ATTACHMENT NO. 4

HERITAGE PROPERTY RESEARCH AND EVALUATION REPORT



189, 191, 193 MUTUAL STREET

Prepared by:

Heritage Preservation Services City Planning Division City of Toronto

30 January 2015

1. DESCRIPTION



Above: 193, 191, 189 Mutual Street (*Heritage Preservation Services, 2014*) Cover: 193, 191, 189 Mutual Street (*Heritage Preservation Services, 2014*)

Address and Name of Property		
ADDRESS	189, 191, 193 Mutual Street	
WARD	27	
LEGAL DESCRIPTION	189 Mutual: PLAN D53 PT LOT 5	
	191 Mutual: PLAN D53 PT LOT 5 RP 64R16154 PART 3	
	193 Mutual: PLAN D53 PT LOT 5 RP 64R16154 PARTS 1	
	& 2 WITH ROW	
NEIGHBOURHOOD/COMMUNITY	Garden District	
HISTORICAL NAME	177 Mutual (current: 189): John W. Hare House	
	179 Mutual (current: 191): Samuel G. Watson House	
	181 Mutual (current:193): Mary A. Strutt House	
CONSTRUCTION DATE	1887	
ORIGINAL OWNER	John Watson	
ORIGINAL USE	Single occupancy dwelling	
CURRENT USE*	Vacant	
ARCHITECT/BUILDER/DESIGNER	Unknown	
DESIGN/CONSTRUCTION	Brick cladding with stone and wood details	
ARCHITECTURAL STYLE	Second Empire	
ADDITIONS/ALTERATIONS	At the rear: change of windows and addition of roof top deck	
CRITERIA	Design/Physical, Historical/Associative and Contextual	
HERITAGE STATUS	n/a	
RECORDER	Heritage Preservation Services: Marybeth McTeague	
REPORT DATE	30 January 2015	

2. BACKGROUND

This research and evaluation report describes the history, architecture and context of the properties at 189, 191 and 193 Mutual Street, and applies evaluation criteria to determine whether it merits designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act. The conclusions of the research and evaluation are found in Section 4 (Summary).

i. HISTORICAL TIMELINE

Key Date	Historical Event
1793	Park Lot 6 is granted to David Smith who trades it to William Jarvis. Jarvis had
	in turn traded his grant of Park Lot 3 to John Small.
1818	William Jarvis deeds Park Lot 6 to his son Samuel Peters Jarvis.
1824	Samuel Peters Jarvis builds his house to the designs of John Ewart. The estate is
	known as 'Hazelburn'.
1846-1851	Samuel Peters Jarvis engages the architect John Howard to plan the subdivision
	of his estate. A large portion of the Hazelburn house is demolished to make way
	for Jarvis Street. Mutual Street and George Streets flank the west and east
	boundaries of the estate.
1852	William Dixon has acquired part of Park Lot 6, a lot at the north-east corner of
	Mutual and Gerrard Streets and deeds this land to Reverend Alexander Dixon
	and William Montagu Westamacott. Half of a brick tenement is identified as
	being located on this parcel of land.
1884	The terms of the William Dixon deed are amended in the Provincial Parliament
	in 1884 to permit the female heirs to benefit from development, rents and leases
	of the land etc.
	Goads indicates this parcel of land as Lot 6 in a subdivision of 6 lots registered
1007	as D53.
1885	John Watson is granted a building permit (No. 313) for 5 attached brick
	dwellings on Gerrard Street East at the north east corner with Mutual. These are
	built on the southern most portion of land deeded to Dixon and Westamacott in
1886	1852.
1880	The first lot on Mutual Street, north of Gerrard, is identified in the assessment rolls recorded in September 1886 for 1887 as belonging to Catherine Dixon,
	Mary Dixon and John Watson and measures 56'6" x 83.'
	Watson is also recorded as owning 5 houses facing Gerrard Street East on the
	east side of Mutual (the building permit was applied for in 1885 as above).
1887	Assessment rolls recorded in September 1887 for 1888 indicate three houses
1007	owned by John Watson at 177, 179 and 181 Mutual Street and rented by John
	W. Hare, Samuel G.Watson and Mary A. Strutt respectively.
1890	Goad's Atlas indicates that Mutual Street has been renumbered and the three
1070	Watson houses are now known as their current addresses, that is, 189, 191 and
	193 Mutual Street.
2008	189 Mutual Street is purchased by Antorisa Investments Ltd.
2014	191 and 193 Mutual Street are purchased by 2391958 Ontario Ltd.
2014	17 September 2014, Charles Schwenger, architect, applied for a demolition
	permit for 189, 191 and 193 Mutual Street on behalf of the owner. As no
	replacement structures have been applied for, the demolition permit has not been
	issued at the date of this report.

ii. HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

Garden District and Jarvis Street Neighbourhood

The properties at 189, 191 and 193 Mutual Street are located on the east side of Mutual Street, just north of Gerrard Street East in the neighbourhood identified as the Garden District. (Image 1) The properties were originally part of Park Lot 6, one of the parcels of land granted by John Graves Simcoe to loyal individuals as well as the military and the clergy, after the founding of the Town of York and the establishment of Fort York in 1793. Park Lot 6 was granted to David Smith who traded it to William Jarvis (1756-1817) who had originally been granted Park Lot 3. The narrow lot of 100 acres stretched north-south, from Lot Street (now known as Queen Street) to the second concession road (now Bloor Street). (Image 2)

William Jarvis did not live on the Park Lot as he built a house at Sherbourne and Adelaide Streets, on the edge of the new town of York. Apart from clearing some of the land, he left it undeveloped, transferring it to his son, Samuel Peters Jarvis (1792-1857), just before he died in 1817. Samuel began to clear the site in 1822 and engaged the distinguished architect, John Ewart (1788-1856), to design a house for him in 1824. It was complete by 1825. (Images 3 and 4) Samuel and his wife Mary Boyles Powell lived there until 1845. By that time, Samuel was encountering various financial difficulties and engaged the prominent architect, surveyor and engineer, John George Howard (1803-1890), to survey the park lot for subdivision and sale.

Howard's plan subdivided the narrow lot on its long axis, with a north-south street named for the Jarvis family running down the middle and aligning with New Street (later known as Nelson, as of 1857, and finally Jarvis Street) and connecting with the wharves at the lake's edge. (Image 5) This was a decisive move for the sale of subdivided lots and for the future development of the city as Jarvis Street on its way south from the Jarvis estate, would pass the new St. Lawrence Hall with its arcade and market (1849-50) and the second City Hall (1844-5 and 1850-51) with its police station, courts and additional markets on the west side of the street. With an extraordinary 80' width, Jarvis became a grand avenue with additional boulevards of 16' on either side. William Cawthra invested in the development of the southern 40 acres which resulted in smaller lots for working class housing. The northern 60 acres, typically divided into one-acre plots, was intended for grander houses and eventually prominent Toronto families such as the Masseys, Mulocks, Flavelles, and McMasters built them. Cawthra, himself, retained 11 acres for his own substantial estate at the upper north-west corner of the park lot at Bloor Street. Apart from residential buildings, the street attracted institutions such as churches including the Jarvis Street Baptist Church (1869), and the Toronto Collegiate Institute (later Jarvis Collegiate). The 1878 Illustrated Historical Atlas of the County of York declared:

Jarvis Street is the handsomest avenue in Toronto and cannot perhaps be equalled on the continent. The well formed road, the boulevarded borders, and the delightful villas with their well ordered grounds, present to the eye a very attractive picture.¹

With Howard's 1845-51 survey Jarvis Street became a primary north-south route linking the original core of the town of York with the Second Concession Line (now Bloor Street). It was augmented by two narrower north-south side streets at the edge of the park lot. George Street, on the east, was an extension of one of the original streets of the Town of York. Mutual Street, on the other hand, started at Lot Street and terminated at Carlton Street, on the western boundary of the park lot, and was destined to remain a quieter residential street than Jarvis. North of Gerrard Street, Mutual Street provided the eastern boundary to the residential enclave of Ann (now Granby) and McGill Streets. Mutual Street's name indicates that it was shared between Park Lots 6 and 7. The name McGill recalls the original owner of Park Lot 7, Captain John McGill, but in fact commemorates Ann, wife of Andrew McGill, who, after his death, married Bishop Strachan.² In contrast to Jarvis Street, Mutual, Ann and McGill streets are characterized by more modestly-scaled, late 19th century houses built as semi-detached or row houses. Where these have been demolished, new town houses were built between the 1960s and the 1990s which maintain the basic two-and-a-half storey type and are consistent to the neighbourhood character. This neighbourhood is part of the Garden District, named for Allan Gardens, and enclosed by Queen, Yonge, Carleton and Sherbourne Streets.

By 1858 Boulton's Atlas of the City of Toronto and Vicinity indicates a plot of land on the north side of Gerrard Street, bound on the west and east by Mutual and Jarvis Streets. It has been subdivided with a large square lot at the corner of Gerrard and Jarvis, and narrow lots to the north facing Jarvis and one narrow lot to the west fronting onto Gerrard Street East on the north-east corner with Mutual Street. (Image 6) This last lot is shown to be occupied by a brick building, set well back from both streets, which was the site of the future 189-193 Mutual Street properties.

Goad's Atlas of 1884, the first in the series to record this section of the city, shows this plot of land registered as D53 with lots numbered 1-6. (Image 7) A lane from Mutual Street ran between the northern edge of Lot 5 and the southern edge of Lot 4 still exists today. Lot 5 was the subject of an act of Provincial Parliament in 1884, following a petition which was brought forward on behalf of the heirs, particularly the female heirs, of William Dixon. Dixon, who had owned the property by 1852, granted the property to Reverend Alexander Dixon and William Montagu Westmacott.³ The 1884 petition was brought on behalf of the female heirs of Alexander Dixon and Westamacott so that they might be able to benefit from the ownership through developing, renting and leasing the land.

The assessment rolls for 1887 indicate that by September 1886 Catherine and Mary Dixon, together with John Watson, owned a vacant lot measuring 56.5' by 83', on the east

¹ Lundell, p 55.

² Arthur, p 285.

³ Statutes of the Province of Ontario, 1884, Chap. 95, p. 387.

side of Mutual Street, just north of Gerrard. This was the northern portion of Lot 5. The southern portion of Lot 5 was owned by John Watson alone and he had already built five houses on the property. (Image 8) Watson had received a building permit "for the erection of five attached brick dwellings on NE corner Mutual and Gerrard Streets" on October 29, 1885.⁴ Reverend Alexander Dixon owned the next vacant to the north, known as Lot 4. Catherine and Mary also owned the three houses north of Lot 4, then known as 189-193 Mutual Street.

By September 1887, the assessment rolls prepared for 1888 indicate that Watson was the sole owner of the northern half of Lot 5 and had constructed three row houses on the land. The houses are described as being two storeys in height with an additional mansard roof. Their dimensions were approximately 16 x 28' for all three floors indicating that the two-storey extensions behind were not part of the original building. Goad's Atlas of 1890 shows that these extensions were complete by that year. The houses were originally identified with the street numbers 177, 179 and 181 Mutual Street. The houses were rented to John W. Hare, a fruit grocer, Samuel G. Watson, an employee with James H. Rogers, Hatter and Furrier at 105 King Street East and Mary A. Strutt, the widow of Charles Strutt. By 1890, Mutual Street had been re-numbered, corresponding to the current street addresses for these three properties, that is, 189, 191 and 193 Mutual Street. Goads Atlas indicates the three houses built by John Watson at 189-193 Mutual Street, as well as the five built by Watson at 102-110 Gerrard Street East. (Image 9)

In 2008, 189 Mutual Street was purchased by Antorisa Investments Ltd. In 2014, 191 and 193 Mutual Street were purchased by 2391958 Ontario Ltd.

iii. ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

189, 191, 193 Mutual Street

The row houses at 189, 191 and 193 Mutual Street are located on the east side of Mutual Street just north of Gerrard Street East. (Image 10) Completed in 1887, they are twoand-a-half-storey brick houses on a raised basement with a mansard roof. They are further distinguished by bay windows which extend from the basement to the first floor. They represent a hybrid of the Toronto Bay-n-Gable and Second Empire Styles.

The Toronto Bay-n-Gable Style⁵ may more correctly be termed a typology which emerged for urban houses in Toronto in the third quarter of the nineteenth century. The type responded to the city's residential subdivisions which typically included long, narrow building lots with minimal street frontage. These parameters resulted in narrow, interior layouts, only wide enough to accommodate an entry hall and one room facing the street at the ground floor level. The characteristic elements of the Bay-n-Gable type are a two-and-a-half-storey residence with, at the first floor level, a door at one side, rather than the centre of the façade, and a bay window as the other primary element. The bay window added a formal complexity to the composition while also increasing daylight and

⁴ Building Permit 313, 29 October 1885. City of Toronto Archives.

⁵ McHugh, 1989 is credited with first employing the term.

view. Further elaboration could be added through other details including the gable roof, a verandah and a variety of windows and materials. While often associated with a High Victorian eclecticism, the Bay-n-Gable type could be adapted to a variety of styles. Here it is given a more unusual treatment by being associated with the Second Empire Style through having a mansard, rather than a gable, roof.

The Second Empire Style evolved during the "second empire" of Napoleon III (1808-1873) whose reign in France extended from 1852-1870. It was showcased in the extensions to the Louvre Palace undertaken by L. T. J. Visconti and H. M. Lefuel in 1852-7. (Image 11) The style was widely adopted in Canada from the 1870s onwards:

"Second Empire was... one of Canada's major architectural manifestations for almost two decades. In its most ornate phase it affected all building types, but especially those of an official character – public buildings, institutions, banks – and the residences of the influential; in all cases, the desired effect was one of conservatism, stability, respectability and opulence."⁶

While the style was essentially a variation of Renaissance Classicism, its distinguishing feature, and that most frequently adopted in Canada, was the mansard roof, named for the 17th century French architect Francois Mansart (1598-1666) who popularized its use. An important example of its use in Canadian government buildings was the Ottawa Parliament Building complex, 1859-65, by Thomas Fuller and Chilion Jones. On Jarvis Street Second Empire Style houses of prominent citizens building large estates in the 1870s included 'Hazelburn II,' built by Samuel Jarvis's grandson, Edward Aemilius Jarvis, 'Roseneath,' the home of Chief Justice Sir Charles Moss, and 'Humewood,' home of the honourable Edward Blake. Apart from style and aesthetic associations, the mansard roof, with its nearly vertical angle, had the additional attraction of creating greater head-room in attic spaces and, therefore, had a functional appeal.

Whether John Watson adapted the mansard roof in his buildings at 102-110 Gerrard Street East and 189-193 Mutual Street for practical reasons or for its association with the local houses of the well-to-do on Jarvis Street is not known. (Images 12 and 13) Each of the three houses represents a combination of the Bay-n-Gable type with a mansard roof representing the Second Empire Style. With high raised basements, each unit has a door on the far side of the first floor with a bay window adjacent. Two long, narrow windows on the second floor are centred over the door and the bay respectively. In the mansard roof, each house has a dormer window centred over the bay window which has resulted in an irregular spacing of these features.

At 189, 191 and 193 Mutual Street the mansard roof extends across the upper half storey of all three dwellings. Its surface is distinguished by the use of slate shingles, now painted, with the original patterning combining a band of "fish-scale" shingles with plain rectangles. (Image 14) The dwellings are constructed with a brick facing, of an orange hue, which appeared frequently in new construction in the 1880s. The brick is distinctive

⁶ Cameron and Wright, p 22.

for its fine quality, smooth surface and the care with which it has been used to enhance the form of the building. This is evident in the projecting layer of brick just above the foundation. (Image 15) It is also seen in the way in which the angles of the bay windows are articulated where right-angled corners are built between the diagonal wall planes as well as in the carefully corbelled firebreak walls at the end of the group. (Images 16 and 17) Each house had two chimneys and these are expressed on the outer side walls in the centre of the main two-and-a-half storey volume and on the rear extensions. (Images 11, 12 and 13) The foundations have been stuccoed over, concealing the original materials which might have been rough-hewn blocks of stone as seen in the Gerrard Street East houses by Watson. (Image 8) The rear east elevations have also been refaced with a stucco-like material and their first floor window openings altered with sliding doors. (Image 13, as above) The door openings and windows feature pale stone lintels which appear to be of limestone with a smooth ashlar finish. (Image 18) The window sills are painted and are likely of wood.

The doors match in details and each entry has retained a narrow transom above the door. The original windows have all been replaced with single-pane sash except for the window opening in the bay of 193 Mutual Street. Here the opening is divided with two sash with a longer one at the bottom of the frame and a more square opening above, giving a sense of the proportions of the original windows. (Image 19)

Of all the careful detailing evident in the building, the most exceptional are the wood elements evident at the cornices and the dormer windows. The wood cornices of the bay windows highlight the precisely angled geometry achieved in the brick construction of the three-sided bay windows. (Images 16 and 18, as above) They feature multiple richly-profiled scroll brackets typical of the elaboration of surface favoured in the later nineteenth century. At the second floor, large, richly-profiled cornice brackets with incised spirals support the soffit and eaves beneath the mansard roof. (Image 20) On the mansard roof, tiny brackets support the transition between the angled walls of the mansard and the projecting cornice of the flat roof on the frieze board, which encloses the top of the slates and provides a transition to the roof eaves. (Image 21)

Most elaborate and extraordinarily detailed are the dormer windows. The dormers project forward from the steep angle of the mansard roof and have a small cornice which is stepped and notched above the pairs of curved console brackets set at 90 degrees to one another at either side of the window. (Image 21, as above) These are a smaller version of the console brackets supporting the soffit of the mansard at the second floor and have the same incised spiral moulding. The underside of the cornice is richly decorated with small moulded elements set like miniature brackets. The window itself is framed with moulded wood bands at the sides and top of the window. The top of the window sash is further elaborated with a tiny course of curved dentils and within the frame, on either side of the window, are two tiny colonettes with moulded capitals. (Image 22) These colonettes are the proverbial cherry on top of quite an extraordinary, imaginative and careful set of details for three dormer windows belonging to a set of row houses on a side street in Toronto.

Apart from the replacement of the original windows, the other elements that have been replaced are the stairs providing access to the three entrances at the raised first floor level. Watson's houses on Gerrard (Image 8, as above) included covered porches but they were integrated within the roofline of the second storey. Here, given the return of the cornice on the bay windows, it cannot be confirmed if there were covered porches or not. Nevertheless 189, 191 and 193 Mutual Street present a very fine collection of late 19th century detailing which is still in a very good state of preservation in 2015.

iv. CONTEXT

The properties at 189, 191 and 193 Mutual Street are located on the east side of Mutual Street just north of Gerrard Street East. Mutual Street runs north-south from Shuter to Carlton between Jarvis and Church Streets. (Image 1) These latter two streets, along with Gerrard, are busy main arterial routes, with higher density and a greater number of institutional buildings. In contrast, Mutual Street forms part of a quiet residential enclave along with McGill (Images 23, 24) and Granby (originally Ann) Streets which terminate at Mutual Street.

These three streets share a consistent scale of development originally determined by late nineteenth century houses, typically row houses or semi-detached, with raised basements and attic storeys. While corner lots on Church Street are typically resulting in larger-scale development, to the east and west of Church, the nineteenth century character prevails and infill buildings, primarily townhouses of the latter half of the twentieth century, have preserved the lot sizes as well as the scale and built form in a complementary and harmonious manner. Surrounded by late 20th century development, to wnhouses to the north and a one-storey commercial block fronting on Gerrard Street East to the south, 189, 191 and 193 are anchors for the nineteenth century on the east side of Mutual Street. (Images 25 and 26)

3. EVALUATION CHECKLIST

The following evaluation applies <u>Ontario Regulation 9/06 made under the Ontario</u> <u>Heritage Act: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest</u>. While the criteria are prescribed for municipal designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, the City of Toronto uses it when assessing properties for inclusion on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties. The evaluation table is marked "N/A" if the criterion is "not applicable" to the property or X if it is applicable, with explanatory text below.

Design or Physical Value	
i. rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method	X
ii. displays high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit	Х
iii. demonstrates high degree of scientific or technical achievement	

The three row houses at 189, 191 and 193 Mutual Street are valued for their design and construction which display a high degree of craftsmanship and artistic merit. They are also valued as fine examples of the Bay-n-Gable type combined with the Second Empire Style. While the Second Empire Style was featured in some of the grand estates on the adjacent Jarvis Street, and was also widely employed for institutional uses across Canada, it is a rare stylistic example for row houses within the Garden District enclave of Mutual, McGill and Granby Streets. The elements of the style are seen primarily in the Mansard roof and in the rich elaboration of well-preserved architectural elements and wood trim evident at the windows and cornices. The Bay-n-Gable type is represented in the two-and-a-half-storey building on a raised basement. Other features include the main entrance, set to one side, with the bay window adjacent at the first floor level. The variation on the type is the replacement of the typical gable roof in the attic storey with a mansard. Within the Garden District it is a very well-preserved, rare example of this variation of the Bay-n-Gable type which includes the Second Empire Style.

Historical or Associative Value	
i. direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or	
institution that is significant to a community	
ii. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an	X
understanding of a community or culture	
iii. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder,	
designer or theorist who is significant to a community	

The row houses at 189, 191 and 193 Mutual Street have an associative value for their contribution to understanding the historic, social and urban development and subsequent evolution of this part of the Garden District. Initially the properties were part of one of the series of hundred acre Park Lots, created with the founding of the town of York in 1793 and acquired by the influential Jarvis family. Its subdivision included the creation of Jarvis Street, an extraordinarily wide, grand avenue where influential and wealthy Torontonians built their estates and which provided a connection from the Second Concession Line (Bloor Street) southward to the town's commercial and civic institutions and lakefront wharves. Mutual Street, in contrast, represents a residential enclave developed for the middle class, adjacent to the grand Jarvis Street estates. The whole area declined in the 1920s with the retreat of the wealthy northwards, but the residential enclave persisted and was revived with complimentary infill projects in the last quarter of the twentieth century.

Contextual Value	
i. important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area	Х
ii. physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings	Х
iii. landmark	N/A

189, 191 and 193 Mutual Street have contextual value as they are important in defining, maintaining and supporting the character of the residential enclave west of Jarvis and

north of Gerrard Street East, which along with McGill and Granby Streets, are part of the Garden District. This character was defined in the last quarter of the nineteenth century with row houses and semi-detached houses of a consistent scale and built form which featured two-and-a-half storey dwellings, on raised basements, with sloping attic roofs expressed as gable, hips or mansards. Other features included bay windows, verandahs and porches, and dormer windows. Variety was achieved through materials, brick, wood, stone and shingle, different geometrical shapes in plan, elevation and three dimensions and elaborate decoration provided through intricately carved, turned and incised wood elements. This character was reinforced in the last quarter of the twentieth century with infill projects that carefully maintained the scale and built form of the residential types reflecting the pattern of lot sizes. 189, 191 and 193 Mutual Street contribute to the consistency of the late nineteenth century character of this enclave and through their well-preserved details and rare combination of Second Empire Style with Bay-n-Gable type enhance the quality of variety and diversity. They are physically, functionally, visually and historically linked to their surroundings.

4. SUMMARY

Following research and evaluation according to Regulation 9/06, it has been determined that the properties at 189, 191 and 193 Mutual Street have design, associative and contextual values. The three 1887 row houses are valued for their associations with the history of Park Lot 6, the influential Jarvis family, the creation of Jarvis Street, one of Toronto's "handsomest avenues" and ultimately a significant Toronto artery and the development and evolution of a residential enclave in the Garden District. Their design values are evident in their form, materials and details which make them fine representatives of Toronto's Bay-n-Gable type combined with the Second Empire Style and a rare example of this combination in this neighbourhood. The row houses have contextual value as their scale, form and massing, as well as their details, define, support and maintain the continuity of the historic character of this section of the Garden District.

5. SOURCES

Archival Sources

- Assessment Rolls, City of Toronto, St. James Ward. (City of Toronto Archives).
- W S Boulton and H C Boulton: *Atlas of the City of Toronto and Vicinity*, 1858. (Toronto Public Library).
- Building Permit 313, 29 October 1885. (City of Toronto Archives).
- Cane, James. *Topographical Map of the city and liberties of Toronto*. 1842. (City of Toronto Archives).
- City of Toronto Directories. (City of Toronto Archives).
- Fleming, Ridout and Schreiber. *Plan of the City of Toronto, Canada West*, 1857. (City of Toronto Archives).
- Goad Charles E. *Atlas of the City of Toronto and Suburbs*, 1884, 1890, 1899, 1903, 1913, 1924. (City of Toronto Archives).
- Robertson, J. Ross. *Robertson's Landmarks of Toronto: A Collection of Historical Sketches of the Town of York from 1792-1837 and of Toronto from 1834 to 1904*, Toronto, Vol. 2. 1904.
- Statues of the Province of Ontario, Passed in the session held in the forty-seventh year of the reign of her Majesty Queen Victoria. (Chap 95 Venerable Alexander Dixon, p 397), 1884.

Secondary Sources

- Arthur, Eric. *Toronto: No Mean City*. 3rd edition, revised by Stephen A. Otto, 1986.
- Cameron, Christine and Janet Wright. *Canadian Historic Sites No. 24: Second Empire Style in Canadian Architecture.* 1980.
- Dendy, William, and William Kilbourn. Toronto Observed. 1986.
- Hitchcock, Henry-Russell. *The Pelican History of Art: Architecture: Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries.* 3rd edition, 1969.
- Lundell, Liz. The Estates of Old Toronto. 1997.
- Martyn, Lucy Booth. Aristocratic Toronto: 19th Century Grandeur. 1980.
- McHugh, Patricia. *Toronto Architecture: a city guide*. 2nd edition, 1989.
- Thompson, Austin Seton. Jarvis Street: A Story of Triumph and Tragedy. 1980



6. IMAGES: the **arrows** mark the location of the subject property

1. <u>City of Toronto Property Data Map</u>: showing the location of the subject property on the east side of Mutual Street just north of Gerrard Street East. Yonge Street runs north-south at the far left of the map and Jarvis Street at the far right.



2. James Cane, Topographical Map of the city and liberties of Toronto (detail), 1842: showing Park Lot 6 stretching from Lot Street (Queen Street) to the Second Concession Road (Bloor Street). (*City of Toronto Archives*)



3. James Cane, Topographical Map of the city and liberties of Toronto (detail), 1842: showing the southern portion of Park Lot 6 just above Lot Street with the Hazelburn estate. Note how the driveway into the estate is on axis with New Street (now Jarvis Street). (*City of Toronto Archives*)



4. John Ross Robertson's View of Hazelburn, 1824: showing an aerial view of the estate with the house designed by the architect John Ewart. (*Thompson, p 87*)



5. <u>Fleming Ridout & Schreiber, Plan of the City of Toronto, Canada West (detail), 1857</u>: showing the subdivision of Park Lot 6, by John George Howard, with Jarvis Street as an important central spine continuing Nelson Street (originally New Street) which ran down to the harbour, with the market and city hall on its western side and, by 1850, St Lawrence Hall. Lot 6 is flanked to either side by Mutual St. (on the west) and George St. (on the east). Hazelburn has been demolished. (*City of Toronto Archives*)



6. <u>WS & HC Boulton, Atlas of the City of Toronto and Vicinity (detail), 1858:</u> showing the development of the plot of land at the southern end of the street block bound by Carlton, Jarvis, Gerrard and Mutual Streets with a single brick building. *(Toronto Public Library)*



7. <u>Goad's Atlas, 1884</u>: showing the subdivision of the plot of land identified as D53 into 6 irregularly-sized lots accommodating existing buildings and lanes. By 1886, Lot 5 and the frame houses, shown as 189-193 (north of the arrow), belonged to Catherine and Mary Dixon and John Watson. Lot 4 belonged to Rev'd Alexander Dixon. (*City of Toronto Archives*)



8. <u>Gerrard Street East looking West from Opposite #112, 1956</u>: showing at the far right 102-108 Gerrard Street East, houses built by John Watson, 1885-86. Note the two-storey height with a raised basement with what appears to be rough hewn stone blocks and mansard roof. Mutual Street is visible as the first street crossing Gerrard. (*City of Toronto Archives*)



<u>Goad's Atlas, 1890</u>: showing the subject properties 189, 191, 193 Mutual Street on Lot 5 of D53 and the properties at 102-110 Gerrard Street East also constructed by John Watson. Note that 195, 197 and 199 Mutual Street have been renumbered as they were previously 189, 191 and 193. (*City of Toronto Archives*)



10. <u>193, 191 and 189 Mutual Street, 1887:</u> showing the principal west and south elevations. *(Heritage Preservation Services, 2014)*



11. <u>New Louvre, Paris, L T J Visconti and H M Lefuel, 1852-7:</u> showing the mansard roofs and Classical Renaissance elements given the elaborate decorative treatment which typified the Second Empire Style. (*Hitchcock, p 195*)



12. <u>193, 191 and 189 Mutual Street, 1887:</u> showing the principal west and north elevations. *(Heritage Preservation Services, 2014)*



13. <u>193, 191 and 189 Mutual Street, 1887:</u> showing the south and west elevations with an indication of changes to the surface material and the windows at the first floor level. *(Heritage Preservation Services, 2014)*



14. <u>189 Mutual Street, 1887:</u> showing the 'fish scale' and rectangular pattern of shingles (now painted) on the mansard roof, as well as the corbelled firebreak wall and cornice brackets below the mansard. *(Heritage Preservation Services, 2014)*



15. <u>189 Mutual Street</u>: showing the projecting panel of brick above the raised stuccoed basement. (*Heritage Preservation Services, 2014*)



16. <u>193 Mutual Street</u>: showing the precise construction of the bay window with the 90 degree-angle corners as transitions between the diagonal walls of the bay. (*Heritage Preservation Services, 2014*)



17. <u>193 Mutual Street:</u> showing the corbelled firebreak wall at the second and mansard levels. (*Heritage Preservation Services, 2014*)



18. <u>189 Mutual Street, bay window detail:</u> showing the limestone lintels and the richly decorated soffit of the eaves. (*Heritage Preservation Services, 2014*)



19. <u>193 Mutual Street</u>: showing original surviving window pattern and proportion with the long lower sash and squarer upper sash in first floor bay window. *(Heritage Preservation Services, 2014)*



20. <u>193 Mutual Street:</u> showing the cornice brackets with their incised scrolls supporting the soffit and eaves of the mansard roof. (*Heritage Preservation Services, 2014*)



21. <u>189 Mutual Street:</u> showing the tiny scroll brackets on the frieze board above the slate shingles with their fish scale and plain rectangular patterns and the projecting dormer window with its stepped and notched cornice supported on paired scroll console brackets set at 90 degrees to one another. (*Heritage Preservation Services, 2014*)



22. <u>189 Mutual Street:</u> showing the tiny wood colonettes to either side of the window with the band of scrolled dentils within the decorative frame with the console brackets. (*Heritage Preservation Services, 2014*)



23. <u>108-118 McGill Street:</u> showing late nineteenth century houses with later twentieth century houses retaining scale, type and lot size of the 19th century neighbourhood (*Heritage Preservation Services, 2014*)



24. <u>120-130 McGill Street terminating at Mutual Street:</u> showing the combination of late 19th and early 20th century housing on McGill with late 20th century housing on Mutual Street maintaining scale, type and built form. *(Heritage Preservation Services, 2014)*



25. McGill Street (right) at Mutual Street with 189-193 Mutual Street in the distance: showing the consistent scale, type and built form developed in this residential enclave between the late 19th and late 20th century. (*Heritage Preservation Services, 2014*)



26. Mutual Street: showing early 20th century row housing on the left facing 189-193 Mutual Street with late 20th century housing beyond on the right all contributing to a consistent scale, type and built-form. (*Heritage Preservation Services, 2014*)