



**STAFF REPORT
ACTION REQUIRED**

Alterations to a Designated Heritage Property and Authority to Amend Existing Heritage Easement Agreement – 176 Yonge Street (Robert Simpson Company Building)

Date:	May 25, 2015
To:	Toronto Preservation Board Toronto and East York Community Council
From:	Director, Urban Design, City Planning
Wards:	Ward 27 – Toronto Centre-Rosedale
Reference Number:	P:\2015\Cluster B\PLN\TEYCC\TE15069

SUMMARY

This report recommends that City Council approve the proposed alterations to the designated heritage property at 176 Yonge Street and give authority for the City to amend the existing Heritage Easement Agreement with the owner. The property at 176 Yonge Street is designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.

City Council's approval of the proposed alterations to the heritage property and authority to enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement is required under the Ontario Heritage Act.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council approve the alterations to the heritage property at 176 Yonge Street, in accordance with Section 33 of the Ontario Heritage Act, to allow for the alterations to the heritage building on the lands known municipally in the year 2015 as 176 Yonge Street, with such alterations substantially in accordance with the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), prepared by Goldsmith Borgal & Company Ltd. Architects, dated April 24, 2015, and on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, subject to the following additional conditions:

- a. That prior to the issuance of any heritage permit for the alterations as set out in the report from the Director, Urban Design, City Planning Division, dated May 25, 2015, at 176 Yonge Street, including a heritage permit or a building permit, but excluding permits for repairs and maintenance and usual and minor works for the existing heritage building as are acceptable to the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, the owner shall:
 - i. Amend the existing Heritage Easement Agreement (HEA) for the property at 176 Yonge Street in accordance with the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), prepared by Goldsmith Borgal & Company Ltd. Architects, dated April 24, 2015, and on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
 - ii. Provide full building permit drawings, including notes and specifications for the conservation and protective measures, including a description of materials and finishes, to be prepared by the project architect and a qualified heritage consultant to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
 - iii. Provide a Lighting Plan that describes how the heritage property will be sensitively illuminated to enhance its heritage character to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services and thereafter shall implement such Plan to the satisfaction of the Manager Heritage Preservation Services;
 - iv. Provide photo documentation of the interior and exterior of the southeast corner vestibule of the heritage property, including two (2) printed sets of archival quality 8" x 10" colour photographs with borders in a glossy or semi-gloss finish and one (1) digital set on a CD in tiff format and 600 dpi resolution keyed to a location map to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services;
2. City Council authorize the City Solicitor to amend the existing Heritage Easement Agreement, registered on the title for the heritage property at 176 Yonge Street, Instrument No. CT991633 dated November 18, 1988 and on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.
3. City Council authorize the City Solicitor to introduce any necessary bill in Council to amend the Heritage Easement Agreement.

Financial Impact

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY

The property located at 176 Yonge Street was listed on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register on June 20, 1973. On March 31, 1976, Toronto City Council designated the property under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. The property is also subject to a Heritage Easement Agreement with the City dated November 18, 1988 (CT991633).

BACKGROUND

Development Proposal

The application includes the introduction of new entrance doors and glazing systems at the southeast corner of the building at Richmond Street and Yonge Street, the northeast corner at Yonge Street and Queen Street, on the Richmond Street, Queen Street, and Yonge Street facades. The eastern half of the building is being renovated to accommodate Saks Fifth Avenue while the Hudson's Bay Company will be relocated to the western half of the building. This renovation will result in several alterations which do not require Council approval, including the installation of new signage, awnings, and decorative flags. The installation of decorative metal grilles on the exterior face of the building is not part of this report and will be subject to a separate application under the Ontario Heritage Act.

Policy Framework

Provincial Policy Statement and Planning Act

The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) provides policy direction on matters of provincial interest related to land use planning and development. The PPS sets the policy foundation for regulating the development and use of land. The key objectives include: building strong communities; wise use and management of resources; and, protecting public health and safety. City Council's planning decisions are required to be consistent with the PPS.

The Planning Act and associated Provincial Policy Statement guide development in the Province and they include provincial interests regarding heritage resources as described in the Provincial Policy Statement issued under the authority of Section 3 of the Planning Act. The Planning Act requires that all decisions affecting land use planning matters "shall be consistent with" the Provincial Policy Statement. The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) provides direction on matters of provincial interest related to land use planning and development, and promotes the provincial policy-led planning system.

Provincial Policy Statement 2.6.1 reads "Significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved".

Official Plan

Policy 3.1.5.2 of the Official Plan states that "Heritage resources on properties listed on the City's Inventory of Heritage Properties will be conserved."

At its meeting of April 3, and 4, 2013, Toronto City Council adopted amendments to the Official Plan heritage policies. By-law 468-2013 enacting these policies was appealed to the Ontario Municipal Board. These appeals have been settled and an oral decision of

approval by the Ontario Municipal Board has been issued. HPS also considered the proposal within the context of these amended policies.

Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada

In 2008 Toronto City Council adopted the *Parks Canada Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada* as the official document guiding planning, stewardship and conservation approach for all listed and designated heritage resources within the City of Toronto. The Heritage Impact Assessment submitted in support of this application identifies the proposed conservation treatment for 176 Yonge Street as rehabilitation. For this reason the General Standards (1-9) and the Standards for Rehabilitation (10-13) apply to this project.

Heritage Resource

The Robert Simpson Company building (begun 1894-95 by Edmund Burke) at 176 Yonge Street is designated on architectural grounds as an outstanding example of late nineteenth century commercial design. It is an early example of the use of steel post and beam construction in Canada and of the work of one of Toronto's most important architects. Additions were made to the complex at various periods up to 1971, and it is now an important unit in itself as well as in the streetscape of the area. The Reasons for Identification in the HEA (Attachment No. 5) include the interior hexagonal vestibule at Richmond and Yonge Streets, with its etched glass and Art Deco metal work.

COMMENTS

Heritage Impact Assessment

Heritage Preservation Services (HPS) has reviewed the Heritage Impact Assessment prepared by Goldsmith Borgal & Company Ltd. Architects, dated April 24, 2015. The HIA finds that although the proposed alterations to the southeast corner at Richmond and Yonge Streets will result in the loss of the angled display window and original use as a vestibule, the new use as a restaurant and construction will utilize the space and be legible as a contemporary intervention. The HIA also finds that the proposed rehabilitation of the northeast corner at Queen and Yonge Streets retains character-defining attributes of the building and that the work can be accomplished in accordance with accepted conservation principles, returning it to a pre-existing condition dating to the 1920s and 1930s.

Assessment of Heritage Impacts

Northeast Corner – Queen Street West and Yonge Street

The proposal includes the infill of the bays between existing granite columns with new display windows at the northeast corner of Yonge and Queen Street. The HIA indicates that "[t]he new glazed curtain wall system will recreate the display window/transom configuration, matching the systems of the adjacent bays". Staff feel that the rehabilitation of the display window and transom configuration, to match the adjacent

bays on the Yonge and Queen Street elevations, will restore the original design of the openings to a previous condition and is an appropriate alteration.

Southeast Corner – Richmond Street West and Yonge Street

The proposal also includes the reconfiguration of the southeast corner of the building at Yonge and Richmond Streets. A new glazing system will replace non-original doors in the second bay on the Yonge Street side and in the second bay on the Richmond Street side. Entrance doors will be included in the new glazing system only on the Yonge Street side of the building, however the glazing system will be a reversible alteration that will allow for the future reinstallation of entrance doors if necessary in the future. The original decorative metal cornice and glass transom will be retained as part of the new glazing system. The original materials in the interior lobby space, including the terrazzo floors, marble walls, plaster frieze, and central octagonal column with metal cornice, aluminum framing and etched glass, will be retained and incorporated into the restaurant/bar. A portion of the marble wall on the west side of the lobby space will be removed to accommodate a new elevator, and the War Memorial currently on this part of the wall will be relocated within the building.

CONCLUSION

HPS has considered the application in the context of the Planning Act, the heritage policies of the Provincial Policy Statement 2014 (PPS), the heritage policies of the City of Toronto Official Plan, the heritage policies of the Council adopted amendments to the City of Toronto Official Plan, and the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada. Staff agree with the findings of the HIA and feel that the proposed alterations should not have a negative impact on the heritage character of 176 Yonge Street. Staff are supportive of the applicant's efforts to conserve the heritage property and recommend that City Council approve the proposed alterations to 176 Yonge Street. The applicant will be required to submit replacement HEA photos to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, upon completion of the proposed work.

CONTACT

Sherry Pedersen, Heritage Coordinator
Heritage Preservation Services
Tel: 416-338-1089; Fax: 416-392-1973
E-mail: speders@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Harold Madi
Director, Urban Design
City Planning Division

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 – Location Map: 176 Yonge Street

Attachment 2 – Photographs: 176 Yonge Street

Attachment 3 – Elevations: 176 Yonge Street

Attachment 4 – Plans: 176 Yonge Street

Attachment 5 – Reasons for Identification (HEA): 176 Yonge Street