Demolition of a Designated Heritage Property in the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District and Construction of a Replacement Structure – 99 Whitehall Road

Date: April 27, 2015

To: Toronto Preservation Board
    Toronto and East York Community Council

From: Director, Urban Design, City Planning Division

Wards: Ward 27 – Toronto Centre-Rosedale

Reference Number: P:\2015\Cluster B\PLN\TEYCC\TE15050

SUMMARY

This report recommends that City Council approve the demolition of a designated non-contributing heritage property in the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District (NRHCD) under Section 42 of the Ontario Heritage Act and the construction of a replacement structure.

The proposal is to demolish an existing 2-storey brick building and to construct a new 2-storey residence. The existing property has been evaluated as an "unrated" structure in the NRHCD, and as per the District Plan is not considered to be of national, provincial, citywide or contextual heritage significant and does not contribute to the heritage character of the heritage conservation district.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Planning Division recommends that:

1. City Council approve the application to demolish 99 Whitehall Road, an "unrated" structure in the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District in accordance with Section 42 of the Ontario Heritage Act subject to the owner, prior to the issuance of a demolition permit, submitting photo-documentation of the existing structure at 99 Whitehall Road to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.
2. City Council approve the replacement building at 99 Whitehall Road as shown in the plans and elevations submitted by the applicant and prepared by CIRCA Design, all date stamped received by Heritage Preservation Services February 27, 2015 and on file with the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services, and that the replacement structure be constructed substantially in accordance with the submitted plans, subject to the following condition:

a. Prior to the issuance of any heritage permit for the replacement structure located at 99 Whitehall Road, the applicant will provide final building permit drawings and a landscape plan to the satisfaction of the Manager, Heritage Preservation Services.

Financial Impact
There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

DECISION HISTORY
Council adopted the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District (NRHCD) on September 30, 2004 (By-law 749-2004).


There have been no previous reports to Council regarding the property at 99 Whitehall Drive under the Ontario Heritage Act.

BACKGROUND
Proposal
The property known as 99 Whitehall Road is located within the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District (NRHCD) and at the time the heritage conservation district study was undertaken, was evaluated as an "unrated" property (Attachment Nos. 1 and 2).

The proposal is to demolish an existing 2-storey brick building and to construct a new 2-storey residence.

Policy Framework
OPA 199
At its meeting of April 3, and 4, 2013, Toronto City Council adopted amendments to the Official Plan heritage policies. By-law 468-2013 enacting these policies was appealed to the Ontario Municipal Board. These appeals have been settled and an oral decision of approval by the Ontario Municipal Board has been issued. HPS considered the proposal within the context of these amended policies.

North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District (NRHCD) plan
As per the NRHCD plan, "unrated" buildings are "… not of national, provincial, citywide or contextual heritage significance and do not contribute to the heritage character of
North Rosedale or they are buildings which are too recent to be accurately evaluated for their heritage value. As per the district design guidelines, "demolition of an unrated building will generally be permissible if the replacement building, as shown in the building permit application, is acceptable under these guidelines and the zoning by-law". New buildings within the NRHCD should "contribute to and not detract from the variety and heritage character of the district", and they "should be designed to be compatible with the heritage buildings" in the district "in terms of scale, massing, height, setback, and entry level".

COMMENTS
Heritage Preservation Services (HPS) staff have reviewed a proposal for a new house against the guidelines of the North Rosedale Heritage Conservation District (NRHCD) plan and have worked with the applicant on the overall design of a new 2-storey house within this district. HPS staff raised concerns about the overall massing of the proposed house, the roof volume and height as well as the front yard setback. The owner agreed to break up the massing of the house and roof volume by setting the garage back from the front wall of the house and reducing the height of the roof over the garage. Also, the front yard setback was increased to align the entry porch with the neighbouring houses.

The massing of the proposed residential building is similar to other houses along Whitehall Road and the heritage conservation district. The proposed setback and height of the new house is similar to that of adjacent properties. Proposed materials include stone and brick, typical of houses in the neighbourhood (Attachment Nos. 3 and 4).

For these reasons, HPS supports the application to demolish the existing unrated property and recommends approval of the proposed replacement structure as it will be an appropriate addition to the existing streetscape of Whitehall Road in the NRHCD.

CONTACT
Sherry Pedersen, Preservation Coordinator
Heritage Preservation Services
Tel: 416-338-1089; Fax: 416-392-1973
E-mail: speders@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

_________________________________________
Harold Madi
Director, Urban Design
City Planning Division
ATTACHMENTS
Attachment 1: Location Map
Attachment 2: Photographs of existing house
Attachment 3: Drawings of proposed replacement building