Car-Share Parking in Permit Parking Areas

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date:</th>
<th>October 22, 2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To:</td>
<td>Public Works and Infrastructure Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From:</td>
<td>General Manager, Transportation Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wards:</td>
<td>All Wards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reference Number:</td>
<td>p:/2015/ClusterB/TRA/NorthYork/pw15086</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**SUMMARY**

Transportation Services is responding to a request from the Public Works and Infrastructure Committee regarding the feasibility of creating a pilot project to allow car-share vehicles to park in certain residential on-street permit parking areas throughout the city where on-street parking exists.

Transportation Services currently administers a program for designating on-street spaces specifically for vehicles displaying a car-share vehicle permit. This program was initiated as a pilot project in 2009 and confirmed in 2012 as an ongoing program. There are currently 66 car-share vehicle parking spaces designated on City streets, with permits held by three different car-share companies.

Transportation Services has concluded that our current program for designating car-share vehicle parking areas allows the City to control the number of car-share vehicles parking in a specific area and limits the potentially significant impact on the amount of parking available to residents. Allowing car-share vehicles to park anywhere in residential on-street parking areas would have negative impacts on residential permit parking supply, particularly in areas that are at capacity. The availability of temporary parking permits would also be negatively affected.

**RECOMMENDATIONS**

The General Manager, Transportation Services recommends that:

1. The Public Works and Infrastructure Committee receive this report for information.
Financial Impact

There is no financial impact resulting from adopting the recommendation in this report.

The Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

DECISION HISTORY

Public Works and Infrastructure Committee at its meeting of June 18, 2014, considered a communication, "Pilot Project Investigating On-street Parking for Car Share Vehicles" (Item PW32.25).

In considering this communication Public Works and Infrastructure Committee adopted the following item:

"1. Requested the General Manager, Transportation Services, in consultation with impacted Councillors and industry members, to report to the Public Works and Infrastructure Committee in the first quarter of 2015 on the feasibility of creating a pilot project that tests allowing car share vehicles to park in on-street permit parking areas where on-street parking capacity exists, and that the report include a review of the current Car-Share Vehicle Parking Area Program."


Toronto and East York Community Council, at its meeting of September 15th, 2009 established a pilot program for designating on-street spaces specifically for vehicles displaying a car-share vehicle permit.

http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2009.TE27.84

City Council at its meeting of April 10 and 11, 2012 adopted an expansion of the pilot program to allow car-share parking within the city. This expansion established specified installation criteria, established a tiered parking permit structure, and introduced new fees.


ISSUE BACKGROUND

Car-Share Vehicle Parking Program

Transportation Services currently administers a program for designating on-street spaces specifically for vehicles displaying a car-share vehicle permit. The installation criteria established by this program prohibits the installation of a car-share vehicle parking area when it is located in a low-density residential zone (in front of a single family dwelling),
where there is a wait list for residential permit parking, in an area where traffic operations
would be compromised, and where it may not be supported by the Ward Councillor.

The program expansion established an annual permit fee with a three-tiered structure,
based on the impact a car-share vehicle parking area would have on the existing parking
supply.

1. Tier 1: The car-share vehicle parking area will not impact on, or cause a
reduction in, the number of residential permit parking spaces or parking
machines/parking metres on the street.

2. Tier 2: The car-share vehicle parking area will eliminate or cause a reduction
in the number of parking spaces in a designated residential permit parking
area.

3. Tier 3: The car-share vehicle parking area will eliminate an existing parking
space in an area where parking is controlled by a parking machine or parking
meter.

Tier 1 would incur the lowest permit fee, while Tier 3 would be the highest.

Car-share companies have different operational models and supplementary permits were
created to accommodate the needs of any company requiring the flexibility to allow
multiple vehicles to use their car-share vehicle parking area.

There are currently 31 car-share vehicle parking areas (CVPAs), which total 66
designated parking spaces on city streets, with permits held by three different car-share
companies (AutoShare, Car2Go and Zipcar). The majority of these CVPAs are located in
the downtown area (Bloor Street to Lake Shore Boulevard and Dufferin Street to Jarvis
Street). The program expansion allows for a maximum of 40 additional designated car-
share parking spaces to be added per year. To date this maximum number has not been
reached.

Since the expansion of this program, a total of five CVPAs have been rescinded and
relocated, at the request of the area councillors.

Transportation Services has also received complaints from car-share companies
pertaining to the occasional loss of their designated parking spaces as a result of
road/sidewalk reconstruction, street event permits, film permits and illegal parking by
other vehicles.

In response to car-share company concerns, Transportation Services is working with
various city staff to ensure these car-share companies are provided with sufficient notice
when designated CVPAs will be impacted by city issued permits or construction projects.
Transportation Services is also working with the Toronto Police Service, Parking
Enforcement Unit, to ensure there is increased enforcement of CVPAs to help reduce the number of illegal (non car-share vehicles) parking within CVPAs.

**Residential On-Street Permit Parking**

The permit parking program entitles permit holding residents to park their vehicle on the street within a specified area during permit parking hours. This program generally services those residential areas where driveways and/or garages are not available.

Currently, the program is in effect in the communities of the former cities of Toronto, East York, and York and to a limited extent in Etobicoke.

Permit parking is implemented on either a street name basis where parking is restricted to one specific street or on an area basis where a number of streets have been grouped into permit areas in order to maximize the available parking.

Certain streets and areas are wait-listed if there are no available parking spaces.

At the present time, there are currently 98 permit parking areas, and 428 streets with permit parking on a street-name basis only. Although the availability of permit parking in these areas and streets can vary depending on demand, there are currently 13 areas and 38 streets that are wait-listed due to lack of available spaces. The attached map (Appendix 1) shows the permit parking areas in the downtown core that are currently wait-listed, over 90 per cent capacity, or at 80-90 per cent capacity.

Also, temporary parking permits may be obtained to provide 24-hour, 48-hour and weekly on-street parking within the limits of a permit parking area or street provided space is available. This is a popular program that addresses the needs of residents with visitors, short-term parking needs, tradespersons, contractors, etc. However, to ensure that spaces are available for residential parking permit holders, once permits have been issued for 90 per cent of the available parking spaces within an area or on a street, no temporary parking permits can be issued for that area or street.

**COMMENTS**

**Car-share Parking in Residential Permit Parking Areas**

Transportation Services has considered the proposal to allow car-share vehicles to park within residential permit parking areas, either as a pilot project in a specific area or as a City-wide program.

Car-share vehicles currently must display a Car-Share Vehicle Parking permit when occupying a designated on-street car-share vehicle parking space. These permits apply to any space designated to a particular company, and supplementary permits are issued to companies to allow different vehicles to use the same space. It would be possible to amend the municipal code to exempt any vehicle displaying a Car-Share Vehicle Parking permit from the regulations that restrict parking to vehicles displaying a residential parking permit.

We have explored options for allowing car-share vehicles to park in residential on-street permit parking areas only when parking capacity exists. The available parking within a
particular area, or on a specific street, can vary almost daily, depending on both the purchase of residential parking permits and temporary overnight parking permits. Ideally, real-time information could be made available from our permit parking system on what areas or streets have excess capacity. The number of car-share vehicles allowed in the area would then be limited to the excess spaces available. The system does not currently have this capability, nor is it likely to in the near future.

Alternatively, using historical data on the purchase of residential parking permits, we could identify specific permit parking areas that generally always have excess parking available. We would also want to ensure that these specific areas also never reach their capacity with temporary parking permits. The exemption for car-share vehicles would then apply only to those specific areas, and the car-share vehicle parking permit would need to be modified to allow for enforcement. Also, the available inventory of parking spaces within the specific areas identified would need to be reduced to account for the spaces taken by car-share vehicles. Given this impact, we would recommend that the Ward Councillor be consulted prior to identifying a specific permit parking area or street where car-share vehicles would be allowed to park.

Currently, a car-share vehicle parking permit is associated with a designated space on-street. The fee for that permit, as noted earlier, is based on a 3-tier structure based on impact of that space on existing parking. A Tier 2 permit, in a residential permit parking area is currently set at $1,349.64 per year. Supplementary permits for additional car-share vehicles that may use that same space are $52.53 each. It is envisioned that a different car-share vehicle parking permit would need to be introduced which applies to residential permit parking areas. The fee for this permit would need to be set at a level that would compensate the City for any potential loss in revenue from the sale of residential parking permits and temporary overnight parking permits.

The following impacts of the proposal to allow car-share vehicle parking in residential areas should also be considered:

1) **Enforcement**

Limiting car-share vehicle parking to specific permit parking areas with excess parking capacity would mean somehow limiting the number of car-share vehicles allowed in a specific area at a time. The logistics required for the Toronto Police Service to enforce a maximum number of car-share vehicles within an area would be impracticable, particularly with more than one car-share company operating in the City.

2) **Reduction in available parking for residents**

Without designating specific spaces for car-share vehicles within a permit parking area, there would be no way to control the number of car-share vehicles within a specific area, nor where they choose to park. Streets located near subway lines,
shopping districts, or popular venues could experience a high demand for car-share vehicle parking which would then limit the ability for residents to park.

Reduction in the number of available parking spaces is of particular concern for locations in or near residential neighbourhoods in the downtown area of the city. The majority of applications from car-share companies are for streets in these areas which typically have demands for on-street permit parking either approaching, at, or over capacity with waitlists for residents. These neighbourhoods already experience many competing demands for parking on their roadways including legal and illegal daytime non-resident parking, parking by motorists with accessible parking permits, and temporary street occupations for construction, street events or filming.

3) Reduction in availability of temporary parking permits

Temporary parking permits are made available whenever less than 90% of the available parking spaces in an area are sold through residential parking permits or temporary parking permits. The majority of these permits are sold online. The availability of temporary permits is determined on a daily basis as transactions take place. The number of parking spaces available for this programme would also be impacted should car-share vehicles be allowed to park in these areas. Assigning parking spaces in an area to car-share vehicles would reduce the number of available spaces, bringing the area closer to the 90 per cent capacity threshold. There would then be less temporary parking tickets available for visitors, short-term parking needs, tradespersons, contractors, etc.

Continuing with our existing program to designate car-share vehicle parking areas allows for control of the number and location of car-share vehicles parked on streets within a specific area, limits the impact on the availability of parking for residents, and allows the Ward Councillor to obtain input from local residents and businesses prior to designation of the spaces.
CONTACT

Jacqueline White, P. Eng.
Director, Transportation Services
Tel: 416-395-7480
Email: jwhite@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

_______________________________
Stephen M. Buckley
General Manager
Transportation Services

ATTACHMENTS

Appendix 1: Permit Parking Area Maps