is committed to working with the CMO and other divisions under CPIP umbrella to address the oversight mechanism/role required to ensure they have fully implemented the remaining recommendations.  SDFA aims to have an action plan by the end of 2015.
005	City Council request the City Manager to ensure checklists for supervisory review of Community Partnership and Investment Program grant allocations are developed and that supervisory reviews are performed in a timely manner.	SDFA is committed to working with the CMO and other divisions under CPIP umbrella to address the oversight mechanism/role required to ensure they have fully implemented the remaining recommendations.  SDFA aims to have an action plan by the end of 2015.
006	City Council request the City Manager to ensure all grant assessment forms are relevant, practical and clear.	SDFA is committed to working with the CMO and other divisions under CPIP umbrella to address the oversight mechanism/role required to ensure they have fully implemented the remaining recommendations.  SDFA aims to have an action plan by the end of 2015.
007	City Council request the City Manager to train grants staff on the use of updated assessment forms.	This recommendation impacts on all Community Partnership and Investment Program grant funding. Due to the extensive scope of the recommendation, this recommendation will not be implemented until 2015.
008	City Council request the City Manager to ensure that standard documents developed for the application or assessment of specific grant programs be carefully completed, all outstanding issues are addressed, and files contain explanations for exceptions to established guidelines.	SDFA is committed to working with the CMO and other divisions under CPIP umbrella to address the oversight mechanism/role required to ensure they have fully implemented the remaining recommendations.  SDFA aims to have an action plan by the end of 2015.

**Division:** Solid Waste Management Services  
**Report Title:** District 2 Curbside Collection contract - Review of Cost Savings and Opportunities for Improving Contract Monitoring  
**Report Date:** February 06, 2014  
**Recommendations:**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
006	City Council request the General Manager, Solid Waste Management Services, to ensure collection services are completed on a timely basis in accordance with the City by-law governing residential waste collection.	<p>The General Manager of SWMS will be recommending a change to the City By-Law governing waste collection to amend the time from 5:00 p.m. finishing time to 6:00 p.m. finishing time to reflect actual operations. This will be completed in Q2 2015 as part of other By-Law updates.</p> <p>Route times are monitored and staff review the daily line up received from the contractor. All daily line ups are saved on the shared drive. Many times when the contractor is later than 6:00p.m., it is either weather related or due to back-ups at the transfer station. These incidents happen to both contractors and in-house operations. When these incidents do occur, it is documented on the daily line up and verified by staff.</p>
007	City Council request the General Manager, Solid Waste Management Services, to continue to monitor Contract deficiencies and assess liquidated damages if and when determined to be appropriate, and to document decisions regarding the assessment or waiver of liquidated damages.	As outlined above, systematic approach to conducting and documenting on-road daily inspections has been implemented as of April of 2014. The inspections are based on the schedule of liquidated damages. Route finishing times are monitored using the daily line up received from the contractor. Any deficiencies identified are followed up with to ensure that corrective actions are taken by the Contractor or if appropriate, liquidated damages are assessed.
008	City Council request the General Manager, Solid Waste Management Services, to implement a standard process for reviewing closed service requests, including non-qualifying service requests. Reviews should be documented and include an evaluation of the adequacy of Contractor investigation notes, timeliness of resolution, and validity of closure.	A standard process for reviewing closed service requests which includes an evaluation of the adequacy of investigation notes and the validity of closure has been developed and implemented since October 2014. A monthly review of the timeliness of resolution is conducted through the analysis of service standard reports as of April 2014.



No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
009	City Council request the General Manager, Solid Waste Management Services, to implement the practice of trend analyses for monthly tonnages, late finishing times and any other relevant operational and performance indicators, and to ensure that any significant anomalies identified are investigated to the extent appropriate in the circumstances.	A procedure related to the practice of trend analysis has been implemented since April 2014. Trends such as projected tonnages and last dump times are established and reviewed on a monthly basis.
011	City Council request the General Manager, Solid Waste Management Services, to consider conducting periodic evaluations of the Contractor's performance against a set of specific assessment criteria that are aligned with Contract provisions.	The annual assessment of the Contractor's performance for 2014 is currently in process.

**Division:** Toronto Building  
**Report Title:** Toronto Building - Improving the Quality of Building Inspections  
**Report Date:** January 15, 2014

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
002	City Council request the Chief Building Official and Executive Director to take the appropriate action to develop and implement an action plan to resolve dormant permits and priority be given to those with unresolved violations.	<p>In consultation with Legal Services, Toronto Building developed a risk management strategy to address dormant permits along with a process to mitigate future open permits.</p> <p>These proposals were considered by the Division's management team in Q3-2014.</p> <p>A business case was included in the Division's 2015 budget presentation to employ a risk management plan that would include a dedicated enforcement unit to address dormant permits.</p> <p>If the business case and re-resources are approved by Council, the plan will be implemented after the 2015 budget pro-cess is completed.</p>
003	City Council request the Chief Building Official and Executive Director review the current administrative process and the controls related to outstanding	In 2014, Toronto Building completed a pilot project in the Toronto and East York district that undertook a review of violation orders issued prior to 2013 with the objective to clear

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	violations. Such a process ensure that there is ongoing supervisory review of all outstanding violations. In particular, the review should include an immediate evaluation of "unsafe orders" and, where appropriate, immediate action be taken.	<p>outstanding violations where possible.</p> <p>As a result of the pilot, beginning in Q1-2015, a program will be implemented across all districts that will include a supervisory review of all outstanding violations. Quarterly reports will monitor the success of the initiative.</p>
004	City Council request the Chief Building Official and Executive Director to review system controls in IBMS to ensure additional fees to building permits issued in response to a "work no permit" violation are appropriately and consistently applied.	<p>Toronto Building has implemented a review of divisional procedures and controls on administrative fees for work that has commenced without a permit.</p> <p>The review has determined an automated IBMS fix to capture additional permit fee prior to permit issuance should be developed.</p> <p>This initiative has a target for completion in Q1-2015.</p>
005	City Council request the Chief Building Official and Executive Director to ensure all inspection requests relating to construction activity are accurately recorded in the IBMS management information system. Performance measures be developed as appropriate and based on complete inspection activity information.	<p>Toronto Building is currently investigating enhancements to IBMS functionality to improve recording of all inspection types and to track additional performance measures.</p> <p>This work is scheduled to be completed by Q4-2015.</p>
006	City Council request the Chief Building Official and Executive Director take steps to review data categories for recording inspection results in order to ensure management information reports are reliable and useful in deploying inspectors efficiently.	<p>Toronto Building has reviewed data categories and is undertaking changes to the way inspection results are recorded. This will include eliminating the use of "in progress" result for Part 9 permits and the continuation of the "in progress" result for Part 3 permits but supplemented with the use of enhanced notes explain the "in progress" result. Steps are also underway to reinforce the use of the IBMS deficiency tab by inspectors.</p> <p>The changes being developed are expected to be completed by Q4-2015.</p>
007	City Council request the Chief Building Official and Executive Director to ensure compliance with inspection documentation standards and that all inspection records are complete and	The Division has procured a consultant to undertake an Inspection Business Process Review (BPR) which will include recommendation 007 as part of its scope of work.

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	reliable.	A draft policy for quality assurance has been developed by Toronto Building and will be completed by Q4-2015. This policy will address compliance with divisional documentation standards by inspection staff.
009	City Council request the Chief Building Official and Executive Director to review the controls in place to ensure that revenue from partial occupancy permits is appropriately accounted for and collected.	<p>Toronto Building has under-taken a complete review of how fees are charged for occupancy permits. A flat rate verses an hourly rate is being considered for implantation.</p> <p>This will permit automation within IBMS for Partial Occupancy Permits (AO)</p> <p>This work is expected to be completed by Q4-2015.</p>
010	City Council request the Chief Building Official and Executive Director review the current quality assurance process and take steps to ensure City-wide inspection practices are consistent and comply with established Divisional standards.	<p>The Division has procured a consultant to undertake an Inspection Business Process Review (BPR) which will further develop the division's Quality Assurance Program and will consider what additional re-sources are required to ensure City-wide inspection practices are consistent and comply with established Divisional standards.</p> <p>This work is scheduled to be completed by Q4-2015.</p>
011	City Council request the Chief Building Official and the Executive Director to review and formalize its training program.	<p>Toronto Building has undertaking a review of all current training programs and has considered a plan to formalize on-going training related to Minis-try qualifications, program and regulatory changes, refresher training and employee orientation. The Business Process Review (BPR) will also consider implementation of a complete learning development strategy for Toronto Building Inspections.</p> <p>This work is scheduled to be completed by Q3-2015.</p>

**Report Title: Toronto Building Division - Building Permit Fees, Improving Controls and Reporting**

**Report Date: January 23, 2012**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
001	City Council request the Chief Building Official in consultation with related City divisions review, revise and monitor the accuracy and completeness of information used to calculate building permit fees on an annual basis.	<p>The 2011 and 2012 Building Permit Fees reports were considered by the Planning and Growth Management Committee on September 12, 2013 and were received for information with no further action required.</p> <p><a href="http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.Do?item=2013.PG26.2">Http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.Do?item=2013.PG26.2</a></p> <p>Accounting Services updated the Full Cost Model, which was approved by Council as part of the User Fee Policy adopted in late 2011. Values consistent with the updated policy have been included in the Building Permit Fees 2011 and 2012 Annual Reports. The costing elements of service level agreements have been completed and were considered against fee calculations. Based on the audit review, future annual building permit fee reports will include information on the amount of deferred revenue being recognized in the reporting year.</p> <p>Based on the audit review, future annual building permit fee reports will include information on the amount of deferred revenue being recognized in the reporting year.</p>
002	City Council request the City Manager formalize service level agreements with key divisions supporting the Toronto Building Division permit process. Service level agreements should set forth anticipated service levels and applicable charges.	A Service Level Agreement is in development with the corporate Information and Technology Division, with completion expected by the third quarter of 2013. Exploration of service level agreements with Fire Services and ML&S will be considered in consultation with new division heads in 2013.
008	City Council request the Chief Building Official to ensure that the annual report on building permit fees includes additional information explaining the differences between building permit fees collected and the amounts included in the annual report	There continues to be ongoing discussions between the Ministry of Municipal Affairs and Housing (MMAH) and large municipalities in Ontario with respect to clarifying the legislation regarding these reporting requirements. Toronto Building will implement any necessary changes once requirements are clarified.

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
		<p>Currently the Building Code Act does not direct the municipality to include information on deferred revenue. Until the legislation is changed or MMAH provides direction regarding this matter, future annual building permit fee reports prepared by the division, will include information on the amount of deferred revenue being recognized in the reporting year</p>
010	<p>City Council request the Chief Building Official ensure that building permit fees in IBMS and the Toronto Municipal Code are current, complete and accurate.</p>	<p>With the exception of some sign permit fees, all fees are current, complete, and accurate and consolidated in Chapter 441 of the Toronto Municipal Code. IBMS and all Toronto Building communications have also been updated and are consistent with the fees now contained in Chapter 441. The new sign permit fees which were introduced mid 2014 require a correction in the amount stated in Chapter 441 and require coding in the division's permitting system. (IBMS) These corrections will be made with a report to Council by Q3-2015.</p> <p>A report with recommendations for amendments to Chapter 363 to transfer fee schedules and indexing provisions to Chapter 441, Fees and Charges, was considered by the Planning and Growth Management Committee on October 22, 2013 and adopted without amendment. City Council adopted this item on November 13, 2013 without amendments and without debate.</p> <p><a href="http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2013.PG27.11">http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2013.PG27.11</a></p> <p>Fee changes that were adopted by Council during the 2014 budget process have now been included in Chapter 441.</p>

**Report Title: Administration of Development Funds, Parkland Levies and Education Development Charges**

**Report Date: June 16, 2010**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
006	The Chief Building Official evaluate the current audit process to ensure development charge calculations are verified to supporting documentation. Consideration be given to an audit process prior to the issuance of a building permit.	<p>Toronto Building is completing the development of a new audit system that will include a process that will permit the verification of development charge calculations prior to the issuance of a building permit.</p> <p>The new audit system will incorporate recent IBMS updates including plans and records that are now available electronically.</p> <p>The new audit system is expected to be implemented by the first quarter of 2015.</p>

**Division: Toronto Environment Office**

**Report Title: Toronto Environment Office - Review of Administration of Environmental Grants**

**Report Date: January 17, 2011**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
002	The Director, Toronto Environment Office, ensure that each grant file is complete and contains all relevant documentation. Further, the Director, Toronto Environment Office document in each project file the assessment of the impact of any reductions to grant requests on the organization's ability to complete the project as proposed.	The following new actions will be implemented for the 2016 Live Green Grant program: 1. During the technical review stage, EED staff will now include a critical analysis of projects recommended for partial funding; the analysis will outline potential risks & impacts for each item not suggested for grant funding; 2. the Review Committee will be asked to take into consideration the risks to project success if a partial funding award is made; and 3. the Grant Program Manager will discuss all partial funding awards and any potential risks with the Director before any projects are finalized for approval.

**Division:** Toronto Paramedic Services  
**Report Title:** Emergency Medical Services - Payroll and Scheduling Processes Require Strengthening  
**Report Date:** October 3, 2013  
**Recommendations:**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
003	<p>City Council request the Chief and General Manager, Emergency Medical Services, develop a process to ensure divisional consistency in attendance management procedures. Attendance records including overtime and time off requests should be adequately supported with documentation reflecting supervisory review and approval, and maintained in accordance with legislated record retention requirements.</p>	<p>The Division is preparing an exception report that will be sent to on-shift Deputy Commanders to review and approve unanticipated, end-of-shift overtime by shift workers that is less than 90 minutes. Once the report is prepared, the Division will send an example to the Auditor General's Office for review. We anticipate implementing this report and monitoring capability by Q3, 2015.</p>
009	<p>City Council request the Chief and General Manager, Emergency Medical Services, evaluate whether transactions entered using shared IDs or by system users not authorized to enter transactions identified during the audit require further analysis to determine if transactions were valid and properly authorized. Reports should be developed to identify such transactions on an ongoing basis for review and action.</p>	<p>The Division further investigated the transactions identified in Recommendation #9. Please see the Letter dated May 26, 2015, to the Auditor General's Office from Chief Paul Raftis.</p> <p>In summary, our review found that 1603 of the 10,221 transactions were by the TMS vendor, who confirmed they were the result of providing daily TMS Application Support for automatic TMS processes and support for a major data migration program which caused entries not to be uploaded to SAP during the payroll cycle.</p> <p>The remaining 8618 transactions were completed by two Schedulers who used the shared user ID because they were unable to access their assigned TMS User profiles. However, neither made entries from their assigned TMS User profiles during the same timeframe. The Division randomly spot-checked these entries and they were in order.</p> <p>The specifications for the new Time, Attendance &amp; Scheduling Software include the capability to track users and we anticipate this new (city-wide) system to be in place by Q4, 2016. This tracking capability will allow monitoring of individual user activity.</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
012	City Council request the Chief and General Manager, Emergency Medical Services, upgrade the history log in the scheduling module to track deletions and changes by user ID, date and time.	The Division is advising that it is not feasible to implement the recommendation because the current TMS system does not have the capability to track deletions and changes by User ID, date and time. However, as indicated above, the specifications for the new Time, Attendance & Scheduling Software include this capability. We anticipate this new system to be in place by Q4, 2016.

**Division: Toronto Water**

**Report Title: Toronto Water - Review of Construction Contracts**

**Report Date: May 7, 2013**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
009	City Council request the General Manager, Toronto Water to implement the practice of comparing actual project costs to an established standard and investigate significant differences to the extent appropriate in the circumstances.	Refer to the Memorandum dated January 15, 2015 (Attachment 1). Standard repair costs have been established as a guide to stem a review process between Manager and project Manager on a quarterly basis. Standard repair costs will be reviewed and adjusted annually. The unit will also start comparing and investigating significant differences between actual project item cost and standard item cost in 2015.
010	City Council request the General Manager, Toronto Water to ensure the District Contract Services Unit complies with Toronto Water documentation requirements.	Refer to memorandum dated May 5, 2014 (Attachment 2). All staff have been reminded to comply with Toronto Water Documentation requirements. Ongoing continuous improvement of documentation requirements underway. The unit is also updating the District Operations Field Service Manual to reflect any changes in the unit, process and documentation requirements.

**Division: Transportation Services**

**Report Title: Local Road Resurfacing - Contract Management Issues**

**Report Date: May 10, 2013**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
001	City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services to ensure that:	Efforts have been made towards achieving compliance with the audit recommendations. However, the recommendations have not been fully implemented yet. A plan is being developed



<b>No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame</b>
	<p>a. Inspectors use costs sheets to record quantities of material delivered and measurements taken;</p> <p>b. All cost sheets are signed-off by the contractor representative, the City Inspector and the Inspector's supervisor;</p> <p>c. Inspectors maintain adequate support for all quantities and measurements recorded on cost sheets; and</p> <p>d. Supervisors randomly spot check cost sheet measurements and document results of their work.</p>	to implement all recommendations fully by June 2016.
004	City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services to review opportunities to prevent or detect input errors for data entered into the Toronto Maintenance Management System.	Efforts have been made towards achieving compliance with the audit recommendations. However, the recommendations have not been fully implemented yet. A plan is being developed to implement all recommendations fully by June 2016.
005	City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services to regularly monitor actual quantities of goods and services supplied against tender call quantities, make any inquiries necessary arising from such review and take appropriate action where required.	Efforts have been made towards achieving compliance with the audit recommendations. However, the recommendations have not been fully implemented yet. A plan is being developed to implement all recommendations fully by June 2016.
007	City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services to ensure the City's material testing protocol is complied with, corrective action is taken on a timely basis when material test results fail to meet specifications and Divisional staff are adequately trained on testing requirements.	Efforts have been made towards achieving compliance with the audit recommendations. However, the recommendations have not been fully implemented yet. A plan is being developed to implement all recommendations fully by June 2016.

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
009	City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services to ensure that a uniform weight verification protocol is implemented and complied with.	Efforts have been made towards achieving compliance with the audit recommendations. However, the recommendations have not been fully implemented yet. A plan is being developed to implement all recommendations fully by June 2016.

**Report Title: Inventory Controls Over Traffic Control Devices in Transportation Services Need to be Improved**

**Report Date: April 25, 2012**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
003	City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services, in consultation with the Director, Purchasing and Materials Management, to implement effective controls over the inventory of traffic control devices with consideration being given to using the SAP financial information system module currently being used by other City divisions.	<p>PMMD has entered inventory for Transportation Services in the City's financial information system and is using corporate inventory control parameters.</p> <p>Transportation Services continues with the process of transferring equipment from 8 Milner Avenue to contractors as part of our signal work. We are also working with Auction on material that is no longer usable for our traffic plant system.</p>
008	City Council request the Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer to take appropriate action to identify City operations that maintain a significant level of inventory and review those operations to ensure adequate inventory controls are in place such as those identified in City's warehouse and stores business model as adopted by Council in the Corporate Warehouse/Stores Rationalization Project.	PMMD has reviewed a number of Divisions for Significant Inventory and will continue to review other Divisions through the end of 2015. For Divisions interested in transitioning products into Corporate SAP inventory, PMMD will add the products as required. This will allow for both financial and inventory control practices to be put in place. For those Divisions not interested in transitioning their products into Corporate inventory, PMMD will continue to review and validate that Corporate procedures and policies are adhered to.

**Report Title: Review of Coordinated Street Furniture Contract - Public Realm Section, Transportation Services Division**  
**Report Date: February 3, 2012**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
006	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services ensure Astral Media develop and maintain an adequate management information system that effectively reports on the status of all street furniture including but not limited to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Tracking of permit and approval process</li> <li>b. Tracking of roll-out and installation process</li> <li>c. Tracking of day-to-day maintenance program.</li> </ul>	<p>Completion of the items 'a' and 'b' are expected when data migration from the servers between Astral and Bell is completed. Completion date is anticipated at the end of the second quarter 2015.</p>

**Report Title: Red Light Camera- Although Red Light Cameras Have Contributed to a Reduction in Accidents, Opportunities Exist to Improve Financial Results and Program Effectiveness**  
**Report Date: August 25, 2011**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
004	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Transportation Services, as requested in April 2008, report back to Council "with an update on the status of the red light camera operations". In preparing the report, information detailing financial results of the Red Light Camera program be provided as well as revised estimates for future program costs and revenues.</p>	<p>The 2015 report associated with the RFP results for a third phase of red light camera operations, will include a financial summary of the second phase of red light camera operations (years 2008 – 2013 ) as well as estimated costs and revenues for a third phase of red light camera operations.</p>
006	<p>City Council request the City Solicitor in consultation with the General Manager, Transportation Services, and the Chief of Police request the Province of Ontario to amend legislation to permit Parking Enforcement Officers to issue tickets in relation to licence plate visibility</p>	<p>To be completed by summer 2015.</p>

**CITY DIVISIONS  
PUBLIC RECOMMENDATIONS – NO LONGER RELEVANT**

**Division:** Fire Services  
**Report Title:** Toronto Fire Services - Improving the Administration and Effectiveness of Firefighter Training and Recruitment  
**Report Date:** September 16, 2013

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
014	<p>City Council request the Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire Services Division, to reassess the overall necessity of Ontario Fire Marshall exams. If exams are determined to be required, to take the necessary steps to ensure exam eligibility requirements are met. Such steps should include, but not be limited to:</p> <p>a. Ensuring each recruit is evaluated on final performance tests by a certified trainer-facilitator;</p> <p>b. Ensuring required supporting documentation is completed, signed off, and maintained on file; and</p> <p>c. Giving consideration to obtaining and reviewing exam results to identify opportunities for training program improvement.</p>	<p>- OFMEM transitioned towards NFPA Standards.</p> <p>- Recruits hired are NFPA Certified /Pre-Service Qualified.</p>

**Division:** Solid Waste Management Services  
**Report Title:** District 2 Curbside Collection contract - Review of Cost Savings and Opportunities for Improving Contract Monitoring  
**Report Date:** February 06, 2014

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
002	<p>City Council request the General Manager, Solid Waste Management Services, to ensure that all financial, performance and operational information</p>	<p>No further quarterly reports are required as such reports were under the directive of the previous PWI. Therefore this recommendation is no longer applicable. However, the General Manager of</p>

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
	in future collections operations reports are accurate and provide a consistent and complete reflection of the Contract costs and performance-related activities.	Solid Waste Management Services will ensure that more effort is put on QA/QC in future reports as required.

**Report Title: Management of Construction Contracts – Toronto Water and Sewer  
Emergency Repair Contracts**

**Report Date: July 30, 2007**

No.	Recommendation	Management's Comments and Action Plan/Time Frame
015	The General Manager, Toronto Water, expedite the review and assessment of existing work management systems, including an assessment of the SAP Plant Maintenance Module. Following the selection of a work management system, its implementation should be expedited and the cost benefits of its integration with SAP be evaluated.	<p>The Request for Pre-Qualification (RFPQ) was completed in 2014 and both of the short listed software solutions have the capability to be integrated with the SAP Plant Maintenance Module.</p> <p>Over the course of 2015, a cross-divisional working group will be responsible for evaluating and implementation the work management system, as well as reviewing and documenting cross-divisional work management processes which includes SAP integration.</p>