1. DESCRIPTION

Above: 'De La Salle Physical Training Class, "Oaklands" May 15th, 1932', showing the Lake Iroquois Ridge and the South Elevation of Oaklands (Archives of Canada);

Cover: Oaklands, North Elevation, 1859-60, 1869-70, c1912 (Heritage Preservation Services, 2015)

| ADDRESS | 131 Farnham Avenue |
| WARD     | 22 (St. Paul's)   |
| LEGAL DESCRIPTION | PL 289Y PT LTS 7 TO 9 PL 1287 LT32 PL 820 PT LT A **GRID S2211 |
| NEIGHBOURHOOD/COMMUNITY | Yonge - St. Clair |
| HISTORICAL NAME | Oaklands |
| CONSTRUCTION DATE | 1859-60, 1869-70, c1912 |
| ORIGINAL OWNER | Senator John Macdonald |
| ORIGINAL USE | Residential |
| CURRENT USE* | Educational |
| ARCHITECT/BUILDER/DESIGNER | William Hay (1859-60)  
Gundry & Langley (1869-70)  
Darling & Pearson (1908)  
Gordon & Helliwell (c1912)  
James H. Haffa (1949) |
| DESIGN/CONSTRUCTION/MATERIALS | Brick cladding, stone, metal, leaded and stained glass |
| ARCHITECTURAL STYLE | High Victorian Gothic |
| ADDITIONS/ALTERATIONS | Alterations/additions to the house as well as other buildings/structures including gates, gatehouse, barns and stables, school building, residential building, skating rink and retreat centre |
| CRITERIA | Design/Physical, Historical/Associative and Contextual |
| RECORDER | Heritage Preservation Services: Marybeth McTeague |
| REPORT DATE | July 2015 |
2. BACKGROUND

This research and evaluation report describes the history, architecture and context of the property at 131 Farnham Avenue containing the house known as Oaklands which was designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act in 1977 by former City of Toronto By-law No. 10-77 and the gates which were included on the Heritage Register in 1984, as well as the De La Salle College "Oaklands" building (1949) and the grounds of the property. The report includes an evaluation of the property according to Ontario Regulation 9/06, the criteria for municipal designation prescribed by the Province of Ontario following the 2005 amendments to the Ontario Heritage Act. The conclusions of the research and evaluation are found in Section 4 (Summary).

i. HISTORICAL TIMELINE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Date</th>
<th>Historical Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C 11,000 BCE</td>
<td>The Lake Iroquois Shoreline, now a ridge that crosses east-west through the City of Toronto and the Oaklands property, north of Davenport Road, was originally formed by proglacial Lake Iroquois</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1793</td>
<td>Lot 22 in the Second Concession from the Toronto Bay is granted to David Smith, Surveyor General, who sold it to Chief Justice John Elmsley. Prior to his death in 1805 Elmsley donated the property to the Anglican Church</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1858</td>
<td>The Anglican Church sells John Macdonald 3 lots of the subdivided Lot 22 on the east side of College Avenue (now Avenue Road), in York Township, acquiring a total of 35 acres and naming it Oaklands for the abundance of Oak trees on the property</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 1859-60        | Call to tenders in the Globe, January 25, 1860, 'Architect Wm Hay for bricklaying, carpentry and plastering for John Macdonald residence on the ridge opposite the north end of College Avenue, near the Yorkville brickyards, "Oaklands."
<p>| 1860           | An archival photograph labelled &quot;A scene on the terrace of Oaklands when it was built in 1860&quot; shows the original house with a T-shaped plan with crossgable roofs, three-storey tower at the south-east corner and an eastern one-and-a-half storey wing with prominent chimney |
| 1861 (January) | City of Toronto Directory indicates, for the first time, John Macdonald living in a house on College Avenue in York Township |
| 1869           | Call to Tenders in the Globe September 25, 1869 indicate Gundry &amp; Langley undertake additions to the residence of John Macdonald, east side of Avenue Road, Yorkville |
| 1876           | Peter Alfred Gross's Bird's Eye View of Toronto shows a perspective of the city which extends beyond the city's boundaries up to the Lake Iroquois ridge. The view shows the Macdonald estate. Images bordering the map represent important Toronto buildings including at the top and centre, John Macdonald &amp; Co. Importers, the warehouse on Wellington St, and at the bottom centre, John Macdonald's house with the extensions by Gundry and Langley |
| 1884           | The first Goad’s Atlas shows the line of mid-19th century estates lining edge of the Lake Iroquois ridge above the Davenport Road includes John Macdonald's house and property |
| 1890           | John Macdonald dies. Ownership of the property is transferred to his widow Annie Macdonald and sons John Kidston and James Fraser Macdonald |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Event Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1903</td>
<td>Goad's Atlas shows the severing of a southern portion of the Macdonald estate with the creation of Alcorn Avenue along the new southern edge of the estate and the north-south Oaklands Avenue. A northern portion of the estate is severed as Farnham Avenue is extended westward to Avenue Road.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1906</td>
<td>Assessment rolls (as of July 1905) indicate that Annie Macdonald (widow), John Kidston Macdonald, the eldest son, and James Fraser Macdonald own Oaklands.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1905-1906</td>
<td>The McCormick Estate purchases Oaklands. Assessment rolls as of 5 July 1906, for 1907, indicate Oaklands as &quot;a vacant house owned by Nettie McCormick (widow) and Cyrus H McCormick, trustees in c/o John (Kidston) Macdonald. (The land includes) Part Lot 7 and Part Lot 8 Plan 289, 10 acres.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1908</td>
<td>October 6 – Building Permit # 12815 is granted to the McCormick Estate to erect a 1 ½ storey brick dwelling, corner of Avenue Rd and Alcorn Ave. Architect Darling and Pearson, Cost of building $3,300. The assessment rolls for 1909 recorded on 16 July 1908, Mary V. McCormack is living on the property.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1909</td>
<td>March 30 – Building Permit #14450 is granted to the McCormick Estate to erect a 1 ½ storey brick addition to stable, near Farnham Ave on Avenue Road. Builder The J C Scott Co. Ltd., Cost of building $2,800.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1912</td>
<td>April 23 – Building Permit # 33569 is granted to McCormick Estate, Avenue Rd and Alcorn, to erect a 2 1/2 storey brick addition to dwelling near Alcorn Avenue on Avenue Rd. Architect Gundry (sic) &amp; Helliwell, Builder: Whitehall &amp; Son. Cost of building $12,000.00.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1913</td>
<td>Goads Atlas shows significant changes to the property. The house has acquired a narrow eastern extension which was the bowling alley added by Mary McCormick. The gatehouse is shown at the south-west corner of the estate. Alcorn Avenue extends east and jogs northwards to connect with the former Wickson Avenue. Development of the building lots on Farnham Avenue has taken place; one lot remains unbuilt providing a northern entrance to the estate where the brick stables and wooden out buildings are located.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1925</td>
<td>Architect Warren H. Manning and landscape architects Harries, Hall &amp; Cruise of Cambridge, MA, produce a plan of the Oaklands estate showing existing conditions and proposed alterations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1931</td>
<td>The Brothers of the Christian Schools purchase the property and renames the school De La Salle College &quot;Oaklands&quot;. Classes held in house and former stables.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1932</td>
<td>De La Salle Senior School moves to Oaklands.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1949</td>
<td>Building permit # 28790 is granted to erect a new school building including classrooms, gymnasium, cafeteria and brothers' dining room by architect James H. Haffa. The historic house becomes a residence for the Brothers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1958-60</td>
<td>Building Permit #50190 is granted to demolish the bowling alley is demolished and replace it with a residential wing attached to existing house by Roy E. Orlando, architect.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960-66</td>
<td>Building permit # 80001 is granted to erect athletic building over existing skating rink by McNamara Engineering Ltd. and Fisher, Tedman and Fisher Associated Architects.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1973</td>
<td>The property is listed on the inaugural City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties (now known as the Heritage Register).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1975-77</td>
<td>Alterations to the school building are undertaken by architect Bruno Appollonio, building permit #s 087908, 099968.102123.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ii. HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The Davenport Ridge Neighbourhood (Casa Loma-Yonge St. Clair)

131 Farnham Avenue, (Images 1 and 2) the property historically referred to as Oaklands straddles the ridge which 12,000-13,000 years ago, was the shoreline of the proglacial ancient Lake Iroquois which covered the area of Toronto south of the ridge. Lake Iroquois retreated to become the body of water now known as Lake Ontario exposing the ridge which is seen most clearly at the Scarborough Bluffs in the east and north of the centre of the city above Davenport Road. Study of the ridge throughout the 19th century culminated with the work of Dr A. P. Coleman who, in 1913, published his innovative map and section which collated the geographical strata (Images 3 and 4). Dr. Coleman's work also revealed the presence of late Pleistocene fossil mammals including caribou, mammoth, mastodon and musk ox on the ridge.¹ The soil conditions resulted in different types of botanical development so that the well-drained land of the upper ridge would encourage the growth of large oaks and pine trees while that at the base of the ridge would develop as savannah with forests of lighter tree density. The pre-dominant presence of the oaks is commemorated in the historic name of the property. The ridge was also a place for the earliest Aboriginal settlement (Paleo-Indian) in the province approximately 9,000-11,000 years ago. Early patterns of use and occupation are still present in the Davenport Road which originated as a trail following the ridge and its ravines which then became an early plank road in the mid-19th century.²

When the town of York was established in 1793 it was surveyed with a grid created by series of concession roads which ran approximately east-west. Between these concession roads long narrow north-south lots were laid out.³ (Image 5) The first concession road occurred just north of the town, appropriately named "Lot" Street (now Queen) and terminated at the second concession road now known as Bloor Street. The second concession stretched between Bloor and St. Clair. The land in the first concession was

---

¹ Stewart, p 2
² Ibid.
³ The exception to this was the lots adjacent to the Don River which took and east-west axis to increase access to river frontage.
divided into 100 acre plots and was dominated by a grid of streets with little interference from topography except for example at the Don River and Garrison Creek.

The second concession, in contrast, had larger 200-acre lots and was characterized by the dramatic rise of the Lake Iroquois ridge, the ravines which erupted from it and the persistence of the Davenport trail which all provided a break with the grid of settlement. (Image 6) Although the land was granted to members of the Family Compact or soldiers such as John McGill who built the first estate on the ridge, known as Davenport in 1797, and the Baldwin Family who built estates at Spadina and Russell Hill, by the mid-19th century most of the land had been sold to recent immigrants from Ireland, Scotland and Europe, self-made men who were prospered through commercial enterprise, enriching the city with trade, employment and, in some cases, exemplary philanthropy. (Image 7) These included, along with John Macdonald at Oaklands, James Austin who built the third Spadina house (1866), Samuel Nordheimer (Glen Edyth, 1871) and Edmund Gunther who purchased portions of Russell Hill, William McMaster who built Rathnelly (1851), Simeon Janes who built Benvenuto (1890) and Henry Pellatt who built Casa Loma (1910-13).

The estates were developed over a century when the Picturesque aesthetic and its appreciation for natural and dramatic landscapes with views and variety was in full swing. A sense of place, an interest in local indigenous culture and a romantic connection with homeland roots was evident in the names given to the estates: Oaklands, Ravenswood, Poplar Plains and Casa Loma (Spanish for "house on the hill"), Spadina (from the Ojibway *espadinong* for hill or mont), Mashquoteh ("meadow where the deer come to feed") and Irish origins expressed in Russell Hill, Rathnelly and Ardwold (Gaelic for "high green hill").

The location of the houses on the ridge represented a retreat from the city with a view back over and beyond it to lake and bluffs. (Image 8) Of Russell Hill it was said "the house sat on the Davenport escarpment and looked down over York three miles distant." In 1819 William Warren Baldwin built the first Spadina and wrote afterwards: "I have cut an avenue all the way so we can see the vessels passing up and down the bay." Ninety years later as John Craig Eaton completed Ardwold, the architect Frank Wickson, "looking out over the city from the escarpment property remarked to Eaton, 'Not only have you a splendid view – but imagine being able to look out at four hundred and fifty thousand people working for you'." As with Benvenuto, the buildings and the design of the surrounding grounds were to be "a lasting adornment of its fine situation."

Oaklands – John Macdonald
John Macdonald (1824-1890) and the estate he created at Oaklands fit into this social and geographical matrix. (Image 9) Macdonald arrived from Scotland in 1837 with his father

---

4 Lundell, p 88.
5 Op cit., p 65.
6 Ibid.
7 Op cit., p 90.
8 Mercer, p 144.
who was part of the troops called to respond to the McKenzie rebellion. Describing Macdonald's youth, Michael Bliss wrote, "Macdonald had been raised on floggings and Presbyterian meetings to be an intensely serious lad." While living at Fort York with his father he worked as a clerk. In 1843 he converted to Methodism, "attracted to the Methodist's philosophy of living one's life for others." He intended to become a preacher, but ill health prevented this and so, in 1849, he opened his own business on Yonge Street just north of the Town of York. In 1853 he shifted his focus to dry goods and was so successful that by the 1860s "John Macdonald and Company was the largest dry good house in Canada and probably the largest wholesale house of any kind.… In the 1870s the business was estimated to be worth $500,000 with annual sales of $1 million." In 1862 Macdonald commissioned Gundry and Langley to design a warehouse for the business at 23-27 Wellington St, which Langley was subsequently commissioned to extend in 1878. (Image 10) Macdonald combined his business success with politics and was elected as a representative for Toronto West in 1863, was defeated in 1867 but returned by acclamation for Toronto Centre in an 1875 by-election, serving until 1878. In 1887 Sir John A. Macdonald made the rare gesture of appointing Macdonald, a Liberal, to the Senate. Macdonald, however, "gained his greatest prominence as a devout and generous Methodist." A regular preacher, he acquired 37 miniature silver trowels in recognition of each of the churches he financed and was generous in his further donations to hospitals, Victoria College and the YMCA.

After opening his first business in 1849 he married Eliza Hamilton in 1850. Eliza died following the birth of their second daughter. In 1857 he married Annie Elizabeth Alcorn with whom he had 5 sons and daughters. The family lived in the old town on George Street until in 1858 when Macdonald purchased Lots 7, 8 and 9 of Lot 22 in the Second Concession then designated as part of the Township of York. Macdonald's sons were involved with the family business; his eldest son, John Kidston, became president and another son, Duncan, was vice president after his death. Major James Fraser was a part-owner of family land-holdings and Arthur represented the business in Medicine Hat.

Oaklands Estate
The two-hundred acre Lot 22 had originally been granted to the Surveyor General David Smith, but was soon sold to the Chief Justice John Elmsley. Elmsley managed to purchase 8,000 acres before his death in 1805 by which time he had donated this lot to St. James Cathedral and the Anglican Church. By the 1850s Lot 22 had been split along the centre by the north-south axis of College Avenue which ran between the narrower Lots 11 and 12 in the First Concession south of Bloor Street. (Image 6, as above) By 1860, the subdivision of Lot 22 with large square lots is evident as the village of Yorkville develops on it south east corner and the Annex begins to take shape on the south-west. (Image 7, as above) The Davenport Plank Road follows the route of ancient trails across the lots and Poplar Plains Road the boundary along the west side of Lot 22 responds to

---

9 Bliss.
10 Jones, H14.
11 Bliss.
12 Bliss.

Amending of Designating By-Law and Authority to Amend HEA – 131 Farnham Avenue
Attachment 5 Part 1
the topography of the ravines as it breaks off the orthogonal lines of the survey grid and winds its way south on a gentle diagonal heading west to meet the plank road. The three lots Macdonald purchased are indicated by square outlines just north of Cottingham Avenue. To the west Lot 23, the Russell Hill estate, is already seeing some subdivision of the lot north of the ravine. To the east Lot 21 has been subdivided with lots aligned east-west to maximize the number with Yonge Street frontage. The development of each lot responded uniquely to a variety of circumstances natural or man-made.

**Oaklands House Phase 1 - Macdonald - 1859-60**

Macdonald commissioned the architect William Hay to design the house. Hay placed a call to tender in the Globe in January 1860 for bricklaying, carpentry and plastering, identifying the project as being for the "John Macdonald residence on the ridge opposite the north end of College Avenue, near the Yorkville brick yards, "Oaklands". The reference shows that Macdonald's name for the estate in response to the proliferation of oaks was already in use. The reference to the ridge also indicates the importance of the ridge as a geographical locator within the city. The construction must have been complete by the end of 1860 as the City Directory for 1861 published in January indicates Macdonald as living on College Avenue in York Township. A year later College Avenue north of Bloor Street was renamed Avenue Road.

A copy of a photograph labelled "A scene on the terrace of Oaklands" when it was built in 1860" in the City of Toronto Archives indicates what the first phase of the house included after its completion in 1860. (Image 11) The photograph has been taken from the eastern end of the house showing a lower one-and-a-half storey wing in the foreground and the three storey tower that was built at the south-east corner of the main house. Beyond, the 2 ½ storey main house appears to have an L-shaped plan with a gable-roofed wing with a bay window extending to the south. The main body of the connecting these two wings has an unusual hipped roof, instead of a gable roof, which facilitated construction of a link to provide access to the third floor of the tower. A bay window is evident at the base of the gable-roof wing. "The view from Oaklands to Lake Ontario was magnificent and John claimed that with binoculars he could see Brock's monument." According to the historian Lucy Booth Martyn who interviewed Macdonald's descendants, stable and a coach house were part of this early phase.

**Oaklands House Phase 2 – Macdonald -1869-70**

By 1869 Macdonald's life had expanded in a number of directions; his business was booming, he had served in political office and his family had grown from 2 daughters from his first marriage to what would eventually be an additional five sons and five daughters following his second marriage in 1857. Reflecting the increased stature, prosperity and size of family, the house was extended. Gundry and Langley, the successors to William Hay's firm and the architects of Macdonald's Wellington Street

13 City of Toronto Archives, Box 503589, Folio 8. The back of the photocopy is labeled "January 7, 1932, Mail."
14 Martyn, p 151.
15 Martyn, p 151.
warehouse in 1862-3 and its later extension in 1878, undertook the expansion. The house extended primarily to the west with a two-and-a-half storey wing with dormers and verandahs, and a great five storey tower on the north side with a new main entrance. A third tower and a two-storey wing plus an additional one-storey wing were added to the east. (Image 12) Although no drawings have been found for these earliest phases of the house, a photograph from 1905 of the north façade has been marked up to indicate the elements of the two building periods, based upon the 1860s photograph (Image 10, as above), the image in the 1876 Gross Map (Image 11, above) and the records made by Martyn in her interviews of two of Macdonald's descendants (Image 13)

It is probable that the stone gates on Cottingham Avenue which served as the primary entrance to the estate as indicated in Gross's map of 1876 were also built in this second phase. Although no reference to the gates in the tender call or any other documents has yet been found, their High Victorian Gothic Revival style and detailing makes a late 1860s date probable. (Image 14 – Gross detail) The call to tender placed in the Globe on September 25, 1869 by Gundry and Langley, indicates "addition to residence of John Macdonald, east side of Avenue Road, Yorkville.

Oaklands – Macdonald's Family - 1890-1906

Following the completion of the second addition in 1870 the Oaklands property remained relatively stable. First represented on Goad's Atlas in 1884, it is shown as situated midway on Lots 7, 8 and 9 at the corner of Cottingham Avenue and Avenue Road. (Image 15) In 1890 Macdonald's death is noted in the attribution of the estate, and the development of Woodlawn Avenue and Farnham as they extended from Yonge Street is indicated. (Image 16) With John Macdonald's death in 1890 the ownership of the property transferred to his widow Annie Macdonald and his two sons John Kidston and James Fraser Macdonald.

Up to and including 1899 there is no evidence of any change with the Oaklands estate, but by the 1903 edition of Goad's property at the north (Lot 9) and south (Lot 7) has been severed. (Image 17 Goads 1903) Goad's Atlas of that year shows the severing of part of the Macdonald estate north of Cottingham with the creation of Alcorn Avenue, named for Macdonald's second wife, Annie Elizabeth Alcorn, and Oaklands Avenue. With Alcorn running east from Avenue Road and Oaklands running north from Cottingham they effectively cut off a large square portion of Lot 7 at the south-west corner of the estate. A northern portion of the estate (Lot 9) is severed as Farnham Avenue extends westward from Yonge Street to Avenue Road.

In 1906 the assessment rolls indicate that "lands have been annexed to the City of Toronto under Proclamation by the Lieutenant Governor dated the 10th day of March 1906. This was probably the extension of Wickson Avenue to Alcorn Avenue permitting a direct connection through from Yonge Street to Avenue Road. (Image 18 Goads 1913)

---

16 Op Cit., p 225, Mrs. J.M. Routledge (nee Macdonald) and Mrs. F. H. Lytle (nee Macdonald).
Oaklands – McCormick Estate - 1906-1931

Recorded on July 5 1906, the assessment rolls for 1907 indicate that the property, including part of Lot 7 and Part of Lot 8 Plan 289, had been purchased by Nettie McCormick, widow and the trustees of the Cyrus H McCormick Estate sometime between July 1905 and July 1906. Oaklands was purchased by the estate as a residence for the eldest daughter of Nettie and Cyrus, Mary Virginia (1861-1941). Cyrus Hall McCormick (1809-1884) was a Chicago-based inventor who had patented a mechanical reaper as early as 1831. Although it was partly based upon the work of others and the patent was contested by numerous competitors over the years, McCormick was successful at manufacturing and distributing the reaper which reduced labour and increased productivity and with the help of his brothers, Leander and William, and ultimately his secretary and (later) wife, Nancy Nettie Fowler, (1835-1923) he became a multi-millionaire. He exhibited the reaper at the 1851 London Crystal Palace Exhibition and was named an Officier de la Legion d'Honneur by the French Government who subsequently also elected him to be a member of the French Academy of Sciences in 1878 as "having done more for agriculture than any other living man." His company the McCormick Harvesting Machine Company merged with J P Morgan to be part of the International Harvester Co. in 1902. In 1940 he was honoured by having a 3 cent postage stamp issued in commemoration of his achievements. Numerous books have been published about him between 1909 and 2009; one of these listed him as one of the one hundred richest Americans of all times. Like Macdonald before him McCormick was also devoutly religious (Presbyterian) and philanthropic, supporting seminaries, universities, churches, Sunday schools, the founding of the YMCA and a religious publication he renamed "The Continent." His wife Nettie continued to be an outstanding benefactor after his death.

Their eldest daughter, Mary Virginia McCormick (1861-1941) was diagnosed with schizophrenia when she was only 19. Relying on family trustees, she lived between 3 large estates; one in Alabama, a second in California and Oaklands in Toronto. She was also a generous benefactor, supporting YMCAs, building hospital wings in Alabama for African Americans during the time of racial segregation and in 1912 sponsoring a children's playground in Toronto. Intended to be in the park at Cottingham Street just south of Oaklands, it was deemed too close to the railway line and so was relocated to Sheridan Avenue in Brockton. The project includes a playground based on innovative Chicago models and the Central Neighbourhood House which was to be used for community meetings and a shelter. An article in the Toronto Star on December 31 1917 records that Mary McCormick had provided Christmas entertainment and stockings for 400 children and the following week a party for 185 parents. Today the complex is known as the Mary McCormick Recreation Centre and the Mary McCormick Park. It is thought that Mary McCormick stayed at Oaklands until 1927. Up to and this year, plans were being prepared to transform the grounds as well renovate and extend the

---

18 Klepper Michael and Michael Gunther, 100 Richest Americans of all Times, 1996.
Mary McCormick transformed Oaklands. As early as April 1906 a drawing prepared by Gordon & Helliwell indicates proposed alterations to the stables.21 According to the assessment rolls she arrived at Oaklands more than a year later, between July 1907 and July 1908. The second known project was the gatehouse located at the corner of Avenue Road and Alcorn Avenue (now known as Oaklands Avenue). Permit #12815 issued on October 6, 1908 was granted to the McCormick Estate to erect a one-and-a-half storey brick dwelling; architect Darling & Pearson, Cost $3,300. 22 (Image 19) The following year, on March 30, 1909, Permit # 14450 was issued to the J. C. Scott Co. Ltd. to erect a one-and-a-half storey brick addition to stable (demolished) at the McCormick Estate at a cost of $2,800. No architect was indicated on the permit. Finally on April 23, 1912, Permit # 33569 is granted to the McCormick Estate to erect a "two-and-a-half storey addition to a dwelling". The architects are recorded as Gundry (sic) & Helliwell23 and the cost is substantial: $12,000.00. This building permit may reference the additions including the kitchen wing, new bay windows, the porte-cochere and the bowling alley which extended to the east. (Images 20 and 21)

This change in the plan of the house is reflected on the 1913 Goad's Atlas (Image 18 as above) which also shows, for the first time, the stables to the north and two wooden out buildings close to the top of the property. Since 1903, Farnham Avenue has been developed with houses on the south side of the street. One lot has been left vacant to provide access to the property from the north.

A plan of the entire estate produced by Warren H Manning, Architect,24 provides a summary of the condition of the site in 1925. (Images 22 and 23) The entrance drive through the gates from Alcorn Avenue passes the gatekeepers house at the south east corner of the property and then travels across the ridge in a diagonal ascent to arrive at the upper gardens. Here there was access either to the stables or the opportunity to continue onwards in a great circuit around the gardens to arrive at the porte-cochere.

---

20 Ontario Archives, C11-1206 Horwood and White architectural drawings for the McCormick estate dating to 1921-1927.
22 An earlier permit, 3976 had been granted to the McCormick estate on May 26, 1906 to erect a 2 ½ storey stone and brick dwelling near Cottingham Street, East Side Avenue Rd. Architect Gordon & Helliwell, cost $4,700. However as the existing building is 1 ½ storeys it seems probable that the Darling & Pearson design was constructed. There is no indication currently known that the Gordon & Helliwell structure was constructed elsewhere on the estate.
23 It is thought that the name of the firm is an error as the firm at this time was Gordon & Helliwell, as recorded on earlier permits and drawings, and Gundry, the architect previously associated with Oaklands, had died in 1869.
Other elements included a skating rink at the north-west corner, and a tennis court on the lower field as well as a vegetable garden and extensive formal gardens with "flower borders".

Oaklands – De La Salle "Oaklands" 1931- present
In 1931 the McCormick Estate sold Oaklands to De La Salle College. De La Salle originated with Jean-Baptiste de la Salle (1651-1719). Born in Reims, France, De La Salle was concerned with the lack of education for poor and marginalized youth. In 1680 he created a foundation known as the Brothers of the Christian Schools which would be dedicated to the education of youth. Established in France it became a global movement. In 1837 the Brothers of the Christian Schools established their first school in North America at Montreal. In 1851 they arrived in Toronto establishing a school on Richmond Street East. In 1863 they opened the Christian Brothers Commercial Academy on Jarvis Street and in 1870 relocated to Duke Street with a new name: De La Salle Institute. In 1871 Henry Langley was engaged to expand the school premises and on 26 July placed a call to tender for a "brick addition to De La Salle Institute, n.e.cor. George and Duke" (now Adelaide St. E) in the Globe. In 1900 Jean-Baptiste de la Salle was canonized a saint and in 1950 Pope Pius XII declared him the "Universal Patron of All Teachers." In 1913 De La Salle College, as it was renamed in 1880, moved to 67 Bond Street next to St. Michael's Cathedral. With the pressures of increasing school enrollment, the senior school was located to Our Lady of Perpetual Help School.

With the purchase of Oaklands in 1931 the school was renamed: De La Salle College "Oaklands" which continues to be its name today. Initially the Brothers' residence and the school classrooms and other requirements were accommodated in the Macdonald house and the outbuildings. A 1947 aerial map indicates the transition occurring on the site at that time. (Image 24)

In 1949, a purpose-built school building, designed by the architect James H. Haffa, was located on the eastern edge of the site facing west towards the gardens of the upper terrace. (Image 25 and 26) The building included classrooms, a gymnasium, auditorium, chapel, cafeteria and brother's dining room. The new building resulted in the demolition of the original stables building. The creation of a larger skating rink opposite the house, on the north edge of the property, resulted in the demolition of the cottage and shed.

In 1958, the bowling alley added during McCormick's occupation was demolished and an additional residential wing for the Brothers, designed by the architect Roy E. Orlando, was attached to the existing house. (Image 27) Between 1960 and 1966 the engineers McNamara Engineering Ltd. and architects Fisher, Tedman, Fisher Associated Architects erected an athletic building over the existing skating rink. (Image 28) In 1988-9 De La Salle Centre, a retreat centre with classrooms was built to the east of the Brothers' residential wing, parallel to the house and the first residential wing, to the design of Joseph Medwecki architect. In 2004, De La Salle Hall, a music studio, was added to the west of the retreat centre on the north side of the brother's residence (Images 29 and 30). The original house has provided both classroom as well as academic staff accommodation since 1931. Today it continues to provide space for school activities and
administration and accommodation for the school's president. The historic house is also an Air B-n-B. Writing about Oaklands in 1983, Donald Jones of the Toronto Star reflected that Macdonald's home "was the great Victorian house at the top of the Avenue Road hill that has fascinated Torontonians for more than a century." 25

Oaklands: Architects 26
Writing in 1964, Eric Arthur, architect, influential City of Toronto historian and early heritage activist, described Oaklands as the "Victorian house par excellence." 27 It was designed in stages by a series of some of Toronto's most important and influential architects who from the beginning with William Hay's office represent a continuous lineage of offices through training and apprenticeships. The 1949 De La Salle School Building was designed by an architect noted for his career devoted to religious and educational buildings.

1. William Hay – Oaklands, 1859-60
William Hay (1818-1888) was the architect John Macdonald selected to design the first house on the ridge at Oaklands. Hay is significant as an important link between Gothic Revival theory and practice in England and that in Upper Canada. Born in Scotland, he apprenticed with the London-based architect Sir Giles Gilbert Scott, "the leading architect of the Gothic Revival" 28 and was sent in 1849 to be his clerk of the works in for the Anglican Cathedral in St. John's, Newfoundland. Hay was also an ardent admirer of the work A. W. N. Pugin, the architect and crusading theorist who declared Gothic to be the true Christian style of architecture and whose publications were influential in creating a more accurate revival of Gothic architecture. This was based on archaeological study, functional and structural expression rather than the decorative application of Gothic elements. Hay published an article praising Pugin's work after his death, "The late Mr. Pugin and the revival of Christian architecture" in 1853, the same year he settled in Toronto. Hay's work included several important Toronto buildings: the Gerrard St. Toronto General Hospital (1853), the Gould Street United Presbyterian Church, (1855), St. Basil's Church and St. Michael's College, the addition to Holy Trinity Church (1858) and the Yorkville town hall of 1859-60. In 1862 he returned to Scotland. It may be that the association of the Gothic style with the principles of Christianity and Hay's publication on Pugin were influential on John Macdonald, the devout preacher and church benefactor, in choosing Hay as his architect and the building of Oaklands in the Gothic Revival style.

2. Gundry & Langley – addition to Oaklands, 1869-70
When Hay left for Scotland in 1862 he turned his practise over to Thomas Gundry (1830-1869) and Henry Langley (1836-1907). Gundry was an English-trained architect and civil
engineer who was Hay's partner, while Langley had been an apprentice since 1854. The partnership focused on churches but also did commercial buildings such as one of the first commissions they received, from John Macdonald for the Wellington Street warehouse, praised as "the adornment of Toronto's commercial district." Although Gundry died in 1869, Langley went on to be one of Toronto's most prolific and successful architects in two more practices, Langley, Langley & Burke and Langley & Langley, whose work spread across Ontario. One of his earliest commissions was for the De La Salle Institute, on Adelaide St. E in 1871-2 which included additions and extensions. Highlights of the work in Toronto include the Eighth Post Office on Adelaide Street East, the Metropolitan Methodist Church, the Jarvis Street Baptist Church, and Trinity Methodist Church (now Trinity St. Paul's).

3. Darling & Pearson – Gatekeeper's house, 1908
Frank Darling (1850-1923) trained with Langley before apprenticing in the English office of G. E. Street. His career was based on a series of architectural partnerships. John Pearson (1867-1940) joined the firm of Darling & Curry in 1889 and was promoted to partner in the firm Darling, Curry, Sproatt & Pearson in 1892. Darling was a prolific architect able to practise in a wide variety of styles as determined by the project. He was the architect for Trinity College, as well as frequently for the Bank of Montreal and the Bank of Commerce. His finest works include the warehouses for Perkins & Co. at 45-47 Front Street East, the Bank of Montreal (now Hockey Hall of Fame), and with Pearson the 1916 Parliament Buildings in Ottawa. He received the Royal Gold Medal for Architecture from the Royal Institute of British Architects in 1915.

4. Gordon & Helliwell – additions and alterations to Oaklands c1912
Henry B. Gordon (1854-1951) trained in Langley's office where he may have met Grant Helliwell (1857-1953) with whom he became a partner in 1879 until 1931. They were known well for their ecclesiastical work, such as the Church of the Messiah and the Presbyterian Church of the Covenant (now Hare Krishna) both on Avenue Road as well as the Elm Street YWCA, now the Elmwood Club. While their churches retain the Gothic tradition the Elmwood Club exhibits the influence of Richardsonian Romanesque and the Queen Anne Revival Style popular in the 1890s. Although there is evidence that Gordon & Helliwell were involved as early as 1906 with Oaklands, preparing plans for extensions to the stables and receiving a building permit for a stone and brick dwelling, there is no evidence that this was built or changes were made to the stables. However they did receive a building permit on April 23, 1912 for a two-and-a half storey brick addition to the McCormick estate to cost $12,000. This would seem to encompass the alterations made to the house during Mary McCormick's occupation.

29 Bliss.
31 Arthur, p 250 suggests but does not confirm that Helliwell was trained in Langley's office.
5. Architect: James H. Haffa

James H. Haffa (1894-1980) has been described as the successor to Arthur W. Holmes "who dominated the field of Roman Catholic Church design in Toronto and southern Ontario during the first three decades of the twentieth century." Haffa articled in 1913-14 with James A. Harvey. From 1921 he was the head designer with John M. Jeffrey, and then worked as a draughtsman with John M Lyle from 1930 until 1933, when he opened a practice in his own name. The focus of his career was the design of Catholic churches and schools. His commissions included alterations to St. Michael's Cathedral and the adjacent St. Michaels Roman Catholic Choir School, the Christian Brothers Roman Catholic Training School and Our Lady of Sorrows church. Though completed after World War II, like the new building for De La Salle College "Oaklands", they retain traditional historic architectural styles – Gothic, Classical and Romanesque. He "possessed a total commitment to the design of the interiors for his commissions and often donated all of the contents of the sanctuary, the altars and statues to many of the churches for which he had prepared the plans." In 1957 Pope Pius XII declared him a Knight of St Gregory in recognition of his career's dedication to ecclesiastical architecture.

Oaklands: Heritage Designation

In 1973 Oaklands was listed on the inaugural City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties (now known as the Heritage Register). In 1977, a portion of the property including the house and the attached 1958 brothers' residence with a 20' perimeter of land surrounding the two buildings was designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act by By-law 10-77 prior to the amendments to the Ontario Heritage Act in 2005 and the adoption of Ontario Regulation 9/06 (provincial criteria prescribed for municipal designation) the next year. In 1984 the gates were listed on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties. In 1995, the City of Toronto and the Brothers of the Christian Schools of Ontario entered into a Heritage Easement Agreement to identify and protect the exterior and interior attributes of Oaklands.

iii. ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

Oaklands

Current photographs of Oaklands and the Oaklands estate are found on the cover and in Sections 2 and Attachment 5 - Part 2 of this report.

Oaklands was long acclaimed as one of the most splendid residences in the city, if not the country. Oaklands is an important, and one of only two, surviving examples of the grand estate houses built along the Lake Iroquois ridge during the mid-late nineteenth century. Just as Oaklands was part of a social change, in that after the mid-nineteenth century the ridge was developed by new immigrants and entrepreneurs who bought their land, rather than landed gentry and soldiers who were granted or inherited the land, the architectural style also changed: buff brick and stone replaced the Georgian's red just as asymmetrical

33 James H Haffa Entry, Biographical Dictionary of Architects in Canada.
34 Ibid.
compositions of the Gothic Revival, Italianate and Second Empire styles replaced symmetrical Neo-Classicism. The eclecticism and revival of past styles such as the Gothic and Italianate was characteristic of the Romantic Movement which emerged in the late eighteenth and nineteenth centuries displaying an "affinity for historicism and the remote. It cultivated personal feelings, showed an aesthetic interest in picturesque irregularity and was obsessed with the associations that could be attached to things from the past." 35 While the Gothic Revival re-emerged for use in both ecclesiastical and secular buildings in the 18th century, it was expressed more as the application of decorative Gothic detail. By the 1840s with the combined influences of archaeology, the study of medieval church form and the work and writings of A. W. N. Pugin and the Cambridge Ecclesiological Society, the Gothic Revival incorporated plans that were expressive of function resulting in a complex, picturesque asymmetrical form and an interest in exposed structure and materials. Under Pugin and the Ecclesiologists' influence there was an ideological link with Christianity and morality, or what Kenneth Clark called the "Ethical Gothic Revival." 36 Gundry and Langley's warehouse for Macdonald on Wellington Street (Image 10, as above) is in a Venetian Gothic style perhaps appropriately alluding to the canal-side castles of the merchants of Venice.

**Oaklands - Exterior**
The first iteration of the house as designed by William Hay, 1859-60, corresponds to the aesthetics and principles of the Gothic Revival. (Image 11, as above) A two-and-a-half storey house, clad in buff brick, it had an asymmetrical plan featuring a gable-roofed wing with a double-storey bay window on the south façade at the west end, a hipped-roof main body, a three storey tower and one-and-a-half storey storey kitchen wing to the east. The house corresponded to the model identified as typical of houses in Upper Canada in 1857. (Image 31) Although Oaklands exceeded the model by having a tower and a kitchen wing, these elements, along with the tall chimneys, served both functional as well as aesthetic purposes. (Image 32) The decorative bargeboards with wood finials had Gothic tracery. (Image 33 and 34)

It was Gundry and Langley's 1869-1870 extension to the house which rendered it worthy of Arthur's exclamation that it is the "Victorian House *par excellence*." 37 (Image 35) As partner and apprentice of Hay respectively, Gundry and Langley may both have been involved with the 1859-60 original house. The extension sensitively expands the vocabulary of the first house with two more towers, gable dormers facing south, west and north, single and double storey square or hexagonal plan bay windows on the west elevation and verandahs on the north and south sides. (Image 36) The previous one-and-a-half storey kitchen wing has been added to with a third, and shortest tower, and a gabled wing running north-south which has an adjacent enclosed court. (Image 37) The tallest tower, at 5 storeys would have rivaled those of Toronto's churches and colleges. The Gothic Revival's presence is intensified in the tracery of the verandahs, the decorative treatment of the tower with its oriel window, triangular Gothic window and

---

35 Kalman, p 259.
36 Kalman, p 280.
37 Arthur, 1964 p 236.
rows of corbels (Image 38), the gable bargeboards and finials (Image 39). As seen, the bargeboards are given a variety of treatments; those on the kitchen wing being the simplest, corresponding to the details in the window headers. (Image 40, 41) The stepped crenellations of the kitchen court on the east (see Image 12 above) and the west bay window with its Macdonald family crest38 (Image 42) provided additional Gothic Revival details. The woodwork on the verandah, windows and bargeboards, as photographed in 1897 and 1905, was painted in a dark colour.

The changes made to the house c1912, during Mary McCormick's residency, by Gordon and Hellwell, occurred primarily at the ground level and represented the Edwardian taste of the new century. The principal style was now Classical and although Gothic Revival continued in institutions, it was typically more horizontal than vertical in its emphasis. (Image 43,) The porte-cochere was often featured on grand homes at this time as seen at Casa Loma and Spadina House. (Image 44) Other changes included the addition of large bay windows, on the north, south and west facades which resulted in the removal of the 1869-70 verandahs. These primarily occurred at the ground level although the bay window at the west end was extended at the upper level as well and at the east end a sitting room glazed was added at the upper level. (Images 45) Further to the east was the bowling alley extension which was indicated in the updated footprint of the house on Goad's Atlas in 1913 (Image 18, as above) The kitchen wing was extended to the north of the bowling alley with a second gabled wing which projected further forward than the original and involved rebuilding the original enclosed kitchen yard with its crenellated walls adjacent to it. (Image 46)

Oaklands – Interior

On the interior the house retains much of the configuration of the 1869-70s renovation with the exception that all of the rooms on the ground floor have been extended outwards, with large bay windows, substantially increasing the size and light of the rooms. (Images 47-68) Along with this change was the introduction of Neo-Classical details in most of the ground floor public rooms in the fireplaces, door cases, cornices and other elements such as pilasters and columns which were often employed as transitional elements where the extensions were made. (For example: Images 51 and 52) The fireplaces shown in Images 57, 63, 67 and 68 and the sitting room in Image 66 are not currently identified in the original HEA and are being recommended for inclusion in an amendment to the HEA.

Gatekeeper's House

The gatekeeper's house, constructed by the McCormick estate in 1908 to the designs of Darling and Pearson, like the interior alterations made to the main house c1912, reflects a shift away from the High Victorian taste for the Gothic Revival style. As seen in the house alterations, the gatekeeper's house embodies the picturesque qualities of the site.

---

38 Martin explains the symbolism of the crest: "A gory legend tells that an early Clan Donald chieftain and a neighbouring clan both claimed a large island. It was agreed that the two chiefs would row to the island, and the one whose hand first touched the shore would own it. Macdonald was losing the race, so he chopped of his hand and hurled it to the shore and won the island." p 152.
This is evident in the T-shaped plan which finds its three-dimensional expression in the treatment of the roof which maintains its one-and-a-half storey height in the narrow southern bay of the house and then sweeps down to a low single-storey to encompass the broader footprint of the verandah on the east side and an extension on the west. The roof also features a bell-cast curve with exposed rafters. The picturesque is also evident in the dormers and their variety of being set within the roof with gable, shed or hipped roofs or having the walls extend upwards cutting through the eaves.

The taste for the classical that was prevalent in the Edwardian era is evident in the Doric columns and the arched openings in the end walls of the verandah which suggest more of an Italianate loggia typology. The raised basement has brick walls above which the walls are rendered in stucco. The original verandah floor has been extended to an open deck with a balustrade and steps that are not original to the house. A fire escape has been added on the south elevation of the house.

De La Salle College "Oaklands" (1949)

De La Salle College "Oaklands", constructed in 1949, is a long rectangular, two-and-a-half storey block, clad in a variegated red brick with a flat roof terminated by an eight-sided cupola with stone arches and a conical copper roof surmounted by a cross. Built on an irregular J-shaped plan, with the tail of the j situated on the rear east side of the building, the principal elevation faces west and the open space of the upper terrace. The style of the building is Neo-Classical but modified through the lens of the mid-twentieth century. New materials, such as glass block, are added and traditional classical details are given a new treatment echoing the influence Art Deco or reinterpreted for new functions and meaning. The organization of the west façade recalls the English country house proto-type which was adapted for new public building types in the nineteenth century. This is evident with its central entrance bay and projecting outer wings with red brick and light-coloured classical stone elements.

Classical elements are seen in the three porticoes which have been flattened against the façade. These include full-height, un-fluted stone pilasters with capitals that are a variation on a Corinthian capital incorporating a cross. The central entrance bay has further variations on classical elements where the stone entablature has a compressed architrave, an unusually high frieze, with the words "De La Salle College Oaklands," and crests at either end. Above, the cornice is unusual with its decorative flat band including square and circular notches whose geometry and flatness bears the influence of the Art Deco style. The central portico is topped with four classical urns which frame the cupola in the distance.

Framed by the portico and its pilasters, the main entrance has traditional classical elements with its broad stone surround of pilasters, entablature and large broken pediment with curved volutes flanking a pineapple. On either side of the entrance elongated windows with stone surrounds, panels and wrought iron railings are featured at the main floor level. Above, two narrow windows echo those below but without the stone surrounds. The central window over the door is broader with a wide central section and two narrow sidelights recalling the traditional Palladian window but without the
central arched transom. The windows are made of steel rather than wood and instead of being double-hung sash they have modern lower opening sections.

The projecting wing to the south contains the auditorium entry and features three sets of doors between the portico pilasters with window openings at the second floor with stone surrounds. (Image 72) The pilaster capitals are of two types, one of which incorporates a variation on a traditional Composite capital with a cross as a central motif. Other elements framed by the portico include fluted panels with circular discs between the first and second storeys and a dentil cornice with the same modern flatness and simplicity of that on the central bay. The attic level relief panels feature a central panel with a cartouche flanked by horns of plenty, traditional symbols of victory while to the north and south octagonal panels featuring a running football player with goalposts and the DLS insignia with a bugle and drum speak of current school activities that bring such honours. (Image 73) On either side of the portico are long unadorned window openings with modern glass block. Above them, circular stone discs are feature shields with *fleur de lis* and a rose in relief. The entablature varies from tradition by having two friezes, one with four carved medallions, and the top, featuring the word "Auditorium." The architraves supporting the entablatures continue as bands of moulding onto the brick walls to either side of the portico.

The north projecting bay is the exterior facade of the chapel and does not include an entrance. It differs from the other two wings by having a sloping stone pediment on its cornice with a cross at the centre which is suggestive of the traditional basilica form of early Christian churches. The cornice is supported on two pairs of stone pilasters with fluted capitals resting on a rusticated brick base. (Image 74) Between the pilasters, the central chapel window features a traditional Palladian pattern with a larger central bay of stained glass and two smaller bays with modern glass block. Two crests in stone relief panels are set in the wall above. The lower panel features a shield flanked by cornucopia. The shield has the Greek *Chi Rho* letters which are the first two in the name Christ and is association with the crucifixion. The upper shield is of the De La Salle crest with oak leaves flanking the DLS insignia with the lamp of learning above. The Latin motto "Signum Fidei" or "sign of faith," the motto of the Brothers of the Christian Schools embodying the concepts of faith, service and community is carved on two banners wrapped around the oak leaves. This crest is also featured in the terrazzo floor of the main entrance. (Image 75)

Between the three projecting bays of the west façade are three floors of classrooms articulated as a series of vertical bays with stone frames tying them together. The windows are traditionally proportioned with a wider central opening and stone panels with carved relief between the floors.

The north, east and south elevations are more rudimentary than the principal west facade. (Images 76, 77, and 78) The north provides the first view of the school as it is seen from the current main entry from Farnham Avenue and contains the side chapel elevation with its round-headed windows with stone keystones and narrow impost blocks, brick piers. There is a small entry with wooden door case with a broken pediment framing a cross.
The east elevation presents a typical post-war school elevation with the upper half of the windows glazed in glass block. Finally the south elevation presents the exterior elevation of the auditorium with its tall round-headed windows with stone keystones.

Setting
In the 1897 Toronto Board of Trade publication on Toronto, the author writes of the "residence of the late Senator John Macdonald a property situated on a high ridge overlooking the city and comprising the finest building sites anywhere. It has the advantage of county taxes and cannot be excelled in Canada for residential purposes." 39 The setting of Oaklands expresses high design value. Situated on the edge of the wooded escarpment, and originally accessed by a driveway which ascended across the lower open fields to the upper level of the ridge with dramatic views of the lake and the city, it exemplified the more rustic aspects of the Picturesque aesthetic which converged with the High Victorian Gothic Revival. (Image 14, as above and Image 79) The Picturesque landscape movement emerged in 18th century England with Romanticism, influenced by the landscape paintings of the French painters Claude Lorraine and Gaspar Poussin, the import of Chinese landscape paintings to England and executed in the landscapes designed by Sir Henry Hoare, William Chambers and Lancelot 'Capability' Brown. In contrast to the geometrical and symmetrical gardens of the Renaissance and Baroque styles which extended architectural order into the garden, the Picturesque favoured an approach which championed and enhanced the irregularities of a natural landscape, locating buildings at scenic vantage points to be glimpsed from circuitous carriage drives providing a variety of views often with an element of surprise and awe. Whereas previously gardens could be appreciated from single fixed vantage points, the concept of appreciating the landscape, as well as the extent of the landholdings, by moving through it made the sequence of arrival and the use of the carriage an essential part of the experience of the setting of the house.

The original carriage ride to Oaklands followed a route from the city northwards on Yonge Street, west across Cottingham Street to the entry gates of the property. At this point the gates framed the view across the lower grounds and upwards to the house on the ridge. Once through the gates and proceeding to cross the fields, the driveway, as illustrated in Gross’s view of 1876 (Image 14, as above), curved towards the eastern edge of the property where the slopes are shallower and the ascent easier, arriving in a curve at the upper terrace. Only glimpses of the house would have been possible prior to the final arrival at the top of the ridge, but the picturesque composition of the first 1859-60 house with its tower, tall chimneys and gable facing south would have contributed to the experience which was greatly enhanced with the 1869-70 renovations which added the two more towers, one of five storeys in height and numerous gables and verandahs. Once at the top breathtaking views back over the city would have been presented.

Between 1899 and 1903 with the severing of the estate and the creation of Alcorn and Oaklands Avenues the gates were relocated. This move to Alcorn Avenue (now

---

39 The Board of Trade of the City of Toronto, p 26.

Amending of Designating By-Law and Authority to Amend HEA – 131 Farnham Avenue
Attachment 5 Part 1 20
Oaklands) to Oaklands Avenue and at a location close to the intersection with Avenue Road resulted in the shortening of the driveway by approximately 100 metres. The driveway subsequently took a new course, heading on a diagonal up the slope from the south-west to north-east, as recorded on Manning's 1925 plan of the estate. (Image 22, as above, Image 80) The mid-section of the driveway stretching below the house and the Brothers' Residence still survives. (Image 24, as above) The detailing of the balustrade/retaining walls, with the Gothic arches matching that of the porte-cochere of the c1912 addition, indicates that they likely date from this period. (Images 81 and 82) Travelling across the open fields and then through the wooded landscape of the ridge on a steady upward slope to finally reach the top to tour the upper terrace in a great sweeping circuit would have greatly enhanced the experience of arrival and the appreciation of the qualities of the site, its architecture and landscape. (Images 83, 84 and 85)

In addition to the carriageway, a sequence of pathways circulated around the estate, along the outer edges, around the upper gardens, across the ridge and around to the gates. (Image 23, as above) One of these passed under a bridge created by the driveway to provide access from the upper terrace to the field, tennis court, vegetable and flower gardens. A photograph, dating from between 1910 and 1930, shows girls carrying trays along winding stone path flanked by planted borders with the bridge behind them. (Image 86) The journalist Adele M Gianelli wrote of it at the time of the De La Salle purchase: "a woodland walk saunters thoughtfully under a bridge now spanning the ravine up where the coach and spanking team once pranced."40 The bridge can still be found though the opening has been filled in. (Image 87) Other walkways created routes across the escarpment slopes, some of which also remain extant. (Images 88 and 89)

The trees and vegetation at Oaklands reveal the original qualities of the site before Macdonald's purchase of it. Red and white oaks and pines typically pre-dominated on the ridge as part of the "glacial rolling uplands" of the Lake Iroquois ridge41 The 1870 photograph indicates additional planting of conifers and deciduous trees which had grown substantially by the time of the 1906 sale. (Images 79 and 83, as above) Some of these had been cleared during Mary McCormick's occupation. Maple trees were also added during Macdonald's ownership as testified by a head gardener in 1931 who said he had planted the giant maples fifty years earlier.42 Oaks and maples survive on the upper terraces now and new oaks have been planted around the dell recently.

The use of the open space is partially indicated through plans, photographs, aerial views and interviews. It is evident that the eastern side of lower fields was used for agriculture as shown by the vines in the 1870s photo (Image 79 as above) as well as by the vegetables and flower gardens on the eastern side of the 1925 plan. (Image 22) The lower fields were also occupied by a cricket crease where Macdonald's sons played and subsequently, as the aerial photo of 1947 shows, there were three baseball diamonds before the current running track and football field were established by 1992. A tennis

40 Gianelli, p 99.
41 Stewart, p 1.
42 Gianelli, p 99.
court was also recorded on the 1925 plan. It is known that on the upper terrace John Macdonald also planned kitchen gardens behind a cedar hedge to the north east of the house and had set aside an acre dedicated to growing asparagus, strawberries and celery.\textsuperscript{43} As the stables and orchards were also located to the north east of the house it is probable that service areas were primarily located here and the rest of the upper terrace gardens were left to be viewed and enjoyed for aesthetic and leisure purposes as indicated by the open lawns at the south east shown in the 1860s view of the house (Image 11 as above) and at the south-west in a later view dating to 1900. (Image 90) During the Macdonald family occupation "the oaks of Oaklands ennoble the northern lawns behind the house where the sward dips in a dell nick-named The Dish – most appropriately as here Sunday school classes were picnicked annually."\textsuperscript{44} (Image 91) The upper terrace also had a skating rink, known to be in use during Mary McCormick's residency (Image 22, as above) and afterwards enlarged and then enclosed by the college. An interview with James Fraser Macdonald, one of John's sons, just after Oaklands was sold to the Christian Brothers, had him speculating: "I wonder what the boys and girls of today would think of our simple joys of those days. Under these twin oaks I read my Dickens, Thackeray and Sir Walter Scott, and that spreading chestnut tree shaded my father daily as he read his Bible."\textsuperscript{45}

iv. CONTEXT

The location of Oaklands is shown on the maps attached as Images 1 and 2. The landscape features of the estate are described in Section 2.iii above.

The Lake Iroquois Shoreline Escarpment

In its location on the east side of Avenue Road at the crest of the escarpment, De La Salle College "Oaklands" is an important landmark on this major north-south artery which continues south of Bloor as University Avenue connecting the downtown core with the northern city. It sits within a sequence of nineteenth century landmarks on the route including the Ontario Legislature, and the University of Toronto to the south and Upper Canada College in the north. The Oaklands house is one of only two houses to survive from the series of grand estates built on the escarpment in a line that stretched east-west during the nineteenth century. Its open fields and gardens contribute to the Davenport – Yonge-St.Clair neighbourhoods.

De La Salle College "Oaklands" incorporates the escarpment of the Lake Iroquois Shoreline which stretches across the city from as far as the Humber River terminating at the Scarborough Bluffs. In writing about the importance of the ridge, the archaeologist Andrew Stewart has stated, "the ridge, itself represents one of the city's most important cultural and natural heritage features on account of its archaeological, geological, Aboriginal, city-historic and built heritage associations, as well as its physical prominence and integrity promoting a natural connection between the Humber and Don

\textsuperscript{43} Martyn p 151.
\textsuperscript{44} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{45} Gianelli, p 99.
River valleys."46 "One of the best views of the old shoreline is from below the Avenue Road hill, looking to the northeast across the open field south of De La Salle College."47 (Images 92, 93, 94, 95 and 96)

The significance of the ridge was early recognized as a great natural asset by settlers of town of York and was remarked upon in the writings of Elizabeth Simcoe, wife of John Graves Simcoe, the Lieutenant Governor of Upper Canada for its "highlands" including "Pine plains"48 It was also studied as early as the 1830s by a series of geologists and engineers from Thomas Roy, Charles Lyell, Sandford Fleming, J. W. W. Spencer and Arthur P Coleman which resulted in Coleman's study and map of 1913. (Images 3 and 4 as above) Its importance extends to "our understanding of Aboriginal land-use as…it created the conditions for an east-west trail, used by Aboriginal people, which exists today as Davenport Road."49 Although the ridge was located beyond the city's boundaries in 1876, Gross included it in his Bird's Eye View of Toronto which featured an illustration of the Macdonald estate and house. (Images 8 and 14)

The 2004 Master Plan of Archaeological Resources of the City of Toronto identified the ridge as "an important feature associated with the earliest human (Palaeo-Indian) settlement in the province."50 This portion of the escarpment has also been included in the City of Toronto's Official Plan Natural Heritage Systems, Section 3.4 and Map 9. (Image 97)

3. EVALUATION CHECKLIST

The following evaluation applies Ontario Regulation 9/06 made under the Ontario Heritage Act: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest. While the criteria are prescribed for municipal designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, the City of Toronto uses it when assessing properties for inclusion on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties. The evaluation table is marked “N/A” if the criterion is “not applicable” to the property or X if it is applicable, with explanatory text below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Design or Physical Value</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i. rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii. displays high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii. demonstrates high degree of scientific or technical achievement</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

46 Stewart, p 1.
47 Ibid.
48 Ibid.
49 Op cit., p 2
50 Ibid.

Amending of Designating By-Law and Authority to Amend HEA – 131 Farnham Avenue
Attachment 5 Part 1
Rare and Representative Example of a Type and Style with a High Degree of Craftsmanship – The property's design value relates to the house and its surroundings as one of the only two surviving Victorian houses constructed on the Lake Iroquois escarpment, which retains the essential features of its original landscape setting. Oaklands is valued as one of the finest examples of High Victorian Gothic Revival residential architecture, the "Victorian house, par excellence." Built in 1859-60 and extended in 1869-70 with buff brick with stone details it is an excellent example of the High Victorian Gothic Revival style. This is evident in the asymmetrical plan and picturesque massing of the exterior which combines steeply pitched gable roofs and dormers, oriel and bay windows, and three octagonal towers. The variety of details are typical of the style and include polychromatic slate roofs, elaborate weathervanes, decorative wood bargeboards with kingposts or metal finials, crenellated parapet. The stone gates (c1860s) with their octagonal piers, decorated with quatrefoil motifs in relief, and the iron railings with their trefoil motifs extended the design value to the original entry of the property.

Later additions to the house built during Mary McCormick's occupation of the property (c1912), contribute to design value in the well-crafted features such as the stone porte-cochere on the north side and single-storey bay window extensions on the south side, which replaced the earlier verandahs, but maintain the High Victorian Gothic Revival details and picturesque rambling character of the house. Many of the identified interior areas and features, such as the fireplaces and the door cases reflect the influence of Neo-Classicism after the turn of the century. The result is a unique work which is a rare stylistic combination of evolving architectural style over 60 years that seeks to create a unified whole respecting the original house.

The gatekeeper's cottage (c1908), also built during Mary McCormick's residency, with its stucco walls, steep sloping roofs punctuated by dormers and extending to incorporate an asymmetrical verandah has a compatible picturesque style with a rustic Classical quality evident in the Doric columns and arched verandah walls that contributes to the design value in exemplifying Edwardian eclecticism.

Design value is also evident in the setting of the Oaklands house on the edge of the wooded escarpment, originally reached by a winding, still partially extant drive, which ascended across the lower open fields to the upper level of the ridge and exemplifies the more rustic aspects of the Picturesque aesthetic which converged with the High Victorian Gothic Revival. The escarpment driveway retaining walls with their stone arcades of pointed Gothic arches (c1912) are identified for their design value.

Under the new ownership of the Christian Brothers in 1931 and shift in purpose from a single family home to an educational/collective-residential function, the whole property was re-imagined with a collection of school buildings, including the historic Oaklands house, carefully composed around the edge of the central gardens of the dell on the upper terrace at the top of the ridge with the fields of the open space below being devoted

---

51 Arthur Eric, Toronto: No Mean City, 1964, ill.233.
primarily to athletic activities. This re-development of the site reinforced the physical and design value of the original domestic setting. The upper terrace of gardens with the dell, the original oak trees, additional maples planted during the Macdonald family's occupation and their enclosure on three sides (north, east and south) by the house and the De La Salle College "Oaklands", with the open west side which permits views across the open space from Avenue Road to the house, the college and the gardens, are also identified for their physical and design value.

The De La Salle College "Oaklands" building (1949) is identified as having cultural heritage value through its design which represents a mid-twentieth century Neo-Classical style as a two-and-a-half storey, flat-roofed building with a central cupola topped with a conical copper roof and cross, clad in variegated red brick with Neo-Classical stone pilasters and entablatures framing the central entrance and two side wings of the chapel and auditorium, with stone relief panels and other details. The incorporation of glass block and the inclusion of contemporary subjects in the relief panels and the varied treatment of Neo-Classical elements to accommodate the school's functions are modern elements indicating the influence of the mid-twentieth century on the building's design.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Historical or Associative Value</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i. direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Persons and Institutions** - The property has historical value associations for its associations with important historical figures and institutions of local, national and international significance.

Originally the estate of John Macdonald (1824-1890), who built Oaklands house (1859-60) and later extended it (1869-70) on Toronto's escarpment. A prominent innovative businessman, Methodist preacher, philanthropist and politician who was elected to both the provincial and federal parliaments, Macdonald was ultimately appointed to the Senate by Sir John A. Macdonald.

Oaklands is also valued for its association with Mary Virginia McCormick (1861-1941), the daughter, of Cyrus H. McCormick (1809-1994), the internationally-lauded inventor of labour-saving farm machinery, known as the mechanical reaper, and founder of the Cyrus H. McCormick and Brothers company which later merged with J. P. Morgan to become the International Harvester Company now known as the Navistar International Corporation. Mary McCormick was also a noted philanthropist both in the United States and Canada, contributing funds for the creation of the Mary McCormick Recreation Centre and Park in Brockton. During her occupation of Oaklands she extended the house, added the gatekeeper's house and modified the landscaping and circuitous driveway.
Oaklands is valued for its association with Jean-Baptiste de la Salle who founded the Christian Brothers in Reims, France in 1680. The Brothers operate educational institutions, named for De La Salle around the world. They first opened a Canadian branch in Montreal in 1837 and followed in Toronto in 1851 where they have had a continuous presence in the city as a Catholic educational institution, creating De La Salle College "Oaklands" in 1931.

Finally the property is valued for its association with a series of important Toronto architects: William Hay and his succeeding firm of Gundry and Langley, the firms of Darling and Pearson, Gordon and Helliwell and James H. Haffa.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contextual Value</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i. important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii. physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii. landmark</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Character, Surroundings and Landmark** – The contextual value of the property also relates to the historical, visual, physical and functional links between Oaklands and its grounds and the Yonge-St. Clair and Casa Loma neighborhoods. With the house positioned on the edge of the Lake Iroquois escarpment facing south to the city, Oaklands and its setting are valued for maintaining the 19th century character of the escarpment in this area. This character originated with the sequence of estates built along the ridge from as far west as Wychwood Park, west of Bathurst Street, to Oaklands in the east. Of these nineteenth century estates, only Spadina and Oaklands have survived and maintain their distinctive escarpment setting. Situated on the east side of Avenue Road, Oaklands is contextually valued for providing the most publically visible remnant of this 19th century development pattern on the escarpment.

De La Salle College "Oaklands" is a landmark sitting on the ridge of Avenue Road which with University Avenue is one of the city's main north-south routes. The property is part of a sequence of nineteenth century landmarks viewed on this route which are important institutions including the Ontario Legislature, and the University of Toronto to the south and Upper Canada College in the north.

Beyond the significance of 19th century settlement and history of Toronto, the contextual value of the property also lies with the visibility of the escarpment from Avenue Road and Oaklands Avenue. The escarpment is part of the Lake Iroquois Shoreline Ridge formed approximately 12,000 – 13,000 years ago and recognized as a feature in the City's Natural Heritage System as identified on Map 9 of the Official Plan. "The Iroquois Shoreline Ridge clearly represents one of the city's most important cultural and natural heritage features on account of its archaeological, geological, Aboriginal, city-historic and built heritage associations, as well as its physical prominence."  

52 Stewart, Andrew, "Review of the Significance of the Iroquois Shoreline Ridge (City of Toronto) and Recommendations for Protection," 2015, p 3.
Toronto's *Archaeological Master Plan* has identified the ridge including the De La Salle property as having archaeological potential. The natural heritage features include the prominence of red and white oaks, maple and pine trees on the site. As a link between the Humber River and Don Valley, the ridge fostered an east-west trail used by Aboriginal people which survives today as Davenport Road. The views from Avenue Road across the school's open fields have been identified as providing some of the best views of the escarpment in the City.\(^{53}\) The view from the gates on Oaklands Avenue is significant both for its view of the escarpment as well as preserving the view of Oaklands framed by the gates which was established between 1899 and 1903.

4. **SUMMARY**

Following research and evaluation according to O. Reg. 9/06, it has been determined that the entire property at 131 Farnham Avenue, known as De La Salle College "Oaklands", and originally known as the Oaklands house and estate which has been a prominent landmark on the ridge at Avenue Road for over 150 years, has design, associative and contextual value and associated heritage attributes and therefore the designation by-law should be amended accordingly.

De La Salle College "Oaklands" has design and physical value. As one of the last two surviving Victorian houses of the series which was constructed on the edge of the Lake Iroquois shoreline escarpment above Toronto, Oaklands is a rare example. Its design and physical value is evident in the high degree of craftsmanship and artistic merit as a High Victorian Gothic Revival house. It also displays artistic merit in the original picturesque setting of the house which, with the gates (1860s), the arrival route through the estate and the ascent up the escarpment with the variety of views created of the estate's landscape and gardens as well as towards the lake and the city, expresses the Picturesque Movement in landscape design.

During the McCormick's occupation, the later addition of the gatekeeper's house (1908) was designed in a picturesque style and the redevelopment of the driveway up the slope further enhanced the design value of the original setting. Under the current ownership of the Christian Brothers, the De La Salle College "Oaklands" building (1949) was constructed and is valued as a well-crafted example of mid-twentieth century Neo-Classical style, seen in the symmetrical composition and minimal, reinterpreted Neo-Classical details which are combined with modern elements such as glass block and sculptural relief panels of football players. The 1949 school building's location on the east side is part of the transformation of the upper terrace to an independent secondary school campus with central gardens enclosed by the Oaklands house and additional school buildings.

The reinforcement of the central dell and gardens as the campus focus provides views from Avenue Road including the west face of the De La Salle College "Oaklands" building and the north and west elevations of Oaklands house. The southern field has

\(^{53}\) Stewart, *op cit.*, p 1.
evolved in its design from pastoral and agricultural through to leisure and educational uses for a variety of individuals and communities.

The property is also valued for its association with important historical figures and institutions of both local and international significance. It is associated with the Senator John Macdonald, who was a prominent innovative businessman, a politician who was appointed a senator in 1887, a Methodist preacher and generous benefactor of numerous causes. It is also associated with the American entrepreneur Cyrus H. McCormick who was lauded for his inventions of mechanical farm machinery, and his daughter, Mary V. McCormick, a generous philanthropist in both Canada and the United States, whose contributions in Toronto are still evident in the Mary McCormick Recreation Centre and Park. It is also valued for its association with St. Jean-Baptiste De La Salle, the patron saint of teachers who in 1680 established the Christian Brothers, an international community dedicated to education which arrived in Canada in 1837. The Brothers arrived in Toronto in 1851 establishing schools, named for De La Salle, in various locations until settling at Oaklands in 1931. Finally, the property is valued for its association with a series of important Toronto architectural practices: William Hay, Gundry and Langley, Darling and Pearson, Gordon and Helliwell and James H. Haffa.

Contextually, De La Salle College "Oaklands" is a landmark on Avenue Road defining the character of the neighbourhood where the property is historically, visually, physically and functionally linked to its surroundings. This includes the Lake Iroquois shoreline escarpment, which crosses the estate and has important geological, archaeological, and natural heritage value that is significant to Toronto's history. Views from Avenue Road and from Oaklands Avenue through the gates include the open playing fields, the escarpment and the south elevation of Oaklands. Views from Avenue Road of the upper terrace include the north and west elevations of Oaklands and the west elevation of De La Salle College "Oaklands" as well as the open space, trees and plantings. (See Attachment 2)
5. SOURCES

Archival Sources
Adam, Mercer G. *Toronto Old and New: A Memorial Volume, Historical, Descriptive and Pictorial*. 1891.
Aerial Maps, City of Toronto.
Archival Photographs, City of Toronto Archives and Toronto Public Library (citations in Section 6).
Assessment Rolls, City of Toronto, Ward 3, Divisions 3, 7 and 8.
Browne, J. O. *Plan of the Township of York*. 1851.
Building Records, City of Toronto.
Building Permits, City of Toronto Archives.
City of Toronto Directories. City of Toronto Archives.
Engelhardt, George W. *Toronto, Canada: the book of its Board of Trade*. 1897.
Goad’s Atlases, 1884-1923.
John Macdonald Collection, National Archives of Canada.
Tremaine, George R. *Map of the County of York, Canada West*. 1860. (Ng).
The Board of Trade of the City of Toronto. *Toronto Canada: The Book of Its Board of Trade*. 1897.

Secondary Sources
City of Toronto *Official Plan*. 2015.
City of Toronto *Heritage Property Search Map*. 2015.  
[http://cot-planning.maps.arcgis.com/apps/PanelsLegend/index.html?appid=a90bf1e72b694db5a4892de6b170688d](http://cot-planning.maps.arcgis.com/apps/PanelsLegend/index.html?appid=a90bf1e72b694db5a4892de6b170688d)
"Frank Darling" entry in *Biographical Dictionary of Architects in Canada*  
"Jean Baptiste de la Salle" entry in Wikipedia  
"St. John Baptiste de la Salle" entry in *Catholic Encyclopedia*  
"De La Salle College" entry accessed 28 May 2015
Gianelli, Adele M. "House and Garden: Oaklands becomes boys' School" c1931, unidentified publication, copy in City of Toronto Archives, Box 503589, Folio 8.
"Thomas Gundry" entry in *Biographical Dictionary of Architects in Canada*.
James Harold Haffa Jr. entry in *Biographical Dictionary of Architects in Canada*.
"William Hay", entry in *Dictionary of Canadian Biography, Vol. XI (1881-1890)*
William Hay, entry in Biographical Dictionary of Architects in Canada,
"Henry Langley" entry in *Biographical Dictionary of Architects in Canada*.
Mary Virginia McCormick Papers, Wisconsin Historical Society.
http://digidcoll.library.wisc.edu/cgi/f/findaid/findaid.idx?c=wiarchives;cc=wiarchives;type=simple;rgn=Entire%20Finding%20Aid;q1=McCormick;view=reslist .subview=standard.sort=freq.start=1.size=25.ddidno=uw-whs-mcc0001d accessed 28 May 2015
"Mary Virginia McCormick" entry in *The Blok*.
Stewart, Andrew. "Review of the Significance of the Iroquois Shoreline Ridge (City of Toronto) and Recommendations for Protection." 2015.
"John Andrew Pearson," entry in *Biographical Dictionary of Architects in Canada*.
http://www.dictionaryofarchitectsincanada.org/node/2028
"Sir George Gilbert Scott", entry in Victoria and Albert Museum,
http://www.vam.ac.uk/content/articles/s/sir-george-gilbert-scott/ accessed 29 June 2015.
Wilson, Mitchell. "Cyrus Hall McCormick: American Industrialist and Inventor"