



STAFF REPORT ACTION REQUIRED

Results of the Requests for Quotation 6032-15-0070 to 6032-15-0087 (inclusive) for Collector and Local Road Plowing and Driveway Windrow Clearing.

Date:	March 12, 2015
To:	Public Works and Infrastructure Committee
From:	Director, Purchasing and Materials Management General Manager, Transportation Services
Wards:	All
Reference Number:	P:\2015\Cluster B\TRA\Scarborough District\pwXXXX.docx

SUMMARY

The purpose of this report is to advise on the results of the Requests for Quotation (RFQ) 6032-15-0070, 6032-15-0071, 6032-15-0072, 6032-15-0073, 6032-15-0074, 6032-15-0075, 6032-15-0076, 6032-15-0077, 6032-15-0078, 6032-15-0079, 6032-15-0080, 6032-15-0081, 6032-15-0082, 6032-15-0083, 6032-15-0084, 6032-15-0085, 6032-15-0086 and 6032-15-0087 for Collector and Local Road Plowing and Driveway Windrow Clearing for the winter seasons from 2015-2016 to 2021-2022 [seven (7) winter seasons], in accordance with specifications as required by Toronto Transportation Services and service levels as approved by City Council, and to request authority to award the contracts to the recommended bidders.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The General Manager of Transportation Services and the Director of Purchasing and Materials Management Division recommend that:

1. City Council grant authority to award RFQ 6032-15-0070 for Collector and Local Road Plowing and Driveway Windrow Clearing, West – North West area within North York District, for the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, 2017-2018, 2018-2019, 2019-2020, 2020-2021, and 2021-2022 winter seasons to 1269690 Ontario Ltd. O/A Coons Contracting, being the lowest bidder meeting specifications, for a grand total price of \$6,982,641.77 net of HST recoveries, including an estimate of the annual cost adjustments using 3% per year after year 1;
2. City Council grant authority to award RFQ 6032-15-0071 for Collector and Local Road Plowing and Driveway Windrow Clearing, West – South End area within North York District, for the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, 2017-2018, 2018-2019, 2019-2020, 2020-2021, and 2021-2022 winter seasons to Miller Paving Limited being the lowest bidder meeting specifications, for a grand total price for the seven winter seasons of \$9,022,436.67 net of HST recoveries including an estimate of the annual cost adjustments using 3% per year after year 1;
3. City Council grant authority to award RFQ 6032-15-0072 for Collector and Local Road Plowing and Driveway Windrow Clearing, West – North East area within North York District, for the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, 2017-2018, 2018-2019, 2019-2020, 2020-2021, and 2021-2022 winter seasons, to 1269690 Ontario Ltd. O/A Coons Contracting, being the lowest bidder meeting specifications, for a grand total price for the seven winter seasons of \$8,689,646.99 net of HST recoveries, including an estimate of the annual cost adjustments using 3% per year after year 1;
4. City Council grant authority to award RFQ 6032-15-0073 for Collector and Local Road Plowing and Driveway Windrow Clearing, East – North West area within North York District, for the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, 2017-2018, 2018-2019, 2019-2020, 2020-2021, and 2021-2022 winter seasons, to Defina Haulage Limited, being the lowest bidder meeting specifications for a grand total price for the seven winter seasons of \$7,507,210.16 net of HST recoveries, including an estimate of the annual cost adjustments using 3% per year after year 1;
5. City Council grant authority to award RFQ 6032-15-0074 for Collector and Local Road Plowing and Driveway Windrow Clearing, East – North East area within North York District, for the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, 2017-2018, 2018-2019, 2019-2020, 2020-2021, and 2021-2022 winter seasons, to Defina Haulage Limited, being the lowest bidder meeting specifications, for a grand total price for the seven winter seasons of \$6,579,695.53 net of HST recoveries, including an estimate of the annual cost adjustments using 3% per year after year 1;

6. City Council grant authority to award RFQ 6032-15-0075 for Collector and Local Road Plowing and Driveway Windrow Clearing, East – South West area within North York District, for the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, 2017-2018, 2018-2019, 2019-2020, 2020-2021, and 2021-2022 winter seasons, to Pave-Tar Construction Limited, being the lowest bidder meeting specifications, for a grand total price for the seven winter seasons of \$8,883,956.24 net of HST recoveries, including an estimate of the annual cost adjustments using 3% per year after year 1;
7. City Council grant authority to award RFQ 6032-15-0076 for Collector and Local Road Plowing and Driveway Windrow Clearing, East – South East area within North York District, for the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, 2017-2018, 2018-2019, 2019-2020, 2020-2021, and 2021-2022 winter seasons, to Pave-Tar Construction Limited, being the lowest bidder meeting specifications for a grand total price for the seven winter seasons of \$7,482,091.40 net of HST recoveries, including an estimate of the annual cost adjustments using 3% per year after year 1;
8. City Council grant authority to award RFQ 6032-15-0077 for Collector and Local Road Plowing and Driveway Windrow Clearing, Northwest Quadrant within Scarborough District, the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, 2017-2018, 2018-2019, 2019-2020, 2020-2021, and 2021-2022 winter seasons, to Westridge Farm Equipment Inc., being the lowest bidder meeting specifications for a grand total price for the seven winter seasons of \$9,498,541.12 net of HST recoveries, including an estimate of the annual cost adjustments using 3% per year after year 1;
9. City Council grant authority to award RFQ 6032-15-0078 for Collector and Local Road Plowing and Driveway Windrow Clearing, Southwest Quadrant within Scarborough District, for the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, 2017-2018, 2018-2019, 2019-2020, 2020-2021, and 2021-2022 winter seasons, to Defina Haulage Limited, being the lowest bidder meeting specifications for a grand total price for the seven winter seasons of \$10,234,326.01 net of HST recoveries, including an estimate of the annual cost adjustments using 3% per year after year 1;
10. City Council grant authority to award RFQ 6032-15-0079 for Collector and Local Road Plowing and Driveway Windrow Clearing, Northeast Quadrant within Scarborough District, for the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, 2017-2018, 2018-2019, 2019-2020, 2020-2021, and 2021-2022 winter seasons, to 487550 Ontario Inc., being the lowest bidder meeting specifications for a grand total price for the seven winter seasons of \$7,186,801.07 net of HST recoveries, including an estimate of the annual cost adjustments using 3% per year after year 1;
11. City Council grant authority to award RFQ 6032-15-0080 for Collector and Local Road Plowing and Driveway Windrow Clearing, Southeast Quadrant within Scarborough District, for the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, 2017-2018, 2018-2019, 2019-2020, 2020-2021, and 2021-2022 winter seasons, to 487550 Ontario Inc. , being the lowest bidder meeting specifications for a grand total price for the seven winter seasons of

\$10,091,972.65 net of HST recoveries, including an estimate of the annual cost adjustments using 3% per year after year 1;

12. City Council grant authority to award RFQ 6032-15-0081 for Collector and Local Road Plowing and Driveway Windrow Clearing, South West area within Etobicoke - York District, for the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, 2017-2018, 2018-2019, 2019-2020, 2020-2021, and 2021-2022 winter seasons, to Pave-Tar Construction Limited, being the lowest bidder meeting specifications for a grand total price for the seven winter seasons of \$8,367,539.64 net of HST recoveries, including an estimate of the annual cost adjustments using 3% per year after year 1;
13. City Council grant authority to award RFQ 6032-15-0082 for Collector and Local Road Plowing and Driveway Windrow Clearing, East Central area within Etobicoke - York District, for the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, 2017-2018, 2018-2019, 2019-2020, 2020-2021, and 2021-2022 winter seasons, to Ashland Paving Limited, being the lowest bidder meeting specifications for a grand total price for the seven winter seasons of \$10,451,958.61 net of HST recoveries, including an estimate of the annual cost adjustments using 3% per year after year 1;
14. City Council grant authority to award RFQ 6032-15-0083 for Collector and Local Road Plowing and Driveway Windrow Clearing, West Central area within Etobicoke - York District, for the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, 2017-2018, 2018-2019, 2019-2020, 2020-2021, and 2021-2022 winter seasons, to VBN Paving Limited, being the lowest bidder meeting specifications for a grand total price for the seven winter seasons of \$10,312,121.45 net of HST recoveries, including an estimate of the annual cost adjustments using 3% per year after year 1;
15. City Council grant authority to award RFQ 6032-15-0084 for Collector and Local Road Plowing and Driveway Windrow Clearing, North West area within Etobicoke - York District, for the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, 2017-2018, 2018-2019, 2019-2020, 2020-2021, and 2021-2022 winter seasons, to Pave-Tar Construction Limited, being the lowest bidder meeting specifications for a grand total price for the seven winter seasons of \$14,981,344.71 net of HST recoveries, including an estimate of the annual cost adjustments using 3% per year after year 1;
16. City Council grant authority to award RFQ 6032-15-0085 for Collector and Local Road Plowing and Driveway Windrow Clearing, North East area within Etobicoke - York District, for the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, 2017-2018, 2018-2019, 2019-2020, 2020-2021, and 2021-2022 winter seasons, to Pave-Tar Construction Limited, being the lowest bidder meeting specifications for a grand total price for the seven winter seasons of \$11,867,889.82 net of HST recoveries, including an estimate of the annual cost adjustments using 3% per year after year 1;
17. City Council grant authority to award RFQ 6032-15-0086 for Collector and Local Road Plowing and Driveway Windrow Clearing, Area 1 within Toronto and East York District, for the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, 2017-2018, 2018-2019, 2019-2020, 2020-2021,

and 2021-2022 winter seasons, to K.J. Beamish Construction Co. Limited, being the lowest bidder meeting specifications for a grand total price for the seven winter seasons of \$10,879,407.78 net of HST recoveries, including an estimate of the annual cost adjustments using 3% per year after year 1; and,

18. City Council grant authority to award RFQ 6032-15-0087 for Collector and Local Road Plowing and Driveway Windrow Clearing, Area 2 within Toronto and East York District, for the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, 2017-2018, 2018-2019, 2019-2020, 2020-2021, and 2021-2022 winter seasons, to Pave-Tar Construction Limited, being the lowest bidder meeting specifications for a grand total price for the seven winter seasons of \$10,147,473.21 net of HST recoveries, including an estimate of the annual cost adjustments using 3% per year after year 1.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

The total cost to the City of Toronto for all eighteen (18) contract awards for the seven (7) winter seasons (2015-2016 to 2021-2022) is \$169,167,054.82 net of HST recoveries, \$187,852,566.77 including all taxes and charges and \$166,241,209.53 net of all applicable taxes and charges, including an estimate of the annual cost adjustments using 3% per year after Year 1.

The annual cost estimate of 3% growth is consistent with the increase in winter maintenance contract prices over the last 7 years. Funding in the amount of \$5,612,152.06 for the period of December 1 to December 31, 2015 is required, of which \$1,356,000 is a budgeted contingency resulting in a net requirement of \$4,256,152.06. In the case of a mild winter, one plowing activity from the contract could be omitted, resulting in a \$1,000,000 cost saving and therefore reduce the actual requirement to \$3,256,152.06.

Included in the 2015 Approved Operating Budget for the Transportation Services Winter Maintenance Program is \$1,934,790.50 resulting in a shortfall of \$1,321,361.56. The shortfall could be funded from the Winter Maintenance Contribution Reserve Fund XR1411 (\$879,611.63) and the remaining (\$441,749.93) could be accommodated through savings within the 2015 Approved Operating Budget for Transportation Services. In the case where the plowing activity could not be reduced, the \$1,000,000 budget pressure for the additional plowing activity would be accommodated from within the 2015 Approved Operating Budget for Transportation Services.

The remaining first winter's (2015-2016 season) funding need (\$16,474,381.84) between January 1 and March 31, 2016, along with the first part of the second winter's adjusted cost, will be included in the 2016 Operating Budget Submission. The budget for the first winter season requirement is \$22,077,375.50 net of HST recoveries. The following funding details include the contract cost increase which is not part of the 2015 Approved Operating Budget for Transportation Services.

Operating Budget Funding Details – First Winter Season 2015/2016					
RFQ #	District	Operating Account	Dec. 1, 2015-Dec. 31, 2015 (Net of HST recoveries)	Jan 1, 2016- Mar. 31, 2016 (Net of HST recoveries)	Total (Net of HST recoveries)
6032-15-0070	North York	TP0189	\$231,554.53	\$679,724.59	\$911,279.12
6032-15-0071	North York	TP0189	\$299,198.64	\$878,292.78	\$1,177,485.31
6032-15-0072	North York	TP0189	\$288,161.30	\$845,892.85	\$1,134,054.14
6032-15-0073	North York	TP0189	\$248,949.98	\$730,788.65	\$979,738.62
6032-15-0074	North York	TP0189	\$218,192.25	\$640,499.82	\$858,692.07
6032-15-0075	North York	TP0189	\$294,604.88	\$864,807.86	\$1,159,412.74
6032-15-0076	North York	TP0189	\$247,858.43	\$727,584.43	\$976,460.47
		Sub-total	\$1,828,518.45	\$5,367,586.42	\$7,072,643.94
6032-15-0077	Scarborough	TP0216	\$314,985.40	\$924,634.57	\$1,239,619.97
6032-15-0078	Scarborough	TP0216	\$339,385.10	\$996,259.48	\$1,335,644.57
6032-15-0079	Scarborough	TP0216	\$238,324.75	\$699,598.45	\$937,923.20
6032-15-0080	Scarborough	TP0216	\$334,664.45	\$982,402.10	\$1,317,066.55
		Sub-total	\$1,227,359.70	\$3,602,894.60	\$4,830,254.29
6032-15-0081	Etobicoke York	TP0161	\$277,497.75	\$814,537.34	\$1,092,017.09
6032-15-0082	Etobicoke York	TP0161	\$346,602.11	\$1,017,444.90	\$1,364,047.01
6032-15-0083	Etobicoke York	TP0161	\$344,550.61	\$1,011,422.76	\$1,345,797.37
6032-15-0084	Etobicoke York	TP0161	\$496,803.12	\$1,458,357.55	\$1,955,160.67
6032-15-0085	Etobicoke York	TP0161	\$393,556.44	\$1,155,278.59	\$1,548,835.03
		Sub-total	\$1,858,992.03	\$5,457,041.13	\$7,305,857.16
6032-15-0086	Toronto & East York	TP0108	\$360,776.94	\$1,059,054.90	\$1,419,831.84
6032-15-0087	Toronto & East York	TP0108	\$336,504.93	\$987,804.80	\$1,324,309.73
		Sub-total	\$697,281.87	\$2,046,859.69	\$2,744,141.57
Total – 1st Winter Season			\$5,612,152.06	\$16,474,381.84	\$22,077,375.50

Estimated Costs – Years 2-7

Year	Estimated Costs (net of HST recoveries)
2016/17	\$22,739,696.77
2017/18	\$23,421,887.67
2018/19	\$24,124,544.30
2019/20	\$24,848,280.63
2020/21	\$25,593,729.05
2021/22	\$26,361,540.92

Total Estimated Costs – Years 1-7 (2015-2016 season to 2021-2022 season)

Years	Estimated Costs (net of HST recoveries)
2015-2016 to 2021-2022	\$169,167,054.82

Future funding will be requested in subsequent annual Transportation Services Operating Budget Submissions for the required portions of the contract period.

The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

DECISION HISTORY

Council at its meeting held on December 16, 2013 adopted motions that confirmed the levels of service for roadway de-icing, snow plowing, driveway windrow opening and snow removal that would serve as the basis for the 2015 – 2022 winter maintenance contracts and enabling the General Manager, Transportation Services to issue Requests for Quotations for Winter Maintenance Services for seven (7) year terms covering the period November 2015 to April 2022. Refer to Motions 1, 2, 3 & 4 of Item PW27.15 of the following decision document link at <http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2013.PW27.15>

ISSUE BACKGROUND

All eighteen (18) Requests for Quotation (RFQs) for Collector and Local Road Plowing and Driveway Windrow Clearing were issued by the Purchasing and Materials Management Division on February 24, 2015 on the City’s Internet Website. A number of addenda were issued for each RFQ. The closing date for all of the RFQs was held on March 11, 2015.

The RFQs were designed so that each bidder could bid on one (1) or all eighteen (18) of the RFQs. The RFQs all set out that the public opening process would be done by a lottery. The lottery process randomizes which RFQ would be opened first and provides bidders the opportunity to withdraw from a particular RFQ if they have submitted bids to multiple RFQs. This system is designed to prevent a bidder from being awarded too many contracts and being unable to meet the requirements of all the contracts won. The order that the RFQs were opened was 6032-15-0070, 6032-15-0081, 6032-15-0074, 6032-15-0075, 6032-15-0084, 6032-15-0078, 6032-15-0073, 6032-15-0076, 6032-15-0079, 6032-15-0077, 6032-15-0071, 6032-15-0083, 6032-15-0087, 6032-15-0086, 6032-15-0072, 6032-15-0085, 6032-15-0082 and 6032-15-0080,

The following is the summary of bids received for Request for Quotation 6032-15-0070 West – North West area, within North York District:

Bidder	Winter 2015/2016 (net of all applicable taxes and charges)
1269690 Ontario Ltd. O/A Coons Contracting	\$895,518.00
Defina Haulage Limited	\$907,490.08
Pave-Tar Construction Limited	\$909,834.00
VBN Paving Limited	\$942,862.00
CoCo Paving Inc.	\$946,016.00
Maple-Crete Inc.	\$957,030.00
Ashland Paving Ltd.	\$1,006,500.00
Todd Brothers	\$1,012,184.36
Miller Paving Ltd.	\$1,027,650.00
Rafat General Contractor	\$1,161,580.00
Ferpac Paving Inc.	\$1,331,950.00

The following is the summary of bids received for Request for Quotation 6032-15-0071 West – South End area within North York District:

Bidder	Winter 2015/2016 (net of all applicable taxes and charges)
Miller Paving Limited	\$1,157,120.00
VBN Paving Limited	\$1,158,028.00
CoCo Paving Inc.	\$1,160,942.00
Todd Brothers Contracting Ltd.	\$1,192,766.20
Maple-Crete Inc.	\$1,201,656.00
Ashland Paving Limited	\$1,214,110.00
Caranci Brothers Inc.	\$1,278,952.00
Rafat General Contractor	\$1,426,970.00
Westridge Farm Equipment Inc.	\$1,781,100.00

The following is the summary of bids received for Request for Quotation 6032-15-0072 West – North East area, within North York District:

Bidder	Winter 2015/2016 (net of all applicable taxes and charges)
1269690 Ontario Ltd. O/A Coons Contracting	\$1,114,440.00
CoCo Paving Inc.	\$1,244,758.00
VBN Paving Limited	\$1,261,727.00
Todd Brothers Contracting Ltd.	\$1,281,429.00
Maple-Crete Inc.	\$1,308,174.00
Ashland Paving Ltd.	\$1,328,540.00
Miller Paving Limited	\$1,368,800.00
Rafat General Contractor	\$1,962,830.00
Westridge Farm Equipment Inc.	\$1,924,550.00

The following is the summary of bids received for Request for Quotation 6302-15-0073 East – North East area, within North York District:

Bidder	Winter 2015/2016 (net of all applicable taxes and charges)
Defina Haulage Limited	\$962,793.46
Miller Paving Limited	\$1,044,190.00
VBN Paving Limited	\$1,080,904.00
Maple-Crete Inc.	\$1,109,786.00
Todd Brothers Contracting Ltd.	\$1,121,510.30
CoCo Paving Inc.	\$1,123,642.00
Ashland Paving Ltd.	\$1,148,040.00
Pave-Tar Construction Limited	\$1,281,730.00
Rafat General Contractor	\$1,581,700.00
Westridge Farm Equipment Inc.	\$1,204,276.00

The following is the summary of bids received for Request for Quotation 6302-15-0074 East – North West area, within North York District:

Bidder	Winter 2015/2016 (net of all applicable taxes and charges)
Defina Haulage Limited	\$843,840.48
Miller Paving Limited	\$888,470.00
VBN Paving Limited	\$899,959.00
Maple-Crete Inc.	\$911,642.00
CoCo Paving Inc.	\$936,202.00
Todd Brothers Contracting Ltd.	\$965,709.10
Ashland Paving Ltd.	\$973,570.00
Westridge Farm Equipment Inc.	\$1,028,142.00
Pave-Tar Construction Limited	\$1,059,438.00
Rafat General Contractor	\$1,357,550.00

The following is the summary of bids received for Request for Quotation 6032-15-0075 East – South West area, within North York District:

Bidder	Winter 2015/2016 (net of all applicable taxes and charges)
Pave-Tar Construction Limited	\$1,139,360.00
Defina Haulage Limited	\$1,165,650.32
Miller Paving Limited	\$1,177,130.00
VBN Paving Limited	\$1,217,340.00
CoCo Paving Inc.	\$1,217,552.00
Todd Brothers Contracting Ltd.	\$1,247,942.50
Maple-Crete Inc.	\$1,249,921.00
Ashland Paving Ltd.	\$1,306,640.00
Westridge Farm Equipment Inc.	\$1,399,846.00

The following is the summary of bids received for Request for Quotation 6032-15-0076 East – South East area, within North York District:

Bidder	Winter 2015/2016 (net of all applicable taxes and charges)
Pave-Tar Construction Limited	\$959,572.00
Miller Paving Limited	\$984,240.00
VBN Paving Limited	\$990,401.00
Maple-Crete Inc.	\$995,864.40
CoCo Paving Inc.	\$1,024,048.00
Todd Brothers Contracting Ltd.	\$1,052,900.00
Ashland Paving Ltd.	\$1,078,600.00
Westridge Farm Equipment Inc.	\$1,112,372.00

The following is the summary of bids received for Request for Quotation 6302-15-0077 Northwest Quadrant, within Scarborough District:

Bidder	Winter 2015/2016 (net of all applicable taxes and charges)
Westridge Farm Equipment Inc.	\$1,218,180.00
Todd Brothers Contracting Ltd.	\$1,316,267.50
Ashland Paving Ltd.	\$1,373,730.00
Caranci Brothers Inc.	\$1,414,492.00
IPURC Investments Inc	\$1,535,790.00
VBN Paving Limited	\$1,636,921.00
CoCo Paving Inc.	\$1,743,720.00

The following is the summary of bids received for Request for Quotation 6302-15-0078 Southwest Quadrant, within Scarborough District:

Bidder	Winter 2015/2016 (net of all applicable taxes and charges)
Defina Haulage Limited	\$1,312,543.80
Westridge Farm Equipment Inc.	\$1,457,436.00
Pave-Tar Construction Limited	\$1,474,770.00
Todd Brothers Contracting Ltd.	\$1,518,995.00
Maple-Crete Inc.	\$1,525,281.00
Ashland Paving Ltd.	\$1,529,160.00
Miller Paving Limited	\$1,557,800.00
IPURC Investments Inc	\$1,809,790.00
VBN Paving Limited	\$1,901,978.00
CoCo Paving Inc.	\$2,004,480.00

The following is the summary of bids received for Request for Quotation 6302-15-0079 Northeast Quadrant, within Scarborough District:

Bidder	Winter 2015/2016 (net of all applicable taxes and charges)
487550 Ontario Inc.	\$921,701.26
Maple-Crete Inc.	\$1,144,097.00
Todd Brothers Contracting Ltd.	\$1,186,166.00
Ashland Paving Ltd.	\$1,203,330.00
Westridge Farm Equipment Inc.	\$1,295,928.00
VBN Paving Limited	\$1,398,449.00
CoCo Paving Inc.	\$1,487,380.00

The following is the summary of bids received for Request for Quotation 6302-15-0080 Southeast Quadrant, within Scarborough District:

Bidder	Winter 2015/2016 (net of all applicable taxes and charges)
487550 Ontario Inc.	\$1,294,287.10
Westridge Farm Equipment Inc.	\$1,592,064.02
Todd Brothers Contracting Ltd.	\$1,637,196.00
Maple-Crete Inc.	\$1,637,673.00
Ashland Paving Ltd.	\$1,680,370.00
VBN Paving Limited	\$2,064,455.00
CoCo Paving Inc.	\$2,198,020.00

The following is the summary of bids received for Request for Quotation 6302-15-0081 South West area, within Etobicoke - York District:

Bidder	Winter 2015/2016 (net of all applicable taxes and charges)
Pave-Tar Construction Limited	\$1,073,130.00
CoCo Paving Inc.	\$1,077,429.00
Ashland Paving Ltd.	\$1,102,440.00
VBN Paving Limited	\$1,113,561.00
Maple-Crete Inc.	\$1,180,673.00
Todd Brothers Contracting Ltd.	\$1,206,822.00
Caranci Brothers Inc.	\$1,352,984.00
Gazzola Paving Ltd.	\$1,395,050.00
Miller Paving Limited	\$1,461,435.00

The following is the summary of bids received for Request for Quotation 6302-15-0082 East Central area, within Etobicoke - York District:

Bidder	Winter 2015/2016 (net of all applicable taxes and charges)
Ashland Paving Ltd.	\$1,340,455.00
CoCo Paving Inc.	\$1,347,264.00
Todd Brothers Contracting Ltd.	\$1,371,370.00
Maple-Crete Inc.	\$1,392,317.00
Lawlor Haulage Ltd.	\$1,458,851.96
Caranci Brothers Inc.	\$1,485,220.00
Gazzola Paving Ltd.	\$1,744,070.00
Miller Paving Limited	\$1,824,750.00

The following is the summary of bids received for Request for Quotation 6302-15-0083 West Central area, within Etobicoke - York District:

Bidder	Winter 2015/2016 (net of all applicable taxes and charges)
VBN Paving Limited	\$1,332,521.00
Pave-Tar Construction Limited	\$1,433,621.00
Maple-Crete Inc.	\$1,665,833.00
Ashland Paving Ltd.	\$1,640,985.00
CoCo Paving Inc.	\$1,673,174.00
Todd Brothers Contracting Ltd.	\$1,677,377.00
Miller Paving Limited	\$2,313,205.00
Gazzola Paving Ltd.	\$2,364,425.00

The following is the summary of bids received for Request for Quotation 6302-15-0084 North West area, within Etobicoke - York District:

Bidder	Winter 2015/2016 (net of all applicable taxes and charges)
Pave-Tar Construction Limited	\$1,921,345.00
Defina Haulage Limited	\$1,926,669.52
VBN Paving Limited	\$1,968,804.00
Todd Brothers Contracting Ltd.	\$2,009,779.60
CoCo Paving Inc.	\$2,114,784.00
Ashland Paving Ltd.	\$2,183,145.00
Maple-Crete Inc.	\$2,231,871.00
Gazzola Paving Ltd.	\$3,537,425.00
Miller Paving Limited	\$3,194,855.00

The following is the summary of bids received for Request for Quotation 6302-15-0085 North East area, within Etobicoke - York District:

Bidder	Winter 2015/2016 (net of all applicable taxes and charges)
Pave-Tar Construction Limited	\$1,522,047.00
Todd Brothers Contracting Ltd.	\$1,661,476.90
Maple-Crete Inc.	\$1,741,849.00
Ashland Paving Ltd.	\$1,751,320.00
CoCo Paving Inc.	\$1,773,894.00
Miller Paving Limited	\$2,467,005.00
Gazzola Paving Ltd.	\$2,724,175.00

The following is the summary of bids received for Request for Quotation 6302-15-0086 Area 1, within Toronto and East York District:

Bidder	Winter 2015/2016 (net of all applicable taxes and charges)
K.J. Beamish Construction Co. Limited	\$1,395,275.00
Ashland Paving Ltd.	\$1,522,500.00
Gazzola Paving Ltd.	\$1,554,676.00
Caranci Brothers Inc.	\$1,721,850.00
Maple-Crete Inc.	\$1,762,836.00
Lawlor Haulage Ltd.	\$1,784,132.88
Todd Brothers Contracting Ltd.	\$1,849,296.80
CoCo Paving Limited	\$2,119,950.00
VBN Paving Limited	\$1,983,628.00

The following is the summary of bids received for Request for Quotation 6302-15-0087 Area 2, within Toronto and East York District:

Bidder	Winter 2015/2016 (net of all applicable taxes and charges)
Pave-Tar Construction Limited	\$1,301,405.00
Gazzola Paving Ltd.	\$1,439,975.00
Ashland Paving Ltd.	\$1,485,850.00
Caranci Brothers Inc.	\$1,487,050.00
K.J. Beamish Construction Co. Limited	\$1,554,768.00
Maple-Crete Inc.	\$1,702,626.00
Lawlor Haulage Ltd.	\$1,726,170.90
Todd Brothers Contracting Ltd.	\$1,811,220.00
VBN Paving Limited	\$1,923,333.00
CoCo Paving Limited	\$2,046,475.00

COMMENTS

The Quotation documentation submitted by the recommended bidders have been reviewed by staff of Transportation Services and were found to be in conformance with the Request for Quotation requirements. Transportation Services staff have compared the low bid for each depot to the estimated cost and found the prices of the recommended bidders to be reasonable and within the budget available.

The Fair Wage Office has reported that the recommended firms have indicated it has reviewed and understands the Fair Wage Policy and Labour Trades requirements and has agreed to comply fully.

CONTACTS

Brian Provo
Acting Manager, Road Operations
Transportation Services,
Toronto and East York District
Tel: 416-392-0285
e-mail: bprovo@toronto.ca

E. Caruso
Manager, Goods & Services
Purchasing and Materials Management
Tel: 416-392-7316
e-mail: ecaruso@toronto.ca

T. Tenn
Manager, Road Operations
Transportation Services,
Scarborough District
Tel: 416-396-4823
e-mail: ttenn@toronto.ca

R. Helary
Manager, Road Operations
Transportation Services,
Etobicoke York District
Tel: 416-394-8345
e-mail: rhela@toronto.ca

H. Moreno
Manager, Road Operations
Transportation Services, North York District
Tel: 416-395-6270
e-mail hmoreno@toronto.ca

SIGNATURES

Michael Pacholok
Director
Purchasing and Materials Management

Stephen Buckley
General Manager
Transportation Services

ATTACHMENT

Appendix A – Adjusting Index

APPENDIX “A” - ANNUAL ADJUSTMENT OF COST

The unit bid prices will be adjusted annually as shown in the following example using the CPI as issued for the month of July.

The unit bid prices stated in the Vendor's Quotation will apply during the first Operating Year of the Term.

In the second and subsequent Operating Years, the unit bid prices will be the costs applicable in the previous Operating Year multiplied by [1 + CPI/100].

The unit bid price will be adjusted for the second Operating Year and, if the Term is extended, for the subsequent Operating Years to reflect 100% of the percentage change in the All Item Index of Consumer Price Index (CPI) for Toronto, or the replacement Index, on a year-to-year basis.

In the second and subsequent Operating Years, the unit bid price will be the cost applicable in the previous Operating Year multiplied by [1 + CPI/100].

where:

$$\Delta \text{ CPI} = \left(\frac{\text{CPI Current Operating Year} - \text{CPI Previous Operating Year}}{\text{CPI Previous Operating Year}} \right) \times 100\%$$

and:

CPI Current Operating Year = Monthly Consumer Price Index (All Items) - Toronto for the month containing the beginning of the second and subsequent Operating Years.

CPI Previous Operating Year = Monthly Consumers Price Index (All Items) - Toronto for the month containing the beginning of the previous Operating Year.

Note:

The Annual Adjustment of Cost formula outlined above has replaced the Adjusting Index formula used in the previous snow removal contracts so as to be more transparent and accurately reflect market increases.

The Adjusting Index formula had been developed by the former Metro Transportation and was in place for several previous snow removal contracts. It was unique in the industry and employed only by the City of Toronto.

The Annual Adjustment of Cost increased 14.9% over the last 7 year contract (2007/2008 to 2014/2015) – An average of 3% per year.

It is estimated that the increase in the Adjusting Index for this contract will remain consistent at an average of 3% per year.