



STAFF REPORT ACTION REQUIRED

Alterations to a Designated Heritage Property with a Heritage Easement Agreement – 317 Dundas Street West (The Grange)

Date:	February 5, 2015
To:	Toronto Preservation Board Toronto East York Community Council
From:	Director, Urban Design, City Planning Division
Wards:	20 – Trinity Spadina
Reference Number:	P:\2015\Cluster B\PLN\TEYCC\TE15025

SUMMARY

This report recommends that City Council approve the alterations to the designated heritage property at 317 Dundas Street West (The Grange) to allow for the implementation of the Grange Park Revitalization Project. A cultural heritage landscape of local, City-wide and national significance, this Project is the achievement of a partnership of the AGO with the City in consultation with the Grange Park Advisory Committee and other neighbourhood stakeholders. The purpose of this report is to ensure the conservation of the cultural heritage value of this important heritage property as per the legislative requirements of s.33 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council approve the alterations to the heritage property at 317 Dundas Street West (The Grange), in accordance with Section 33 of the Ontario Heritage Act to allow for the implementation of the Grange Park Revitalization Project, with such alterations substantially in accordance with plans and drawings dated May 20, 2014 prepared by PFS Studio on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services; and the Heritage Impact Assessment, 317 Dundas Street West, Toronto, prepared by ERA Architects Inc., revised October 3, 2014 and on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, satisfactory to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services and subject to the following conditions:

- a. that prior to the issuance of a heritage permit for the designated property at 317 Dundas Street West as pertaining to the implementation of the Grange Park Revitalization Project, but excluding permits for tree maintenance including pruning and necessary tree removals, the removal of the fence on Beverley Street adjacent to Grange Park and other site preparation work as is necessary and acceptable to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, the owner shall have:
 - i. provided full building permit drawings including notes and specifications for the conservation and protective measures to be taken, design details and a description of materials and finishes to be used, to be prepared in consultation with a qualified heritage consultant, all to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
 - ii. provided a Cultural Heritage Landscape Management Plan for Grange Park that includes the following to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services:
 - a. a design and planting plan for the heritage gardens directly adjacent to the Grange house with the intent of interpreting the rich associations of the site with early horticulture in Toronto;
 - b. the identification of the surviving heritage trees on the property and in particular the horse chestnuts, and the methods to be used to protect these trees during and after construction of the Grange Park Revitalization Project;
 - c. the re-establishment of elm trees to retain a character defining feature of the landscape of the Grange from as early as 1845 and survived on the property into the 1960s; and
 - d. a schedule for the maintenance and replanting of trees to conserve the framed axial view to and from the Grange and the picturesque quality of its landscape as characterized by the balanced planting of groves of trees around a grass lawn.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY

The property at 317 Dundas Street West was designated a National Historic Site in 1970. On February 25, 1991 Toronto City Council designated the property under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (By-law No. 130-91). In 2005 a Heritage Easement Agreement was entered into between the Art Gallery of Ontario (AGO) as owners of the property and the City of Toronto.

At its meeting on April 29 and 30, 2009 City Council adopted the report 'Grange Park Revitalization', dated April 9, 2009 from the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation authorizing the negotiation and execution of an amendment to the 1911 Grange Park agreement between the City and the AGO for the fundraising, design construction and enhanced maintenance of the Park, to the satisfaction of the General Manager, Parks, Forestry and Recreation and the City Solicitor.

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2009.GM22.19>

ISSUE BACKGROUND

The designated heritage property at 317 Dundas Street West is entirely owned by the Art Gallery of Ontario (AGO) and includes The Grange (house) constructed in 1818-20 for D'Arcy Boulton Jr., and the original Boulton lands to the south now known as Grange Park (Attachment No. 2). The park was expanded in the 1970s to include closed portions of Grange Road and John Street (Attachment No. 3). These added lands are not part of the designated property.

The property was willed to the Art Museum of Toronto (now the AGO) in 1909. In 1911, an agreement between the Art Museum of Toronto and the City was made in accordance with the request of Harriot Bolton Smith in her will that lands surrounding the Grange residence be used as a public park. The terms of this agreement require that among other things the City is responsible for maintenance and operations, state of good repair and capital improvements in the Park.

In 2008 The Grange Park Advisory Committee (GPAC) was formed comprised of local residents, representatives of neighbouring institutions and City staff to advise on a capital project to restore and revitalize Grange Park. In 2009 City Council granted authority to amend the 1911 agreement between the City and the AGO to give responsibility for fundraising and project management of the design and implementation of the park revitalization to the AGO. Since then, through a partnership of the AGO, GPAC and the Parks Forestry and Recreation Division, the Grange Park Revitalization Project has been developed. A formal agreement between the AGO and the City provides for the contribution of each to this undertaking and to enhanced long-term maintenance of the Park following its implementation.

POLICY FRAMEWORK

Planning Act and Provincial Policy Statement 2014

The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) provides policy direction on matters of provincial interest related to land use planning and development. The PPS sets the policy foundation for regulating the development and use of land. Key objectives include: building strong communities; wise use and management of resources; and protecting public health and safety. City Council's planning decisions are required to be consistent with the PPS.

The Planning Act and the associated Provincial Policy Statement guide development in the Province and they include provincial interests regarding heritage resources as described in the Provincial Policy Statement issued under the authority of Section 3 of the Planning Act. The Planning Act requires that all decisions affecting land use planning matters "shall be consistent with" the Provincial Policy Statement. The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) provides direction on matters of provincial interest related to land use planning and development, and promotes the provincial policy-led planning system.

The Planning Act states that municipalities must have regard for matters of provincial interest. Section 2(d) specifically refers to "the conservation of features of significant architectural, cultural, historical, archaeological or scientific interest."

Provincial Policy Statement 2.6.1 directs that "Significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved." Properties included on the City's Inventory of Heritage Properties are considered to be significant in this context.

In the PPS 2014, "conserved" is defined as "the identification, protection, use and/or management of built heritage resources in a manner that ensures their cultural heritage value or interest is retained under the Ontario Heritage Act."

Provincial Policy Statement 2.6.3 directs that "planning authorities shall not permit development and site alteration on adjacent lands to protected heritage property except where the proposed development and site alteration has been evaluated and it has been demonstrated that the heritage attributes of the protected heritage property will be conserved."

Official Plan

Policy 3.1.5.2 of the Official Plan states that "Heritage resources on properties listed on the City's Inventory of Heritage Properties will be conserved." The policy also states that "Development adjacent to properties on the City's Inventory will respect the scale, character and form of the heritage buildings and landscapes."

At its meeting of April 3, and 4, 2013, Toronto City Council adopted amendments to the Official Plan heritage policies as City of Toronto By-law 468-2013. Heritage Preservation Services (HPS) has also considered the Grange Park Revitalization Project in the context of these amended policies.

The Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada

In 2008 Toronto City Council adopted the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada as the official document guiding planning, stewardship and conservation approach for all listed and designated heritage resources within the City of Toronto. The Grange Park Revitalization Project proposes to rehabilitate the heritage property. This is defined in the Standards and Guidelines as the action or process of making possible a continuing or compatible contemporary use of an historic place, or an individual component, while protecting its heritage value.

COMMENTS

Cultural Heritage Value

The property at 317 Dundas Street West is designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act on architectural and historical grounds. It is a rare surviving example of an early 19th century residential estate that resulted from the Park lot system of the Town of York. The property is comprised of the earliest surviving brick residence in Toronto, a two-and-a-half storey red brick Neoclassical house with a later west wing, viewed from the south across landscaped pleasure grounds that now comprise the 1.7 hectare Grange Park (Attachment No.5). The Grange is historically important as the home of several prominent citizens including William Boulton, a four-term mayor of Toronto, and served as a centre of social and political activity for Toronto's 19th century elite. It is also important in providing the original exhibit space for the Art Gallery of Toronto (now the AGO).

The cultural heritage value of the property is generally accepted as being comprised of key heritage attributes of the property that have survived with varying degrees of integrity. These features can be described as defining two important aspects of the heritage property (Mark Laird, Landscape Revitalization Strategy for Grange Park, Heritage Significance Study): the physical structure of the property, and its horticulture and landscape character.

The physical structure of Grange Park is characterized by three distinguishing features that survive today:

- the site grading with the Grange sitting at the highest elevation on the property that gradually steps down as you move from north to south giving the house prominence within its setting
- the axial design with the Grange terminating an axial view to and from John Street
- the elliptical (oval) drive that was unique to this private residence and has survived despite modern interventions

The horticulture and landscape of the Grange has been more significantly impacted over time. However a great deal is known about the landscape history of the Grange that can and should inform a conservation strategy for the site:

- the significance of horse chestnut and elm as two tree species that have figured prominently over the past two hundred years in the landscape of the Grange
- the composition of tree groves (elm) and specimen trees on grassed lawn in a Picturesque landscape style. The surviving stands of mature trees have helped sustain the grove and grass character of the site but the loss of the elms with their distinctive form has diminished its integrity.
- The rich association of the site with early horticulture in Toronto through the cultivation of plant materials on the property including fruit and ornamental trees, flowering shrubs, biennials and perennials, roses, bulbs and bedding out plants.

In the October 3, 2014 Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) prepared by ERA Architects Inc. for the designated property, a draft Statement of Significance is proposed to inform both the proposed conservation strategy for the property, and the evaluation of its cultural heritage value under Provincial Regulation 9/06. The HIA recommends that key attributes of the house and the landscaped open space that together comprise the Grange be included in the reasons for designation. For the purpose of updating designation By-law No. 130-91, evaluation of the cultural heritage values and attributes of the property is the subject of a separate report from the Director, Urban Design, City Planning Division. An amendment to the designation will be considered at the March 24, 2015 meeting of the Toronto Preservation Board and the April 14, 2015 meeting of the Toronto East York Community Council.

Adjacent Heritage Properties

The subject property is adjacent to three other heritage properties: the designated property at 100 McCaul Street (Ontario College of Art, original wing, 1926); and two listed properties at 74 and 76 McCaul Street (semi-detached houses, 1887). The HIA prepared by ERA Architects Inc. concludes that the Grange Park Revitalization Project will have no negative impact on these adjacent heritage properties. Staff has endeavoured to reduce the impact of the proposed children's north playground in its proximity to Grange House and the adjacent designated wing of the Ontario College of Art. The design team has made best efforts to adjust the location of the children`s north playground further south in response to this concern. Staff is otherwise satisfied the design has no impact on the adjacent heritage properties.

Proposed Scope of Work

The Grange Park Revitalization Project (Attachment No. 6) is the product of a collaborative effort over several years by the AGO with the City of Toronto, GPAC and other key stakeholders to develop a plan for the renewal and maintenance of this important neighbourhood and downtown public park. The Project includes the following key design features: a new south entry to the AGO; east and west water features; a newly

designed forecourt at the entrance to the Grange; a central green (the Great Lawn); expanded children's play areas; a redesigned John Street Promenade; new washrooms and maintenance building; and new benches, plantings, and lighting throughout the park.

Implementation of the Project is supported in large part by the financial contribution of a private donor. The first phase of project implementation is scheduled to begin in the spring of this year.

Conservation Strategy

The Grange Park Revitalization Project proposes to interpret through a contemporary design the 19th century landscape of Grange Park. The plan is based on a conservation strategy that acknowledges the important heritage attributes of the physical structure of Grange Park. The plan maintains the organization of the site around an extended axial approach from John Street and a circular drive as the two key features of the 19th century landscape. While some regrading of the lawn is proposed, the stepping up of the landscape to the Grange house is maintained as part of the design. New public amenities including the children's play areas, washrooms and the maintenance building are intentionally located on the periphery of the site to conserve the design clarity of these heritage attributes. Staff recommend consideration be given to further interpreting the historic physical structure of the site by referencing through a contemporary design solution the original boundary along the southern edge at Grange Road that will enhance the axial and ceremonial vista to the Grange from the top of John Street (Mark Laird, Landscape Revitalization Strategy for Grange Park, Heritage Significance Study).

The horticulture and 19th century landscape character of the Grange is expressed within the Grange Park Revitalization Project through the conservation of the mature trees primarily located on the west side of the park. (Only three trees are recommended for removal due to conflict in their location with the proposed design). On the east side of the central lawn the plan re-establishes groves of trees, a character-defining feature of the designed landscape of the Grange that has lost integrity over time. Heritage gardens are recommended adjacent to the Grange house. At the time of this report, the details of these gardens were not available.

Cultural Heritage Landscape Management Plan

The Grange Park Revitalization Project demonstrates the significant achievement of the AGO with GPAC and Parks staff to advance the rehabilitation of this valued public asset. As a designated heritage property and a National Historic Site in the City of Toronto it is important that this project demonstrate a high standard of heritage conservation. For this reason staff is recommending a Cultural Heritage Landscape Management Plan be developed and implemented based on four important aspects of the cultural heritage landscape of the Grange as described below:

- a design and planting plan for the heritage gardens directly adjacent to the Grange house that interpret the rich associations of the site with early horticulture in Toronto. Current plans for the Grange Park do not include design detail or proposed plantings for these gardens. They are however, extremely important in

their direct proximity to the Grange house, to the proposed new forecourt to the Grange, and to the proposed new entrance to the AGO.

- the identification of the surviving heritage trees on the property and in particular the horse chestnuts, and the methods to be used to protect these trees during and after construction of the Grange Park Revitalization Project. This information will also inform a schedule for the maintenance and replanting of trees within the Park.
- the re-establishment of elm trees as an early character-defining feature of the landscape of the Grange that survived into the 1960s. Many early photos, paintings and descriptions of the Grange demonstrate the significance of the elm on this property, both as a specimen tree and in groves.
- a schedule for the maintenance and replanting of trees to conserve the framed axial view to and from the Grange and the Picturesque quality of its landscape as characterized by the balanced planting of groves of trees in a grass lawn. Archival material is available that should be used to inform the composition, location and species of new plantings.

This Management Plan can be developed while the first phase of the Project is being implemented and will assist in refining the planting plan for the Revitalization Project. It will also ensure that long term maintenance of the Park is informed by a fuller understanding and documentation of its cultural heritage value.

CONCLUSION

The Grange Park Revitalization Project provides an opportunity to raise the public profile and understanding of this important cultural heritage landscape. Staff is recommending that Council approve the proposed alterations as set out in this report.

CONTACT

Sherry Pedersen, Preservation Co-ordinator
Heritage Preservation Services
Tel: 416-338-1089
Fax: 416-392-1973
E-Mail: speders@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Harold Madi
Director, Urban Design
City Planning Division

ATTACHMENTS

- Attachment No. 1 - Location Map: Grange Park
- Attachment No. 2 - Designation By-Law: 317 Dundas Street West
- Attachment No. 3 - Ownership Map: 317 Dundas Street West
- Attachment No. 4 - Photograph: The Grange
- Attachment No. 5 - Photographs: Grange Park
- Attachment No. 6 - Rendered Plan: Grange Park Revitalization Project