



STAFF REPORT ACTION REQUIRED

Parking Ticket Activity – 2014

Date:	March 20, 2015
To:	Government Management Committee
From:	Treasurer
Wards:	All
Reference Number:	P:\2015\Internal Services\rev\gm15005rev (AFS20247)

SUMMARY

This report provides information on the total number and type of parking infraction notices (i.e., parking tickets) issued in 2014, as well as information on cancellation activity, trial requests, court conviction activity, and collection rates. This year's Parking Ticket Activity Report is being submitted to the Government Management Committee together with a report from Toronto Police Service: "Annual Report – 2014 Parking Enforcement Unit Estimated Tag Issuance Report," which identifies enforcement related activity for 2014. The Government Management Committee had previously requested that these reports be submitted concurrently.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Treasurer recommends that:

1. The Government Management Committee receive this report for information.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications arising from this report.

The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

DECISION HISTORY

Staff report annually on parking ticket issuance, collection and cancellation activity. The 2013 Parking Ticket Activity report (Item GM30.2) was received by the Government Management Committee at its meeting of May 12, 2014. The following is the link to the item: <http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2014.GM30.2>

The City continues to use the Council approved "Parking Ticket Cancellation Guidelines" when considering cancellation of parking tickets. These Guidelines were originally approved by Council at its meeting on June 8 and 9, 2010. The City's Parking Ticket Cancellation Guidelines had further revisions made in February 2014 which related to Rush-Hour areas and the associated enforcement and traffic management initiatives.

The Council-approved Cancellation Guidelines are available at:

http://www1.toronto.ca/City%20of%20Toronto/Revenue%20Services/Tickets/Files/pdf/C/cancellation_guidelines.pdf

ISSUE BACKGROUND

The purpose of the City's various parking by-laws is to regulate the movement of traffic on City streets and to help ensure smooth traffic flow and safe City streets. Fines that have been established for parking related offences serve as a deterrent to illegal parking.

The Toronto Police Service (TPS), through its Parking Enforcement Unit, is responsible for parking enforcement and enforcement practices. The TPS issues the majority of the City's parking tickets each year. However, approximately 7% to 9% of all tickets are issued by trained Municipal Law Enforcement Officers (MLEOs). MLEOs are independent private agencies whose staff are trained and certified by the TPS to issue parking tickets on private or municipal property throughout the City of Toronto. MLEO agencies are required to obtain a license from the City's Municipal Licensing and Standards Division in order to operate in the City. Some of the City's agencies, such as the TTC and Toronto Parking Authority, employ MLEOs to enforce off-street parking in their respective areas. Currently, there are approximately 2,300 MLEOs working for 124 different agencies.

Revenue Services Division is responsible for processing and collecting fines for all parking tickets issued in the City of Toronto.

COMMENTS

In 2014, the City of Toronto issued 2,498,660 parking tickets. Approximately 2,292,607 tickets (91.8%) were issued by Parking Enforcement Officers and the balance were issued by Police Officers (8,093 tickets, or 0.3%) and MLEO's (197,960 tickets, or 7.9% of the total tickets issued).

Table 1, provides a breakdown of the number of tickets issued in 2014 (with a comparison to 2013) by issuing officer/unit. The Table also identifies actual parking ticket revenue generated by the annual issuance of parking tickets.

Table 1: Parking Tickets Issued by Unit and Parking Ticket Revenues, 2013 and 2014

	2013	2014	Increase / (Decrease)
Toronto Police Services: Parking Enforcement Officers	2,430,294	2,292,607	(137,687)
Toronto Police Services: Police Officers/Cadets	8,333	8,093	(240)
Subtotal: Toronto Police Services	2,438,627	2,300,700	(137,927)
Municipal Law Enforcement Officers (MLEO's)	191,775	197,960	6,185
TOTAL	2,630,402	2,498,660	(131,742)
Parking Ticket Revenue (Actual)^{*1}			
	\$89,838,566	\$104,954,929	\$15,116,363

*1: Parking ticket revenues include the parking ticket offence or fine amount, and fees related to court and associated administrative costs

Where a parking ticket remains unpaid 51 days after the date of issuance, and a request for trial has not been requested, a notice of fine and due date is produced and mailed. The notification includes court costs and associated administrative costs of \$16.00 which are added to the parking ticket fine amount. The \$16.00 charge includes court costs of \$3.00 applied to Court Service account, administrative cost of \$4.75 which are included in Parking Ticket revenues, and \$8.25 payable to the Ministry of Transportation (MTO) when collected.

The overall number of parking tickets issued in 2014 is fewer than the number issued in 2013 by approximately 5% (there were 131,742 fewer parking tickets issued in 2014). This decrease in issuance is believed to be attributable to a number of factors including:

- greater compliance through higher fine amounts.
- the 10-minute grace period change made to the City's parking bylaws. The Grace Period change relates to a change in the City's bylaws that allow Parking Enforcement Officers to not issue a ticket for expiration of a pay-and-display parking permit within 10 minutes following the expiry of the purchased permit where vehicles are parked in pay and display areas.
- an increase to "calls for service", whereby Parking Enforcement Officers attended private property or other areas for service calls which require towing, thus regular on-street enforcement is reduced during those periods.
- an increase in the number of "relocates," whereby Parking Enforcement Officers are tasked with re-locating vehicles due to weather, community events, construction or other investigations.

Although the number of parking ticket issued has decreased by approximately 5% over 2013, parking ticket revenues have increased by \$15.1 million in comparison to 2013. This increase in parking ticket revenues in 2014 can be attributed to the following factors:

- Approximately \$6.9 million of the increase in parking ticket revenues is related to a better than expected collection success rate for tickets issued in 2013 and prior

years. This improved collection rate for prior year tickets is largely due to a new initiative (the towing of habitual parking ticket offenders) implemented by Toronto Police Service in February 2014, as part of a series of strategies to improve traffic flow and compliance with parking regulations. Under this initiative, the Toronto Police Service may tow vehicles found to be illegally parked where the vehicle owner has three (3) or more unpaid parking ticket fines following a conviction, and where the fine is in default. Upon announcing the new initiative, the City experienced an increase in the collection of prior years' tickets as offenders with multiple outstanding tickets submitted payment on these outstanding tickets.

- Approximately \$8.2 million of the increased parking ticket revenues is related to increased fine levels for rush hour parking offences which were implemented in January 2014 (i.e. No Stopping and No Standing offences were increased from \$40 or \$60 previously to \$150), as well as improved collections for tickets issued in 2014 likely attributable to the introduction of the Fixed Fine System and the towing initiative for habitual parking ticket offenders.

Parking Ticket Issuance by Offence Type

Attachment 1 to this report provides a detailed breakdown of parking tickets issued in 2014 by offence type, with a comparison to 2013.

In 2014, and consistent with past trends, the largest number of tickets issued were for “Expired Meter” offences (i.e., offences where vehicles are ticketed for failing to pay and display a parking receipt or park beyond their permitted time). There were 484,526 tickets issued in this category, representing 19.4% of all tickets issued in 2014. In comparison to 2013, the number of Expired Meter offences decreased by approximately 15% or 87,318 tickets. Staff have confirmed with Toronto Police Service that a large portion of this decrease is thought to be related to the introduction of the 10 minute Grace Period approved by Council in April 2014.

Collection Activity for Tickets Issued in 2013 & Prior Years

Attachment 2 to this report provides information on tickets issued each year since 1989, and the number of tickets that have been paid as at December 31, 2014. The City of Toronto uses a number of collection tools to assist with collection, including the use of collection agencies and the plate denial process. As a result, the City has an excellent collection rate on tickets, achieving over 81% collection in certain years.

Attachment 2 outlines the collection rate for tickets issued in 2014 and paid as of December 31, 2014. The details show that approximately 54% of parking tickets issued in 2014 were paid in 2014. However, based on prior collection experience which demonstrates that offenders will continue to pay 2014 parking tickets in 2015 and later years (when renewing their license plates at the Ministry of Transportation or following trials and /or disputes), coupled with the introduction of the Fixed Fine system and the

new towing initiative for habitual parking ticket offenders introduced by the Toronto Police Service, staff project a long-term average collection rate of approximately 85% for 2014 and future years.

As noted above, the City continues to collect on parking tickets issued in prior years. In 2014, payments were received for tickets issued in 2013, as well as tickets issued as far back as 1989. In fact, 556 payments were received in 2014 that related to parking tickets issued in 1989. Although staff are unable to determine exactly why these older payments continue to be received for tickets that were issued as far back as 26 years ago, it is believed that some of these payments are generated when drivers re-activate a dormant license plate.

Trial Requests and Court Conviction Activity

In 2014, 287,156 parking recipients requested a trial. This figure is less than the 332,680 parking ticket recipients that requested trials in 2013 and the change is likely related to the fact that the Fixed Fines System was implemented in February 2014 which removes the ability for the Courts to reduce fines, thus removing incentives to attend Court with that sole goal and without a valid defence. While this change took effect in early 2014, since tickets issued in previous years continued to have trials set in 2014, some reductions continue to occur. The total trial requests in 2014 represents approximately 11.5% of all tickets issued in 2014, which is slightly lower than the percentage of trial requests in 2013 which was 12.7%.

In 2014, a total of 265,369 trials were scheduled related to parking tickets issued from 2012 to 2014. Of the 265,369 trials scheduled, 178,038 (or 67%) received a conviction by the Justice of the Peace (this includes 54,150 offenders that pre-paid prior to the actual trial date).

Attachment 3 to this report provides a breakdown of the number of:

- a) trials requested for parking tickets issued in 2014; and,
- b) trials scheduled for parking tickets issued from 2012 to 2014, including the outcome of the trial (i.e. the number of convictions versus the number of acquittals).

Cancellations and Withdrawals

In 2014, of the 2,498,660 tickets issued, 529,954 or 21.2% of the total tickets issued were cancelled for a variety of reasons. The reasons for cancellations include:

- tickets cancelled by staff at the City's First Appearance Facilities (parking ticket counters) under the Council-approved Parking Ticket Cancellation guidelines;
- tickets issued to out-of-province vehicles for which ownership information cannot be obtained;
- tickets cancelled because the offender drove away prior to the ticket being served; and,

- tickets cancelled in court by the Judiciary.

Table 2, below, outlines and categorizes all tickets cancelled in 2014.

Table 2: Breakdown of Parking Tickets Cancelled – 2014

Parking Tickets Cancelled in 2013		Parking Tickets Cancelled in 2014		Reason for Cancellation
#	%	#	%	
150,229	5.7%	130,841	5.2%	Cancelled/Conviction by Justice of the Peace at Trial.
129,281	4.9%	107,822	4.3%	Cancelled by Parking Ticket staff for various reasons, contained within the Cancellation Guidelines.
143,050	5.4%	151,507	6.1%	Out-of-Province – issued to out-of-province vehicles - license plate/owner information not available.
91,885	3.5%	78,121	3.1%	Drove Away – offender drives away before officer can serve the ticket.
55,932	2.1%	54,357	2.2%	Plate errors – plate does not exist, plate is unattached
7,873	0.3%	7,306	0.3%	Error on parking ticket ¹
578,250	22.0%	529,954	21.2%	

Notes:

1. "Error on Parking Ticket" includes incomplete, information missing and illegible tickets. Overall error rates in this category are less than 1/3 of a percent and provides evidence that nearly all tickets written can be processed.

The total number of parking tickets cancelled in 2014 (529,954 tickets) was 48,296 fewer tickets cancelled than the number of tickets cancelled in 2013 (578,250). In addition, the percentage of tickets cancelled in 2014 (21.2%) is also slightly lower than 2013 (22.0%). The largest decreases are in two areas:

- a) tickets cancelled in court by the Judiciary or Courts (Crown/Justice of the Peace);
- b) tickets cancelled by Parking Ticket staff under Council-approved Parking Ticket Cancellation Guidelines.

Out-of-Province Offenders

One of the categories of cancelled tickets includes tickets cancelled where the illegally parked vehicle bears out-of-province license plates. Under current legislation, any unpaid tickets issued to out-of-province vehicles cannot be processed or collected upon using conventional methods primarily because vehicle owner information is not available to the City of Toronto. As a result, these tickets must be cancelled.

In 2006, a pilot project was undertaken whereby out-of-province offender information was purchased from jurisdictions with high offender rates. That pilot project found that the cost to obtain and process tickets issued to these offenders was higher than the

revenues collected. As such, the purchase of out-of-province vehicle information was not pursued on a permanent basis.

In February 2015, the Toronto Police Service expanded the Habitual Offender Towing Program to allow for towing of out-of-province offenders who have accumulated three (3) or more parking tickets and have failed to pay or act upon them. Based on the experience in the first four (4) weeks of the program, it is expected that this program will be successful in helping to collect out-of-province tickets. Staff will monitor the success of the program and report to Committee as part of the 2015 parking ticket activity report.

CONTACT

Casey Brendon
Director, Revenue Services
416-392-8065
cbrendo@toronto.ca

Anthony Fabrizi
Manager, Utility Billing & Parking Tickets
416-392-5880
afabriz@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Giuliana Carbone
Treasurer

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1: Breakdown of Parking Offences – 2013 and 2014

Attachment 2: Collection Activity for Parking Tickets Issued in 2014 & prior years -
(1998-2014)

Attachment 3: Summary of Trial Requests and Court Conviction Activity – 2014

Attachment 1 - Breakdown of Parking Offences – 2013 and 2014

Bylaw / Offence	Set Fine Amount	Tickets Issued 2013		Tickets Issued 2014	
		#	%	#	%
Expired Meter Offences – “Park at Expired Meter, Fail to deposit fee/display receipt”	\$30.00	571,844	21.7%	484,526	19.4%
No Parking – “Park Signed Highway during Prohibited Times/Days	\$40.00	546,012	20.8%	444,274	17.8%
No Valid Permit - “Park (Prohibited area/location) without a Permit”	\$30.00	413,664	15.7%	398,138	15.9%
Private Property - “Park Vehicle on Private Property without Consent”	\$30.00	300,519	11.4%	309,599	12.4%
No Stopping - “Stop Vehicle signed Highway Prohibited Time/Day”	\$60.00	180,131	6.9%	179,860	7.2%
Parking – 3 Hour Limit - “Park Longer than 3 Hours”	\$30.00	119,026	4.5%	116,946	4.7%
Parking with Expired Plates – Parking expired license plate	\$40.00	N/A	N/A	92,251	3.7%
No Standing – “Stand Vehicle signed Highway Prohibited Time/Day”	\$60.00	107,436	4.1%	89,274	3.6%
Parking Excess Time – “Park Signed Highway in excess of Permitted Time”	\$30.00	95,354	3.6%	84,788	3.4%
Other Offences – Parking in Parks, Park facing wrong direction, etc.	\$15- \$150*	39,643	1.5%	38,471	1.5%
Fire Hydrant – “Park – 3M of Fire Hydrant”	\$100.00	38,098	1.5%	37,572	1.5%
No Parking 2:00am – 6:00am in North York from Dec 1 to Mar 31	\$40.00	29,661	1.1%	27,541	1.1%
Parking – Transit Zone - “Stand Vehicle - Signed Highway – Transit Zone”	\$60.00	18,267	0.7%	27,411	1.1%
Stop Sidewalk/Footpath - “Stop - on/over sidewalk/footpath”	\$60.00	26,212	1.0%	24,870	1.0%
Parking – Public Lane - “Park in Public Lane”	\$30.00	21,978	0.8%	18,279	0.7%
Fire Route – “Park Vehicle in Designated Fire Routes”	\$250.00	21,664	0.8%	20,919	0.8%
Parking – 9M Intersection - “Park - 9M of Intersecting Highway”	\$60.00	16,263	0.6%	18,801	0.8%
Park Passenger/Freight Loading Zones contrary to Permitted times	\$40.00	14,008	0.5%	13,174	0.5%
Unauthorized Parking on Boulevard	\$50.00	15,080	0.6%	12,477	0.5%
Disabled Parking - “Park Vehicle in Designated Disable Parking Space”	\$60.00- \$450	12,014	0.5%	12,028	0.5%
Municipal Offences - “Park Vehicle on Municipal Property without Consent”	\$30.00	7,676	0.3%	7,325	0.3%
Park not within period permitted	\$60.00- \$150.00	3,838	0.1%	6,838	0.3%
Parking – Parallel to Curb – “Fail to Park/Stop Parallel to curb”	\$20.00	6,320	0.2%	6,356	0.2%
Parking - “Park/Obstruct Driveway/Laneway”	\$40.00	4,498	0.2%	4,826	0.2%
Stand Signed Taxi Cab Stand	\$30.00	4,807	0.2%	4,611	0.2%
Park Contrary to Posted Condition	\$105.00	3,115	0.1%	4,333	0.2%
Fail to Park/Stop Parallel to Right Hand Side of Highway	\$15.00	3,534	0.1%	4,106	0.2%
Park in Park Not in Designated Area	\$105.00	4,177	0.2%	3,566	0.1%
Stop Roadway Side of any Stopped or Parked Vehicle	\$60.00	2,346	0.1%	2,269	0.1%
Stop Within 9.0M of Crosswalk	\$60.00	1,501	0.1%	1,665	0.1%
Park Heavy Truck Highway, Prohibited Times/Days	\$90.00	1,716	0.1%	1,566	0.1%
Totals		2,630,402	100%	2,498,660	100%

N/A indicates: fine was not present in 2013

* The Other Offences” category is a summation of all other parking offences where the number of tickets issued is under 1,000. The fines in this category range from \$15 - \$150.

Attachment 2
Collection Activity for Parking Tickets Issued in 2014 & Prior Years
(1998-2014)

Year	Number of Tickets Issued	Number of Tickets Paid as of Dec 31, 2013	Total Number of Tickets Paid in 2014	Total Number of Tickets Paid as of Dec 31, 2014	Collection Rate
	#	#	#	#	%
1989	803,723	650,540	556	651,096	81.0%
1990	3,144,174	2,426,377	4,072	2,430,449	77.3%
1991	2,929,574	2,294,576	3,284	2,297,860	78.4%
1992	2,639,282	1,938,778	1,638	1,940,416	73.5%
1993	2,598,057	2,005,013	2,301	2,007,314	77.3%
1994	2,481,123	1,980,753	1,713	1,982,466	79.9%
1995	2,284,687	1,791,836	791	1,792,627	78.5%
1996	2,575,178	1,977,509	872	1,978,381	76.8%
1997	2,570,146	1,966,515	1,016	1,967,531	76.6%
1998	2,633,616	2,045,697	1,127	2,046,824	77.7%
1999	2,546,102	2,046,839	1,294	2,048,133	80.4%
2000	2,760,301	2,254,509	1,656	2,256,165	81.7%
2001	2,796,949	2,255,811	2,185	2,257,996	80.7%
2002	2,934,214	2,234,234	2,172	2,236,406	76.2%
2003	3,108,663	2,407,544	2,466	2,410,010	77.5%
2004	3,076,149	2,424,977	2,629	2,427,606	78.9%
2005	2,858,353	1,917,809	2,770	1,920,579	67.2%
2006	2,852,100	2,010,919	2,910	2,013,829	70.6%
2007	2,888,234	2,131,238	5,092	2,136,330	74.0%
2008	2,902,929	2,058,297	7,082	2,065,379	71.1%
2009	2,794,460	1,565,158	12,921	1,578,079	56.5%
2010	2,787,071	1,820,235	19,829	1,840,064	66.0%
2011	2,833,787	1,537,020	30,050	1,567,070	55.3%
2012	2,761,802	1,846,672	85,082	1,931,754	69.9%
2013	2,630,402	1,348,865	427,890	1,776,755	67.5%
2014	2,485,422		1,356,173	1,356,173	54.6%

**Attachment 3
Summary of Trial Requests and Court Conviction Activity - 2014**

Tickets & Trial Requests for 2014 Tickets			
2014	Number of Tickets Issued	Number of Trial Requests	Percentage of Trial Requests
	#	#	%
January	187,446	36,983	19.7%
February	185,401	18,378	9.9%
March	226,111	19,928	8.8%
April	220,477	19,269	8.7%
May	225,653	31,324	13.9%
June	223,267	20,209	9.1%
July	211,592	30,650	14.5%
August	205,370	16,547	8.1%
September	203,973	24,863	12.2%
October	215,553	23,664	11.0%
November	203,191	19,962	9.8%
December	190,626	25,379	13.3%
Total	2,498,660	287,156	11.5%

Court Activity for Tickets issued in 2012, 2013 & 2014					
A	B	C	D	E	F
Total # of Trials Scheduled (D+E+F)	Total Tickets Pre-Paid	Total Trials Held (A-B)	Total Convicted* (Includes B)	Acquittals*	Not Complete
#	#	#	#	#	#
30,506	9,384	21,122	19,929	9,984	593
22,946	2,136	20,810	9,888	12,630	428
21,987	6,019	15,968	17,457	3,938	592
21,760	1,700	20,060	11,144	10,179	437
23,890	7,769	16,121	20,264	2,939	687
32,215	3,291	28,924	16,237	15,019	959
17,715	4,842	12,873	11,624	5,780	311
2,250	770	1,480	1,768	230	252
33,568	9,108	24,460	21,486	11,216	866
21,109	2,430	18,679	15,036	5,336	737
15,099	2,529	12,570	13,444	905	750
22,324	4,172	18,152	19,761	1,439	1,124
265,369	54,150	211,219	178,038	79,595	7,736

*Note: "Total Convicted" include offenders who had a scheduled trial but pre-paid their tickets before trial.
The figures shown above also include parking tickets with trial requests from late 2013 and Re-openings/Appeals from earlier years.