

Purchasing & Materials Management Giuliana Carbone, Treasurer

City Hall 18th Floor, West 100 Queen Street West Toronto, Ontario M5H 2N2 Director
Tel: 416-392-7312
Fax: 416 392-1262
mpachol@toronto.ca
www.toronto.ca

Michael Pacholok

May 15, 2015

SENT VIA EMAIL 2 pages

Mr. Emidio Bevilacqua, President Bevcon Construction & Paving Ltd 600C Magnetic Drive North York, ON M3J 2C4

Mr. Marco Drudi Drudi Alexious Kuchar LLP 7050 Weston Road, Suite 610 Vaughan, ON L4L 8G7

RE: Request for Quotations (RFQs) 6032-15-0091 to 6032-15-0105

For Snow Clearing, Sanding and Salting of Sidewalks, Bus Stops, Pedestrian Crosswalks and Signalized Intersections for the City of Toronto

Dear Mr. Bevilacqua and Mr. Drudi,

Thank you for your response on May 14, 2015 to Clarification No 1, sent by the City on May 12, 2015. The City, as it was conducting a final review of the RFQs in preparation for the staff report to award the contracts noted that for RFQ 6032-15-0095, Aquagran Landscaping and Construction Ltd ("Aquagran") had listed Bevcon Construction & Paving Ltd ("Bevcon") as a reference for three of the four references provided. It was also noted that Bevcon and Aquagran shared the same phone number and were located next to each other. The City wrote the clarifications to both Bevcon and Aquagran as part of further due diligence to ensure that the RFQ process was conducted in a fair and transparent manner. In addition to the clarification, the City conducted further due diligence on the references provided by Bevcon in response to all of the above noted RFQs, and in particular RFQ 6032-15-0096 in which Bevcon is noted as the lowest priced bidder.

Based on your information provided and our further due diligence with respect to your references, the City is declaring your quotes for RFQs 6032-15-0091 to 6032-15-0105 as non-compliant for the following reasons:





- 1) Bevcon listed one reference and not the minimum of two references required by section 9.0 which states that Bidders "[m]ust have completed or be in the process of completing a minimum of two (2) similar projects within Canada in the past ten (10) years. At least one (1) of these projects must include contract work with a municipality or provincial agency (such as on Class 1, 2, 3, or 4 roads under the Ontario Minimum Maintenance Standards). Bevcon listed 4 references however each of them refer to the same City contract (the previous contract for snow clearing, RFQ 6032-08-0185). Finally, section 9.0 provides the City sole discretion in determining if the references do not confirm the Bidder's experience, the quotation will be deemed non-compliant.
- 2) the definition of "Conflict of Interest" as set out in the RFQ includes "(iii) engaging in conduct that compromises or could be seen to compromise the integrity of the open and competitive RFQ process and render that process non-compliant and unfair" and further section 10 of Appendix A, requires Bidders to disclose any potential conflict of interest and if such a conflict of interest exists the City may refuse to consider the Quotation. In this case, the related nature of your business with Aquagran, as only confirmed by your lawyer's response to the Clarification after the close of the call, would put you in a potential conflict to act as a reference for another bidder in a competitive procurement process. Finally, section 8 of Appendix A, requires that "No Bidder may discuss or communicate about, directly or indirectly, the preparation or content of its Quotation with any other Bidder or the agent or representative of any other Bidder or prospective Bidder. If the City discovers there has been a breach at any time, the City reserves the right to disqualify the Quotation..." The acknowledged relationship of the Bidders after the call closed (i.e. after Aquacon listed Bevcon for the purpose of an independent reference), also suggests previous communication between Bevcon and Aquagran about the contents of the Quotation.

The City is proceeding to recommend to the Public Works and Infrastructure Committee meeting on May 28, 2015 that RFQ 6032-15-0096 be awarded to the next lowest compliant bidder. If you wish to object to the declaration of non-compliance, please put it in writing and direct it to my office only. I will remind you that the prohibition on communicating with anyone besides my office is in effect (see section 5.0 of the Procurement Processes Policy which can be found at www.toronto.ca/purchasing/policies).

If you wish to depute at the Public Works and Infrastructure Committee meeting, please contact the City Clerk's office at pwic@toronto.ca to register as a deputant once the agenda for the May 28th, 2015 meeting is posted. To see the agenda, please visit:

http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/decisionBodyProfile.do?function=doPrepare&meetingId=10371#Meeting-2015.PW5

You are also entitled to a debriefing to discuss your quotations, if you wish to set that up please contact the buyer assigned to the call, Christine Sze at csze@toronto.ca or by phone at 416-392-6180.

Yours truly,

Michael Pacholok, J.D.

Chief Purchasing Official & Director, Purchasing Materials and Management Division

Cc: Rod Blake, Legal Services

Elena Caruso, Manager, Goods and Services, Purchasing & Materials Management Division Edward Chin, Supervisor, Goods and Services, Purchasing & Materials Management Division