



STAFF REPORT ACTION REQUIRED

Coordinated Street Furniture Program - Status Update Year 7

Date:	April 15, 2015
To:	Public Works and Infrastructure Committee
From:	General Manager, Transportation Services
Wards:	All
Reference Number:	p:\2015\Cluster B\tra\pr\pw15003pr

SUMMARY

The Coordinated Street Furniture Program is a partnership with Astral Out-of-Home to install, operate, and maintain over 25,500 pieces of street furniture over a 20-year period. The agreement with Astral began in 2007, and follows a fiscal year of September 1 to August 31. This report covers Year 7 of the agreement, for the 2013-14 fiscal year.

As directed by City Council, the annual report outlines the revenues received by the City from the Program, an update on the rollout of the inventory of street furniture elements, and an overview of maintenance performance and issues. The deployment of new street furniture pieces is on schedule. Routine and scheduled maintenance of elements is taking place according to the terms of the agreement, but remains challenging, and the City is working with Astral to improve response times. A new litter bin design is being rolled out to address maintenance challenges experienced with earlier versions, such as broken flaps and pedals.

The report also provides an update on the status of new forms of advertising approved by City Council and now being implemented on transit shelters, namely "creative" advertising that is included within or extends beyond the ad caisson, and "digital" advertising which replaces traditional paper panels in transit shelters with digital screens. Finally, the environmental benefits of the program, such as the avoidance of 920 tonnes of carbon dioxide emissions due to energy efficiency measures, have been included in the report.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The General Manager, Transportation Services recommends that:

1. Public Works and Infrastructure Committee receive this report for information.

Financial Impact

There are no financial impacts that will arise from the adoption of this report.

The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

DECISION HISTORY

City Council, at its meeting of May 23, 24 and 25, 2007, adopted the motion that "City Council accept the proposal by Astral Media Outdoor LP as having achieved the highest evaluated score, to provide a coordinated street furniture program for the City of Toronto as described in the City's RFP 9103-06-7316."

<http://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2007/cc/minutes/2007-05-23-cc08-mn.pdf>

City Council, at its meeting of June 6-8, 2012, adopted a motion requesting the General Manager, Transportation Services, to "... report annually to Council, through the Public Works and Infrastructure Committee, such report to include status updates on implementation of the Street Furniture Program, revenue, inventory and completion rates by street furniture element, installation locations, complaints and response times, maintenance compliance issues, and information related to the emerging practice of 'creative advertising' on bus shelters and other information relevant to compliance with the contract."

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2012.PW15.5>

City Council, at its meetings of May 6-8, 2014 and June 10-13, 2014, approved amendments to the Coordinated Street Furniture Program agreement to allow for the placement of creative advertising and the installation of digital advertising faces at transit shelters.

<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2014.CC51.8>
<http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2014.CC52.4>

ISSUE BACKGROUND

The Coordinated Street Furniture Program will deliver over 25,500 pieces of street furniture (transit shelters, litter bins, benches, etc.) across Toronto over a 20-year period. The Program is a partnership model between the City and the private sector, is being

implemented citywide, and is unprecedented in its scale and scope. Now in its eighth year, the Program has delivered marked improvements to Toronto's streets while reducing the amount of advertising and clutter in the public realm.

The partnership model with Astral Out-of-Home ensures that the provision of street furniture for the public is fully funded from advertising revenue. In fact, the 20-year agreement with Astral guarantees a minimum of \$445.5 million is provided to the City over the contract term. This is additional to the capital investment and maintenance of street furniture, which is valued at \$202 million and \$294 million, respectively.

COMMENTS

The partnership agreement with Astral Out-of-Home prescribes an agreement year that begins on September 1 and ends August 31. Year 7 began on September 1, 2013 and ended August 31, 2014. As of the writing of this report, the implementation of the program is currently within the eighth agreement year.

Revenue

A guaranteed minimum annual revenue (MAG) payment is issued to the City at the beginning of each agreement year. In September 2013, the City received \$15,001,287 in MAG for Year 7, plus an additional \$5 million for the "cash out" of 11 automated public toilets for purposes of funding Toronto Bikeshare. As of the end of Year 7, the City had received a total of \$89,837,905 as a result of the Program, including the \$28 million upfront lump sum payment.

The Year 8 MAG amount of \$17,474,814, which includes the prorated MAG for digital advertising, has also been received. This means the City has received a total of \$107,312,719 to date as a result of the Program. A full accounting of revenue received is included in Appendix A.

Public Service/Unsold Advertising

Over the course of an agreement year, the City is entitled to utilize up to 8.5% of the total number of advertising faces at no charge. In Year 7, 8.6% of the 4,886 advertising faces were used, at an estimated value of \$4,383,926, as well as a bonus amount of \$528,406. The placement of advertising is managed by the City's Strategic Communications division, and included messaging for citywide campaigns such as "Winterlicious", "Share the Road", and promotion of recreational programming. Astral has been a responsive partner in working with the City to provide opportunities for time-sensitive messaging.

In addition to advertising space for City campaigns, each business improvement area (BIA) may receive one free advertising face for promotion within its boundaries. A total of 36 BIAs (approximately half) took advantage of this opportunity in Year 7.

Outside of the Coordinated Street Furniture Program, Astral Out-of-Home provides the City with free national advertising on television, radio, and outdoor media also owned by the company with

a potential maximum value of more than \$2,000,000. In Year 7, this amount of advertising totalled an estimated \$1,179,000 and was used to promote major events such as World Pride 2014.

Additional City Benefits

Further to revenue, the City receives additional benefits from the Coordinated Street Furniture Program agreement to be provided at the discretion of Astral Out-of-Home. The additional benefits are to be implemented at any time during the agreement term and include the following (with status updates as of the end of Year 7):

- Scholarship Program – An investment has been made for Year 7 in the amount of \$371,429 toward local music programs. Total investment to date is \$1,168,429.
- Summer Student Program – Summer students have been hired locally in Year 7 in the amount of \$135,708. Total investment to date is \$1,382,750.
- Public Art Funding Program – This program will be implemented beginning in Year 9.
- Free Homeless Access to Public Washrooms – Six thousand single-use washroom tokens have been provided to the City for Year 7. A total of 24,000 tokens, valued at \$0.25 each, have been provided since the first automated public toilet was opened in Year 3. The distribution of tokens is managed by the Streets to Home Program in the City's Shelter, Support & Housing Administration division.

Inventory and Completion Rates

The Street Furniture Program agreement specifies the number of elements to be installed annually, and is front-loaded in the first eight years to provide amenities to the public as early as possible in the contract term. As of the end of Year 7, 99% of the scheduled elements had been installed since the beginning of the contract, and more than half of all elements to be installed over the 20-year term have been rolled out. A breakdown of installations by element and by ward is included in Appendix B.

Maintenance Compliance, Response Times and Complaints

Astral Out-of-Home provides all maintenance of street furniture elements under the agreement. There are three forms of servicing provided – preventative maintenance; routine maintenance, cleaning, and repair; and requested maintenance, cleaning and repair. City staff perform routine checks to ensure that maintenance standards are being met. In Year 7, 24,557 preventative maintenance checks were conducted across all elements, such as ensuring shelters are properly lit. Routine maintenance and cleaning is performed by Astral every seven days for each element.

Complaints and requests for service are received by City staff through 311 or directly to Transportation Services staff, are then investigated as appropriate, and forwarded to Astral. Requests and complaints are also received directly through the Astral's "Commitment to Quality Service" line at 1-866-8-ASTRAL or quality@astral.com. New systems have been put in place to better track maintenance work and complaints, including an online web tool that provides City staff with access to records of Astral work orders. As a result, a more accurate picture of requests

has been developed this year compared to previous reports, reflecting the over 19,000 service requests received by all parties in Year 7.

Almost all of maintenance-related issues and complaints are for transit shelters (70%) and litter bins (28%). Cleaning of these elements, and repair of damage are common concerns. In Year 8, a new litter bin is being rolled out that addresses or eliminates the most frequent maintenance concerns associated with the first and second generation bins, such as broken pedals and flaps, missing panels, and broken door locks. With more than 7,000 litter bins already rolled out, staff will continue to work with Astral and Solid Waste Management to monitor and address maintenance issues. A full breakdown of service requests per street furniture element is included in Appendix C.

The agreement also requires Astral to provide 24-hour emergency response to make a street furniture element safe in the event of severe damage, such as in the case of shelter glass damaged due to a motor vehicle collision. When this occurs, Astral's sub-contractor will typically remove all of the broken glass and ensure that the rest of the shelter is structurally safe. The replacement of the glass will then be scheduled for a subsequent date. While emergency issues are not tracked independently, City staff have observed consistent and timely responsiveness from Astral in addressing urgent matters.

Finally, another frequent challenge with maintenance of assets is removal for construction purposes unrelated to the Street Furniture Program – this can impact 4-5% of installed elements in a given year. Coordination of construction, and reinstallation of assets such as transit shelters, must be carefully planned and respect the health and safety regulations associated with work zones. In some cases, temporary transit shelters are installed to provide an interim service to residents while construction is taking place, or before permanent assets can be reinstalled. Delays in construction projects can also impact the ability to replace elements, sometimes pushing reinstallation dates into and beyond the winter months. City staff and Astral are currently reviewing procedures and protocols to reduce the impacts to residents and TTC customers from these temporary removals.

Creative Advertising

Creative advertising campaigns involve the use of additional materials, such as decals or wraps, inside or outside of the advertising caisson and on the rest of the transit shelter. Campaigns are usually limited to a small number of shelters where the attention can be focussed; creative advertising is not permitted on information pillars.

In response to concerns that were raised about visible permeability of transit shelters for safety purposes, City staff, supported by Astral, organized a review of creative options on transit shelters with a technical advisory group. The group comprised TTC staff and members of the Toronto Police Services, Divisional Police Support unit, including their expert in CPTED (Crime Prevention through Environmental Design). The group reviewed a number of mocked-up transit shelters with different amounts and levels of transparency. As a result, the creative guidelines that were adopted by City Council at its meetings of May 6-8, 2014 and June 10-13, 2014, were signed off and made slightly more stringent.

As per these guidelines, a maximum of 5% of all transit shelters may contain creative advertising at any given time. In Year 7, a total number of 18 creative advertising campaigns were implemented on 79 ad faces throughout the 12-month period, which represented far fewer than 5% of transit shelter ad faces.

Environmental Reporting

Astral Out-of-Home is required to report to the City annually on its environmental performance in delivering the Toronto Street Furniture Program. A summary of the reported environmental benefits is below:

- Use of an estimated 33.82% recycled content in components installed (by weight)
- Energy savings resulting in 920 tonnes of avoided carbon dioxide emissions
- Recycling of more than 7,500 fluorescent lamps, recovering 327 grams of mercury; and
- Diversion of 1.6 million trash bags through the use of reusable litter receptacle liners.

Publication Boxes

Through the Street Furniture Program, Astral Out-of-Home continues to install publication box kiosks and corrals to reduce visual clutter from publication boxes. A total of 72 kiosks (containing up to 16 publications each) and 708 corrals (organizing up to four publications each) have been installed by the end of Year 7. A total of 27% of the 7,800 licensed publication boxes were migrated from being free-standing on City streets to the kiosks and corrals.

Continued rollout of these items in Year 8 and beyond will continue to assist the Unit staff in reducing clutter and ensuring a standard pedestrian clearway on all streets. This is in addition to an expected reduction in the number of licensed locations for publication boxes, following a declining trend in the physical distribution of print media in the City's right-of-way.

Implementation of Digital Advertising

In accordance with Astral's request and Council's decisions of May 6-8, 2014 and June 10-13, 2014, forty digital advertising faces were installed on existing transit shelter ad panels in the fall of 2014 (Year 8). The implementation of digital advertising guarantees the City an additional \$506,646 (pro-rated from \$629,000 for partial year implementation in Year 8) in guaranteed minimum annual revenue (MAG). This will increase each year over the remainder of the agreement term, totalling \$16,485,009 in additional MAG. City Council has approved a maximum of 40 additional ad faces to be installed in Years 9 and 10, for a maximum of 120 digital ad faces.

New Litter Bin

As discussed in the Year 5 report, a new litter bin design, with a slimmer profile and fewer moving parts, is now being rolled out beginning in Year 8. The new design, created in partnership with Solid Waste Management, features metal panels instead of plastic, does not have

pedals or flaps, and can store the same amount of litter as existing bins using a smaller footprint. It has been designed to address two key concerns – the amount of space required in the public realm to install a litter bin, and the number of maintenance issues associated with the original design. The improved design has proven popular with stakeholders, including Business Improvement Areas and the public, and will be increasingly utilized in the rollout of new street furniture elements. A photograph of the new bin is included in Appendix D.

CONTACT

Elyse Parker
Director, Public Realm Section
Transportation Services
Tel: 416-338-2432
E-mail: eparker@toronto.ca

Ryan Lanyon
Acting Manager, Street Furniture
Transportation Services
Tel: 416-392-1799
E-mail: rlanyon@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Stephen Buckley
General Manager, Transportation Services

ATTACHMENTS

Appendix A: Street Furniture Revenue Report
Appendix B: Street Furniture Rollout Completion Rates
Appendix C: Street Furniture Service Requests
Appendix D: Glossary of Street Furniture Elements

Appendix A: Street Furniture Revenue Report

The following schedule outlines the annual payments received from Astral Media up to the beginning of Year 7. The minimum annual revenue guarantee (MAG) is paid at the beginning of each agreement year (September 1 to August 31).

Agreement Year	Minimum Annual Revenue	Percentage of Gross Advertising Revenues	Amount Received to Date			
			Guaranteed Annual Revenue	Top-up of Advertising Revenue	Digital and Creative Advertising	Initial Lump Sum or Cash Out
1	\$2,000,000	10%	\$2,000,000	\$0	N/A	\$28,000,000
2	\$2,500,000	10%	\$2,500,000	\$0	N/A	
3	\$4,000,000	20%	\$4,000,000	\$403,256	N/A	
4	\$7,816,575	25%	\$7,816,575	\$0	N/A	
5	\$11,638,531	32%	\$11,638,531	\$0	N/A	
6	\$13,478,256	32%	\$13,478,256	\$0	N/A	
7	\$15,001,287	32%	\$15,001,287	\$0	N/A	\$5,000,000**
8	\$17,474,814*	32%	\$16,968,168		\$506,646	
9	\$18,466,772*	32%				
10	\$19,380,346*	32%				
11	\$20,507,706*	32%				
12	\$24,780,955*	32%				
13	\$26,003,946*	32%				
14	\$27,472,182*	32%				
15	\$29,016,942*	32%				
16	\$32,134,601*	32%				
17	\$33,833,432*	32%				
18	\$35,499,890*	32%				
19	\$37,248,790*	32%				
20	\$39,084,220*	32%				
Total	\$417,461,599*	-	\$107,312,719			

* Includes the guaranteed minimum annual revenue from digital advertising.

** Cash out of 11 automated public toilets

Appendix B: Street Furniture Rollout Completion Rates

Citywide Installations

Element	Installed Year 1-7 (August 31, 2014)	Agreement Schedule H Requirement Year 1-7	Completion Rate Year 1-7	Agreement Schedule H Requirement Year 1-20*	Completion Rate Year 1-20
Transit Shelter	2,419	2,451	99%	5,000	48%
Litter Receptacle	7,764	7,835	99%	12,183	64%
Bench (one- and two-seat)	1,418	1,426	100%	2,402	59%
Information Pillar (with ads)	83	85	95%	85	94%
Information Pillar (no ads)	54	60		60	
Poster Column	498	500	100%	700	71%
Poster Board	936	1,023	91%	2,000	47%
Automated Public Toilet	3	3	100%	9	33%
Publication Box Kiosk	72	72	100%	415	17%
Publication Box Corral	708	703	101%	2,000	35%
Total	13,955	14,157	99%	25,595	55%

* As of June 2014

Installations by District and Ward (September 1, 2007 to August 31, 2014)

Element	Etobicoke-York											Total
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	11	12	13	17	
Transit Shelter	76	87	27	43	63	79	75	68	50	46	41	655
Litter Receptacle	184	191	112	135	263	216	143	214	112	197	196	1,963
Bench	30	37	33	40	51	23	33	25	19	24	22	337
Information Pillar												
Poster Column	7	10	7	8	8	5	9	9	6	9	5	83
Poster Board	42	41	17	16	23	15	16	9	10	19	9	217
Public Toilet												
Publication Box Kiosk					1	1				4		6
Publication Box Corral	4	5	7	6	20	13	15	8	3	14	7	102
Total	343	371	203	248	429	352	291	333	200	313	300	3,363

Element	North York											Total
	8	9	10	15	16	23	24	25	26	33	34	
Transit Shelter	116	56	78	83	50	47	84	51	67	43	67	742
Litter Receptacle	181	111	155	218	141	191	166	124	137	90	133	1647
Bench	28	9	34	86	47	46	58	54	57	22	35	476
Information Pillar					10	3		4	1			18
Poster Column	8	6	12	10	7	7	7	4	7	7	5	80
Poster Board	33	14	29	42	18	25	27	22	21	18	15	264
Public Toilet												
Publication Box Kiosk				1	3	2	4	1		1		12
Publication Box Corral	4	1	16	7	18	32	27	14	14	21	41	195
Total	370	197	324	447	294	353	373	274	304	202	296	3,434

Element	Scarborough										Total
	35	36	37	38	39	40	41	42	43	44	
Transit Shelter	82	25	103	58	50	49	79	33	20	30	529
Litter Receptacle	153	111	200	122	125	115	195	133	95	128	1377
Bench	37	40	27	28	24	26	59	30	15	14	300
Information Pillar											
Poster Column	7	6	9	7	10	9	8	4	2	3	65
Poster Board	19	5	36	19	25	27	47	27	8	8	221
Public Toilet											
Publication Box Kiosk	3		1	1					1		6
Publication Box Corral	10	5	14	10	18	10	12	6	8		93
Total	311	192	390	245	252	236	400	233	151	183	2,591

Element	Toronto & East York												Total
	14	18	19	20	21	22	27	28	29	30	31	32	
Transit Shelter	46	52	43	30	44	24	26	54	21	52	64	37	493
Litter Receptacle	179	151	205	457	153	218	412	325	144	206	149	178	2,777
Bench	22	21	27	24	38	40	12	16	18	25	20	42	305
Information Pillar	1	2	8	36	6	9	28	22	3	1	1	2	119
Poster Column	6	11	15	159	9	8	18	13	5	11	4	11	270
Poster Board	20	19	18	25	6	23	26	39	5	21	16	16	234
Public Toilet	1			1								1	3
Publication Box Kiosk	2		2	11	1	4	17	5	4			2	48
Publication Box Corral	19	11	22	40	19	26	71	49	9	18	8	26	318
Total	296	267	340	783	276	352	610	523	209	334	262	315	4,567

Appendix C: Street Furniture Service Requests

Element	Issue	% of Total Service Requests	Total # of Existing Elements	Total # of Service Requests	Service Requests per Element
Transit Shelter	Cleaning/Maintenance	47.6%	4,247	9,190	3.2
	Damage/Repair	22.7%		4,376	
	<i>Total</i>	70.3%		13,566	
Litter Receptacle	Cleaning/Maintenance	11.6%	7,764	2,235	0.7
	Damage/Repair	16.6%		3,210	
	<i>Total</i>	28.2%		5,445	
Bench	Cleaning/Maintenance	0.1%	1,418	12	0.1
	Damage/Repair	0.4%		73	
	<i>Total</i>	0.4%		85	
Info Pillar	Cleaning/Maintenance	0.1%	137	27	0.4
	Damage/Repair	0.2%		34	
	<i>Total</i>	0.3%		61	
Poster Structure	Cleaning/Maintenance	0.1%	498	10	0.1
	Damage/Repair	0.1%		17	
	<i>Total</i>	0.1%		27	
Publication Structure	Cleaning/Maintenance	0.3%	780	61	0.1
	Damage/Repair	0.2%		47	
	<i>Total</i>	0.6%		108	
Washroom	Cleaning/Maintenance	0.0%	3	2	3.7
	Damage/Repair	0.0%		9	
	<i>Total</i>	0.1%		11	
Grand Total		100.0%	14,847	19,303	1.3

* Includes 1,803 shelters installed prior to the Street Furniture Program and currently maintained by Astral Out-of-Home

Appendix D: Glossary of Street Furniture Elements

• FURNITURE •



F1-1
TRANSIT SHELTERS



F1-2
LITTER/RECYCLING RECEPTACLES



F1-3
STANDARD BENCH



MINI BENCH



F1-4
INFORMATION PILLAR



F1-5
PUBLIC POSTING COLUMN



F1-6
POSTER BOARD



F1-7
AUTOMATED WASHROOM



F1-8
MULTI-PUBLICATION STRUCTURE
(KIOSK)



F1-9
PUBLICATION BOX CORRAL



F1-10
BICYCLE RING

New Litter Bin Design

